The Impact of Expanded, Multimodal Applications during a German Lied Performance

Adam Domenico Iannetta, The University of Western Ontario

Supervisor: Schmidt, Patrick, The University of Western Ontario
Co-Supervisor: Hess, John, The University of Western Ontario
A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Doctor of Musical Arts degree in Music
© Adam Domenico Iannetta 2019

Follow this and additional works at: https://ir.lib.uwo.ca/etd

Part of the Music Performance Commons

Recommended Citation
https://ir.lib.uwo.ca/etd/6568

This Dissertation/Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by Scholarship@Western. It has been accepted for inclusion in Electronic Thesis and Dissertation Repository by an authorized administrator of Scholarship@Western. For more information, please contact wlswadmin@uwo.ca.
Abstract and Keywords

This study explored the impact of adaptive methods and modalities in Art Song performance in connecting with adult audiences (aged 18 and older) as explored through a live performance of German Lieder. In addition, this study sought to contribute a qualitative experimental study of in-situ audience perception to an emerging field of practice and research regarding the innovative practices in Art Song performance (e.g. Art Song Theatre). The study was derived from a 2012 informal experiment by Professor Rena Sharon, a leading advocate of expanded Art Song performance practice and pedagogy. Specifically, a single English Art Song was performed in three different treatments: traditional, expanded traditional, and theatrical contextualization. The data helped illustrate a difference in performer interpretation and audience comprehension, confirming a stronger affiliation to the more expansive treatments over the more normative one.

Inspired by the anecdotal report of this experiment, the current study compared three gestural versions of Art Song performance, similar to the previously mentioned, on a larger scale (i.e. a German song cycle) and recorded the data through more extensive and systematic data collection before three distinct audiences, categorized according to level of prior classical music training and/or familiarity with Art Song. The conclusions observed provide further context on the effectiveness of innovative performance practices within classical music, such as Art Song Theatre, as well as suggest a set of parameters when putting forth a classical music performance – specifically that of Art Song/German Lied – for present-day audiences.

Keywords: Art Song Theatre, German Lieder, performance modality
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

Lay Summary

This study aimed to examine the possible impact of enhanced stagecraft in Art Song performance through a live performance of German Lieder for a diverse group of adult audiences (aged 18 and older). In addition, this study aimed to contribute to an emerging field of practice and research regarding the innovative practices in Art Song performance (e.g. Art Song Theatre). The study was based on a 2012 informal experiment by Professor Rena Sharon, a leading advocate of expanded Art Song performance practice and pedagogy. The informal experiment involved a single Art Song, sung in English, performed in three different styles, ranging from traditional to more theatrical. The data confirmed a stronger connection to the more expansive styles over the more traditional one from both the audience and the performer.

Inspired by this experiment, the current study compared three ways of performing Art Song, similar to the previously mentioned, before three distinct audiences, grouped according to familiarity with classical music and Art Song. It also focussed on a larger collection of songs, a song cycle, performed in the original German language. The data was recorded using surveys and interviews and provided three overarching themes. Firstly, age and post-secondary music education were most important to determine one’s level of connection to these kinds of performances. Secondly, the added stage elements from the lecture recital created a positive impact on audience engagement by engaging more of one’s senses, but they could also do the exact opposite when used improperly. Lastly, explaining the history of the piece separate from the musical performance was also beneficial for the audience, especially for those unfamiliar with the music. These conclusions help to establish the effectiveness of innovative performance practices within classical music and suggest a baseline when putting together a performance of Art Song/German Lied for present-day audiences.
Without tradition, art is a flock of sheep without a shepherd. Without innovation, it is a corpse.

– Winston Churchill
For Anna and Pasquale (a.k.a. Mom & Dad). Thanks to your love and support, I now see that anything is possible.
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

Acknowledgements

Thank you to my advisors and supervisors, Prof. Theodore Baerg, Dr. John Hess, Dr. Patrick Schmidt, and Dr. Todd Wieczorek, for your continued support and guidance.

Thank you to my new friend, Prof. Rena Sharon, for helping me to appreciate the true value of Art Song in the 21st century.

Thank you to my accompanist, Sarah Bowker, for being such an integral part of the lecture recital and this collaborative undertaking.

Thank you to my friends and colleagues, Brianna DeSantis and Chad Louwerse, as well as Jennifer Cyr, Bethany Hynes, and Carmen Specht for being part of the lecture recital.

Thank you to my former coaches, Mrs. Melanie Sloane (née Cancade), Dr. Marianna Chibotar-Rutkevich, and Maestro Simone Luti, for helping shape the performance aspect of the lecture recital throughout my doctoral program.

Thank you to my friend and colleague, Stéphanie Brassard, for helping choose the graphics for the second set of the lecture recital.

Thank you to Ms. Karen Kueneman and Ms. Katelyn Harris for solidifying the parameters of this study.

Thank you to my parents, Pasquale & Anna Iannetta, for encouraging me to pursue my passion and for always being there for me.

Lastly, thank you to my beautiful wife, Nicole Iannetta (née Embury), for your constant love and unwavering support over these past four years together. I could not have done any of this without you.
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

Table of Contents

Abstract and Keywords............................................................................................................ ii
Lay Summary .............................................................................................................................. iii
Acknowledgements .................................................................................................................. vi
Table of Contents .................................................................................................................... vii
List of Tables ............................................................................................................................. x
List of Figures .......................................................................................................................... xi
List of Appendices .................................................................................................................. xii
List of Abbreviations .............................................................................................................. xiii
Preface ..................................................................................................................................... xiv
I. Introduction ............................................................................................................................ 1
   Analyzing the Modern Art Song Recital .............................................................................. 2
   Statement of the Problem ...................................................................................................... 5
      The challenge ....................................................................................................................... 11
      Innovation in classical music ............................................................................................ 13
      The need for change from the Art Song recital ................................................................. 13
      Success and sustainability within Art Song Theatre ......................................................... 16
   Purpose of the Study ............................................................................................................. 18
      Framing the research .......................................................................................................... 21
   Research Questions .............................................................................................................. 22
II. Literature Review ................................................................................................................ 24
   Town: The Economy of Art ................................................................................................. 25
      Fine art-facts ...................................................................................................................... 26
      The history of art objectification ...................................................................................... 28
   Gown: How to Appreciate the Artform ............................................................................. 30
      Knowledge versus instinct ................................................................................................. 31
      Interpretation throughout history .................................................................................... 32
   Performer: Hands-on Application ....................................................................................... 34
      Projected translations ........................................................................................................ 35
      Projected illustrations and non-traditional stagecraft ..................................................... 39
      Additional performers ....................................................................................................... 41
   Summary ............................................................................................................................... 45
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

III. Methodology ...........................................................................................................47
   Design .........................................................................................................................49
      Exposure and observation ......................................................................................50
   Sample/Participant Selection ..................................................................................51
   Process and Protocol ...............................................................................................53
   Data Collection .........................................................................................................55
      Surveys .....................................................................................................................55
      Interviews ...............................................................................................................58
   Validity and Limitations .........................................................................................61
      Generalization .........................................................................................................61
      Sample-size inconsistency ......................................................................................62
      Researcher as performer and performance order ..................................................63
      Song selection .........................................................................................................63
      Participant bias .......................................................................................................64

IV. Presentation of the Data .......................................................................................66
   Survey Data ................................................................................................................71
      Section One – Sample size ....................................................................................71
      Section One – Age demographic ...........................................................................73
      Section One – Classical music affiliation ............................................................73
      Section Two – Evaluation of performance modalities .........................................75
      Section Two – Evaluation of multimodal applications .........................................76
      Section Three – Comprehension of text and emotional connection .....................77
      Section Three – Multimodal applications ..............................................................79
      Section Three – Level of focus ..............................................................................80
   Interview Data ...........................................................................................................81
      Performance aesthetic ............................................................................................82
      Movement and gesture ...........................................................................................85
      Text Translation .......................................................................................................87
      Engagement and performance preference ............................................................93
   Summary ...................................................................................................................99

V. Data Analysis .........................................................................................................101
   Audience Classification ..........................................................................................105
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

Education and understanding ................................................................. 107
Age and appreciation ............................................................................. 110
The overarching correlation ................................................................. 112
Sensory Stimulation ............................................................................. 113
  Traditional versus innovative ............................................................. 114
  Sensory saturation ............................................................................. 116
  Text projection .................................................................................. 117
  Direct and indirect translation ........................................................... 119
Contextualization .................................................................................. 124
  “Lecture” recital ................................................................................. 126
Summary ................................................................................................. 128
  The past, present, and future of Art Song ............................................ 130
Considerations for the Future ................................................................. 132
References .............................................................................................. 136
Appendices ............................................................................................. 140
Curriculum Vitae .................................................................................... 178
List of Tables

1. Average and total number of attendances for performing arts activities: 2002, 2008, and 2012 (National Endowment for the Arts, 2015, p. 8) .................................................................8
2. Genres of music attended by adults who reported attending any live music performance in the past 12 months: 2012 (National Endowment for the Arts, 2015, p. 24) .................9
3. Layout of the performance program for the lecture recital ..............................................................70
4. S1-Q1: “What is your age?” (response averages) .............................................................................73
5. S1-Q6: “How often do you attend public classical music performances within a year?” (response averages) .......................................................................................74
6. S1-Q7: “How familiar are you with the genre of Art Song, specifically German Lieder?” (response averages) .................................................................................................75
7. Comparison of responses between the three varying performance modalities (response averages) ............................................................................................................................76
8. S2-Q18: “Rank the effectiveness for each of the following multimodal applications used.” (response averages) .........................................................................................................77
9. S3-Q1: “Explain how your comprehension of the text and emotional connection varied between the three different sections of the performance presented today.” .......................79
10. S3-Q2: “How was your overall experience from today’s performances impacted by movement and gesture, props and costumes, projected illustrations, translations projected as supertitles, and additional performers?” .................................................................80
11. S3-Q3: “Regarding the second section, did any of the aforenoted elements detract from your ability to understand or connect with the performance? Please explain why or how.” ..........................................................................................................................81
12. Comparison of responses between the three varying performance modalities (response averages) ............................................................................................................................109
13. S1-Q1: “What is your age?” (response averages) .............................................................................111
14. Comparison of responses between the three varying performance modalities (response averages) ............................................................................................................................115
15. S2-Q18: “Rank the effectiveness for each of the following multimodal applications used.” (response averages) .........................................................................................................117
16. S3-Q2: “How was your overall experience from today’s performances impacted by movement and gesture, props and costumes, projected illustrations, translations projected as supertitles, and additional performers?” .................................................................120
17. S3: Responses associated to the narration provided by the researcher before each performance ..........................................................................................................................128
List of Figures

1. Illustration of the study’s exposure and observation ........................................50
2. S1-Q2: “How would you best describe yourself, given the options below?” ..............72
List of Appendices

A. UWO Ethics Approval Form .................................................................140
B. Email Script – Interviews with Professor Rena Sharon.................................142
C. Email Script – REMINDER Interviews with Professor Rena Sharon................143
D. Letter of Information and Consent – Initial Interview with Professor Rena Sharon ......144
E. Semi-structured Interview Guide – Initial Interview with Professor Rena Sharon .......148
F. Semi-structured Interview-Guide – Follow-up Interview with Professor Rena Sharon ..150
G. Email Script – Lecture-recital Survey........................................................151
H. Email Script – REMINDER Lecture-recital Survey........................................152
I. Poster........................................................................................................153
J. Verbal Recruitment Script ............................................................................154
K. Letter of Information and Consent – Lecture-recital Survey..............................156
L. Lecture-recital Survey..................................................................................159
M. Consent Form – Contact for Future Studies ..................................................165
N. Email Script – Interview with Lecture-recital Attendees ..................................166
O. Email Script – REMINDER Interview with Lecture-recital Attendees................167
P. Letter of Information and Consent – Interview with Lecture-recital Attendees.........168
Q. Semi-structured Interview Guide – Interview with Lecture-recital Attendees.........172
R. Performance Milestone Events
   1. Opera Role November 2015 ....................................................................174
   2. Recital Program November 2016 ............................................................175
   3. Opera Role January/February 2018 .........................................................176
   4. Lecture-recital Program September 2018 ...............................................177
List of Abbreviations

BFA .................................................................................................................. Bachelor of Fine Arts
CASP .................................................................................................................. Canadian Art Song Project
COC ..................................................................................................................... Canadian Opera Company
DMA .................................................................................................................... Doctorate of Musical Arts
DVI ....................................................................................................................... Digital Video Illumination
ILSR ...................................................................................................................... Institute of Learning Styles Research
MMPALT ................................................................. Multi-modal Paired Associate Learning Test
NEA ....................................................................................................................... National Endowment for the Arts
NWS ..................................................................................................................... New World Symphony
R & B .................................................................................................................... Rhythm & Blues
SPPA ................................................................. Survey of Public Participation in the Arts
UBC ..................................................................................................................... University of British Columbia
VISI ................................................................. Vancouver International Song Institute
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

Preface

It was not until the beginning of the second year of my doctoral program when I finally solidified a research topic. Before then, I was convinced that I was going to focus my research on studying opera, but this came with a caveat of problems. Firstly, opera is a very broad topic, and I could not pinpoint exactly what I wanted to study. I knew that I enjoyed opera for its stories, the characters, and especially the production aspect, but I could not figure out how to put that into words – let alone an academic paper. Secondly, all the opera roles that I wanted to study were far too advanced for a 23-year-old baritone. I was hoping to study the masterworks of Gounod, Verdi, and Wagner; instead, my instructors suggested that I focus on Mozart, Handel, and – of course – Art Song. First and foremost, I have no qualms with either Mozart or Handel, nor do I dislike Art Song; rather, I disliked performing Art Song. As far as I was concerned, performing Art Song was not performing at all: stand still, remain still, and sing. Compared to opera, performing Art Song simply was not something I enjoyed.

Despite my reservations about performing Art Song, I could not deny all the beautiful music within this repertoire. I love Robert Schumann, not only for his music, but for the life he lived and the sacrifices he made that further inspired his music. Schumann’s relationship with Clara Wieck and Johannes Brahms was so timeless, so moving that it could have easily been adapted into a major motion picture, and it was – Song of Love (1947). I was torn. As beautiful as this music was, I did not think the traditional recital format was the way to perform it. Ultimately, my love of Art Song and dislike for its performance parameters helped me to solidify my research. If I was not allowed to perform the music I love the way I wanted, then I was going to dedicate my research to figuring out how I could. A little spiteful of me, I will admit, but I at least found my muse.
To my amazement, I was neither the first nor the only one who felt this way about Art Song and how to perform it. As luck would have it, one of the leading advocates in expanded Art Song performance practice and pedagogy, Professor Rena Sharon, had visited Western University the year before I started my doctoral program. Thanks to Professor Sharon, among other Art Song performers and enthusiasts mentioned in this study, I not only developed new perspectives on how to approach Art Song, I learned to appreciate the value of the pre-existing performance parameters of the Art Song recital. As such, it is my hope that the conclusions observed in this study can provide a suggested set of adapted, expanded parameters when putting forth an Art Song performance for present-day audiences, as well as reinforce the significance of this beautiful collection of works and the need to sustain it.
I. Introduction

By the mid-19th century, Germany had prospered and became the dynamic centre of what is now known as the Romantic period. This era of artistic development was marked by a synthesis of the arts; in particular, the culmination of music and poetry lead to the emergence of the Lied. Despite its small form, the Lied was considered the quintessential medium to convey many of the themes significant in 18th- and 19th-century Romanticism, “combining music and poetry, art and literature, natural landscapes and the interior life of the individual seeking a place in the world” (Elliot, 2006, p. 161). The Lied became highly popular with the general public as a means of home entertainment, given its smaller, more accessible form. Elliot elaborates on how composers took advantage of this demand and went on to compose songs intended for amateur musicians:

Carl Loewe, Robert Franz, [Felix] Mendelssohn, [Robert] Schumann, and [Johannes] Brahms all wrote songs, duets, and quartets geared to the abilities of amateur musicians. Private music making took place in virtually every educated home. Piano and voice teachers in the cities had no want for students from wealthy and middle-class families. The lied was a welcome guest at private gatherings both small and large, and many composers performed their songs in these less formal situations. (Elliot, 2006, p. 161)

This mass appeal further encouraged composers to analyze and discuss the theoretical and philosophical aspects of music by their peers from a more critical perspective. For example, Schumann’s *Neue Zeitschrift für Musik* was one of the first music journals founded out of the development of the Lied (Elliot, 2006). Such publications were written to better inform the general public of the music for whom it was being written and further refine their opinions as a result.
Over the course of the 19th century, the reputation of the Lied expanded from the private parlour to the public concert hall. As the demand for professional public concerts increased, so did the demand for variety in concert programming. This created a demand for Lieder in the concert hall: “Songs, solo instrumental selections, melodramas, and poetry readings gradually began to appear on the same concert programs with symphonies, concertos, and choral works” (Elliot, 2006, pp. 161-162). Touring virtuosos, such as Franz Liszt, seized this opportunity and attracted large audiences wanting to hear his stunning variations and fantasies on the themes and songs of Schubert and other Lied composers, further promoting the artform. This collaboration among performers and composers helped to develop the concept of the solo vocal recital.

Beyond the traditional performance protocol of the singer and piano, composers, such as Brahms, Richard Strauss, and Richard Wagner, began to arrange and compose songs for voice and orchestra. By the end of the 19th century, the Lied was an immensely popular artform and a commercial success. Whether for the amateur musician or the professional connoisseur, however, the Lied was “all-encompassing, [and] still nominally something for everyone” (Johnson, 2004, p. 315). While the reputation of the Lied experienced tremendous growth, the nature of the Lied remained consistent and still “demanded close communication between singer and accompanist and provided an intimate experience between performers and audience” (Elliot, 2006, p. 162). The modern performance practices of Lieder continue to maintain a sense of artistry and refinement consistent with its origins, but the modern Art Song recital, as a result, has become marginalized, no longer reflecting the accessibility from the artform’s apogee.

Analyzing the Modern Art Song Recital

By the end of the 19th century, the song recital in North America began to accumulate a larger following, but this was heavily – if not entirely – based, as Emmons and Sonntag argue, on
the celebrity status of the musicians performing, the music that was sung (i.e. opera arias and ensembles), and the scale of the production:

   Travelling performers like Nellie Melba and Jennie Lind charmed the general public with those operatic arias, resplendent with pyrotechnics, that their devoted public expected to hear. Simple tunes, if included at all, were a pleasant but unimportant part of the evening’s entertainment. On some occasions assisting artists were contracted to appear in duets with the star singer. When feasible, orchestras were hired. In the absence of an orchestra, the dubious duties were performed by an accompanist, who was cautioned to appear not too conspicuous. (Emmons and Sonntag, 1979, p. 2)

As the song recital matured, however, so did the mindset of its audience. Audiences grew more disinterested with the lesser known works, demanding only their favourites. All of this, in turn, divided the public attending these performances, arguably, into three distinct groups:

   (1) the enthusiast, whose musical appreciation and understanding is superior, who therefore has an incentive to investigate and enjoy any new music, whether contemporary or from the past; (2) the connoisseur of good music who hastens to admire chic music, which is in vogue and pleases the prevailing taste; (3) the remaining individual, typical of the majority, who accepts his [or her] standards and convictions second-hand. (Emmons and Sonntag, 1979, p. 2)

Where the first two groups continued to support the diversity of emerging artists and contemporary music, more so the enthusiasts, the third group, often influenced by the connoisseurs, was less inclined to do so (Emmons and Sonntag, 1979).

   By today’s standards, the Art Song recital is not a popular genre: “A soprano in a ball gown or a tenor in a tux, standing stiffly in front of a shiny black Steinway – makes for an ill fit
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

with 21st-century mores” (Varty, 2013, paragraph 7). Helfgot and Beeman assert that singers of classical music have become so fixated on the accuracy of their singing that they neglect the other equally important aspects of interpretation, such as movement and gesture (Helfgot and Beeman, 1993). As a result, the performer’s interpretation of the composer’s work is obstructed by their obsession with pitch, rhythm, and diction accuracy (Hemsley, 1998). In some instances, the coordination between poetry and music is made quite clear. However, the performer needs to invest more time and energy into researching how and why the composer chose to set the text in the manner that he or she did: “Music may illuminate, ignore or betray the text. The artist must find his way to resolve any conflict” (Emmons and Sonntag, 1979, p. 190). Unfortunately, as Hemsley elaborates, this step of the performance process is often treated haphazardly, if not neglected altogether:

All too often, the text, seen as an unwelcome imposition, is treated in a slovenly manner; and in the process the singers have denied themselves, and their audience, the expressive possibilities of the poem which provided the initial inspiration for the composer. They will have surrendered to the easy lure of generalization. (Hemlsey, 1998, p. 118)

As a result, the performer is unable to create a clear interpretation of the piece, let alone fully comprehend the composer’s original inspiration, thereby leaving the audience confused and less enthusiastic about the entire performance. This miscommunication is exacerbated with such subsections of Art Song as German Lieder and French Mélodie, where the songs are sung in a language sometimes unfamiliar to the audience.

The inherited performance practices of the Lied have inhibited the genre from adapting alongside its ever-changing audience. It is only until recent that these traditions have been expanded for the sake of reinventing and reinvigorating this at-risk genre of music. Such
adaptations include narration, theatrical movement and gesture, props and costumes, additional performers, as well as projected text and images, all of which have proven beneficial in improving communicative gains between the performers and their audiences. One such approach, Art Song Theatre, is an alternative method of performing Art Song recitals, utilizing such expanded performance conventions.

While Art Song has existed for more than 200 years, the concept of Art Song Theatre is a recent development – roughly 30 to 40 years. Contrary to the Art Song recital, Art Song Theatre promotes itself as creating an all-encompassing musical experience to engage its audiences in the synthesis of poetry and music, using expanded performance parameters and practices. Although these applications may seem at face value excessive or daring, such attempts to adopt the artform have been referred to as admirable while still remaining within the boundaries of good taste: “While you won’t see dressed-down divas in blue jeans… You will see lyrics projected, opera style, as surtitles; singers embracing a more physical style of presentation; and even a few ventures into musical theatre” (Varty, 2013, paragraph 7). At the core of Art Song Theatre exists a willingness to change and adapt for the sake of better communicating, better understanding, and better appreciating Art Song. By taking a genre of music hundreds of years old and incorporating contemporary technology and stagecraft, Art Song Theatre gives present-day audiences the opportunity to appreciate and enjoy Art Song anew.

**Statement of the Problem**

While university music programs remain supportive of studying Art Song as a principal genre of music for both voice and collaborative-piano majors, its decline outside the classroom is cause for concern. By its very nature, all Art Song should “connect with both performer and public in a way that makes a practical difference to how the music sounds” (Johnson, 2004, p.
That is to say the artform should not simply showcase the voice alone; it should elicit a dialogue based on the music and text between the performer and the audience. However, the Art Song recital’s more normative format opposes the current cultural expectations for live, vocal performance, thereby reducing its overall accessibility.

The popularity of the Art Song recital has been in decline since the early 20th century (Emmons and Sonntag, 1979). Despite the severity of the Art Song recital’s alienation from the modern audience, the classical music industry overall has seen a steady decline since the early 2000s. In 2012, classical album sales of physical CDs in America plummeted by 21 percent, all of which was juxtaposed with statistically more popular genres of music, such as Rock (35%) and R & B (18%). By the following year, only 2.8 percent of albums sold were categorized as classical music; this includes opera, symphonic and orchestral works, chamber music, as well as Art Song (Vanhoenacker, 2014).

Statistics have shown, however, that classical music sells better online than it does in stores. While classical album sales now yield only 2.8 percent of sales, classical music equates to twelve percent of sales on such popular music-downloading services as iTunes, with some classical downloads outweighing those of CD purchases (Higgins, 2006). According to Jonathan Gruber, Universal’s Vice President, and Chris Cracker, head of Sony BMG’s UK operation, there are several advantages to selling classical music online which have led to some success.

‘It’s a great deal for people new to classical. It’s very easy to sample a single track at a very low cost. It’s a low-risk purchase. On the one hand, if you are an expert classical consumer the digital medium is also great. You can (or will be able to) access a vast repertoire of recordings and artists.’ … This is a particularly keen issue in an
environment where… ‘classical has lost innumerable independent specialist stores, and
shelf space in the chains is decreasing.’ (Higgins, 2006, paragraph 4)

Furthermore, classical music’s digitalization offers other benefits for both consumers and producers, such as never going out of stock, no cost for CD manufacturing, and – most importantly – accessibility. Even within the digital market, however, classical music still faces its share of problems. As a result, there is a demand for a major download network tailored specifically for classical music. While there exist smaller operations, such as eClassical.com, they still have a difficult time marketing themselves and competing with the more major online services for pop music (e.g. iTunes and Google Play).

The most compelling findings, however, hail from the classical music industry’s former breadwinners, ticket sales and audience attendance. By today’s standards, live classical music is better funded by charitable donations, arts councils, and other foundations than dependant on ticket sales. According to Slate magazine, “even if every seat were filled, the vast majority of symphony orchestras would still face significant performance deficits” (Vanhoenacker, 2014, paragraph 6). Furthermore, while the classical music industry’s main source of income may not be a direct biproduct of those attending the performances, overall attendance is facing its own shortcomings.

According to The National Endowment for the Arts (NEA), the independent federal agency responsible for the subsidization and funding of the arts in the United States, a gradual decline in adult Americans attending “benchmark” activities (i.e. jazz, classical music, opera, musical plays, non-musical plays, ballet, and art museums or galleries) has been observed via the Survey of Public Participation in the Arts (SPPA) since 1982. The most substantial drop was seen from 2002 to 2008, almost five percent, but stabilized by 2012. Furthermore, attendance for
classical music events faced a decline similar to the previously stated overall attendance for “benchmark” events, as described below (Table 1).

Attendance at classical music events declined from 2002 to 2008, but stayed the same from 2008 to 2012… About 9 percent of adults attended a performance in each of those years, averaging 2.6 events per attendee in 2012, and a comparable 2.9 events in 2008. Both are lower than the 3.1 events per person reported in 2002. (National Endowment for the Arts, 2015, p. 8)

Table 1. Average and total number of attendances for performing arts activities: 2002, 2008, and 2012 (National Endowment for the Arts, 2015, p. 8)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Average number of attendances per attendee</th>
<th>Total number of attendances in millions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Music</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jazz</td>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>2.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Classical Music</td>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>2.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opera</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>1.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latin, Spanish, or salsa music</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>3.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Plays</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Musical Plays</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>2.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-musical plays</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>2.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Dance</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ballet</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>1.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>2.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A correlation between arts attendance and certain demographic characteristics can be observed:

“The typical pattern is that… older adults attended ‘benchmark’ arts events more often than younger adults, females attend more often than men, and people with higher levels of education attend more often than the less educated” (National Endowment for the Arts, 2015, p. 22). The only demographic subgroup to show an increase in attendance from 2002 to 2012 was older Americans (aged 65 and over) (National Endowment for the Arts, 2015). Younger adults, particularly those aged 18 to 24, however, were the least likely to attend classical music and
opera events in place of being the most likely to attend other music events (e.g. rap and pop/rock), with pop/rock having the highest percentage of overall attendance (Table 2).

**Table 2. Genres of music attended by adults who reported attending any live music performance in the past 12 months:**

2012 (National Endowment for the Arts, 2015, p. 24)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GENRES OF MUSIC ATTENDED</th>
<th>ALL ADULTS</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Race/ethnicity</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Education</th>
<th>Income</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jazz</td>
<td>15.9%</td>
<td>15.3%</td>
<td>16.5%</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>18-24</td>
<td>Grad School</td>
<td>Less than $20K</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>9.1%</td>
<td>8.5%</td>
<td>9.4%</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>White</td>
<td>55-64</td>
<td>College</td>
<td>$50K to $75K</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Classical</td>
<td>18.2%</td>
<td>16.6%</td>
<td>20.5%</td>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>African American</td>
<td>65-74</td>
<td>Graduate school</td>
<td>$50K and over</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opera</td>
<td>4.8%</td>
<td>4.1%</td>
<td>4.8%</td>
<td>Race/ethnicity</td>
<td>Other</td>
<td>18-24</td>
<td>Family income</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hymns</td>
<td>14.2%</td>
<td>12.2%</td>
<td>15.1%</td>
<td>Age</td>
<td>High school graduate</td>
<td>55-64</td>
<td>18-24</td>
<td>$20K to $50K</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Country</td>
<td>20.2%</td>
<td>19.3%</td>
<td>20.4%</td>
<td>Education</td>
<td>High school graduate</td>
<td>65-74</td>
<td>18-24</td>
<td>$75K to $100K</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rap</td>
<td>8.7%</td>
<td>9.7%</td>
<td>7.9%</td>
<td>Income</td>
<td>Some college</td>
<td>55-64</td>
<td>18-24</td>
<td>$100K to $150K</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blues</td>
<td>13.1%</td>
<td>12.1%</td>
<td>14.0%</td>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>College graduate</td>
<td>65-74</td>
<td>18-24</td>
<td>$50K and over</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Folk</td>
<td>9.6%</td>
<td>9.9%</td>
<td>9.2%</td>
<td>Race/ethnicity</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>55-64</td>
<td>Family income</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pop/rock</td>
<td>43.6%</td>
<td>46.4%</td>
<td>42.5%</td>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>55-64</td>
<td>18-24</td>
<td>Less than $20K</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Gray shaded box indicates that the estimate is significantly different from the overall 2012 estimate at the .05 level.

Additionally, the rates of attendance for younger adults at classical music and opera events continue to drop while that of older adults increase.

Between 1982 and 2002, the portion of concertgoers under 30 fell from 27 percent to 9 percent; the share over age 60 rose from 16 percent to 30 percent. In 1982 the median age of a classical concertgoer was 40; by 2008 it was 49. (Vanhoenacker, 2014, paragraph 4)

What this evidence suggests is that the overall audience for live classical music is decreasing not simply because of a lack of appreciation for the artform, but also because of age. Furthermore,
any appreciation for classical music from previous generations is not easily transferrable to younger demographics (Vanhoenacker, 2014). Where classical music may have once been considered an artform for the old, it could be more accurately considered an artform for the dead and dying.

There exists another contributing factor to the Art Song recital’s accessibility that is unique to the genre – poetry. Lieder is defined by the synthesis of poetry set to music; one artform inspires the other. Unfortunately, recent studies in poetry readership have shown equally funereal findings as those of classical music attendance. In 2012, the Census Bureau of the United States recorded that in the span of 20 years, from 1992 to 2012, the number of Americans who read poetry (defined as “read a work of poetry [written in English] at least once this past year”) had dropped by more than half, from 17 percent to 6.7 percent (Ingraham, 2015). This nearly perfectly linear downward trend is unique among the literary arts: “Since 2002, the share of poetry-readers contracted by 45 percent – resulting in the steepest decline in participation in any literary genre” (Ingraham, 2015, paragraph 7). While attempts have been made to enhance the availability of poetry (i.e. electronic databases), the share of all Google searches involving poetry continued to drop by almost 80 percent between 2005 and 2015 (Ingraham, 2015). Moreover, the cyclical variations of this search trend appear to be dictated by students doing research for schoolwork as opposed to adults reading for pleasure, as any spikes within this search only exist within an academic year (Ingraham, 2015).

Art Song exists as a unique synthesis of two distinct artforms that in turn provides a unique experience of appreciating both the music and poetry across hundreds of years and from various cultures. Unfortunately, with both classical music and poetry struggling to maintain a
substantial audience, it follows that Art Song is struggling to make any headway in today’s classical performance circles.

The challenge. In order to attain as well as maintain an audience, classical musicians must achieve a delicate balance between respect for tradition and the necessity for innovation by responding “to the needs and sophistication of contemporary audiences, keeping one eye on the audiences of tomorrow as well” (Helfgot and Beeman, 1993, p. 225). Fortunately, innovation within the industry has already started to occur, and the results have been documented to further support the necessity for change in classical music.

Often referred to as the “nexus of knowledge and innovation, advocacy, and leadership advancement” in support of American orchestras and the music they perform, the League of American Orchestras was the first organization ever to conduct a formal study to document and understand the organizational components responsible for and related to innovation in American orchestras (“About the League”, n.d., paragraph 1). Initiated in 2009, the foundation of this research was rooted in observing the dynamic economic and cultural challenges faced by modern American orchestras and their ability to cope with such adversity; specifically, “some [modern American orchestras] began to experiment with new approaches to delivering on their missions” (Tepavac, 2010a, p. 1). The study was conducted as a series of case studies, documenting the practices and innovations of five different American orchestras: Atlanta Symphony Orchestra, Los Angeles Philharmonic, Memphis Symphony Orchestra, Pacific Symphony, and The Saint Paul Chamber Orchestra (Tepavac, 2010a).

While the League’s findings do not present a “one size fits all” solution for modern American orchestras, they offer encouragement for orchestras and their stakeholders to take risks
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

through innovative measures, rather than rely on former, obsolete systems and models, if they hope to keep the orchestral music experience alive in America.

Perhaps the most fundamental characteristic guiding the innovative journeys of the five orchestras in this study is their awareness of the need for constant evolution… They question closely held and conventional assumptions and they purposefully and intentionally blur traditional roles – which means taking risks… Above all, they focus on the human factor. The well-being and satisfaction of the organization’s stakeholders are critically important, and while institutional life is intense and demanding, it is also enjoyable. (Tepavac, 2010b, p. 86)

Based on these findings, the demand for change within the classical music industry has become more apparent; specifically, this change must happen in coordination with the industry’s dynamic audiences and progressive stakeholders. The audiences of classical music performances today are not the same as they once were 50 years ago. Therefore, performers of classical music as well as the industry must be willing to adapt according to public taste (Helfgot and Beeman, 1993).

Based on the decline in popularity of classical music, it is assumed that the formats through which classical music is presented seem less effective to establish clear communication between both performers and audience. In this regard, what is needed should be considered an evolution within the industry rather than a revolution for the artform (Helfgot and Beeman, 1993). Instead of trying to reform the Lied, performer’s need to readjust their focus on learning how to better communicate this music with present-day audiences. After all, the goal of the Lied, or any form of music, is communication.
**Innovation in classical music.** This study aimed to understand people’s perceptions and interaction with classical music today as it relates to German Lied. Within the broader realm of classical music, the New World Symphony (NWS) has been readjusting its efforts to focus on innovative means to attract larger audiences to its classical music performances. This was first encouraged following a three-year period of study conducted by the NWS to evaluate the success of its more non-traditional productions. Between 2010 and 2013, the NWS – in combination with five other American professional orchestras – studied the rate of attendance and audience response within three innovative concert formats: “30-minute ‘Mini Concerts’; Late-night, mixed-genre, lounge-style events titled, ‘Pulse: Late Night at the New World Symphony’; [and] Hour-long ‘Encounters’ that integrate scripted narration and video into the performance – including a post-concert reception for the entire audience” (Burton, 2013, paragraph 4). The results of this study found that these non-traditional, innovative concert formats “attracted more than double the number of new patrons than traditionally formatted programs, while also increasing audience diversity” (Burton, 2013, paragraph 5). While these concerts may have only accounted for ten percent of the overall concert funding, 31 percent of this funding was accredited to first-time ticket buyers; furthermore, 42 percent of these buyers made additional ticket purchases for upcoming productions, both innovative and more conventional formats (Burton, 2013).

**The need for change from the Art Song recital.** The Art Song recital is struggling, with career opportunities being extremely rare, if practically nonexistent. Consequently, “the genre is at imminent risk of disappearing as a performance modality” (Sharon, Fais, and Vatikiotis-Bateson, 2013, p. 370). The genre’s potential extinction may likely result from it becoming increasingly segregated from other forms of classical music, so much so that it is now being advertised to only a small, specialized audience (Sharon et al., 2013).
Art Song repertoire has begun to be marginalized in many university programs to the extent that a trained performer network may not exist within several generations, thus putting the repertoire at risk of devolving to a primarily archival existence of recordings and scores. (Sharon et al., 2013, p. 370) As a result, it is surmised that the Lied will cease to exist from classical-performance circles within 30 years time (Sharon et al., 2013).

There still exists an urgency to study the repertoire and practices of the Lied, specifically within higher education. The majority of post-secondary and graduate music programs in North America continue to promote the significance of the Lied and Art Song as a crucial aspect of Western classical music within their curricula. Despite the efforts of both the students and faculty in support of the Lied, the significance of the artform beyond this domain continues to struggle, so much so that “the university presses remain supportive; but piano-accompanied song needs a broader base in order to survive, and commentators almost certainly enjoy a false sense of security about its future” (Johnson, 2004, p. 315). According to Johnson, the lifespan of the Lied in the present time may only last as long as a two- or four-year university program in voice or collaborative piano, with anything after this diminishing, as he goes on to explain:

As always, economics plays a crucial part in determining the future. Most universities are a long way from concert halls where enough customers pay to hear art songs. Ardent student recitals fade into nostalgic memories as graduates go into the outside world and find that Lieder singing, for all its beauties, pays very few of the bills. Recital dates are rare because audiences are scarce. (Johnson, 2004, p. 316)

In this instance, perhaps the Lied should continue to reside solely in the curricula of such institutions where it can remain safe and well-preserved. By abstracting the artform within the
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

confines of higher education, however, does the risk of the Lied becoming further marginalized increase?

While classical music, more specifically the Art Song recital, and other previously mentioned genres of music, such as pop/rock music, exist within different cultural and technical capacities, perhaps there is opportunity for one to learn from the other. For instance, if the Art Song recital hopes to sustain itself, then perhaps the industry needs to adopt similar conventions as those allowing such genres as pop/rock music to be more accessible. For example, whereas a pop-/rock-music concert employs costume designers, scenic artists, and lighting directors to help construct a multisensory production, in addition to marketing experts to further promote these productions, the parameters of the Art Song recital can be considered minimal, even limiting at times:

The ‘set’ usually consists of a grand piano, with perhaps a large standing vase of flowers and a small table with a glass of water. Sometimes an ornamental rug may be added to invoke a 19th century Salon. A singer and a pianist in formal attire are the sole occupants of the stage. (Sharon et al., 2013, p. 370)

From this description, it follows that the Art Song recital continues to heighten the Lied’s sense of inaccessibility.

The protocols of the Art Song recital necessitate a readjustment to ensure a broader range of accessibility, appreciation, and relevancy for the artform. Fortunately, there already exists a coalition of musicians and performance scholars who have committed their efforts to the preservation and performance of Art Song. Through Art Song Theatre, this group of individuals has assumed responsibility for the reimagining and revitalization of an endangered genre of music.
Success and sustainability within Art Song Theatre. Professor Rena Sharon’s research on the effectiveness of Art Song performance in establishing a performer-audience connection through non-traditional methods helped introduce Art Song Theatre as a new and innovative medium to present Art Song (Sharon, Interview 1, 2018). Sharon’s research helped determine an overall enhancement in solo-voice performance accredited to “natural expressive gesture, technical capacities, and theatrical context” (Sharon et al., 2013, p. 377). From Sharon’s findings, further research was encouraged, thus leading to the development of the Vancouver International Song Institute (VISI) and the SONGIFRE Theatre Alliance, two organizations developed to accommodate the study of song performance practice and performance cognition (i.e. VISI) and the production of professional theatre and student venues for music performances, including Art Song Theatre (i.e. SONGFIRE Theatre Alliance) (Sharon et al., 2013). In addition, Art Song Theatre was first publicized as part of Sharon’s performance group, the Song Circle, having performed hundreds of recitals, lectures, and theatre works across North America from 1994 to 2004 (Sharon, n.d.a).

Despite the need for change within the genre of Art Song, performers and innovators still face the financial capability to subsidize such endeavours. As previously mentioned, the classical music industry is already dealing with diminishing audience attendance and album sales (Vanhoenacker, 2014). Furthermore, a dramatic change in the process of design and production across the cultural sector has been observed within the past ten years. Specifically, “Technical Directors across the country are now facing increasing rates of change in digital technology, but are having difficulty adapting because of unchanging budgets, and sometimes reduced rates of public funding in the cultural sector” (Woyno, 2011, p. 2). As a result, the present-day success and relevancy of Art Song performance is now dependent on not only adapting its performance
parameters to those of more popular genres of music, but also doing so with limited resources and a minimal budget. As debilitating as the situation may seem, however, such restrictions have proven beneficial in providing cost-effective alternatives for producing and performing Art Song Theatre.

As part of his BFA thesis from the University of British Columbia (UBC) (2011), Theatre Design and Production graduate, Wladimiro Woyno proposed “open-source initiatives, practical testing and research in the university setting” as a solution to adapt to such changes in an affordable manner (Woyno, 2011, p. 3). In coordination with VISI, Woyno’s team was able to produce two Art Song Theatre performances, *Try Me, Good King* by Libby Larsen and *Songs from Spoon River* by Lita Grier, with the Digital Video Illumination (DVI) research/creation systems being developed at UBC at that time.

The significance of the proposed DVI technology was that it could enhance the musical performances by using projected illustrations and lighting, not normally associated with the traditional Art Song recital, while utilizing fewer resources and staying within a fixed budget (Woyno, 2010). Woyno describes Art Song Theatre as a radical movement from the traditional recital format, in which “the songs are dramatically staged and presented with a connecting narrative or theme” (Woyno, 2011, p. 2). As such, Woyno’s goal was to incorporate the DVI process, replacing traditional stage lighting with video projection, “to envelop the story in a visually immersive ‘dreamscape’” (Woyno, 2011, p. 2). Woyno and his team were able to achieve a professional level of production quality with an equally successful critical response. From his findings, Art Song Theatre as a means to “reignite interest in the neglected Art Song canon, not only from classical music audiences, but also from new groups interested in
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

avantgarde theatre and digital media” has become more apparent, cost-effective, and, in turn, accessible (Woyno, 2011, p. 2).

Purpose of the Study

The purpose of this study was to explore the impact of adaptive methods and modalities in Art Song performance in connecting with adult audiences (aged 18 and older) as explored through a live performance of German Lieder, and to investigate possible correlations. Furthermore, it sought to examine the relationship between the performer’s ability to communicate the music and poetry and the audience’s capacity to better understand and connect to what the performer presented by incorporating multimodal applications not regularly associated with the standard format of a traditional Art Song recital.

Author H. Wesley Balk asserts in his text, Performing Power: A New Approach for the Singer-Actor, that people utilize three of their five senses for interpersonal communication (i.e. sight, hearing, and touch), providing the perceptual and projective modes for communication. While the perceptual modes (i.e. the hearing mode, the seeing mode, and the kinesthetic mode) refer to the ways in which one processes or perceives information, the projective modes (i.e. speech and singing, facial expression, and movement and touch) refer to the ways in which one delivers information (Balk, 1985).

Traditionally, the performer in an Art Song recital is limited to what he or she is allowed to do beyond the voice and face, thus largely appealing to only the hearing/vocal mode and perhaps the facial/emotional mode.

Your [the singer’s] palette of actor’s skills is very small, more limited at some times than others, and always dependant upon the particular musical style. Those actor’s skills include the eyes and face, which should always be communicating; gesture, which is not
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

often suitable; and body movement, which should be used very discreetly until later in the program, when informality increases. (Emmons and Sonntag, 1979, p. 116)

Based on Balk’s theory of perceptual and projective modes, it is expected that the incorporation of such sensory applications beyond the normative format of the Art Song recital – as seen with Art Song Theatre – will prove beneficial to improving communicative gains by allowing the performer(s) to appeal to all three of the perceptual modes for an entire audience.

Balk affirms that there exist different formulas of the three means of communication – both positive and negative. However, not all audience members will utilize the same perceptual modes, nor will their individual perceptual modes always coordinate with the performer’s projective modes. This is where the performer may face difficulty in trying to draw in an entire audience.

In the performing arts we have long known that audiences tend to divide in the music crowd (hearing mode dominants), the theatre crowd (seeing mode dominants), and the dance crowd (kinesthetic mode dominants) … It is a relatively small audience that is able to integrate their modes of perception, appreciating each separately or in combination and enjoying the complexity of interplay among them. (Balk, 1985, p. 29)

In order to alleviate this sensory segregation among performing-arts audiences, Balk encourages performers to assist their audiences in developing a higher capacity of integration by providing more opportunities that allow them to do so (Balk, 1985). As such, performers must tailor their performances to be as encompassing of all three perceptual modes as possible, rather than restrict oneself to only a select group of audience members.

In addition to Balk’s findings, the Institute for Learning Styles Research (ILSR) has continued to build upon the theories of projective and perceptual modes, specifically as they
The Impact of Expanded, Multimodal Applications

Relate to learning and teaching. Having been formally organized in 1996, the ILSR has focused its efforts on the assessment of perceptual learning style theory, as well as reevaluating and revising the means by which this theory is tested, the Multi-modal Paired Associate Learning Test (MMPALT), now in its third iteration (“Welcome to the Institute for Learning Styles Research”, n.d.).

Where Balk’s theory focuses on the three senses best associated with artistic performance (i.e. sight, hearing, and touch) and their respective perceptual and projective modes, the ILSR has identified seven distinct means of interpreting information based on all five senses.

Perceptual learning styles are the means by which learners extract information from their surroundings through the use of their five senses. Individuals have different ‘pathways’ that are specific to them. When information enters that ‘pathway’ the information is retained in short term memory. Repeated exposure and use promote retention in long term memory. The seven perceptual modes (pathways) included in this theory are print, aural, interactive, visual, haptic, kinesthetic, and olfactory. (“Overview of the Seven Perceptual Styles”, n.d., paragraph 1)

While both theories present their own individual characteristics, specifically which of the five senses are utilized more than others, Balk’s theory of perceptual and projective modes in artistic performance and the ILSR’s theory of perceptual learning adhere to the idea that repeated exposure to a particular projective mode – or a combination of projective modes – will encourage participants to utilize their respective perceptual modes more easily.

In support of these theories, Professor Rena Sharon has indirectly applied the concept of perceptual and projective modes to her own research on the application of enhanced performance modalities during an Art Song performance. Specifically, her 2012 informal experiment at the
Conceptual Structure, Discourse, and Language Conference in Vancouver determined the success of relational components (i.e. additional performers/actors) during an Art Song performance, concluding that a more expanded – albeit, theatrical – interpretation of an Art Song was more effective in establishing and maintaining a connection between performers and audience members when compared to the normative performance parameters of an Art Song recital (Sharon et al., 2013).

**Framing the research.** The current study’s conception was derived from the description of an informal experiment from 2012 by Professor Rena Sharon:

A song setting of Elizabeth Barrett-Browning’s ‘How Do I Love Thee?’ by Vancouver composer David McIntyre was performed for delegates by soprano Robyn Driedger-Klassen and pianist Rena Sharon in three modalities:

1. Traditional: singer placed at the piano with minimal stage space parameters.
2. Expanded traditional: movement and stage parameters increased.
3. Theatrical contextualization: a volunteer spontaneously drawn from the audience of delegates served as the relational character to whom the song was performed. The volunteer was instructed to respond to gestural and text cues, while the singer was instructed to imagine performing within the context of a musical theatre work.

The question posed to the audience was: Does your text comprehension and emotional connection vary in the different gestural versions? (Sharon et al., p. 379)

The event was reported anecdotally by Sharon, who noted with regret that had she and her research partners thought to devise a methodology for a survey process at the time, the data would have been invaluable – given the particular areas of expertise of the audience demographic. She further reflected that there was a strong need for this sort of investigative
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

study and data capture during an era when the Art Song professional network was urgently seeking new strategies for audience development (Sharon, Interview 1, 2018).

For those reasons (with Sharon’s enthusiastic consent and support), the researcher undertook to build a formal model drawn from the initial ad hoc exploration. The original parameters were greatly altered at a larger scale in which the three distinct performance modalities, as well as their impact on performer-audience communication, were compared and evaluated. Contrary to Sharon’s experiment, this study sought to record the data collected through more extensive testing and systematic data collection before three distinct audiences. Additionally, whereas Sharon’s study focused on the performance of a single Art Song performed in English, this study focussed on a larger collection of songs, a song cycle, in which the pieces were performed in the original German language. It is crucial to note that this experimental model did not reflect nor explore the scope of fully realized Art Song Theatre. Specifically, Art Song Theatre comprises a broad range of multimedia elements and may include multiple singing characters, full-scale theatrical production capacities (e.g. lighting, sets, multiple projection options, etc.), and extensive spoken narrative presented along the lines of opera and/or musical theatre. Nevertheless, it was assumed that the incorporation of expanded, multimodal applications found in Art Song Theatre would help resolve issues of miscommunication for the performer and misinterpretation for the audience.

Research Questions

The following questions were used to guide and frame this study:

I. When incorporated in a live performance of 18th- and 19th-century German Lieder, can expanded, multimodal applications – including modern stagecraft and theatre technology
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

– support an effective means of providing communicative gains to present-day performances of German Lieder for adult audiences?

II. To what extent can the use of expanded, multimodal applications help mitigate the obstruction of communicative gains between a performer and his or her audience during a German Lied performance without compromise to the poetic and/or musical primacy?
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

II. Literature Review

The goal of this study was to explore the impact of adaptive methods and modalities in Art Song performance in connecting with adult audiences (aged 18 and older) as explored through a live performance of German Lieder, and to investigate possible correlations. Concurrently, the present-day stagnation of this style of music based on more traditional performance practices – the Art Song recital – must be effectively addressed to support the requisite change within the way the music is performed and perceived. Given the objective of this study, the corresponding literature review has been structured according to author Graham Johnson’s three-point theory of the classical music industry from his article, “The Lied in performance”. According to Johnson, there are three distinct elements that interact with one another to ultimately determine the success of a genre of classical music, German Lieder in this instance:

The triangle made up of town, gown, and performer – between the money to buy (and thus support) the Lied, the knowledge to explicate its subtleties, and the hands-on ability to sing and play it – seems to me [Johnson] to mark out the battle lines for survival in the modern world. (Johnson, 2004, p. 317)

A career in Lieder performance today cannot succeed without any one of the three previously mentioned elements – town, gown, and performer. Though individual, each element within the industry must be acknowledged by and cooperate with the remaining two. As the aim of this study was to fully contextualize its focus and establish a clear background upon which the methodology would be designed, a variety of texts, articles, and performance reviews were considered to represent the individual components of Johnson’s three-point theory and in turn support this research.
Town: The Economy of Art

As previously stated, the Lied found its success from the ability to easily communicate the significant themes of 18th- and 19th-century Romanticism with the general public in the form of easily accessible home entertainment. Since that time, however, the Lied is no longer as accessible – certainly not to the general public, at least. Johnson asserts a connection between the Lied’s current level of inaccessibility to the general public with the removal of its everyday, more human qualities, thus deeming it only worthy to those who have dedicated their lives to further studying the theoretical composition and historical background of the artform, as explained below.

There are countless artistic disciplines, after all, which are unconnected with the realities of everyday life, and the university publications devoted to these are increasingly arcane manifestos of power-politics within academia more concerned with internal point-scoring and scholarly one-upmanship than with communicating with the outside world. (Johnson, 2004, p. 316)

Even so, Johnson emphasizes that, while the Lied may still exist within the confinement of university music programs, its success outside the realm of academia is not as strong. Furthermore, he argues that any attempt to pursue a career in Lieder performance outside post-secondary education is often futile, as the current economic state of the Lied in recital has not been in demand for quite some time: “Recital dates are rare because audiences are scarce; there is little sign that the abundance of commentary about German song is reflected by a growth industry in actual performance” (Johnson, 2004, p. 316).

By its very nature, all music – regardless of genre or style – should encourage communication or a connection. According to Johnson, the current level of appreciation for the
Lied as a monument of fine art within the vast history of Western classical music has in turn replaced the everyday, human qualities of the artform, the very qualities that helped the Lied to achieve a level of universal popularity from its conception. The simplicity and accessibility of these once simple songs has now been superseded by “the fact that its [the Lied’s] seeming inaccessibility to the common listener has given it the glamour of a minority cult” (Johnson, 2004, pp. 315-316).

**Fine art-ifacts.** While such appreciation for the genre has granted the Lied a place within the canon of Western classical music, the complexity surrounding it has further removed the Lied from the human experiences from which it was created, that is to establish an intimate connection between the performers and their audience through the synthesis of poetry and music. As a result, the Lied is no longer a genre of music for the general public. In his text, *Art as Experience*, author John Dewey expands on Johnson’s argument, explaining that all art – not just music – is inevitably constrained to forfeit the human experiences from which it was created after having achieved the status of fine art: “When an art product once attains classic status, it somehow becomes isolated from the human conditions under which it was brought into being and from the human consequences it engenders in actual life experience” (Dewey, 1934, p. 3). Contrasted with its current denomination, Dewey goes on to argue that these artifacts and compositions, now glorified as fine art, were not originally conceived for the purpose of being placed atop a pedestal of isolation; rather, they were crafted for the specific needs of human existence from that time.

Domestic utensils, furnishings of tent and house, rugs, mats, jars, pots, bows, spears, were wrought with such delighted care that today we hunt them out and give them places of honor in our art museums. Yet in their own time and place, such things were
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

enhancements of the processes of everyday life. Instead of being elevated to a niche apart, they belong to display of prowess, the manifestation of group and clan membership, worship of gods, feasting and fasting, fighting, hunting, and all the rhythmic crises that punctuate the stream of living. (Dewey, 1934, pp. 6-7)

Even today, almost all the items previously mentioned have their specific place within human existence. The utensils and dishes one uses today are not so different from the ones used hundreds of years ago; yet, such items from hundreds of years ago are now seen as unequal when compared to their modern-day equivalences. Where such items should be observed as a reflection of what human convenience once was, they are instead marveled as obelisks of fine art, severed from any human connection. It would seem, however, that the only difference between them is whether they were manufactured to accommodate the current demands of human existence or excavated from an anthropological site once home to a group of beings – still of the same species and functions for daily life as are today – hundreds of years in the past. Does this mean that present-day life will one day find its way atop a pedestal or hung on the walls of future historical museums and art galleries, and if so, when? At what point do these objects deem themselves worthy to the title of fine art?

While Dewey’s research focuses more on the philosophy and interpretation of visual art (e.g. paintings, sculptures, pottery, etc.), music and the performing arts have also fallen victim to the debate of art versus fine art and suffer the same communicative obstructions as a result. Dewey affirms the association of music and other performing arts with religious rites and celebrations of daily life (Dewey, 1934). Where such works are now segregated within the unnatural confinement of upscale performance halls and theatre houses, their very existence was conceived organically to sustain natural existence and/or to suffice social purpose. Specifically,
Dewey elaborates on how the performing arts were a vital aspect of a community or group of people’s social experience.

Music and song were intimate parts of the rites and ceremonies in which the meaning of group life was consummated. Drama was a vital reënactment of the legends and history of group life. Athletic sports, as well as drama, celebrated and enforced traditions of race and group, instructing the people, commemorating glories, and strengthening their civic pride. (Dewey, 1934, p. 7)

The Athenian Greeks observed art in all its many forms to be an act of reproduction; that is, it was meant to serve as a reflection of daily life and natural existence. This belief reinstates the affiliation that art has with human experience. Furthermore, it denounces the removal of such works from these experiences to instead be rehabilitated as works of fine art (Dewey, 1934). Similarly, the Lied was valued as a reflection of the themes and morals of the 18th and 19th centuries, perfectly preserving the conditions of human existence found at that time and still shared today. Even though these works were written more than 200 years ago, their themes transcend time and are still relevant today. Despite the overall relatability of the Lied, its ability to connect with audiences today has been obstructed due in part to the contrived impression of elitism as fine art, removed from a culture distant to that of North American, thereby abstracting itself from any human association.

**The history of art objectification.** Dewey goes further to pinpoint three socioeconomic movements relevant to the objectification and institutionalization of art: nationalism, capitalism, and internationalism. He observes the construction of museums and galleries as an attempt for an individual nation or group of people to immortalize and publicly display their national identity and imperialism (Dewey, 1934). Such examples of this include the Louvre in Paris, France.
Originally established in 1793, this museum houses the accumulation of the spoils of France’s former emperor, Napoléon Bonaparte. These priceless possessions, now housed on display for the public to gaze at with amazement, only “testify to the connection between the modern segregation of art and nationalism and militarism” (Dewey, 1934, p. 8). Beyond nationalism, the rise of capitalism further propelled the development of art galleries and performance halls and made way for the nouveaux riches. Seen as a direct biproduct of the capitalist movement, the nouveaux riches refers to a group of people that insisted on the collecting of fine art deemed to be rare and equally expensive (Dewey, 1934). Such individuals can be compared to Emmons and Sonntag’s definition of the connoisseur of good music, the members of a classical music audience from the early 20th century who only hastened to appreciate music based on whether or not it was pleasing to the prevailing taste of that time (Emmons and Sonntag, 1979). While erecting such monuments and cultural exhibits may have raised the cultural status of these works of art, their removal from the common life from which they were created in turn dissolved any association they once possessed to a native and spontaneous culture (Dewey, 1934). Today, this segregation has expanded to an international scope. As a result of international trade and the exchange of goods, specifically art, any remaining association to native status these works of art once possessed is practically eliminated. These works, once crafted from human expression and cultural enthusiasm, no longer exist as such, but simply as specimens of fine art (Dewey, 1934).

While the Lied may still exist today, its current relevancy does not compare with the success it once held during the 18th and 19th centuries. In tandem with Johnson and Dewey’s arguments of art versus fine art and the removal of human experience within art, the Lied is now venerated as “a phenomenon of the nineteenth century” (Johnson, 2004, p. 316). Such reverence for the artform, however, has in turn isolated it from a potential consumer audience. Instead of
being readily available and easily accessible to the general public, as it once was during its apogee, “European art song is brushed with the fairy-tale magic of the past… [and] these *märchenhaft* qualities are just what make the Lied… appear increasingly irrelevant to the majority” (Johnson, 2004, p. 316). In order to rectify this communicative interference, supporters of the Lied must denounce its false affiliation with the elite and thereby regain the transcendent qualities of human experience synonymous with the artform’s origins. Only then can the Lied be appreciated in its truest form: an expression of human existence, relatable to all peoples and communities, in turn creating an experience both individual and ubiquitous to everyone who encounters it.

**Gown: How to Appreciate the Artform**

The performance and appreciation of German Lieder and classical-style singing have been removed from the general public, most often found at the university level of music education and other similar academic circles deemed worthy enough to preserve the artform. Contrasted with this association with the elite, however, is the cliché archetype of the uneducated singer, or – as Johnson defines it – the “‘stupid singer’” (Johnson, 2004, p. 318). Johnson’s offensive euphemism for the vocal performer implies that such individuals willingly choose to remove themselves from the academic circles of music theory and research (i.e. musicology) to instead reside solely among groups and communities in which their ideas and interpretations can remain uninfluenced by opposing academic perspectives. Johnson’s argument implies that, even among the professional and academic circles of music performance and study, there seems to be an inability to connect with one’s colleagues. The only difference between this and that of a performer versus his or her uninformed audience (i.e. the general public) is a seemingly
conscious decision to resist establishing any sort of connection between both parties based on their respective denominations of music application (i.e. theory versus performance).

**Knowledge versus instinct.** Contrary to musicologists, Johnson asserts that a singer’s knowledge is often superseded “by something more visceral: instinct in bucketloads, instinct for what sounds and feels right” (Johnson, 2004, p. 320). Where the composer may be the individual responsible for arranging the piece and setting the text, it is ultimately the singer who is entrusted to breathe life into the music based on his or her personal experiences and imagination. Often, the singer’s instincts may lead him or her to interpret the piece differently from what the composer may have envisioned, but that is not to say that the singer’s performance is wrong. As a collaborative pianist and vocal coach, Johnson adheres to the idea that there is no such thing as a definitive performance (Johnson, 2004). That is to say that, despite what evidence the musicologist may discover surrounding the composer’s original intentions for his or her work, the singer may choose to perform the piece differently based on instinct and his or her emotional connection with the piece. This is how the singer will ultimately communicate his or her interpretation of the piece to the audience: by establishing an emotional connection that is both honest and relatable to those who are willing to listen. Helfgot and Beeman summarize this dynamic conflict of knowledge versus instinct through Richard Wagner’s opera, *Die Meistersinger*.

It is the conflict between the pedant, Beckmesser and the free-spirited Walther von Stoltzing. Beckmesser sits behind his curtain and ticks off every mistake that Walther makes as he sings. But Walther sings what he feels in his heart with no inhibitions. He sings what he feels is *right*. He triumphs artistically while Beckmesser slinks off. (Helfgot and Beeman, 1993, p. 226)
This is not to say, however, that a singer is free to do as he or she pleases with a piece of music, rejecting any historical accounts of how the piece may have been originally performed. Instinct, like personal opinion, “has to be schooled and refined by teaching and coaching, encouraged to grow and then cut down to size when necessary” (Johnson, 2004, p. 320). Rather than simply being referred to as artists, professional singers should more appropriately be considered craftspersons, those who have dedicated years of practice and evaluation to understanding the unique skills required to master a specific trade – music, in this case. As a craftsperson, a singer can construct a well-informed interpretation of a piece of music based on artistic deliberation and what is considered possible within his or her physical capabilities, as opposed to the preconceived notion of being born from God-given talent and artistry (Johnson, 2004).

**Interpretation throughout history.** According to Johnson, Lieder perfectly encapsulates the balance between an informed opinion and human instinct. Within the realm of Lieder, there exists a controversy between the singing voice and the written text and which one should take precedent. To rule in favour of the former may result in an overtly affectionate comic projection, but to rule in favour of the latter runs the risk of presenting the piece with insensitivity and a lack of imagination (Johnson, 2004). While the latter style may be better associated with such post-war singers as Dietrich Fischer-Diskau, it dates further back to Franz Schubert’s favourite singer, Austrian baritone Johann Michael Vogl (Johnson, 2004). While the composer may have admired what Vogl was able to bring to his music, Vogl’s off-the-voice colour and word-painting left most audiences divided between admiration and disregard.

Despite Vogl’s association with this style of song interpretation, Johnson admits that Fischer-Diskau epitomized the style as a movement, given its juxtaposition against the pre-war phenomenon of the “ultra-manliness of German male singers… held up to be a golden example
of unaffected singing” (Johnson, 2004, pp. 323-324). Furthermore, it is Johnson’s belief that Fischer-Diskau’s justification for a more enthusiastic reaction to the written text rather than the singing voice was influenced by his country’s immediate past and the need to remove himself from such traditions as a result: “His [Fischer-Diskau’s] was a younger generation that needed to remind the world of German sensibility and flexibility rather than the grandiose and marmoreal (to say the very least) aspirations of Germany in the 1930s and 1940s” (Johnson, 2004, p. 324). Almost 100 years after the fact, the debate between vocal mastery and reverence for the text within Lieder performance persists, as the artform demands a balance between both. One is not better than the other; to that end, every singer who attempts these pieces will interpret them differently given their respective human nature; as such, they will each face their own respective battles to achieve this balance. Furthermore, every audience member will have his or her own personal agenda for what he or she will listen, whether that is the voice or the attention to detail for the written text (Balk, 1985).

According to Johnson, vocal performance – whether studying an opera role or any style of Art Song (e.g. European, North American, South American, etc.) – puts forth a demand for the singer to approach the music with both an educated and instinctive interpretation. Every talented Lieder singer will approach the piece differently, given his or her knowledge and experiences, and will in turn create a performance unique to his or her identity. Despite the individuality of each performer’s process and outcome, their intention to sing with emotional vulnerability in addition to an informed opinion is unanimous. To interpret the music based on an informed opinion stems from tradition, and the “fascination of song interpretation is that it is not exempt from the influence of history and of Zeitgeist” (Johnson, 2004, p. 324). In this instance, Fischer-Diskau was influenced by the immediate events of the Second World War to break from the
previous traditions of Lieder singing; his reverence and sensitivity for the text was consistent
with that of Vogl more than 100 years earlier. Furthermore, to sing with emotional vulnerability
comes from a desire to defy tradition and create something new in the hope of reinvigorating the
artform. That is not to say that the traditions of Lieder singing should be completely abolished in
an attempt to restore the popularity of Lieder for the 21st-century audience. Instead, the traditions
of Lieder singing and the composer’s intentions need to be revered as a starting point to
appreciate the music for what it is and how it was created. Only from that foundation can the
performance customs be altered to create a more accessible experience for both the performers
and the audience. In this instance, present-day advocates are achieving this balance through their
continuing innovation for the expansion of Art Song performance practice. Instead of searching
for a non-existent, definitive interpretation of a piece of music, the Lieder singer must be
prepared to constantly question and adapt his or her perspective to attain a seemingly impossible
balance for this perpetually dynamic artform.

**Performer: Hands-on Application**

Coordinated behaviour is a naturally occurring phenomenon among all biological
organisms. Such behaviours as speech and gesture are further tempered and refined to create a
desired outcome considered appealing or appropriate by the reciprocating individual or group of
people (Sharon et al., 2013). Over time, this process instills upon its participants a standard for
how these refined behaviours should be executed without exception and are passed on to the next
generation. This is how the protocols – the traditions – of performing German Lieder became
standardized more than 200 years ago. While beneficial in establishing the history and rudiments
of performance practice at the beginner level, tradition can also constrain the other possible
options of interpreting a piece of music (Sharon et al., 2013). Professor Rena Sharon, along with
authors Laurel Fais and Eric Vatikiotis-Bateson, analyze the parameters of Art Song performance, highlighting the challenges faced by performers as a result of these parameters when trying to effectively communicate the intentions of the music to present-day, uninformed audiences. This is done in order to support the expansion of the current performance style of the artform for the sake of creating a stronger connection between performers and audiences of Art Song. In this instance, expanding the performance parameters of the Art Song recital, as seen with Art Song Theatre, is the prescribed medium to rectify this problem. However, Art Song Theatre is not the first or the only attempt that has been made to reconfigure the protocols of a genre of classical vocal music in the present day; as such, reviews of such performances have been considered for this literature review in support of Sharon and her colleague’s research.

**Projected translations.** It has been argued that the current performance parameters of the Art Song recital do not provide an effective means for performers to clearly communicate the meaning or interpretation of a piece of German Lieder. Beyond these parameters, however, the Art Song duo is already challenged to communicate to an uninformed audience based on the lack of knowledge or familiarity with the artform (Sharon et al., 2013). At the core of Art Song – whether German Lieder, French *Mélodie*, Spanish *Cancion*, etc. – is a synthesis of spoken language and musical sound. When executed properly, Professor Rena Sharon and company argue that the themes and narrative of the poetry are heightened by the music to “trigger a powerful cascade of multimodal synesthetic and visceral cognition” (Sharon et al., 2013, p. 369). Unfortunately, the delicate balance between music and text is often heavily one-sided. For the uninformed audience, connecting to a classically trained vocalist reciting German poetry through song can prove to be difficult when the audience is not familiar with the language. The audience’s insecurity with the language, according to Sharon and her colleagues, is one of the
more prominent elements ultimately responsible for the lack of interest towards German Lieder from the modern-day general public.

Informal surveys gathered over the past 10 years indicate that… a large percentage describe disaffection for Art Song ranging from mild alienation to hostile antipathy. Rather than feeling united in a space of heightened communal understanding, listeners often express a sense of being ‘left out of the enlightened and sophisticated inner circle’.

Common complaints include feeling unengaged, citing incomprehensibility of text, expressive monotony, [and] emotional distance. (Sharon et al., 2013, p. 370)

This communicative obstruction does not exist only within the realm of Art Song. A large portion of Western classical vocal music has been written in several different languages outside the level of familiarity to the general public of North America (e.g. French, Italian, Russian, etc.). As such, appropriate countermeasures have been taken to resolve this language barrier while still maintaining a level of respect and tradition for the artform. The most well-known countermeasure in this instance is projected translations, specifically for operatic performances.

In January of 1983, the Canadian Opera Company (COC) first utilized an English translation projected above the proscenium simultaneously during its production of Richard Strauss’ opera, *Elektra*, having been performed in the original German. Originally developed to counter the opera house’s problematic acoustics, this projection technology – having been trademarked by the COC as “supertitles” – is now an integral production aspect for most major opera companies (Brown, 2010).¹ Acrimony surrounding the practicality and sophistication of

---

¹ Surtitles is the current terminology used by the COC, current via their website. Supertitles is what they were referred to in New York City since the COC and Gunta Dreifelds filed for copyright of the terminology – John Leberg and Gunta Dreifelds were the original developers of the technology (Plan Your Visit, n.d.). Western University’s Opera Workshop program was the first university program in North America to use this technology for its productions (Opera, n.d.).
this technology, however, quickly emerged following its premier. In addition to serving as a distraction to the audience due to the distance between the performers and the translations, surtitles were considered a disruption for the performers and the work, being denounced as “a celluloid condom inserted between the audience and the immediate gratification of understanding” (Brown, 2010, paragraph 2).

Beyond the premiere of this technology, Dr. Christina Margaret Alves further investigated the effectiveness and preference of supertitles within American opera companies as part of her research for her DMA monograph from Louisiana State University and Agricultural and Mechanical College (1991). According to Alves, the use of supertitles continues to be one of the most controversial topics in the classical music industry: “Although the primary purpose is to enable the audience to understand a foreign text, there is an ongoing controversy over whether supertitles enhance an opera performance or detract from it” (Alves, 1991, p. vi). Alves’ research involved analyzing the history of supertitles from its predecessors (i.e. silent-film subtitles), documenting the resources and skillset associated with the technology, and highlighting the observed controversy as well as documented preferences and opinions surrounding supertitles. The overarching goal of Alves’ research was to provide further insight on the use and effectiveness of supertitles for both opera companies, primarily those still hesitant about utilizing the technology, and opera goers.

From her research, Alves concluded that supertitles have provided a new dimension within opera performance; however, they are only effective when they are developed and operated at the professional level. As such, the demand for the proper equipment and personnel can often be a detractor for opera companies to utilize such technology (Alves, 2011). Furthermore, Alves argues that the controversy of supertitles may never be fully resolved given
the dynamic opinions of both those attending the performances and – just as important – those performing the work. Regarding the latter, the fear of such technology interfering with the overall artistry of the performance can be concerning.

Artists who feel strongly that canned text is out of place in live theatre, and who have clout, could perhaps do more. A contract clause reading, say, ‘Miss Marton does not sing with titles’ would be not an act of prima donna presumption, but a genuine service to opera. (Alves, 1991, p. 86)

In conclusion, however, Alves reaffirms that the use of supertitles should never impede one’s focus on the opera: “The attention of the audience should remain on the music, drama, and artists; important elements which make opera unique among other artforms” (Alves, 1991, p. 86). Nevertheless, Alves supports the use of supertitles as a means of enhancing an operatic performance, particularly for those who are unfamiliar with the language in which the piece is being performed and ensuring the future of opera in America.

Despite such criticisms, projected translations have been commended for serving both audiences and performers in understanding and being understood. Wagner, a proponent of complete immersion in the art, expected his works to be translated and performed in several different languages for the sake of audience comprehension, rather than interfere with the performance by illuminating the auditorium so that the audience could follow along in their personal libretti (Brown, 2010). Since its inception, projected translations have been improved upon for the sake of further convenience, so much so that opera companies, such as the Metropolitan Opera in New York and La Scala in Milan, allow their audiences to individually select the preferred language for translations via the monitors on the reverse side of each chair (Brown, 2010).
Projected illustrations and non-traditional stagecraft. Inspired by the success of this technology, the use of projected translations has been incorporated into other performances of classical vocal music outside the realm of opera. Specifically, Professor Rena Sharon’s work with Art Song through the SONGFIRE Theatre Alliance has utilized projected translations and has received similar success in terms of not abdicating its audience from an Art Song performance brought on by a language barrier (Varty, 2013). In addition, Sharon’s work has also encouraged projected graphics alongside the translations to further relieve any miscommunication between the performers and the audience, as well as to evoke specific themes and ideas found within the music (Sharon, Interview 1, 2018).

One of the more well-known examples of this concept comes from a professional Art Song performance. German bass-baritone Mathias Goerne and pianist Mark Hinterhäuser gave a performance of Schubert’s song cycle, Winterreise (Op. 89), at the Sydney Festival in Australia in January of 2016. Contrary to any other performance of this work by the same duo, Goerne and Hinterhäuser were placed in front of a filmic backdrop provided by South African artist and director William Kentridge. The production was a major success, with Kentridge having been commended for his appreciation for the music through his projections.

For the visual element, Kentridge has drawn on a wide range of pre-existing works created over the last 25 years, fusing them with a wealth of new ideas into something mostly cohesive and always intellectually and emotionally engaging. Working on several planes simultaneously, he hints at connections rather than illustrates, never narrating but creating resonances that sometimes go far beyond the relatively literal poetry of Wilhelm Müller’s 24 songs. (Paget, 2016, paragraph 3)
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

In addition to Kentridge’s contribution, Goerne further capitalized on this production by incorporating a full range of physical gesture and movement in coordination with the music and the projections, never interfering with the work itself.

Clutching to the piano as if terrified at times of being sucked into the nightmare of his [Goerne’s] own subconscious, the weary plod of ‘Gute Nacht’ suggest he has gone on this journey many times before. He acts with his whole body, and when he turns to stare and is met by the mirror image of a Kentridge eye staring back it’s almost unbearable.

(Paget, 2016, paragraph 4)

The overall performance was regarded as a “gripping Transvaal,” both hypnotizing and provoking (Paget, 2016, paragraph 1). Using intense visual effects, both Kentridge’s projections and Goerne’s non-traditional stagecraft, the audience was immediately drawn into the performers’ interpretation of Müller’s text and Schubert’s music without ever questioning the words being sung or the intentions behind them.

Such performances are commended for going beyond the normative culmination of music and poetry for an Art Song performance by further capitalizing on the synthesis of art in all its forms to create a completely new artistic experience. As explained by Elliot, this was the mentality of all peoples – both the creators and the consumers – during the Romantic period.

The richness of the German poetic tradition in the hands of great masters such as [Johann Wolfgang von] Goethe, [Heinrich] Heine, [Friedrich] Rückert, and others helped shape the course of the Romantic movement. Poems and vast landscape paintings depicted the individual’s place in the natural world and helped define the German national identity. The growing educated middle class in German-speaking countries showed a heightened interest in poetry and art, as well as an increased appetite for literature, science, and
music… Many Romantics sought to synthesize numerous artistic elements into a unified whole, eventually epitomized by Wagner in his music dramas and his concept of the Gesamtkunstwerk. (Elliot, 2006, pp. 160-161)

Rather than focusing on the performance of German Lieder as simply an example of the parameters instilled at that time to preserve the artform, contemporary artists, such as Goerne and Kentridge along with Sharon and the SONGFIRE Theatre Alliance, have taken advantage of the culmination of all forms of art – as it was originally epitomized during the 18th and 19th centuries. By doing so, these artists can communicate to modern-day audiences the themes and ideals of the Romantic period through a newly invigorated and accessible modality.

Additional performers. Beyond sensory effects separate from the performers, the performers themselves can be utilized to heighten a performance beyond the singing voice. As previously discussed, the performer in an Art Song recital is restricted to what he or she is permitted to do with movement and physical gesture, so much so that they become heavily dependant on facial expression (Emmons and Sonntag, 1979). The reason for these limitations is to allow the audience and the performers to focus only on the text being sung, as it is believed that “physical gesture dilutes the intensity of authentic expression through the musical channel” (Sharon et al., 2013, p. 372). Furthermore, while such advocates of this practice admit to the limitations of Art Song’s more normative performance protocols, specifically how the performer is able to interpret the piece, they concede to the idea that “within the bounds of these restrictions, the opportunities for expression are immense, because they [the performers] have both words and interplay, at their disposal” (Hemlsey, 1998, p. 114). In fact, Robert Schumann, one of the most widely recognized composers and proponents of the Art Song genre during its infancy, advocated a performance setting even more subdued than the current traditions of the
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

Art Song recital: “Lieder, as suggested in his [Schumann’s] *Neue Zeitschrift für Musik*, were ideally to be sung alone in a private space or to a small circle of close friends” (Sharon et al., 2013, pp. 372-373).

While most of the Art Song written is intended to be performed by an individual singer, several songs have been written as a dialogue or a conversation. By the end of the 20th century, the common practice for Art Song performers still insisted upon minimal gesture and movement. It was not until the early 21st century that an “unnamed world-renowned baritone,” who upon further research was revealed to be Swedish baritone Håkan Hagegård, challenged the common practice during an Art Song recital where he “claimed about 12 square feet of stage space and extensive complex gestural expressivity more commensurate with operatic parameters” (Sharon et al., 2013, p. 372). The responses following this performance were divided as well as heavily influenced on the audience’s familiarity with the genre of music.

The extreme polarization of views following his [Hagegård’s] performance articulated the conundrum: many professionals found his stagecraft objectionable, while the general audience manifested a prolonged ovation and reported an immediacy of emotional connection and comprehension. (Sharon et al., 2013, p. 372)

Even Hagegård later referred to his actions as being “‘renegade’,” fully aware that the choices he made were not well-advised within the performance parameters of a traditional Art Song performance at that time (Sharon et al., 2013, p. 372). Nevertheless, the juxtaposition of responses from this performance helped Sharon and her colleagues to pose the daunting question surrounding the future of Art Song: “Can artistic integrities be sustained in an array of adaptive practices for the 21st century audience?” (Sharon et al., 2013, p. 372)
Beyond this performance, the question of appropriate stagecraft during an Art Song recital has been further tempered against similarly divided audiences with comparable results. In 2002, for instance, baritone Simon Keenlyside collaborated with choreographer Trisha Brown to produce and perform a completely original production of Schubert’s *Winterreise*. Having asked Brown to help him give Schubert’s masterpiece a “choreographic makeover,” Keenlyside’s performance included both singing and dancing while onstage with three additional dancers (Brown, 2003, paragraph 5). For a classically trained singer, balancing choreographed movement and proper vocal production can seem daunting. Having worked with opera singers before, however, Brown’s staging was focussed on rudimentary maneuvers in order to never interfere with Keenlyside’s singing, nevertheless producing a stunning performance of movement and sound.

Brown, like many choreographers, draws on her dancers’ intimate familiarity with her likes and dislikes, aesthetic preferences and expressive pitch. Keenlyside has none of this training, and yet he had the courage – and physical flexibility – to take an equal part in Brown’s spare, intricate body weavings. And there are some extraordinary flashes – singing while lying suspended by the dancers in one song, executing a dazzling leap in another. (Brown, 2003, paragraph 12)

Despite the performance’s overall success, having nine sold-out shows following its New York premiere, Keenlyside explains that his intentions were never rooted in improving upon tradition for the sake of drawing in larger audiences.

‘I [Keenlyside] get a bit belligerent about it: there is no better way to do a recital than with a piano and a singer – dress code aside – on a platform. If you were reciting poetry, you wouldn’t do anything other than pin people to their seats with intention, with nuance,
and with subtlety – in their own language, of course. There is the problem: this work is in German. And we English have a reputation in the opera world for being good theatre animals, I think it’s because we deal constantly in foreign languages. But you can fall into a tendency to mum and mug your meaning to the audience.’ (Brown, 2003, paragraph 8-9)

Keenlyside’s intentions for this production stemmed from his desire to collaborate with Brown, having worked with her previously in 1998 during a production of Claudio Monteverdi’s *Orfeo*, in a non-operatic setting, specifically *Winterreise*. Despite his opinions on the purity of the Art Song recital, Keenlyside’s original production of *Winterreise* turned out to be a major success in support of reimagining an out-of-date artform for a new audience (Brown, 2003).

Based on the diversity of responses from non-traditional Art Song performances, Sharon and her colleagues have identified two contributing factors:

1) the traditions of the era and culture of the composer, and 2) current gestural styles of the country in which the song is being performed, acknowledging that in circumstances where language comprehension is challenged, meaning-making is further compromised when culturally normative interaction of gesture and speech are diminished or extracted. (Sharon et al., 2013, p. 374)

While audience members who are already familiar with the genre may disagree with such attempts to incorporate unconventional stagecraft during an Art Song performance, such as the previous examples provided, these non-traditional performances have proven themselves to be easily accessible in terms of communicating the themes and topics – though already made aware to the professional observers – to audiences unfamiliar with the artform. Furthermore, therein lies the objective of this study. These methods have been developed to allow both performers and
uninformed audiences the chance to better understand and appreciate the work, ultimately giving
Art Song newfound performance opportunities needed to survive and succeed today.

By analyzing the previously discussed techniques and methods of multimodal
performance with Art Song Theatre and classical-style singing, such practices have the potential
to benefit both the performer’s and audience’s capacity to properly interpret Art Song and
connect with it. By expanding its pre-existing parameters, Art Song has the potential to regain its
accessibility by establishing a stronger performer-audience connection.

Summary

Using Johnson’s three-point theory of the classical music industry, the literature reviewed
for this study has been structured in such a way as to establish a foundation for the continuation
of this research. In addition, it has allowed for numerous other forms of research, fields of study,
as well as their respective literature to become more readily apparent, accessible, and applicable
to this research. Such resources and fields of study included theatre production, performance
management, and the principles of acting for singing.

Lieder as a coalesced genre of two distinct artforms (i.e. music and poetry) further
emphasizes the level of emotional vulnerability and informed opinion necessary when studying
such works. The transparency of the themes emphasized in the lyrics – the poetry – of the Lied
reinforces the genre’s accessibility, despite having been written more than 200 years ago. The
accessibility of these themes, however, is inhibited by the more fixed, limiting performance
parameters of the Art Song recital. Furthermore, the mindset of the audience is dynamic and has
changed substantially since the mid-19th century. Therefore, performers of Art Song, whether
German Lieder or any other form, should be encouraged to explore, experiment, and expand
upon the predetermined parameters of the Art Song recital. The necessary coordination of the
knowledge of German Lieder, the ability to perform it, and the willingness to appreciate it presents a strong case for the continued survival and hopeful rejuvenation of this genre of music for the 21st-century audience.
III. Methodology

The primary objective for this study was to explore the impact of adaptive methods and modalities in Art Song performance in connecting with adult audiences (aged 18 and older) as explored through a live performance of German Lieder, and to investigate possible correlations. Despite its earlier success, the overall relevancy and popularity of the Lied has diminished, with the genre becoming “increasingly isolated into a specialized audience sector, even in the European countries of its [Art Song’s/German Lieder’s] native origins” (Sharon et al., 2013, p. 370). While the way in which the Lied is being presented (i.e. the Art Song recital) has helped to preserve the traditions of the Art Song genre, such performance parameters have shown limited appeal to modern-day audiences (Varty, 2013). To prevent the Lied from being marginalized any further, countermeasures have been taken to alter the traditional performance parameters and revitalize the genre through enhanced performance modalities (e.g. theatrical movement and gesture, props and costumes, projected translations, etc.).

Specifically, Art Song Theatre has the potential to allow the general public to better connect with German Lieder while concurrently maintain an appreciation for the artform from its original conception. As such, this study attempted to systematically understand the overall effectiveness of expanded Art Song performance practices, including those affiliated with Art Song Theatre, as a means of providing communicative gains to present-day performances of German Lieder for college-educated adult audiences.

According to Balk’s theory of perceptual and projective modes, individual audience members at an artistic performance will process the same performance differently based on their individual perceptual modes (i.e. the hearing mode, the seeing mode, and the kinesthetic mode). As a result, performers must be willing to effectively coordinate all three projective modes (i.e.}
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

speech and singing, facial expression, and movement and touch) to an artistic performance in order to appease the corresponding perceptual modes of their audience, rather than tailor their performance to the specific needs of certain individuals (Balk, 1985). By achieving a balance between all three modes, this may help to alleviate any interference for performers to connect with their audience and enhance the level of communicative gains between both groups as a result.

The study’s conception was derived from the description of a 2012 informal experiment by Professor Rena Sharon, in which she indirectly applied Balk’s theory of perceptual and projective modes. This study compared three distinct performance modalities, similar to those from Sharon’s study, and their respective impact on the level of communicative gains between performers and audience members: (1) traditional, referring to the minimalist setting and stagecraft of a traditional Art Song recital with translations printed as a physical handout; (2) expanded traditional, increasing the aspects of gesture and movement from the first modality and adding projected translations; (3) theatrical contextualization, applying the techniques of expanded Art Song performance practice, including movement and gesture, props and costumes, projected illustrations, translations projected as supertitles, and additional performers.

As previously discussed, the current study’s experimental model does not reflect nor explore the scope of fully realized Art Song Theatre, which comprises a broad range of multimedia elements and may include multiple singing characters, full-scale theatrical production capacities (e.g. lighting, sets, multiple projection options, etc.), and extensive spoken narrative – occasionally improvisatory but generally scripted and memorized, presented along the lines of opera and/or music theatre. Rather, this was a preliminary study that sought to encourage a mobilization of follow-up research. Inspired by Sharon’s findings to acquire more
formalized data, this study proposed to simulate some aspects of her conference study in a larger format. The researcher’s decision to itemize the three sets as such was to ensure that the full scope of practices and techniques for Art Song and classical-style singing available for this study, as well as their varying levels of application, could be evaluated.

**Design**

This study was based on the hypothesis that the more expanded the performance modality of the Art Song performance, the higher the level of communicative gains between the performer(s) and their audience will be. The intention of this study was to assess the impact of one’s knowledge and/or familiarity on the topic of Art Song, specifically German Lieder (first independent variable), in combination with varying levels of performance modality (second independent variable), on the level of communicative gains between the performer(s) and audience during an Art Song performance (dependent variable). As previously mentioned, the level of performance modality during each of the three Art Song performances (i.e. traditional, expanded traditional, and theatrical contextualization) was observed as the treatment to which the participants responded, thereby serving as the second independent variable.

The target population for this study was adult audiences (aged 18 and older) with a minimum post-secondary level of education. The sample, however, was taken from the students and faculty located specifically at Western University. Furthermore, this study focussed particularly on the responses from the audience in relation to their level of knowledge and/or familiarity on the topic of Art Song, specifically German Lieder. This was the first independent variable.

The first independent variable was considered based on Professor Rena Sharon and her colleague’s reference to an unconventional Art Song performance from the early 2000s. During
this performance, Håkan Hagegård gave a performance of Art Song but incorporated stagecraft and movement not considered to be in the traditional style of the genre. As a result, the audience’s responses were heavily divided between disapproval from other professionals within the artform and immediate emotional connection and ovation from the uninformed general public (Sharon et al., 2013). Based on this evidence, participants were divided into three subgroups: (A) an informed audience at the minimum post-secondary level of music education; (B) an uninformed audience at the minimum post-secondary level of education, not in Music; (C) an informed audience including both experienced concertgoers and individuals at the professional level of music performance and/or pedagogy. The participants were subdivided as such to determine if their responses would reflect their respective subgroup, as supported by the previously stated findings.

Exposure and observation. This study collected numerical and qualitative data through surveys and interviews. The three subgroups of participants, as determined by the first independent variable, were exposed to and recorded their observations from the same treatment – in all three of its varying capacities, as dictated by the second independent variable – as a collective audience (Figure 1).

Figure 1. Illustration of the study’s exposure and observation

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{Group A} & \quad \{X_1\quad O_1\quad X_2\quad O_2\quad X_3\quad O_3\\
\text{Group B} & \quad \{X_1\quad O_1\quad X_2\quad O_2\quad X_3\quad O_3\\
\text{Group C} \end{align*}
\]

The following illustration has been notated according to the notation system provided by Campbell and Stanley (1966): “X represents an exposure of a group to an experimental variable or event, the effects of which are to be measured; O represents an observation or measurement
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

[the surveys]; X’s and O’s in a given row are applied to the same specific persons… The left-to-right dimension indicates the temporal order” (Creswell, 1994, p. 131).

With respect to the diagram, Groups A, B, and C have been used to represent the three subgroups of participants that took part in this study (i.e. Group A, informed; Group B, uninformed; Group C, professional). Despite this itemization, all three subgroups were exposed to and recorded their responses to the treatment as a collective audience rather than individually. The treatment, represented by X, refers to the three sets and their respective level of performance modality (i.e. traditional, expanded traditional, and theatrical contextualization). Following each set, the impact of the treatment was measured and recorded by the participants using surveys, as represented by O. Once a treatment had been both tested and recorded, the proceeding treatment would commence. At the conclusion of the study, three sets of exposure and observation occurred; this has been indicated by the subscripted numeration in the diagram.

Sample/Participant Selection

This study focussed on adult audiences (aged 18 and older) with a minimum post-secondary level of education. The data collected from this sample was not used to generalize its findings to a larger population (Creswell, 1994). Within this demographic, participants were itemized into three subgroups based on their level of prior classical music training and/or familiarity with Art Song, specifically German Lieder (i.e. informed, uninformed, and professional).

For the sake of convenience, given that the study was conducted at Western University’s Don Wright Faculty of Music, the sample audience was collected from the same environment (i.e. students and faculty at Western University). This sample was representative of the first and third subgroups, the informed audience at the minimum post-secondary level of music education and the informed audience including both experienced concertgoers and individuals at the
professional level of music performance and/or pedagogy. As such, there was no intention of representing a wider population outside the sample. Based on the intentions of this study, given that it focussed on a captive audience (i.e. participants within an educational institution), convenience sampling was the specific method of non-probability sampling utilized to obtain the participants required (Cohen, Manion, and Morrison, 2011). This strategy of sampling involved selecting “the nearest individuals to serve as respondents and continuing that process until the required sample size [had] been obtained” (Cohen et al., 2011, p. 155). Whereas the first and third subgroups drew their sampling from Western University’s Don Wright Faculty of Music, particularly voice and collaborative-piano majors and faculty, the second subgroup focussed its sampling on Western University’s other faculties (e.g. Business, Engineering, Human Kinetics, etc.).

The number of completed surveys confirmed that there were 70 participants who participated in this portion of the study, ten participants more than what was determined to be the ideal number of participants in order to attain sufficient data. Regarding the number of participants within each of the three subgroups, however, the sample sizes were unbalanced. Specifically, 37 participants, more than half the number of total participants, categorized themselves within Subgroup A – post-secondary or graduate student/alum in Music. The remaining two subgroups – Subgroup B, post-secondary or graduate student/alum not in Music, and Subgroup C, experienced concertgoer.professional in Music – had a total number of 18 and 15 participants respectively. As a result, data from the larger subgroup was randomly reduced to achieve a number equal to the least-represented subgroup. This was only done when comparing the results across the three subgroups, as part of the cross-sectional survey, and not when analyzing the findings from each on its own.
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

Both advertisement and incentive measures were taken to gather the sample. Electronic advertisements (i.e. recruitment emails) and physical posters were the primary means of promoting this study. These materials were designed and approved in coordination with the researcher’s supervisors, academic advisory committee, as well as Western University’s Ethics Committee. All materials clearly stated the objective of the study, its process and procedures, the projected duration of the study, and additional incentive. Furthermore, it clearly stated that all testing and data analysis would remain anonymous throughout the duration of the study. This was done to reduce – if not remove – the potential for personal confrontation, biases, or mistrust between the researcher and the participants. As for incentive, individuals who participated in the study were automatically entered into a raffle, the prize for which was an Apple iTunes gift-card valued at $50.00. The winner of the raffle was determined at the conclusion of the study.

Prior to submitting any promotional materials, the university – specifically, the dean or head of each department – was contacted via formal letter. This letter provided the same information pertaining to the study as the promotional materials. Only when a department had given its written consent was participant selection permitted within that department. Following this, a mass email was sent to the students and faculty within each department that had given its signed consent. In addition, physical posters were then posted on any available news bulletins within that department. All advertisement measures occurred at the beginning of the 2018-2019 fall semester.

Process and Protocol

The study was presented as a lecture recital, which took place at Western University’s Don Wright Faculty of Music (von Kuster Hall) on September 28th of 2018 as part of the Don Wright Faculty of Music’s Fridays @ 12:30 concert series. Prior to entering the performance
hall, participants received a survey, in which Section One of the survey determined their respective knowledge and/or familiarity of Art Song and German Lieder, thereby identifying with which of the three subgroups they best associated themselves.

The lecture recital presented an adapted version of Robert Schumann’s nine-piece song cycle, *Liederkreis* (Op. 24). As previously mentioned, Schumann has been referenced in his *Neue Zeitschrift für Musik* as saying he preferred Art Song to be performed in a more private, more intimate setting than the current traditions of the Art Song recital (Sharon et al., 2013). Despite the composer’s performance preference, the researcher chose to present the aforenoted song cycle, rather than a work from a more dramatically inclined composer, because of the overall thematic similarities of German Romanticism shared throughout the nine individual songs. As such, the larger work was arranged and performed as three self-sustaining – though still unifying – sets:
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

1. Set One
   1.1. Song No. 1 “Morgens steh’ ich auf und frage”
   1.2. Song No. 2 “Es treibt mich hin, es treibt mich her”
   1.3. Song No. 3 “Ich wandelte unter den Bäumen”

2. Set Two
   2.1. Song No. 4 “Lieb’ Liebchen, leg’s Händchen aufs Herze mein”
   2.2. Song No. 5 “Schöne Wiege meiner Leiden”
   2.3. Song No. 6 “Warte, warte, wilder Schiffmann”

3. Set Three
   3.1. Song No. 7 “Berg’ und Burgen schau’n herunter”
   3.2. Song No. 8 “Anfangs wollt’ ich fast verzagen”
   3.3. Song No. 9 “Mit Myrten und Rosen, lieblich und hold”

Additionally, each set of songs was performed according to one of the three levels of varying
performance modality (i.e. Set One – traditional, Set Two – theatrical contextualization, and Set
Three – expanded traditional). Participants notated their personal responses to each set in Section
Two of the survey; each set of songs had its own corresponding set of similar survey questions
(i.e. Set One – Section Two-A, Set Two – Section Two-B, and Set Three – Section Two-C). The
results gathered thereby contributed to understanding which of the three performance modalities
utilized during the lecture recital was most effective in establishing communicative gains
between the performer(s) and the audience.

Data Collection

Surveys. Data was collected by means of a survey containing 26 items. The majority of
these were Likert-like items based on a scale as they pertain to participants’ responses to the
lecture recital’s three varying sets, as well as factual information relating to participants’ level of prior classical music training and/or familiarity with Art Song. All information used in this analysis was derived from survey data determined from Professor Rena Sharon’s 2012 research and the National Endowment for the Arts’ (NEA) Survey of Public Participation in the Arts (SPPA).

While surveys may vary in their level of complexity (e.g. simple frequency counts versus relational analysis), the purpose of a survey is typically to “gather data at a particular point in time with the intention of describing the nature of existing conditions, or identifying standards against which existing conditions can be compared, or determining the relationships that exist between specific events” (Cohen et al., 2011, p. 256). They are most often used to describe or measure potentially generalized aspects within a broader scope of issues or peoples. A survey can be determined by several different aspects:

- Gathers data on a one-shot basis and hence is economical and efficient; … generates numerical data; … [and/or] captures data from multiple choice, closed questions, test scores or observation schedules. (Cohen et al., 2011, p. 256)

Surveys can be classified as either exploratory or confirmatory, based on whether a hypothesis has been put forward, as well as descriptive or analytic, based on whether the data and/or variables are observed or tested respectively. Such data can include factual information, preference, predictions, opinions, and/or experiences (Cohen et al., 2011). Furthermore, the data collected from surveys can either be completed by the researcher or administered by the participants.

Regarding this study, the survey utilized was a confirmatory and analytic survey. This means that the survey was designed according to a hypothesis. Specifically, the hypothesis was
the more expanded the performance modality of the Art Song performance, the higher the level of communicative gains between the performer(s) and their audience will be. As such, the survey sought to test the impact of the independent variables (i.e. one’s prior classical music training and/or familiarity with Art Song, specifically German Lieder, and the varying levels of performance modality) on the dependent variable (i.e. the level of communicative gains between the performer and audience during an Art Song performance). Furthermore, the survey was administered by the participants to collect nominal data on the participants’ background and personal information in addition to their behavior and experiences during the lecture recital.

The data collection for the survey was contained within the same timeframe in which the participants were exposed to the treatment. This means that the overall study was further classified as a cross-sectional study. While cross-sectional studies can provide data that can be further applied to a longitudinal study, in which multiple cross-sectional studies are utilized at various times with different samples, this study strictly focussed on creating a snap-shot of the sample audience and its response to the treatment from only the lecture recital.

The rationale for using Likert-like items for this survey was to draw the participants’ attention to specific aspects of the performance that were both valuable and underappreciated during a traditional Art Song performance. Specifically, such aspects included emotional connectivity and text comprehension. According to Sharon and her colleagues, the more common shortcomings of a traditional Art Song performance include “feeling unengaged, citing incomprehensibility of text, expressive monotony, [and] emotional distance” (Sharon et al., 2013, p. 370).

The survey was designed in three sections. Section One was developed to understand the audience’s individual knowledge and/or familiarity with the content of this research. Questions
asked included the number of public music performances attended annually and overall level of prior classical music training and/or familiarity with Art Song. Participants’ responses to these questions allowed the participants to identify with which of the three subgroups they best identify (i.e. A, informed; B, uninformed; C, professional), thereby addressing the first independent variable. These questions have been adapted from the NEA’s SPPA.

Section Two focussed on the second independent variable. These questions were developed to understand the audience’s individual responses to the material presented during the study. The same set of questions was asked for each of the three sets. Sharon’s 2012 study posed the question, “Does your text comprehension and emotional connection vary in the different gestural versions?” (Sharon et al., 2013, p. 379). Based on Sharon’s methodology, further questions were devised for this section to identity other aspects of the sets deemed valuable for this research in addition to text comprehension and emotional connectivity.

Contrary to Sections One through Two-C, Section Three presented open-ended questions in which the participants were asked to further elaborate on their responses from Sections Two-A through Two-C. Similar to the previously mentioned sections, Section Three was designed according to Sharon’s 2012 study in order to pinpoint which specific elements – and at what level – were responsible for participants’ responses. From there, it was anticipated that a more accessible means of performing German Lieder for present-day audiences could be determined.

**Interviews.** In addition to the more quantitative data gathered from the surveys, this research project benefited from more in-depth, qualitative information from a selective number of participants, the intention of which was to present the selected participants an opportunity to expand on their responses from the surveys. Specifically, such information was collected through interviews at a later date and time.
Contrary to questionnaires and surveys, interviews emphasize the collection of data through organic human interaction, particularly through conversation. As such, interviews provide their participants an opportunity “to discuss their interpretations of the world in which they live, and to express how they regard situations from their own point of view” (Cohen et al., 2001, p. 409). It should be noted, however, that an interview is not the same as an ordinary, everyday conversation. Unlike an everyday conversation, an interview is a specifically planned situation, rather than naturally occurring, with its own regulations and protocols in order to achieve a desired outcome. Furthermore, the overall purpose of an interview can vary:

To evaluate or assess a person in some respect; to select or promote an employee; to effect therapeutic change, as in the psychiatric interview; to test or develop hypotheses; to gather data, as in surveys or experimental situations; [and] to sample respondents’ opinions, as in door-step interviews. (Cohen et al., 2011, p. 411)

Despite the varying objectives previously mentioned, as well as the varying responsibilities of both the interviewer and interviewee(s), the exchange of seeking and supplying information remains consistent throughout. In addition, Oppenheim suggests that interviews are more effective than questionnaires and surveys when asking more difficult, open-ended questions, because participants become more motivated to impart more about the research than within the confines of a questionnaire or a survey (Cohen et al., 2011, p. 412).

While there exists a great deal of acrimony among researchers surrounding the number of types of interviews (e.g. LeCompte and Preissle’s six types, 1993, versus Oppenheim’s ten, 1992), Patton (1980) establishes a foundation for the intentions, procedures, and outcomes of the various types of interviews by outlining four types of interviews from which to start: (1) informal conversational interview, (2) interview guide approach, (3) semi-structured interviews, and (4)
closed quantitative interviews (Cohen et al., 2011). As its name suggests, an informal conversational interview is the most informal type of interview. Questions arrive from the immediate context of the discussion, like an everyday conversation, and there is no pre-determined number or order of questions to be asked. While interview guide approach and semi-structured interviews share a pre-determined outline, they differ based on whether the order of questions is determined during or before the actual interview respectively. Finally, closed quantitative interviews are the most similar to questionnaires and surveys, as the pre-determined responses are fixed, limiting participants’ answers. When analyzing data from an interview, researchers must be aware of such aspects as the frequency of ideas and themes mentioned, patterns and themes, as well as relations between variables.

For this study, three sets of interviews were conducted, all of which were semi-structured interviews. This means that the exact wording and sequence of questions which all participants were asked was determined prior to the actual interviews. Two interviews featured Professor Rena Sharon as the interviewee. As one of the leading advocates in expanded Art Song performance practice and pedagogy, this study benefited greatly from Sharon’s insight surrounding the issues, literature, and methodology considered for this study, as well as the findings following the study. As such, one interview took place prior to the lecture recital to present the intentions of the research (August 18th, 2018), while the other interview occurred following the lecture recital’s completion to present its findings (December 19th, 2018). The other set of interviews was part of the lecture recital. A selective number of participants from the lecture recital was asked to expand on their responses from the surveys. A total of six participants, two participants from each of the study’s three subgroups (i.e. the informed, the uninformed, and the professional), was interviewed. Furthermore, the researcher was fortunate
enough to have four of the six interviewees represent the opinions and perspectives of classically trained singers, collaborative pianists, and vocal pedagogues, which played a crucial part during the final data input. Participants were asked to provide an email address following the lecture recital only if they were willing to participate. To ensure the participants from the lecture recital’s anonymity, a list linking participant identifiers to a unique ID was created, de-identifying material for data analysis and to allow for data withdrawal, if a participant chose to withdraw from the project (e.g. Interviewee A-1). Interviews for both Sharon and the lecture recital’s attendees were conducted both in person and over the phone, whichever was most convenient for the interviewees.

Validity and Limitations

Generalization. As previously mentioned, the target population for this study was adult audiences (aged 18 and older). This is the same target population from which the NEA samples for its SPPA when evaluating the rate of audience attendance at performing-arts events (National Endowment for the Arts, 2015). Within this broader demographic, however, the sample for this study was further refined to focus on adult audiences (aged 18 and older) with a minimum post-secondary level of education. Given the denomination of the sample, this study had no intention of representing a wider population; therefore, the data collected from the sample audience was not generalized to a broader population beyond the sample (Cohen et al., 2011). Despite the disadvantage based on its unrepresentativeness, to seek a generalization about a wider population is irrelevant for a convenience sample, such as this one. Furthermore, the audience derived from this sample proved to be consistent with audiences referenced in both Professor Rena Sharon and her colleague’s as well as Johnson’s findings, that is individuals – both uninformed and
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

professional within the realm of Art Song performance – at the minimum post-secondary level of education.

Sample-size inconsistency. Participants within the sample audience for this study were further divided into three subgroups based on factual information pertaining to participants’ knowledge and/or familiarity of Art Song, specifically German Lieder, as well as overall level of prior classical music training and/or familiarity with Art Song: (A) an informed audience at the minimum post-secondary level of education in Music; (B) an uninformed audience at the minimum post-secondary level of education, not in Music; (C) an informed audience including both experienced concertgoers and individuals at the professional level of music performance and/or pedagogy, ideally within voice or collaborative piano. Participants were responsible for determining with which of the three subgroups they best identified themselves by answering the Likert-like items in Section One of the survey provided prior to the lecture recital.

The issue surrounding the itemization of participants stemmed from the sample size as it related to each of the three subgroups. As of April 2018, Western University’s Don Wright Faculty of Music was home to more than 180 students – from undergraduate to post-graduate – with a major in voice or piano. This is contrasted with the faculty’s 23 voice and piano instructors collectively. Given the extent of the difference between both students and instructors, the challenge was ensuring that the three subgroups were represented equally or as relatively close to one another as possible. In order to draw viable findings, should the sample size had been proven to be unbalanced during the study, appropriate countermeasures were taken. In this instance, data from the larger groups was randomly reduced in order to achieve a number equal to the least-represented subgroup. It should be noted that this was done only when comparing the
results across the three subgroups, as part of the cross-sectional survey, and not when analyzing the findings from each subgroup on its own.

**Researcher as performer and performance order.** This study was presented as a lecture recital in which the researcher presented an adapted version of Schumann’s nine-piece song cycle, *Liederkreis*, divided into three varying levels of performance modality (i.e. traditional, expanded traditional, and theatrical contextualization). As the researcher was the individual responsible for presenting the treatment to the participants, the performance was tempered in coordination with the researcher’s supervisors and academic advisory committee in order to ensure that the performance was presented in an unbiased way as not to intentionally persuade the participants’ responses beyond the treatment. Furthermore, the order in which the treatment was presented was not done in an ordinal manner, that is in an order from least expanded to most expanded or vice versa. The reason for doing this was to prevent further potential bias when presenting the treatment to the participants. As such, the order considered was as follows: Set One – traditional, Set Two – theatrical contextualization, and Set Three – expanded traditional.

**Song selection.** As previously discussed, this study drew inspiration from the anecdotal report of an earlier, informal research experiment conducted by Professor Rena Sharon on the theatricalization of Art Song and its impact on audience perception and interpretation. Specifically, the research was conducted at the Conceptual Structure, Discourse, and Language Conference in Vancouver to examine the use of relational components (i.e. additional performers/actors) during an Art Song performance. By performing the same Art Song, Barrett-Browning’s “How Do I Love Thee?”, three times in three distinct modalities, Sharon and her colleagues sought to compare the impact of the performer-audience relationship during the
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

performance visa vie the three distinct modalities, which ranged from the traditional to the more theatrical. Outside the similarity in overall design of these two studies, this study focussed on a larger collection of songs, a song cycle, divided into three smaller sets sung in the original German language, as opposed to the same Art Song performed three times in English.

The lecture recital featured Schumann’s nine-piece song cycle, Liederkreis; however, the larger work had been adapted for this performance and was presented as three self-sustaining sets with overarching themes of German Romanticism. In addition, each of these smaller sets of songs was performed according to one of the three distinct modalities mentioned previously (i.e. traditional, expanded traditional, and theatrical contextualization). By presenting the three modalities using three different sets of songs, a new variable was brought to the forefront, that is the music performed within each set. It is possible that participants may have been partial to one set of songs over another, thereby presenting a potential bias for their responses outside the modalities. Whereas Sharon’s experiment compared all three modalities using the same song, the purpose for this reconfigured programming, however, presented a new challenge for the researcher, the performers, and the audience specific to this study: the researcher now had to evaluate the performer’s ability to clearly and effectively communicate his interpretation of the music for the audience to properly understand, in addition to the audience’s capacity to maintain focus on the performance as a whole, as opposed to a series of unrelated songs.

**Participant bias.** Since this study attempted to quantify the responses of three distinct audiences based on a performance of German Lieder, it was anticipated that the responses from these groups would vary based on their specific categorization. In addition, this study attempted to quantify such responses as they were influenced by varying levels of performance modality. As such, the hypothesis for this study was that the more expanded the performance modality of
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

the Art Song performance, the higher the level of communicative gains between the performer(s) and the audience would be. With respect to Subgroup C, an informed audience including both experienced concertgoers and individuals at the professional level of music performance and/or pedagogy, however, it was anticipated that their responses may have proven to contradict the hypothesis, as they were already familiar with the traditional format of performing German Lieder. What this means is that participants from Subgroup C may have recorded being able to decipher the text and emotional nuance of the performance in the traditional format more easily than the remaining two subgroups, particularly Subgroup B. Furthermore, such results also may have concluded that any expansion of the performance parameters beyond the traditional format may prove to be unnecessary – albeit obnoxious or distracting – for that subgroup. As previously discussed, the purpose of this study was to explore the impact of adaptive methods and modalities in Art Song performance in connecting with adult audiences (aged 18 and older) as explored through a live performance of German Lieder, and to investigate possible correlations. Had the previously hypothesized result occurred, then perhaps the second and third performance modalities tested during this study are better suited only to audiences who are not familiar with the style of music in order to achieve a greater understanding and appreciation for the artform, rather than for audiences who are already familiar with the performance practice and style.
IV. Presentation of the Data

This study was a preliminary investigation that explored the impact of adaptive methods and modalities in Art Song performance in connecting with adult audiences (aged 18 and older) as explored through a live performance of German Lieder. The purpose of this study was to understand if different levels of performance modality (e.g. movement and gesture, props and costumes, projected illustrations, translations projected as supertitles, and additional performers) during a live performance of German Lieder might resonate more with adult audiences. Amidst a growing field of experimental “expanded performance protocols” for Art Song, such as Art Song Theatre, the auxiliary purpose of this study was to contribute a qualitative experimental study of in situ audience perception to an emerging field of practice and research regarding innovative practices in Art Song performance. While the experimental design did not offer a full-scale theatrical production, it presented three performance modalities, ranging from traditional recital protocols and moving outward to explore several expanded practices, during a live performance of German Lieder. The treatments were experienced and assessed by the in-situ audience from which preliminary data regarding audience perceptions, preferences, and discomfitures was gathered for analysis via survey instrument.

While the manner in which German Lied is being presented today – the Art Song recital – has helped to preserve the traditions of the Art Song genre, such performance parameters have shown limited appeal to modern-day audiences (Varty, 2013). To prevent the Lied from being marginalized any further, countermeasures have been taken to alter the performance traditions and reframe the genre through the inclusion of enhanced performance modalities (e.g. theatrical movement and gesture, props and costumes, projected translations, etc.). More specifically, Art Song Theatre has been promoted as one alternative medium of performing Art Song while
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

incorporating such non-traditional conventions. The aim of this study was to explore which performance methods and modalities are the most effective in connecting with an audience and investigate a possible correlation between individuals’ level of prior classical music training and/or familiarity with Art Song and performance preference. More specifically, its purpose was to examine the potential feasibility and impact of expanded practices in Art Song performance to support an effective means of providing communicative gains to present-day performances of German Lieder for adult audiences.

The study’s conception was derived from the description of an informal experiment from 2012 conducted by Professor Rena Sharon, one of the leading advocates in the field of expanded Art Song performance practice and pedagogy. The original experiment sought to explore cognitive shifts for performers and audience that occur when changes are made to movement parameters and other expressive protocols during a performance of a single Art Song, sung in English, across three distinct performance modalities, ranging from traditional to more theatrical. Inspired by the anecdotal report of the aforenoted experiment, this study compared three gestural versions of Art Song performance, similar to the previously mentioned, at a larger scale and sought to record the data through more extensive and systematic data collection before three distinct audience, categorized according to level of prior classical music training and/or familiarity with Art Song. In addition, the study focused on a larger collection of songs, a song cycle, performed in the original German Language.

This study was focused on adult audiences (aged 18 and older) with a minimum post-secondary level of education. Within this demographic, participants were itemized into three subgroups based on their level of knowledge and/or familiarity of Art Song, specifically German Lieder (i.e. informed, uninformed, and professional). Eligibility was determined based on
whether participants could identify themselves as either (A) a post-secondary or graduate student/alum in Music, (B) a post-secondary or graduate student/alum not in Music, or (C) an experienced concertgoer/professional in Music. Based on the criteria of eligibility, as well as given that this research was conducted at Western University’s Don Wright Faculty of Music, the sample audience was collected from the same environment (i.e. students and faculty at Western University).

In order to gather such a sample, both advertisement and incentive measures were taken into consideration. Prior to submitting any promotional materials, the heads of department from ten of Western University’s eleven departments, excluding Western University’s School of Graduate and Postdoctoral Studies, were contacted via formal letter, asking that they forward a recruitment letter on behalf of the researcher via mass email to their respective department’s faculty and students to promote the study. Physical posters were then printed and posted on any available news bulletins within twelve of Western University’s faculty buildings and community centres, according to the Poster Patrol regulations of Western University’s Creative Services’ department. Both sets of materials provided the same information, including the objective of the study, its process and procedures, the projected duration of the study, and participant confidentiality. Furthermore, participation in this study was further incentivized by automatic entry into a raffle, the prize for which was an Apple iTunes gift-card valued at $50.00.

The first portion of the study was conducted in the form of a lecture recital, lead by the researcher, on Friday, September 28th of 2018 at 12:30 PM. The performance took place in von Kuster Hall at Western University’s Don Wright Faculty of Music as part of the department’s Fridays @ 12:30 concert series. Having entered the performance venue, participants were given a survey package, the procedures of which were explained by the supervisor of this study, Dr.
Patrick Schmidt, prior to the beginning of the lecture recital. The survey package consisted of four items: a Letter of Information and Consent, reiterating the protocol for the study; the survey; a Letter of Consent of Contact for Future Studies, asking participants to provide an email address if they were interested in participating in a follow-up interview following the lecture recital; a raffle ticket, thereby indicating one’s entry into the raffle for the $50.00 Apple iTunes gift-card immediately following the lecture recital. It was at this time that participants were also asked to complete the first portion of the survey, which asked participants to identify their overall level of prior classical music training and/or familiarity with Art Song.

The lecture recital was approximately 60 minutes in length and was divided into three sections (Table 3). The music featured during the lecture recital was an adapted version of Robert Schumann’s nine-piece song cycle, *Liederkreis* (Op. 24). Within each of the previously mentioned sections of the lecture recital, the researcher presented a different set of three songs from the original song cycle according to one of three varying levels of performance modality.
Table 3. Layout of the performance program for the lecture recital

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Song Set</th>
<th>Performance Parameters</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Set One – Traditional</td>
<td>• Formal attire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1. Song No. 1 “Morgens steh’ ich auf und frage”</td>
<td>• No movement or gesture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2. Song No. 2 “Es treibt mich hin, es treibt mich her”</td>
<td>• Expression limited to eyes and face</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3. Song No. 3 “Ich wandelte unter den Bäumen”</td>
<td>• Printed translations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Set Two – Theatrical Contextualization</td>
<td>• Props and costumes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1. Song No. 4 “Lieb’ Liebchen, leg’s Händchen aufs Herze mein”</td>
<td>• Theatrical movement and gesture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2. Song No. 5 “Schöne Wiege meiner Leiden”</td>
<td>• Additional performers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3. Song No. 6 “Warte, warte, wilder Schiffmann”</td>
<td>• Translations projected as supertitles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Set Three – Expanded Traditional</td>
<td>• Projected illustrations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1. Song No. 7 “Berg’ und Burgen schau’n herunter”</td>
<td>• Formal attire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2. Song No. 8 “Anfangs wollt' ich fast verzagen”</td>
<td>• Limited movement and gesture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3. Song No. 9 “Mit Myrten und Rosen, lieblich und hold”</td>
<td>• Translations projected in poetic form</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Participants were asked to notate their responses to each of these sets. Each set of songs had its own corresponding set of similar survey questions, except for Set Two, which had an additional five questions pertaining to the effectiveness of the additional expanded, multimodal components implemented during this particular set.

Data collection for this study was based on survey responses and semi-structured interviews. The surveys were delivered before the lecture recital started and consisted of 26 Likert-like items, which were divided into four sections. Where Section One’s questions were based on factual information relating to participants’ level of prior classical music training and/or familiarity with Art Song, Sections Two-A through Two-C were based on a scale as they pertained to participants’ responses to the lecture recital’s three varying sets (i.e. Section Two-A,
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

Set One; Section Two-B, Set Two; Section Two-C, Set Three). As previously stated, Sections Two-A through Two-C contained the same set of survey questions; however, Section Two-B had an additional five questions pertaining to the effectiveness of the additional expanded, multimodal components utilized in Set Two. The final section of the survey, Section Three, consisted of three open-ended questions in which participants were asked to further elaborate on their responses from Sections Two-A through Two-C.

In order to acquire more in-depth, qualitative information, the participants from the lecture recital were presented the opportunity to expand on their responses from the surveys through semi-structured interviews at a later date and time. In order for a participant from the lecture recital to be considered for an interview, they were asked to first indicate their implied consent by providing an email address on the Consent Form of Contact for Future Studies, included with the survey package, in order for the researcher to contact them. In addition, two more interviews were conducted outside the lecture recital and featured Professor Rena Sharon. As one of the leading advocates of expanded Art Song performance practice and pedagogy, this study sought to collect Sharon’s insight and personal opinions surrounding the issues, literature, and methodology considered for this study, as well as its findings following the study. As such, one interview took place prior to the lecture recital to present the intentions of the study, dated August 8th of 2018, and the second interview occurred following the lecture recital’s completion to present its findings, dated December 19th, 2018. Where the interviews with the lecture-recital attendees were conducted both in person and over the phone, both interviews with Sharon were conducted over the phone.

Survey Data

Section One – Sample size. The Don Wright Faculty of Music’s von Kuster Hall has a seating capacity of approximately 260 with additional overflow seating with live-video feed of
the hall separate from the performance venue. While the exact number of audience members present for the lecture recital overall was not determined, the research team later surmised that there were approximately 80 individuals present for the performance. The number of completed surveys confirmed that there were 70 participants who participated in this portion of the study, ten participants more than what was determined to be the ideal number of participants to attain sufficient data. Regarding the number of participants within each of the three subgroups, however, the sample sizes were unbalanced. Specifically, 37 participants, more than half the number of total participants, categorized themselves within Subgroup A – post-secondary or graduate student/alum in Music. The remaining two subgroups – Subgroup B, post-secondary or graduate student/alum not in Music, and Subgroup C, experienced concertgoer/professional in Music – had a total number of 18 and 15 participants respectively (Figure 2).

*Figure 2. S1-Q2: "How would you best describe yourself, given the options below?"

As a result, data from the larger subgroup was randomly reduced to achieve a number equal to the least-represented subgroup. This was only done when comparing the results across the three
subgroups, as part of the cross-sectional survey, and not when analyzing the findings from each on its own.

**Section One – Age demographic.** From Section One of the survey, the data collected determined that the majority of participants who attended the lecture recital was older than age 55 (45%). Within each of the three subgroups, however, the data varied. The majority of participants from Subgroup A was younger than age 25 (60%); the majority of participants from Subgroup B was between ages 35 and 55 (61%); the majority of participants from Subgroup C was older than age 55 (80%) (Table 4).

*Table 4. S1-Q1: “What is your age?” (response averages)*

![Bar chart showing age distribution](image)

**Section One – Classical music affiliation.** From Questions Six and Seven of Section One of the survey, the data collected determined that the overall majority of participants who attended the lecture recital frequently attend public classical music performances within a year (67%) and are moderately familiar with the genre of Art Song, specifically German Lieder (45%). Again, however, the data from each of the three subgroups varied. The majority of participants from Subgroup A frequently attend public classical music performances within a
year (86%) and are very familiar with Art Song and German Lieder (65%); the majority of participants from Subgroup B sometimes attend classical music performances within a year (50%), but there was a 50-50 split between moderately familiar and not-at-all-familiar with Art Song and German Lieder; the majority of participants from Subgroup C frequently attend public classical music performances within a year (80%) and are moderately familiar with Art Song and German Lieder (53%) (Tables 5 and 6).

Table 5. S1-Q6: "How often do you attend public classical music performances within a year?" (response averages)
Table 6. S1-Q7: "How familiar are you with the genre of Art Song, specifically German Lieder?" (response averages)

Section Two – Evaluation of performance modalities. For Sections Two-A through Two-C of the survey, participants were given the same set of five questions to compare the effectiveness of five distinct performance aspects within each of the three varying performance modalities from the lecture recital: comprehension of text, despite being sung in a language unfamiliar with the general public (i.e. German); comprehension of the story; level of focus on the performer; comprehension of the emotional setting; overall connection to the performance.

In comparing the overall effectiveness of the three varying performance modalities from the collective audience, the data collected provided the following results: highest, theatrical contextualization (82%); second highest, expanded traditional (71%); lowest, traditional (66%). These results were found to be consistent within each of the three subgroups, thereby emphasizing a trend (Table 7).
It is worth mentioning, furthermore, that responses to the survey from Subgroup C, experienced concertgoer/professional in Music, were between four percent and seven percent higher than those from either Subgroup A or Subgroup B.

**Section Two – Evaluation of multimodal applications.** As previously mentioned, Section Two-B of the survey had an additional five questions in which participants were asked to evaluate the overall effectiveness of the five additional expanded, multimodal applications incorporated into Set Two: movement and gesture, props and costumes, projected illustrations, translations projected as supertitles, and additional performers. In comparing the averages from the audience overall, the data collected determined that movement and gesture (85%) and additional performers (83%) were the two most effective applications, while projected illustrations (64%) and translations projected as supertitles (68%) were the least effective (Table 8).
Furthermore, while these results were consistent within the three participant subgroups, the responses from Subgroup B and Subgroup C determined that translations projected as supertitles were slightly less effective than projected illustrations when compared to the responses from Subgroup A and the collective audience.

Section Three – Comprehension of text and emotional connection. Section Three of the survey encouraged more qualitative responses from the participants, so that they could expand on their answers from the previous, quantitative sections. Specifically, this section asked participants to elaborate on their ability to comprehend the text and emotional connection, how their overall experience changed with the addition of expanded, multimodal applications, and whether any of the previously noted applications detracted from Set Two. Had the study utilized the quantitative portion of the survey as its only means of data collection, the results would have suggested that Set Two – theatrical contextualization – was the most effective of the three sets from the lecture recital across all three subgroups of participants. The results from the qualitative portions of the study, however, do not lend themselves to similar conclusions. In fact, the refined
perspectives from the qualitative section of the survey, in addition to the semi-structured interviews, present a sense of duality between the two sets of data.

When analyzing the responses to Question One, text comprehension and emotional connection, the majority of responses from all three subgroups helped to determine that, while both text comprehension and emotional connection were enhanced in Set Two, the method in which the text translations were provided (i.e. supertitles) was the least beneficial – albeit the most distracting – in doing so. Rather, what was most beneficial in this instance was the use of movement and gesture and additional performers to draw a physical association to the music and poetry. Furthermore, the common responses from this section explained that the printed translations and the projected translations in poetic form from Set One and Set Three respectively were more beneficial in understanding the text than the projected supertitles from Set Two. According to these responses, participants could read the text both prior to the performance and during, rather than neglect to acknowledge the supertitles as they quickly changed with every new line of music (Table 9).
Table 9. S3-Q1: "Explain how your comprehension of the text and emotional connection varied between the three different sections of the performance presented today."

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subgroup</th>
<th>Responses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Subgroup A | • “Having the text printed allows me to read it before the performance [Set One] started in order to make a connection to the music during the performance.”  
• “I preferred the final set [Set Three], because the projected text was similar to the printed translations, only without having to divert my attention from the stage.”  
• “Having the translations change as often as they did as supertitles was very distracting.”                                                                                   |
| Subgroup B | • “The additional performers are what really made it very easy to understand what was happening in the music.”  
• “Having the text projected one line at a time was very distracting.”  
• “Having the entire translation projected was very helpful, but it was easiest when I could read the translations ahead of time when they were printed.” |
| Subgroup C | • “The supertitles were not easy to read and made it very distracting.”  
• “The physical movement and expression made the music that much more engaging and easier to understand.”  
• “Being able to both read ahead and afterward with the projected translations in the third set amplified my understanding, rather than the fleeting supertitles.” |

**Section Three – Multimodal applications.** When analyzing the responses to Question Two, the impact of additional multimodal applications, the responses from all three subgroups agreed that the performance became more enhanced and, therefore, more enjoyable. In particular, the context of the songs as they related to the overarching story and larger theme of separation became clearer, thereby strengthening the audience’s connection to the performance. In addition, participants commented further, emphasizing that such applications added to this style of music and allowed for an increased level of accessibility (Table 10).
Table 10. S3-Q2: “How was your overall experience from today’s performances impacted by movement and gesture, props and costumes, projected illustrations, translations projected as supertitles, and additional performers?”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subgroup</th>
<th>Responses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Subgroup A** | “Very entertaining. It was refreshing to see Art Song portrayed this way.”  
“Additional performers helped me to understand the context of the songs as dialogues.”  
“It enhanced my experience, because it added another layer to the performance to strengthen my connection.” |
| **Subgroup B** | “It was so much easier to understand the flow of the story and emotion of the performance [Set Two].”  
“My overall experience was enhanced, because the emotion behind the text was that much more energized.”  
“Highly entertaining.” |
| **Subgroup C** | “The songs were so much more accessible this way.”  
“The more staged they were [the performances], the greater the enjoyment was.”  
“All of the other elements allowed me to immerse myself into the performance [Set Two].” |

**Section Three – Level of focus.** Despite the more positive results from the previous question, however, the responses to Question Three, whether the previously mentioned applications detracted from the performance, determined that participants’ focus, regardless of which subgroup, was divided. Specifically, while the addition of expanded, multimodal applications helped to increase the overall entertainment value of the performance, participants reported that they were no longer able to focus on the music and poetry (Table 11).
Table 11. S3-Q3: "Regarding the second section, did any of the aforementioned elements detract from your ability to understand or connect with the performance? Please explain why or how."

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subgroup</th>
<th>Responses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Subgroup A    | • “The additional aspects sometimes took away from the music and the singing.”  
|               | • “I was no longer paying attention to the collaboration; I was more focussed on the story.”  
|               | • “I didn’t understand the pictures that were projected, and the supertitles changing constantly were very distracting.”  |
| Subgroup B    | • “I felt like I was focussing on too many things at one time. It was very distracting.”  |
| Subgroup C    | • “I couldn’t focus on the performer; therefore, the music was diminished.”  
|               | • “While entertaining, it takes away from the music and poetry, which should be the most important aspects.”  
|               | • “I would have preferred to just sit and listen to the music by itself.”  |

**Interview Data**

Following the lecture recital, six semi-structured interviews were conducted with six participants from the lecture recital to gain further insight from the previously conducted study. To ensure that the three subgroups from the recital were evenly represented during this portion of the study, the researcher interviewed two participants from each of the previously mentioned subgroups. These participants were contacted via email from the contact information provided from the survey package’s Consent Form of Contact for Future Studies. All six interviews took place during the week of October 22nd of 2018. Two of these interviews were conducted over the phone, while the remaining four were conducted in person. All six interviews were recorded and later transcribed with the signed consent of the participants prior to each interview. All six participants received the same set of eleven questions, the majority of which asked for them to describe their experience from the lecture recital and explain which set(s) and aspect(s) of each set they liked and did not like.
Responses from the six interviewees were consistent with those from the surveys and reemphasized several major points highlighted from the qualitative section of the survey (i.e. Section Three). Furthermore, it was observed that the responses provided by Professor Rena Sharon from her initial interview prior to the lecture recital coordinated with the previously mentioned results, both from the surveys and from the interviews. As a result, the connections observed helped to establish four larger themes.

**Performance aesthetic.** One of the research questions used to guide and frame this study was, “To what extent can the use of expanded, multimodal applications help mitigate the obstruction of communicative gains between a performer and his or her audience during a German Lied performance without compromise to the poetic and/or musical primacy?” As previously mentioned, the responses to Question Three from Section Three of the survey determined an overall increase across the five performance aspects analyzed; however, it was further reported that this increase came at a loss of attention for the music and poetry. Similarly, while it was unanimous that Set Two was more entertaining, the majority of interviewees – specifically those who considered themselves to be very familiar with classical music, Art Song, and German Lieder – agreed that their focus on the music and the poetry was superseded – albeit, distracted – by the additional performative elements of the set.

The second one [Set Two] I found highly entertaining, but it distracted me from the music, which I believe to be the most important part of an Art Song recital… I wouldn’t say they [the additional performance aspects] took away from my ability to understand the performance, but – at the same time – they distracted me from the music.

(Interviewee A-1)
For me, I think it [the additional performance aspects] detracted a little bit, but there was something pulling me away from what you [the researcher] were singing. At times, it did get a little hard for me to manage everything. It added, too, but it also felt like going too far, in my opinion. (Interviewee C-1)

Having interviewed Professor Rena Sharon prior to conducting the lecture recital, it had already been made clear to the researcher that attempts to modify the traditional Art Song recital – let alone Art Song Theatre – are often subject to specific considerations and limitations from the professional perspective:

Song-artist teachers who are opposed to any changes in performance practices attest to the merit of associating sung poetry with naturally occurring physical movement and narrative or theatrical application in the pedagogical context. For that group, staging practices are viewed as dynamic instructional tools implemented in the interpretive learning process, but not carried forward into the performance mode. (Sharon, Interview 1, 2018)

Sharon further considered reasons for such professional antipathy, emphasising that the aesthetic integrities of expressive musical essence and poetic meaning are the foremost priority in any treatment of Art Song, and nothing should supersede that primary obligation:

The fact that I can say to my colleagues that people were standing up and screaming for more doesn’t necessarily prove the worth or merit of the product. People can easily reply, ‘Of course – it had all those bells and whistles, but too much was sacrificed in the process.’ (Sharon, Interview 1, 2018)

As an educator and proponent of Art Song, Sharon not only understands the arguments against theatricalized Art Song, she sympathizes with those who put forth such barriers, because she
supports the view that there is a hierarchy within Art Song performance, in which the poetry being set to music is the fundamental component.

Audience members will often report that they will put the poetry aside entirely and just enjoy the beautiful music… However, without deep engagement of the poetry, the intrinsically hybrid nature of the Art Song form – the fusion of text and tone – is deactivated as poetry recedes into a secondary awareness. (Sharon, Interview 1, 2018)

It is because of this deep dedication for the artform that Sharon is careful to explain that the methods of Art Song Theatre have been proposed only to enhance the audience’s connection to and understanding of the poetry, never to dilute it. Furthermore, Sharon explained that such communicative gains are more than possible without the need for expanded, multimodal applications – in the traditional Art Song recital – and, therefore, are not necessary in such instances:

One wants to know whether individual audience members feel that the intense intimacy of the traditional recital mode is diminished through any form of theatricalization. That’s the touchstone question and standard of practice. If the calibre of the music/text artistry seems to have been diluted or distorted by the addition of theatrical modes, the theatrical process has not succeeded in this particular treatment, because the aesthetic integrity of the vocal/piano performance – the first and fundamental goal in all cases – has been deprioritized or overshadowed. That can be an inadvertent outcome, but if the majority of the audience reports that impression, the staging or other components have to be re-worked to sustain connection to the artistic essence of the songs. (Sharon, Interview 1, 2018)
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

Based on the results from the six interviews, further supported by Sharon from her earlier interview, the approaches that were used in this study did not fully engage the existing practices and require further investigation and consideration for a subsequent production.

**Movement and gesture.** The results from the surveys determined that there were specific multimodal applications from Set Two that were considered to be more beneficial than others to understanding the context of poetry for the audience. Of the five expanded, multimodal applications incorporated into this set (i.e. movement and gesture, props and costumes, projected illustrations, translations projected as supertitles, and additional performers), movement and gesture as well as additional performers were ranked the most effective, as previously explained from Question 18 of Section Two-B from the survey. Just as well, the interviewees were asked to identify which of these elements was the most beneficial to the set and elaborate on their choices. All six interviewees made note of the effectiveness of the previously highlighted aspects during their interviews.

I liked the couple dynamics that were there, and I felt those were very effective in the presentation. I liked the overall staging where you [the researcher] were actively changing levels on the ground and felt that added significantly to your representation of the song. (Interviewee C-1)

Professor Rena Sharon credits the effectiveness of movement and gesture and additional performers when presenting Art Song as one of her first observations when working on performance interpretation with her students. According to Sharon, her students often approached the text of an Art Song – unlike that of an operatic aria – with a sort of intellectual detachment.
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

Many students express lack of confidence about their skills in poetic analysis, dramatic recitation, and how to embody those elements within the traditional performance protocols. Those very valid concerns – largely attributable to our often-delimited curricular scope – can manifest in somewhat static musical choices, and less emotional engagement than one would seek for Art Song’s quintessentially soulful disclosures.

(Sharon, Interview 1, 2018)

Based on this assessment, Sharon devised a series of improvisation exercises, in which she and the students co-constructed hypothetical character identities, backstories, plot narratives, and dialogues deriving from considerations of the poetic content. The intention was to help performers relate more personally to the poetic content as a character within a scene. In overwhelmingly consistent outcomes, the pre-performance conceptualizations and performative theatrical implementations generated demonstrable shifts in interpretative comprehension, musical choices, and – intriguingly – technical skills.

By creating context and inter-relationality of the text while singing, students would report that they immediately felt engaged on a more personal, more human, and more intimate level than they had been previously unable to access… The spontaneous, unrehearsed, and un-coached musical choices that students made – phrasing, shaping, timing – often reflected radical interpretive shifts from what had been repeatedly rehearsed prior to the performance, as confirmed by their pianist partners. (Sharon, Interview 1, 2018)

In addition to being able to better interpret the poetry from a performer’s perspective, the responses from the interviewees acknowledged how movement and gesture helped to better understand the poetry.
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

The performance is a temporal unfolding of events, and the acting was that, as well. The props were static, and so they adorned [and] ornamented the product, but they did not as ‘actively’ add to the performance as the gestures and the interpretation did. (Interviewee A-2)

This connection occurs based on the level of engagement and sensory cognition from the brain. As such, one might say that people report feeling more engaged, because they are living it [the performance] more in the moment as more of the brain is involved.

We [Sharon and colleagues] speculated that when performers include movement, visual imagery and/or sets, narrative context, and interrelation communication with other characters, a creative synthesis of neural processes is activated for both performers and audience that may not be fully engaged in the standard recital mode as a consequence of movement protocols and other performative differences. (Sharon, Interview 1, 2018)

Even those within the professional realm who are opposed to the theatrical interpretation of Art Song appreciate the merit of associating the spoken or sung poetry with physical movement and gesture. To that end, however, they encourage such methods as an instructional tool only when learning the piece, not when performing it: “Students are asked to internalize what they’ve discovered in the theatrical processes to inform their interpretation for the traditional recital modality” (Sharon, Interview 1, 2018). Beyond this practice, the organic nature of movement and gesture within a performance extends beyond the teaching studio, allowing a performance to be that much more accessible, as demonstrated by the results of this inquiry.

**Text translation.** One of the primary intentions of this study was to examine how an adult audience would be able to appreciate an Art Song performance when the repertoire being performed is in a language unfamiliar to the general public (i.e. German). As such, the interviews
and survey had been designed to determine whether the participants could understand what was being said from the methods of translation provided. As previously discussed, Art Song is the synthesis of poetry set to music; as such, it is crucial for the poetry – whether spoken or sung – to be the primary focus of the performance. This fundamental practice, however, becomes increasingly difficult when the audience’s ability to understand the text is compromised due to a language barrier, that is the audience is unable to understand the text since the piece is being sung in a language unfamiliar to them. Given the multilingual span of the repertoire, furthermore, issues regarding text translation open a host of questions regarding comprehension and accessibility for the international recital market, since it is a customary practice in many recitals to present songs in diverse languages (Sharon, Interview 1, 2018).

What defines the Lied – all Art Song – as a genre is that it demands such an intense level of communication between singer and pianist in order to connect with audiences on a more intimate level. Despite the best efforts of the Art Song duo, however, an audience’s willingness to connect with a performance is heavily dictated by whether they understand the context of the performance, especially when the music being performed is presented in a foreign language. This relationship between understanding the context of a performance in order to connect with the performance was emphasized during the post-lecture-recital interviews, more so from participants less familiar with Art Song.

Being engaged heightens the overall experience for me. If you’re feeling disengaged because you’re not really understanding it [the performance], chances are you’re going to be less involved and more distracted. You’re not going to fully appreciate what’s being presented and lose interest. (Interviewee B-1)
While such responses suggest a change in the way the material of an Art Song recital is presented, the problem then becomes how to do so without diffusing the intensity or intimacy of the performance. The preliminary exploration of multimodal applications from this study produced mixed results from which it would not be possible to assert conclusive theories. Given the positive audience responses to multiple professional productions, the more mixed results of this study offer useful information to contribute to the emergence of grounded theories for this realm of new practices.

According to the survey results, the primary method used to alleviate the language barrier during the second set – translations projected as supertitles – was found to be one of the least effective applications overall. Furthermore, the responses to the interviews confirmed that this was since the supertitles were seen as more of a distraction to the set.

I think the second one [Set Two] was the least helpful to understanding the text, even though they [the translations] came up as you [the researcher] spoke – or sung – the lines, because it was so easy to forget as it kept changing. You were so focussed on when the slide was going to change, that you’d forget what was just up there before. (Interviewee A-2)

Contrary to this, Set One and Set Three – the more traditional adaptations – were regarded as more effective in conveying the meaning of the text while enhancing the value of the sets because of the methods of text translation (i.e. printed translations and translations projected in poetic form respectively). According to the responses from the interviewees, similar to those from the surveys, the participants appreciated when the text translation was presented in full prior to the start of the set, rather than briefly projected as supertitles, because it allowed for further reflection on the meaning of the poetry throughout the entire set, even afterward.
I enjoyed the third one [Set Three] the most. That is probably now the standard for the Art Song recital, because you can digest the poetry as a whole, rather than getting it line-by-line, which is easy to forget as it goes on. (Interviewee A-2)

Beyond serving as a distraction, supertitles can be ineffective during an Art Song performance, because they can also take away from the visual structure of the poem. At its most basic level, a poem is structured according to a system, whether that is the frequency of rhyming couplets, the variation of stressed and unstressed syllables, or the overall length of each verse. Furthermore, each line of text is organized in such a way, like a verse or stanza, to illustrate a story or convey an overarching theme. When the structural integrity of the poetry is divided and then shown as individual lines of text, separate from their larger work, the overall intensity of the poem is thereby divided, as well. Sharon commented that this had been stressed to her by a colleague who was strongly opposed to supertitles for such reasons and that she has experimented with various methods of projecting text translations to understand which methods are most effective.

Many years ago, I [Sharon] spoke with one of the Art Song realm’s greatest performing artists, who was (at the time) very strongly opposed to text projection of any kind, but particularly the use of line-by-line operatic format. He noted that a poem’s visual structure and grammatical arrangement is different from spoken prose. For example, the reconciling of the poem’s first line may not occur until the fourth line of the stanza. As surtitles roll along, you can’t see the integral structure of the poetic work – disrupting a plethora of vital and complex artistic fundaments. Further, it is not possible to refresh your understanding of the first line of text by the time you’re looking at the fourth line. The inability to reflect on prior stanzas, to review specific lines, or the overall work may even be viewed as disrespectful to a poet’s work – or at least disruptive to its full
engagement. His brilliant elucidation caused me to pursue formats that protect structural
integrities as much as possible, while situating the projection screens relative to the
performers in ways that promote maximal immersion (depending on what the venue
provides). (Sharon, Interview 1, 2018)

By presenting the translation of the poetry in full prior to or during the performance, whether as a
physical handout or projected in poetic form, the audience’s ability to understand the text and
appreciate the poetry is enhanced, thereby increasing the audience’s level of engagement on the
performance.

While the methods of text translation from Set One and Set Three generated more
positive feedback than that of Set Two, the interview responses yielded further information to
suggest that one of the two previously mentioned methods was preferred over the other. Despite
the effectiveness of being able to present the text translation in full prior to the start of the set,
printed translations were also considered to be somewhat of a distraction for the audience.
According to the interviewees from the lecture recital, the focus of Set One was at times divided
between watching the performer on stage and having to read the printed translations, whereas the
audience’s attention was more focussed during the third set when the translation was projected in
full behind the performer on stage.

If I was to say I preferred one [method of translation], it was definitely when the entire
poem was being projected, because I could watch the performer while it [the translation]
was in view. If I’m constantly looking down at my program, it’s not as easy. It’s also the
simplest thing, like hearing someone flip through the program pages. That’s a distraction
to the performer now, too. (Interviewee C-2)
Sharon’s own research found similar results, as well, that is the audience’s focus can be divided if they have to divert their attention from the performer to read the translations. This in turn causes problems for both the performer and the audience.

I [Sharon] have interviewed many people who report that they try to use printed texts for a while but eventually abandon the effort because it’s too confusing and laborious (though some report enjoying that process enormously). Having to move one’s eyes continuously between stage and programme interrupts both the connection with the performers and with the poem. If you look up at the stage, you’ve lost your place on the page. And when you return to the page after a few moments looking at the stage, how will you then locate the correct line when the singer is not singing in the language you’re reading? One needs to follow both the original language and then identify the corresponding line of translated text. Though some find it quite a fascinating exercise, it is a challenging process. What cannot be denied is that for the duration of that pursuit, one’s eyes have left the performer and have missed any gestural content – including the intense facial expressivity of traditional performance protocols. As well, it might be proposed that one’s audition of the music while engaged in the programme booklet becomes somewhat peripheral. (Sharon, Interview 1, 2018)

Because the audience’s attention is now divided between the performer and the translations, neither aspect is being fully appreciated. As a result, the impact of the performance is a risk of never being fully immersive, because the audience’s attention has been too actively divided. Based on these results, having the translations projected in poetic form, as they were during Set Three, was found to be the preferred means of text translation among the options presented. By
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

maintaining both the text translation and the performer within the same visual capacity, the performance can be that much more focussed for the audience to connect and enjoy.

Engagement and performance preference. The final question from the post-lecture-recital interviews asked if the interviewees would be willing to attend more Art Song performances based on what was done from the lecture recital. While all six of the interviewees agreed that they would be more than willing to attend such performances, a variety of reasons to further support their responses helped to reaffirm the effectiveness of expanded, multimodal applications during such performances. As previously stated, the goal of an Art Song performance is to connect with the music and poetry being performed and those performing the music, thereby creating an all-encompassing musical experience in which all participants can be fully engaged. As with any artistic performance, audiences respond better when they are more engaged. This was one of the more common themes gathered from the interview responses.

I found it very entertaining, and – again – it engaged me as part of the audience. I felt as if I was a part of the performance, and I would certainly go and see more of those kinds of performances. It engages you, and it makes you feel as if you’re getting the full experience. (Interviewee B-2)

From a pedagogical perspective, Professor Rena Sharon’s observations reported similar results, specifically when performing more theatricalized adaptations during her own song-interpretation classes. Students reported an intense, immediate, and comprehensive shift of their interior relationship to the poetic texts, and concomitant spontaneous reframing of the musical performance parameters (e.g. phrasing, dynamics, timing, etc.) often companioned by related technical shifts to breathing, tone, and pitch. As well, the pianists reported having a sense of deepened collaborative connection despite the singer having moved away from the instrument,
and student audiences reported commensurate shifts in their processing of the performance – less attention to elements of craft and more involvement in their colleagues’ storytelling.

Watching audiences during staged performances, one could see them responding with intense, unguarded emotion to the songs during the unfolding ‘story’ – smiling when joyous lovers embraced at the end of ‘Liebst du um Schönheit’, weeping at the fusion of sound and meaning in ‘Sure on this Shining Night’ as the singer moved through the audience incanting ‘All is healed… Hearts all whole’. Empathetic engagement was written all over their faces and supported by vigorous applause and detailed commentary following the performances. (Sharon, Interview 1, 2018)

Having first observed this phenomenon of shifting immersion levels for performers and audience in her classes in the mid 1990s, Sharon speculated that these practices could be transported to the concert stage in a variety of treatments that might produce similar intensities of perception for performers and audiences. In order for the full potential of an Art Song performance to be realized, all participants present – performer(s) and audience members – must not only understand the context of the piece but must also be willing to connect emotionally to the story being told.

Whatever conditions cause the performers to play and sing with that level of connectedness, one can feel an immediacy of intense soulful understanding of poetry’s existential power as conveyed through Art Song’s multi-sensory fusion. At such times, performers and audience inhabit a vibrant circle of intention and comprehension in which the performers interpret to the audience with intense intimacy. The incorporation of multimodal applications, such as narrative dramatic threads, relational characters, etc., add additional tools for contextual meaning-making that open to broader accessibility.
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

(Sharon, Interview 1, 2018)

At such times, both groups of participants are met with their own respective yet coordinated objectives. For the performers, singer and pianist, they must clearly communicate their interpretation of the music for the audience to properly understand. For the audience, they must remain focussed on the performance in its entirety to not only avoid misinterpretation of the performer’s intentions, but better connect to the themes and story of the performance on a more personal level. By incorporating such expanded, multimodal applications as narrative and drama, Art Song performance can achieve a new level of accessibility for all participants to truly appreciate and enjoy the artform as it was once during its original apogee. These conclusions should not be considered generalizable, however. The current study’s experimental model produced certain results, but theatrical contextualization was not presented in its full range of components; as such, the results were contextual to a very specific set of conditions, methodologies, and implementations.

While this study indicated many beneficial aspects of expanded, multimodal applications, it also identified some problematic issues. As previously discussed, the results from both the surveys and interviews concluded that Set Two, while enjoyable, was not effective in maintaining the audience’s focus on the music and poetry. The responses from the interviews determined that this was since there was too much incorporated into the set, ultimately distracting audience members from the focal point of the musical performance. What this data would suggest, then, is that incorporating expanded, multimodal applications can be beneficial for some, but there is a saturation point at which the performance becomes overwhelming for others. As such, it is important not to draw overarching disciplinary conclusions regarding multimedia elements based on this study. This is particularly pertinent currently since the data
collected was based on a minimalist theatrical treatment with limited production capacities within a recital environment.

In comparing the methods of sensory stimulation in both Set One and Set Two, there was a strong juxtaposition surrounding how each set was presented. Where Set One (i.e. traditional) was more focussed on the music and poetry but less engaging for the audience, the refined perspectives from the qualitative data reject the conclusion of Set Two (i.e. theatrical contextualization) as being the most effective set of the three, as this specific data referred Set Two as being more distracting from the musical and poetic intensity of the work. As a result, Set Three (i.e. expanded traditional) was considered to be the most balanced of the three sets.

I enjoyed the third one [Set Three] the most. I believe that was the one with the full translation projected and slight acting. I thought it was the most balanced of the three. Not one element was more distracting than the other, and all the media came together with the performance to give it a deeper understanding for the audience. (Interviewee B-2)

The specific applications incorporated into Set Three were projected translations in poetic form and theatrical movement and gesture. It did not, however, include props and costumes, projected illustrations, translations projected as supertitles, or additional performers. These specific elements, furthermore, were generally cited to be the most effective in helping audience members to better understand the context of the music and the poetry without dividing one’s attention. As such, it can be suggested that this set was the most balanced and, therefore, the most effective of the three sets from the lecture recital in creating a stronger sense of connection, communication, and ultimately engagement between the performers and the audience.
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

These findings should not in turn devalue the remaining two sets, however. It should be restated that Art Song were originally performed in the style of Set One, yet it was still credited as being widely successful. Just as well, the expanded, multimodal applications utilized during the second set reflect practices present in major opera, music theatre, as well as pop-/rock-music productions presented today. In addition to maintaining the focus of the audience during the performance, performers of Art Song – let alone any genre of music – must also focus their attention for whom the performance is being created. Every member of the audience will have his or her own personal preference as far as what the perfect performance should be, and – just like the three varying performance modalities from the lecture recital – they exist on a spectrum.

Sharon stresses that Art Song Theatre is in no way intended to supplant the traditional recital. Rather, Sharon proposes that each modality has purpose and – perhaps – distinct but overlapping demographics.

The recital is the modality of direct singer-audience connection, and the touchstone of origin practices. Sustaining its practice is vital to preservation of aesthetic integrities in all expanded practices and modalities. Full-scale Art Song Theatre provides ancillary narrative frames, complex plotlines and characters, and diverse visual elements that bring the entire Art Song repertoire (rather than just the song cycle repertoire) fully into the storytelling theatrical realm. Used creatively, the texts become elements of scripts that build dramatic multilingual stories of contemporary relevance. In that format, the massive song archive comprising millennia of poetry and centuries of musical settings can acquire a different form of global accessibility. A great diversity of forms is possible within an emerging continuum of Art Song practices, recitals, and an immensity of multimedia pairings (e.g. song paired with dance, visual arts, film, lectures, and multiple theatre
modalities). Building audiences for each modality also serves to sustain the others.

(Sharon, Interview 1, 2018)

Despite her affinity to Art Song Theatre, Sharon’s personal advocacy of theatricalization practices for pedagogy and public performance comes with a strong caveat. The artistic intentions of the works’ creators are paramount and must be revered, while the traditions governing their normative practice must be deeply studied and fully engaged before any staging is considered. Only from that foundation, as explained by Sharon, can the performance customs (but not the musical integrity) be altered to create a more accessible experience for both performers and audiences.

The fundamental purpose of expanded practices for Art Song is to draw a larger audience to its realm through diverse treatments that promote engagement. Whatever modality is undertaken, the aesthetic integrities of the composer’s intent in setting a poetic work to music must be paramount and inviolable. More specifically, if free movement, contextual narrative, and other media elements help to advance text comprehension and engagement, these are assets to be considered. However, the song itself must in all cases be interpretively prepared and performed with all the essentials of craft, style, intensity, sincerity, and vocal and pianistic beauty – the paramount obligation of the artists.

(Sharon, Interview 1, 2018)

While Set Three may have proven to be the most effective of the three sets presented from the lecture recital, broad assessment of the data suggests that each performance variation, or combination of performance variations, has its own respective audience demographic and, as such, must be taken into consideration when putting forth a performance, be it Art Song or any other genre of music.
Summary

The purpose of this study was to explore the impact of adaptive methods and modalities in Art Song performance in connecting with adult audiences (aged 18 and older) as explored through a live performance of German Lieder. Furthermore, it sought to determine a possible correlation between such varying levels of performance modality and the individual level of prior classical music training and/or familiarity with Art Song and performance preference of adult audience members attending these performances. Inspired by the anecdotal report collected from previous research conducted in 2012 by Professor Rena Sharon, this preliminary study was designed as a series of three sets of songs within a larger lecture recital, in which three distinct performance modalities, ranging from traditional to more theatrical, as well as their impact on performer-audience communication, were compared and evaluated through systematic data collection (i.e. surveys and semi-structured interviews). As a result, the research design directed the focus of this study on evaluating both the performer(s) ability to clearly communicate their interpretation of the music and the audience’s capacity to maintain their attention on the performance and connect with the performer(s).

In analyzing the responses to both the surveys and the interviews, the data helped to identify four overarching themes for further exploration. Firstly, while the expanded, multimodal applications utilized for Set Two (i.e. theatrical contextualization) enhanced the enjoyment of the set and provided a greater sense of eventful complexity to the presentation, they detracted from the audience’s ability to connect with the music and poetry of the songs performed. Of the various expanded, multimodal applications utilized, however, movement and gesture as well as additional performers were determined to be the most effective in contributing to the set, both for the performer’s communication of the piece and for the audience’s comprehension of the text.
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

Regarding text comprehension, furthermore, the methods of text translation in which the full translation of the poetry was made available to the audience throughout the performance, as opposed to momentary supertitles, allowed for a better understanding of the text and greater opportunity to reflect on the poetry. Lastly, while the level of one’s engagement during an Art Song performance can be enhanced through sensory stimulation, there seemed to be a saturation point at which the performance was perceived as less engaging and more distracting for some participants. This study suggests that Set Three (i.e. expanded traditional) was the most engaging of the three sets as it was the most engaging and the least distracting. That being said, each of the three performance variations analyzed from this study has its own respective audience demographic, and this must be accounted for when deciding how to produce and perform any genre of music, not just Art Song. Based on the findings collected from the data, further conclusions have been considered in conjunction with the literature used to support and structure the focus of this study.
V. Data Analysis

The Lied has been considered one of the defining artforms of the Romantic period, with Germany at the centre of this era of artistic development. As this movement was heavily influenced by the synthesis of the arts, the culmination of poetry set to music through the Lied perfectly reflected this artistic ideal and many of the other themes significant in 18th- and 19th-century Romanticism (Elliot, 2006). In addition, its small, more accessible format allowed for the Lied to become widely popular with the general public, starting from simple songs for the private parlours of amateur musicians and expanding to grander orchestrations for celebrity singers and full orchestra. By the end of the 19th century, the reputation and popularity of the Lied had grown into a cultural phenomenon across Europe, even extending to North America (Emmons and Sonntag, 1979). Since that time, composers went on to write more and more Art Song, but the popularity of these works – let alone the genre of Art Song – has been subject to a significant decline.

Within the modern performance practice of Art Song, the Art Song recital, the 200-year-old traditions have held firm to maintain a sense of artistry and refinement consistent with its origins. As a result, however, the success and relevancy of Art Song has diminished to the point of becoming extinct within today’s performing-arts circles (Sharon et al., 2013). In an attempt to rectify this, the Art Song recital has been altered through the incorporation of modern theatre technology, stagecraft, and narrative to reinvent and reinvigorate the Lied while at the same time ensure that the principal integrity of the artform stays intact: “Connect with both performer and public in a away that makes a practical difference to how the music sounds” (Johnson, 2004, p. 316). More specifically, Art Song Theatre has been promoted as just one example of an alternative medium for performing Art Song, creating an all-encompassing musical experience to
engage modern-day audiences in the synthesis of poetry and music through multimedia and expanded, multimodal applications.

Beyond Art Song, classical music in general is suffering as a genre, according to diminishing album sales and audience attendance. Recent findings from the Survey of Public Participation in the Arts (SPPA), conducted by the National Endowment for the Arts (NEA), confirmed an overall drop in attendance of “benchmark” activities (e.g. classical music, opera, music theatre, etc.) by adults aged 18 and older between 2002 and 2008 (National Endowment for the Arts, 2015). More specifically, it was determined that the primary audience for classical music events was adults over the age of 60, while younger demographics continue to drop. What this evidence would suggest, then, is that the classical music industry must make a change to attain new audiences while maintain current ones.

Within the realm of Art Song, specifically, audiences have become increasingly segregated from other forms of classical music to the extent that it exists primarily within higher education (Sharon et al., 2013). However, it is from these institutions that the resurgence of Art Song has taken place. For example, Professor Rena Sharon’s research on the effectiveness of Art Song performance in creating connections between performers and audiences through non-traditional practices helped to introduce Art Song Theatre as a new and innovative alternative to the Art Song recital. This in turn helped to make way for further research and the development of specific organizations dedicated to understanding performance cognition and promoting both professional and student music-performance venues (Sharon, n.d.b). Over the past 50 years, supporters of innovation within Art Song performance – including musicians, pedagogues, and researchers – have helped to reaffirm the effectiveness of expanded, multimodal applications in Art Song performance, such as Art Song Theatre, and the overall need for change to survive.
Taking inspiration from a previously conducted informal experiment conducted in 2012 by Sharon, the purpose of this study was to explore the impact of adaptive methods and modalities in Art Song performance in connecting with adult audiences (aged 18 and older) as explored through a live performance of German Lieder, and to investigate possible correlations. By incorporating expanded, multimodal applications not regularly associated with the Art Song recital, this study examined the relationship between performers and audience members during a performance of German Lieder. The study was designed as a set of three smaller sets of songs within the context of a larger lecture recital before three distinct audiences itemized according to level of prior classical music training and/or familiarity with Art Song. The data from this study was collected and recorded through both surveys during the lecture recital and semi-structured interviews following the lecture recital. In order to evaluate and potentially resolve issues of miscommunication between the performers and audience members, a variety of multimodal applications were incorporated into the three smaller sets of songs at varying degrees, creating a spectrum between traditional and innovative.

In putting forth this study, two questions were brought to the forefront when framing the study. Firstly, when incorporated in a live performance of 18th- and 19th-century German Lieder, can expanded, multimodal applications – including modern stagecraft and theatre technology – support an effective means of providing communicative gains to present-day performances of German Lieder for adult audiences? As previously stated, audience attendance for classical music events has been in steady decline for quite some time, with that of Art Song being marginalized further from the larger population. In order to offset this decline, several classical music organizations have begun to implement innovative countermeasures, focussing on enticing new audiences while sustaining current ones (Tepavac, 2010b). Art Song Theatre is an example
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

of such innovations within classical music performance; however, such innovative measures have also been the cause for dispute between those wanting to preserve the traditions of the artform and those hoping to share this underappreciated catalogue of music with a larger audience. As such, this study drew attention to its participants’ responses to such performances based on their affinity to the artform, in addition to their reactions to the lecture recital.

The second question was, “To what extent can the use of expanded, multimodal applications help mitigate the obstruction of communicative gains between a performer and his or her audience during a German Lied performance without compromise to the poetic and/or musical primacy?” One of the more prominent factors surrounding the Art Song recital’s inaccessibility is its constricting performance parameters, in addition to the potential language barrier when performing German Lieder for modern North American audiences (Sharon et al., 2013). According to Balk’s theory of perceptual and projective modes, performers are challenged to coordinate speech and singing, facial expression, and movement and touch within a performance for audiences to better connect with the performer(s) based on their individual perceptual modes (i.e. aural, visual, and kinesthetic) (Balk, 1985). As such, an array of expanded, multimodal applications aligning with Art Song Theatre, opera, and music theatre were incorporated at varying degrees within the lecture recital to assess a potential correlation between sensory stimulation and performance perception. Prompted by the current issues surrounding the classical music industry, framed by the objectives of this study, and further supported by the literature and data collected, a series of overarching themes have opened new insights from the analysis of this study.
Audience Classification

At its most basic level, to perform music – whether instrumental or vocal – stems from the desire or necessity to communicate and is therefore an act of communication unto itself. For the Lied, the synthesis of poetry set to music as easily accessible songs for amateur musicians and professionals alike allowed for both composers and poets to more easily communicate the significant themes in 18th- and 19th-century Romanticism with larger audiences, including those who lacked a formal education in either discipline. According to Johnson, however, the scope of the Lied’s accessibility has diminished, abdicating itself from the more human experiences of its origins for the “arcane manifestos of power-politics within academia more concerned with internal point-scoring and scholarly one-upmanship” (Johnson, 2004, p. 316). It is as if a feigned barrier of musical complexity and foreign language has been built to imply that the Lied is only available to those who are academically inclined. As a result, the overall relevance of the Lied today has been confined to higher education (i.e. university music programs) with little success or relevancy outside the realm of academia.

Even though the Lied was first conceived from a need to connect with audiences on a more human level, the competitive nature of academia – as mentioned by Johnson – has reduced its accessibility outside of higher education. More specifically, by claiming a place within the canon of Western classical music as dictated by university-level music education, the Lied has been forced to denounce its affiliation to the human experiences of its origins in place of being immortalized as fine art. Furthermore, this is also true of other cultural disciplines of Art Song (e.g. French Mélodie, Spanish Cancion, etc.). This abandonment of the human experience is something which, according to Dewey, happens to all forms of art, in addition to music. Despite their current denomination, the majority – if not all – of the artifacts and the musical
compositions considered today to be fine art were not originally intended to be revered as monuments to great art. Rather, they were crafted out of necessity, that is “such things were enhancements of the processes of everyday life… and all the rhythmic crises that punctuate the stream of living” (Dewey, 1934, pp. 6-7). With music, specifically, the affiliation with the human experience is meant to serve as a reflection of daily life and natural experience, rather than sophisticated refinement. This can be seen with the Lied, because it was created as a means of capturing the various themes in 18th- and 19th-century Romanticism, preserving their more human qualities, and sharing them anew with both familiar and unfamiliar audiences. In an earlier interview with the researcher, Professor Rena Sharon quoted one of the founding members of the Franz Schubert Institute, the prestigious international mastercourse on Lied interpretation and performance in Baden, Austria, giving light to this idea.

‘German Lied is like all great music. It’s about taking something of the human condition and getting it down to its essence, so that, for a brief period in time, the musicians and audiences share in the same treat. The [Franz] Schubert Institute taught me [the unnamed founding member] that it’s our responsibility as musicians to allow ourselves and our audiences to have this kind of genuine experience and to be open to the kind of deep communication that is unique to music’. (Claborn, n.d., paragraph 5)

From the researcher’s perspective, while the general language of this quote appears to present an invitation to a broader, more open scope for participation, the internal language can be interpreted as bellying such notions. Specifically, the concept of a “genuine experience” presents a potential paradox with regard to whether or not this genre of music – this genre of “great music” – can be accessible to any audience, not just an educated audience. On one hand, this genuine experience can be presented as something that is authentic and, therefore, free from any
pretense or affectation, thereby creating something that is relatable to any group or affiliation. On the other hand, the concept of a genuine experience can also be perceived as a shibboleth: a password that implies a preliminary knowledge or understanding of this coded language in order to truly acknowledge the greatness of this music and appreciate such performances. Is great music, then, defined by the scope of its accessibility, suggesting that anyone may freely enjoy it, or by the complexity of its craft, implying that only a select few can truly appreciate it?

The segregation of classical music as dictated by higher education, as explained by Johnson, in addition to cultural obstruction (i.e. foreign language), combined with the objectification of fine art, as affirmed by Dewey, has contributed to the embellished reverence for the Lied and ultimately its current inaccessibility outside the halls of university-level music education. Despite the speculative nature of the theoretical evidence presented, the data collected from the study, specifically the surveys, further supports these theories from a more practical perspective.

**Education and understanding.** Prior to the beginning of the lecture recital, participants were asked to complete Section One of the survey, which asked participants to self-identify such personal traits as age, level of education, and affiliation to classical music, Art Song, and German Lieder. Of the 70 individuals who participated in the study, the majority of participants identified themselves within Subgroup A, either post-secondary or graduate student/alum in Music (53%), with the remaining 47 percent of participants divided between Subgroups B and C, post-secondary or graduate student/alum not in Music (26%) and experienced concertgoer/professional in Music (21%) respectively. Because this study was conducted within an institution of higher education in Music, specifically Western University’s Don Wright Faculty of Music, the sample itself cannot be used to generalize its findings to a larger
population; rather, the sample is only representative of individuals willing to attend classical music recitals. Furthermore, this portion of the survey was designed with the specific intent of determining the possible separation within higher education, that is individuals within higher education in Music and those within higher education not in Music. In addition to the difference in attendance between the two, both subgroups’ responses to the remainder of the survey support the assumption that higher education does not guarantee a greater accessibility to classical music; rather, higher education in Music, specifically, can increase this accessibility. Nevertheless, the significant difference between the number of participants from Subgroup A compared to Subgroups B and C aligns with Johnson’s previous statement that the overall accessibility of the Lied now primarily resides within university music programs, with performance opportunities outside this realm being scarce (Johnson, 2004).

In addition to representing the largest of the three subgroups from the lecture recital, Subgroup A – post-secondary or graduate student/alum in Music – showed the most substantial differences in survey responses between the three varying modalities from the lecture recital. Specifically, Subgroup A’s survey responses for Set Two – the more theatrical set – were higher than those of either Set One or Set Three across all five categories: text, story, focus, emotion, and connection. Furthermore, while all three subgroups’ responses were consistent in that Set Two scored higher than either Set One or Set Three in all five categories, Subgroup A’s response were on average eight percent higher than those from either Subgroup B or C. On the other hand, in comparing the overall effectiveness of the three varying sets, the survey responses from Subgroup C, experienced concertgoer/professional in Music, were between four percent and seven percent higher than those from either Subgroup A or B.
Sharon had already explained that attempts to modify the traditional Art Song recital – let alone Art Song Theatre – are often subject to disproval and criticism from the professional perspective (Sharon, Interview 1, 2018). The survey responses from Subgroup C, experienced concertgoer/professional in Music, further illustrate this maintained level of enthusiasm towards enhanced performance practices from the professional perspective, because they were less dynamic in comparing the overall effectiveness of the three varying sets than Subgroup A or B (Table 12).

*Table 12: Comparison of responses between the three varying performance modalities (response averages)*

![Graph showing comparison of responses between sets for different subgroups]

When asked to identify their affiliation to classical music – specifically how often one attends public classical music performances within a year – and their familiarity with Art Song and German Lieder, the survey responses from each subgroup varied. The majority of participants from both Subgroups A and C were recorded as frequent attendees of public classical music performances (83% average between the two). In addition, while most participants from Subgroup A identified themselves as being very familiar with Art Song and German Lieder (65%), there was an almost even split between participants from Subgroup C,
who identified themselves as either very familiar or moderately familiar with Art Song or German Lieder (47% to 53% respectively). Contrasted with the first and third subgroups, participants from Subgroup B only sometimes attend public classical music performances within a year, with an even 50-50 split between moderately and not at all familiar with Art Song and German Lieder. As a result, the findings from the collective audience determined that the majority of participants from the lecture recital overall would frequently attend public classical music performances (67%) and were moderately familiar with Art Song and German Lieder (45%).

**Age and appreciation.** In addition to education, age has been proven to be an equally important variable when evaluating the accessibility of Art Song and classical music. The most recent findings from the NEA’s SPPA, between 2002 and 2012, determined that older audiences, specifically aged 65 and over, are more likely to attend “benchmark” activities (i.e. public art and music performances) than younger audiences (National Endowment for the Arts, 2015). Not only were Americans aged 65 and over recorded as the only demographic subgroup to show an increase in “benchmark” attendance during this time, their rates of attendance at classical music and opera events, specifically, were significantly higher at the end of this decade of research (National Endowment for the Arts, 2015). On the other end of this spectrum, furthermore, the rates of attendance for classical music and opera events from younger audiences, particularly those between ages 18 and 24, continue to drop. More specifically, the average number of concertgoers under the age of 30 dropped by almost 20 percent between 1982 and 2002, whereas that of concertgoers over the age of 60 rose by almost 15 percent (Vanhoenacker, 2014). With the rate of attendance for classical music events from both older and younger audiences at such an extreme juxtaposition, it follows that there is an inability to effectively transfer an
appreciation for classical music between these groups. As a result, the possibility of classical music dying alongside its older audiences continues to increase.

That being said, innovative strategies within the classical music industry have proven to be successful in drawing in new audiences while maintaining current ones. As previously discussed, the results from the New World Symphony’s (NWS) non-traditional concerts found such practices “attracted more than double the number of new patrons than traditionally formatted programs, while also increasing audience diversity” (Burton, 2013, paragraph 5). While these concerts may have only accounted for ten percent of the overall concert funding, 31 percent of this funding was accredited to first-time ticket buyers; furthermore, 42 percent of these buyers made additional ticket purchases for upcoming productions, both innovative and more conventional formats (Burton, 2013).

In analyzing the age demographic from the lecture recital, the majority of participants overall were over the age of 55 (45%); furthermore, the majority of participants from Subgroup C were found to be within the same demographic (80%) (Table 13).

*Table 13. S1-Q1: “What is your age?” (response averages)*
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

This data coordinates with that of the NEA, thereby reaffirming a stronger appreciation for classical music from older adult audiences and less so from younger adult audiences.

The overarching correlation. Based on each subgroup’s age and affiliation to classical music, Art Song, and German Lieder, one can deduce a correlation between the subgroups’ identification and their responses to the varying stimuli from the three sets. This is to say that older audiences and individuals with a stronger understanding of classical music and Art Song are more likely to connect with an Art Song performance more easily than those who do not. Both shifts in music education and classical music consumption have proven to be strong defining factors in determining an audience’s ability to understand and appreciate classical music. Where the objectification and the segregation of classical music within higher education, as put forward by Johnson and Dewey, has isolated the Lied from audiences new to the genre, the ever-expanding divide between older and younger audiences’ appreciation for classical music, as reported by the NEA, has prevented the recognition for classical music to seamlessly transition from one generation to the next. As a result, the perceptions surrounding Art Song and classical music may continue to be distorted, ultimately creating a falsified representation for such artforms as being available to only a select few.

The original objective for this study was to explore the impact of adaptive methods and modalities in Art Song performance in connecting with adult audiences (aged 18 and older) as explored through a live performance of German Lieder, and to investigate possible correlations. However, the data provided from the surveys in combination with the literature reviewed provide a revised, alternative research objective. As the majority of participants who attended the lecture recital were identified as over the age of 55 and already familiar with classical music and German Lied, either at the student or professional level, the increased responses to the varying
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

sets – certainly higher than those from Subgroup B – strongly indicate the potential for such performance methods within Art Song to create greater sustainability for the artform and minimize the transition from older to younger generations of pre-existing classical music audiences.

Sensory Stimulation

As previously discussed, the classical music industry has been defined by years of tradition, firmly establishing the standards for how classical music should be performed. While such traditions have helped to preserve the history and rudiments of classical music performance practices, the current decline within the industry demands an adjustment. As a result, classical musicians are being challenged to become innovators within the industry while at the same time acknowledge and respect the traditions from when the industry was first defined, thereby attracting newer and larger audiences while maintaining current ones, as well. (Helfgot and Beeman, 1993). This balancing act between tradition and innovation should not be interpreted as a “one size fits all” solution, however. The studies of both the League of American Orchestras (2010) and the NWS (2013) concluded that innovation within the industry is necessary; however, this innovation exists as a spectrum in which the solutions are determined by the individual mission statements, goals, as well as the specific genre(s) of classical music (e.g. orchestral, chamber, vocal, etc.) (Tepavac, 2010b).

As for Art Song and German Lieder, the purpose – albeit the mission statement – for such genres of music has always been communication: firstly, communication between singer and collaborative pianist to create an original but honest interpretation of the music and poetry; second, communication between the performer(s) and the audience to ensure that the message, story, or theme that they are presenting on stage is being effectively conveyed to the audience. Within this subsection of classical music, however, there exist two distinct yet highly educated
schools of performance practice which thereby represent the opposing sides of Art Song’s own spectrum of performance and communication, specifically traditional versus innovative.

**Traditional versus innovative.** At face value, the performance parameters of a traditional Art Song recital can seem limiting, both for the performer(s) and the audience. For example, while facial expression is considered the Art Song performer’s greatest asset at his or her disposal, movement and gesture are often considered inappropriate or strictly advised under very specific circumstances (Emmons and Sonntag, 1979). While such protocols may be interpreted as overly restrictive, they have been established for good reason, that is to allow the music to remain the primary focus of the Art Song recital, thereby removing the risk “that physical gesture dilutes the intensity of authentic expression through the musical channel” (Sharon et al., 2013, p. 372). In addition to preventing an emotional disconnect from the audience, having such parameters for Art Song performance put forward can benefit the performers. According to Hemsley, most classically trained singers struggle with interpretation, because they choose not to give the words that they are singing the attention they deserve. The words – the poetry – are most often the primary focus of any Art Song, because it is the poetry that first inspired the composer to create his or her musical work; as such, they must be treated as the starting point for interpretation and the focal point of the performance (Hemsley, 1998).

Beyond current reservations about Art Song performance, it has already been mentioned that Schumann, the primary composer whose works on which this study is focussed, instilled in his *Neue Zeitschrift für Musik* stricter, more private parameters when performing Lieder: “To be sung alone in a private space or to a small circle of close friends” (Sharon et al., 2013, pp. 372-373). If these are the composer’s opinions on the genre, would Schumann have cared for the researcher’s interpretation of his songs from the lecture recital?
As Professor Rena Sharon has already disclosed, attempts to modify the traditional Art Song recital – let alone Art Song Theatre – are often regarded as unwarranted from the professional perspective. As such, they do not require anything further beyond the music and poetry to enjoy such works (Sharon, Interview 1, 2018). Applying this to the data from the lecture recital, the survey responses from Subgroup C, experienced concertgoer/professional in Music, further illustrate this maintained level of enthusiasm towards enhanced performance practices from the professional perspective, because they did not fluctuate as much as the responses from Subgroup A or B when comparing the overall effectiveness of the varying sets (Table 14).

Since Subgroup C was itemized as having a professional understanding of Art Song and the Art Song recital, their responses in comparing the overall effectiveness of the more normative sets from the lecture recital (i.e. Set One and Set Three) were that much more consistent to those from the more enhanced set (i.e. Set Two).
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

Sharon has spoken with many colleagues within the Art Song community who are opposed to her work with Art Song Theatre based on some of the previously mentioned criteria, but there is a growing community of professionals who are experimenting with staging and providing very positive feedback and enthusiastic advocacy for innovation. More importantly, however, Sharon acknowledges that such oppositions come from a great respect for the artform and agrees whole-heartedly that “artists bear an obligation to connect with each individual song’s integrities – to protect what must never be forfeited while respectfully exploring what may be added in service of profound connections” (Sharon, Interview 1, 2018). Theatricalization, whether that includes movement and gesture, props and costumes, additional performers, and so on, can be used to enhance the audience’s ability to connect with the poetry via visual and/or kinesthetic association or the performer’s ability to express the context of the poetry more naturally. However, these elements must prioritize the revelation of the poetic context and musical interplay, or the perception of the performance may be diverted, in which case the emotional intensity of the music may be forfeited. Data from the lecture recital suggested that – for some – the addition of expanded, multimodal applications can produce a negative impact on an experienced audience’s focus and comprehension.

**Sensory saturation.** Of the three sets from the lecture recital, Set Two, the more theatrical set, was reported – according to the survey responses – as being the most entertaining set, scoring nine percent higher than Set Three, the intermediary set, and 16 percent higher than Set One, the more traditional set. This impressive result is mitigated by the data concerning distracted focus, however. At the conclusion of the lecture recital, participants were to complete Section Three of the survey, where they were asked to expand on their selections from the Likert-like questions of Sections Two-A through Two-C using more qualitative responses.
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

Question Three from this section asked participants whether any of the additional, multimodal applications utilized in Set Two (i.e. movement and gesture, props and costumes, projected illustrations, translations projected as supertitles, and additional performers) detracted from the set. The responses to this question determined that, regardless of whatever subgroup into which the participants itemized themselves, participants were no longer able to focus on the music and poetry during this set, because there were too many additional components to the set that left the audience either distracted or confused. Of the five additional, multimodal applications utilized during Set Two, projected illustrations and translations projected as supertitles were recorded as being the least effective in helping the audience to better understand and connect with the performer(s). Specifically, these two applications were recorded between 17 and 21 percent less effective than the most effective applications of this set (i.e. movement and gesture and additional performers) (Table 15).

*Table 15. S2-Q18: "Rank the effectiveness for each of the following multimodal applications used." (response averages)*

Text projection. With regard to translations projected as supertitles, specifically, there has always been – and continues to be – a great deal of acrimony surrounding the use of
projected translations during a classical voice performance, even in opera. According to Alves, while supertitles are practically a staple component within most larger opera houses, including the Metropolitan Opera and La Scala, there is a standard within supertitle development and operation that must be upheld for them to be effective (Alves, 1991). Furthermore, what will ultimately determine the overall effectiveness of projected translations is not just whether the audience can understand the words being sung but whether or not the audience can understand the words being sung without being drawn away from the performance. As previously mentioned, such components are to be treated as supplementary to a performance; they are meant to enhance the overall performance, but they must never interfere with or supersede the primary aspects of the artform. The standards for projected translations in opera have been created for a reason: to enhance an audience’s level of comprehension, particularly for those unfamiliar with the music or sung language, thereby ensuring that the musical integrity of the operatic performance is truly realized and appreciated (Alves, 1991).

Similar to opera, there is much debate surrounding projected translations in an Art Song performance; however, the standards for its use are governed by different priorities. While projected translations must never take away from the musical integrity of the performance, as with opera, Art Song puts greater emphasis on the text being sung (i.e. the poetry) in addition to the music. As a result, the specific intricacies of poetry present their own specific considerations when putting forth projected translations.

The comparison to the use of opera surtitles is only partially relevant, because (unlike most operatic libretti) there can be many lines of text within a very short span of time, resulting in a need to keep one’s eyes continuously raised above the performer(s). In that
logistic situation, the benefits of shifting from printed text to projected text are greatly diminished. (Sharon, Interview 1, 2018)

Whether for opera or Art Song, the text is an equally intrinsic component of the musical performance. For Art Song, specifically, the value of projected translations is to re-establish the primacy of the recital as sung poetry rather than music accompanied by words. As such, while it is possible for the projected translations of an Art Song recital to be treated in the same manner as supertitles for an operatic performance, there are alternative methods available that better compliment the unique demands of poetry.

As previously discussed, poetry possesses a visual structure, framed according to such criteria as syllabic stress, rhyming couplets, and length. The visual structure of the poem is arranged as such to organize each moment or theme within the larger work. Because the visual structure is so important, projecting the translation of the poem as individual lines of text akin to operatic supertitles impedes the connection of the lines of poetry to one another, the intensity of the poetry, and its impact on the audience reading the poetry during the performance. In this case, it is advised that one stanza be projected at a time in order to contain the themes relative to each stanza or grouping, thereby minimizing any potential impediment on the audience’s understanding of the poetry (Sharon, Interview 2, 2018). In addition to the advocacy of such performance scholars as Sharon and Alves, the responses from the lecture recital also concur with a similar criterion for projected translations during a live Art Song performance.

**Direct and indirect translation.** It has already been mentioned that the translations projected as supertitles and the projected illustrations were determined to be the least effective elements from Set Two of the lecture recital. Rather than help the audience better connect with the poetry being sung in a foreign language, the translations projected as supertitles were seen as
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

a distraction, primarily because they changed too often and too quickly and were too removed from the stage space of the performance. When considering the more qualitative responses from Section Three of the survey, participants explained that the use of movement and gesture and additional performers, the most effective components of Set Two overall, were more effective in understanding the text than the translations projected as supertitles, because participants were able to create both a kinesthetic and a relational association to the music while still being contained within the stage space of the performance (Table 16).

Table 16. S3-Q2: “How was your overall experience from today’s performances impacted by movement and gesture, props and costumes, projected illustrations, translations projected as supertitles, and additional performers?”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subgroup</th>
<th>Responses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Subgroup A | “Additional performers helped me to understand the context of the songs as dialogues.”  
“Having the translations change as often as they did as supertitles was very distracting.” |
| Subgroup B | “It was so much easier to understand the flow of the story and emotion of the performance.”  
“My overall experience was enhanced, because the emotion behind the text was that much more energized.”  
“Having the text projected one line at a time was very distracting.” |
| Subgroup C | “The songs were so much more accessible this way.”  
“The more staged they were, the greater the enjoyment was.”  
“The supertitles were not easy to read and made it very distracting.” |

In addition, disrupting the visual structure of the poetry as fragmented lines of text further diluted the impact of the poetry, as previously mentioned by Professor Rena Sharon. This is one of the reasons why Sharon does not use this method of text translation in her own work. Instead, Sharon advocates providing both the original language and the text translation in their original poetic format – printed and/or projected – to maintain both the visual and emotional impact of
the poetry, as well as to create a stronger association to what the audience hears from the singer and reads from the translation.

When a projection format keeps stanzas in concordance with poetic structure, though multiple slides may be necessary due to length of the poem and the need for legible font size, some degree of visual integrity is sustained for the poem, while also maintaining connection with the artist on stage. In my [Sharon’s] opinion, this allows for a more immersive and logistically demanding experience for audiences... My colleagues and I experimented with various text-projection options. The approach that seemed to eliminate distraction most successfully during a full-scale theatrical production was to have two medium-sized, black screens with white text in clearly readable font and size positioned on walls at opposite sides of the stage so that they do not interfere with the stage processes. About eight lines of text were projected per slide so as to offer readability with minimal shifts. For recital modalities, the screen is on stage or suspended at a comfortable visual angle relative to performers. Ideally, the original language is projected alongside the translation. If there are images, the text is placed usually on the margin, but can overlay the image if readability permits. The most compelling version was a venue with a backscreen that comprised the entire stage, creating a beautiful sense of immersion in the poetry. (Sharon, Interview 1, 2018)

Because the method of text translation provided in Set Two did not adhere to the appropriate criteria of text translation for an Art Song performance, additionally those set forth by Sharon from her work with Art Song Theatre, Sharon disclosed to the researcher – after having reviewed a video recording of the lecture recital – that this particular performance does not encompass a complete definition of Art Song Theatre. Rather, Sharon places this performance within the
broaden spectrum of theatricalized Art Song performance (Sharon, Interview 2, 2018).

Furthermore, there were additional components from the remaining two set sets of the lecture recital that both Sharon and participants from the lecture recital reported as being more effective and more suitable for an Art Song performance. Alves’ research on the use of supertitles already confirmed that, when treated improperly, supertitles can present more of a distraction. Since this format of text translation was only utilized in Set Two, this specific stimuli may have played a more substantial role in the qualitative survey questions regarding distraction, thereby impacting the conclusions regarding the effectiveness of Set Two as opposed to that of Set Three in which text translations were projected holistically. As such, it must be noted that ancillary elements, such as supertitles, may have had an obstructive impact on audience engagement pertaining to other elements of the musical performance. Contrasted with that of Set Two, the means of text translation from both Set One and Set Three (i.e. printed translations and translations projected in poetic form respectively) were recorded as both more effective and more appropriate.

While the quantitative data from the survey recorded that text comprehension during Set Two was higher than that of either Set One or Set Three, between five and 15 percent higher respectively, the qualitative responses from Section Three of the survey seemed to contradict the previously mentioned data. Specifically, where the quantitative data determined that Set Two scored the highest for text comprehension overall, this was only because Set Two utilized movement and gesture and additional performers to more effectively convey the text, better than the translations projected as supertitles – the intended means of text translation for this set. On the other hand, where Set One and Set Three scored lower for text comprehension overall, the intended means of text translation from these sets were recorded as being more effective than that of Set Two. Looking at the qualitative responses from the survey, as well as the responses to
the interviews, participants reported that having the text translation provided as either printed translations from Set One or projected in poetic form from Set Three were the more effective means of text translation, because participants could absorb and apply the translation prior to, during, and immediately after the set, unlike with the translations projected as supertitles from Set Two.

I prefer printed translations, because it allows me the time to read them and reflect on them, after the performance even. Perhaps it is a bit of a skewed image in music, but if the song is not completed, and it is only completed when it is in the past tense, having the printed translations as a reference point is helpful to reflect on the performance.

(Interviewee A-1)

While the results from the lecture recital may appear duopolistic in nature, they emphasize the effectiveness of sensory stimulation in projecting and processing information, as put forth by Balk and the Institute of Learning Styles Research (ILSR).

As previously discussed, Balk’s theory of perceptual and projective modes in artistic performance promotes a combination of facial expression, singing and/or speaking, and movement and gesture (i.e. projective modes) when performing to appeal to the primary senses (i.e. perceptual modes) of a collective audience rather than isolate individual members more prone to one specific mode (Balk, 1985). Furthermore, the ILSR’s theory of perceptual learning encourages the repeated exposure and utilization of all seven perceptual pathways (i.e. print, aural, visual, haptic, interactive, kinesthetic, and olfactory) to instill greater retention via long-term memory, thereby granting greater ease of access to all five of one’s senses when processing information in any form (“Overview of the Seven Perceptual Styles”, n.d.). With all five senses that much more stimulated, akin to a full-body workout, the concept of individual learning styles
should be amended. No longer will such individuals be considered visual or aural learners alone; instead, they will be universal learners, adept to effectively processing information however it is presented.

With regard to the lecture recital, the results from the surveys and interviews reported multiple means of effective text translation and comprehension via multiple sensory pathways: firstly, both Set One and Set Three’s intended methods of text translation (i.e. printed translations and translations projected in poetic form respectively) effectively appealed to the print, visual, and potentially haptic pathways; secondly, the use of movement and gesture in both Set Two and Set Three, as well as additional performers in Set Two, further aided the visual and kinesthetic pathways; thirdly, the singing voice – what should never be overlooked in a voice recital – engaged the aural pathway. Had the aforesaid components been incorporated into a single Art Song performance, engaging five of the audience’s seven available perceptual pathways, it is anticipated that the emotional intensity of the poetry – the primary focus of any Art Song performance, as stressed by Sharon – would have been that much more accessible to the audience. In this specific scenario, perhaps establishing such parameters as a baseline for future Art Song performances has the potential to further promote such accessibility and engagement for this genre of music on a larger scale.

**Contextualization**

Comprehension and connection are an essential combination when presenting any material, especially with classical music. Whether or not the audience understands the material being presented will ultimately determine their ability to engage with the performer(s) and the performance. The presentation of the material is just as important in helping audiences to comprehend and ultimately appreciate the performance.
From her research, Professor Rena Sharon asserts that an Art Song performance, particularly when the poetic language is non-native to an audience member, possesses a number of equally integral components. These components – to an audience unfamiliar with the genre – can be overwhelming. In addition, the minimal staging and a foreign language can also create a great deal of confusion. As a result, audiences tend to abandon the printed translation so as to remain focused on what is happening on the stage, thereby missing the poetic-musical fusion (Sharon, Interview 1, 2018). In order to resolve this issue, Sharon structured her lecture recitals in such a way that provided a consistent level of contextualization and comprehension for the audience from start to finish.

The first show we [Sharon and colleagues] did was around ’97. We had a script, and the show was divided into two sections. The first part was about going through the songs that we were to perform to help the audience to understand; after intermission, we had a one-hour show. As a result, audiences immediately realized that they understood what they were hearing. (Sharon, Interview 1, 2018)

Sharon effectively counteracted normative comprehension issues by providing musical and poetic contextual information to the performance, thereby allowing audiences to appreciate the music on a more intimate, artistic level. In addition to explaining the context of the music prior to the performance, Sharon’s methods of narrative and stagecraft have been found to help audiences to carry over this contextualization to the performance itself. Furthermore, such methods exemplify both Balk’s theory of perceptual and projective modes in artistic performance and the ILSR’s theory of perceptual learning. Just as there are multiple ways in which individuals can perceive and interpret information (e.g. aural, visual, kinesthetic, etc.), there are multiple ways in which one can present information – in this instance, perform a piece of music.
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

As such, musicians are challenged to employ a variety of these methods to their own performances to satisfy the varying perceptual modes of an audience, as opposed to limiting the performance to only a single dimension (Balk, 1985).

“Lecture” recital. After collecting the data from the lecture recital, the findings were then summarized and presented to Professor Rena Sharon in order to conduct a follow-up interview. Having reviewed a video recording of the lecture recital in addition to the summarized data from both the surveys and the six interviews with the lecture-recital attendees, Sharon was clear to emphasize to the researcher that the methods utilized in the lecture recital, specifically those utilized during the second, more theatrical set, do not specifically follow the model of Art Song Theatre; rather, the lecture recital should be considered an interpretation inspired by earlier anecdotal reports from Sharon’s own research concerned with the theatricalization of Art Song and its impact on audience cognition and interpretation. While the manner in which the songs were performed during the lecture recital does not represent Sharon’s work with Art Song Theatre as a full-scale production modality, there are similarities between the overall structure of the lecture recital and that of Sharon’s own lecture-recital series. One such similarity is taking the time to help the audience to understand the context of the music before performing it.

The repertoire on which the lecture recital focussed was Liederkreis (Op. 24) by Robert Schumann. In order to compare the varying performance modalities, however, the nine-piece song cycle was divided into three smaller sets. In addition to performing the songs, the researcher was also responsible for presenting the context of the songs and the history of the composer to the audience prior to each set. As previously discussed, Sharon’s own lecture recitals were structured in a somewhat similar fashion.
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

While the primary focus of the study was to better understand the varying levels of performance modality during an Art Song performance and their impact on adult audiences by comparing the three variations within a single lecture recital, the fact that the context of each set of songs was further contextualized to the audience separate from the musical performances seemed to be just as effective than the theatricalization of Art Song alone. As previously disclosed by Sharon from her own research and performances, incorporating narrative and staging to the music after having first provided the context of the music and poetry is a powerful template for a lecture recital, especially when the music is being performed to an audience foreign to the genre. Similar responses were alluded to from the interviews with the lecture-recital attendees, emphasizing a connection between contextualization and engagement.

If you’re feeling disengaged because you’re not really understanding it [the music], chances are you’re going to be less involved and more distracted, and you’re not going to fully appreciate what’s being presented and less interested. (Interviewee B-1)

Beyond helping the audience to connect with the music, providing context prior to a performance encourages the audience (Sharon, Interview 1, 2018). If the format of the lecture recital had been changed, removing all narrated contextualization, would the data from the surveys have provided different results?

Upon further evaluation of the qualitative responses to Section Three of the survey, all three subgroups were impacted by the contextualization (Table 17).
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

Table 17. S3: Responses associated to the narration provided by the researcher before each performance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subgroup</th>
<th>Responses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Subgroup A</td>
<td>• “As a whole, this is the only Art Song recital I have ever enjoyed.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• “I don’t feel as if my experience changed between sets. I knew what I was going to listen to, because the context had already been provided.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• “My emotional connection felt strong throughout all three [performances] because of the strong storytelling, both during and in between each performance.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subgroup B</td>
<td>• “I didn’t feel much of a difference in comprehension between the three performances, because the larger presentation helped me to appreciate the performances.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subgroup C</td>
<td>• “The major factor in comprehension and emotional connection was the background to these songs and to Schumann’s life provided by Mr. Iannetta before the singing. The performance and the songs were a very nice window into the Romantic era.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• “Having never attended a performance quite like this, I found it engrossing. All the extra elements allowed me to be immersed in a world of references that enriched both my historical an emotional understanding.”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As the primary objective of this study was not to determine the impact of contextualization prior to each set, the responses gathered in support of this hypothesis cannot sufficiently support such assumptions, certainly not for this study. That being said, the previously disclosed responses from the surveys and the interviews in conjunction with the data of Sharon’s own lecture recitals encourages continued research on the specific impact of narrated contextualization during an Art Song performance prior to the music being performed.

Summary

The study presented here has been framed according to two topics of interest: firstly, whether or not the use of expanded, multimodal applications synonymous with opera and music theatre is an effective means of providing communicative gains to present-day performances of German Lied, as seen with Art Song Theatre, for adult audiences; secondly, whether or not such practices can become distracting if overemphasized. This study was inspired and devised
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

according to earlier anecdotal reports from an informal experiment conducted by Professor Rena Sharon on the impact of the theatricalization of Art Song on audience cognition and interpretation. Participants attended a lecture recital where three distinct modalities of Art Song performance, ranging from traditional to more theatrical, were presented, evaluated, and compared using surveys containing both quantitative and qualitative materials. In addition to the three sets, participants identified their knowledge and affiliation to classical music and Art Song, anticipating a potential correlation to one’s classification and responses to each performance modality. Lastly, a select number of participants (a total of six) participated in a series of follow-up interviews to expand on their previous responses from the lecture recital.

Based on the results collected from the study in coordination with the research evaluated from the literature review, three overarching themes have been established. Firstly, age and education as it relates to post-secondary music were determined to be the primary factors in determining one’s level of connection to a live performance of classical music, German Lied in this instance. In addition, the more of one’s senses that are stimulated during a performance, as seen with the additional, multimodal applications from the lecture recital, can have a positive impact on audience engagement; however, such practices require professional refinement and application in order that they not inhibit or distract. Lastly, while not evaluated directly within this study, providing context to a performance separate from the musical presentation was also beneficial to the audience, especially audiences unfamiliar with the material. Based on these findings, the initial research questions used to frame this study can be addressed as such:

I. When incorporated in a live performance of 18th- and 19th-century German Lieder, expanded, multimodal applications – including modern stagecraft and theatre technology – can support an effective means of providing communicative gains to present-day
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

performances of German Lieder for adult audiences; however, the design of the expanded, multimodal applications may need to consider the target demographic.

II. While the exact impacts have not been determined, the use of expanded, multimodal applications to help mitigate the obstruction of communicative gains between a performer and his or her audience during a German Lied performance – in the context of this study – presented a saturation point, at which time the musical and/or poetic primacy of the performance was compromised.

The conclusions observed in this study provide further context on the effectiveness of innovative performance practices within classical music, such as current work with Art Song Theatre. It also suggests a set of parameters when putting forth a classical music performance – specifically that of Art Song/German Lied – for present-day audiences.

**The past, present, and future of Art Song.** This was a preliminary study to evaluate the impact of multimodal applications within the context of an Art Song performance based on strategic data collection. However, this is not the first endeavour to innovate and/or expand upon the pre-existing Art Song recital (Sharon, Interview 2, 2018). As previously discussed, Professor Rena Sharon’s work with Art Song Theatre spans almost 30 years; furthermore, other Art Song and classical voice practices and performances not directly related to Art Song Theatre – as discussed in the literature review – have encouraged further innovation within this context.

Beyond the reinvigoration and reimagining of the Art Song recital, however, the work that has been done thus far, including this study, should not be interpreted as testimony to why the Art Song recital should be annulled in place of something more multidimensional. Instead, it must be understood as a representation for a broader, more pressing matter that is understood amongst all Art Song scholars and performers: the significance of Art Song and the need to sustain it.
The performance practices instilled within the Art Song recital have been upheld to preserve the traditions of a 200-year-old artform and to establish the preliminary steps needed for entry-level classical singers and collaborative pianists to properly understand and appreciate the artform. Only from such a foundation can the performance customs be enhanced to create a new experience for both performers and audiences. The sustainability of Art Song cannot solely depend on innovation; it requires effective representation from a highly educated and equally passionate community of scholars, musicians, and enthusiasts to uphold the traditions of Art Song as well as encourage and oversee innovation within the artform, as Sharon has already asserted (Sharon, Interview 1, 2018).

In the midspring of 2018, the researcher attended a seminar at the University of Toronto’s Faculty of Music entitled Seminar on the Future of Song Recitals. In addition to a townhall discussion with roughly 120 stakeholders in the artform of song (e.g. teachers, singers, pianists, scholars, etc.), the seminar was lead by a panel of four highly regarded guest speakers in Art Song and classical music: Jim Norcop, singer, teacher, arts administrator, and cofounder of the Art Song Foundation of Canada; Warren Jones, collaborative pianist, teacher, and conductor; Rena Sharon, whose work has been previously discussed throughout this study; Andrew Kwon, classical musician agency manager (Hutcheon, 2018). Following this, four groups of artists provided a series of short performances, all of which were designed to present a song recital with the intention of attracting new audience members. It was here that a number of other innovative practices were presented and discussed, even beyond the materials presented in this paper.

One such example included violist Rory McLeod’s Pocket Concert, a group of freelance musicians whose business model revolves around intimate chamber concerts held in patrons’ homes, work places, and other non-traditional venues. During such performances, “the hosts
provide the place, food, and wine; tickets are sold to the general public, and the revenue goes to pay the performers” (Hutcheon, 2018, paragraph 12). In addition, tenor and teacher, Lawrence Wiliford, and pianist and University of Toronto professor, Steven Philcox, gave a presentation of their combined work as cofounders and codirectors of the Canadian Art Song Project (CASP), the mission statement of which involves both the preservation and recovery of earlier Canadian Art Song and the commissioning of new Art Songs by Canadian composers for Canadian singers while incorporating “more radical dramatizations” of such commissions (Hutcheon, 2018, paragraph 14).

The proceeding townhall discussion allowed for audience members to discuss and elaborate on some of the larger themes presented throughout the day. From the panel and proceeding discussion, five themes emerged: communication (for performers and audiences), diversity, venue, funding opportunities, and experiments (in format, genre, media, and other technology) (Hutcheon, 2018). In addition to these five themes, the collective audience of stakeholders and attendees strongly agreed that this seminar was the first of its kind and that more should be conducted “in order to share new ideas, but also to talk through the problems and difficulties faced by teachers, students, performers, and presenters in both keeping and creating an audience for the artform we all call ‘song’” (Hutcheon, 2018, paragraph 24).

Similar to the stakeholders from the Seminar on the Future of Song Recitals, the researcher hopes that the material put forth from this study can be considered a small contribution to a much larger movement in pursuit of the representation and appreciation for Art Song and its continued relevancy and sustainability. No matter the performer’s intentions, be they innovative or traditional, Art Song will always demand close communication between singer and pianist so that they may connect on a more personal level with those willing to listen.
To perform Art Song is to sing with an open heart, but to enjoy Art Song is to listen with an open mind.

Considerations for the Future

This study provides a preliminary model of a formal methodological design to investigate audience perception of traditional and expanded Art Song practices. It was designed in response to field-wide appraisal of the genre’s diminishing performance market and builds on informal data capture from surveys and interviews of audiences for both traditional and expanded practices as well as several published studies and performance reviews investigating the efficacies of staging practices in pedagogical environments.

While the study’s conception was derived from the description of an informal experiment previously conducted by Professor Rena Sharon, Sharon did not participate in the design of the study, specifically the lecture recital. Given the limitations of time and resources made available during the development and implementation of the study, the choices made by the researcher for the lecture recital – specifically, the more theatrical set (Set Two) – do not curate the full definition of Art Song Theatre. Specifically, Art Song Theatre (a term that, according to Sharon, has not been generally adopted and may not therefore be relevant) refers to “an expansive spectrum of practices – for example, scripted narrative, multiple characters using spoken and sung text, production-level theatrical capacities with a stage director, discreet piano placement, non-theatrical or alternative environments, and diverse other media,” all of which were not present during the study (Sharon, Interview 2, 2018). Relatedly, since Art Song Theatre is normatively a distinctive performance event (i.e. a full-length piece with inherent breadth of pacing, plot, and character development), inserting a staged portion (i.e. Set Two) within a traditional recital presentation precludes an array of conceptual and production elements that
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

could have presumably had a different impact for the audience. As such, while Set Two of the
lecture recital falls within the spectrum, it should not be considered an encompassing model of
these practices. Therefore, the assessments and conclusions from this study should not be
interpreted in that context but as an experimental model of a much larger emerging realm of prior
and potential multimedia productions. Had the researcher been provided the substantial amount
of time and resources needed to produce a performance that more accurately aligned with the full
scope of practices found in Art Song Theatre, perhaps the results gathered would have provided
different conclusions, specifically a more accurately defined affinity to Set Two and the
expanded, multimodal applications from that set of the lecture recital.

Looking more closely at some of the specific elements from the lecture recital, the post-
lecture-recital interview with Sharon revealed insights regarding further nuances of text
projection that may have an important impact on audience perception (e.g. height of projection
screen, number of lines per slide and related poetic structural issues, sensibilities regarding
imagery graphics, size and placement of screen, visibility and readability issues, etc.) that were
not explored in this study due to venue constraints. Consideration of these components in
shaping alternative projection treatments may potentially have yielded a different set of
outcomes both to the perception of projections per se, and to the overall experience of the
performance modality.

Furthermore, imagery projection essentially falls within the domain of scenography. As
such, it is an additional production medium and, in this usage, an emerging aspect of multimedia
presentation. In other words, imagery choices are entirely subjective and will generate diverse
reactions from observers. There is also a subgroup of observers who express strong aversion to
presenting any images aligned to poetry, arguing that these inherently intrude on the essential
nature of poetic engagement. Within the expanded practices of Art Song, there are a variety of treatments for imagery – as companions to text projections, or as digital scenography separate from text slides. Here, too, given the array of nuanced meanings and available options, as well as fundamental questions regarding quality of projection equipment, ambient lighting, and screen size, it is crucially important to avoid drawing summary conclusions. Therefore, given the available equipment and formatting choices, these were the impressions recorded from the audience. Perhaps this proposes another study in which the aspect of expanded practice would be to perform the same material using different imagery, different screen sizes and placements, different hall lighting/backlit screen, and varying text layouts with every slide.

As the data from this study is based on a more minimalist theatrical treatment with limited production capacities within a recital environment, it is necessary to perform and observe many more recitals and studies with a multiplicity of production elements, modalities, full-scale works, and diverse venue variables before drawing overarching disciplinary conclusions regarding multimedia treatments. Additionally, a broader continuum of refined methodologies would be needed to engage all the inherent issues. At this preliminary stage of disciplinary research, without more direct knowledge of the existing field, it is premature to propose a conclusive statement to the genre of Art Song Theatre as a whole. Rather, it is sufficient at this time to identify the specific framework of the study’s design and structure to encourage and advance the exploration of innovative practices within Art Song performance.
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

References


THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS


THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS


THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS


Appendix A

Date: 24 July 2018
To: Dr. Patrick Schmidt
Project ID: 111152
Study Title: Art Song Theatre: The Impact of Expanded, Multimodal Applications during a German Lied Performance
Application Type: NMREB Initial Application
Review Type: Delegated
Full Board Reporting Date: 03/Aug/2018
Date Approval Issued: 24/Jul/2018 21:25
REB Approval Expiry Date: 24/Jul/2019

Dear Dr. Patrick Schmidt,

The Western University Non-Medical Research Ethics Board (NMREB) has reviewed and approved the WREM application form for the above mentioned study, as of the date noted above. NMREB approval for this study remains valid until the expiry date noted above, conditional to timely submission and acceptance of NMREB Continuing Ethics Review.

This research study is to be conducted by the investigator noted above. All other required institutional approvals must also be obtained prior to the conduct of the study.

Documents Approved:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Document Name</th>
<th>Document Type</th>
<th>Document Date</th>
<th>Document Version</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2_5 - Interview Guide - Follow-up Interview with Professor Rena Sharon (15_05_2015)</td>
<td>Interview Guide</td>
<td>15/May/2018</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2_5 - Interview Guide - Initial Interview with Professor Rena Sharon (15_05_2018)</td>
<td>Interview Guide</td>
<td>15/May/2018</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2_5 - Interview Guide - Interview with Lecture-recital Attendees (15_05_2018)</td>
<td>Interview Guide</td>
<td>15/May/2018</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2_5 - Paper Survey (06_06_2018)</td>
<td>Paper Survey</td>
<td>06/Jul/2018</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3_1_2b - Poster (15_05_2018)</td>
<td>Recruitment Materials</td>
<td>15/May/2018</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Email Script - Interview with Lecture-recital Attendees (07_07_2018)</td>
<td>Recruitment Materials</td>
<td>07/Jul/2018</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Email Script - Interviews with Professor Rena Sharon (07_07_2018)</td>
<td>Recruitment Materials</td>
<td>07/Jul/2018</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Email Script - Lecture-recital Survey (07_07_2018)</td>
<td>Recruitment Materials</td>
<td>07/Jul/2018</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Email Script - REMINDER Interview with Lecture-recital Attendees (07_07_2018)</td>
<td>Recruitment Materials</td>
<td>07/Jul/2018</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Email Script - REMINDER Interviews with Professor Rena Sharon (07_07_2018)</td>
<td>Recruitment Materials</td>
<td>07/Jul/2018</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Email Script - REMINDER Lecture-recital Survey (07_07_2018)</td>
<td>Recruitment Materials</td>
<td>07/Jul/2018</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consent Form - Contact for Future Studies (06_06_2018)</td>
<td>Implied Consent/Assent</td>
<td>06/Jul/2018</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Letter of Information and Consent - Interview with Lecture-recital Attendees (07_07_2018)</td>
<td>Written Consent/Assent</td>
<td>07/Jul/2018</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Letter of Information and Consent - Interviews with Professor Rena Sharon (07_07_2018)</td>
<td>Verbal Consent/Assent</td>
<td>07/Jul/2018</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

No deviations from, or changes to the protocol should be initiated without prior written approval from the NMREB, except when necessary to eliminate immediate hazard(s) to study participants or when the change(s) involves only administrative or logistical aspects of the trial.

The Western University NMREB operates in compliance with the Tri-Council Policy Statement Ethical Conduct for Research Involving Humans (TCPS2), the Ontario Personal Health Information Protection Act (PHIPA, 2004), and the applicable laws and regulations of Ontario. Members of the NMREB who are named as Investigators in research studies do not participate in discussions related to, nor vote on such studies when they are presented to the REB. The NMREB is registered with the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services under the IRB registration number IRB 00000941.

Please do not hesitate to contact us if you have any questions.

Sincerely,

Katelyn Harris, Research Ethics Officer on behalf of Dr. Randal Graham, NMREB Chair

*Note: This correspondence includes an electronic signature (validation and approval via an online system that is compliant with all regulations).*
Email Script for Recruitment

Subject Line: Invitation to participate in research on performance modality

Dear Professor Rena Sharon,

You are being invited to participate in a study that we, Adam Iannetta (Research Assistant) and Dr. Patrick Schmidt (Principal Investigator), are conducting. As one of the leading advocates of expanded Art Song performance practice and pedagogy, as well as the individual after whose research this study has been modelled, this study would benefit greatly from your insight. Briefly, your participation in the study will consist of two interviews, each of which will take approximately 20 minutes, where you and the Research Assistant (Adam Iannetta) meet and discuss your insight surrounding the issues, literature, and methodology considered for this study, as well as the findings from the study. Prior to the second interview, the findings from the study will be provided to you via email as a summarized report. Both interviews will be done over the phone and will be audio-recorded. The date and time of each interview will be determined between both you and the Research Assistant (Adam Iannetta).

A copy of the Letter of Information and Consent has been attached to this email.

A reminder email will be sent one week prior to the confirmed date of each interview.

If you would like more information on this study, please contact the Research Assistant (Adam Iannetta) at the contact information given below.

Thank you,

Adam Domenico Iannetta
Don Wright Faculty of Music
Subject Line: REMINDER – Invitation to participate in research on performance modality

Dear Professor Rena Sharon,

This is a reminder that you have agreed to participate in a study that we, Adam Iannetta (Research Assistant) and Dr. Patrick Schmidt (Principal Investigator), are conducting. To reiterate, your participation in the study will consist of two interviews, one of which is to take place a week from today on August 8\(^{th}\) of 2018/December 19\(^{th}\) of 2018, where you and the Research Assistant (Adam Iannetta) meet and discuss your insight surrounding the issues, literature, and methodology considered for this study (August 8\(^{th}\), 2018), as well as the findings from the study (December 19\(^{th}\), 2018). Prior to the second interview, the findings from the study, that is the surveys and the interviews following the lecture recital, will be shared with you via email as a summarized report. This report will not contain any identifiable information linking participants to the study. Both interviews will be done over the phone and will be audio-recorded. Your verbal consent will be documented by the Research Assistant (Adam Iannetta) at the beginning of the interview.

A copy of the Letter of Information and Consent has been attached to this email.

If you would like more information on this study, please contact the Research Assistant (Adam Iannetta) at the contact information given below.

Thank you,

Adam Domenico Iannetta
Don Wright Faculty of Music
Letter of Information and Consent

Interviews with Professor Rena Sharon

111521: The Impact of Expanded, Multimodal Applications

The Impact of Expanded, Multimodal Applications during a German Lied Performance

Dr. Patrick Schmidt (Principal Investigator)
Dr. Patrick Schmidt, PhD
Chair – Music Education and Associate Professor, Don Wright Faculty of Music
Western University

Adam Iannetta (Research Assistant)
Adam Iannetta, MMus
DMA Candidate, Don Wright Faculty of Music
Western University

Invitation to Participate: You are being invited to participate in this study to better understand the varying levels of performance modality during an Art Song performance, specifically German Lieder, and their impact on adult audiences (aged 18 and older). As one of the leading advocates of expanded Art Song performance practice and pedagogy, as well as the individual after whose research this study has been modelled, this study would benefit greatly from your [Professor Rena Sharon’s] insight surrounding the issues, literature, and methodology considered for this study, as well as the findings from the study.

Why is this study being done? The purpose of this study is to understand if different levels of performance modality (e.g. movement and gesture, props and costumes, projected illustrations, translations projected as supertitles, and additional performers) during an Art Song performance, specifically German Lieder, resonate more with adult audiences (aged 18 and older). While the manner in which German Lieder is being presented – the Art Song recital – has helped to preserve the traditions of the Art Song genre, such performance parameters have shown limited appeal to modern-day audiences (Varty, 2013). To prevent the Lied from being marginalized any further, countermeasures have been taken in an attempt to alter the performance traditions and reinvent the genre through enhanced performance modalities (e.g. theatrical movement and gesture, props and costumes, projected translations, etc.). The aim of this study is to determine
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

which performance methods and modalities are the most effective in connecting with an
audience, as well as deduce a possible correlation between individuals’ level of prior classical
music training and/or familiarity with Art Song and performance preference.

How long will you be in this study? You will be in the study for two interviews, each of which
will take approximately 20 minutes. Sessions may be longer or shorter based on your answers. In
the unlikely case that the interviews go longer than 20 minutes, you will be asked if you are able
to complete the interview. You may choose to stop or end the interview at any time.

What are the study procedures? If you agree to participate, the study will consist of two
interviews where you and the Research Assistant (Adam Iannetta) meet and discuss your insight
surrounding the issues, literature, and methodology considered for this study, as well as the
findings from the study. Prior to the second interview, the findings from the study, that is the
surveys and the interviews following the lecture recital, will be shared with you via email as a
summarized report. This report will not contain any identifiable information linking participants
to the study. Both interviews will be done over the phone and will be audio-recorded.

What are the risks and harms of participating in this study? Participation in this study will
involve the disclosure of personal opinion that will be audio-recorded, for example, your
thoughts about the study. Therefore, we ask you to make only those comments that you feel
comfortable making in a public setting. The risks associated with the study are not expected to
surpass the risks associated with daily life.

What are the benefits? You may not directly benefit from participating in this study, but
information gathered may provide benefits to society as a whole, which include understanding
whether enhanced levels of performance modality influence the impact of Art Song performance,
specifically German Lieder, on adult audiences (aged 18 and older). If you are interested, you
can ask for the study results once they are available.

Can participants choose to leave the study? You can choose to leave the study at any time and
your information will not be included in the study if withdrawn prior to the Research Assistant’s
(Adam Iannetta) analysis of the information. You do not waive any legal right by consenting to
this study.

How will participants’ information be kept confidential? If you decide to participate in the
study, the information that you share will be used in presentations and publications of this
research. Personal answers and comments made will only be used to examine the research
questions of this study. The information you provide will be directly linked to you, and you will
be able to withdraw your data from the study up until the Research Assistant’s (Adam Iannetta)
analysis of the information. Should you choose not to consent to having the information you
provide be directly linked to you, any presentations and publications of this research will refer to
you as “an unnamed proponent of Art Song Theatre”. Only the Principal Investigator (Dr. Patrick
Schmidt) and the Research Assistant (Adam Iannetta) will have access to your recordings and
transcripts made during the interview process, and these will be kept on an encrypted, password-
protected USB device in a locked filing cabinet at the Don Wright Faculty of Music. Aside from
signed consent forms, your personal information (i.e. email address and phone number) will only

145
be used for initial contact to set up an appointment time. However, they will be stored separately from the study data. No other personal identifiable information will be kept or stored by the researchers. Only your name may appear in any publications stemming from this research if you consent; additional contact information will be withheld. This data will be stored in paper (consent form), word documents (transcribed interviews), and audio-recorded form on an encrypted, password-protected USB device locked in a filing cabinet at the Don Wright Faculty of Music for seven years upon completion of the study. Once the data has been transcribed into a typed document form, this information will be saved on an encrypted, password-protected USB device locked in a filing cabinet at the Don Wright Faculty of Music. The Principal Investigator (Dr. Patrick Schmidt) will have access to this data. After the data-retention period of seven years, all electronic data will be permanently deleted, and any hard copies will be cross-shredded. Representatives of Western University’s Non-Medical REB may require access to your study-related records to monitor the conduct of the research.

Are participants to be compensated in the study? You will not be compensated for your participation in this study.

What are the rights of the participant? Your participation in this study is voluntary. You may decide not to be in this study. Even if you consent to participate, you have the right to not answer individual questions or to withdraw from the study at any time. If you choose not to participate or to leave the at any time, it will have no effect on your professional standing. We will give you new information that is learned during the study that might impact your decision to stay in the study. You do not waive any legal right by providing your consent.

Whom do participants contact for questions? If you have any questions about this study, please contact either the Principal Investigator (Dr. Patrick Schmidt) at Western University or the Research Assistant (Adam Iannetta). If you have any questions about your rights as a research participant or the conduct of this study, you may contact The Office of Human Research Ethics. This consent form, a copy of which will be provided to you for your records and reference, is only part of the process of verbal consent. It should give you the basic idea about what the study is and what your participation will involve. If you would like more detail about something mentioned here, or information not included here, you should feel free to ask the Research Assistant (Adam Iannetta). Please take the time to read this carefully and to understand any accompanying information.
Consent: Your verbal consent will be documented by the Research Assistant (Adam Iannetta), who will check the appropriate boxes on your behalf.

1. Do you confirm that the Letter of Information has been read to you and have had all questions answered to your satisfaction?
   - [ ] YES    [ ] NO

2. Do you agree to participate in this research?
   - [ ] YES    [ ] NO

3. Do you agree to be audio-recorded?
   - [ ] YES    [ ] NO

4. Do you consent to the use of personal, identifiable quotes obtained during the study in the dissemination of this research?
   - [ ] YES    [ ] NO

5. Do you consent to the use of unidentified quotes obtained during the study in the dissemination of this research?
   - [ ] YES    [ ] NO

6. Do you agree to have your name used in the dissemination of this research?
   - [ ] YES    [ ] NO
Semi-structured Interview Guide

Initial Interview with Professor Rena Sharon

111521: The Impact of Expanded, Multimodal Applications

The Impact of Expanded, Multimodal Applications during a German Lied Performance

Principal Investigator: Dr. Patrick Schmidt, Chair – Music Education and Associate Professor, Don Wright Faculty of Music

Research Assistant: Adam Iannetta, DMA Candidate, Don Wright Faculty of Music

The primary objective for this study is to understand the varying levels of performance modality during an Art Song performance, specifically German Lieder, and their impact on adult audiences (aged 18 and older). As one of the leading advocates of expanded Art Song performance practice and pedagogy, as well as the individual after whose research this study has been modelled, this study would benefit greatly from your [Professor Rena Sharon’s] insight surrounding the issues, literature, and methodology considered for this study.

1. As one of the initial proponents of the Art Song Theatre genre, please explain how this artistic movement started.

2. Please explain your professional – be it performance-based or pedagogical – career as it relates to Art Song Theatre.

3. The Vancouver International Song Institute (VISI) and SONGFIRE Theatre Alliance have been referred to as organizations developed to understand performance cognition and to promote professional and student music-performance venues respectively. What were the steps taken to develop these organizations?

4. Please explain the success of your research and promotion of Art Song Theatre. To what do you credit this success?

5. Please explain any criticism your research on Art Song Theatre has received. How do you interpret such responses?
6. In what ways do you see Art Song Theatre functioning within the classical performance circuit of today? What are the challenges, risks, and opportunities?

7. As this study aims to replicate and expand on your informal experiment from the Conceptual Structure, Discourse, and Language Conference in Vancouver, dated May of 2012, please explain the original intentions of that experiment.

8. What was the process utilized for this experiment? This refers to how the experiment was constructed and how the data was collected.

9. What was the hypothesis and/or initial prediction for the experiment?

10. Explain the results gathered from this experiment. Did the results coordinate with your hypothesis and/or initial predictions?

11. This study aims to expand on the aforenoted study by increasing the length of the performance based on the number of songs performed (i.e. a song cycle) as well as performing those songs in a language with which the audience may be unfamiliar (i.e. German). Given these circumstances, please explain any concerns, predictions, and/or reservations you may have about this study.

12. This study also aims to assess the effect of one’s knowledge and/or familiarity on the topic of Art Song, specifically German Lieder, in combination with the varying levels of performance modality as observed in your informal study. As such, participants will be itemized into three groups according to their prior classical music training and/or familiarity with Art Song: informed, uninformed, and professional. Please explain any concerns, predictions, and/or reservations you may have about this portion of the study.
Appendix F

Semi-structured Interview Guide

Follow-up Interview with Professor Rena Sharon

111521: The Impact of Expanded, Multimodal Applications during a German Lied Performance

Principal Investigator: Dr. Patrick Schmidt, Chair – Music Education and Associate Professor, Don Wright Faculty of Music

Research Assistant: Adam Iannetta, DMA Candidate, Don Wright Faculty of Music

The primary objective for this study is to understand the varying levels of performance modality during an Art Song performance, specifically German Lieder, and their impact on adult audiences (aged 18 and older). As one of the leading advocates of expanded Art Song performance practice and pedagogy, as well as the individual after whose research this study has been modelled, this study would benefit greatly from your [Professor Rena Sharon’s] insight surrounding the findings from this study.

1. Please explain your reaction to the findings from this study. Are they in any way different from your initial predictions from our initial interview? Please explain why or how.

2. Do the findings from this study appear similar to the findings from your informal experiment from 2012? Please explain why or how.

3. Based on the results from this study, what are the specific performance aspects performers of Art Song, specifically German Lieder, should incorporate in their own performances of such music?

4. It is anticipated that a number of other questions will emerge from the data collected through this study.
Subject Line: Invitation to participate in research on performance modality

Dear Colleague/Faculty Member/Student/etc.,

You are being invited to participate in a study that we, Adam Iannetta (Research Assistant) and Dr. Patrick Schmidt (Principal Investigator), are conducting. Briefly, the study involves attending a one-hour public lecture recital of German Art Song, Lieder, at Western University’s Don Wright Faculty of Music (von Kuster Hall) on September 28th, 2018 at 12:30 PM and notating your responses to the performance using surveys; a selective number of volunteers may be asked to participate in a semi-structured interview at a later date and time. Participation is voluntary, that is your decision to participate (or not) will have no effect on your academic or professional standing. Furthermore, any decision to participate will be kept confidential from your department. In appreciation for your time, you will receive entry to a raffle for which the prize will be an iTunes gift-card valued at $50.00. Further details regarding the raffle will be provided prior to the lecture recital on the date of the performance. A complimentary reception will also be provided following the lecture recital.

A copy of the Letter of Information and Consent has been attached to this email.

A reminder email will be sent on Friday, September 21st, 2018.

If you would like more information on this study, please contact the Research Assistant (Adam Iannetta) at the contact information given below.

Thank you,

Adam Domenico Iannetta
Don Wright Faculty of Music
Email Script for Recruitment
(to be used when the contact information is publicly available or appropriate permissions to use email have been received)

Subject Line: REMINDER – Invitation to participate in research on performance modality

Dear Colleague/Faculty Member/Student/etc.,

This is a reminder that you are being invited to participate in a study that we, Adam Iannetta (Research Assistant) and Dr. Patrick Schmidt (Principal Investigator), are conducting. To reiterate, the study involves attending a one-hour public lecture recital of German Art Song, Lieder, at Western University’s Don Wright Faculty of Music (von Kuster Hall) a week from today, on September 28th, 2018 at 12:30 PM and notating your responses to the performance using surveys; a selective number of volunteers may be asked to participate in a semi-structured interview at a later date and time. Completion of the survey will be indication of your implied consent to participate.

A copy of the Letter of Information and Consent has been attached to this email.

If you would like more information on this study, please contact the Research Assistant (Adam Iannetta) at the contact information given below.

Thank you,

Adam Domenico Iannetta
Don Wright Faculty of Music
PARTICIPANTS NEEDED FOR RESEARCH IN PERFORMANCE MODALITY

We are looking for volunteers to take part in a study to understand the varying levels of performance modality during an Art Song performance, specifically German Lieder, and their impact on adult audiences who meet the following criteria:
- post-secondary or graduate students/alum in Music;
- post-secondary or graduate students/alum NOT in Music;
- experienced concertgoers/professionals in Music.

If you are interested and agree to participate you would be asked to:
- attend a public lecture recital of German Art Song, Lieder, and notate your responses to the performance using surveys;
- a selective number of volunteers may be asked to participate in a semi-structured interview at a later date and time.

Your participation would involve one session, the session will be about 60 minutes long.

In appreciation for your time, you will receive entry to a raffle for which the prize will be an iTunes gift-card valued at $50.00.
A complimentary reception will also be provided following the lecture recital.

For more information about this study, or to volunteer for this study, please contact:
Adam Domenico Iannetta
Don Wright Faculty of Music
Verbal Recruitment Script
(to be used when addressing the audience prior to the lecture recital as in-person recruitment at the time of the event)

Good afternoon. My name is Dr. Patrick Schmidt, and I am the Chair of Music Education here at Western University, as well as the Principal Investigator under whom this study is being supervised. Today’s performance is a lecture recital featuring baritone and Doctoral Candidate, Adam Iannetta. In addition, today’s performance will also serve as part of a study being conducted to better understand the varying levels of performance modality during today’s Art Song performance, German Lieder, and its impact on adult audiences.

In order to participate in today’s study, you must be a legal adult, that is age 18 or older, as well as meet the following criteria as either (A) a post-secondary or graduate student/alum in Music, (B) a post-secondary or graduate student/alum NOT in Music, or (C) an experienced concertgoer/professional in Music. Participation is voluntary. If you do not meet the criteria or do not wish to participate in the study at any given point, you are still welcome to enjoy the performance without participating in the study.

This study will coincide with today’s public lecture recital of German Art Song, Lieder, as you will be asked to notate your responses to the performance using a survey.

We will now distribute the study packages. Inside this package are three colour-coded documents: a Letter of Information and Consent (the green document); the survey itself (the red document); and a Consent Form of Contact for Future Studies, which will be further explained shortly (the blue document).

The Letter of Information and Consent further explains the details of this study and your rights as the participants. You will keep this document as a reference for your participation in this portion of the study. Completion of the survey is indication of your implied consent to participate. Participants who take part in today’s study are automatically entered to win an Apple iTunes gift-card valued at $50.00, the winner of which will be determined at the conclusion of today’s performance. Your entry into the raffle is indicated by the raffle tickets paperclipped to the front page of this document. At the conclusion of the lecture recital, you will submit only one of these tickets into the marked container located immediately outside the performance venue. The winning raffle ticket will be determined at that time, once all tickets have been submitted, after which time you will be asked to dispose of your raffle tickets in the blue recycle bin located outside the performance venue.
Looking at the survey, you will note that it has been divided into three sections. Section One (page two) is to be completed prior to the start of the lecture recital. After this presentation, you will have five minutes to complete this section, after which time the lights will indicate the beginning of the lecture recital. The lecture recital has been divided into three sections, labelled as Sections Two-A through Two-C (pages three through five). Each of these sections has its own set of survey questions that you will answer during or immediately after its respective performance. The sections are indicated on the performance program you received before entering the hall (the white document). Section Three (page six) is to be completed at the conclusion of the lecture recital before leaving today.

A number of you may be asked to participate in a semi-structured interview following today’s performance at a later date and time. If you are interested in doing so, we ask that you provide an email address by which we can contact you on the Consent Form of Contact for Future Studies (the blue document). This portion of the study is optional, and you are not obligated to sign or return this form if you do not wish to participate in a follow-up interview.

At the conclusion of the lecture recital, you will submit both your survey (the red document) and your completed Consent Form of Contact for Future Studies (the blue document) into the locked box located immediately outside the performance venue. Again, you will only keep the Letter of Information and Consent (the green document) as a reference for your participation in this portion of the study. If you choose not to sign or return the Consent Form of Contact for Future Studies (the blue document), we ask that you dispose of this form in the blue recycle bin located outside the performance venue.

Lastly, at the conclusion of the lecture recital, once all previously stated documents have been submitted or disposed, there will be a complimentary reception located immediately outside the performance venue. We hope that you will join us after the performance.

Thank you for your consideration in participating in today’s study. You now have five minutes to complete Section One of the survey, after which time the lecture recital will begin.
The Impact of Expanded, Multimodal Applications during a German Lied Performance

Dr. Patrick Schmidt (Principal Investigator)
Dr. Patrick Schmidt, PhD
Chair – Music Education and Associate Professor, Don Wright Faculty of Music
Western University

Adam Iannetta (Research Assistant)
Adam Iannetta, MMus
DMA Candidate, Don Wright Faculty of Music
Western University

Invitation to Participate: You are being invited to participate in this study to better understand the varying levels of performance modality during an Art Song performance, specifically German Lieder, and their impact on adult audiences (aged 18 and older). You are eligible to participate if you are (a) aged 18 or older; (b) can read and write in English; (c) give consent to participate; and (d) are either a post-secondary or graduate student/alum in Music, a post-secondary or graduate student/alum NOT in Music, or an experienced concertgoer/professional in Music. If you do not meet these criteria, you will be ineligible to participate at this time.

Why is this study being done? The purpose of this study is to understand if different levels of performance modality (e.g. movement and gesture, props and costumes, projected illustrations, translations projected as supertitles, and additional performers) during an Art Song performance, specifically German Lieder, resonate more with adult audiences (aged 18 and older). While the manner in which German Lieder is being presented – the Art Song recital – has helped to preserve the traditions of the Art Song genre, such performance parameters have shown limited appeal to modern-day audiences (Varty, 2013). To prevent the Lied from being marginalized any further, countermeasures have been taken in an attempt to alter the performance traditions and reinvent the genre through enhanced performance modalities (e.g. theatrical movement and gesture, props and costumes, projected translations, etc.). The aim of this study is to determine...
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

which performance methods and modalities are the most effective in connecting with an audience, as well as deduce a possible correlation between individuals’ musicianship and performance preference.

**How long will you be in this study?** You will be in the study for one lecture recital, which will take approximately 60 minutes. You may choose to stop or leave the lecture recital at any time.

**What are the study procedures?** If you agree to participate, the study will consist of answering the survey based on the lecture recital. You will answer the questions from Section One prior to the start of the lecture recital. Sections Two-A through Two-C will be answered following each of the corresponding performances during the lecture recital. Section Three will be answered at the conclusion of the lecture recital, once all questions from Sections One through Two-C have been completed. This study would benefit from more in-depth, qualitative information provided by a selective number of participants further to the responses from today’s surveys. If you are interested in being contacted for future studies, as previously described, please indicate your implied consent on the Consent Form of Contact for Future Studies included with this study package.

**What are the risks and harms of participating in this study?** There are no known or anticipated risks or discomforts associated with participating in this study.

**What are the benefits?** You may not directly benefit from participating in this study, but information gathered may provide benefits to society as a whole, which include understanding whether enhanced levels of performance modality influence the impact of Art Song performance, specifically German Lieder, on adult audiences (aged 18 and older). If you are interested, you can ask for the study results once they are available.

**Can participants choose to leave the study?** As the information collected from the surveys will be anonymous, you cannot withdraw your data once the survey has been submitted. You can choose to leave the study at any time and your information will not be included in the study if withdrawn prior to submitting your survey at the conclusion of the lecture recital. You do not waive any legal right by consenting to this study.

**How will participants’ information be kept confidential?** If you decide to participate in the study, the information that you share will be used in presentations and publications of this research. Personal answers and comments made will only be used to examine the research questions of this study. Only the Principal Investigator (Dr. Patrick Schmidt) and the Research Assistant (Adam Iannetta) will have access to your survey responses, and these will be kept on an encrypted, password-protected USB device in a locked filing cabinet at the Don Wright Faculty of Music. No other personal identifiable information will be kept or stored by the researchers. Once the data has been analyzed, the findings will be shared with Professor Rena Sharon, one of the leading advocates of expanded Art Song performance practice and pedagogy, for further discussion on the impact of the study’s findings. The findings will be shared with Sharon via email as a summarized report and will not contain any identifiable information linking your participation to this study. Furthermore, as the surveys are being submitted anonymously, the survey data will not be labelled and/or linked to identifiers. This data will be
stored in paper and locked in a filing cabinet at the Don Wright Faculty of Music for seven years upon completion of the study. Once the data has been analyzed, this information will be saved on an encrypted, password-protected USB device locked in a filing cabinet at the Don Wright Faculty of Music. The Principal Investigator (Dr. Patrick Schmidt) will have access to this data. After the data-retention period of seven years, all electronic data will be permanently deleted, and any hard copies will be cross-shredded. Representatives of Western University’s Non-Medical REB may require access to your study-related records to monitor the conduct of the research.

Are participants to be compensated in the study? Individuals who participate in this study will be automatically entered into a raffle, the prize for which at this point has been determined to be an Apple iTunes gift-card valued at $50.00. The winner of the raffle will be determined at the conclusion of the lecture recital. Entry into the raffle is indicated by the raffle tickets paperclipped to the front page of this document. At the conclusion of the performance, you will submit only one of these tickets into the marked container located immediately outside the performance venue. The winning raffle ticket will be determined at that time, once all tickets have been submitted, after which time you will be asked to dispose of your raffle tickets in the blue recycle bin located outside the performance venue.

What are the rights of the participant? Your participation in this study is voluntary. You may decide not to be in this study. Even if you consent to participate, you have the right to not answer individual questions or to withdraw from the study at any time. If you choose not to participate or to leave the study at any time, it will have no effect on your academic and/or professional standing. You do not waive any legal right by providing your consent.

Whom do participants contact for questions? If you have any questions about this study, please contact either the Principal Investigator (Dr. Patrick Schmidt) at Western University or the Research Assistant (Adam Iannetta). If you have any questions about your rights as a research participant or the conduct of this study, you may contact The Office of Human Research Ethics.

This consent form, a copy of which will be provided to you for your records and reference, is only part of the process of implied consent. It should give you the basic idea about what the study is and what your participation will involve. If you would like more detail about something mentioned here, or information not included here, you should feel free to ask the Research Assistant (Adam Iannetta). Please take the time to read this carefully and to understand any accompanying information.

Consent: Completion of this survey is indication of your implied consent to participate. At the conclusion of the lecture recital, please submit your completed survey into the locked box located immediately outside the performance venue.
Lecture-recital Survey

111521: The Impact of Expanded, Multimodal Applications

The Impact of Expanded, Multimodal Applications during a German Lied Performance

Dr. Patrick Schmidt (Principal Investigator)
Dr. Patrick Schmidt, PhD
Chair – Music Education and Associate Professor, Don Wright Faculty of Music
Western University

Adam Iannetta (Research Assistant)
Adam Iannetta, MMus
DMA Candidate, Don Wright Faculty of Music
Western University
Section One: The following questions are to be answered prior to the start of the lecture recital. Please choose one answer for each of the following questions by marking an X in the box located above each possible response.

1) What is your age?
   a) Younger than 25  b) 25 to 35  c) 35 to 55  d) Older than 55

2) How would you best describe yourself, given the options below?
   a) Post-secondary or graduate student/alum in Music  b) Post-secondary or graduate student/alum NOT in Music  c) Experienced concertgoer/professional in Music

3) How often do you listen to classical music?
   a) Once a day  b) Once a week  c) Once a month  d) A few times a year  e) Almost never

4) Do you play a musical instrument, including voice?
   a) Yes  b) No

5) If you answered yes to the previous question, what is your level of prior classical music training?
   a) Self-taught/amateur  b) High-school instruction  c) Private instruction  d) University-level instruction  e) Professional

6) How often do you attend public classical music performances within a year?
   a) Frequently  b) Sometimes  c) Rarely  d) Never

7) How familiar are you with the genre of Art Song, specifically German Lieder?
   a) Very familiar  b) Moderately familiar  c) Not at all familiar
Section Two-A: The following questions are to be answered either during or immediately following the first set of songs from the lecture recital. Please choose one answer for each of the following questions by marking an X in the box located above each possible response.

8) How would you rate your comprehension of the text, despite being sung in a language unfamiliar with the general public, during this performance?
   a) Very high   b) High   c) Fair   d) Poor   e) Very poor

9) How would you rate your comprehension of the story/what was happening within this performance?
   a) Very high   b) High   c) Fair   d) Poor   e) Very poor

10) How would you rate your level of focus on the performer during this performance?
    a) Very high   b) High   c) Fair   d) Poor   e) Very poor

11) How would you rate your level of comprehension for the tone/emotional setting of each piece during this performance?
    a) Very high   b) High   c) Fair   d) Poor   e) Very poor

12) How would you rate the overall effectiveness of this performance in establishing a connection between you (the audience member) and the performer?
    a) Very effective   b) Effective   c) Fair   d) Ineffective   e) Very ineffective
**Section Two-B:** The following questions are to be answered either during or immediately following the second set of songs from the lecture recital. Please choose one answer for each of the following questions by marking an X in the box located above each possible response.

13) **How would you rate your comprehension of the text, despite being sung in a language unfamiliar with the general public, during this performance?**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>a) Very high</th>
<th>b) High</th>
<th>c) Fair</th>
<th>d) Poor</th>
<th>e) Very poor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

14) **How would you rate your comprehension of the story/what was happening within the scene during this performance?**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>a) Very high</th>
<th>b) High</th>
<th>c) Fair</th>
<th>d) Poor</th>
<th>e) Very poor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

15) **How would you rate your level of focus on the performer during this performance?**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>a) Very high</th>
<th>b) High</th>
<th>c) Fair</th>
<th>d) Poor</th>
<th>e) Very poor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

16) **How would you rate your level of comprehension for the tone/emotional setting of each piece during this performance?**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>a) Very high</th>
<th>b) High</th>
<th>c) Fair</th>
<th>d) Poor</th>
<th>e) Very poor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

17) **How would you rate the overall effectiveness of this performance in establishing a connection between you (the audience member) and the performer?**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>a) Very effective</th>
<th>b) Effective</th>
<th>c) Fair</th>
<th>d) Ineffective</th>
<th>e) Very ineffective</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

18) **On a scale from one (1) to five (5), five being the highest and one being the lowest, rank the effectiveness for each of the following multimodal applications used.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>a) Movement and gesture</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>b) Props and costumes</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c) Projected illustrations</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d) Translations projected as supertitles</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e) Additional performers</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Section Two-C: The following questions are to be answered either during or immediately following the third set of songs from the lecture recital. Please choose one answer for each of the following questions by marking an X in the box located above each possible response.

19) How would you rate your comprehension of the text, despite being sung in a language unfamiliar with the general public, during this performance?
   a) Very high  b) High  c) Fair  d) Poor  e) Very poor

20) How would you rate your comprehension of the story/what was happening within this performance?
   a) Very high  b) High  c) Fair  d) Poor  e) Very poor

21) How would you rate your level of focus on the performer during this performance?
   a) Very high  b) High  c) Fair  d) Poor  e) Very poor

22) How would you rate your level of comprehension for the tone/emotional setting of each piece during this performance?
   a) Very high  b) High  c) Fair  d) Poor  e) Very poor

23) How would you rate the overall effectiveness of this performance in establishing a connection between you (the audience member) and the performer?
   a) Very effective  b) Effective  c) Fair  d) Ineffective  e) Very ineffective
Section Three: The following questions are to be answered at the conclusion of the lecture recital.

1. Explain how your comprehension of the text and emotional connection varied between the three different sections of the performance presented today.

2. How was your overall experience from today’s performances impacted by movement and gesture, props and costumes, projected illustrations, translations projected as supertitles, and additional performers?

3. Regarding the second section, did any of the aforenoted elements detract from your ability to understand or connect with the performance? Please explain why or how.
Consent Form

Contact for Future Studies

111521: The Impact of Expanded, Multimodal Applications

The Impact of Expanded, Multimodal Applications
during a German Lied Performance

Dr. Patrick Schmidt (Principal Investigator)
Dr. Patrick Schmidt, PhD
Chair – Music Education and Associate Professor, Don Wright Faculty of Music
Western University

Adam Iannetta (Research Assistant)
Adam Iannetta, MMus
DMA Candidate, Don Wright Faculty of Music
Western University

This study would benefit from more in-depth information provided by a selective number of participants. Interviews will be done in person or over the phone (whatever is most convenient) and will last 20 minutes.

If you agree to be contacted for future studies, as previously described, please indicate your implied consent by checking the appropriate box below and by providing an email address by which the Research Assistant (Adam Iannetta) can contact you.

☐ I agree to be contacted for a follow-up interview.
☐ I do NOT agree to be contacted for a follow-up interview.

_____________________________________________
Email Address (only if the first box has been checked)
Email Script for Recruitment
(to be used when the contact information has been provided by the participant from the signed Consent Form of Contact for Future Studies)

Subject Line: Invitation to participate in research on performance modality
(follow-up interview)

Dear Colleague/Faculty Member/Student/etc.,

You are being invited to participate in a study that we, Adam Iannetta (Research Assistant) and Dr. Patrick Schmidt (Principal Investigator), are conducting. As you have provided the appropriate contact information from your signed Consent Form of Contact for Future Studies following the lecture recital, dated September 28th, 2018, you are being invited to participate in a follow-up interview. Briefly, your participation will consist of one interview, approximately 20 minutes in length, where you and the Research Assistant (Adam Iannetta) meet and discuss your responses to the lecture recital. This interview will be done either in person in the Research Assistant’s (Adam Iannetta) office at Western University’s Talbot College or over the phone, whichever is most convenient for you, and will be audio-recorded. The date and time of the interview will be determined between both you and the Research Assistant (Adam Iannetta). Participation is voluntary, that is your decision to participate (or not) will have no effect on your academic and/or professional standing. Furthermore, any decision to participate will be kept confidential.

A copy of the Letter of Information and Consent has been attached to this email, and a physical copy will be provided on the day of the interview.

A reminder email will be sent one week prior to the confirmed date of the interview.

If you would like more information on this study, please contact the Research Assistant (Adam Iannetta) at the contact information given below.

Thank you,

Adam Domenico Iannetta
Don Wright Faculty of Music
Email Script for Recruitment
(to be used when the contact information has been provided by the participant from the signed Consent Form of Contact for Future Studies)

Subject Line: REMINDER – Invitation to participate in research on performance modality (follow-up interview)

Dear Colleague/Faculty Member/Student/etc.,

This is a reminder that you have agreed to participate in a study that we, Adam Iannetta (Research Assistant) and Dr. Patrick Schmidt (Principal Investigator), are conducting. To reiterate, your participation in the study will consist of one interview, which is to take place a week from today on DATE TBD, where you and the Research Assistant (Adam Iannetta) meet and discuss your responses to the lecture recital from September 28th, 2018. This interview will be done either in person in the Research Assistant’s (Adam Iannetta) office at Western University’s Talbot College or over the phone, whichever is most convenient for you, and will be audio-recorded. Your written consent will be documented on the Letter of Consent and Information on the day of your interview. In the event that the interview will be conducted over the phone, a copy of the Letter of Information and Consent will be emailed to you in order for you to provide your written consent to participate, from which point you will be asked to scan and email the signed Letter of Information and Consent back to the Research Assistant (Adam Iannetta) prior to the date of the interview.

If you would like more information on this study, please contact the Research Assistant (Adam Iannetta) at the contact information given below.

Thank you,

Adam Domenico Iannetta
Don Wright Faculty of Music
Appendix P

Letter of Information and Consent
Interview with Lecture-recital Attendees

111521: The Impact of Expanded, Multimodal Applications

The Impact of Expanded, Multimodal Applications during a German Lied Performance

Dr. Patrick Schmidt (Principal Investigator)
Dr. Patrick Schmidt, PhD
Chair – Music Education and Associate Professor, Don Wright Faculty of Music
Western University

Adam Iannetta (Research Assistant)
Adam Iannetta, MMus
DMA Candidate, Don Wright Faculty of Music
Western University

Invitation to Participate: You are being invited to participate in this study to better understand the varying levels of performance modality during an Art Song performance, specifically German Lieder, and their impact on adult audiences (aged 18 and older). You are eligible to participate if you are (a) aged 18 or older; (b) can read and write in English; (c) give consent to participate (consent to have interview audio-recorded); and (d) are either a post-secondary or graduate student/alum in Music, a post-secondary or graduate student/alum NOT in Music, or an experienced concertgoer/professional in Music. If you do not meet these criteria, you will be ineligible to participate at this time.

Why is this study being done? The purpose of this study is to understand if different levels of performance modality (e.g. movement and gesture, props and costumes, projected illustrations, translations projected as supertitles, and additional performers) during an Art Song performance, specifically German Lieder, resonate more with adult audiences (aged 18 and older). While the manner in which German Lieder is being presented – the Art Song recital – has helped to preserve the traditions of the Art Song genre, such performance parameters have shown limited appeal to modern-day audiences (Varty, 2013). To prevent the Lied from being marginalized any further, countermeasures have been taken in an attempt to alter the performance traditions and reinvent the genre through enhanced performance modalities (e.g. theatrical movement and
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

gesture, props and costumes, projected translations, etc.). The aim of this research is to determine which performance methods and modalities are the most effective in connecting with an audience, as well as deduce a possible correlation between individuals’ musicianship and performance preference.

**How long will you be in this study?** You will be in the study for one interview, which will take approximately 20 minutes. Sessions may be longer or shorter based on your answers. In the unlikely case that the interview goes longer than 20 minutes, you will be asked if you are able to complete the interview. You may choose to stop or end the interview at any time.

**What are the study procedures?** This is only a portion of the larger study, having already participated in the first phase of the study, that is the lecture recital from September 28th, 2018. If you agree to participate, the study will consist of one interview where you and the Research Assistant (Adam Iannetta) meet and discuss your responses to the lecture recital. The reason for this is to gain more in-depth, qualitative information from a selective number of participants in order to build off the responses to the survey from the lecture recital. This interview will be done either in person in the Research Assistant’s (Adam Iannetta) office at Western University’s Talbot College or over the phone, whichever is most convenient for you, and will be audio-recorded. In the event that the interview will be conducted over the phone, a copy of this Letter of Information and Consent will be emailed to you in order for you to provide your written consent to participate, from which point you will be asked to scan and email the signed Letter of Information Consent back to the Research Assistant (Adam Iannetta). Audio-recording is optional. If you do not wish to be audio-recorded, the Research Assistant (Adam Iannetta) will take notes.

**What are the risks and harms of participating in this study?** Participation in this study will involve the disclosure of personal opinion that will be audio-recorded, for example, your thoughts about the lecture recital. Therefore, we ask you to make only those comments that you feel comfortable making in a public setting. The risks associated with the study are not expected to surpass the risks associated with daily life.

**What are the benefits?** You may not directly benefit from participating in this study, but information gathered may provide benefits to society as a whole, which include understanding whether enhanced levels of performance modality influence the impact of Art Song performance, specifically German Lieder, on adult audiences (aged 18 and older). If you are interested, you can ask for the study results once they are available.

**Can participants choose to leave the study?** You can choose to leave the study at any time and your information will not be included in the study if withdrawn prior to the Research Assistant’s (Adam Iannetta) analysis of the information. You do not waive any legal right by consenting to this study.

**How will participants’ information be kept confidential?** If you decide to participate in the study, the information that you share will be used in presentations and publications of this research. Personal answers and comments made will only be used to examine the research questions of this study. Only the Principal Investigator (Dr. Patrick Schmidt) and the Research
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

Assistant (Adam Iannetta) will have access to your recordings and transcripts made during the interview process, and these will be kept on an encrypted, password-protected USB device in a locked filing cabinet at the Don Wright Faculty of Music. With permission, interviews will be audio-recorded, de-identified, and transcribed. If permission for audio-recording is denied, the researcher will take hand notes. A list linking participant identifiers to a unique ID will be created de-identifying material for data analysis, and to allow for data withdrawal, if a participant chooses to withdraw from the project. Aside from signed consent forms, your personal information (i.e. email address and phone number) will only be used for initial contact to set up an appointment time. However, they will be stored separately from the study data. No other personal identifiable information will be kept or stored by the researchers. Once the data has been analyzed, the findings will be shared with Professor Rena Sharon, one of the leading advocates of expanded Art Song performance practice and pedagogy, for further discussion on the impact of the study’s findings. The findings will be shared with Sharon via email as a summarized report and will not contain any identifiable information linking your participation to this study. This data will be stored in paper (consent form), word documents (transcribed interviews), and audio-recorded form on an encrypted, password-protected USB device locked in a filing cabinet at the Don Wright Faculty of Music for seven years upon completion of the study. Once the data has been transcribed into a typed document form, this information will be saved on an encrypted, password-protected USB device locked in a filing cabinet at the Don Wright Faculty of Music. The Principal Investigator (Dr. Patrick Schmidt) will have access to this data. After the data-retention period of seven years, all electronic data will be permanently deleted, and any hard copies will be cross-shredded. Representatives of Western University’s Non-Medical REB may require access to your study-related records to monitor the conduct of the study.

Are participants to be compensated in the study? You will not be compensated for your participation in this study.

What are the rights of the participant? Your participation in this study is voluntary. You may decide not to be in this study. Even if you consent to participate, you have the right to not answer individual questions or to withdraw from the study at any time. If you choose not to participate or to leave at any time, it will have no effect on your academic and/or professional standing. We will give you new information that is learned during the study that might impact your decision to stay in the study. You do not waive any legal right by providing your consent.

Whom do participants contact for questions? If you have any questions about this study, please contact either the Principal Investigator (Dr. Patrick Schmidt) at Western University or the Research Assistant (Adam Iannetta). If you have any questions about your rights as a research participant or the conduct of this study, you may contact The Office of Human Research Ethics.

This consent form, a copy of which will be provided to you for your records and reference, is only part of the process of written consent. It should give you the basic idea about what the study is and what your participation will involve. If you would like more detail about something mentioned here, or information not included here, you should feel free to ask the Research Assistant (Adam Iannetta). Please take the time to read this carefully and to understand any accompanying information.
Consent Form

Dr. Patrick Schmidt (Principal Investigator)
Dr. Patrick Schmidt, PhD
Chair – Music Education and Associate Professor, Don Wright Faculty of Music
Western University

Adam Iannetta (Research Assistant)
Adam Iannetta, MMus
DMA Candidate, Don Wright Faculty of Music
Western University

Consent: If you agree to participate in the above study, as previously described, please indicate your written consent by checking the appropriate box provided for each question and by signing below.

I have read the Letter of Information, have had the nature of the study explained to me, and I agree to participate. All questions have been answered to my satisfaction.

7. I agree to be audio-recorded.
   □ YES □ NO

8. I consent to the use of personal quotes obtained during the study in the dissemination of this research.
   □ YES □ NO

9. I consent to the use of unidentified quotes obtained during the study in the dissemination of this research.
   □ YES □ NO

________________________  __________________________  __________________________
Participant                  Signature               Date (DD/MM/YYYY)

The signature of the Person Obtaining Consent means that he/she has explained the study to the participant named above and has answered all questions.

________________________  __________________________  __________________________
Person Obtaining Consent    Signature               Date (DD/MM/YYYY)
Appendix Q

Semi-structured Interview Guide

Interview with Lecture-recital Attendees

111521: The Impact of Expanded, Multimodal Applications

The Impact of Expanded, Multimodal Applications during a German Lied Performance

Principal Investigator: Dr. Patrick Schmidt, Chair – Music Education and Associate Professor, Don Wright Faculty of Music

Research Assistant: Adam Iannetta, DMA Candidate, Don Wright Faculty of Music

The primary objective for this study is to understand the varying levels of performance modality during an Art Song performance, specifically German Lieder, and their impact on adult audiences (aged 18 and older). In addition to the data collected from the surveys during the lecture recital, this study would benefit from more in-depth, qualitative information from a selective number of participants, the intention of which would be to present the selected participants an opportunity to expand on their responses from the survey.

1. Have you participated in an study such as this before? If so, please share your experience.

2. How familiar with classical music would you consider yourself?

3. How familiar with Art Song, specifically German Lieder, are you?

4. The aim of this study was to compare and evaluate the effectiveness of expanded, multimodal applications during a performance of German Lieder in three distinct variations. Of the three variations you saw, which one(s) did you enjoy the most? Please explain why.

5. Of the three variations you saw, which one(s) did you enjoy the least? Please explain why.

6. With regard to the second variation, the performance that utilized costumes, props, translations projected as supertitles, and additional performers, which of these
elements was most effective in helping you to understand and connect with the performance? Please explain why.

7. With regard to the second variation, did any of the aforenoted elements detract from your ability to understand or connect with the performance? Please explain why.

8. With regard to the second variation, were you able to experience the aforenoted elements as a unified experience, or was your attention divided? Please explain why.

9. As the music being performed was sung in a language that may not have been familiar to the entire audience (i.e. German), were the methods of translation effective for you to understand what was being said? Of the three methods, which one(s) did you find the most beneficial to understand the text? Please explain why.

10. Of the three methods, which one(s) did you find the least beneficial to understand the text? Please explain why.

11. If this style of music was more readily available and presented in this way, would you be more willing to attend such performances? Please explain why.
Appendix R-1

**Opera Role November 2015**

November 20, 21, 2015
Paul Davenport Theatre

Opera: *Hansel and Gretel*
Composer: Engelbert Humperdinck (1854-1921)

Opera role: Father

Stage director: Theodore Baerg
Music director: Alain Trudel

Other roles sung by:
- Gretel – Daniela Agostino
- Hansel – Jillian Law
- Mother – Kaitlyn Clifford
- Sandman – Monica Sowinski
- Dew Fairy – Jocelyn Francescut
- Witch – César Aguilar

*This opera role was performed in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Doctorate of Musical Arts degree.*
Appendix R-2

Recital Program November 2016

November 26, 2016
2 p.m., von Kuster Hall
Adam Iannetta, voice
Melanie Cancade, piano

Dover Beach
Samuel Barber
(1910-1981)

Francisco Barradas, violin; Mikela Witjes, violin;
Katie McBean, viola; Sophie Stryniak, cello

Let Us Garlands Bring
Gerald Finzi
(1901-1956)

Come away, come away, death
Who is Sylvia?
Fear no more the heat o’ the sun
O Mistress Mine
It was a lover and his lass

- Intermission -

Six Settings of Johann Wolfgang von Goethe’s Poem,
Wanderers Nachtlied
Franz Schubert
(1797-1828)

Fanny Mendelssohn
(1805-1847)

Carl Loewe
(1796-1869)

Max Reger
(1873-1916)

Aliah Nelson, soprano

Robert Schumann
(1810-1856)

Franz Liszt
(1811-1886)

Five Selections from Cabaret Songs
William Bolcom
(1938)

Waitin
Song of Black Max (As Told by de Kooning Boys)
The Actor
At the Last Lousy Moments of Love
George

This recital was presented in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Doctorate of Musical Arts degree.
Appendix R-3

Opera Role January/February 2018

January 26, 28, February 3, 2018
Paul Davenport Theatre

Opera: *The Pirates of Penzance*
Composer: Sir Arthur Sullivan (1842-1900)

Opera role: Pirate King

Stage director: Theodore Baerg
Music director: Tyrone Paterson

Other roles sung by:
- Major-General Stanley – Ardavan Taraporewala
- Samuel – Christopher Pitre-McBride
- Frederic – Grayson Nesbitt
- Sergeant of the Police – Andrew MacDonald
- Mabel – Leyanna Slous
- Edith – Lauren Halász
- Kate – Annie Bird
- Isabel – Fiona Wahl
- Ruth – Leanne Vida

This opera role was performed in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Doctorate of Musical Arts degree.
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

Appendix R-4

Lecture-recital Program September 2018

September 28, 2018
12:30 p.m., von Kuster Hall

“The Impact of Expanded, Multimodal Applications during a German Lied Performance”

Adam Iannetta, voice
Sarah Bowker, piano

Liederkreis (Op. 24)
Set One – Traditional
  No. 1 Morgens steh’ ich auf und frage
  No. 2 Es treibt mich hin, es treibt mich her
  No. 3 Ich wandele unter den Bäumen

Robert Schumann (1810-1856)

Set Two – Theatrical Contextualization
  No. 4 Lieb’ Liebchen, leg’s Händchen aufs Herze mein
  No. 5 Schöne Wiege meiner Leiden
  No. 6 Warte, warte, wilder Schiffman
    Brianna DeSantis, supporting actor;
    Chad Louwerse, supporting actor

Set Three – Expanded Traditional
  No. 7 Berg’ und Burgen schaun herunter
  No. 8 Anfangs wollt ich fast verzagen
  No. 9 Mit Myrten und Rosen, lieblich und hold

This lecture recital was presented in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Doctorate of Musical Arts degree.
THE IMPACT OF EXPANDED, MULTIMODAL APPLICATIONS

Curriculum Vitae

Name: Adam Domenico Iannetta

Post-secondary Education and Degrees:
The University of Windsor
Windsor, Ontario, Canada
2009-2013 B.Mus.

Western University
London, Ontario, Canada
2013-2015 M.Mus.

Western University
London, Ontario, Canada
2015-2019 D.M.A.

Honours and Awards:
The University of Windsor Entrance Scholarship
2009

The University of Windsor Community Scholarship
2009-2013

H. Whorlow Bull Scholarship in Choral Conducting
2012

Helen Veldora Bowlby Scholarship in Music
2012-2013

The University of Windsor Faculty of Music In-course Scholarship
2012-2013

Related Work Experience:
Choral Librarian
The University of Windsor
2010-2013

Teaching Assistant
Western University
2013-2019

Private Voice Instructor
St. Clair College
2019