June 2013

Negotiating Elder Care in a Transnational Context: Taiwanese Families and Vietnamese Migrant Workers

Stephen Lin
The University of Western Ontario

Supervisor
Dr. Danièle Bélanger
The University of Western Ontario

Joint Supervisor
Dr. Ingrid Connidis
The University of Western Ontario

Graduate Program in Sociology

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree in Doctor of Philosophy

© Stephen Lin 2013

Follow this and additional works at: https://ir.lib.uwo.ca/etd
Part of the International and Area Studies Commons, and the Sociology Commons

Recommended Citation
https://ir.lib.uwo.ca/etd/1310

This Dissertation/Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by Scholarship@Western. It has been accepted for inclusion in Electronic Thesis and Dissertation Repository by an authorized administrator of Scholarship@Western. For more information, please contact tadam@uwo.ca, wlswadmin@uwo.ca.
NEGOTIATING ELDER CARE IN A TRANSNATIONAL CONTEXT: TAIWANESE FAMILIES AND VIETNAMESE MIGRANT WORKERS

(Thesis format: Monograph)

by

Stephen Lin

Graduate Program in Sociology

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

The School of Graduate and Postdoctoral Studies
The University of Western Ontario
London, Ontario, Canada

© Stephen Lin 2013
Abstract

As one of the most rapidly aging nations in the world, Taiwan is experiencing a growing demand for elder care labour. Limited state-funded care services combine with an ever-increasing number of dependent elderly members, to create a crisis of care that continues to be managed primarily by families. Although this is a culture where sons bear the primary filial responsibility in a patrilineal structure of filial care, daughters-in-law are often expected to provide significant levels of care to their parents-in-law when they require assistance. Women’s increased participation in the workforce since the 1980s, however, poses an additional challenge to families who are now trying to meet the competing demands of paid work and elder care. A growing number of families now seek care assistance by employing a foreign live-in care worker, an alternative that creates employment opportunities – with attendant costs – for women from less developed economies seeking to support their families. When working abroad as care workers, migrant women and their families also experience contradictory demands of meeting the economic and care needs of family members.

This thesis takes a multi-level approach that incorporates life course, gender, class and transnational perspectives, and the concept of ambivalence to investigate a ‘dual’ family reality: how do Taiwanese families with dependent elders and Vietnamese migrant care workers and their families negotiate care arrangements and kinship ties when trying to meet the needs of family members, often in combination with paid work? Based on an ethnographic study in Taiwan from May to August 2009 and from November 2010 to April 2011, findings from intensive interviews with Taiwanese family members and Vietnamese care workers reveal multiple contexts of care negotiations. In Taiwan, sons, their wives (daughters-in-law to the elder) and their brothers and sisters work out their share of filial responsibility in the household and family context. When Taiwanese families employ Vietnamese care workers, the Taiwanese employers, their elderly family members and extended family negotiate good care and a stable working relationship with their Vietnamese care workers in the context of domestic employment. Despite their physical absence, the Vietnamese women who are hired as care workers continue to work out multiple family care responsibilities as mothers, wives, daughters or daughters-in-law from afar.

This thesis reveals the phenomenon of the global care chains as an outcome of negotiating contradictory work, care and kinship ties in both Taiwanese and Vietnamese families over time. Cultural norms, class differences, changing gender relations, state policies, market forces, regional economic inequalities and labour migration provide relevant contexts for understanding how global care chains produce both continuity and change in the lives of family members in both geographical and transnational contexts.

Keywords: filial responsibility, competing demands, life course, gender, class, transnational, ambivalence, negotiate, care arrangements, kinship ties, global care chains, state, market forces, regional economic inequalities, labour migration, continuity, change
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I would like to take this opportunity to express my appreciation to those people who contributed in various ways to the completion of my doctoral thesis. First and foremost, I am indebted to my two advisors, Professor Danièle Bélanger and Professor Ingrid Connidis, for their guidance and encouragement throughout the process of writing this thesis.

Danièle Bélanger is a strong, supportive and inspiring doctoral supervisor. She was the one who helped me to develop my thesis topic. I truly benefit from her research expertise in kinship norms and gendered labour migration in East and Southeast Asia. Ever since the beginning of my doctoral program, she has been encouraging me to think critically and challenge the gender or cultural stereotypes taken for granted. Her keen interest in developing innovative research ideas motivated me to further develop my research questions in the thesis. Furthermore, I thank Danièle for her generosity in funding my thesis research and her assistance in my preparation for data collection in Taiwan. Finally, during the moments of uncertainty and frustration, she was able to provide me with strong emotional support and helped me to cope with the difficulty and challenge that occurred during my study at Western. Danièle, you are an exemplary mentor. Thank you so much for everything.

I also like to express my gratitude to Ingrid Connidis for her continuous provision of intellectual inspiration and patience at every stage of my thesis writing. Whenever I had a difficulty formulating research ideas properly, she never hesitated to point me out the right direction. Like Danièle, she encouraged me to think outside the box. Prior to the completion of my thesis, Ingrid provided endless efforts to ensure that my writing was clear, concise,
and effective. I was very fortunate to have her in my advisory committee. Thank you so much for everything too!

Second, I would like to express my sincere appreciation to all the research participants in Taiwan for their valuable thoughts and views with regards to my thesis research. Without their active participation, I would not be able to complete this research. Thank you all for their cooperation and those who introduced me to the study participants in Taiwan.

Third, I would like to thank all the wonderful staff members in the Department of Sociology at Western for their continuous help and support. They play a crucial role in meeting my needs and ensuring that I received necessary resources to proceed my study at Western. I would also like to take this opportunity to thank the graduate program assistant, Denise Statham, Professor Tracey Adams and Professor Lorraine Davies greatly for providing necessary guidance to succeed in the graduate program.

Finally, my deepest expression of gratitude goes to my parents who have been showing their support since I was admitted to the PhD. Program at Western. Despite me being away from home for years, they are my biggest driving force to complete my degree. Whenever I encounter difficulties in writing my thesis, they provided the primary source of comfort. Thank you for assisting me to finish this thesis and I love both of you very much!
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract .................................................................................................................................................. ii
Acknowledgements ................................................................................................................................... iii
Table of Contents ...................................................................................................................................... v
List of Tables ........................................................................................................................................... viii
List of Figures ......................................................................................................................................... ix
List of Appendices ................................................................................................................................. x
List of Abbreviations .............................................................................................................................. xi

Chapter 1: INTRODUCTION .................................................................................................................. 1

1.1 Context and Study Objectives ........................................................................................................ 1
1.2 Thesis Outline ................................................................................................................................... 13

Chapter 2: A LITERATURE REVIEW .................................................................................................... 15

2.1 A Life Course Perspective ................................................................................................................ 17
2.2 Taiwanese Cultural Context of Family Care ................................................................................... 23
  2.2.1 The normative intergenerational relationship over the family life course .................................. 23
  2.2.2 Ambivalence and family relationships ....................................................................................... 33
2.3 Social Welfare System and Elder Care Policies ............................................................................. 46
  2.3.1 Conceptualization of the welfare state ...................................................................................... 46
  2.3.2 The historical development of Taiwan’s welfare state .............................................................. 51
2.4 The Role of Class Relations ........................................................................................................... 60
  2.4.1 Class as a social divide .............................................................................................................. 60
  2.4.2 Class as a regional divide ......................................................................................................... 62
  2.4.3 The interaction of class, gender, care and migration ................................................................. 64
  2.4.4 Migrants’ vulnerability primarily as a class issue .................................................................... 67
2.5 Paid Care Relationships .................................................................................................................... 73
2.6 Transnational Families ...................................................................................................................... 74
Chapter 3: RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY ................................................................. 81
3.1 Ontological, Epistemological and Methodological Issues ........................................... 81
3.2 Fieldwork and Data Collection ...................................................................................... 83
  3.2.1 Two-phased ethnographic fieldwork and sampling procedure ............................... 83
  3.2.2 Analytical Approach and Sample characteristics .................................................. 91
3.3 Self-reflection ................................................................................................................. 100
3.4 Study Limitations ......................................................................................................... 102

Chapter 4: FAMILY LIVING AND CARE ARRANGEMENTS ............................................. 104
4.1 Living and Care Arrangements ...................................................................................... 105
  4.1.1 Continuous multi-generational living arrangement ................................................ 106
  4.1.2 Multiple cohabitation arrangements ...................................................................... 113
  4.1.3 From independent living to cohabitation later in life ............................................. 114
  4.1.4 Independent living .................................................................................................. 115
4.2 Family Negotiation of Care ............................................................................................ 116
4.3 Family Transition to Paid Domestic Care ..................................................................... 122
  4.3.1 Rationale for hiring a foreign live-in care worker .................................................. 122
  4.3.2 Negotiation for an alternative care arrangement .................................................... 125
  4.3.3 A summary of care transitions .............................................................................. 128
4.4 The Employment of a Foreign Live-in Care Worker ...................................................... 130
  4.4.1 Recruitment process ............................................................................................... 130
  4.4.2 Negotiating the cost of paid care ........................................................................... 134
  4.4.3 After the care worker’s arrival ............................................................................... 137
4.5 Summary ........................................................................................................................ 141

Chapter 5: RELATIONSHIP DYNAMICS WITH THE FOREIGN CARE WORKER .......... 142
5.1 Domestic Labour Relations .............................................................................................. 139
  5.1.1 Employer-worker relationship trajectory .................................................................. 142
**List of Tables**

Table 2.1: Percentage Distributions of Household Types: Taiwan 1965-2005

Table 2.2: Taiwan’s 2009 Living Arrangements of the Elderly aged 65 and above (%).

Table 2.3: Primary caregiver for Dependent Elders aged 65 and above, by Sex and Age of Elderly (%) Taiwan, June 2009.

Table 2.4: Number and Percent of Domestic Care Workers by Country of Origin.

Table 2.5: Domestic Workers: Annual Totals and Percentage Changes.

Table 3.1: Sample Size.

Table 3.2: Demographic Profile of 20 Vietnamese Live-in Elder Care Workers.

Table 3.3: Case Profiles.

Table 5.1: Perceptions of Good Care.

Table 5.2: A Summary of Conflict Situations in the Paid Domestic Care Relationship.

Table 6.1: A Summary of Alternative Care Arrangements in Migrant Workers’ Families.

Table 6.2: Primary Remittance Recipient by the Migrant Worker’s Marital Status.

Table 6.3: Remittances and Family/Gender Relationships.
List of Figures

Figure 2.1: Female Labour Participation Rate (Aged 15 and Older)........................................ 37
Figure 2.2: The Process of Employing a Foreign Live-in Care Worker in Taiwan............... 58
Figure 2.3: Subcategories of Social Welfare Foreign Worker............................................. 60
Figure 3.1: The Makeup of Social Welfare Foreign Workers in Taiwan over Time........... 85
Figure 4.1: Types of Living Arrangements........................................................................... 105
Figure 4.2: The Process of Seeking Paid In-Home Care.................................................... 129
Figure 5.1: A Typical Employer-worker Relationship Trajectory ........................................ 157
Figure 5.2: A Typical Worker-elder Relationship Trajectory............................................. 170
Figure 6.1: The Configuration of Global Care Chains.......................................................... 204
List of Appendices

Appendix A: Interview Guide ............................................................................................................. 273

Appendix B: Ethics Approval ............................................................................................................. 279
List of Abbreviations

AECA: alternative elder care arrangements

CLA: The Council of Labour Affairs

DGBS: Directorate-General Budget, Accounting and Statistics

DPP: Democratic Progressive Party

EI: employment insurance

ILO: International Labour Organization

KMT: Kuomintang (Chiang Kai-shek’s Nationalist army on the Chinese mainland)

LIA: Labour Insurance Act

LTCAC: Long-Term Care Administration Center

NHIP: National Health Insurance Program

NPS: National Pension System

TFR: Total Fertility Rate
Chapter 1: INTRODUCTION

This thesis is about family ties, care arrangements and the dynamics of care transfers. Situated in the context of the life courses of the agents involved in elder care in Taiwan, it examines several aspects of care relationships: an aging population stimulating a growing need for care; the changing landscape of kinship norms; shifting gender relations; interactions between members of different social classes; the effects of welfare policies; global trends in labour migration and transnational families.

The fieldwork supporting this thesis was conducted in response to the growing tendency to purchase domestic elder care services among Taiwanese families, who often rely on the global labour market to meet such needs. The factors that characterize the negotiation of care responsibilities among these families and the migrant workers who reside with them makes this a unique site for studying care at the macro, meso and micro levels. Researching this phenomenon aids our understanding of Taiwanese family culture, gender relations, the global demand for and supply of care, and regional labour mobility. These are pressing issues and our attention to them is timely.

1.1 Context and Study Objectives

Between the early 1960s and the 1990s, Taiwan, along with Hong Kong, Singapore and South Korea, witnessed accelerated industrialization, increased prosperity and rapid yet sustainable economic growth, creating the phenomenon of the ‘East Asian Miracle’ (World Bank, 1993). This region’s remarkable economic performance coincided with
major changes in the population's age distribution. In a trend that continues into the present, declining fertility rates and increased life expectancy have caused steady population aging. In 1988, Taiwan’s total fertility rate (TFR) fell below the replacement level (2.1) and continued to drop throughout the following decade. In 1993, the proportion of the population aged 65 or older exceeded 7%, making Taiwan what the World Health Organization defines as an ‘aging nation’. By 2009, it experienced one of the world’s lowest TFRs, estimated at 1.0 (Population Reference Bureau, 2009). Birth rates are predicted to remain low as more women remain single or childless after marriage (DGBAS, 2010).

This fertility decline has caused negative population growth and a proportionate increase of elderly persons. By 2008, the proportion reached 10.4 percent; by 2036, the proportion is expected to peak at 27.9 percent. By that same year, the old age dependency ratio, that is, the ratio of persons aged 65 and above who are economically dependent on those who provide for them, is projected to increase from 14.4 to 46 percent (Council for Economic Planning and Development, 2008). Whereas seven persons supported one aged citizen in 2008, by 2036 three persons will support one.

In 2009, 75.9 percent of the population older than 65 suffered from at least one chronic or critical illness and required some form of daily assistance (Department of Statistics, Taiwan, 2009). Population aging not only reflects a demographic transition; it also creates a growing need for medical and personal care. Nonetheless, despite the association between old age and physical dependency, not every elderly person is dependent. Researchers, such as Matthews (2002), classify elders under three
categories: the dependent (disabled or diseased individuals who need assistance to maintain their daily functions in old age); the capable (those who have relatively good functional health and can accomplish daily activities without seeking help); and those who fall somewhere between these two categories. My thesis research focuses mainly on the ways in which the adult offspring meet the care needs of their dependent parents, and, in particular, upon how family members make specific care arrangements and whether these are altered over time.

In Taiwan, the Confucian tradition of filial piety is an important part of Chinese culture shaping family relationships over the life course. Elder care is deeply embedded in the patrilineal kinship system, making gender essential for understanding a typical care arrangement. Traditionally, sons assume the primary caregiving responsibility for aged parents and this gendered filial care usually involves cohabitation. Only when sons are not available do daughters fulfill this role (Lin et al., 2003). However, if sons are married, it is often daughters-in-law who perform the actual caring tasks (Liu & Tinker, 2003; Liu & Hsieh, 1995).

Although the division of care responsibilities varies, the family is the primary source of care for elders; specifically, intergenerational reciprocal care is a key characteristic of family life. Parents and children are essentially bound by an ‘implicit moral contract’ (Lan, 2002): Caring for each other is expected, and adult children’s collective provision of support to parents later in life is often the norm (Lin et al., 2003). How families arrange and negotiate the division of care responsibilities is central to revealing the dynamics of family caregiving relationships. For the purpose of this thesis, I analyze the term, ‘the
process of care arrangements,’ to study how care will be organized and allocated, as well as when, where and how much of it is delivered to the person needing it.

Scholars have suggested that there is a potential ‘care crisis’ (Kelly et al., 1999; Peng, 2004) or ‘care deficit’ (Fine & Mitchell, 2007) in economically developed nations. As Taiwan continues to change economically and socially, whether families can continue to adequately fulfill their care needs has become a heated debate (Chattopadhyay & Marsh, 1999; Hsu & Shyu, 2003; Hsu et al., 2001; Kung & Yi, 2001). In addition to population aging, several other factors contribute to the changing landscape of care provision in Taiwan and pose challenges to families caring for their elderly members. These include shifting gender relations and employment and household structures, as well as the recent introduction of welfare state policies. Despite the continued tradition of filial piety that influences the structures through which elder care is provided in Taiwan, women are often the primary caregivers. Accordingly, the increasing labour force participation of women since the early 1950s may affect the continuity of family care provision. Furthermore, due to rapid industrialization and urbanization, people in contemporary Taiwan are more likely to live away from their parents’ homes than in previous generations, leading to the erosion of the extended household structure. Consequently, some elders may not be able to receive their adult offspring’s immediate assistance due to geographical distance (Chattopadhyay & Marsh, 1999).

Taiwan’s Confucian-oriented welfare state policies also contribute to a possible care deficit. Compared with Western and North European countries, East Asian countries have a relatively weak welfare state, meaning publicly-funded care services are often
limited. These states often deem family to be the primary source of care (Chan, 2005; Chen, 2008; McDaniel, 2009), an ideological construction of care support that causes many dual-earner families to experience difficulties in balancing work and family life. Consequently, for some families, seeking hired help becomes inevitable. In recent years, women in the younger cohorts are less likely to choose traditional feminine domestic work as a career option (Lan, 2006), thus contributing to the shortage of local care workers. All of these factors combine to force some families to search for alternative means of fulfilling their care needs.

In response to an increased demand for the provision of elder care, in 1992 Taiwan's government launched a program to assist families trying to hire foreign care workers to provide live-in care for their dependent elders. This state-regulated but market-driven program provides families with a means of obtaining paid help. This solution, that is, to import workers across national borders, not only reflects welfare state inadequacies (Razavi, 2007) in providing nationwide long-term care services, but also reinforces Taiwan's neo-liberal ideology, as the cost of care is assumed by families as a private expense. However, the growing demand for foreign care workers suggests that elder care is no longer an activity confined to the private domestic sphere. The need to find alternatives to traditional care arrangements has caused state policy, family needs and concerns, and the global labour market to intersect.

The growing demand for private in-home care services has led to the recruitment of foreign workers to Taiwan from less developed economies. How increasing numbers of migrant workers are mobilized and employed in domestic care in Asia-Pacific is well-
documented (Cheng, 2003, 2004; Constable, 2007; Piper, 2003; Lan, 2006). Persistent regional economic disparities exist in developing countries, where deteriorating economic infrastructures, government debt, a rising unemployment rate, cutbacks in government social expenditures and the closing of firms in traditional industries have undermined local prosperity (Sassen, 2000). These factors have motivated more and more people living in these regions to seek an alternative livelihood abroad. As well, governments in countries such as the Philippines actively encourage citizens to export their labour and then send remittances back home to improve the national economy (Cheng, 2006:31; Hugo, 2005).

Regional economic disparities cannot fully explain the causes and pattern of this particular migration flow. Increasing migration is due not only to adverse economic conditions in the home countries of migrating labourers, but also to the rising demand for inexpensive care labour in countries such as Taiwan. While the former factor suggests that global labour migration is a seemingly gender-neutral process, the latter is structured by gender norms, leading to different migratory trajectories for men and women (Boyd & Grieco, 2003). Care, whether paid or unpaid, has been socially constructed as women’s work, and it has long been part of the global economy. While migrant women carry a variety of skills to other countries, those who find work in the domestic care sector persistently dominate the migration flow, particularly from South-East to East Asia (Constable, 2007; Lan, 2003a, 2003b; Cheng, 2006). The rising demand for such labour in Asia Pacific (Piper, 2004) has generated a gender- and sector-specific ‘migration stream’, a constant flow of female migrants who move from one geographic
region to another to work in a specific employment niche. The phenomenon of women migrating independently for paid employment (ILO, 2004:11; Yamanaka & Piper, 2005) has been described as the ‘feminization of labour migration’ (Piper, 2004; Wee & Sim, 2004:168). This highlights gender as a key socially structured relation determining the need for and impact of labour migration (Curran et al., 2006; Dodson, 2008; Ford & Piper, 2007: 64-5). Thus, one must address gender and class relations as part of sociological research on global migration.

Labour migration not only changes people’s individual circumstances but also reconfigures their family relationships. While working abroad, migrants often experience the pain of physical separation and face challenges to maintaining family ties over long distances (Lin & Bélanger, 2012; Parreñas, 2001). How migrant women negotiate their family responsibilities from afar has become the central focus of recent studies on transnational families (Hondagneu-Sotelo & Avila, 1997; Pinnawala, 2009; Parreñas, 2005; Skrbis, 2008). These scholars have shown how migrants reassert their role and constantly negotiate gender relations with their spouses back home. As core family members, their absence may also generate care needs; this may require them to mobilize family or paid labour to fulfill such needs. All of these issues provide important contexts for understanding the dynamics of transnational family relationships.

The integration of the existing research detailed above grounds my exploration of a central idea in this thesis: How family obligations inform how Taiwanese families come to hire foreign live-in care workers and the factors that affect their decisions to migrate in order to support the dependents back home. To understand this ‘dual’ family reality at
the micro-, meso- and macro- levels, this thesis asks the following four main research questions: (1) How do Taiwanese families negotiate living and care arrangements later in life? (2) Why and how do some families arrange to hire a foreign live-in care worker? (3) How does the presence of a Vietnamese care worker reconfigure social dynamics in Taiwanese households? (4) How do Vietnamese migrant care workers negotiate their family care responsibilities and kinship ties while working abroad? To answer these questions, I conducted a two-phased qualitative study. The first phase entailed interviewing 20 Vietnamese domestic care workers. In the second phase, I interviewed one or multiple participants (employer, care worker, elder) from 23 families.

To answer my first research question, I consider two relevant issues that are worth exploring. While filial care in Taiwan typically occurs in a cohabitation arrangement, we know little about the family and gender dynamics within that arrangement. Hence, I investigate how families determine which child – typically a son - lives with the elderly parents and later becomes the primary caregiver, and under what circumstance daughter(s) takes over the care tasks. Next, I explore how family members negotiate care arrangements. Negotiation in this context refers to the process by which family members ‘work out’ (Finch & Mason, 1993) the division of care. I explore this complex process in the household and family context separately in order to study both individuals’ and married couples’ strategies of balancing work and care, and various divisions of care responsibilities among siblings who may not be in the same household. The objectives of these explorations are to (1) gain insight into both intergenerational (i.e., parent-child) and intragenerational (i.e., siblings) relationships, (2) understand how
adult offspring negotiate their relationships while meeting family care needs over time, and (3) identify specific outcomes of negotiated care.

To understand the factors that influence the outcomes of family care negotiation, I consider: family structure, especially, the size and gender composition of the sibling network; levels of family involvement and engagement (Matthews, 2002); and geographic proximity between family caregivers and recipients (Keong-Suk, 2001; Matthews, 2002). Documenting care arrangements as they change over time helps to establish family elder care biographies and trajectories. In addition, consideration of family dynamics helps to identify when work-care conflict occurs and the specific strategies adopted to resolve these conflicts. By asking what kinds of adaptations various family members make, and how they are negotiated, I am able to analyze the relationship of family decision-making to social institutions and structured social relations, especially gender. The focus of this element of my project is how Taiwanese families work out their care arrangements and why specific care choices are made at different points in time.

The thesis then proceeds to address my second research question of why some families rely on paid care labour to look after their elderly members, specifically focusing on those who choose to hire a foreign live-in care worker rather than resort to other alternative care options. I investigate how the transition from an informal to a mixed source of caregiving occurs and examine the implications for families who purchase in-home care by employing a live-in care worker. This transition is conditioned by social policies in Taiwan. To this end, I discuss how families respond to public-care-service
options prior to their recruitment of a foreign care worker, as well as the process by which this recruitment is accomplished.

Understanding the choice to employ a migrant care worker demands an examination of a changing ‘family care network’, a term I use to indicate both the person receiving care and the several participants who provide this care. The analysis explores changes in the family care network after the worker’s arrival. Many scholars, realizing the limitations of the dyadic primary/secondary caregiver and care recipient model (Brody, 1981; Horowitz & Shindelman, 1980), have sought to provide a better explanation of the complexity of family caregiving relationships by broadening the construct to include all parties involved in the caregiving dynamic (Dilworth-Anderson et al., 1999; Horowitz, 1992; Keith, 1995; Matthews, 2002). Following this approach, I explore the effect on existing family relationship dynamics of shared care arrangements; that is, how family members negotiate the division of care with the foreign care worker is examined. How the host family interacts with the care worker in the private household over time is also an important area of investigation. Of equal importance is the question of how the presence of a care worker reconfigures social dynamics in the host family’s home. I therefore investigate how parties perceive each other’s roles and identities while sharing care responsibilities. This provides a means to study relationship boundaries between the employer and the care worker from the point of the latter’s arrival until the termination of their contract.

In order to answer my third research question of how the presence of a Vietnamese care worker reconfigures social dynamics in the Taiwanese household, this thesis
documents the details of caregiving trajectories that elucidate the specific transitions occurring in the multiple-party social relationships. Unlike previous research on domestic employment, which primarily focused on dyadic-employer-worker relationships (Cheng, 2006; Constable, 2007; Lan, 2006), my research aims to incorporate the complex relationships of all parties involved. This approach considers social and power dynamics among all parties in the private care space: the employer (typically the adult offspring or children-in-law of the elderly care recipient); his or her siblings; the elder; and the foreign worker.

To answer my last research question of how Vietnamese migrant care workers negotiate their family and care responsibilities and kinship ties while working abroad, I first investigate how these workers negotiate overseas work with their own family, how some manage to fulfill maternal responsibilities from afar, and how workers' absences from their own homes impact their familial relationships. Then, I examine how, and what alternative care arrangements migrant workers make to meet the needs of dependent kin members back home. Broadly, these inquiries help to understand the kinship system of the society to which migrants belong (this study focuses on workers who have migrated from Vietnam). More specifically, I approach the practice of sending remittances abroad as a site to study how migrant workers maintain complex and dynamic kinship ties across distance, allowing this thesis to graph the trajectories of transnational family relationships.

When researching transnational migration and the creation of transnational families, I also study how migrant workers perceive their social identities. This is achieved by
exploring the meaning of their new social relationships with the host family, as well as the implications of their simultaneous involvement in two families. Understanding how migrant care workers construct and negotiate multi-geographic social ties requires a socio-geographic perspective which goes beyond thinking of in-home care and domestic labour relations as purely economic transactions in order to appreciate the complexity of social ties across geographical boundaries.

One important analytical approach of this research is to incorporate the micro, meso and macro contexts of care into the understanding of the ‘dual’ family reality previously discussed. Specifically, how developed countries’ demand for inexpensive care services drives regional labour migration and reconfigures the division of care in the labour-sending families is central to this thesis. Although this phenomenon has been captured by the concept of ‘global care chains’ (Hochschild, 2000; Yeates, 2004, 2012), nuances of how care is negotiated and transferred locally and transnationally requires further investigation. I situate this inquiry particularly in a sociological framework that takes market forces, state, class, gender and kinship ties into account. I investigate various types of care transfers operating in both the host and migrant’s family as a dynamic process. By directing my analysis towards understanding the complex dynamics of two geographically distant families, I attempt to show how Taiwanese and Vietnamese families become connected through migratory care work.

In addition to the empirical objectives, this thesis also has a conceptual objective: to advance the existing theoretical frameworks on the family negotiations of work-care demands and local-global nexus of family care. Accordingly, several related themes run
through and act as continual queries in this research: the gendered nature of care; familial management of work-family conflict; care within kinship ties; power dynamics in domestic labour relations; and the formation of transnational families.

1.2 Thesis Outline

The next chapter establishes this study’s conceptual framework and reviews relevant research on elder care from several countries. I consider where previous findings are relevant in order to ascertain similarities and differences between the Taiwanese context and elsewhere. I also discuss how several theoretical approaches as they inform this study. Particularly, I attempt to show how gender, class and culture shape understandings of family care and caregiving transitions in both local and transnational contexts.

Chapter Three provides a detailed description and rationale for my methodological approach: the study design and implementation; methods of data collection; and sampling procedures and sample characteristics. I detail my analytical approach, outline the ethical challenges I encountered during data collection, and discuss the limitations deriving from selection of my study subjects.

Chapter Four explicates a range of dynamics that emerge over time in living and caregiving arrangements in Taiwan. Family history, the gender composition of adult sibling networks, the strength of sibling ties and the work-care commitments of married couples’ are examined as parameters influencing the configuration of care arrangements across families. I also explore how the division of elder care is the outcome of family negotiations in Taiwan, detailing transitions in care arrangements -
specifically, the recruitment of foreign live-in care workers - and how these affect family relationships.

Chapter Five develops this analysis of caregiving relationship dynamics by taking into account all three parties engaged in a shared care scenario: the elder; the employer and his or her partner and siblings, and the worker. I explore how these parties negotiate and form complex webs of relationships as these evolve in the private space of care provision in the home.

Chapter Six takes up the transnational aspect of migratory care work. I explore how migrant care workers negotiate and maintain family ties with their loved ones back home and how they and their family members meet the needs of their children and parents. I also discuss how migrants manage their pay, and the impact of remittances on their spousal relationships, and conclude by analyzing how migrants construct the meaning of family through migratory care work provided to two geographically distant households.

The final chapter presents a brief overview of the findings of the thesis and then relates them to current theoretical and empirical literature in the field. I consider the significance of my findings, their empirical and conceptual contributions to the study of family ties, the provision of care and transnational family dynamics. Finally, I discuss the limitations of the study and suggest possible directions for future research.
Chapter 2: A LITERATURE REVIEW

This chapter discusses scholarship that has contributed to the study of family elder care, the recruitment of migrant care workers and transnational families. An array of literature is reviewed to situate my research in different social, cultural and geographical contexts, after a conceptual framework is presented. This framework ties together key concepts and ideas from the family care and migration literature to illuminate why kinship ties are central to the care needs of both Taiwanese families and Vietnamese migrant workers and their own families.

The life course perspective provides an overarching approach for exploring family ties, configurations of care arrangements and care transitions over time and distance. Gender, as a key structured social relation and cultural parameter, greatly influences Taiwanese intergenerational living and care arrangements. How these differ from the Western context is presented. Gender also permeates sibling negotiations of filial responsibilities, particularly, how brothers and sisters collaborate when care is required is explored.

The complexity of how kin relationships and care arrangements are linked to broader cultural and social structural forces and social institutions prompts the adoption of multilevel analysis. The concept of ambivalence provides one exemplar of how structured social relations and the cultural ideal of care (macro) create work-family conflict (meso), which influences how individuals negotiate their family ties and care responsibilities intergenerationally and intragenerationally (micro) (Connidis, 2010; 2012). By focusing on gender, this thesis studies how Taiwanese adult offspring,
particularly daughters-in-law, negotiate their own multiple, contradictory social roles and relationships.

The Taiwanese welfare state provides another macro context, helping us to understand why current elder care policies inadequately meet the care needs of some families and prompt them to seek an alternative care arrangement, primarily through migrant care labour. A family’s recruitment of a foreign care worker also involves macro-meso-micro levels of analysis. Class contextualizes families’ economic ability to purchase care services. Taiwan’s demand for domestic workers and a global supply of female caring labour reflects both class and gender structures at the national and global levels. The macro context of gendered migration is then placed in the meso context of labour relations and family, forming a paid care relationship where social and power dynamics among employers, migrant workers and care recipients create the micro context of social interactions.

Finally, ways in which both Taiwanese and Vietnamese families meet their care needs are discussed in the context of global care chains, which are placed in the macro contexts of class, gender and global migration. Transnational family provides a meso context for studying how Vietnamese migrant workers respond to the care needs of their own families while working abroad to support their families. The concept of ambivalence helps us to study how Vietnamese migrants negotiate their contradictory demands in both work and family domains. The transnational perspective is aimed at exploring the micro context of kinship dynamics in Vietnamese migrants’ families and the meaning of familyhood.
2.1 A Life Course Perspective

This multidisciplinary paradigm places care arrangements into various contexts: historical change; social structure; cultural values; personal circumstances; life domains; and the intersection and mutual influence of individual lives. This thesis takes a multilevel approach to examine how configurations of care arrangements and family ties change over time.

Transitions, trajectories, turning points and time are central concepts of the life course perspective (Elder, 1991a; Elder et al, 2004). These terms provide useful conceptual tools for studying both stability and dynamics of individual lives over time, and for observing general and changing life patterns that construct individual biographies. Transitions refer to short-term “changes in status that are discrete and bounded in duration” (George, 1993:358). A transition typically occurs when one acquires a new status while relinquishing an old one. For instance, when parents transition to old age, they are likely to experience chronic conditions and thus require help from others; a major transition will also occur in adult offspring’s lives when they become the primary caregiver for their dependent parents, reflecting the concept of linked lives (Conidis, 2010; Heinz, 2001; Settersten, 2003). When a transition occurs and how it affects one’s subsequent life course are also key to life course studies (Elder et al., 2003, Moen, 2003; Pavalko, 1997). Transitions also apply to families (Cowan, 1991; Elder, 1991b). In the context of parent care, family transitions refer to changes to which members of a family adapt in order to balance care with other competing demands, such as work. The study of family transitions is at the core of this thesis’s
attempt to understand how particular living and care arrangements occur to meet specific family needs at different points in time. It is necessary to situate family transitions in specific cultural and historical contexts (Elder, 1991b) because such transitions are conditioned by particular cultural values and norms as well as by social change, for example, in gender relations.

Trajectories are “long-term patterns of stability and change” (George, 2003:672) that capture the flow of multiple transitions people go through over time. They represent the sequences of multiple status configurations that people occupy over time (Connidis, 2010; Heinz, 2001), for example a child, sibling, spouse, parent, and labour force participant. As we age, most of us experience multiple life domains simultaneously, such as family, education and work; how these domains intersect and shape institutional arrangements have been a primary focus in studies of the life course trajectories (George, 2003; Heinz, 2001, 2003; Settersten, 2003). My thesis applies the concept of trajectories to study individuals’ employment and family relationships from the time when care is needed to the point when a foreign live-in care worker is hired. Another application of trajectories is concerned with changes that occur in the caregiving relationship. These include inquiries about who joins the family care network and how the caregiving relationship evolves over time; both applications help to comprise the ‘caregiving relationship trajectory’.

Turning points are dramatic transitions in one’s life course (Elder, 1998). Examples are marriage and childbirth – major events in the life course trajectory. Some of these events are more predictable than others; when highly predictable, they become life
course markers (Winsborough, 1980). For example, there is a far greater likelihood of requiring care in old age than in early adulthood, and therefore, adult care is more generally associated with old age. Turning points also apply to the experiences of transnational migrant care workers who decide to make an alternative livelihood away from home; how this decision leads to their subsequent life transition and whether this decision alters their relationships with family members back home is explored in this thesis.

Time is another central concept of the life course perspective. In addition to biological time, that is, chronological age, life course scholars also consider ‘social time’ which comprises culturally shared expectations, and establishes when certain social events are expected to occur (Neugarten, 1996; Settersten & Hagestad, 1996a, 1996b). ‘Social time’ is particularly relevant to Taiwan’s filial norm that adult offspring will look after their parents when needed. Failure to follow the socially prescribed timetable may result in social sanctions (Marshall & Muelle, 2002:9). In Taiwan, there is a common perception that failing to fulfill one’s filial duty brings shame upon the family.

Although the classic life course concepts discussed above add the ‘time’ dimension to the study of Taiwanese family care, they mainly describe life course events at the micro level. Little attention is given to the influence of structured social relations, such as class and gender, on individual experiences (the macro-micro link) and the relationship between individuals and social institutions (the meso-micro link) (Connidis, 2010, 2012). This motivated scholars to advance the life course approach. In recent years, Elder et al. (2003), Mayer (2009) and Connidis (2010) have suggested an
alternative direction in life course research. Despite the methodological challenge, they recognize the importance of incorporating macro, meso and micro contexts in studies of every aspect of social life.

The life course principle of linked lives, for example, bridges meso and micro levels of analysis. Research that adopts this principle examines individual lives over a considerable period of time, not only linking experiences in early life with those occurring in later stages, but also studying the relationship dynamics of older and younger family members (Bierman & Milkie, 2008; Crosnoe & Elder, 2002; Hagestad, 2003; Moen & Erickson, 2009). As Marshall and Mueller argue, “Lives are lived interdependently and social-historical influences are expressed through this network of relationships” (2003:10). Linked lives shift the focus from individuals to their relationships with each other (Moen, 2003; Moen & Han, 2001). Because people generally live longer now than before, their lives are linked with parents and even grandparents for a longer duration (Bengtson, 2001; Burgess et al., 1998). Linked lives thus encourage exploration of the dynamics of intergenerational support, especially the ways in which Taiwanese adult offspring provide care to their parents in old age (Hsu & Shyu, 2003; Lin et al., 2003) in this thesis. Linked lives not only apply to intergenerational reciprocal care but also to intragenerational relationships, especially when examining how adults work out their caregiving responsibilities (Finch, 1993; Matthews, 2002).

The multi-level life course perspective is also evident in the life course concept of ‘risk’ which refers to the economic vulnerability people perceive or experience in life
Several factors contribute to this risk. First, an adverse macroeconomic condition, such as a recession, will most likely put people at risk of losing their jobs or staying unemployed for a longer period. The structured social relation of class, as indicated by variations in income, education and occupational status, is another macro factor contributing to one’s economic insecurity. People in lower social classes tend to be economically vulnerable; a lack of financial resources poses a challenge to meeting basic survival needs. Whether this structural disadvantage persists over one’s life course also requires a consideration of the state. Life course scholars see welfare state policies and the outcome of individual biographies as inseparable; specifically, how the level of state-funded public support can perpetuate or reduce individuals’ economic vulnerability over their life course (Leisering, 2003; O’Rand, 2003; Whelan & Maitre, 2008). By making these macro-micro links while applying the concept of ‘risk’, this thesis will explore how adverse economic situations, a disadvantageous class position, and limited public support from the government of the labour-sending country lead people to seek an alternative livelihood abroad.

How people attempt to resolve the structurally-determined risk exemplifies the life course principle of ‘human agency’. It refers to individuals’ capacity to construct their lives through choices and actions which depend on social and historical circumstances, opportunities and constraints (Elder et al., 2003:11). The agency-within-structure model (Settersten, 2003; Settersten & Gannon, 2005) enhances the life course perspective by linking macro and micro levels of analysis; specifically, this model connects structural factors and social forces to choices available to individuals over time. Structural forces
either facilitate or constrain choices that one makes regarding particular life course events (Settersten, 2003). The choices individuals make can also influence the institutionalized arrangements of family lives (meso) (Connidis, 2010:16) and modify the ‘normative’ life trajectory that shapes individual biographies (micro). This multilevel-oriented concept of human agency is useful for exploring how migrant care workers from less developed countries improve their life chances and their family’s economic condition and how migration affects their relationships with family members remaining at home.

Life course scholars also study how people exercise human agency to shape their own biographies instead of following specific cultural norms over time (Heinz & Krüger, 2001). This observation is key to understanding how macro-level social changes may provide individuals with alternative options to alter their ‘social time’ and then construct their own life path. By applying this particular aspect of human agency to the context of family care, this thesis explores why some adult offspring, who must balance elder care with meeting competing demands, such as paid work, seek alternative approaches to fulfill their filial duty.

The consideration of key life course concepts and principles and a multilevel analysis prompts this chapter to explore: (1) how the macro contexts of cultural norms on filial care, structured social relations, particularly class and gender, and state policies influence adult offspring’s choices of caregiving practice, (2) how the meso context of family ties shapes kin members’ care involvement and engagement, and the process of negotiating care responsibilities, including the living and care arrangements they make.
for their dependent parents, (3) how the recruitment of foreign care workers reproduces the macro context of class and gender relations in the meso context of private households, and (4) how the macro context of care labour migration reconfigures the meso context of kinship ties in both the host and sending families.

2.2 Taiwanese Cultural Context of Family Care

Taiwan’s cultural emphasis on filial piety (Chinese: xiao dao) stresses that adult offspring are expected to fulfill their care responsibility for their parents in old age. In Confucianism, filial piety is a primary virtue (Sung, 2003); it links lives via the culturally-constructed kinship norm of an ‘intergenerational contract’ (Greenhalgh, 1985). Adult offspring typically reciprocate parents for nurturing and financially supporting them during their upbringing by providing them with home care and financial support as they age. This is the normative life course relationship between parents and their children. Adult offspring are motivated by filial piety to maximize the well-being of their parents; failure to ensure this brings a family shame. The entrenched cultural norm of filial piety makes intergenerational relationships a key unit of analysis for studying Taiwanese family elder care.

2.2.1 The ‘normative’ intergenerational relationship over the family life course

Intergenerational relationships are one of the most dynamic and complex social ties over the family life course. While the provision of care between two generations is influenced by a general norm of filial piety, gender also operates in how care is arranged and provided. Therefore, how the perspective of gender relations sheds light on the
‘normative’ family trajectory of parent care in Taiwan is explored. However, a normative-reality gap may occur when the macro-level context of social changes (e.g., urbanization), the meso-level context of social institutions (e.g., work-family), or the micro-level context of family ties (e.g., tension between individuals) disrupt the ideal caregiving relationship. I now explore care practices in the ‘normative’ intergenerational relationship.

**Gendered Living Arrangements**

Observing how adult offspring arrange living arrangements with their aged parents is relevant for studying intergenerational relationships later in life. Despite the conceptual usefulness of linked lives, a full understanding of intergenerational living arrangements also requires a consideration of gender relations. In Taiwan, continuous multi-generational cohabitation remains the norm rooted in the patrilineal tradition: Elderly parents normally reside with at least one son (and his family) even before care becomes necessary (Hwang, 1997; Lin, et al., 2003). This living arrangement evolved in tandem with Taiwan’s economic progress. Studying this process allows us to understand how societal changes (macro) transformed the household structure (meso). When Taiwan was primarily agrarian, the ‘joint-stem family’ was the norm: Parents cohabited with married sons and their families. However, urbanization and industrialization have reduced the incidence of extended households (Lee & Sun, 1995). From the 1970s onwards, the ‘stem family’ has been the norm (Weinstein et al., 1994). In the simplest form of ‘stem family’, parents live with one married or single son, while other sons live apart, forming their own nuclear families (Lee et al., 1995; Weinstein et al., 1990). This
change to a simplified family household structure involves the division of extended
kinship systems into smaller family units (Cohen, 1992), known as fen jia: Fen denotes
“subdivisions of varying size and genealogical depth within the lineage” (Cohen,
1976:57), while jia refers to the smallest Chinese kinship system unit of “members
related to each other by blood, marriage, or adoption and having a common budget and
common property” (Lang, 1946:13). Two important facets of fen jia are used in this
thesis: the division of residence among sons and the division of family assets and
property amongst children. This gender-based household division and transfer of
economic resources (from father to son) is an important context for studying which son
(and his family, if married) is likely to continue to live with his parents and whether
daughters might be involved.

Previous research in the Taiwanese context documents that even when sons do not
cohabit, they may follow a mutually-agreed-upon timeline according to which they take
turns in providing parents with housing, support and care (Goldstein, 2004; Hsieh, 1985;
Hsu et al., 2001). I term this as ‘rotating’ living arrangement. In this arrangement, adult
children must live close to aged parents, who move from one child’s residence to the
other periodically. However, although continuous multigenerational living arrangements
persist in Taiwan, sons may choose to cohabit with parents only briefly after marriage
prior to living independently. Cohabitation can re-occur later, when either a parent’s
health declines (Tseng et al., 2007), or more frequently, when the parent loses a spouse
(Yang, 1999). Changes in parent-offspring living arrangements reflect transitions in the
lives of both throughout the life course.
This practice is uncommon in North America and Europe, where the elderly tend to live alone or with a spouse (De Vox & Sandefur, 2002; Wilmoth, 1998; Wilmoth & Longino, 2006). However, studies of East Asian contexts reveal that although intergenerational cohabitation continues to be practiced (Chu & Yu, 2009; Hermalin et al., 2003; Thornton & Lin, 1994), the incidence of this form of living arrangement is declining; increasingly, adult offspring live on their own (Chang, 1994; Chu, 1994; Wang & Chen, 1988). Between 1986 and 2005, the proportion of elderly living only with their spouses increased in Taiwan (Xu, 2008). This is in part due to an economic shift beginning in the 1970s, when regional differences in unemployment and wage rates motivated significant rural-urban migration (Hsueh et al., 2002). This has been confirmed by the national statistics. Table 2.1 shows a gradual decline of extended families and a steady increase in nuclear families between 1965 and 2005. When extended families are subcategorized into stem and joint-stem, the joint-stem household structure has declined markedly, from 30% in 1965 to 6% in 2005. This can be partly justified by a major demographic transition. According to the Council for Economic Planning and Development (2008), Taiwan’s total fertility rate dropped from 4.82 to 1.09 between 1966 and 2008, suggesting that as parents have a fewer number of children, their likelihood of cohabiting with multiple children over the family life course decreases accordingly.
Table 2.1: Percentage Distributions of Household Types: Taiwan 1965-2005

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nuclear</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extended</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stem</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joint-stem</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: 1965-1986 figures are from Weinstein et al. (1994). 2000 and 2005 figures are calculated from the Taiwan Social Change Survey (Chang, 2000)

In addition to the demographic factor, macro-level social changes also lead to the decline in the extended household structure. As the young move to urban areas, meeting a spouse and forming nuclear families away from the family of origin (Qi, 1989, 1990), the proportion of nuclear families has increased (Tung et al., 2006). Educational and career opportunities in major urban centers continue to attract young adults to migrate, leaving their parents behind in rural areas.

Other social factors must also be considered. In the past, offspring would encounter social disapproval if they failed to assume responsibility for parents left to live alone or care for themselves (Hsu & Shyu, 2003). From the early 1990s, rising levels of higher education have brought attitudinal change: Younger cohorts now re-evaluate and re-interpret traditional filial values. Still, despite the decline of intergenerational cohabitation since the early 1990s, adult children of elderly parents continue to fulfill their filial obligation via financial transfers and economic support (Chattopadhyay & Marsh, 1999).

In comparison with the joint-stem, the proportion of the stem-family household structure remains relatively constant (see Table 2.1), meaning that the declining fertility
rate does not change the intergenerational living arrangement to the same extent as the joint-stem. That parents continue to live with one child, typically a son and his family, remains a norm in Taiwan. As Table 2.2 shows, over 65% of the elderly in 2009 continue to live with their adult children; intergenerational cohabitation remains most common with 37.8% living tri-generationally and 29.8% bi-generationally; only 2.8% live in the nursing homes.

Table 2.2: Taiwan’s 2009 Living Arrangements of the Elderly aged 65 and above (%)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Sex</th>
<th>Age group</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Live alone</td>
<td>9.2</td>
<td>7.9</td>
<td>10.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>With spouse/common-law</td>
<td>18.8</td>
<td>25.6</td>
<td>12.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two generation</td>
<td>29.8</td>
<td>29.2</td>
<td>30.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(1) Only with parents</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2) Only with grandchildren</td>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>3.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Three generation</td>
<td>37.8</td>
<td>32.0</td>
<td>43.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(1) With parents and grandchildren</td>
<td>37.0</td>
<td>30.7</td>
<td>42.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2) With parents and children</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>0.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Four generation</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>0.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>With relatives or friends</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>0.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Living in a nursing home</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>1.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: The 2009 Senior Survey, Department of Statistics, Ministry of the Interior
Gendered Family Elder Care Arrangements

In Taiwan, intergenerational living arrangements often shape subsequent family care arrangements. Typically, in the stem-family household structure one particular married son assumes the primary caregiving responsibility when his parents require care. While the son holds the filial obligation, his spouse often provides the actual care (Liu & Tinker, 2003; Liu & Hsieh, 1995). To understand this pattern of intergenerational care over the family life course, one must consider the culturally-specific gender reality; this means that the caregiving experiences of men and women cannot be isolated from each other (Connidis & Kemp, 2008), but must be placed in the contexts of structured gender relations and cultural norms.

The gendered life course perspective (Krüger & Baldus, 1999; Moen, 2001; Moen & Spencer, 2006) provides a macro context for understanding how the care involvement between men and women varies. In the United States, despite increased female labour force participation, women still provide a disproportionate share of family elder care (Joseph & Hallman, 1996; Martin-Matthews, 2007; Noelker & Townsend, 1987; Pyper, 2006). Approximately two-thirds of informal caregivers are female (Johnson & Wiener, 2006). This is similar in Europe (Kotsadam, 2011; Leitner, 2003). The gendered life course promotes “common assumptions about the desirable, ‘normal’ form of gender relations and the division of labour” (Pfau-Effinge, 1998:178). Pre-established cultural gender norms and practices create gender-distinct life paths (Moen, 2011). In many cultures, women are expected to provide care. Their assumed role as nurturers typically
begins with motherhood. As their life progresses, they shift socially-acquired care capital to dependent family elders (Lee, 1992).

Institutional arrangements, such as those that prescribe family responsibilities and labour market participation, reflect cultural expectations and shape the ‘gendered life course’ (Krüger & Baldus, 1999). When women are expected to provide family care, they tend to choose contingent employment that offers them more flexibility than the work typically sought by men (Guillemard, 2005; Moen, 2001; Krüger, 1999). For instance, part-time work permits women to provide care for dependent in-laws (Matthews et al., 1989). Effinger (1998) terms such structured gender relations ‘gender arrangement’.

Although women provide most informal care to older family members, some scholars have considered care provided by men (Fisher, 1994; Gerstel & Gallagher, 2001; Harris et al., 1998; Kaye & Applegate, 1994; Kramer & Thompson, 2002). When a married man is the only child, his role becomes essential; by default, he is expected to be a family’s primary caregiver (Campbell & Martin-Matthews, 2000; Lamanna & Riedmann, 1997). Under this circumstance, men do not always follow a ‘typical’ gendered life course pattern. Furthermore, when wives devote more time to helping their own parents, their husbands will likely to provide more care to their parents-in-law (Gerstel & Gallagher, 2001).

Applying the gendered life course perspective to the kinship system then allows us to explore which family members are most likely to provide care later in life. Both men and women normally provide care to their spouse when it is needed (Kasuga, 2003; Spitze & Ward, 2000; Stoller & Pugleisi, 1988). However, adult offspring may also
provide assistance (Connidis, 2010). North American and European research continues to show that daughters undertake more caregiving responsibilities than do sons (Laditka & Laditka, 2000; Martin-Matthews & Campbell, 1995; Masuy, 2011; Matthews, 2002; Mui, 1995). However, employment status and conditions alter gender’s impact on care provision. Masuy (2011) finds that employment does not deter adult offspring, especially daughters, from providing non-intensive parent care. Once intensive care is required, employed offspring’s direct involvement decreases in both gender groups. Still, although daughters may be discouraged from taking on the primary responsibility for elder care by heavy demands at work, the social expectation remains that they, rather than sons, will provide it (Gerstel & Gallagher, 1994). Nonetheless, as Sarkisian and Gerstel argue (2004), when sons and daughters share equal conditions of employment (i.e., job hours and earnings), the gap in care narrows significantly. Mathews (2002) found that when sons and daughters enjoy the same work status, their degree of responsibility remains relatively equal. Nevertheless, when parents require intensive care, daughters are most likely to be the care providers. In North America, married women assume more domestic responsibilities, including those of elder care, than do unmarried women who are in the labour force (Brody, 2004). The interplay of gender, marital status, and work conditions in degree of care involvement is considered and explored further in Chapter Four.

In contrast to Western culture, Taiwan exhibits a different pattern of gendered family elder care arrangements. One long-held family norm has been the practice of intergenerational care. In patriarchal Taiwan, parents give preferential status to their
male children from childhood to adulthood. In return for this ‘investment’, they expect that, in their old age, their sons will care for them (Lin et al., 2003; Tseng et al., 2007). However, after marriage it is often not the sons, but their wives who provide the care to the co-residing, dependent elderly relatives, a phenomenon Lan (2002:813) describes as ‘the gender transfer of filial care’ (Lan, 2002: 813), leaving the sons’ and their wives’ share of elder care to the sons’ parents unequal. This gender specific care arrangement exemplifies a household context of care network and results from another Taiwanese traditional family norm: ‘patrilocality’, a family system in which a married couple resides with or near the husband’s parents. Accordingly, this living arrangement leads to a particular gendered life course trajectory for daughters-in-law. One Chinese proverb says, “A married daughter is considered to be the water poured out”; therefore, she becomes part of her husband’s family, to which she transfers her filial responsibilities (Greenhalgh, 1985). The Taiwanese kinship norm has constructed an ideal daughter-in-law (Sung, 2003): Her loyalty to the family of her husband takes precedence over her loyalty to her parents. For women, marriage is a highly important life transition because they become directly involved with their parents-in-law. Daughters’ responsibilities to their parents typically cease at marriage (Lee et al., 1994; Sung, 2003). However, they may provide care to their own parents when sons are unavailable (Lee et al., 1994).

**Gendered Care Work**

In provision of parent care, the extent to which men and women are involved and the tasks they perform differ. Women are more likely to be involved in ‘body work’ that requires intimate physical contact, such as bathing and feeding, that men avoid because
it is often regarded as ‘women’s work’ (Twiggs, 2004). Men tend to perform tasks outside the house, such as yard work and home repairs (Campbell & Martin-Matthews, 2003; Martin-Matthews & Campbell, 1995). Coward (1987) finds women are much more likely than men to provide help with domestic chores. Martin-Matthews’ concept of ‘gendered space’ captures the social-spatial dimension of care: Men tend to perform the caring tasks in the ‘public’ spaces (spaces that are generally accessible by everyone in the household, such as the yard), whereas women are more likely to provide care within the ‘private’ spaces (spaces where intimate care is performed, such as bathroom or bedroom) (2007). Whether these findings regarding the gendered practice of elder care in the Western context applies to Taiwan is explored further in Chapter Four.

2.2.2. Ambivalence and family relationships

*Intergenerational Relationships*

While the Confucius norm of filial piety prescribes a cultural ideal of intergenerational living and care arrangement throughout the family life course, to what extent do Taiwanese adults fulfill this ideal today? When living in contradictory life domains, adults often experience conflict, making the cultural ideal of intergenerational family-life trajectory problematic. The Confucius norm of filial care does not address the enormous complexity that exists in modern Taiwanese families; an alternative perspective is, therefore, needed in order to gain a proper understanding of family elder care situations. The concept of ambivalence provides a more complex understanding of intergenerational relationships over the family life course by exposing the contradictions that characterize the experiences of individuals who are part of those relationships.
By underscoring the co-existence of family harmony and conflict instead of treating one or the other as an overarching feature of intergenerational relationships, ambivalence helps us to recognize the ‘ideal-reality gap’ in filial care, that is, the discrepancy between the ideal care situation and the actual care arrangement. To uncover this gap, we must understand how ambivalence occurs and characterizes people’s experience in the context of filial care.

Connidis and McMullin (2002) provide one of the most influential explanations of how individuals experience ambivalence over the life course. Based on themes from critical theory, such as the influence of structured social relations (e.g., class, gender, age, race and ethnicity), individuals attempt to exercise agency in the context of negotiating social life and the conflicting interests embedded in the social structure. They propose ‘sociological ambivalence’ to show that the contradictions individuals experience in relationships across the life course are not merely a micro-level phenomenon, but must be understood from both macro- and meso-level contexts. Feelings of contradiction (micro) occur when social structures (macro), like gender relations, are made manifest in colliding social institutions such as paid work and family life (meso). ‘Sociological ambivalence’ reminds us that the pattern of individual life paths, for example, how one navigates choices in contradictory life domains, cannot be separated from larger social structural forces. When individuals encounter contradictions while interacting with their family members, for instance, adult children interacting with their parents, ‘intergenerational ambivalence’ (Connidis, 2010:140)
results. This type of ambivalence emerges at both the psychological (subjective sentiments) and sociological (institutional resources and requirements) levels, suggesting that contradiction is not only an individual experience, but also transpires in family life because individuals are connected to one another, to social institutions and to the realities of structured social relations across the life course. Both ‘sociological’ and ‘intergenerational’ ambivalence address the experiences of individuals and their relationships in broader social, cultural and economic conditions and various social domains. This multi-level approach is applied in this thesis to explore the following: which family members are more likely to experience the impact of contradictory demands or norms when elderly relatives require care later in life? How do they experience it? When ambivalence is experienced, how do people respond to and resolve it over time?

Work-family conflict is a manifestation of ‘sociological ambivalence’. A sizeable body of Western research has examined whether gender differences exist in levels of strain between married partners when they both participate in paid work outside the home (Blanchard-Fields et al., 1997; Dilworth, 2004; Eagle et al., 1997). Although these studies do not find significant gender differences, they observe strain or stressors that men and women experienced when attempting to fulfill the demands in both domains.

Strain or stressors are the outcome of experiencing ‘sociological ambivalence’. People feel strained or stressed because of competing demands from contradictory life domains. The lack of significant gender differences in levels of work-family strain suggest that, today, married couples share the burden of life’s competing demands
more equally than before. While this may be a sign of a more egalitarian gender relation in Western societies (Presser, 1994), one cannot overlook a major transition in the workforce. Dual-earner families have become the norm, which has in turn altered the traditional structured gender relation. Today, men are often not the only family breadwinner, and women do not necessarily stay in the private sphere. Paid employment increases women’s socio-economic position which allows them to negotiate the household division of labour and family responsibilities with their spouses (Stier, 2000) in order to reduce their levels of life conflict. Whether this type of gender relation applies to Taiwanese married couples must be considered. Are women, especially after marriage, more likely than men to experience the effect of ‘sociological ambivalence’ as a result of the traditional gendered care arrangement in combination with the economic demand of paid work? My consideration of gender relations and ambivalence seeks to connect work and the family life course to the cultural norm of filial care, in the micro context of individual choice (i.e., the exercise of human agency), the macro context of structured social relations, and the meso-level context of kinship ties as family members attempt to negotiate their responsibilities with one another.

In Taiwan, female labour participation for those aged 15 and over (see Figure 2.1) grew from 39% in 1978 to almost 50% in 2008 (Directorate-General of Budget, Accounting and Statistics, 2012), and women there, as elsewhere, now enjoy greater educational opportunities (Kung & Yi, 2001; Tsai et al., 1994) which are likely to increase their likelihood of taking employment outside the home. As a consequence, the traditional life course trajectory in which women raise children and serve their parents-
in-law after marriage cannot adequately characterize the life transitions of many Taiwanese daughters-in-law. While many daughters-in-law continue to live with their parents-in-law, not all of them may be able or willing to fulfill their caregiving role due to the changing gender relations.

**Figure 2.1: Female Labour Force Participation Rate (Aged 15 and Older)**

![Female Labour Force Participation Rate (Aged 15 and Older) in Taiwan](image)

Source: Directorate-General of Budget, Accounting and Statistics, Executive Yuan, Taiwan

The rising cost of living in Taiwan has increased women’s likelihood of entering the workforce, making the dual-earner family the norm. Macro-level changes in workforce composition and patriarchal gender roles may potentially lead some daughters-in-law to experience ‘sociological ambivalence’: In the context of changing gender relations, women’s enhanced socio-economic status may grant them greater independence that clashes with traditional expectations of fulfilling the needs of their in-law (including care) after marriage. They must re-negotiate their traditional caregiving roles as they engage less in family care and unpaid domestic work and more in paid work outside the
home. For women to resolve sociological ambivalence requires fundamental changes not only in their gender-scripted practices, but also in the gendered nature of their relationships. This thesis shares the view of Connidis and McMullin (2002) that institutional arrangements may shape women’s life course trajectories, but that women may nonetheless exercise human agency to alter how they experience structured gender relations.

Taiwanese women attempt to resolve or reduce ‘sociological ambivalence’ through a process of negotiation and reconciliation. Their structured social relations will shape both the options available and their ability to access these options. Lan (2000) adopted Kandiyoti’s (1988) concept of ‘bargaining with patriarchy’ to show that middle-class Taiwanese women resort to market forces by hiring female migrant workers to take on some of their domestic responsibilities, as a way of negotiating gender relations. Lan (2002) describes this phenomenon as a ‘market transfer’, a process in which Taiwanese daughters-in-law hire waged caregivers as a way of subcontracting their filial duty to their spouses’ parents.

The concept of ambivalence enhances the life course principle of linked lives because the contradictory demands of work and family care inevitably affect those involved (Krüger & Baldus, 1999; Moen & Hernandez, 2009; Settersten, 2003). On the surface, subcontracting filial piety may appear to be a personal decision, but in fact, care arrangements are negotiated in the family context (Wolf et al., 1997). In many cases, the married son and his wife employ ‘adaptive strategies’ to negotiate a mutually acceptable balance of work and family care (Moen, 2003:245; Moen & Hernandez,
2009:273; Moen & Wethington, 1992). As couples work out adaptive strategies, they establish a new type of ‘work/care regime’ (Pocock, 2005) in which they redefine their care responsibilities. These family care providers’ changing needs may involve hiring a paid care worker, creating a dynamic, adaptive system capable of meeting the care recipient’s changing needs and responding to the caregiver’s changing capacities (Brewer, 2002).

The consideration of ambivalence and linked lives alerts us to the ever-changing nature of family care. Understanding elder care as a process that involves multiple linked relationships connects the life course trajectories of multiple family members, whose lives intersect during the transitions involved in providing care. The resulting arrangements may be interrupted when needs or circumstances prompt changes in the care network’s configuration (Ingersoll-Dayton et al., 2003), leading to further care transitions. This thesis explores this process in Taiwanese families.

Ambivalence in family relationships also constitutes an important dimension of family elder care situations in Taiwan. Contradictory relationships between parents and adult offspring can, in fact, impact how care is provided when it is required. For example, a son may feel committed to caring for his parents, while at the same time deeming the provision of care too demanding and undesirable. ‘Intergenerational ambivalence’ uncovers such contradictory feelings experienced in family relationships through attention to conflicting norms and roles that are embedded in structured social relations (Curran, 2002; Lüscher & Pillemer, 1998; Willson et al., 2004). To understand how contradictory feelings occur and whether they intensify over time prompts
attention to the often unrecognized, problematic challenges of ‘family’. Critical feminists, in particular, have seen family as a contested site of sociological inquiry. They portray it as an ideologically-driven social institution that continues to reproduce “normative’ structured social relations by socializing individuals with entrenched cultural ideals, values, beliefs and practice (Wood, 2006). They also question the persistent gender pattern in which many women continue to assume the primary caregiving responsibility for their dependent family members, such as children, parents or parents-in-laws even after they join the labour force (Oakley, 2002; Steil, 1997).

The early feminist community identified dominant gender ideology as problematic (Baca Zinn, 1990; Ferre, 1990; Osmond & Thorne, 1990). These scholars challenged the idea that family interests are always consensual, arguing that economic and political structures can cause some family members to have differing interests and values. Age, gender and class create differing power relations among individual members of the family. Hence, Connidis and Walker (2009) remind us that we must pay attention to multiple perspectives and voices within families in order to capture complex and diverse family relationships across time. To do so, the application of the life course perspective alone is insufficient, and the simultaneous consideration of the critical and feminist perspectives is necessary, highlighted by the concept of ambivalence. This combined approach allows us to see how the prevailing social structure and patriarchal gender relations produce contradictory family ties, and to examine how social actors negotiate power relations and contradictory life domains as embedded in social institutions and social interaction.
By taking a critical feminist approach, this thesis examines whether intergenerational ambivalence occurs in the Taiwanese context of parent care. Over the family life course, intergenerational bonds do not remain static, but are subject to change (Rossi & Rossi, 1990). In Taiwan, the asymmetrical domestic power relationship between mother-in-law and daughter-in-law often accounts for their interpersonal conflict (Tseng et al., 2007); this can discourage adult offspring’s continued cohabitation with elderly parents (Asis et al., 1995; Lee et al., 1995). Family and education backgrounds may differ widely between mothers-and daughters-in-law and can cause mismatched expectations (Gallin, 1986; Lin, 2005; Sandel, 2004). For instance, mothers-and daughters-in-law may have a different cultural perception of gendered relations that may discourage daughters-in-law from providing care to their in-laws later in life.

Assessing sources of intergenerational ambivalence, the impact of ambivalence on family ties over time, and the negotiation of ambivalence by family members as they arrange the living and subsequent care arrangements of family elders are explored in Chapter Four.

**Intragenerational Relationships**

Parent care also involves intragenerational ties. Exploring how siblings develop a support network and share their filial responsibility over the family-life trajectory (Connidis, 1992; Connidis & Kemp, 2008; Ingersoll-Dayton et al., 2003; Matthews, 1987, 2002; Matthews & Heidorn, 1998; Mathews & Rosner, 1988) connects the meso and micro contexts of elder care. The provision of care creates complex webs of interlinked lives, including those of siblings, spouses and children (Matthews, 2002; Mathews &
Heidorn, 1998). This is what I define as the family context of care network, which must be distinguished from that in the household context where the son and daughter-in-law negotiate the share of the care work. In the past, the contributions of non-primary family caregivers were not sufficiently recognized, preventing researchers from observing and studying how care networks varied. Considering siblings as part of a care network involves shifting the focus of analysis from a single primary caregiver to multiple caregivers. Elder care research must therefore extend beyond the caregiving dyad (Dilworth-Anderson et al., 1999; Horowitz, 1992; Keith, 1995). When siblings are considered part of the care network, a significant topic of study is how caregiving responsibilities are divided (Wolf et al., 1997:102).

Sibling negotiations of care typically occur during care transitions and generally result in the mobilization of financial and human resources. Such transitions may be turning points for some, but not necessarily all families (Kane et al., 1999). Families’ ability to respond to the needs of their frail elders varies by network size and the gender composition of sibships (Himes et al., 1996). Negotiation processes regarding the division of filial responsibilities among family members vary and may take the form of explicit, overt discussions or less direct, implicit forms of communication (Connidis & Kemp, 2008).

How do negotiations in care shape siblings’ relationship over time? Connidis (1992) concludes that sibling relationships tend to be rekindled and strengthened by their parents’ need for care. Likewise, Matthews (2002) observes that siblings’ ties to original family members tend to become tighter when parents are old. Parents’ need for care
often strengthens or reinforces pre-existing sibling ties, creating a noticeable transition in family relationship. However, conflict can also occur in the context of joint parental care (Ingersoll et al., 2003; Kwak et al., 2012; Strawbridge & Wallhagen, 1991). When family care arrangements are not negotiated to the satisfaction of all participants, family conflict often results (Keith, 1995). Most commonly, when one family member provides parents more support than the others, his or her perception of inequity and lack of filial responsibility on the part of his or her siblings may result in conflict that can damage sibling ties and compromise care quality (Merrill, 1997; Suitor & Pillemer, 1996). Like intergenerational ties, intragenerational relationships are also marked by contradiction and ambivalence as siblings negotiate competing demands and claims based on their position in the social structure, such as gender relations.

Matthews (1987) finds that siblings’ feelings about one another influence how they evaluate the fairness of each other’s care contribution. Here, the concept of ‘distributive justice’ is analytically useful: How siblings view their relationships with one another shapes their definition of fairness of the division of responsibility each assumes (Connidis & Kemp, 2008; Matthews, 1987; 2002; Suitor & Pillemer, 1996). When relationships are antagonistic to begin with, siblings who are providing elder care may regard even a relatively proportionate contribution as unfair. On the other hand, siblings who are close are motivated to maintain good relationships with each other, leading them to regard disproportionate contributions as fair by deeming circumstances such as geographic distances, employment demands, financial difficulties and other competing family commitments as socially acceptable reasons for not offering more help. Finding
such justification is described by Finch (1989) as ‘legitimate excuses’. Therefore, the concept of ambivalence, despite its primary application to intergenerational relationships, is also useful for studying how both intragenerational solidarity and conflict arise (Bedford & Avioli, 2012) during siblings’ negotiations of their care responsibilities. Ambivalence theory contributes to the revelation of enormous complexity in family relationships which the life course perspective alone cannot fully capture (Connidis, 2010; 2012).

Gender also factors into intragenerational negotiation processes, as can be observed in siblings’ approaches to meeting their parents’ needs. Terming these approaches 'participation styles', Matthews and Rosner (1988) find that in American families, sisters are more likely than brothers to make collective efforts to help parents by consulting with all the siblings prior to providing care. Sisters are more proactive, whereas brothers are reactive to their parents’ needs and less likely to perceive the need for seeking support from other siblings (Matthews, 2002). When the elder is frail and needs assistance with routine daily tasks, sisters tend to mobilize other family members, whereas brothers generally prefer to independently meet their parents’ needs; only if a crisis occurs do they mobilize other siblings’ help in the form of financial, physical, and/or material assistance.

In patriarchal Taiwan, sons assume the primary caregiving responsibility for their parents. However, whether they take a lead in negotiating the care responsibility with other siblings or whether daughters choose to get involved requires empirical attention. By considering gender, a sibling network’s size and its gender composition, this thesis
examines how care negotiations and ‘participation styles’ vary among families with both son(s) and daughter(s). Essential to this inquiry is studying how family history, particularly the process of fen jia (the subdivisions of the kinship system into smaller family units over the Taiwanese family life course) leads to different elder care arrangements later in life. I examine variations across the life course by examining whether siblings’ caregiving roles change and the factors that lead to care transitions (Ingersoll-Dayton et al., 2003). How siblings perceive the quality of their relationship over time is likely to affect how they collaborate and participate in care for their frail elderly relatives. The above inquiries are used to construct the family caregiving trajectory which involves the intersection of the multiple life courses.

Although a parent’s need for care may prompt the initial negotiation between siblings, the process of caregiving is ongoing. In some families, adult offspring must re-negotiate their share of care due to changes that occur in parents’ and siblings’ lives (Connidis & Kemp, 2008). In order to understand the relationship between changing care arrangements and the intersection of multiple life courses, Kahn and Antonucci (1980) developed the convoy model of social support. The convoy model posits that, over time, the composition of the convoy, or “network of persons to whom an individual is connected by the giving or receiving of support” (Connidis, 2010:155), changes. For instance, at marriage, a daughter-in-law joins an elder’s support network and provides care when required; or a son has employment that causes him to live apart from his parents and leads other family members to provide care during his absence. This thesis considers whether adult children’s involvement and engagement in care changes over
time, factors related to such changes and consequences for caregiving relationships with elders who require ongoing assistance.

2.3 Social Welfare System and Elder Care Policies

So far my thesis’s conceptual framework has focused on the issue of care arrangements, inter- and intragenerational relationships and negotiations of care responsibilities, and the importance of gender in how these relationships are constructed. How families come to hire a foreign live-in caregiver and how this growing demand continues to drive the migration of care labour requires a consideration of another macro-level factor more closely. The hiring of foreign care workers must be placed in the context of Taiwan’s social welfare system.

2.3.1 Conceptualization of the welfare state

Generally, the degree of public support for family care needs depends on how comprehensive a country’s welfare regime is. In East Asia, where state-funded care services are often limited, families remain their elders’ primary care provider. Taiwan’s welfare system shares the characteristics of those of other East Asian countries (Lee & Ku, 2007). Macro-level changes in Taiwan’s economic and social development have created challenges to providing in-home filial care for many families. I now explore how the social policies of Taiwan’s government lead some families to hire others to care for the elders.

Examining how a welfare system affects family care practices first requires the understanding of ‘welfare.’ Marshall (1998:701) defines welfare as “the state or
condition of doing or being well”. Policy initiatives are often required to satisfy differing social groups’ needs that go beyond that of mere survival to include attainment of “a reasonable or adequate life within the society” (Marshall 1998: 701). Briggs (2000:18) explains ‘welfare’ as something “in which organized power is deliberately used (through politics and administration) in an effort to modify the play of market forces”. In the context of governance, the welfare state takes responsibility for minimizing the free market’s negative impact on its citizens’ well-being.

In relation to market forces, Therborn (1987) noted how class and citizenship also shape welfare state development. In this formula, ‘class’ represents a social stratification system that benefits certain socio-economic groups while disadvantaging others, and citizenship is the institution that grants individuals, regardless of their social-class position, equal access to societal resources. Thus, the welfare state represents a dialectical relationship between class and citizenship, constantly mediated through its redistributive and reforming forces, of which politics and political institutions are key factors (Myles & Quadagno, 2002).

Esping-Andersen (1990) created a threefold typology of the liberal, the corporatist and the social democratic welfare state, which are widely used today. The 'liberal' welfare state's intervention in individual lives is minimal. It expects self-reliance and grants minimal public assistance according to means-tested programs, where only those qualifying as needy (e.g., low-income individuals) receive social benefits. The liberal welfare state focuses on allocative efficiency and individual responsibility rather than on equity and collective responsibility; the social protection of individual citizens is typically
seen as unfavourable to state economic growth. Similarly, the ‘corporatist’ welfare state allocates benefits to individuals based on earnings, thus preserving social status differentials. Rights are determined according to one’s class position (Esping-Anderson, 1990). The family is the primary welfare provider, and the state does not become involved until families exhaust all means of providing assistance. Like the liberal regime, the corporatist welfare state allots public assistance selectively based on pre-specified criteria. Individuals must assume differing levels of social risks that the welfare state does not ameliorate.

By contrast, the ‘social democratic’ welfare state adopts a universalist position and treats social welfare as a fundamental right. It thus implies a ‘social citizenship’ (Marshall, 1950) that emphasizes individuals’ rights and entitlements to state-provided social services and benefits. The state aims to maximize its citizens’ economic security by reducing free-market caused risks that cause class inequalities.

Esping-Anderson (1990) argues that in reality these three types of are more ideal than actual. Thus, a country can have more than one regime type; in fact it can have one that hybridizes the several ideal types (Arts & Gelissen, 2002). Hence, it may be more appropriate to situate the welfare state along a continuum instead of assuming discrete socio-political categories. However, a typological analysis of welfare regimes remains useful because it reveals the underlying philosophy which influences a country’s development and delivery of welfare policies.

Scholars who respond to Esping-Anderson’s typology believe that a ‘productivist-oriented’ welfare regime better characterizes East Asia, where state policies are
typically concerned with economic and industrial development (Gough, 2001; Holliday, 2005; Kwon, 2005; Lee & Ku, 2007). Holliday (2000, 2005) argues that East Asian states subordinate welfare policies to national economic growth, regarding these as facilitating forces for achieving various economic objectives. For Holliday, this approach is a form of ‘productivist welfare capitalism’, where social policies are highly selective and associated with pre-determined economic goals. Similarly, Lee (2007:3) describes this approach as geared towards producing ‘developmental social welfare’, that is, economic growth that generates state revenue and in turn permits the expansion of welfare services.

Titmuss considers social policies the direct result of specific state priorities (1974). Economic recession and a changing population age structure can modify the structure of a country’s welfare system (Kim, 2005; Ku, 1998; Lee, 2007:55; Weyland, 2002). In the most economically advanced East Asian countries, the care needs of an increasingly elderly population demand a more active welfare state. Both the economic downturn during the 1997 Asian financial crisis and continuous population aging pose challenges for national welfare services, but states intending to meet their political and economic objectives must consider competing economic demands. Alongside the influence of the ideology of ‘productivism,’ Confucianism also encourages minimal state intervention and investment in social welfare (Goodman & Peng, 1996; Goodman et al., 1998; Jones, 1990, 1993; Lee & Ku, 2007; Sung, 2003; Walker & Wong, 2005). The ‘Confucian welfare state’ emphasizes reliance on non-state actors, namely family, community and firms.
The Confucian ideal of filial piety thus accounts, at least in part, for East Asia’s delayed development of welfare for its elders.

East Asian welfares are the product of unique historical developments and differ significantly from those of the West (Aspalter, 2005; Jacobs, 2000; Jones, 1993; Holliday, 2000; Gough, 2002). These welfare states of Taiwan, Japan, Singapore and South Korea, are often labeled as ‘familistic’ (Walker & Wong 2005), meaning that the state grants the elderly limited public support, because the family is considered the primary welfare provider. However, despite the claim that social development still lags behind economic growth (Chen, 2008), there is evidence of a trend towards enhancing social welfare services in these regions (Kim, 2005; Lee, 2007; Lin, 2000; Peng, 2002, 2004; Walker & Wong, 2005; Wong, 2004). The assumption that East Asian welfare state development is minimal must be re-assessed. Despite East Asian states’ increased efforts to enhance the well-being of vulnerable social groups, such as seniors, the dominant force of economic globalization continues to impact their social policy development (McDaniel, 2009; Peng & Wong, 2010). Balancing the contradictory demands of maintaining economic competitiveness and responding to the needs of increasing aging population is, now, a challenge faced by most well-developed East Asian countries. Observing the macro-meso link between welfare states and care regimes in aging societies (McDaniel, 2010) inspires this thesis to explore how Taiwan’s welfare system evolves to meet the growing needs of its elderly population.
2.3.2 The historical development of Taiwan's welfare state

In 1949, the Chinese Communists defeated Chiang Kai-shek’s Nationalist (Kuomintang [KMT]) army on the Chinese mainland. After the civil war, Chiang and his followers retreated to Taiwan, where the conservative authoritarian KMT regime ruled for many decades and provided centralized power and social order. The KMT established welfare insurance policies in several sectors: Labour Insurance for those in factories and mines, the Craft Workers' Insurance Program and Fishermen's Insurance. All three began before 1950, and were regulated under the 1958 Labour Insurance Act (LIA). The LIA was amended several times to provide insurance to more sectors and to provide pension plan benefits, better protection and more generous health care (Council of Labour Affairs, Executive Yuan 2010). That same year, Employment Insurance (EI) provided public servants with health benefits. In 1965, the EI included pension plans and in 1980, EI extended coverage to the military, public and private school teachers and civil servants. In 1988, the Farmer’s Health Insurance Act insured farmers. Although the state gradually extended welfare benefits to different groups of workers, the whole system remained selective about who could receive benefits and how much coverage one could claim until 1995 when the first universal welfare policy, the National Health Insurance Program (NHIP), extended medical benefits to all citizens, regardless of their employment type and status.

In 2000, the Democratic Progressive Party (DPP) was elected and introduced a universal National Pension System that year. In 2007, the National Pension Act extended coverage to those not registered in the plans already provided to the military, state
employees, teachers and labourers. The NPS eliminated the country’s former pension system gaps, providing all retired workers with greater social and economic protection and stability. The Bureau of Labour Insurance (2009) introduced a Funeral Expenses Grant as well as three important NPS pensions: Old Age (every citizen aged 65 and above is eligible for Old Age Pension), Disability, and Survivors’ (spousal) benefits. Further, the NPS incorporated two previous allowance programs for old-age citizens and indigenous peoples. Thus, the NPS became a relatively comprehensive welfare program replacing previously fragmented social policies. While its intention was to emulate social democratic welfare systems such as those existing in the West, criticism remains regarding its ability to be financially sustainable for the long term (Zhan & Lin, 2009).

Although the Taiwanese state provides social security programs for various occupational groups, and for the elderly (Riley et al., 1994), there remains a structural lag in the development of welfare services. Until the 1980s, the state did not recognize and address the growing needs of the elderly. The purpose of the 1980 Senior Citizens Welfare Act was to “assert the dignity and health, to maintain the standard of living, to protect the rights and to facilitate the welfare of elders” (Department of Social Affairs, Ministry of Interior, 2011). It established specific policies designed to ensure the financial security, health protection and adequate provision of care for seniors. Only low- to mid-income citizens aged seventy and above qualified for a public living allowance and some free and subsidized health care (Chen, 2008).

Early seniors-related welfare policies suffered from a rhetorical-reality gap: a means test strictly regulated eligibility for public assistance (Xu, 1993). None of the other social
programs (LIA and EI) provided for those who were disqualified and, thus, remained financially vulnerable, dependent on support from their families. In 1997, the government responded to public concern about a lack of universal coverage and effective policy delivery, and amended the act to improve seniors’ welfare services delivery (Chou, 2000). Notable policy revisions included:

1. Redefinition of “senior” from a citizen aged 70 to one aged 65
2. Provision of universal welfare delivery, regardless of income status
3. Better regulation of welfare organizations, including nursing homes
4. Promotion, via partnership with non-state organizations, of home care services
5. Measures for meeting the economic needs of the elderly, including a living allowance, care benefits and pension schemes
6. Improved regulation of organizations or individual care providers caring for seniors and dependent elders, with penalties assessed to those failing to provide the necessary quality of care

For seniors, these revisions were an important milestone in Taiwan’s history of welfare policies, but to date, these state services are primarily provided in the form of national health care and pension benefits. More recently, the state offered families in dire need limited, partially subsidized elder care services (Tsai, 2009). Nonetheless, the lack of a national long-term elder care program forces some families to find other means to provide for dependent elders’ needs.

Inadequate state support of the elderly is due to the state’s assumption that care should be an individual or a familial responsibility (Chan, 2005; Chen, 2008). Premier Siew’s speech at the National Conference of Social Welfare in 1998 reflects this view of Taiwan’s pro-family welfare ideology and political discourse. Describing the family as the irreplaceable, essential pillar of society, he encouraged the public to show greater concern for the institution of the family, and directed the Department of Social Affairs
to create a family-centred service model that would reinforce family as the basic unit of social welfare provision while integrating social assistance, social welfare and community mutual help (Walker & Wong, 2005:160). One resulting government policy document captures this strategy of minimizing the cost of social assistance by imposing responsibility for welfare on individual families:

Being cared for at home is an ideal model in accord with our culture, and also the ideal way the elderly think. Thus, it is the government’s task to assist families to revitalize care function. The one and only way to realize home care is to help families to clear the possible barrier of caring for senior citizens. Therefore, it is of great urgency to establish resources supporting systems in order to realize the home care model. (‘A Review of the Elderly Policy in Taiwan,’ Department of Social Affairs, Ministry of Interior 2000, cited in Chen 2008:187)

As the Taiwanese state cultivates family-oriented elder care, the cultural norm of filial piety finds expression and reinforcement in the political arena. The state’s role remains limited compared with that of the family. The current welfare regime thus forces families to assume and manage social and economic costs, while ensuring elder care is provided. Taiwan’s pro-family welfare ideology has therefore produced another rhetoric-reality gap. Family-provided care remains an ideal but is problematic for some families, especially given that Taiwanese society has experienced and continues to witness such macro-level social changes as increased female labour force participation and changes in household structures.

To respond to growing care needs, Taiwan’s government provides families with ‘alternative elder care arrangements’ (abbreviated AECA). In 2000, the government began to fund short-term ‘respite care’ (Tsai, 2009), entailing a wide range of services provided by municipal public health bureaus. This reform sought to provide temporary
relief to families caring for their dependent members, and to prevent family caregivers from becoming future care recipients (Tainan City Government, 2011). Families could request in-home care performed by a trained care worker for up to six hours per day for physical assistance (e.g., bathing and feeding), domestic help (e.g., meal preparation and household cleaning), and recreational and emotional support. Institutional care also became available; dependent elders could be provided constant care in state-contracted nursing homes for a short period of time. In addition, day care service became available at certain nursing care facilities. At this stage local governments also began to provide disabled elders transportation between private residences and hospitals (Tainan City Government, 2011).

The amount of state-subsidized care made available depends on a household’s total income, ranging between full to 70% coverage depending upon income bracket. Tsai (2009) notes that the state prioritizes both in-home and community care, since its objective is to support ‘aging in place’ (Wu & Chuang, 2001). Its policies discourage elders from being inappropriately placed in institutions and isolated from society. The terminally-ill unable to receive adequate care in a home setting can access long-term, medically equipped care facilities.

Despite the availability of state-funded AECA, few Taiwanese families utilize them. Table 2.3 provides caregiver data categorized by the age and sex of the dependent elder. Forms of respite care are used by 3.8% of families, primarily in the form of in-

---

1 Dependent elders, as defined by Taiwan’s Department of Statistics (2009), are people aged 65 years and above who must rely on others to carry on daily activities.
home care (0.5%) and institutional/day care (3.3%). However, respite care, especially in-home care, provides only temporary relief to family caregivers of elderly relatives. For seniors experiencing chronic illness or permanent disability and requiring constant and prolonged extensive care, AECA is insufficient. That is why some families opt for paid in-home, around-the-clock care. The influence of the Confucian ideal of filial piety causes many to regard the home as an ideal place for care (Chen, 2008). Since Taiwan’s government does not subsidize private care, it is a choice available only for families who can afford it. Thus, family-provided care is the norm at 66.7%, respite care is used by only 3.8%, and private in-home care is adopted by 16.6%.

Of the latter, 3.8% of the families hire a care worker who is Taiwanese, while 12.8% employ one who is foreign (see Table 2.3); the long-term cost difference explains this preference. The standard contract is for 24-hour care. Since average family monthly income is approximately US $ 2,500, the typical monthly US $2000 salary for a certified Taiwanese care worker is simply unaffordable for most families. There has thus been increasing demand for a cheaper international source of live-in care workers (Chuang et al., 2007).
Table 2.3: Primary Caregiver for Dependent Elders 65 Years and Older, by Sex and Age of Elderly (%) Taiwan, June 2009

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>65-69</th>
<th>70-74</th>
<th>75-79</th>
<th>80+</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Family</td>
<td>66.7</td>
<td>63.1</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>66.8</td>
<td>71.5</td>
<td>66.2</td>
<td>63.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spouse/common-law</td>
<td>14.2</td>
<td>25.4</td>
<td>8.9</td>
<td>24.5</td>
<td>21.3</td>
<td>14.7</td>
<td>5.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daughter</td>
<td>11.3</td>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>13.6</td>
<td>6.6</td>
<td>11.6</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Son</td>
<td>22.3</td>
<td>18.8</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>18.2</td>
<td>24.2</td>
<td>18.2</td>
<td>25.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daughter-in-law</td>
<td>14.6</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>16.8</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>10.8</td>
<td>18.7</td>
<td>15.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Son-in-law</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>0.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brother/Sister</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mother</td>
<td>0.4</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grandchild</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>4.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relative</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>0.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neighbour</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>0.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Friend</td>
<td>0.4</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>0.4</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>0.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Respite Care</td>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>7.8</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>5.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Home care assistant</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>0.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nursing home assistant</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>5.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private in-home care</td>
<td>16.6</td>
<td>16.2</td>
<td>16.8</td>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>9.8</td>
<td>12.8</td>
<td>25.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taiwanese care worker</td>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>5.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreign care worker</td>
<td>12.8</td>
<td>11.6</td>
<td>13.4</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>11.9</td>
<td>20.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Themselves</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12.6</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>19.1</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td>4.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>total</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: The 2009 Senior Citizen Condition Survey, Ministry of Interior, Department of Statistics

In response, the government in 1992 initiated the foreign live-in caregiver program. It resembles that of Singapore (Yeoh & Huang, 2010) and allows families to purchase care services by migrant workers (Lan, 2003a, 2003b; Loveband, 2004). The state does not provide additional support to families requiring care and sets no minimum income requirement for a family to hire a foreign care worker, but it does impose specific eligibility criteria based on family need (Lan, 2003b). According to the Employment
Service Act, Article 12-1, families with dependent elders who wish to employ foreign live-in caregivers must make an application through the Council of Labour Affairs:

An employer who intends to hire a foreign live-in caregiver must ensure that the health condition of his/her elderly family member qualifies for twenty-four hour of care which is determined by the designated medical team. Once qualified, the employer must advertise the caregiver position to local people while the Long-term Care Administration Center (LTAC) reviews the application. After the unsuccessful local recruitment, LTCAC makes a recommendation to the Council of Labour Affairs with regards to the employment of a foreign live-in caregiver (Council of Labour Affairs, Executive Yuan, Taiwan 2008).

Employing a foreign carer can encounter several obstacles. Families must comply with a series of bureaucratic procedures. A medical examination is necessary to establish that fulltime care is unnecessary and can delay the process. If officials determine that a claimed need for full-time care is unnecessary, the application can be rejected. This formal process of recruitment is summarized in Figure 2.2.

**Figure 2.2: The Process of Employing a Foreign Live-in Care Worker in Taiwan**

1. The person who needs care requires medical examination
2. Need for 24-hour care
   - Evaluation by long-term care management center
     - Successful recommendation
     - Submitting information to CLA
     - Hiring a foreign live-in care worker
   - No need for 24-hour care
     - Application rejection
     - Unsuccessful recommendation
     - Hiring a Taiwanese care worker
     - Submitting information to CLA
By February 2013, there were over 193,000 registered foreign domestic care workers in Taiwan. Women from Indonesia comprise the vast majority of this population (81.72%), followed by those from the Philippines (11.03%), Vietnam (6.85%) and Thailand (0.40%) (Bureau of Employment and Vocational Training, 2012) (see Table 2.4). The Council of Labour Affairs (hereafter CLA) termed domestic care workers as ‘social welfare foreign workers,’ a category that also includes nursing home care workers who provide care in an institutional setting and domestic helpers who mainly perform child care and household chores in private homes² (see Figure 2.3).

Table 2.4: Number and Percent of Foreign Domestic Care Workers by Country of Origin (by February, 2013)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Indonesia</th>
<th>The Philippines</th>
<th>Vietnam</th>
<th>Thailand</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>193,270</td>
<td>157,947</td>
<td>21,321</td>
<td>13,242</td>
<td>760</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(100%)</td>
<td>(81.72%)</td>
<td>(11.03%)</td>
<td>(6.85%)</td>
<td>(0.40%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

² According to the CLA (2010), employing a domestic helper requires the following point-based qualification:
(1). Have multiparous children of triplets and/or above, and under the age of three.
(2). Have accumulated over sixteen points.
The number of points is granted based on the age and the number of young children in the household. The younger the child is, the higher point each household receives.
2.4 The Role of Class Relations

Class is another important macro factor that will enhance the life course study of Taiwanese family elder care situations. First, it shapes our understanding of why a particular care arrangement is adopted. Second, it conditions the growing trend towards the importation of foreign care workers and the global phenomenon of unskilled, temporary labour migration. I now discuss these topics as viewed through the lens of class relations by using the multilevel of analysis.

2.4.1 Class as a social divide

Like many other capitalist societies, Taiwan is stratified according to class. For families requiring elder care, a class division occurs between those able to employ a foreign live-in caregiver and those unable to do so. Although class is not the only
deciding factor, it determines which type of paid care arrangement a given family can afford. The most relevant approach to conceptualizing individuals’ or families’ class standing in this case is Weber’s ‘means of consumption’ (Whimster, 2004), rather than Marx's ‘means of production’. In regards to the capacity to choose a particular care arrangement, income, rather than relationship to the means of production, is the most relevant measure of class for this study. For example, kin members in a better higher social class position are more likely to provide monetary support than those in a lower one (Matthews, 2002).

Aside from the lack of comprehensive publicly-provided elder care, the scarcity of Taiwanese citizens willing to accept low wages in exchange for performing care work is another key factor driving public demand for inexpensive foreign care workers. Table 2.5 reveals both a steady increase in this type of worker and in the demand for them (by 34.97% between 2004 and 2012). This has led to a class-based hierarchical structure in the labour market that is described by the dual or segmented labour market theory (Bulow & Summers, 1986; Dickens & Lang, 1988; McDonald & Solow, 1985). The labour market is divided into a primary high wage sector characterized by good working conditions, secure employment, career advancement and a high return for human capital investment such as education, and a secondary sector, where insecurity, poor returns, and exploitative working environments are common. Into the latter fall such domestic services as house work and caring for the ill, elderly and young. Until recently, only obasans – early-old-aged, less educated, unskilled local women – were employed in this traditional gender-specific niche. However, the cohort of younger Taiwanese
women, whose socio-economic status has increased, now tends to discount a career in domestic service (Lan, 2006). Thus, as Taiwan continues to experience a shortage of such labour, foreign workers have become an importance source of replacement. Their presence in Taiwan has led to the stratification of the labour market even within the 'secondary' sector which is further reinforced by differential ethnicity and citizenship status. This tendency is crystallized in and reinforced by the officially used term *wailao*, which applies only to unskilled foreign workers in fisheries, manufacturing, construction and domestic service industries. Its use entrenches the class boundary that socially divides Taiwanese-born and lower paid, foreign workers, a stratification that emerges at the very beginning of the labour migration process.

**Table 2.5: Foreign Live-in Elder Care Workers: Annual Totals and Percentage Changes**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Yearly Percent change</th>
<th>Percent change 2004-2012</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>189,373</td>
<td>+2.14</td>
<td>+34.97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>185,317</td>
<td>+5.94</td>
<td>----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>174,307</td>
<td>+6.02</td>
<td>----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>163,818</td>
<td>+3.91</td>
<td>----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>157,416</td>
<td>+3.40</td>
<td>----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>152,067</td>
<td>+5.22</td>
<td>----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>144,128</td>
<td>+5.88</td>
<td>----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>135,659</td>
<td>+9.22</td>
<td>----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>123,157</td>
<td>----</td>
<td>----</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Bureau of Employment and Vocational Training, Council of Labour Affairs, Executive Yuan, Taiwan

**2.4.2 Class as a regional divide**

Labour migration from countries with less developed economies to the more developed region is a macro-level class issue. The continuous flow of labour migrants from one to the other signifies a persistent economic asymmetry between the country
of origin and the destination. In countries such as Vietnam, where weak economic infrastructures do not allow the state to offset the ‘risk’ encountered by its citizens, people are likely to seek work abroad to improve their economic condition. Agreements between labour sending and receiving states (Go, 2007) and a well-developed labour brokerage system (Bélanger, 2008; Wang & Bélanger, 2007) provide a meso-level ‘opportunity structure’ whereby citizens of one state can make their livelihood in another. Although a labourer’s ‘class standing’ is one of several factors influencing this choice, it is usually the most relevant ‘context of exit’ (Portes & Rumbaut, 1996). Class separates those who have sufficient access to the country’s economic resources from those who have little or none.

Wallerstein’s (1974) world-systems theory regarding the unequal global class structure can be applied to the Asian migration of unskilled, independent labour. Wallerstein uses historical analysis to argue that, in the capitalist world-economy, an uneven distribution of economic resources creates ‘cores’, or, dominant capitalist centers with high levels of industrialization and urbanization which control and dominate the less developed periphery nations that depend on the core for capital and have minimal or no industrialization. In the global economy, a person’s labour is considered a commodity to be bought and sold (Rodriguez, 2008). Through international migration, cheap labour is mobilized from the periphery to meet the economic interests of core economies (Castles & Miller, 2009:26). Core regions’ economic and technological advancements create high-paid jobs for locals; low-paid, insecure jobs are filled by migrant workers. Wallerstein’s theory provides a global context for the ‘dual labour
market theory’. In the Asia-Pacific region, the core-periphery relationship which governs the labour migration flow is evident: Japan, South Korea, Taiwan, Hong Kong and Singapore comprise the core economies, while the Philippines, Indonesia, Thailand, Vietnam, Laos and Cambodia form the periphery (Jones & Findlay, 1998).

2.4.3 The intersection of state, class, gender, and migration

In comparison with other Southeast Asian countries, Vietnam joined the international labour market fairly late. It was not until the 1980s that Vietnam followed other neighbouring countries and actively promoted labour export to its citizens as a means of reducing domestic unemployment and poverty (Anh, 2008). Vietnam witnessed three waves of labour export. The first and second waves involved Eastern Europe and the Soviet bloc, whereas the third wave, starting in 1994, was directed primarily to Malaysia, South Korea, Taiwan and Japan, as well as to countries of the Gulf region (Dang, 2000). For many Vietnamese families, participating in international labour migration is a way of improving their economic well-being, especially since the country shifted from the socialist to the market-oriented economy (transition known as ‘doi moi’) in the late 1980s (Barbieri & Bélanger, 2009). To adapt to the institutional and economic transformation, families had to shoulder the main responsibility of being the welfare provider for their members.

Compared to major contract labour migrant-sending countries, such as Bangladesh, the Philippines and Indonesia, Vietnam contributes to a relatively smaller international migration stock (Bélanger & Wang, 2013). For instance, in 2005 the Philippines sent almost one million workers abroad, Indonesia approximately 400,000 and Bangladesh
over 200,000. In the same year, Vietnam only exported 70,000 to 80,000 workers.\(^3\)

Labour migration from Vietnam is far from being structurally embedded in the national economy and family structure the way it is for major sending countries. The Philippines, for instance, has roughly 10 per cent of its population working abroad. Emigration not only has become part of the Filipino culture (Castles & Miller, 2009), but it has also impacted the family life in the homeland (Battistella & Conaco, 1998). In addition, remittances play a key role in sustaining the national economy.

Emigration from Vietnam has a long history, particularly with the refugee movement that followed the US-Vietnam War, but these movements mostly resulted from family reunion. In the case of temporary labour migration, migrants cannot migrate with family members and families are apart for extended periods of time (Lin & Bélanger, 2013) which has a considerable impact on family structure and family relations. While this impact is notable locally and at the household level, Vietnam is not characterized by labour migration culture the way countries such as the Philippines or Mexico are.

Migration not only occurs within a global capitalist structure, but also operates through a gendered process (Ford & Piper, 2007:64-5). Hence, gender relations and ideology in both labour-sending and –receiving countries can both facilitate and constrain migration opportunities for men and women and thus shape their biographies differently. Early migration literature predominantly constructed migration as a male-

\(^3\) Vietnam Ministry of Labour Affairs, unpublished statistics.
dominated activity and thus overlooked women’s migratory experiences (Hondagneu- 
Sotelo, 2000). Until the early 1980s, women were still perceived as ‘baggage’ (Cohen, 
1997) or dependents of ‘primary’ (King, 2002; Yamanaka & Piper, 2005) male migrants. 
However, more recent research documents that female migrants are as active as are 
male ones (Boyd, 2006; King, 2002; Kofman et al., 2000). This is particularly the case in 
the Asia-Pacific region where a growing number of women migrate to work in 
traditionally female-dominated sectors (Piper, 2004). ‘Global patriarchal capitalism’ 
(Liang, 2010:8) produces this migration pattern.

A gendered division of domestic labour persists in both developing and 
economically advanced countries. Globally, women continue to perform an inordinate 
share of unpaid domestic work, regardless of whether they participate in the labour 
force (Breen & Cooke, 2005; Lan, 2003a, 2003b). Some women’s advantaged class 
position makes them more capable of reducing this discrepancy (Lan, 2003b, 2006; 
Parreñas, 2008). In economically privileged countries, women with financial resources 
can employ other women, often from Third World countries, to care for their children or 
elderly relatives. At the same time that class-privileged women and men manage to 
transfer some of their domestic responsibility to less privileged migrant women, the 
migrant workers meet their care responsibilities at home by relying on unpaid family 
members (Yeates, 2004). Such transnational and local transfers of care generate class-
based global care chains (hereafter GCCs), which Hochschild (2000:131) describes as “a 
series of personal links between people across the globe based on the paid or unpaid 
work of caring”. Such chains involve the employer, the worker, one or more members of
the worker’s family back home, or someone hired by the worker to fulfill their care obligations in their absence. GCCs provide a construct for analyzing the ‘globalization–migration–care nexus’ (Yeates, 2004), with its emphasis on the gendered division of domestic labour in both sending and receiving countries and the power dynamics of global patriarchy and of class disparities between women in rich and poor nations. The intersection of class, gender, and care work creates an ‘international division of reproductive labour’4. Women with unequal class positions are enmeshed in a mutually dependent relationship (Parreñas, 2000) where the global care supply and demand of feminized migrant labour perpetuates a particular form of linked lives that is characterized by ‘global relations of social inequality’ (Yeates, 2012:137).

2.4.4 Migrants’ vulnerability primarily as a class issue

Taiwan’s demand for female migrant care workers creates an alternative employment opportunity, and taking this opportunity can occur as a turning point in these female workers’ lives. Women exercise agency through migration to escape the economic constraints of their own country; this exemplifies Settersten’s and Gannon’s (2006:35) agency within structure model. Nevertheless, they often continue to experience economic vulnerability while working abroad. Their disadvantageous class position in the system of labour migration leaves them to be economically vulnerable. Taiwan’s government, in concert with most Asian countries (ILO, 2006), does not

\[\text{4 According to Parreñas (2000), reproductive labour refers to ‘labour needed to sustain the productive labour,’ including household chores and caring for the ill, elderly and children.}\]
directly administer foreign labour programs, but instead permits profit-driven labour agencies and brokers to recruit, place, and manage foreign workers. Brokers also exist in the labour-sending countries. For example, in Vietnam private recruiting agents may enter the rural communities and advertise job opportunities in well-developed Asian Pacific countries to the peasants (Bélanger & Wang, 2013). Selection criteria are often imposed on the prospective migrant workers. Recruitment criteria of domestic worker established by Vietnam recruitment agencies stipulate that workers should be married women between the ages of 25 and 45 years. In Vietnam, married women with children are expected work and earn income for their family, so targeting them for labour migration does not cause a cultural conflict (Bélanger & Wang, 2013). These rules, along with labour export agreements signed between Vietnam and specific receiving countries, circumscribe peasants’ possibilities for labour migration.

Recruiting agencies of labour-sending and -receiving countries charge workers substantial fees. In this very profitable ‘migration industry’, workers are poorly paid (Loveband, 2004). Those from sending countries pay agencies exorbitant fees and their home country taxes on the income earned abroad. Workers become trapped in the complex transnational brokerage system that makes them ‘indentured labourers’ (Derks, 2010) forced to pay off debts within a fixed period of time. Indeed, migrants’ pre-departure financial situation is made more vulnerable by the brokers who facilitate migration (Derks, 2010; Wang & Bélanger, 2007).

Once in Taiwan, this disadvantaged class position persists. In the globalized economy, migrant workers are ‘disposable labour’ compensated at the minimum legal
wage (US $ 550 monthly). Initially, Taiwan’s Council of Labour Affairs enforced a quota control system that both restricted migrant workers' admission and limited non-renewable permits to three years. The contract could end at any point at which the employer no longer required the worker. However, employers discovered that training new workers proved costly and preferred to retain those previously contracted, resulting in these workers illegally overstaying their visas. As a result, in 2002, public pressure led to the government to renew for a further three years the permits of workers in good standing (CLA, 2003), and a second three-year extension became permissible in 2007 (CLA, 2009). Nonetheless, migrants face another risk; during the migratory trajectory, many take on significant debts in the form of travel costs and agency fees and are at risk of being required to leave the country before paying these back (Bélanger & Wang, 2013). Migrant workers lack the right to attain permanent residency, even after working in Taiwan for years. Thus, most maximize their stay to pay off debts and accumulate discretionary income for themselves and their family (Lin & Bélanger, 2012), before having to leave and find work elsewhere, a process that typically involves another round of exorbitant agency fees.

Migrants experience vulnerability brought on by macro- and meso-level forces: Regional economic disparity produces unequal class relations which lead to asymmetrical labour relations in the private household setting (Lan, 2006). The work of Glenn (1986), Romero (1992) and Rollins (1985) contributed to early theories regarding domestic labour relation dynamics. They examined an oppressive American class struggle at the macro level while recognizing how this transpires in the meso-level
family setting where privileged employers and racialized domestic workers co-exist. They perceived class and race as fundamental causes of the employer-worker asymmetry. In this analysis, gender and race also serve as important dimensions of inequality reproduced in the domestic work setting. After reviewing the existing literature, this thesis asks: Do structured social relations, such as class gender, ethnicity, always reproduce asymmetrical labour relations in the private household setting? Is there a continuum of degrees of social vulnerability experienced by migrant workers? To properly explore these two inquiries, we must consider the complexity of employer-worker power dynamics.

Recent research on migrant-provided care (Cheng, 2006; Constable, 2007; Hondagneu-Sotelo, 2007; Lan, 2003a; Parreñas, 2001a; Stiell & England, 1997) draws on this earlier work, focusing on the contradictions and ambiguities inherent in class relations. For instance, the concept of ‘personalism-asymmetry’ can be applied to the working conditions of migrants. Although fictive kinship and intimacy can be meaningful to both parties in an inherently asymmetrical domestic power structure based on race/ethnicity, nationality and citizenship status (Glenn, 1986), such differences leave migrants vulnerable to exploitation. Concepts such as Lan’s (2006:60) ‘stratified otherness’ examine how employers and domestics negotiate their class relations, allowing a more nuanced understanding of relationship dynamics than the mere

___

5 ‘Stratified otherness’ exists in the socially constructed, racialized boundary between respected, skilled white-collar professionals (mainly from developed, Western nations) and blue-collar, unskilled, primarily Southeast Asian wailao who face exploitation and considerable state regulation.
dichotomy of employer-worker power imbalance (that is, domination versus subordination) affords. One common observation is that both parties eventually renegotiate their initial social boundaries (Anderson, 2000; Hondagneu-Sotelo, 2007; Ozyegin, 2001).

Lan (2003a) employed the concept of ‘boundary work’ to further explain the social and power dynamics between employers and domestic workers. In domestic employment, both parties develop preferences and strategies to pursue their own agendas. Employers who feel superior to their workers may prefer to maintain a household hierarchy that preserves status differences. That way they can perpetuate their exploitation of or discrimination against domestic workers (Cheng, 2006; Lan, 2003a). In a private household setting, they continue to reproduce class-based social inequalities. Workers, on the other hand, may exercise agency by developing defensive strategies (e.g., playing tricks to avoid particular household rules or demonstrating themselves as irreplaceable workers to their employers) to resist an exploitative asymmetrical power structure (Constable, 2007; Lin & Bélanger, 2012).

Some employers, instead of holding onto their class superiority, choose to downplay their dominant class position and identity; they validate their own middle-class identity – an identity associated with the values of self-reliance, equality, and democracy in a modernized society” (Lan, 2003a:535) to reduce their class guilt. Furthermore, the employer may cultivate personal bonds with the worker to ensure quality care and may obtain unpaid labour from the worker. This strategy, known as ‘instrumental personalism’ or ‘strategic intimacy’ (Hondagneu-Sotelo, 2007; Lan, 2003a)
obscures the employer-worker status hierarchy. While ‘instrumental personalism’ involves fostering a quasi-familial tie with workers, which is beneficial to the employment relationship, it also permits a certain degree of exploitation (Lin & Bélanger, 2012).

When workers feel that they are treated as part of the family by their employers, they may choose to accept exploitative work conditions. By avoiding confrontation, they intend to maintain a good working relationship with their employers (Anderson, 2000; Cheng, 2006). In this situation, workers may feel a sense of ambivalence, which appears to result from an individual’s choice, but is in fact influenced by factors at the macro level. The critical feminist approach recognizes the inherent asymmetrical employer-employee power relationship in predominantly female-oriented domestic employment (Elias, 2008; Parreñas, 2000). My thesis seeks to add to the theoretical emphasis on exploitation in the meso-context of labour relations and macro-context of transnational labour by uncovering the nuances of interpersonal relationships between the Taiwanese employer and the Vietnamese care worker. Following this approach, this thesis applies the concept of sociological ambivalence to study how the dynamic and contradictory power relations in the context of paid domestic care are worked out in personal relationships.

2.5 Paid Care Relationships

A paid care relationship, a form of linked lives involving the employer, the care worker and the care recipient, offers a micro context for studying how structured power relations are embedded in social institutions and social interaction. Caring involves both
physical tasks (referred to as ‘caring for’) and emotional labour (known as ‘caring about’) (England, 2005). ‘Caring about’ entails providing expressions of affection, love, warmth, sociability, nurturing and sympathy to the care recipient (England & Folbre, 2003; Folbre & Nelson, 2000; Himmelweit, 1999), a type of labour Meagher (2006) considers more important than 'caring for'. Recipients of such care often establish close relationships with their providers, while a paid provider's lack of interpersonal engagement may create a sense of exclusion or alienation in the care recipient (Attree, 2001).

Meagher (2006) argues that elements as diverse as job satisfaction, altruistic love, and financial reward can combine to motivate workers to create a good caring relationship. Himmelweit (1999) considers the distinction between unpaid and paid care as overly simplistic and dismisses the idea that paid care is no more than an economic transaction between caregiver and employer. Instead, he finds that a meaningful relationship and personal attachments can develop between the care provider and the recipient. Folbre and Nelson (2000) debate whether paid caregivers are motivated by monetary rewards, emotional rewards, or both. Some scholars depict paid caregivers as materialists whose impersonal relationships with clients can compromise care quality, whereas others hold that, for paid caregivers who demonstrate genuine love and concern to their clients, their care work become a ‘labour of love’ (Folbre & Nelson, 2000). My objective is to examine whether this ‘labour of love’ forms the basis of a good caring relationship. Studying this relationship allows us to explore how social and power dynamics in the private household setting (e.g., ambivalent employer-worker
relationships) are shaped by the macro context of class, gender and ethnic relations and the meso context of Taiwanese family care needs and domestic labour relations. By applying Lan’s concept of ‘boundary work’ (2003a), I attempt to examine how a labour of love operates in the cultivation of a good caring relationship, and how this relationship is constantly negotiated as a result of the varying needs of the worker, the elder, the employer and other household members over the course of domestic employment.

2.6 Transnational Families

As Taiwan’s demand for cheap migrant care labour continues to grow, spatially-fractured ‘transnational families’ anchored in the periphery will increase accordingly, a phenomenon that results primarily from global structural inequalities at the macro level. The United Nations defines transnational families as “those whose members belong to two households, two cultures and two economies simultaneously” (UNFPA, 2006:33). While varying modes of migration create a wide range of transnational families (Parreñas, 2005; Pe-Pua, 2003; Waters, 2005), this thesis focuses on Vietnamese women who leave their families to provide elder care in Taiwan. In addition to necessitating that family members adapt to their physical separation from one another (Yeoh et al., 2005), other obligations and relationships must be reconfigured across the distance.

How migrants negotiate ties with their distant family has been examined from a transnational perspective (Hondagneu-Sotelo & Avila, 1997; Parreñas, 2001). The complexity and dynamics of migrants’ family life-course trajectories are highlighted when the transnational perspective and the life course principle of linked lives are
considered in tandem. The concept of transnational family serves to define long-distance kinship relationships, which, in the case of migrant caregivers, involve various ongoing responsibilities. Physically separated members of such families strive to maintain and strengthen collective family unity despite the distance involved (Herrera Lima, 2001; Sørensen, 2005).

In addition to gender, the impact of labour migration on transnational family ties also varies by the migrant’s marital status. Asis et al. (2004) observed that married mothers who live apart from their families tend to experience a greater impact of international migration on their management of family ties than do those who are single. I incorporate the marital status of migrants is essential to this analysis, because it illuminates how different pre-migration social contexts lead to different migratory experiences. For example, in Taiwan migrant domestics from the Philippines and Indonesia tend to be single (Lan, 2006), whereas those from Vietnam tend to be married with children (Bélanger & Wang, 2013).

Studies of how married women migrants manage their intergenerational relations with children back home often focus on the phenomenon of ‘long-distance’ (Parreñas, 2005; Yeoh et al., 2005) or ‘transnational mothering’ (Parreñas, 2001) which occurs in many forms: sending remittances; maintaining frequent communication; offering regular material support; demonstrating emotional care (Boccagni, 2012; Hondagneu-Sotelo & Avila, 1997; Parreñas, 2005; Yeoh et al., 2005); providing moral guidance (Mummert, 2005); and remaining involved with their children’s education (Sternberg,
These efforts create ‘continuities’ (Yeoh et al., 2005) of family ties and intimacy, despite distance.

However, research that considers only transnational motherhood may overlook the long-term impact of migrant workers’ absences from their families on other family relationships. While labour migration provides financial gains, it also comes with emotional costs, notably the pain of family separations (Lin & Bélanger, 2012; Parreñas, 2001). Long-term absence can compromise kinship ties and thus create family tensions (Dreby, 2007). Accordingly, this thesis explores how migrants navigate their family responsibilities as wife, mother, daughter, and daughter-in-law, whereas earlier work tends to focus on the migrant’s role as mother only.

Migrants who attempt to fulfill their own family care responsibility while continuing to meet their family’s economic needs may experience the effects of ‘sociological ambivalence’. Further research is needed to understand how these women, especially those who stay abroad for a longer period of time, continue to negotiate contradictions in both work and family domains. This thesis thus addresses the question of how migrants ‘work out’ their family relationships while meeting their own family’s economic, emotional and care needs. The ‘ambivalence perspective’ enhances our understanding of their co-existing obligations and loyalties and helps to explain how they decide whether to continue to work far from the family or to return home. How do migrants respond to the structurally-created ambivalence of working abroad to support their families financially at the cost of being able to offer support and care at home?
This inquiry will help us to see a broader application of ambivalence to migration studies.

Do migrants, as they resolve ambivalence, adopt alternative family care arrangements? Recent studies find that transnational mothers mobilize help from female relatives at home to care for their children, thus making child care a collective responsibility shared by migrants and their blood kin (Akesson, et al. 2012; Drotbohm, 2012). Although much research has already focused on child care in migrant workers’ families, little attention has been paid to their elder care arrangements. Considering both child and elder care arrangements means recognizing and exploring multiple care chains in the country of origin.

Past research has also found that migrants tend to retain their established familial ties despite forming new relationships with members of their employing families. Hondagneu-Sotelo and Avila (1997) notes this ‘bi-familial tie’ of intimacy constructed in multiple geographic locations amongst Latina immigrant nannies and housekeepers in Los Angeles, as does Lan (2006) amongst Filipina domestics in Taiwan. Both studies exemplify Levitt and Schiller’s (2004) concept of ‘simultaneity,’ which posits that transnational migrants attempt to acculturate while simultaneously remaining connected with their homeland. These realities are highlighted by considering both transnational migration and linked lives.

Whether migrants experience ‘simultaneity’ through the process of cultivating a sense of belonging to multiple places requires further empirical investigation and conceptual development. This thesis examines how migrant workers’ provision of both
paid and unpaid care for geographically-separate households affects their sense of familyhood. My thesis also considers the quality of domestic labour relations in order to see how migrants perceive and define their social identity in the employing family, while continuing to maintain home ties. This approach combines research on domestic labour relations and transnational families, allowing us to study how ‘family ties’ are constructed and reconstructed within asymmetrical class, gender and transnational family relationships.

2.7 Summary

Several conceptual frameworks are employed to examine how Taiwanese families come to hire Vietnamese care workers and how the host family and the family of the employed worker shape complex global care chains. Core concepts from the life course perspective provide an overarching paradigm for examining the inter- and intragenerational negotiations of care arrangements and care transitions. Gender enhances a life course study of filial care: It sheds light on a cultural-specific living arrangement, helping to identify how care involvements differ between sons and daughters/daughters-in-law and between brothers and sisters. The concept of ambivalence highlights the problematic nature of the cultural ideal of filial piety in the context of contradictions embedded in structured social relations and social institutions. Ambivalence draws attention to the complexity and dynamism of negotiating relationships in these contexts. The combined perspective of life course, gender relations, and ambivalence is used to explore how Taiwanese family members negotiate care arrangements for their elder family members and how these negotiations may
produce outcomes that are at odds with cultural ideals. How inadequate state support leads some Taiwanese families to utilize migrant caring labour in order to resolve ‘sociological ambivalence’ is central to this thesis. Understanding this process allows us to construct a particular family caregiving trajectory unique to countries like Taiwan.

Families’ recruitment of foreign care workers typically involves women from less economically developed countries. Class factors into patterns of labour migration. Global capitalism produces regional economic inequalities which are consolidated in a global class structure arranged on national lines with countries classified as either core or peripheral economies. The core economy’s demand for cheap labour from the periphery drives the migration of unskilled labour. In sending countries, gender conditions men’s and women’s opportunity to migrate. Increasingly, the core’s growing demand for care labour has led to the feminization of migration. When families in the core transfer the burden of care to migrant workers, an ‘international division of reproductive labour’ occurs. Global care chains account for who ‘hires’ and who ‘is hired’ to do the care, and links a particular flow of transnational migration to a persistent regional economic inequality.

Class also shapes domestic labour relations. The concept of ‘boundary work’ provides a useful tool to identify how employer and worker negotiate their household relationships. Exploring boundary work in this thesis prompts uncovering the complexity of social and power dynamics anchored in a paid care relationship. ‘Boundary work’ brings together the issues of class interests, ambivalent employer-worker relationships and migrant workers’ sense of vulnerability.
The core’s demand for migrant care labour from the periphery creates ‘transnational families’. The transnational perspective illuminates how kinship ties are linked and negotiated across distance. This perspective incorporates the migrant’s standpoint in order to understand the contradictory family dynamics at the other end of global care chains, and to study the meaning of familyhood within multiple social and geographic contexts.
Chapter 3: RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

Data for this research were collected during two periods of fieldwork conducted in Taiwan between May and August 2009 and November 2010 through April 2011. Study participants included 40 Vietnamese care workers (four of whom participated in both periods of fieldwork), 23 Taiwanese employers and seven elders. Due to the nature of the research questions, I chose qualitative, as opposed to quantitative, research methods. My choice was informed by the concept of ‘thick description’ (Geertz, 1973). In-depth interviews were conducted to produce a detailed, narrative description of various social situations and observed actions. Narrative is more effective than quantitative data collection techniques at capturing a comprehensive account of changes in family care arrangements over time and of migrant women’s lived experiences as domestic care workers.

3.1 Ontological, Epistemological and Methodological Issues

As Schwandt (2000:197) argues, “human beings do not find or discover knowledge so much as we construct or make it.” Adopting this postmodern ‘social constructivist’ (Guba & Lincoln, 2005; Karagiorgi & Symeou, 2005) paradigm means challenging the ‘positivist’ tradition and viewing research as a process of revealing multiple partial truths rather than one single reality. Acknowledging the complex and dynamic nature of family ties, caregiving situations, and the transnational aspect of care work in Taiwan, my research attempts to provide one of the many interpretations which are required to better understand this phenomenon through qualitative methods.
Despite competing paradigms (Guba & Lincoln, 2004), practitioners of qualitative research generally regard knowledge as socially constructed and derived from interactions between social actors in particularly situated activities. Qualitative techniques understand activities and situations as open to interpretation, rather than reducible to a set of laws. When approaching how Taiwanese families organize and arrange elder care and the implications of hiring a foreign care worker, qualitative researchers must incorporate demographic, social, cultural, gender, policy and transnational contexts into their analyses. Understanding this situation sociologically requires the interpretation process expressed by Max Weber's term ‘Verstehen,’ an interpretive method that makes it possible to construct fluid and contestable knowledge.

As a method of investigation, in-depth interviews are particularly suited for constructing fluid and context-specific knowledge. The researcher conducting interviews does not view study participants as an investigated ‘object’, separated from the investigator, in the manner that quantitative researchers often do; rather, he or she privileges participants' ‘voices’ by providing a space where their views and experiences can be expressed (Carpenter & Hammell, 2000; Clandinin & Connelly, 2000). Qualitative researchers examine social realities through the eyes of the study participants who belong to the culture being studied; thus, they aim to gain an ‘emic’ or insider perspective (Denzin & Lincoln, 2000; Willis et al., 2007:100). This approach emphasizes a partnership between the researcher and study participants (Miller & Crabtree, 2004:187); both parties engage in ‘meaning-making work’ (Holstein & Gubrium, 1995)
and produce a collaborative perspective of family negotiations of care and the implications of migration of caring labour. This perspective provides a means to create family biographies of elder care and to reveal migrants’ experiences of sharing their life with their host family while maintaining ties with their distant families.

In-depth interviews allow study participants to seek clarification from the researcher; at the same time, the researcher can ask for more information when this seems expedient. Open-ended questions offer participants an opportunity to share experiences, knowledge, stories or personal biographies. Another important objective of in-depth interviews is to derive new conceptual ideas from data. This means deploying one’s ability to explore ideas that are not confined to existing concepts in the inquiry. To accomplish this task, common language must be used during interviews, as this technique minimizes the social distance between academic researchers and study participants, resulting in enhanced rapport between both parties.

3.2 Fieldwork and Data Collection

3.2.1 Two-phased ethnographic fieldwork and sampling procedure

I conducted a two-phased ethnographic study between May and August, 2009, and November 2010 and April 2011, in my hometown, Taichung City, Taiwan’s third largest metropolitan area which has a population of over two million. Doing research in Taichung facilitated my access to potential participants through known information resources and personal contacts. Interviews in both fieldwork phases were guided by the life course approach, discussed in Chapter Two. This approach is particularly suitable
for understanding Vietnamese caregivers’ migratory trajectory and their long-term relationship with Taiwanese employers and elderly care recipients.

Previous Taiwanese research has studied the situation of migrant workers from the Philippines and Indonesia (Cheng, 2004; Lan, 2003a, 2003b, 2006; Loveband, 2004) and Vietnam (Bélanger, 2008; Wang & Bélanger, 2009). Although Vietnamese care workers previously dominated the demographic composition of the foreign domestic workers, in 2005 the Taiwanese government restricted their entry because, compared with those from other Southeast Asian countries, they had the highest incidence of ‘runaway’ (National Immigration Agency, 2009). Due to the ban, the number of Vietnamese migrant care workers decreases annually, compared with those from other countries of origin (see Figure 3.1). As a result, all the Vietnamese participants included in this study had arrived before 2005, and due to the possibility of extension, they were allowed to work in Taiwan for up to twelve years past this point. Therefore, at the time of interview, they were long-term migrants (averaging between six and eight years of stay), and were expected to provide a richer history of domestic care employment than more recent arrivals. Additionally, Vietnamese care workers primarily provide care for the frail elderly, whereas women from other regions (such as Indonesia) are hired as both child care and elder care workers (Bureau of Employment and Vocational Training, 2012). Longer residency and the occupational allocation of Vietnamese workers in elder care characterize this group of migrant workers.
Although I used a ‘snowball sampling’ strategy to recruit all the study participants in both fieldwork periods, the research focus varied between the first and second phase. The initial fieldwork was part of a migrant-centered study in which Vietnamese migrants were the only target sample. In total, 20 were recruited and interviewed: four from personal networks, 15 as referrals from these initial four study participants, and, one from a non-governmental organization.

In the second fieldwork, the study participants included Taiwanese employers (typically adult children of elderly care recipients), Vietnamese care workers and elderly care recipients. For the most part, the recruitment of these three took place simultaneously. Finding households that employed a Vietnamese care worker in this phase of fieldwork was challenging due to the 2005 ban on Vietnamese domestics; however, family, friends and neighbours connected me with the first 15 households, each of which included at least one elderly relative cared for by a Vietnamese care worker. Because Taiwanese employers were involved in this phase, their permission to interview the worker was often required, and six of these 15 families refused to
participate as they deemed this research to be intrusive. I was introduced to two additional households with the help of two different labour brokers, and I approached the remaining six households through the workers whom I had initially recruited. Altogether, the second phase of fieldwork included 23 employers and 23 workers.

Among 23 employers, three had previously, but no longer, employed a Vietnamese worker; however, despite the absence of the worker, these participants provided valuable information on how family elder care arrangements changed between the time when the worker was present and after she had left. Among the 23 worker participants, four had participated in the first fieldwork and were willing to take part in the second one; another three were included in the sample despite their employers being unwilling to participate. Among the 23 households, 12 dependent elders were not capable of participating because of strokes or degenerative diseases such as Alzheimer’s. Two were not allowed to take part by their adult child, seven were able and willing to participate and discuss their experience of being cared for by a Vietnamese worker and two had passed away prior to the interview. The second phases included 53 interviews. Altogether, 73 interviews were conducted during two phases of the fieldwork. Table 3.1 shows the sample details of each study period.

Table 3.1: Sample Size

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study Participants</th>
<th>Employer (Adult Child of Care Receiver)</th>
<th>Migrant Care Worker</th>
<th>Elder (Care Receiver)</th>
<th>Subtotal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1st Fieldwork (2009)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2nd Fieldwork (2011)</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total number of Interview</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
After an initial phone conversation, I met those who agreed to participate in this study at a time and place suitable to them: a public place or their workplace. Because the majority of caregiver interviews were conducted in private residences, I had an additional opportunity to observe worker-elder, face-to-face interactions. Employers’ and workers’ interviews averaged between 60 and 80 minutes and those of elders lasted for an average of 30 minutes. They were conducted primarily in Mandarin and audio recorded. Vietnamese care workers participating in this study had been in Taiwan for over five years and were fluent in this language. However, the Taiwanese dialect was used with those elders who preferred it. All participants were offered remuneration of ten Canadian dollars. My research complied with University of Western Ontario social research ethics regulations (see Appendix B) and thus provided all participants with confidentiality.

I typically began each interview with informal conversation to establish rapport with the interviewee, followed by a brief explanation of the research objectives. At this point, I gathered participants’ information on age, gender, education, marital status and number of children, in order to establish a personal profile for each case study. Guideline questions (see Appendix A) were then asked. At times I prompted participants by suggesting hypothetical scenarios to encourage and stimulate further elaboration. When they found recalling certain events difficult, I provided cues to retrieve events or circumstances that they might have forgotten. For example, when Taiwanese participants recounted their family integration process, I asked them whether any specific member of the family or a particular activity facilitated such a process. Later, to
gain deeper insight, I conducted follow-up interviews with 11 workers and two
employers. Although guideline questions (see Appendix A) were used throughout this
process, these were occasionally modified as the fieldwork evolved. Interviews
carried out early in both fieldwork phases allowed me to assess whether questions were
effective at capturing a wide range of experiences and in-depth information. Participant
responses helped me to develop new questions, simplify those that were initially
difficult to answer, and remove those that were less relevant to the participants.

Ethical challenges encountered in both fieldwork phases must be noted. While I
avoided interviewing the employer and the worker simultaneously to minimize the
impact on how each party presented him/herself, in some cases the employer chose to
stay close by when the worker was being interviewed. This ‘monitoring effect’ could put
the worker in an uncomfortable situation, particularly when asked about the employer-
worker relationship and the perception of vulnerability in the private household. Instead
of responding openly, the worker might provide a selective, neutral, or socially desirable
answer. While my goal was to better understand the social and power dynamics in
domestic employment, I also held myself responsible for not jeopardizing the worker’s
job and her relationship with the employer. To circumvent this problem, I asked the
employer’s permission to conduct a separate interview with the worker to get to know
about her ‘migratory experience’. While the worker might deem speaking behind the
employer’s back as inappropriate, I then assured her that information she provided
would be completely confidential.
The other ethical challenge I experienced was identity related. Because of my Taiwanese background, some workers, especially those who were not introduced by my Vietnamese referrals, initially regarded me as ‘the employer’s friend’ or even a representative from a Taiwanese broker. This misperception led to their initial discomfort or defensive outlook toward me. To reduce their discomfort, I provided them with a detailed explanation of my research project, along with potential benefits of sharing their anonymous views (e.g., receiving the public’s acknowledgement of their ‘invisible’ labour). This strategy not only helped me to earn their initial trust, but also to reduce their perception of intrusiveness regarding my research.

The first phase of fieldwork focused primarily on the migrant care workers’ perspective and was comprised of three parts. I began by asking workers about their initial migration process and first contact with the employing family. Participants described their experience of being a migrant live-in care worker and the quality of their life while working in the private household. Then, I investigated their views of the employer-worker and worker-elder relationship during their co-residential period. Finally, I addressed workers’ perception of economic and social vulnerability and their views on social networking outside the private household.

The second phase evolved from the first and shifted the focus to three topics: family negotiation of care arrangements, domestic labour relations, and workers’ view on their migratory trajectory and relationships with their distant family. The investigation of care arrangements sought to provide family care history. Each family defined physical care needs in old age and described how changes in care arrangements
occurred. They discussed who was principally involved in care and the reasons for family members’ differing involvement in, and commitment to, care. Attention was paid to the negotiation process among family members that accounted for the selection of a particular care arrangement, including where the elder lived and the sharing of elder care among family members at specific points in time. Because Taiwanese culture traditionally emphasized the patrilineal kinship system (Lin et al., 2003), I also investigated how this cultural norm may have influenced the sons’ role in their negotiation process. This question led me to explore whether family member’s position in the kinship structure (i.e., son and daughter-in-law, daughter and son-in-law, or brother and sister) creates variations in how filial care was performed.

When exploring the reasons why Taiwanese families chose to hire a foreign live-in care worker rather than use state-funded programs such as nursing homes, I was particularly interested in whether adult children considered the elder’s feelings before hiring the worker. After recording participants’ descriptions of the initial hiring process, I asked questions designed to establish employer-worker relationship trajectories. This procedure provided information about how employers defined their status and role in relation to the worker and how that status and role altered during the time of employment. Attention was paid to exploring multi-directional interaction, such as triangular power dynamics among the employer, the worker and the elder over time, and how their relationships changed over time. Employers were asked to identify factors that led to changes in a paid care relationship and to describe what they believed changes meant to the parties involved. Their reflections helped to construct
one version of the caregiving relationship trajectory. Finally, I asked employers how they felt about purchasing care services and their view of ‘good care’ of the elder.

A final focus of the second phase of fieldwork was workers’ views on their migration experiences. Participants were first asked about their decision to migrate. I explored whether this decision was made individually or collectively, whether with their natal or husband’s family. Then, workers commented on their perception of and interaction with the host family and the elder. Finally, I explored how workers maintained family ties from afar by focusing on multiple roles they played in fulfilling various family responsibilities. To understand how the household division of labour, such as child care, elder care and other domestic chores, altered during workers’ absence from their family, I asked how they negotiated household and family responsibilities with other family members back home. Then, I explored whether workers’ long-term absence led to any family conflicts. Next, workers responded to questions regarding their management of remittances, for example, how they allocated and spent them; who managed them if they were sent home; and whether the ability to send remittances changed workers’ previous household position. Finally, I solicited comments on their social identity after the long-term employment in the Taiwanese household.

3.2.2 Analytical approach and sample characteristics

Interviews were transcribed into narratives. During transcription, I had an chance to reflect on the participants’ stories and assess the variations across my cases. Data were initially analyzed by reading the transcripts and keeping a journal of my observations.
The analysis used descriptive codes to arrive at thematic concepts useful for breaking the lengthy narratives into smaller text units responding to a specific theme. These units assisted me in revealing similarities and differences emerging from the data. From here, I developed analytical concepts that became the building blocks of my analysis, as seen in Chapters Four, Five and Six. To avoid losing the entirety of the narrative during the analysis, I also conducted case analysis that allows me to preserve the overall picture of each case. Despite multiple participants involved in my study, family remains a primary unit of analysis, meaning that any derived themes from the data are discussed and compared at the family level. The conceptual framework and the literature review informed my analysis, directing me to pay attention to the key issues identified in my research questions, and to make conceptual and empirical links in this thesis. I went back and forth between the conceptual framework and data analysis and derived new ideas and concepts from the data.

Table 3.2 and 3.3 show 40 Vietnamese care workers’ demographic information. 34 workers were married, two were divorced, two were widowed and four were single. The respondents were aged between 28 and 51. Many had a primary school education, although some had secondary education and one had a university degree. Most came from rural Northern Vietnam and 36 had left children and husbands behind. They had been working in Taiwan between five and eight years except one for two years. Most reported that, prior to being in Taiwan, they had never been abroad. They learned about Taiwan’s live-in elder care program through neighbours, friends, or family members who had previously worked in Taiwan.
Table 3.2: Demographic Profile of 20 Vietnamese Live-in Elder Care Workers (1st Fieldwork)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Marital Status</th>
<th>Education</th>
<th>Job Description</th>
<th>Living Arrangement</th>
<th>Duration of Stay</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td>married</td>
<td>some</td>
<td>caring for an elderly woman</td>
<td>alternating residence with care recipient (adult children’s collaborative care)</td>
<td>5 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td>married</td>
<td>some</td>
<td>caring for an elderly woman</td>
<td>with one care recipient and employer (husband of care recipient)</td>
<td>5 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>married</td>
<td>secondary</td>
<td>caring for an elderly man</td>
<td>with one care recipient only</td>
<td>6 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>married</td>
<td>some</td>
<td>caring for an elderly man and woman</td>
<td>with two care recipients</td>
<td>5.5 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td>married</td>
<td>secondary</td>
<td>caring for an elderly woman</td>
<td>with one care recipient and employer (son of care recipient) and wife</td>
<td>5.5 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>married</td>
<td>some</td>
<td>caring for an elderly woman</td>
<td>with one care recipient and employer (son of care recipient)</td>
<td>4.5 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>married</td>
<td>secondary</td>
<td>caring for an elderly woman</td>
<td>with one care recipient only</td>
<td>5.5 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>single</td>
<td>some</td>
<td>caring for an elderly woman</td>
<td>with one care recipient and employer (husband of care recipient)</td>
<td>5.5 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>married</td>
<td>some</td>
<td>caring for an elderly woman</td>
<td>with one care recipient, employer (son of care recipient) and family</td>
<td>5 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>married</td>
<td>some</td>
<td>caring for an elderly woman</td>
<td>with one care recipient only</td>
<td>5 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td>married</td>
<td>some</td>
<td>caring for an elderly man</td>
<td>with one care recipient, employer (son of care recipient) and family</td>
<td>5 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td>married</td>
<td>some post-secondary</td>
<td>caring for an elderly woman</td>
<td>with one care recipient, employer (son of care recipient) and family</td>
<td>5 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td>married</td>
<td>secondary</td>
<td>caring for an elderly man</td>
<td>with one care recipient, employer (son of care recipient) and family</td>
<td>8.5 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>married</td>
<td>some</td>
<td>caring for an elderly woman</td>
<td>with one care recipient, employer (daughter of care recipient) and family</td>
<td>5.5 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>married</td>
<td>some</td>
<td>caring for an elderly man</td>
<td>with one care recipient and employer (wife of elderly man)</td>
<td>5 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td>married</td>
<td>some</td>
<td>caring for an elderly woman</td>
<td>with one care recipient, two employers (sons of care recipient) and family</td>
<td>5.5 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>married</td>
<td>secondary</td>
<td>caring for an elderly woman</td>
<td>with one care recipient, employer (son of care recipient) and family</td>
<td>5.5 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>single</td>
<td>some</td>
<td>caring for an elderly woman</td>
<td>With employer, but provide care at elder’s residence</td>
<td>4.5 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>married</td>
<td>some</td>
<td>assisting with employer’s business (exploited case)</td>
<td>With employer</td>
<td>5.5 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>married</td>
<td>some</td>
<td>caring for an elderly woman</td>
<td>with one care recipient and employer</td>
<td>4.5 years</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 3.3 provides information on the demographics, family ties and composition of the 23 Taiwanese families. My study includes employers who are sons, daughters, daughters-in-law, spouses and a niece of the elder who required care. Employers’ ages varied from 36 to 90 years. Most were married and had at least secondary education; six were university graduates. Most were employed but two had retired. The employers’ employment status is important because it may affect the degree of interaction possible with the caregiver. Due to the sensitivity of the income question, I relied on reference to occupations as a rough indicator of social classes. Taiwanese employers fell into the middle or upper-middle classes. Regarding ethnic/cultural identity of the employers, based on the distinct accent of Mandarin Chinese and their ability to speak Mingnan, a southern dialect of mainland China spoken in Taiwan, the majority belonged to the Mingnan ethnic group.

All the employer participants have multiple siblings. Out of 23 cases, most interviews were conducted with one member of the employing family, but four interviews involved married couples who participated together. While the vast majority co-resided with the dependent elder, two employers lived independently. At the time of one interview, the co-resident elder parent had died. Participating elders were in their 70s and 80s, had at least one chronic illness and disability, lived either with adult children or a spouse, and had been cared for by a Vietnamese worker for at least four years.
### Table 3.3: Case Profiles

**Cases with three participants (Employer, Worker & Elder)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Family</th>
<th>Employer: Miss Lin</th>
<th>Care worker: A-shui</th>
<th>Elder: Mr. Lin</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>The Lin family</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>Age</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marital status</td>
<td>Single</td>
<td>Marital status</td>
<td>Married</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Secondary</td>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Some secondary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment status</td>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>Origin</td>
<td>North Vietnam (Vinh Phuc)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationship to the elder(s)</td>
<td>Second oldest daughter</td>
<td>Job</td>
<td>Caring for an elderly couple</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family structure</td>
<td>1 older brother, 1 older sister, 2 younger brothers, 3 younger sisters</td>
<td>Duration in T.W.</td>
<td>7 years</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Living arrangement: The elderly parents live separately from adult children

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Family</th>
<th>Employer: Miss Feng</th>
<th>Care worker: A-jin</th>
<th>Elder: Mrs. Gong</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>The Feng family</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>Age</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marital status</td>
<td>Single</td>
<td>Marital status</td>
<td>Divorced</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Some post-secondary</td>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Some secondary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment status</td>
<td>Employed (service)</td>
<td>Origin</td>
<td>North Central Vietnam (Quang Tri)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationship to the elder(s)</td>
<td>Niece and daughter</td>
<td>Job</td>
<td>Caring for an elderly woman and her older brother</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family structure</td>
<td>2 older brothers</td>
<td>Duration in T.W.</td>
<td>7 years</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Living arrangement: The elders live with 3 adult children

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Family</th>
<th>Employer: Mrs. Tu</th>
<th>Care worker: A-xian</th>
<th>Elder: Mrs. Si</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>The Tu family</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>Age</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marital status</td>
<td>Married</td>
<td>Marital status</td>
<td>Married</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Post-secondary</td>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Some secondary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment status</td>
<td>Self-employed (manufacturing)</td>
<td>Origin</td>
<td>North Vietnam (Bac Giang)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationship to the elder(s)</td>
<td>Youngest daughter-in-law</td>
<td>Job</td>
<td>Caring for an elderly woman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family structure</td>
<td>1 older sister, 2 older brothers (husband's siblings)</td>
<td>Duration in T.W.</td>
<td>7 years</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Living arrangement: The elder lives with her youngest son, daughter-in-law and grandchildren
### The Liu family

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Employer: Mr. Liu</th>
<th>Care worker: Yuan-yuan</th>
<th>Elder: Mrs. Liu</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Age</strong></td>
<td>78</td>
<td>Age</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Marital status</strong></td>
<td>Married</td>
<td>Marital status</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Education</strong></td>
<td>Secondary</td>
<td>Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Employment status</strong></td>
<td>Retired</td>
<td>Origin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Relation to the elder(s)</strong></td>
<td>Husband</td>
<td>Job</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Family structure</strong></td>
<td>3 sons, 1 daughter</td>
<td>Duration in T.W.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Living arrangement: The elder lives with her husband

### The Zhu family

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Employer: Mrs. Zhu</th>
<th>Care worker: A-zen</th>
<th>Elder: Mr. Zhu</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Age</strong></td>
<td>49</td>
<td>Age</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Marital status</strong></td>
<td>Married</td>
<td>Marital status</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Education</strong></td>
<td>Some secondary</td>
<td>Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Employment status</strong></td>
<td>Self-employed (beverage)</td>
<td>Origin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Relation to the elder(s)</strong></td>
<td>Daughter-in-law</td>
<td>Job</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Family structure</strong></td>
<td>1 younger brother, 2 younger sisters (husband's siblings)</td>
<td>Duration in T.W.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Living arrangement: The elder is living with his oldest son, daughter-in-law and grandchildren

### The Chang family

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Employer: Mrs. Chang</th>
<th>Care worker: A-bei</th>
<th>Elder: Mrs. Gong</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Age</strong></td>
<td>45</td>
<td>Age</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Marital status</strong></td>
<td>Married</td>
<td>Marital status</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Education</strong></td>
<td>Some post-secondary</td>
<td>Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Employment status</strong></td>
<td>Self-employed (manufacturing)</td>
<td>Origin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Relation to the elder(s)</strong></td>
<td>Daughter-in-law</td>
<td>Job</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Family structure</strong></td>
<td>Ten older sisters (husband's siblings)</td>
<td>Duration in T.W.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Living arrangement: The elder is living with his only son, daughter-in-law and grandchildren

### The Zeng family

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Employer: Mr. and Mrs. Zheng</th>
<th>Care worker: Fan-jie</th>
<th>Elder: Mrs. Jin</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Age</strong></td>
<td>56/39</td>
<td>Age</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Marital status</strong></td>
<td>Married</td>
<td>Marital status</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Education</strong></td>
<td>Primary/some secondary</td>
<td>Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Employment status</strong></td>
<td>Employed (manufacturing)</td>
<td>Origin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Relation to the elder(s)</strong></td>
<td>Fourth son/daughter-in-law</td>
<td>Job</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Family structure</strong></td>
<td>2 older brothers, 1 older sister, 1 younger brother (husband's siblings)</td>
<td>Duration in T.W.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Living arrangement: The elder is living with his son, daughter-in-law and grandchildren
### Cases with two participants

#### The Ji family

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Employer: Mr. Ji</th>
<th>Care worker: Xiao-ba</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marital status</td>
<td>married</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Post-secondary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment status</td>
<td>employed (service)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationship to the elder(s)</td>
<td>Oldest son</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family structure</td>
<td>1 older sister, 2 younger brothers</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Living arrangement**: The elderly mother lives alone.

#### The Xiao family

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Employer: Mrs. Liu</th>
<th>Care worker: A-sheng</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marital status</td>
<td>Married</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Secondary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment status</td>
<td>Employed (meat processing)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationship to the elder(s)</td>
<td>Youngest Daughter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family structure</td>
<td>2 brothers, 1 older sister (husband's siblings)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Living arrangement**: The elder lives with one of the brothers.

#### The Chen family

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Employers: Mr. and Mrs. Chen</th>
<th>Care worker: A-chao</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>49/49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marital status</td>
<td>Married</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Secondary/some secondary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment status</td>
<td>Employed (manufacturing)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationship to the elder(s)</td>
<td>The only son and daughter-in-law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family structure</td>
<td>3 older sisters, 1 younger sister (husband's siblings)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Living arrangement**: The elder lives with her only son and daughter-in-law.

#### The Dai family

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Employer: Mr. Dai</th>
<th>Care worker: A-tang</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marital status</td>
<td>Married</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Secondary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment status</td>
<td>Self-employed (food)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationship to the elder(s)</td>
<td>The oldest son</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family structure</td>
<td>1 younger brother, 2 younger sisters</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Living arrangement**: The elder lives with the oldest son and her daughter-in-law.

#### The Wu family

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Employer: Mrs. Wu</th>
<th>Care worker: A-xiang</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marital status</td>
<td>Married</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Secondary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment status</td>
<td>Employed (construction)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationship to the elder(s)</td>
<td>Daughter-in-law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family structure</td>
<td>2 older sisters, 1 younger sister (husband's siblings)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Living arrangement**: The elder is living with his son, daughter-in-law and grandchildren.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Family Name</th>
<th>Employer: Mr. or Mrs.</th>
<th>Care Worker: A-</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Li family</td>
<td>Mr. Li</td>
<td>A-hui</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employer</td>
<td>Mr. Li</td>
<td>Care worker: A-hui</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>Age 40</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marital status</td>
<td>Divorced</td>
<td>Marital status Married</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Secondary</td>
<td>Education Secondary</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment status</td>
<td>Self-employed</td>
<td>Origin North Central Vietnam (Thanh Hoa)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationship to the elder(s)</td>
<td>The oldest son</td>
<td>Job description Caring for an elderly woman</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family structure</td>
<td>1 older sister, 2 younger brothers</td>
<td>Duration in T.W. 8 years</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Living arrangement</td>
<td>The elder is living with his son and an unmarried daughter</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Song family</th>
<th>Employer: Mrs. Song</th>
<th>Care Worker: A-</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employer</td>
<td>Mrs. Song</td>
<td>A-tsun</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>Age 37</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marital status</td>
<td>Married</td>
<td>Marital status Married</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Primary</td>
<td>Education Some secondary</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment status</td>
<td>Employed (service)</td>
<td>Origin North Vietnam (Bac Giang)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationship to the elder(s)</td>
<td>Wife</td>
<td>Job Caring for an elderly man</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family structure</td>
<td>2 sons, 1 daughter</td>
<td>Duration in T.W. 7 years</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Living arrangement</td>
<td>The elder is living with his wife and the oldest son</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Guo family</th>
<th>Employers: Mr. and Mrs. Guo</th>
<th>Care worker: A-bi</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employer</td>
<td>Mr. and Mrs. Guo</td>
<td>A-bi</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>60/60</td>
<td>Age 35</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marital status</td>
<td>Married</td>
<td>Marital status Married</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Post-secondary</td>
<td>Education Some post-secondary</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment status</td>
<td>Self-employed (Retail)</td>
<td>Origin Central Vietnam (Thanh Hoa)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationship to the elder(s)</td>
<td>Fourth son/daughter-in-law</td>
<td>Job description Caring for an elderly woman</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family structure</td>
<td>3 older brothers, 1 older sister</td>
<td>Duration in T.W. 8 years</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Living arrangement</td>
<td>The elder is living with his son, daughter-in-law and one grandchild</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lin family</th>
<th>Employer: Mrs. Lin</th>
<th>Care Worker: A-su</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employer</td>
<td>Mrs. Lin</td>
<td>A-su</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>Age 40</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marital status</td>
<td>Married</td>
<td>Marital status Married</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Secondary</td>
<td>Education Some secondary</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment status</td>
<td>Retired</td>
<td>Origin North Vietnam (Hai Duong)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationship to the elder(s)</td>
<td>Daughter-in-law</td>
<td>Job Caring for an elderly woman</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family structure</td>
<td>3 older brothers, 1 older sister (husband's siblings)</td>
<td>Duration in T.W. 8 years</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Living arrangement</td>
<td>The elder is living with his son and daughter-in-law</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Huang family</th>
<th>Employer: Mr. Huang</th>
<th>Care Worker: A-jing</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employer</td>
<td>Mr. Huang</td>
<td>A-jing</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>Age 42</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marital status</td>
<td>Married</td>
<td>Marital status Widowed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Secondary</td>
<td>Education Secondary</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment status</td>
<td>Retired</td>
<td>Origin North Vietnam (Vinh Phuc)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationship to the elder(s)</td>
<td>Oldest son</td>
<td>Job Caring for an elderly woman</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family structure</td>
<td>5 younger sisters</td>
<td>Duration in T.W. 7.5 years</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Living arrangement</td>
<td>The elder is living with his only son, daughter-in-law and grandchildren</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Xu family

Employer: Mr. Xu
Age: 90
Marital status: Married
Education: Some secondary
Employment status: Retired
Relationship to the elder(s): Husband
Family structure: 2 sons, 7 daughters

Care worker: A-yun
Age: 46
Marital status: Married
Education: Some post-secondary
Origin: North Vietnam (Thai Nguyen)
Job: Caring for an elderly woman
Duration in T.W.: 7 years

Living arrangement: The elder is living with his husband only

The Mo family

Employer: Mr. Mo
Age: 48
Marital status: Single
Education: Secondary
Employment status: Self-employed (business)
Relationship to the elder(s): Fourth son
Family structure: 3 older brothers, 2 older sisters, 1 younger brother

Care worker: A-nan
Age: 39
Marital status: Married
Education: Secondary
Origin: North Vietnam (Ha Nam)
Job: Caring for an elderly woman
Duration in T.W.: 7 years

Living arrangement: The elder is living with her husband, 2 sons, 1 sister and grandchildren

The Wang family

Employer: Mr. Wang
Age: 58
Marital status: Married
Education: Post-secondary
Employment status: Employed (education)
Relationship to the elder(s): Youngest son
Family structure: 2 older brothers, 1 older sister

Care worker: A-xiang
Age: 38
Marital status: Married
Education: Some secondary
Origin: North Vietnam (Vinh Phuc)
Job: Caring for an elderly woman
Duration in T.W.: 7 years

Living arrangement: Two sons take turns housing the elderly mother

Cases with one participant (Employer)

The Qu family

Employer: Mr. and Mrs. Qu
Age: 55/49
Marital status: Married
Education: Secondary/secondary
Employment status: Retired/self-employed (business)
Relationship to the elder(s): Youngest son/daughter-in-law
Family structure: 3 older brothers, 4 older sisters

Living arrangement: Two sons previously took turns housing the elderly parents who had passed away

The Deng family

Employer: Mrs. Deng
Age: 45
Marital status: Married
Education: Secondary
Employment status: Employed (insurance)
Relationship to the elder(s): Daughter-in-law
Family structure: 1 older brother, 4 older sisters (husband's siblings)

Living arrangement: The elder used to live with his youngest son, daughter-in-law and grandchildren
3.3 Self-reflection

As a qualitative researcher, I am aware of various biases I may bring to the study.

My theoretical orientation, personal beliefs, life experiences and identities are likely to affect all stages of the research process, including the construction of research questions, research design, analysis, findings and conclusions drawn. As Rose (1985) suggested, value neutrality is unlikely, but the level of subjectivity can still be managed. By practicing ‘self-reflexivity’ (Charmaz & Mitchell, 1997; DeVault, 1997; Primeau, 2003), I hope to realize my commitment to qualitative methodological rigor.

Whittemore et al. (2001), for example, offered the following set of criteria to assess methodological rigour in qualitative research: (1) credibility, which is concerned with
whether the results of the research reflect the participants’ experience in a believable way; (2) authenticity, which concerns whether researchers are aware of the existence of subtle differences in the voices of all participants; (3) criticality: an evaluation of whether critical appraisal is present in the research; (4) integrity: whether there are recursive and repetitive checks of validity and a fair presentation of findings.

Researchers’ identities, that is, their fixed or culturally ascribed attributes, such as gender, ethnicity and nationality - often impact their relationship with the subjects under investigation. My experience and position is as a young male researcher who grew up in urban areas of Taiwan and pursued higher education in Western universities. I am neither an ‘insider’ nor an ‘outsider’ to the Taiwanese family culture; rather, I self-identify as a subject who incorporates both identifications. This required me to negotiate my in-between status while conducting my fieldwork. In addition, my position in relation to Taiwanese employers shifted over time. Having lived outside Taiwan for eight years, I felt culturally disconnected. On my return, it took time for me to culturally reorient myself. I made an effort to observe Taiwanese cultural expressions and interpersonal etiquette in order to reduce social distancing between myself and Taiwanese participants. This helped me to gain access to subjects in Taiwanese households from whom I gathered family elder care narratives.

The differences between myself and, in particular, the Vietnamese participants I interviewed, in gender, ethnic origin and education, make me an outsider. Being a male without previous encounters with Southeastern Asian migrant women hindered my initial attempts at information gathering. To break the gender and cultural barrier, I
strove to build rapport by showing my gratitude for their willingness to participate, expressing my enthusiasm for learning about Vietnamese culture and being empathic toward their situation of having to leave their families behind and work overseas. I presented myself in a non-scholarly fashion to bridge the academic and lay community disjuncture. As fieldwork progressed, my participants and I became more comfortable sharing knowledge and experiences on issues of interest. Throughout my inquiry, I strove to be sensitive to variations in age, gender, marital and socio-economic status of the participating employers and employed caregivers. Adopting this approach helped me to capture the diverse views of the participants, and to increase my sensitivity in the subsequent interviews.

3.4 Study Limitations

This study has a number of limitations. First, although all the Vietnamese interviewees were in Taiwan for years, there were distinguishable differences in their Mandarin proficiency, which accounts for variations in the amount and depth of information I was able to gather during each interview. An ability to conduct interviews in Vietnamese would have enhanced workers’ ability to express their experiences and ideas more clearly and comfortably using their own language. Second, as this is a case study with a small sample size (40 Vietnamese care workers and 23 Taiwanese employers), it can only identify some patterns and themes relevant to my study objectives. Hence, it cannot speak for the conditions of all Vietnamese domestic care workers in Taiwan or all Taiwanese families who hire foreign domestic workers. Third, my attempt to include the perspective of the dependent elder from each family was
often prevented by their chronic illness. Although seven elders participated, many of them, due to their declining speech ability, were unable to articulate their views and thoughts clearly. This hindered my ability to incorporate the elder’s perspective into my subsequent analysis. Not having other family members participate in this study is another shortcoming. Most families preferred to have one household representative - usually the one who hired the care worker- talk about family care history, reasons for employing a live-in caregiver and domestic labour relations. Although most employer participants shared the views of their family members regarding those issues, the inclusion of voices from other family members might have yielded different findings.

In addition, the employer’s presence during the interview with the worker, as previously discussed, may have inhibited workers’ willingness to share a more forthright description of their conditions of employment. Finally, self-selection bias was also present in the recruitment of Taiwanese employers: Those who had abused or exploited their worker were probably less likely to participate.
Chapter Four: FAMILY LIVING AND CARE ARRANGEMENTS

This chapter examines the dynamics of living and care arrangements and whether these arrangements change over time, with attention to the factors that shape different trajectories and patterns of family elder care processes. As the patrilineal ‘stem family’ predominates in Taiwan, studying patterns of filial care also produces an understanding of gender dynamics. Therefore, factors that influence which male child continues to live with his parents and later becomes the primary caregiver are explored, as is the question of under what circumstances daughters become involved in parent care.

Another integral element of this analysis is investigating how adult offspring and children-in-law manage to fulfill caregiving responsibilities while participating in the labour force. What work adjustments and strategies do married couples deploy in order to care for elderly family members? To better understand the family context of elder care, I also consider whether siblings collaborate when the need for parent care arises later in life. How adult offspring/children-in-law negotiate their division of care and the recruitment of a foreign live-in care worker is central to the analysis. Next, this chapter explores the decision to recruit a care worker, the recruitment process, how families negotiate the payment of the worker's salary, and how the presence of the worker reconfigures the family division of care. The subsequent analysis discusses how these several factors interact to create variant patterns of family elder care processes.
4.1 Living and Care Arrangements

Figure 4.1 summarizes information about family living arrangements for the 23 cases prior to hiring a care worker.

**Figure 4.1: Types of Living Arrangements (Year: 2010-2011)**

A. **Continuous multi-generational living arrangement (17 cases)**

- Living in the same house (16 cases)
- ‘Rotating’ living arrangement between two sons (1 case)

B. **Multiple cohabitation arrangement (2 cases)**

C. **From independent living to cohabitation (2 cases)**
D. **Independent living (2 cases)**

In 17 cases, living arrangements took the form of continuous multi-generational living arrangement. Among the remaining six cases, two families demonstrated multiple cohabitation arrangements; two showed the transition from independent living to cohabitation; and two described a situation of elder ‘independent living’. It must be noted that these four categories of living arrangements do not represent the entire trajectory of the family living situation, but are captured at the time of my study. I discussed each type below.

4.1.1 Continuous multi-generational living arrangement

Continuous multi-generational living arrangement represents Taiwan’s patrilineal stem-family household structure. While typically one married son and his family continue to live with his parents, which male child in a multi-son family makes this arrangement, and how this occurs in a single-son family requires investigation. While sons rather than daughters ‘officially’ shoulder the primary caregiving responsibility, in many families, daughters-in-law actually provide the care. However, when sons are not available, daughters may assume this role.

*Birth order*

The birth order of the male child plays a part in intergenerational living and care arrangements. In one family, the eldest son and his wife assumed the primary care
primary care responsibility for his elderly mother whom he continued to live with after marriage:

I’m the oldest son, so I assumed the caregiving responsibility. This is our Taiwanese tradition. However, there’re families whose elderly parents are cared for by their younger sons, but they are the minority. My wife and I had to devote some time from work to caring for my mom. (Mr. Dai, 45 years old)

Mr. Dai’s involvement in care suggests that a married son may not transfer the care task fully to his wife. Full ‘gender transfer of filial care’ does not always occur and son and daughter-in-law may share the task. In another family, the eldest son claimed his care responsibility after the process of family division, fen jia, occurred in the form of the division of residence among adult offspring:

My mom was self-dependent until she had a problem with walking ten years ago. My younger brothers and their wives used to live here and would provide help to her. Later, they moved elsewhere for their career. Because I’m the oldest son, I continue to live with my mom and shoulder the primary caregiving responsibility. (Mr. Li, 63 years old)

Unlike Mr. Dai’s case, Mr. Li’s divorce separated the daughter-in-law from the family care network. Instead, his older unmarried sister, who continued to live with him and their elderly mother, assumed a daughter-in-law’s caregiving role. Here, ‘gender transfer of filial care’ involved shared care by a divorced son and his unmarried sister. This pattern was also seen in another family:

My two younger brothers aren’t around, so I decided to be my mom’s primary caregiver. However, my older sister shares the care tasks and costs with me. She comes over quite often and checks on her. (Mr. Ji, 50 years old)

Although Mr. Li’s sister refused to participate in this study, I happened to see her accompanying and helping the elderly mother in a local hospital.
Similar to Mr. Li, Mr. Ji did not share the care task with his wife; instead, the eldest female sibling stepped in and shared it with him. Gender transfer of filial care did not involve Mr. Ji’s wife, but rather his sister. In this case, this was not due to a divorce but because of the Ji family’s separate living arrangement. Mr. and Mrs. Ji lived nearby, in part due to Mrs. Ji’s demanding employment situation. As Mr. Ji explains:

After I got married, my wife and I lived with my mom for a few years until we got our own house. One of my younger brothers continued to live with her until he found a new job elsewhere. Ever since my mom required care, I’ve been coming over a lot and offering her as much help as possible.... It’s hard for my wife to look after her because she doesn’t live with her and works full-time. (Mr. Ji, 50 years old)

Mr. Ji was the only case in which care primarily provided by the eldest son did not take place in a cohabitation arrangement, but instead in the form of frequent visits to the elder. Nonetheless, the care situation in the Li and Ji families suggests that ‘gender transfer of filial care’ to a son’s wife or daughter-in-law fails to convey more complex forms of care arrangements; in these two families, gender transfer occurred but to a sister/daughter rather than to a wife/daughter-in-law.

Marital status and timing of marriage

Unless they depart for education and career opportunities elsewhere, unmarried adult children often stay at their parents’ home and provide care when needed. In one of the families, an unmarried son became the primary source of care for his ill mother with whom he continued to live:

When my mom had a stroke five years ago, she was hospitalized. All of my brothers got married and have their own family to care for. I’m the only unmarried son in the family, so I decided to look after her. (Mr. Mo, 48 years old)
Mr. Mo is the second youngest child in his family. After marriage, three of his four brothers and one sister moved out of their parents’ house. Mr. Mo, along with one older married brother and his family, and their mentally disabled sister who did not require regular care, continued to live with his parents. In comparison with his married brothers, Mr. Mo had fewer family responsibilities over and above his filial duty and thus provided a larger share of care.

In addition to singlehood, the timing of male children’s marriage also influences which son is likely to stay close to his elderly parents and provide primary care. In three of the families, it was the last married son who continued to live with the elders:

My husband’s two older brothers moved out years ago after they got married. My husband was the last person to marry in his family. He always lived with his parents. (Mrs. Tu, 51 years old)

Interviewer: Can you tell me why your parents live with you, but not with other brothers?
Mr. Zeng: Well, they have their own career elsewhere. It’s difficult to make a living by doing farming here.
Interviewer: Did your brothers all live here before?
Mr. Zeng: Yes.
Mrs. Zeng: My brothers-in-law got married and moved out. My husband is the last person to get married in his family. He didn’t marry me until the age of forty.

Interviewer: Can you tell me about your husband’s family structure?
Mrs. Wei: He is the youngest son in his family. He has three older sisters and two older brothers, so there are six children in total.
Interviewer: Did your husband’s siblings all live here before?
Mrs. Wei: Yes, but they moved out after they got married.
Interviewer: Is your husband the last child to get married in his family?
Mr. Wei: Yes. He is. He is seven years younger than his second older brother.

The Tu, Zeng and Wei family show how the breakdown of the traditional household structure (from ‘joint-stem’ to ‘stem-family’) led to the same living arrangement. Male
children’s exit from the natal family after marriage, denoting the process of *fen jia* marked by the division of residence, left one son to continue to live with the elders. For these families, the sequence of sons’ marriages is more influential than birth order for understanding why multi-generational living involves a particular son.

**Career choice and geographic proximity**

Career-driven migration also affects family living and care arrangements. Mr. Ge was raised in a rural farming community in central Taiwan. He is the youngest son, with three older brothers and one older sister who have all moved elsewhere for their careers. Mr. Ge is the only child engaged in farming at home. Career choice and geographic proximity explain why he assumed the primary caregiving responsibility for his ill 87-year-old mother. In this case, geographic proximity due to career choice is a more important factor than birth order and the timing of marriage in explaining his living arrangement. When the elderly mother became dependent, it was Mrs. Ge who provided most care, in keeping with the traditional ‘gender transfer of filial care’ to the wife/daughter-in-law.

**Quality of intergenerational relationship**

How parents perceive their relationship with their adult children also explains why they continue to live with a particular son. In one family, the elders had a preference to live with one of their sons:

---

7 In the case of the Ge family, Mrs. Ge agreed to be the study participant. However, she requested the interview not to be audio recorded, so therefore the information provided is solely based on the fieldwork notes.
Interviewer: May I ask you why your parents-in-law decided to live with your husband?
Mrs. Liu: I don’t think there’s a particular reason. Perhaps, we have a stronger affinity with them than my brother-in-law. They decided to live with us, so it has been this way for years.

Unlike previous factors (i.e., birth order, marital status, timing of marriage, career choice and geographic proximity) that are associated with male children’s attributes, the quality of the intergenerational relationship influences the elders’ own decision to cohabit with a particular male child later in life.

The only son

In a single-son family, sorting out living and care arrangements is less complicated than in multiple-son families. When one is the only male child in the family, he is most likely to carry the care responsibility for his parents. Two participants who continued to cohabit with their elderly mother exemplified this pattern:

I’m the only son in my family. I have three older sisters and one younger sister... My mother’s health started to decline eight years ago. She had some cardiovascular diseases. After her first surgery, some parts of her body became paralyzed... Initially, my wife looked after her.... At that time, I helped my wife to bathe my mom after work (Mr. Chen, 49 years old)

I’m the only male child in my family, so I take the primary responsibility of caring for my mother. When my mom first required care after she had a stroke, I was still employed as a director in my company. I had light workload and flexible work schedule, so I could spend some time caring for her. Even though my wife still worked at the time, she shared the care with me, but she bathed my mom every day though. (Mr. Huang, 65 years old)

Although both daughters-in-law provided care, they differed in the volume of care work that they offered to the elder. Mrs. Chen became a full-time caregiver, whereas Mrs. Huang appeared to share the care equally with her husband. A clear gendered division
of care existed in Mr. Huang’s case in which he specifically designated the bathing task
to his wife.

‘Rotating’ living arrangements

Continuous multi-generational living arrangements remain the norm in Taiwanese
society. Three of the study participants preferred this, as opposed to what they viewed
as a precarious ‘rotating’ living arrangement (see page 25):

I don’t think rotating parents’ residence is appropriate. They won’t be
comfortable with this kind of arrangement. I don’t want my children to
move me around when I’m old. My parents-in-law had been used to living at
their own place. Plus, it’s quiet here. (Mrs. Zeng, 39 years old)

My mother-in-law will never move out of here. She knows her neighbor
well, so if she moves to my brother-in-law’s place, she’ll have to build her
social network again. That’s why she didn’t want to move elsewhere. (Mrs.
Liu, 41 years old)

My parents-in-law don’t like to move around. Their friends are all living in
this neighbourhood. Also, they prefer their own bedroom, so they won’t feel
comfortable living elsewhere. (Mrs. Wei, 40 years old)

While alternating the elder’s residence may offer adult offspring a means to “divide”
their filial responsibility, for these families it is not viewed as the best care arrangement.
They find it detrimental to the overall well-being of the elder. However, in one case
where the elder lived primarily with one son and his family, an occasional change in the
elder’s residence was seen as acceptable:

My husband made it clear that it’s not necessary to move parents around.
Now, if my mother-in law wants to stay with my brothers-in-law for a few
days, that’s totally fine, but she mainly lives with us. Also, my brothers-in-
law all live quite close to us and they visit her frequently. (Mrs. Tu, 51 years
old)
When adult sons cannot fulfill their caregiving responsibility, daughters do step in to help their parents. This type of ‘gender transfer of filial care’ from sons to daughters is evident in the second type of living arrangement.

4.1.2 Multiple cohabitation arrangements

In two of the families, parents did not continuously live with the same child, but with different children who provided care at various points in time; I term this ‘multiple cohabitation arrangements’. In one family, two sisters (one is married and the other is single) alternated the housing for their ill mother:

My mom had a surgery on her kidney a few years ago, and I took care of her in the hospital. Then, she broke her hip bone and had another surgery. After she was discharged, she stayed with me for a year and then stayed with my sister for a while. (Miss Lin, 51 years old)

Although daughters are not the primary source of care in Taiwan, that is, only 11.3% of the elders cared for by them in 2009 (see Table 2.3), they serve an important function for certain families when sons fail to fulfill their filial responsibility. In another case, the changing caregiving relationship over a family's life course resulted in multiple cohabitation arrangements:

My mother-in-law used to live with her third son at her old house. Over time, she couldn’t get along with him and his wife.... One day, she stopped eating and became dehydrated. Then, she was hospitalized. Ever since, I’d been looking after her for ten years. At that time, they stopped talking to each other.... Back then, my brother-in-law’s wife was quite busy with her career and I was busy with my own business, so we didn’t really discuss my mother-in-law’s care arrangement. I knew that she didn’t have time to look after her. Plus, they didn’t get along, so I decided to bring her over to my place. It was a smooth transition. (Mrs. Guo, 60 years old)

---

8 Unfortunately, I was not able to find any families in which all the adult offspring are daughters.
Mrs. Guo’s story presents a gendered division of care and a dynamic caregiving relationship. When she took over the care of her mother-in-law from another daughter-in-law, a transfer of filial care between two daughters-in-law occurred. This care transition allowed her to provide adequate care when it was compromised by parent-daughter-in-law conflict. She replaced the other daughter-in-law as a caregiver and provided an alternative living arrangement for the elder in a diplomatic manner. The ‘timing’ of this transition was critical: the focus on apparent job demands as the reason that the other daughter-in-law could not meet the elder’s needs served as a legitimate excuse for her renunciation of this responsibility. Although both the Lin and Guo family shared the evidence of ‘multiple cohabitation arrangement’, their care arrangements are distinct from each other. In the Lin family, living and care arrangements were made by two daughters, whereas in the Guo family, they were arranged by two daughters-in-law. This difference led to different processes of ‘gender transfer of filial care’: One from sons to daughters and the other from sons to daughters-in-law.

4.1.3 From independent living to cohabitation later in life

Unlike the previous 17 cases in which elders continued to live with their son, there were two cases in which elders lived independently for some time and then cohabited with one or more adult offspring later in life. Elders’ declining health and their need for daily care and assistance resulted in such changes in living arrangements. In one case, the precariousness of children’s’ employment was also a factor conducive to cohabitation, making it a mutually beneficial adaptive strategy for both parties:
My son’s work schedule varied from daytime to graveyard shifts. Formerly he worked in Taipei but when he lost his job and because his father’s health deteriorated, he returned home. He can now provide care to his father. (Mrs. Song, 62 years old)

Cohabitation not only facilitates the adult offspring’s provision of care, but can also help to strengthen weak family ties:

After my parents’ divorce, my aunt raised us. We weren’t close to her when we were young, but as we got older, we realized that she was always concerned about us even though she could be hard to get along with… She would lose her temper easily and make everything a big deal, so I didn’t have a happy childhood. After we grew up, we moved out, but I realized that she might feel lonely, so I’d come home quite often and keep her company. When she needed anything, I bought it for her. My brothers also came home during the holidays. Now she is paralyzed, and we feel obligated to care for her. Since she got sick, we all moved back here. It’d be easier to take care of her when we have more people around. (Miss Feng, 36 years old)

Miss Feng’s narrative demonstrates the resurgence of intergenerational bonds that were previously estranged. While living apart, adult offspring slowly re-established emotional ties with the elderly relative. The onset of the elder’s diseases heightens the adult offspring’s sense of filial obligation. Moving back home makes it easier for these adult offspring to more fully engage in caregiving processes.

4.1.4 Independent living

In contrast with the previous category in which families demonstrated a transition in the living arrangement, I included two other families in which the elderly couple was living separately at the time of my fieldwork. Elders’ independent living remains the minority situation in Taiwan. In 2009, only 9.2% of the elderly aged 65 and above lived alone, and 18.8% of them lived with their spouse or common-law partner, whereas over
70% of the elders lived with two or multiple generations (see Table 2.2 in Chapter Two).

One couple described their current living arrangement:

I have three sons and one daughter. They all lived with me and my wife until they found a job elsewhere. Now, they have to work and take care of their own children, so they have little time to look after us. (Mr. Liu, 78 years old)

All of my children and their spouses are working in Taipei. It takes too much time for them to come back and forth. (Mrs. Liu, 75 years old)

Another elder described how he and his ill wife ended up living by themselves:

Interviewer: Is any of your children living with you?
Mr. Xu: After they got married, they all moved out the house.
Interviewer: Mr. Xu, can you tell me why your wife needs long term care?
Mr. Xu: Ten years ago, she had a minor stroke and a major one afterward. After the second episode, she needed someone to provide 24-hour care to her.
Interviewer: Who cared for her before you hired A-yun?
Mr. Xu: I did for one year when she had a minor stroke.

Although these two cases do not represent the most common family living and care arrangement later in life, it is still important to document them; they may exhibit different dynamics of intergenerational ties which cannot be studied by examining the living and care arrangements alone. In general, an elder’s spouse becomes an immediate source of care in the absence of adult offspring.

4.2 Family Negotiation of Care

When an elder first requires care, family members make various adjustments in their lives. I now explore how family members work out or negotiate their share of the care responsibility, particularly through the lens of gender relations in both the household and family context.
Adaptive work-care balance strategy

Family care often means financial costs over time. Most households surveyed in this study had at least one member who temporarily withdrew from the workforce, reduced work hours, changed career paths or took retirement in order to provide care to the dependent elder. I term these employment adjustments ‘adaptive work-care balance strategies.’ One informant shared her family’s adaptive strategy for meeting both elder care and economic needs:

After my father-in-law had a stroke, my husband took a month off from work to care for him. Because he worked for his younger sister, he didn’t have problem getting time off from work. I didn’t have time to look after my father-in-law because of my own business. (Mrs. Zhu, 49 years old)

In this case, the husband had a less stringent work arrangement which allowed him to temporarily exit the workforce to fulfill his filial care responsibility, whereas his wife remained the income earner when care was first required. By contrast, there was one family in which the wife stayed home to care for her mother-in-law while the husband continued to work:

When my mother-in-law became ill, I stayed home to care for her, but when she got better, I returned to work. (Mrs. Chen, 49 years old)

Although The Zhu and Chen families show that the gendered division of care is subject to variation based in part on paid work circumstances, both cases exemplify how sons and daughters-in-law attempt to reduce ‘intergenerational ambivalence’ experienced as a result of their contradictory demands of paid work and filial care responsibilities.

In another case, the self-employed son and daughter-in-law chose to reduce their work hours in order to provide care for the elder:
When my mom first needed care, my wife and I had to reduce our business hours because it’s impossible to work full time while taking care of my mom at the same time. (Mr. Dai, 45 years old)

The Dai family illustrates how a married couple might collectively negotiate a balance between work and elder care.

Another couple took a risk by making a major career transition in order to make both care and work demands manageable:

My husband and I decided to be self-employed, so we could take his mother to the hospital at our own convenience. If we were working for someone else, it’d be hard for us to take days off from work frequently….. My husband’s company had operational problems, so it was good timing for him to leave and start his own business. He couldn’t handle his own business, so I quit my job to help him. Later, we hired two more employees to help us, so we didn’t have to be in the factory all the time. (Mrs. Chang, 45 years old)

Shifting to self-employment allowed Mr. and Mrs. Chang to gain greater levels of work flexibility and autonomy, helping them to meet the elder’s care needs. This is another example of how adult children manage their intergenerational ambivalence over time. During this employment transition, they exercised agency to alleviate the conflict between work and family care. They also took an apparently egalitarian approach to work-care balance.

In another adaptive work-care balance strategy, the son took retirement to meet the care needs of his mother for whom the employed daughter-in-law had previously cared:

My mother-in-law required 24-hour care when I had a full-time job. Back then, I couldn’t handle both work and care. My husband served in the army full time, so he didn’t live with me for fifteen years. Fortunately, he happened to retire when help was needed. (Mrs. Deng, 45 years old)
In this family, the married couple negotiated a caregiving transition after the change in the husband’s employment status. Retirement not only enabled Mr. Deng to fulfill his care responsibility, but also helped his wife to reach a better work-care balance. Also, reverse gender transfer of filial care occurred as the husband assumed his filial caregiving role after years of absence for work.

The above families demonstrate how married couples manage ‘intergenerational ambivalence’ experienced in the competing life domains of paid work and family elder care. They deploy specific adaptive strategies to negotiate the demands from both domains. The outcomes of such negotiations mark the transition in both work and care arrangements. In addition, such work-care negotiations are influenced by the dynamics of gender relations.

Sibling ties and parent care

Although siblings do not necessarily live together, they are often involved in each other’s lives when elderly parents require care, demonstrating the life course principle of linked lives. Negotiation occurs when one seeks collaboration from other siblings; quality of sibling ties, in particular, affects the degree to which this is achieved. In one of the families, strong sibling ties developed early in life eased the distribution of responsibilities when care was required:

My husband’s sisters are always concerned about us and my mother-in-law. Whenever she has serious health problems, they’d return home and help us as much as possible. They’d also discuss my mother-in-law’s health problems together. (Mrs. Chen, 49 years old)

When I was five, my dad passed away, so my mom had to raise five children by herself. My sisters and I have been very close to each other since our
childhood. We’ve never argued or fought. We always support each other.
(Mr. Chen, 49 years old)

Although the primary caregiving responsibility fell on the Chen couple, they continued to
receive support from other siblings. Similar to the Chen family, another family shows
how strong sibling ties ease care collaboration among adult offspring:

Aunty had more than one disease, so it was hard for one person to handle it. My brothers and I are very close to each other, so we want to share this caregiving responsibility together. It’d be unfair to let any one of us assume all the caregiving tasks. (Ms. Feng, 36 years old)

In the Feng family, two brothers and one sister lived together, sharing and alternating
caregiving tasks in order to reduce the burden resulting from around-the-clock care.

By contrast, poor sibling ties developed over time can compromise the quality of
care; I observed this in two of the families. In one case, the elder’s unequal distribution
of family property and assets, which represents another form of fen jia, had caused
tension among adult offspring. This then discouraged them from making collaborative
efforts in helping the elders in need of care:

The way my dad passed down the family assets has damaged our sibling relationship. I don’t know why he only gave money to one of my younger brothers. Everyone in my family thinks it’s unfair…. In his view, we (daughters) didn’t deserve any money. He didn’t give my mom any money either, so none of my brothers feel like caring for her…. I have no choice but to take on this caregiving responsibility. None of my siblings can or want to care for my mom and I don’t want to see her suffering either. (Miss Lin, 51 years old)

Miss Lin’s story demonstrates an incidence of ‘intragenerational ambivalence’
which occurs when a lack of collaboration among siblings and family tensions
disrupt the cultural ideal of cooperative family elder care. In this case, she is the
only one who took the initiative to ensure that her dependent mother received
care. In another family, the sons inherited all of the family assets, and the daughters became less involved in care:

My parents-in-law still believe that sons are more important than daughters, so sons deserve more family wealth than daughters…. That’s why I think my sisters-in-law are not willing to share the cost of the care because the way the family wealth is allocated. Also, they think parent care is sons’ responsibility. After the money was distributed, my sisters-in-law didn’t visit as often as they used to. (Mrs. Wei, 40 years old)

Mrs. Wei’s narrative shows how parents reinforced the ideology of son preference by an unequal distribution of family wealth. As a consequence, the relationship between brothers and sisters is weakened, making adult offspring’s collaboration in care less possible in this family.

Adult offspring typically negotiate help from their siblings, but when siblings fail to provide assistance, the primary caregiving child may resort to other household members. One adult child described this situation:

I had to mobilize everyone from my own family to care for my mom. My younger brother and sisters have their own family, so they provide little assistance in care. Therefore, my wife, children and I all got involved in care. In summer, my kids helped me and my wife to care for their grandmother. (Mr. Dai, a 45-year-old bakery owner)

Siblings constitute an integral part of the family care network, and their family dynamics are an important factor in how care arrangements are configured. How closely their lives are linked and how much collaboration takes place between them depends in part on the quality of their relationship.
4.3 Family Transition to Paid Domestic Care

All the families in this study ultimately employed a foreign live-in care worker. I now explore how this transition from a kinship-based care network to one including a paid helper occurred.

4.3.1 Rationale for hiring a foreign live-in care worker

A family that has hired a foreign live-in care worker has rejected other care options, such as nursing homes. Two participants condemned these as an unacceptable way to fulfill their filial duty:

I totally object to nursing home care. Our parents raised us for years, so it’s our responsibility to take care of them when they’re old. This has been the tradition in our society. Unless we have no choice, we won’t send them to a nursing home. I’d rather hire someone to care for them at home. I can’t accept the living environment of a nursing home even though I’ve never seen one. No matter how busy we are, we should be responsible for parent care. (Mrs. Zhu, 49 years old)

I think the elders should be cared for at home. Having an elder is like having a treasure. We can set up a good role model for the next generation by showing them adult offspring take care of elderly parents. Filial piety is part of our Taiwanese tradition. Unless an elder needs medical attention, we prefer our in-home care. (Mrs. Chang, 45 years old)

For Mrs. Zhu, placing parents in a nursing home was morally inappropriate and contravened the tradition of filial piety; Mrs. Chang perceived in-home care as the ideal care arrangement for the elderly parents, and hoped that this would be carried on to the next generation. On the other hand, two of the participants were less critical of nursing home care:

Placing parents in a nursing home is neither right nor wrong. There are doctors and nurses on site. Patients receive immediate medical attention, so they can be better cared for. Plus, staff are always available to meet their
needs. At home, they may not survive when complication occurs. There’s a higher risk associated with in-home care. In terms of the expense, nursing home care is cheaper than hiring a live-in carer…. We also need to respect the elder’s feelings. If they prefer to live with their families, they may choose home care, but if they don’t want their families to see them suffer, they may choose to stay at a nursing home. (Mr. Dai, 45 years old)

Mr. Dai acknowledged the functions nursing homes serve and highlighted the importance of the elder’s own choice in determining their care arrangement. Another participant expressed a positive attitude toward nursing home care, an option that was, however, not pursued because her husband deemed it inappropriate:

People in a nursing home are often in a similar age group, so they share many life interests and build their social network. Loneliness often comes with old age, so friends are important…. A nursing home is like a school. It provides different activities…. The elderly also receive spiritual support when priests visit them. If they stay home and aren’t visited by their children, their emotional well-being will be affected. On weekdays, they spend time with their friends and on the weekends, their children can pick them up…. So, a nursing home wouldn’t be a bad idea. However, because my husband is against this idea and never thinks about its advantages, we never choose nursing home care. (Mrs. Tu, 51 years old)

The Tu family showed different perceptions of nursing homes: Mrs. Tu was more liberal about them, whereas her husband discounted them as a care option. Despite their different views, they ultimately agreed to hire a foreign live-in care worker.

While remaining committed to preserving the in-home care tradition, families experiencing the physical and mental strain of caregiving may resort to paid home care for temporary relief. One couple shared this experience:

Interviewer: How do you feel about taking care of your mother?
Mr. Chen: It’s exhausting for everyone in my family. My mom’s dementia makes the care more challenging.
Mrs. Chen: Sometimes, she doesn’t recognize us, but sometimes she does. Interviewer: Is her dementia getting worse?
Mrs. Chen: Yes. She had both dementia and some sort of depression, so her situation is a bit complicated. Because of these reasons, we had no choice but to hire someone to look after her.

While making this caregiving transition, Mr. Chen described how he experienced a clash between the cultural ideal of filial piety and the everyday reality:

There’s a saying: When one falls ill for a long time, there’s no dutiful son. Each of us has our own social life, so it’s impossible to stay home caring for a parent every day.... We don’t want to send her to a nursing home, but we also need time to relax and do our own thing. (Mr. Chen, 49 years old)

The Chen family experienced a caregiving dilemma. They encountered a limitation in their ability to perform filial care for a long-ill parent, yet they insisted on keeping the elder at home. For them, hiring a live-in care worker was the best way to resolve that dilemma.

For another family, in-home care was preferred over nursing homes simply for ‘convenience’:

It’s more convenient to look after mom at home. I can check her condition and see her every day. If she stayed in a nursing home, I have to go there and it’s a hassle to travel between here and there. (Mr. Mo, 48 years old)

As families navigate alternative care options, cost is often a major consideration.

Typically, family members make a cost-benefit appraisal by comparing two or more care arrangements. One participant commented:

My wife and I were debating whether we should hire a local care worker or a wailao. After I compared both costs, a wailao is fifty percent cheaper than a Taiwanese care worker. (Mr. Dai, 45 years old)

Another family did not consider a foreign live-in care worker until they realized the higher cost of employing a native-born caregiver:

A Taiwanese care worker we used to have cost us too much, so we decided to hire a foreign one. We didn’t think of it ahead of time because we
thought we only needed a helper for two months. Also, we didn’t know that my father-in-law’s health condition would deteriorate. (Mrs. Qu, 49 years old)

The Qu family had undergone multiple caregiving transitions since the elder became ill.

Each care arrangement serves a different purpose at a specific point in time. This reveals a dynamic caregiving process which involves an ongoing series of adjustments geared towards meeting family care needs.

4.3.2 Negotiation for an alternative care arrangement

How does a family reach the decision to hire a foreign live-in care worker? For the most part, this decision is negotiated between various family members, a process which in turn shapes both intragenerational and inter-generational relations and cause shifts in family dynamics. This particular type of negotiation is essential to understanding how a caregiving transition is intertwined with family ties which may change over the life course.

Negotiation with siblings

In this study, negotiations concerning paid home care often occurred between the son who cohabited with the elder and other siblings. Whether a consensus took place regarding care worker recruitment depended on the levels of siblings’ involvement:

Interviewer: How did you come to hire a foreign live-in care worker?
Mr. Chen: Initially, I discussed it with my sisters and told them that mom might refuse to go to a nursing home. The other option was to hire someone to care for her at home. If we didn’t do that, whoever cares for my mom would eventually suffer from depression. They accepted my reasoning and agreed that I should hire a live-in care worker.
Interviewer: Can you tell me about the decision of hiring a foreign care worker?
Mr. Ji: Yes. I first discussed this option with my sister though I knew it was inevitable. I first came up with some plans and then told her what I would do before seeking her approval.
Interviewer: Did your brothers agree with your plans too?
Mr. Ji: Yes, but they left this up to me to decide, but we still wanted to have every sibling’s consent and this is important.

Mr. Chen and Mr. Ji exemplified sibling negotiations on paid care. As the primary caregiver, they took the lead by proposing the recruitment of a live-in caregiver to their siblings. Both considered their siblings’ views prior to the recruitment. However, in one of the families when negotiation involved sharing the cost, siblings showed ‘passive consent’:

I considered my younger siblings’ thoughts regarding paid home care. However, they asked me to make the decision because I’m the oldest child in the family. They knew that I’d pay for it, but I’d prefer them to cover some of it. (Mr. Dai, 45 years old)

Mr. Dai intended to get his siblings involved in alterative care. However, his expectation of shared cost discouraged them from being part of it, leaving him to assume the cost.

The decision to hire a care worker did not only involve the son and his siblings; in many cases, the daughter-in-law who cohabited with the elder also participated in the decision making process:

We felt it necessary to have someone to prepare my parents-in-law’s meals and meet their daily needs. That’s why we hired a wailao. (Mrs. Tu, 51 years old)

My husband, brother-in-law and his wife and I are all working right now. My two daughters are working and the younger one is still at school, so no one has time to care for my father-in-law at home. After my husband and I discussed with my brother-in-law, we then decided to hire a live-in care worker. (Mrs. Zhu, 49 years old)
Negotiation with the elder

In some families, in addition to adult offspring and their spouses, elders are also involved in the negotiation process. In one of the families, adult offspring attempted to ‘work out’ the alternative care with the elder to whom they expressed concerns and justified the need for hiring a live-in care worker:

I told my mom, “When I leave you home alone, I can’t be carefree because no one can assist you when you need help.” I also told her that many adult offspring are hiring someone to look after their elderly parents. (Mr. Wang, 58 years old)

In another family, the elder feared of being abused by the live-in care worker:

Initially, my mother-in-law didn’t like the idea of having a care worker to look after her. She heard that many would abuse the elder when the employers were away. After negotiating with her, she was willing to give it a try. (Mrs. Wei, 40 years old)

Despite the elder’s fear of physical abuse by the foreign worker, the Wei family managed to convince the elderly mother to accept this alternative care arrangement.

Absence of family negotiation on paid care

Family did not always negotiate alternative care. This was observed in a family with a damaged sibling relationship. In one family, one of the sons, the major family inheritance recipient, employed a foreign live-in care worker for his elderly parents without having his siblings involved:

One of my younger brothers and his wife got most of the inheritance from my dad… I can say my father’s unequal distribution of inheritance ruined our family relationship…..Instead of providing care to my parents, they simply hired a wailao. (Miss Lin, 51 years old)

The lack of negotiation was also evident in a spouse-only family care network. In two of the families in which all the adult offspring had moved away from home years ago, the
spouse became the initial caregiver and the sole decision-maker for hiring a foreign live-in care worker:

About six years ago, she had kidney stones and had a few surgeries. Her spine had some problems too, so she couldn’t walk properly. All of my children haven’t been around much because of work and 6 years ago, I had a small business to do, so I couldn’t stay home all the time. That’s why I hired a foreign live-in care worker to care for my wife. (Mr. Liu, 78 years old)

All of my children moved out after they got married. Ten years ago, my wife had a minor stroke and a major one afterward. After the second episode, she needed 24-hour care. I looked after her for one year, but eventually I hired a foreign live-in care worker by myself. (Mr. Xu, 90 years old)

These participants indicate that family negotiation of alternative care is not a homogeneous process. Quality and history of family relationships, living arrangements and geographic proximity and career choice, also shape the degree to which family members are involved in the negotiation.

4.3.3 A summary of care transitions

Based on the above analysis, I have created a summary of caregiving trajectories to present the range of family care transitions. Figure 4.2 shows three different trajectories that led families to the same outcome of hiring a foreign live-in care worker. Type One represents the most common pattern of care transition to live-in care; initially, the elder or elders cohabit with their primary providers, a son and his wife, (except in two cases, where this task falls to an individual son in one instance and two brothers and one sister in the other). The quality of sibling ties influences whether the son receives help from his siblings. In response to the competing demands of care and paid work, adult offspring make work-related adjustments to meet the elder’s care needs. The demand
for around-the-clock care prompts the search for a long-term solution. Following a series of family negotiations, families desirous of cost-effective in-home care consider hiring a foreign live-in care worker.

Types Two and Three capture slightly different caregiving trajectories. In Type Two, the daughter, and in Type Three, the spouse, provide primary care when sons (or, in Type 3, all the adult offspring) offer limited assistance to the elder. At this point, one primary agent emerges to assume caregiving responsibilities. Work-care conflict does not apply to either type when the primary caregiver is unemployed or retired; the elder’s need for 24-hour care makes alternative care necessary. In these circumstances, families are also in favour of in-home care, leading to the employment of a foreign live-in care worker. Family negotiations of alternative care do not occur in Type Two because of inter-generational conflict, and in Type Three due to adult offspring’s absence.

**Figure 4.2: The Process of Seeking Paid In-Home Care**

**Type One (19 cases)**

Diagram:
- **Family Care**
  - Care by a son/daughter-in-law
  - Work-care conflict
  - Help from siblings (quality of relationship)
- **Transitioning to Paid in-Home Care**
  - Work-care balance strategy
  - Growing need for care
  - Justifying paid care
  - Negotiating with siblings
  - Negotiating with the elder and siblings
  - Hiring a foreign live-in care worker (long-term solution)
  - Passive consensus
4.4 The Employment of a Foreign Live-in Care Worker

I now explore what the hiring of the foreign live-in care worker involves. My data presented below focused on the recruitment process, the family negotiation of the worker’s salary and the consequences and changes created by the arrival of the worker.

4.4.1 Recruitment process

The role of physicians in paid domestic care

In order for families to employ a foreign care worker, their dependent elder must pass a medical examination. Government-designated physicians certify that an elder's health has deteriorated to the point that 24-hour care has become necessary. Medical professionals are thus an initial gatekeeper for the entry of foreign care workers:
Interviewer: How long did your aunt stay in the hospital after she had a stroke?
Miss Feng: She was there for two months. Half of her body was paralyzed and she couldn’t look after herself. It was only when she sufficiently recovered that our doctor advised that she could return home and he certified that her condition now qualified her for the hiring of a foreign live-in carer. Since that lightened our burden, we followed our doctor’s advice and hired a foreign live-in carer.

It was not until my wife's health deteriorated and her doctor was then able to issue me a certificate indicating a "major health disorder" that she qualified for hiring a live-in care worker and I could make a request for one. (Mr. Xu, 90 years old)

These two cases show that the medical community not only legitimizes the foreign live-in caregiver program, but also facilitates Taiwanese families in adopting this alternative care arrangement.

*The role of labour brokers in paid domestic care*

Labour brokers also play a role in introducing foreign care workers to private households. As a profit-driven organization, they use various means to meet their clients’ needs. The Government's strict medical criteria often pose an obstacle to families who wish to employ a live-in caregiver. However, in some cases, at the family’s request, brokers can step in to ease or simplify the medical assessment process, even in cases where the family was initially deemed ineligible.

Our broker helped us to process the recruitment of a foreign live-in care worker. Back then, my mother-in-law’s health didn’t qualify for 24-hour care, but our broker found a way to bypass the stringent medical requirement, so we could hire one. (Mrs. Chang, 45 years old)

It took my mother almost five months to meet the minimum medical requirement for hiring a foreign live-in carer. My broker helped us to speed up the application process. (Mr. Wang, 58 years old)
Finding a suitable care worker involves a series of decisions. The worker is ultimately selected based on preferred attributes, such as country of origin, cultural practices and diet. These preferences are strongly influenced by how foreign workers are perceived by the receiving country. In particular, brokers may associate particular dispositional characteristics, for instance, 'attitude' and behavioural tendencies, with workers from different ethnic origins and direct the clients accordingly. In part because brokers often promote workers along ethnic lines, employers tend to stereotype potential workers from different countries; for instance, Filipinos are educated and speak English, and Vietnamese are docile and hard working. These socially constructed attributes are expected by employers prior to the worker’s arrival. Hence, certain ethnic or national groups are considered more desirable and are more likely to be hired than others:

My co-worker’s sister happened to be a recruitment agent. She suggested Vietnamese workers to me because they are unsophisticated and their diet and religion are similar to ours. Many Indonesians don’t eat pork, so preparing meals for them can be inconvenient. There’re many Thai workers in Taiwan, so they are more likely to hang out with each other frequently. Therefore, we fear that they may pay less attention to their work. (Miss Feng, 36 years old)

To meet clients’ needs and preferences, brokers also profile workers based on age and whether she has children. For some employers, age indicates levels of maturity and work ethic. They may also favor one with mothering experience, which they represent as entailing the ability to express love, concern and patience to vulnerable family members:

I told my agent that I preferred a worker who has motherly characteristics. I was afraid that a young worker may not have something in common with my
aunt and this young-old carer-cared for relationship may be awkward. If my aunt needs her diaper changed, she may feel too embarrassed to tell the young worker. I think my aunt will feel more comfortable with a mature worker. Also, I think middle-aged workers are more committed to work than younger workers and are better at understanding older people’s needs and communicating with them. (Miss Feng, 36 years old)

Brokers ‘customize’ the care worker to fit individual families’ preference. Workers’ attributes thus become ‘marketable’ to their potential employers.

*Internal transfer of care worker*

Families do not always approach brokers to find an ideal worker. Kin networks can also facilitate the recruitment process. Two families in this study hired a foreign caregiver from an extended family member who no longer needed home care services after an elder’s passing. Timing is essential for this employment transition. According to one participant, care workers who are transferred ‘internally’ are considered more trustworthy and reliable than those who are employed through the regular channels:

My son’s mother-in-law introduced A- tsuen to me. She took care of her father before he passed away. My son asked me if we should transfer A- tsuen to our family. Because A- tsuen was introduced by my son’s mother-in-law, I didn’t doubt her quality of care. If we hire someone else, we may worry if she can take good care of my husband because we can’t get any reference at all. My son met A- tsuen a few times when his grandfather-in-law was still alive. His mother-in-law also told us that A- tsuen is a good person, so we hired her to take care of my husband. (Mrs. Song, 62 years old)

My husband’s aunt was cared for by a Vietnamese worker, but then she passed away. We knew that that worker had to find a new employer, so his aunt’s family asked us if we wanted to hire her. We then discussed with our broker and we were allowed to hire her. (Mrs. Liu, 45 years old)

Negotiations of alternative care arrangements extend beyond the family context.

Although the foreign live-in caregiver program is a state-regulated policy, data from
participants indicate that recruitment does not directly involve the state; non-government actors, such as medical professionals and brokers, can either block or facilitate the entry of the foreign care workers into the private household.

4.4.2 Negotiating the cost of paid care

Families in this study adopted different approaches to cover the cost of paid care. Unless family members choose not to get involved, the cost of a worker’s salary is usually split between sons. Data exhibit four general options. First, two of the families shared the cost based on each individual sibling’s financial standing: those who are financially stronger contribute a bigger portion of the cost than those who are not:

My brothers and I split the worker’s salary, but each of us pays a different amount. We evaluate everyone’s financial standing to decide who should pay more. If one has a financial difficulty, we don’t force him to pay. One of my brothers has passed away, so we don’t count him. (Mr. Li, 63 years old)

My twin brother and I can afford to hire a foreign worker. My second older brother has a financial difficulty, so we don’t mind paying the worker’s salary by ourselves. (Mr. Wang, 58 years old)

In both families, the negotiation of cost only involved brothers with better financial standing; this exemplifies the concept of ‘distributive justice’ and shows how sons’ different economic positions influence their varying involvements in filial care.

Second, in some cases, sons who shared a mutual fund split the worker’s salary equally. In one family, this mutual fund was set up specifically to pay for the cost of hired help:

My husband and his two older brothers have a joint fund. Each of them set aside one million NT dollars to pay for my parents-in-law’s daily expenses. The fund also covers the cost of hiring a live-in care worker. They have been doing this for three years. (Mrs. Wei, 40 years old)
In this family, the equal sharing of the cost resulted from *fen jia*. According to Mrs. Wei, her father-in-law had previously allocated family assets equally to each of his three sons before care was required. In comparison with the Li family, married daughters in both families were not involved in sharing the cost as they no longer belonged to the natal family after marriage. However, exceptions did exist, and sisters stepped in to provide assistance to their sole brother or to the brother receive little support from other male siblings:

Interviewer: Can you tell me what kind of help your sisters offer to you?
Mr. Chen: They don’t offer personal care to my mom, but they help me to pay some of the cost.

Interviewer: How do you pay for the worker’s salary?
Mr. Ji: My sister and I share the cost of the worker’s salary. I pay two thirds and she pays one third.
Interviewer: What about your younger brothers?
Mr. Ji: Well, if they can contribute a little bit, I’ll really appreciate them. Each of us has different financial standings, so I don’t ask my brothers to pay the cost; I leave it up to them. I don’t want to cause any conflict in my family because of the money issue. It will make our sibling relationship awkward.

In both families, daughters voluntarily provided financial help to the brother who shouldered the primary caregiving responsibility. Mr. Ji adopted a neutral approach instead of soliciting assistance from his younger brothers, preserving a harmonious relationship with them despite his frustration with their failure to contribute to the cost of elder care. Unequal processes of *fen jia* led to the third type of payment arrangement: In one family, one of the sons received the bulk of the family’s assets and paid for the worker’s salary alone:
I have three brothers in my family and my dad was supposed to distribute his wealth and assets to them, but my second brother and his wife somehow convinced him to transfer all the assets to them.... After receiving the money, he hired a *wailao* to take care of my dad and pay for her salary. (Miss Lin, 51 years old)

The uneven allocation of wealth accounted for the Lin family’s payment arrangement.

As the primary heir of family wealth, Miss Lin’s second brother thus assumed the whole cost of paid care.

Sharing the financial cost of care is often a sensitive matter that can potentially create intragenerational tensions. The third type of cost negotiation thus involved only a son and daughter-in-law who assumed the cost to avoid any conflict that might be caused by the monetary issue:

We were willing to cover the cost, so we wouldn’t have to bother other siblings. If we chose to split the cost with other siblings, we might create family conflict. (Mrs. Guo, 60 years old)

The division of filial care among siblings commonly observed in Taiwanese families did not apply to the Guo family, who chose to take on the primary care responsibility and its cost as a strategy to prevent unnecessary family tension. As was the case for Mr. Ji, maintaining family harmony was the Guo couple's highest priority, influencing their choices about elder care provision.

Fourth, when siblings choose not to contribute to the cost, the primary caregiving adult child is forced to assume it. One participant reflected on this situation:

As our society develops and becomes more urbanized, our family relationship gradually weakens.... When nothing happens, we seem to have a good relationship, but when we need financial assistance, they all keep away from us.... Honestly, I’d prefer my siblings to pay some of the cost, but they told me that they can’t contribute any. (Mr. Dai, 45 years old)
Mr. Dai’s comment describes multiple aspects of his relationship with his siblings. On one level, they appeared to be closely connected, but on another, they became distant, especially when financial assistance was needed. The family support network appeared weakened.

This part of the analysis demonstrates how family negotiation continues even after the worker’s arrival. In addition to family history (e.g., *fen jia*) and sibling ties, class (e.g., financial status of adult offspring) and gender proscriptions (the filial role of son, daughter and daughter-in-law) also shape the negotiation dynamics.

**4.4.3 After the care worker’s arrival**

Most of the employers in this study provided job training to their newly arrived workers (if they had no prior caregiving experiences) to ensure proper care. Such training is highly gendered and typically performed by women. In one of the families, the younger sister with her two older brothers jointly employed the worker, but she was the one who provided the training:

A-jin received basic training prior to her arrival, but I still had to teach her every single task, such as changing the diaper, feeding and tell her what she needed to be aware of regarding my aunt’s daily life.... The other thing I had to teach her is how to use the vacuum cleaner because in Vietnam, very few people have seen it, so I wanted to ensure she knew how to use it. Other than that, I didn’t have to remind her and she’d do her job adequately. (Miss Feng, 36 years old)

In another family, the daughter-in-law used her own income to outsource the training by hiring a local female domestic trainer:

She was my father-in-law’s old employee who I’ve known for years.... Because I couldn’t stay home and teach A-bei every single task, I hired her to train A-bei for three months. She also taught A-bei how to make
Taiwanese dishes…. Once A-bei knew all the tasks, that lady would come less frequently. (Mrs. Chang, 45 years old)

Mrs. Chang’s financial power allowed her to employ a local worker to train one from Vietnam, highlighting her advantageous class position; this process created multiple interpersonal ties within the private home space.

For the vast majority of the families, the dependent elder continues to live with one son after the worker’s arrival. For two of the families, cohabitation, however, involved multiple households because two of the sons agreed to share care and alternate the housing of their parent after they jointly employed the worker:

When we hired A-Chin years ago, my brother and I decided that my mom stayed at each of our places for a month and we took turns caring for her. A-chin thus spent one month with my brother and another with me. (Mr. Qu, 55 years old)

My twin brother and I always take turns caring for my mom….When she first needed care, she lived with me at that time because my brother was renovating his house. After the renovation, then mom moved back there…. We’ve been doing this for seven years so far. It’s totally up to my mom. She decides with whom she wants to live. (Mr. Wang, 58 years old)

In the Qu family, adult offspring negotiated and predetermined the length of cohabitation, whereas the elder in the Wang family had autonomy in deciding her own living arrangement.

Adult offspring are not freed of their care responsibility after the worker’s arrival; rather, family members typically incorporate the additional helper into the family care network. Thus, shared care occurs and the existing household division of care becomes further divided. Employers engage primarily in more routine household support (e.g., grocery shopping, transportation aid) rather than personal care (e.g., bathing, feeding,
or toileting), whereas the worker is typically responsible for the more burdensome and ‘dirty’ tasks:

My mom has a problem with her intestines, so her bowl movements don’t work properly. Thus, someone has to give her an enema. Many sons and daughters can’t perform this task, but *wailao*, with their proper training and their self-awareness of being *wailao*, are willing to do it and they do a good job too. (Mr. Dai, 45 years old)

In other cases, employers also relied on their experienced workers to perform technical care:

Interviewer: Can you tell me how A-tsuen takes care of your husband?
Mrs. Song: She takes charge of his daily activity, including removing mucous from his lungs with a special machine that helps him to breathe.
Interviewer: Did you teach her how to use that machine?
Mrs. Song: She’s better at using it than I am. I also learned how to remove mucous for my husband from her. Before she arrived, I neither knew how to do it nor did it properly.

While shared care was common for families that employed a foreign worker, how the employer and the worker negotiated the division of care varied considerably. In two of the families, employers simply took over the care from their workers to reduce their workload:

My older sister (the Vietnamese worker who was the older sister of the female employer) cares for my mother-in-law during the day. After work, my husband and I help her out at night. (Mrs. Zeng, 39 years old)

My father lives with my mom, older brother and sister-in-law. They take care of him together and keep him company on a daily basis. We need A-sheng’s assistance only when my dad stays in the hospital. My brother and sister-in-law can’t stay with him in the hospital twenty-four hours because they have to work. When they have time, they’ll go to the hospital, take over the care from A-sheng and let her take a break. (Mrs. Liu, 41 years old)
In these two families, the employers’ help was in favor of their workers. In another two cases, employers had no choice but to provide additional care because the worker could not meet the growing demand of care alone:

We were quite busy when my parents-in-law were sick at the same time. Back then, my husband and A-hua had to go to the hospital and take care of my mother-in-law during the day. At night, A-hua returned home and helped us to look after my father-in-law. (Mrs. Deng, 45 years old)

When my mom was hospitalized, our wailao stayed with her at all times. We (adult offspring) would prepare and deliver food to our mother and take turns visiting her. If she requires a major medical examination, we have to be with her. When she’s ready for discharge, we have to be with her too. (Mr. Li, 63 years old)

Another type of division of care occurred when adult offspring provided emotional support to their elderly parent while he/she was looked after by the care worker. One participant commented:

Many elders are alone because their partners have passed away. Then they may find their lives meaningless or unimportant, but when we hire someone to look after them, they realize that we still care about them....Everyone in my family must express our concerns to my mother-in-law. We want her to be happy and optimistic instead of being emotional and passive all the time. (Mrs. Tu, 51 years old)

While detailing the nature of shared-care arrangements, another employer also discussed the significance of emotional support:

To take good care of a sick family member entails three different areas that must work together. First, care costs money and second, the sick must hold a strong will to live. Third, the sick need family’s emotional support. These three components are equally important; care cannot be delivered without one of them. Right now, my mom needs the care worker’s assistance wherever she goes. (Mr. Dai, 45 years old)

Mr. Dai provided a holistic view of care that involved the efforts of both familial and non-familial caregivers.
4.5 Summary

Interview data show the prevalence of the continuous multi-generational living arrangements in Taiwan. In a small number of cases, multiple cohabitation arrangements and intergenerational re-cohabitation later in life serve important needs for some families. In many cases, sibling collaboration in parent care is an important factor in shaping how families negotiate their care obligations; levels of collaboration, in turn, are affected by the quality of sibling ties. Nonetheless, the most typical filial care relationship involves the elder and one particular son with his wife; daughters only take over the filial responsibility when sons cannot fulfill their caregiving role. This social practice reinforces Taiwan’s patrilineal structure of parent care arrangements.

My analysis produced ways in which family members ‘work out’ their filial care responsibility while participating in the labour forces; this provides a perfect example of how adult offspring manage their intergenerational ambivalence experienced later in life. Although the family members I interviewed varied considerably in the configuration of their care networks, strength of kinship ties, and caregiving negotiations, they all made the same care transition: purchasing care services through the recruitment of a foreign live-in care worker. After the worker’s arrival, family negotiations continued to determine payment arrangements for the worker’s salary. Further, family incorporation of the worker into the care network leads to a shared care arrangement involving both formal and informal caregivers. Nevertheless, a division of care between the employers and the worker remains. How this division shapes the complex relationship dynamics in the household is explored further in the next chapter.
Chapter 5: RELATIONSHIP DYNAMICS WITH THE CARE WORKER

Chapter Four explored living and care arrangements that eventually lead families to recruit a foreign care worker. This chapter shifts the focus to the relationship dynamics which involve the employer, the care worker, the elder and other household members. To begin, I examine domestic labour relations by constructing a typical employer-worker relationship trajectory, with particular attention to how these two parties negotiate work and care. Next, I explore worker-elder relationships to show how the presence of the worker reconfigures the family caregiving relationship over time. Then, I document various sources of caregiving conflict. The analysis considers dyadic (that is, worker-elder and worker-employer) and triadic (that is, worker-elder-employer or worker-employer-employer’s sibling) relationships, and attempts to identify their common threads and the social implications which emerge from them. The purpose of this chapter is to (1) explore the relationship between domestic employment and family care, and (2) to reveal family ties and caregiving dynamics after the worker’s arrival.

5.1 Domestic Labour Relations

5.1.1 Employer-worker relationship trajectory

Domestic employment is more than an economic transaction between the service provider and the household that needs it. It also comprises complex social relationships embedded in the structured relations of class, gender, race, ethnicity and nationality. How these relationships evolve and transition over time requires careful examination.
At the first encounter, one third of the workers who participated in this research described experiencing nervousness, anxiety and fear of their employers:

Interviewer: Were you afraid of your employer when you first arrived?
A-dan: Of course. I was afraid that if I didn’t meet his expectation, he might send me back home. I didn’t want this happen to me.
While some employers may treat us well, others may not be so friendly. If I have a bad employer, I don’t think I can stay for too long. (A-jin⁹, 51 years old)

If I had a bad employer, I wouldn’t want to work here any longer. I’d go home or run away. (Xao-ba, 38 years old)

Employers also expressed apprehension, especially when they feared that their workers might abuse the elder or disappear unexpectedly¹⁰:

Interviewer: How did you feel about A-tsuen when she first arrived?
Mrs. Song: Back then, we didn’t know her well and people often warned that we had to be careful about foreign workers because some of them might abuse the elder.

Interviewer: Can you tell me about your relationship with A-chao since her arrival?
Mrs. Chen: Initially, we didn’t know each other well, so I was afraid that she might run away.

To reduce anxiety, one of the employers addressed that concern to the worker immediately after her arrival:

I told A-chao if she ran away, I had to deal with many problems. When I first hired her, Vietnamese workers had the highest runaway rate. She came with three other workers. They all disappeared even though the elders they

⁹ In this study, all the care worker participants did not use their Vietnamese first name. After their arrival, their employer gave them a Chinese name which was closely translated from Vietnamese and easier for members of the Taiwanese household to remember.

¹⁰ The National Immigration Agency (2009) reported that Vietnamese domestic workers, in comparison to those from other countries, had the highest run-away rate in the early 2000s. An employer who reports a worker missing must wait for a certain period of time before he or she is allowed to recruit a replacement. This can cause inconvenience and interrupt the planned care arrangement.
cared for were relatively healthy. I was quite lucky and believe that A-chao is meant to be with us. Before hiring her, I prayed a lot. I heard that many wailao stole stuff or had bad attitudes. (Mrs. Chen, 49 years old)

Building trust was a common goal in the early employer-worker relationship. Typically, the employer made daily observations of the worker to determine whether they were compatible. Two interviewees commented:

When she first arrived, we barely knew her, so I waited and saw if we could get along.... In the first two months, I also observed her behavior. (Mrs. Zhu, 49 years old)

When she first arrived, we listed things she had to do on the daily basis. We then observed her for a while before we could trust her. (Mrs. Chang, 45 years old)

Another interviewee recalled how his worker gained his full trust:

One time, I dropped my wallet in the garage before work. A-xiang found it and asked me if it was mine after I returned. I appreciated the fact that she didn’t have any bad intention of possessing it. Another time, my sister dropped two paper bills in the washroom and she found them and returned them to her. That’s why we don’t have to worry about her when we are not home. After my daily observation of her, she has gained my full trust. (Mr. Wang, 58 years old)

Both the worker and the employer initially underwent necessary transitions to ensure the elder received good care. These included the worker’s adaptation and the employer’s training of the employee. To fit into the host family, workers must first acquire a new language, culture and customs. Most workers initially encounter a language barrier that reduces work productivity and quality of communication with the employer. To improve productivity and daily communication, workers found it necessary to enhance their language skills:
Interviewer: A-su, do you find your work difficult?
A-su: Yes, not because of the job itself, but my initial language barrier prevented me from doing things properly at the beginning.

When I first came here, I didn’t speak Mandarin or Taiwanese well, so it was difficult for me to communicate with my employer. After I improved my language skill, I could talk with him more often especially when I take a break from caring for his mom. (A-mei, 40 years old)

Learning the dietary preferences of the host family was also necessary for workers; they had to match the tastes of employers instead of making the kinds of food eaten in their home country. During this acculturation process, some of the employers informed their workers of specific needs and concerns:

When she first arrived, it wasn’t her fault that she failed to meet our expectations; she had to adjust to differences in customs, lifestyle and cuisine. As we worked with her, she gradually learned about our preferences. For instance, her preference was salty food; now we’re getting older, so we try to avoid it. At first, she tended to forget that, but now she understands. (Mr. Liu, 78 years old)

Interviewer: Mrs. Deng, did A-hua’s cooking suit your family’s taste?
Mrs. Deng: Basically, my family isn’t overly picky about it, but if her cooking doesn’t suit our taste, I’d tell her our preference and she adjusted her cooking accordingly.

One worker described how she fit herself into the host family through food preparation on daily and special occasions:

Interviewer: How do A-gong and his family feel about your cooking?
A-nan: They enjoy the food I make. A-gong taught me how to make the dishes he likes and now I can make them myself. During major festivals, his sons buy the ingredients and I am in charge of food preparation. A-gong trusts my cooking because I’ve been here for years.

Besides job training (as discussed in Chapter Four), five of the employers in this study also provided comfort to their workers to reduce the emotional difficulties that
occurred during this period of adjustment. They often personalized their relationship with workers and made them feel at ‘home’. This socially constructed ‘home’ was particularly important during workers’ early adaptation process:

*A-ma has three daughters-in-law and they are all very helpful…. They treat me very well and I really appreciate their help. They knew I was homesick, so they comforted me.* (A-hui, 40 years old)

*When A-zhen first arrived here, it was the Chinese New Year. I saw her crying and told her, “Please don’t cry. You should consider here like your home and we’re like your own family. You can treat me like your sister. My husband is like your older brother. A-gong can be your dad in Taiwan.” (Mrs. Zhu, 49 years old)*

*If we were to put ourselves into Yuan-yuan’s shoes, we’d understand all the hardship she has undergone. Imagine if we were her, we had to come here and earn money and were mistreated by our employer; that would probably make us miserable. Thus, we should treat her with respect and see her like part of our family.* (Mrs. Liu, 75 years old)

Mrs. Zhu and Mrs. Liu showed their empathetic understanding of the hardships experienced by migrant workers and provided a friendly, welcoming and quasi-familial work environment to alleviate emotional difficulties.

The social construction of “being at home” is also facilitated by performative utterances.

Data show that both parties preferred to address each other by kinship titles:

*When our wailao first arrived, it’s important to treat her like our own family. If we didn’t do that, we would have a problem in the future. When she arrived, I asked her to call us “Papa” and “Mama.” She later realized that we treated her well and asked us if she could call us “papa” and mama” I responded, “Of course, you’re supposed to treat us like your own parents! You take care of us and we’ll do the same to you.”* (Mr. Liu, 78 years old)

*Because we treat her like our own family, she feels it necessary to protect and care about us. This also improves her sense of well-being.* (Mrs. Liu, 75 years old)
Mr. and Mrs. Liu exercised ‘instrumental personalism’ (see page 70) to establish and maintain harmony with Yuan-yuan. Both parties cultivated a sense of mutual caring.

Four other employers in this study also deployed this strategy to enhance a good work and family environment. One of them even explicitly disregarded the employer-worker status hierarchy and preferred to think of her relationship with the worker as familial:

Ever since her arrival, we’ve never treated A-jin like a worker. Her broker asked her to call us either “sir” or “madam”, but we don’t like to be called this way. We’ve never had this master-servant relationship, so we asked her to call our name. This status hierarchy makes us uncomfortable. Now she calls me mei-me (younger sister) and my brothers by their names. (Miss Feng, 36 years old)

The Lius and the Fengs practice what can be described as a type of ‘boundary work’ (see page 68) that alters the initial formal employer-worker relationship. For workers, using kinship titles allows them to redefine themselves in the host family. One of the workers reflected on this view:

I called my employer ‘Mama’ spontaneously because I didn’t want to feel distant from her and other family members or see myself as a stranger. (A-xian, 35 years old)

A-xian showed a status-seeking initiative as she identified herself as more than an employee. In another situation, the worker treated her employers just like her own brothers and sisters. However, for her this fictive kinship remained only in the private household:

In public, I call my employers ‘boss’ to show them my respect, but, at home I call them ‘big brother’ or ‘second brother’ if they’re older than me. A-gong has two younger sons; I call them by first name. (A-mei, 47 years old)

The employer and the worker constantly negotiate social boundaries as their relationship evolves. The employer-worker and the emerging quasi-familial relationship
are intertwined in the private space of care and shape the dynamics of domestic employment.

Some employers believed that when living under the same roof, developing emotional intimacy and a quasi-familial bond with the worker was inevitable. One participant commented:

I treat A-tang like my own sister. We live together, so there’s more or less emotional attachment. If we treat her like an outsider and always suspect that she may steal stuff, inevitably there’ll be a social distance between us. Even if we don’t say it aloud, she can still feel it. After all, we are emotional beings. (Mr. Dai, 45 years old)

Mr. Dai developed a trusting, quasi-familial relationship with A-tang to maintain a harmonious employer-worker cohabitation relationship.

One of the workers in this study sustained a quasi-familial tie with her previous employer, even after working for another family:

After moving into my new employer’s house for two months, my previous employer’s wife phoned and asked me if everyone in the new family treated me well. We still keep in touch with each other. A-mа’s another daughter-in-law also calls me frequently. She always says “Happy Chinese New Year” to me! One of A-mа’s daughters, who I called, Auntie, also phoned and asked me if my new employer was nice to me. She talked to A-gong (the current employer) and made sure everything was alright. (A-nan, 39 years old)

This narrative shows that in some cases, even after the termination of the employment relationship, the quasi-familial relationship previously developed remains and provides emotional support to the worker despite their changed work and living situation.

The cultivation of intimacy, emotional bonds and quasi-familial ties are all conducive to family integration of the worker. In domestic employment, integration refers to the stage at which the employer attempts to cultivate a sense of belonging to the host
family in the worker. I found evidence of some form of this integration in 16 of the families. Two of the workers commented on this:

When I first arrived, A-gong showed me around. Five years ago, he once introduced me to his friends and jokingly told them I was his youngest daughter. From then on, I knew he already considered me part of his family.... He never told his friends that I was his wailao. (A-mei, 44 years old)

I feel that I have become part of this family. My bosses told me that I’m like their daughter. They asked me not to worry about anything, but to take good care of A-gong and A-ma. If anything were to go wrong, I would call them and they would handle it. They don’t see me as a wailao or treat me as an outsider. I’m like anyone else in the family. (A-ling, 40 years old)

Both workers made reference to the term wailao. In Chinese, wai means outside or foreign and lao means labour. Wailao typically denotes a ‘foreigner hired to perform low-paying, unskilled work’, highlighting the social exclusion of the person to whom it is applied. Members of the employing family who use a kinship title, such as daughter, attempt to alleviate the feeling of distance that this term connotes.

The employer’s inquiry about the worker’s own family and the worker’s willingness to share their news are also signs of family integration:

Interviewer: Do you ever ask A-nan about her family in Vietnam?
Mr. Mo: Yes, I do. I ask her if her husband and children are doing well at home. I also want to know their living condition. I know they call each other very often, so she doesn’t feel homesick all the time and she can focus on caring for my mom.

Not only do we ask about her life in Vietnam, she’d share it with us too. I think it’s because she feels that she’s been included as part of this family, she’s very willing to share her personal life with us. (Mrs. Chang, 45 years old)

By contrast, there were two cases in which integration did not involve intimacy or quasi-familial relationships:
Because A-bi will return to Vietnam one day, I don’t develop emotional intimacy with her .... At arrival, she wasn’t familiar with my husband’s family, so I introduced her to them. Later on, I also familiarized her with my social circle to avoid misunderstanding or confusion in the future. If I hadn’t told her these things, she might have felt she was being excluded. (Mrs. Guo, 60 years old)

For Mrs. Guo, integration was a temporary strategy to provide a comfortable social environment for the worker. The ultimate, inevitable employment termination, a macro-level factor, justifies her decision to minimize emotional intimacy and contributes to the dynamic, fluid process of negotiating employer-worker social boundaries in the private household.

Another employer also recognized the worker being integrated into the family despite the lack of intimacy:

For me, Xiao-ba remains a foreigner; one day she’ll leave. You can say that we have integrated her into the family, but more importantly, we show mutual respect. I often tell her if she needs anything, she can let me or my sister know and we’ll provide whatever she needs. (Mr. Ji, 51 years old)

In another case, performing the same tasks resulted in an integration which blurred the employer-worker boundary:

We don’t distinguish between A-jing and the rest of my family. What she’s doing is part of our daily work and our daily domestic chores are also part of her work, so how can we differentiate her from us? If we need her, we will call her name right away. It’s the same situation if my sons are around. “Hey, sons. Come over and help me!” (Mr. Huang, 65 years old)

Nonetheless, Mr. Huang did not fully regard the worker as part of the family, a circumstance that created an ambiguous employer-worker relationship:

Interviewer: How do you see A-jing over time? A friend, a family member or a worker?
Mr. Huang: We don’t completely see her as an outsider because we always share things (e.g., food) with her. On the other hand, we don’t fully see her as part of my family either. For me, she is still a person I hire to do the work for my family.

It must be noted that not all the workers experience family integration during their employment. Two of the workers experienced exclusion and limited contact with others:

After I prepared the meal, Madam served me only a tiny portion of food and set it at a separate table for me to eat alone, which made me quite sad. She didn’t treat me as if I was part of the family, and I couldn’t change the way my employers treated me. (Fan-jie, 42 years old)

They didn’t let me talk to anyone living in the neighbourhood. We lived in a condominium building and at night, every household took out the garbage to be picked up. I saw my neighbour and other Vietnamese workers, but A-gong didn’t allow me to talk or greet to anyone (A-su, 40 years old).

Both of their employers reinforced the asymmetrical employer-worker class and ethnic relations, unlike the majority of the cases in this study. In Fan-jie's case, an employer-worker status hierarchy determined even meal-seating arrangements and food sharing, whereas A-su experienced social isolation resulting from the employer’s control. This occurred in a less extreme form in other cases. Some employers did not practice exclusion or control, but established other types of domestic employer-worker boundaries:

Interviewer: Can you talk about A-xiang’s daily interaction with your family?
Mrs. Wu: We only talk to her when we want to know something; otherwise, we rarely chat with her.
Interviewer: Does A-xiang cook for everyone in the family?
Mrs. Wu: Her style of cooking doesn’t suit my family. She cooks only for the elders and I cook for the rest of the family.
Interviewer: Have you and your family shown concern for her family in Vietnam?
Mrs. Wu: No, we are not nosy about others' personal lives, so I wouldn't ask her. We were concerned about her after her arrival but what was happening with her family was none of our business.

The combination of little daily interaction, separate meal preparation and the lack of intimacy indicated an emotionally distant employer-worker relationship. Mrs. Wu treated the worker simply as an employee who was hired to fulfill care needs. Similarly, another employer, Mrs. Ge, did not perceive her worker, A-su, as a family member. She insisted on maintaining the employer-worker boundary. During the unrecorded interview, she told me that she never inquired about A-su’s family in Vietnam because she thought that might intrude on her personal privacy.

*Negotiation of work and care*

The employer-worker relationship trajectory is shaped by how both parties negotiate work to meet their own and each other’s changing needs. Some of the workers in this study attempted to seek employment outside the household in order to gain additional income. This possibility was negotiable under certain circumstances. In one family, the employer allowed the worker to do additional paid work only at a specific time of the day:

I don’t mind Yuan-yuan collecting recycling items because I can help her to make more money. I also introduce my close friends to her when they need someone to clean their houses, but they need to negotiate the time with us and decide when is convenient for everyone. For example, she needs to be with me at certain times every day, but she can do something else in her free time. (Mrs. Liu, 75 years old)
In other cases, employers deemed work outside the household inappropriate, because of legal restrictions, and, more importantly, because they believed that work outside of the caregiving task would detract from the worker's ability to provide 'good care':

A-tang once asked me if she could come to my shop and learn how to make pastries from me. I know this will make her more marketable after she returns home, but because of my mom’s current condition, it's not a good idea to leave my mom alone at home. (Mr. Dai, 45 years old)

A-bei knows that I’m very busy at work, so she once suggested that I come home to take care of A-ma for a few hours and she could help me with my work. I told her that it's illegal and that her job is to take good care of A-ma and if I’m overwhelmed by work, I’ll hire more staff. I appreciated her offer though. (Mrs. Chang, 45 years old)

In another case, work negotiation occurred when it was necessary for the worker to meet personal needs:

A-su practices Buddhism and goes to the temple twice a week. I let her attend her religious ritual at nighttime, and my husband and I keep an eye on my mother-in-law when she is away. (Mrs. Ge, 53 years old)

The employers were willing to negotiate work with the worker because they perceived the worker’s personal request to be reasonable, and care adjustments were made accordingly.

In another family, the employer adjusted work conditions to improve the worker’s well-being when the demand for care increased and adjustments were necessary:

One time, A-xian told me that she almost went nuts because A-ma didn’t want to sleep at night. My mother-in-law also likes to walk around so A-xian has to make sure she doesn’t fall. She once attempted to quit, so to keep her here, I told her that I’d sleep with A-ma and she could rest at night. My husband didn’t want me to do so, so we hired someone else just to keep my mother-in-law company from 8pm to 8am the next day. (Mrs. Tu, 51 years old)
Mrs. Tu offered various alternative work arrangements to A-xian, including hiring another helper, hoping that she would continue to stay and provide care to her mother-in-law. This narrative shows how making work adjustments is part of family negotiations of care.

In one case, despite the financial burden, a family considered hiring an additional caregiver. The original worker participated in this decision-making process, and, once she understood the family’s financial constraints, she volunteered to care for both elders:

Interviewer: Since you have two elders requiring care, have you and your brothers considered hiring another worker?
Miss Feng: We thought about it, but we can’t afford to hire another…. Hiring A-jin cost us NT 20,000 dollars. We discussed this with her. Because she’s been here for many years, we respect her before doing anything else. Finally, we realized that it’d be too crowded if we had another person living here…. Ever since my aunt got sick, her son only came back once and didn’t keep in touch with us. He didn’t assume any care responsibility. A-jin knew that and told us that it was unnecessary to hire another worker; she was willing to look after both elders.

This family’s experience showed how the employer and worker negotiated and resolved the challenge caused by increasing care needs. The worker ended up caring for two elders without receiving additional monetary compensation. Here is a case where ‘boundary work’ was so effective that the worker viewed herself to be part of this family, even to the point of being willing to donate her own resources, that is, her labour, as a contribution to their collective well-being. This worker commented:

Once papa considered hiring another live-in care worker, but I told him I am capable of taking care of both of them and I don’t mind it at all. I also asked him not to worry about me. I can do it! (A-jin, 51 years old)
In this situation, A-jin's actions actually contradicted her own interests as these might be understood at the structural level; that is, as a paid labourer who is situated in a specific class position.

Governmental regulations require that, prior to contract expiry every three years, the employer and the worker must decide whether that contract will continue. If both parties agree to extend the contract, the worker must exit the country before starting the next one. In one case, the employer hoped that the worker could shorten her vacation to reduce the care interruption:

Initially, A-zhen told me that she wanted to stay in Vietnam for two months, but I asked her if she could come back sooner. Since she insisted on staying there for the two full months, I respected her decision, but then she changed her mind and returned in one month. (Mrs. Zhu, 49 years old)

Each contract lasts three years, a major time commitment for workers; some were therefore hesitant to extend their stay for another term. However, many employers had become highly dependent on the worker for care, and these employers strove to convince the worker to extend the contract:

Before extending A-chao’s last contract, she planned to return home after the second one. She’s been with us for many years, so it’s hard for me to let her go…. My sisters-in-law also asked her to think twice before she made a final decision…. I didn’t force her to stay. Finally, she decided to stay here for another three years. (Mrs. Chen, 49 years old)

A-chao described how desperately Mrs. Chen wished to keep her:

Mrs. Chen begged me to stay and even cried in front of me. She told me that she’d become emotionally attached to me and would miss me very much if I were to leave. Also, she told me that if I were to leave, there would be nobody to care for A-ma. (A-chao, 46 years old)
Mrs. Chen not only showed emotional outbursts but also made A-chao aware that she would be irreplaceable once she left. This dramatic form of 'strategic personalism' helped Mrs. Chen to attain her goal.

When the worker takes a required leave of absence (usually one month) between two contracts, families often seek a temporary care arrangement. Typically, the broker arranges a substitute to replace the absent worker until her return:

My broker arranged another worker to provide temporary care to my mom when A-xiang was away. (Mr. Wang, 58 years old)

Before A-nan returned to Vietnam, my broker sent an Indonesian worker to us. At that time, she just arrived in Taiwan, so she was learning how to care for an elder. Without any experience, I had to teach her all the tasks. A-nan also trained that worker for 10 days before she left. (Mr. Mo, 48 years old)

Two of the families resorted to nursing home care during the workers' absence:

After A-yun returned to Vietnam for the first time, I couldn’t provide all the tasks by myself, so I sent my wife to a nursing care facility in a hospital. (Mr. Xu, 90 years old)

Interviewer: When A-chao went back to Vietnam, who took care of your mother-in-law?
Mrs. Chen: When I could care for her, I did it by myself. After she became disabled, I couldn’t carry her anymore because of her weight. My husband and I sent her to a nursing home for one month.

In two more cases, the worker found her own short-term replacement:

When A-yun returned home for the second time, she asked me to send my wife to her friend’s place and I paid her friend 800 NT dollars per day. (Mr. Xu, 90 years old)

Interviewer: What did your family do when the worker returned to Vietnam
Miss Feng: At that time, we couldn’t afford to hire a Taiwanese live-in care worker, so A-jin introduced her Vietnamese friend to us. She can speak Mandarin too.

Others provided home care to the elder themselves:
My husband has been retired for years, so he took care of my parents-in-law at home when A-hua returned to Vietnam for a short visit. (Mrs. Deng, 45 years old)

Diverse sources of care labour, including brokers, family members and the migrant worker’s own social network, provide care replacement during the worker’s temporary leave. Adult children often make an alternative care adjustment together, but when the spouse is the only caregiver (e.g., Mr. Xu), he/she has to make it alone.

Figure 5.1 illustrates the employer-worker relationship trajectory. The initial stage involves the employer’s and the worker’s first encounter, followed by the trust building and employment transitions made by both parties. The next stage is relationship-building, when both parties developed ties over time. This typical employer-worker relationship trajectory is propelled along by both parties' attempts to meet their objectives: Good care is desired by the employer, and stable good employment is desired by both the employer and the worker. In the following section, I discuss how negotiations of good care and good working relationships occur over time

**Figure 5.1: A Typical Employer-worker Relationship Trajectory**
5.1.2 Perspectives on 'good care'

A key issue highlighted by the employer and the worker is ‘good care’ of the elder. I now explore the dynamics of this process by comparing employers' and workers' understandings of ‘good care’.

Employer’s view

There was a general trend among employers to describe 'good care' in terms of the elder's physical, psychological, and social well-being. Although employers consistently described a good and congenial employment relationship as being desirable, the value of 'good care' was mainly applied to interactions between the worker and the elder.

Seniority, that is, long-term experience, was highly regarded by employers as an important qualification for care workers to possess; 'good care' made a worker irreplaceable.

One female employer perceived 'good care' as comprehensive caring tasks by the worker:

I often tell my mother-in-law that A-xian’s better than me or her own daughter. She not only keeps her company, but also changes her meals regularly and ensures she’s warm when it’s cold. If she were sick, she’d take her to a clinic. My mother-in-law used to throw away her medicine because she disliked it; now A-xian ensures that she takes it on time. We aren’t comparable to A-xian. We can’t afford to stay home and take care. (Mrs. Tu, 51 years old)

Mrs. Tu emphasized the excellent one-on-one care her mother-in-law receives from the worker, something that she regarded as a goal that she herself could not achieve due to her employment situation. Another employer acknowledged his worker’s good care through her provision of companionship and her positive attitude toward the elder:
A-tang plays an important role in the non-material aspect of my mom’s life. She keeps her company and provides emotional care when we’re at work. My mom is very dependent on her... One special thing about A-tang is that she has a positive outlook. She always tells me that my mom’s health is getting better every day and that her appetite is improving. (Mr. Dai, 45 years old)

Mr. Dai perceives companionship and emotional care as essential and beneficial to his mother. Both the employer and the elder became increasingly dependent on the worker to meet their needs through providing good care. In these two families, middle-class employers value their workers’ caring labour, contributing to a three-party caregiving relationship that benefits all the participants. The employer and the elder benefited from the care provided by the worker, and the worker benefits monetarily from her physical and emotional labour.

Some employers became aware of the worker’s good care by the improvement in the elder’s health:

Interviewer: When did you find out A-tsuen provided good care?
Mrs. Song: After I noticed the improvement in my husband’s health. A-tsuen has been taking good care of him. He once weighed 36 kilograms. When he walked, he would shiver but now he weighs 40 kilograms.

Five of the employers in this study acknowledged that the good care provided by the worker was due to skills that would be difficult to replace:

A-yun knows how to take care of my wife, so I can enjoy my own free time and do things I want to do, but if I have to hire a new worker in the future after she leaves, then it’ll be a hassle to retrain the worker. (Mr. Xu, 90 years old)

Interviewer: You realize that A-jin has two more years left. Do you have other plans after she leaves?
Miss Feng: All we can do is to hire a new worker. We’re hoping that we can hire someone like A-jin in the future. It’s not easy to find someone like her.

For Mr. Xu and Miss Feng, the worker’s experience in caregiving makes her highly desirable and difficult to replace.

Worker’s view

Care workers’ labour is comprised of predictable, repetitive daily tasks: cleaning, assisting with recreation and exercise, meal preparation, washroom visits, providing company, and moving the elder to prevent bedsores:

Each day I feed A-ma several meals, bathe her at 5pm and let her sleep while I make dinner. At midnight, I feed her additional nutritional products. (A-yun, 46 years old)

For A-gong and A-ma during the last seven years, daily I've cleaned the house, prepared and fed them three daily meals, done their laundry and kept them company. (A-shui, 40 years old)

I provide A-gong milk and a snack every couple of hours. Every day I bathe him and change his diaper, sometimes even in the middle of the night, because he is unable to tell me when he wets his diaper. At night, I have to change his sleeping position, so he doesn’t get bedsores. (A-xiang, 29 years old)

Some workers highlighted their ability to provide good care by reporting their employer’s incompetence and anxiety about caring for the elder’s body. One worker commented:

One time, A-ma dirtied her pants when I was away and my employer freaked out. As soon as I entered the house, he asked for my help. He said that I am his life saver! I think men can’t handle this kind of task. (Xiao-ba, 38 years old)

Another worker shared a similar situation:

Before A-gong passed away, he was very sick for four months. I cared for
him in the hospital during the day and looked after A-ma at night. Once I asked Madam to watch A-gong while I stayed home caring for A-ma. A few hours later, she phoned and said, “A-mei, A-gong is screaming at me! Can you return right away?” I asked her why. She said she didn’t know how to massage him, so he kept complaining. I responded, “What am I going to do? It’s nine o’clock at night! Then she told me that she gave up. (A-mei, 40 years old)

According to A-mei, her employer felt incapable of providing intimate care to the elder, thus relegating it to the worker. In this case, the three parties, the employer, the elder and the worker became interdependent on each other.

Most workers in this study, especially those employed for years, developed mastery in caring for chronically-ill elders. Some even played a ‘frontline’ caregiving role. They took the initiative to address the elder’s needs and receive up-to-date information from health care professionals before other family members did.

I take both elders to the hospital by myself. If they need to stay there, I’ll discuss it with their doctors. Doctors asked my employers to consult with me if they wanted to know about the elder’s health and treatment. They are aware that I can take good care of their dad and aunt, so they are worry free. (A-jin, 51 years old)

Workers considered detailed care tasks and knowing the elder’s health condition to be essential aspects of good care:

Interviewer: In your opinion, what entails “good care”?
A-xiang: Because A-gong wears the diaper every day, it’s important to ensure that his butt is clean and dry every day; otherwise he can get infection easily and then feel the pain. If I can avoid that, then he will not suffer from it.

We need to familiarize ourselves with care recipients’ health conditions, ways to deal with them and their personality. This is the way I care for the elders. (Fan-jie, 42 years old)
Despite a lack of official training, years of experiences have equipped some of the workers with the knowledge necessary to perform tasks that would normally be performed by professionals such as nurses. One study participant commented:

I’ve been helping A-ma to absorb food through a tube. I know how to insert it into her throat. I don’t need her doctor to do it. Many people don’t know how to perform this task. I also observe her feces regularly. If they become harder than usual, I’ll ask her doctor to prescribe medicine to soften them. I’d also update her doctor if her blood pressure increases or if she has difficulty breathing. (A-yun, 46 years old)

Despite foreign care workers’ lower occupational status in health care, some perceived themselves to be more skillful than those with a higher status:

I don’t like nurses to clean A-gong’s butt because they don’t do a good job. I prefer to do it by myself. I often ask them to leave everything (e.g., medication) in the room and I take care of everything by myself. I always clean it first with a wet paper towel and a cloth after. Then, I apply medication to disinfect it. Unlike the nurses, I take each step slowly and make sure A-gong’s butt is dry and clean. (A-xiang, 29 years old)

Workers also stressed their good care in comparison with other workers. One participant narrated:

One time, I saw an elderly man who was left alone in the park. An Indonesian worker who was supposed to accompany him was not there. Then, I asked A-ma, “Did you see that elderly man who is left alone? Poor him! He’s been left alone for a long time.” Finally, that worker returned and brought him home. I always accompany A-ma wherever we go. (A-tang, 34 years old)

Making this comparison allowed A-tang to demonstrate that good care meant giving full attention and dedication to the elder for whom she cared.

Other workers related ‘good care’ to their ability to enhance the elder’s happiness.

The following quotes showed various tactics workers adopted to please the elder:
When she expresses her own opinion on something, I always agree with her. That way, she’ll be happy though she may not be right all the time. This is how I make her happy. (Fan-jie, 42 years old)

A-gong and I have a great relationship. He was once hospitalized, didn’t like the nurse and scolded her. To please him, I also scolded the nurse. Later, I told the nurse that I pretended to be mad at her. Then, she soon understood how close I was to A-gong. (A-tsuen, 37 years old)

One time, I told A-ma that her husband had passed away. She got mad at me and thought that I was talking nonsense! From then on, I tried to say things that would please her instead of telling her the truth. (A-bi, 35 years old)

These care workers all aimed to develop and maintain a good care relationship with the elder by performing emotional care.

Proper verbal communication is also an indispensable component of good care. Because communicating with physically or mentally impaired elderly persons can be challenging and frustrating, workers sometimes seek and give nonverbal cues, through intonation, body posture, gestures, and facial expression, to assess and respond to the elder’s needs. The ability to capture accurate nonverbal information regarding care needs required years of caregiving experience:

A-ma had a stroke before, so she couldn’t speak properly. Even her sons couldn’t understand her sometimes, but I can because I’ve been taking care of her for many years. (A-ling, 42 years old)

Not only do we have to constantly show our concern to the care recipient, we have to be observant as well. By observing A-ma’s facial expression, I can tell her needs, but it takes me years of experiences to be able to do so. When I first cared for her, I didn’t know exactly what she wanted by looking at her face. She might agree to you by saying yes, but then I could tell that might not be the case, so I had to observe her facial expression to ensure if that was her true response. (A-jing, 42 years old)

If A-ma is doing great, I have to say good things to her to please her. If she upsets me by doing something inappropriate, I won’t say a word, but show
her my unhappy face and then she’ll stop what she was doing. She reads my face because she can’t hear a word right now. (A-su, 40 years old)

Over time, the ability to process non-verbal cues generates experiential knowledge helping the worker to better identify the elder’s needs. This paralinguistic skill complements technical and occupational skills and enhances quality care.

Finally, workers recognized good care by noticing the elder’s improvement in health:

She was very sick and stayed in the hospital when I first arrived. Her face was swollen. Then, I phoned my mom and told her I was taking care of an elderly lady. She coughed a lot and I didn’t know what to do. My mom suggested that I make ginger tea for her. In the next three years, I fed her that every morning and now she doesn’t cough! She got better and never stayed in the hospital again after I took care of her. She really appreciated my assistance. When I first arrived, she had to take eight different kinds of medicine and now she only takes three! (A-hui, 40 years old)

The elder’s improved health and gratitude for A-hui’s caring efforts were emotionally rewarding to her, making her aware of the ability to provide good care. This particular perception of ‘good care’ is also shared by the employer (see Mr. Dai’s or Mrs. Song’s case on page 156).

Table 5.1 summarizes the employer’s and the worker’s perceptions of ‘good care’.

There are parallels in what employers and caregivers consider ‘good care’.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 5.1: Perceptions of Good Care</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Perceptions of Good care</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>○ One-on-one comprehensive care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>○ Companionship and positive attitude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>○ Improvement in the elder’s health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>○ Irreplaceable long-term skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Based on my observations, the worker’s provision of good care serves two primary functions. First, by providing good care, workers strengthen their relationship with their employers. Second, by responding to the elder’s needs properly and effectively, workers build a good caregiving relationship with the elder. To provide further evidence of my second observation, I now discuss how the worker interacts with the elder and construct their relationship trajectory accordingly.

5.2 Worker-Elder Relationship Trajectory

For most workers in this study, language was a barrier that hindered their communication with the elder. In one case, it created a sense of exclusion:

A-ma and I couldn’t understand each other. She got frustrated and angry with me. One day, my agent came over and A-ma asked her to replace me with someone who could speak proper Mandarin. (A-bei, 45 years old)

To ease communication with the elder, workers realized that language proficiency was imperative:

I think that being able to communicate with a person is a prerequisite for getting to know a person. Good communication also helps me to avoid any misunderstanding. (A-xiang, 28 years old)

They not only had to learn Mandarin, but in many cases, were also required to acquire Taiwanese, the dialect spoken by many elders. Long-term residence with elders helped them to overcome this additional barrier, and in some cases improved proficiency in Taiwanese allowed them to reduce the social distance and to develop meaningful relationships that transcended the strictly physical caring tasks:
Interviewer: How long did it take you to feel comfortable speaking Taiwanese with the elders?
A-jiang: About one year. After understanding what they said, I could respond to them and felt closer to them. When I had difficulty understanding them, they rarely talked to me. They didn’t mean to ignore me, but just didn’t know how to communicate with me.

Over the long-term, most of the workers sensed the elder’s dependency on them.

Two of them noted it by observing how the elder reacted to help from health professionals or other family members:

A-gong had to go to the hospital for more treatments, so I stayed there with him. He had a bad temper, so no one could handle him except me. He once scolded the doctor. If I were not there with him, the medical staff wouldn’t be able to give him a shot. Nurses were also afraid of him. As soon as I comforted him, he would let them give him a shot. (A-huan, 31 years old)

A-gong is aware that I’m taking good care of him. When he was hospitalized, his grandson, A-feng, helped me to take care of him at my break. He asked A-feng, “Why hasn’t A-xiang come back yet?” He’d look for me if I’m away for too long…. He doesn’t want anybody else to care for him. He’s so used to my care. (A-xiang, 29 years old)

Five other workers recognized such dependency by noting how the elder felt about the worker’s temporary leave. One participant recalled:

I didn’t have a great relationship with A-ma when I first arrived. When I lived with her in the first month, she didn’t feel like talking to me. She’d refuse everything I did for her…. I chatted with her every day, hoping that she’d be nice to me. Three months later, she said, “You are the only person I like right now. I don’t want anybody else to take care of me”. After my first contract, she became emotionally attached to me. She cried and asked me to talk to my family over the phone instead of leaving Taiwan. I told her that I would be gone for a month, but she said, “If you go home, who’s going to look after me? Just go back for one week!” (A-nan, 39 years old)

During the worker’s short leave, the elder at times refused family-provided care and eagerly awaited her return. Maintaining the elder’s contact with the worker via
telephone was a common means of easing the pain caused by separation. Three participants described this situation:

During my absence, A-gong didn’t let his children bathe him, including his own wife. She only washed his body three times while I was away... He was very stubborn because he only wanted me to bathe him. He’d hit other people when they did that. (Xiao-ba, 38 years old)

When I returned home after my first contract, A-ma wanted to go home with me. I think she’ll ask me again after my second contract. When I was in Vietnam, I talked to her on the phone and asked her if she ate properly. (A-si, 43 years old)

While I was in Vietnam, I phoned Mrs. Song and made sure everything was alright. A-gong stayed in the hospital when I was away. I knew that it wasn’t good for him. He talked to me on the phone and asked me to return sooner! (A-tsuen, 37 years old)

In these three instances, the elder’s strong emotional and physical dependency on the worker indicates that the worker’s presence reconfigured family caregiving relationships. In another case, the worker reported the elder’s extreme form of dependency. After the interview, A-hui told me that if she decided to return home, the elder would commit suicide. Despite the possibility of extending contracts, separation is inevitable due to the ultimately temporary status of migrant workers.

While caregiving can be physically demanding and stressful, it can also be emotionally rewarding. Fifteen of the workers developed sentimental attachments to the elder with whom they shared the same residence for years:

I really love Papa and Auntie because I have shared the same bed with them for almost seven years. (A-jin, 51 years old)

Interviewer: Did you still develop a close relationship with A-ma even though she treated you poorly?
A-zhen: Well, I got used to her bad temper. We once taught each other language. I would teach her Mandarin and she would teach me Taiwanese.... I lived
with her for quite a few years, so I cried a lot when she passed away. After all, I became emotionally attached to her.

Some workers described strong emotional reactions to the elder’s worsening condition:

A-ma was in critical condition and I was so scared because she could die any minute! I cried and begged the doctor to save her. The doctor and nurses were quite surprised at what I did…. At that time, she was all over my mind. I was anxious about her condition. After she recovered, the doctor told me that I was a great person who showed true compassion to the care recipient. (A-mei, 40 years old)

After A-pa lost consciousness for two days, I was worried about him and felt painful to see him suffer. His doctor put a tube all the way to his stomach to keep him alive. At that time, he couldn’t talk. When he opened his eyes, I asked him, “A-pa, do you know who I am?” He didn’t talk, but nodded at me. I cried all day because I’ve never seen him in such bad condition. If he’s gone, I’ll be very sad. (A-mei, 44 years old)

Last August, A-ma was in an intensive care unit and almost passed away. I could hear her heavy breathing and she was struggling to stay alive. I was very sad when I saw her suffering. Luckily, she survived. (A-yun, 46 years old)

In addition to sentimental attachments, workers might also seek to develop a quasi-familial relationship with the elder:

I’m not here just to make money, but show my concern toward the elder’s feeling. I must treat her like my own family in order to show how sincerely I care about her. (A-juan, 40 years old)

After caring for A-gong for years, I’ve seen him like my own family….I sympathize with his situation…. He fell several times, so part of his brain isn’t functioning properly, but when he was in better shape, he showed his concerns to me. Once he said, “A-xiang, I’m sympathetic with your work condition. Have you eaten anything yet?” (A-xiang, 29 years old)

A-juan regarded herself as more than a worker who was paid to provide care. A-xiang shared emotional intimacy with the elder for whom she cared. For both, cultivating a
quasi-familial tie with the elder was another strategy for providing good care, something they described as requiring love and compassion.

Some workers used playful teasing or jokes to further enhance their emotional intimacy and quasi-familial tie with the elder:

When we came back home, I jokingly said to A-ma, “A-ma, let me go help your son in the bakery and you can go to the nursing home.” She said, “No, I don’t want you to go there.” I added, “Maybe I can find another caregiver to look after you.” She said, “No! I just want you to look after me.” (A-tang, 34 years old)

A-ma and I get along with each other very well! We chat every day. I would tease her by saying that, “A-ma, you have to teach me Taiwanese, or I’ll ignore you! (Fan-jie, 42 years old)

Some workers established a pleasant rapport through teasing and joking with elders. This allowed them to avoid using demanding language when making requests of elders as part of the provision of care:

Papa, you must behave yourself, or I’ll stop caring for you and will look after someone else instead.” He said, “If you do that, I’ll kill myself! A-tsuen, you cannot change your employer! You are the best caregiver.” (A-tsuen, 37 years old)

Sometimes I tease A-ma by saying, “if you don’t love me, I might return to Vietnam. Then she's upset. Sometimes when I ask her to stay home and not go elsewhere before I do grocery shopping, she smiles. (A-juan, 40 years old)

For other workers, a quasi-familial attachment intensified over time and consisted of a sense of commitment and responsibility as well as an emotional bond:

Interviewer: Do you take any day off?
A-jin: No, I don’t. If I take time off, who’s going to take care of A-gong and Auntie? It’ll be against my own conscience if I go out and have fun, but they’re suffering here. If I really need to go out, I’ll feed them and let them sleep first.
Interviewer: A-mei, how long will you stay in Vietnam this time?
A-mei: Two weeks at most and then I’ll come back right away. I’m afraid no one else can take care of A-pa properly. A substitute worker may not know what kind of medication he needs and his health condition.

The fact that A-mei did not plan a long vacation and worried about the quality of the care by the substitute demonstrated a desire of continuing to provide good care to the elder. Another worker expressed a similar experience:

After finishing the first contract, I returned home for two weeks. A-gong placed A-ma in a nursing home for twenty days. After I left, I missed her terribly. I’ve been caring for her for so many years and treated her just like my own grandma. Upon my return, I visited her there and saw tears coming out of her eyes. Despite her coma, she knew that I wasn’t with her for two weeks. I asked A-gong to bring her home immediately. (A-yun, 46 years old)

A-yun’s eagerness to retrieve the elder not only revealed her strong sense of caregiving responsibility, but also showed her preference for elder care in the home environment. The following figure summarizes the analysis on the worker-elder relationship trajectory which consists of several transitions showing how the worker and the elder adapt to each other over time.

**Figure 5.2: A Typical Worker-Elder Relationship Trajectory**

![Diagram](https://via.placeholder.com/150)

1. Little interaction due to workers’ language barrier
2. The worker’s provision of good care (The workers’ sentimental attachments toward the elder)
3. The elders’ physical and emotional dependency on the worker (reconfiguration of family caregiving relationship)
4. Quasi-familial relationship
5. The worker’s commitment/responsibility
5.3 Conflict in Domestic Care

While seeking good care and a good work and family environment, the employer, the worker and the elder might encounter conflict. I now explore sources of conflict, which parties were involved, and how conflict was resolved. Tension typically developed between two parties, but when dyadic relationships deteriorated, a third party might step in to restore family peace.

Worker-elder conflict

In one case, conflict initially occurred between the worker and the elder; when the employer got involved, a family drama resulted. One daughter-in-law narrated:

My mother-in-law doesn’t see A-xian as part of the family. She thinks that A-xian is supposed to do what she’s told when hired. She often complains about her job performance. Now, they don’t get along with each other. When I comfort A-xian, my mother-in-law will show jealousy and resentment to her. (Mrs. Tu, 51 years old)

While both Mrs. Tu and her husband were the employers, Mrs. Tu was the one who mediated the tension between her mother-in-law and the worker:

To keep my mother-in-law happy, I pretend to dislike A-xian and then my mother-in-law will feel better for a week. One time I told A-xian in front of my mother-in-law, “A-xian! Just do what I tell you to do. Let A-ma do whatever she wants. A-ma is always right no matter what.” If she wants to sleep longer instead of eating or exercising, don’t worry about her. Do you understand?? Then, my mother-in-law said, “Alright, that’s enough! Don’t be so harsh with her. By scolding A-xian, my mother-in-law would feel better. After that, I said to A-xian privately, “A-xian, from now on, when I ask you to do anything for A-ma, just say yes and you don’t need to say anything else!” Then A-xian knew that I was acting in front of A-ma. (Mrs. Tu, 51 years old)

Mrs. Tu attempted to alleviate the tension and maintain good intergenerational and employer-worker relationships. After reprimanding the worker in front of her mother-in-
law, Mrs. Tu brought ‘belated justice’ to A-xian to ensure her continuous provision of care. Mr. Tu, however, opposed this peace-negotiation strategy:

Sometimes my husband asks me to stop pleasing his mother. He thinks if she’s wrong, we should point it out instead. (Mrs. Tu, 51 years old)

In another case, a problematic caregiving relationship began when the worker failed to control her emotions while performing a frustrating care task. One son who employed this worker recalled:

My family hired A-jing to substitute for us. Occasionally, she gets stressed out and once lost her temper because my mom couldn’t finish her meal and dropped it on the floor (Mr. Huang, 65 years old)

To restore harmony in home care, Mr. Huang felt it necessary to intervene. He described his strategy:

After I discovered this, I instructed A-jing not to give my mom so much food next time. I also told my mom that if she didn’t want to eat, just leave the food alone instead of making a mess. I try to put myself into A-jing’s shoes, so to understand the difficulty she faces with my mom. I realize that, in some situations, my mother is the one at fault. For example, she may lie to A-jing about having gone to the washroom and then defecate in her pants. In such ways, my mom can increase A-jing’s workload. (Mr. Huang, 65 years old)

Mr. Huang appreciated both the worker’s frustrations and the elder’s limitations. While advising the worker, he communicated the problem to his mother, hoping that she would not increase the worker’s workload. He attempted to please both parties.

Although Mrs. Tu’s and Mr. Huang’s cases differed in the source of conflict, both demonstrated the desire for good care and good employment relationships.

In other situations, caregiving conflicts happened between the worker and the elder without the employer’s intervention. Several workers reported that the elder
abused them psychologically. Workers often became the easy ‘target’ because they were the ones who spent the most time with the elder at home. One worker shared her experience:

It was difficult to get along with the elder I cared for because of her personality. She sometimes got mad at me because I couldn’t understand her. She often said nasty things to me and complained about the food I made, but I didn’t mind it at all because I knew that she was getting older. I heard that the first worker who cared for her did not stay for too long and ran away. (A-zhen, 47 years old)

A-zhen was not treated nicely by the elder. Although she was in a potentially conflicting situation, she downplayed the seriousness of the elder’s mistreatment and attributed it to declining mental health. Other workers responded to similar conflict differently:

Interviewer: A-bing, do you know why A-ma doesn’t like you?
A-bing: Probably because I don’t know how to say nice things to please her. I don’t flatter or fake emotions. Some people know how to please elders when they’re unhappy, but I can’t do that. Do I need to admit to mistakes that I didn’t make? When angry, I don’t pretend everything is OK and hide my feelings. I often cried when I found her treatment unreasonable.

A-bing found the elder emotionally demanding. Her inability to meet the elder’s expectations heightened tension between them.

Physical abuse and sexual harassment also contributed to conflict. Two of the workers experienced such forms of violence:

Mrs. Xu was mentally ill, so it’s tough to take care of her. When she lost her temper, she’d hit me and pulled my hair when I bathed her. (A-yun, 46 years old)

A-ma has some mental problems. She once accused me of stealing her money and underwear. I didn’t know she had this problem, so I was very afraid of her…. Another time, she hit me while I was mopping the floor. I
told her that I had taken care of you for years and asked her why she hit me. She answered, “I don’t know! I don’t know!” (A-xian, 47 years old)

Sexual harassment took place especially when the worker cared for a male elder:

One time when I bathed him, he purposely rinsed his penis for a very long time in front of me. I knew that he wanted to have sex with me. He was lonely and I was the only person living with him. It’s quite easy for him to have this kind of thought. I was mad at him and yelled at him for a few minutes.... I told him, “Papa, you know what, if you want to sleep with me, you have to pay me twice as much as you are paying me now. Then, he remained silent. (A-rong, 46 years old)

Workers showed different reactions to the abuse and harassment by the elder. A-yun’s and A-xian’s sense of fear and helplessness illustrate workers’ vulnerability in home care, whereas by threatening to demand more pay, A-rong reduced her vulnerability. In both situations, workers exercised agency, but in different ways, one by demanding an explanation and the other by demanding more pay.

Worker-employer conflict

Conflict between the worker and employer frequently occurred. In one case, the employer treated his worker poorly until his cohabitating daughter intervened:

A-jin had to put up with my dad’s temper. Before he was sick, he was hard to live with. He held the master-servant ideology and treated her poorly. Once I saw her crying and asked her what happened. She answered, “Because papa scolded me.” Then I was quite angry with my dad. I told him, “Dad, if you aren’t nice to A-jin, we won’t hire anyone to take care of aunty!!” After that, he softened his harshness on A-jin. I am the youngest child in my family and my dad is afraid of me, so he listens to me if I condemn his behavior. (Miss Feng, 36 years old)

Miss Feng protected the worker from her father’s hostility. Her initiative not only modified the employer-worker power relation but also improved the quality of domestic
labour relations. Another incidence of employer-worker conflict happened when the worker felt she was being misjudged by a third party:

During A-gong's hospitalization, the nurse complained to my employer’s son that I did my job poorly; when A-ma told me not to be lazy, that angered me. I told the family that if they were unsatisfied with my work, they could hire someone else. I had done so many things for A-gong so their misjudging made me mad and upset. I calmed myself down and considered switching to a factory job where I might not get so stressed. However, if I were to quit and A-ma were to be the carer, that would not be fair to her. (A-xiang, 29 years old)

This quote revealed the worker’s conflicting emotions and a situation where she was caught between her commitment to the elder and her unhappiness with her employer. She chose to suppress her negative sentiments and prioritized her caregiving responsibility.

In another situation, the worker bargained with her employers to alter her subordinate position. Whenever she had a disagreement with her employer, she demonstrated how irreplaceable she was to them and consequently gained power in an asymmetrical employer-worker relationship. This worker commented:

Upon my arrival, I was passive, compliant and afraid of my employers. Gradually, I learned how to bargain with them. They knew how well I cared for A-pa and did domestic chores. Thus, whenever I argued with my employers, I was able to pressure them by threatening to quit, and they would stop arguing with me. Ever since then, everyone in the family has treated me well and respectfully. (A-rong, 46 years old)

**Conflict between the worker and the employer’s sibling**

Problems sometimes developed between the worker and family members of the employer. In one case, the worker’s marital tension damaged her relationship with the employer’s older sister who lived in the same house:
We need to be aware of the caregiver’s own family relationship. If A-hui has marital conflict, that can affect her emotionally. In turn that could affect the quality of care. Whenever she argues with her husband, she becomes moody.... All we can do is to minimize her emotional turbulence. During her care of my mom, I wanted to avoid any sense of negativity... A-hui visited Vietnam for a month, during which we hired a substitute. She was supposed to return in one month, but told us that her husband didn’t want her to leave. Then, I found out that she stayed a day with friends in Taipei. That’s why she didn’t return on time. She said, “You can just cut my salary.” Her response thus angered my sister. (Mr. Li, 63 years old)

A-hui failed to apologize and Mr. Li’s sister ceased communication with her. Mr. Li chose to remain neutral, maintain the status quo and do nothing to improve the damaged relationship:

Interviewer: How is your current relationship with A-hui?
Mr. Li: Well, I try to be nice to her. If I too stopped communicating with her, how then could she stay working here? Regardless of our dislike for her, as long as she doesn’t make serious mistakes, we can’t fire her, nor can she terminate her contract at will.

Interviewer: So, Mr. Li, are you playing a mediating role in the relationship between your sister and A-hui?
Mr. Li: Well, it’s very hard for me to mediate as I can’t blame my sister, for if I did she would probably wonder why I was taking the wailao’s side. Conversely, if I took my sister’s side, the wailao might claim we are all mistreating her.

Interviewer: Do you find yourself in an awkward situation?
Mr. Li: That’s right. We accept the current situation as it but realize that probably cannot improve it.

Mr. Li held two contradicting positions as a family member and as an employer who relied on paid help. In this ambivalent situation, he felt it difficult to please his sister and the worker simultaneously.

Conflict also occurred when the worker failed to meet the employer’s expectations. In one family, tension intensified when the uncooperative worker sought alliance with the elder:
The major conflict between me and A-shui occurred after my mom’s return from the hospital. We asked A-shui to care for my mom. At that time, my dad could walk, so he didn’t need much help. As A-shui refused my requests to sleep with my mom in case she needed assistance at night, I told her that I could hire someone else! She replied, “Fine, I’ll quit!” I think she was afraid we might hire someone else, so she sought my dad’s support. He told me, “I don’t want anyone else but A-shui to care for me.” We couldn’t do anything but let her stay. My siblings and I really needed her help. Finally, we decided to raise her monthly salary, so she would cooperate. (Miss Lin, 51 years old)

While the elderly father did not have the intention of resolving conflict between his children and the worker, his involvement altered the employer-worker power relation. The employers could not make additional demands of the worker after she secured support from the elder. Instead, they resolved the risk of losing a much-needed worker by increasing her pay. Miss Lin’s narrative shows a complex three-party conflict negotiation.

*Adult offspring-elder conflict*

For some of the families, the worker’s arrival could create tension between adult offspring and/or their spouses and the elder. In one case, the daughter-in-law felt that her mother-in-law failed to give her adequate attention after she became dependent on the worker:

Interviewer: How did you feel about your mother-in-law’s dependency on the worker?
Mrs. Wei: Sometimes I’m jealous of the worker because my mother-in-law treats her very well. I once overheard her saying to the worker, “Oh, I am very sympathetic with your hardship. Then I told myself, “I am also providing care!”

Interviewer: Didn’t your mother-in-law realize that you and your husband have to pay for the worker’s salary?
Mrs. Wei: Well, she feels more emotionally attached to whoever spends the majority of time helping her.
Although Mrs. Wei’s husband and his two other brothers jointly hired the worker, she continued to provide care to her mother-in-law. She wished that the elder could recognize her care contribution. In some cases the elder’s demand for intense care from their children or children-in-law, even when a care worker is present, also creates conflict. In these situations, the elder in some families expects adult offspring to perform the same amount of care as the worker even when other family obligations prevented them from meeting such expectations:

My mom told the worker that she wanted to return to Vietnam with her. You know the elderly people would trust you if you care for them. Sometimes, I think my dad is deliberately lukewarm to me. He wants us to provide the care to him like the way that the worker does, but you know it’s impossible for us to do so. (Miss Lin, 51 years old)

In both cases, the worker over time reconfigured the family caregiving relationship. The elder gradually became dependent on the worker. Such dependency generated the tension between the adult offspring or their spouses and the elder.

Employers use various approaches to negotiate and restore family peace and maintain a good work and family relationship. While workers generally remained vulnerable when conflicts arose, there were cases where they took the initiative to reduce conflict to protect their own interests. Workers also have power when elder and employer fear they might leave.

To summarize, conflict occurs and evolves in the forms of direct three-party encounters, indirect three-party encounters and two-party encounters. Table 5.2 presents a summary of conflict situations in the paid domestic care relationship.
Table 5.2: A Summary of Conflict Situations in the Paid Domestic Care Relationship

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Direct 3-party encounter</th>
<th>3rd Party Intervention</th>
<th>Purpose</th>
<th>Strategies</th>
<th>Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Worker-elder</td>
<td>The employer (child/child-in-law)</td>
<td>Restoring family peace</td>
<td>Creative mediation</td>
<td>Slight improvement in domestic labour relations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Maintaining a good work and family relationship</td>
<td>Communication with the worker and the elder</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Worker-employer</td>
<td>The daughter of the employer</td>
<td>Seeking justice for the worker</td>
<td>The daughter: direct confrontation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Improving the quality of domestic labour relation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Worker-employer's sibling</td>
<td>The employer</td>
<td>Avoiding exacerbating the conflict situation</td>
<td>The employer: remain neutral to maintain the status quo</td>
<td>Tension remains</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indirect 3-party encounter</th>
<th>3rd party involvement</th>
<th>Purpose</th>
<th>Strategies</th>
<th>Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Worker-employer</td>
<td>The elder</td>
<td>Securing employment (the worker)</td>
<td>Seeking alliance with the elder</td>
<td>Power gained in an asymmetrical employer-worker relationship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Reducing employer-worker conflict (the employer)</td>
<td>Providing incentive to the worker</td>
<td>The worker continues to provide care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Worker-employer</td>
<td>Maintaining the elder’s well-being (the worker)</td>
<td>Reducing the confrontational attitude toward the employer</td>
<td>The worker continues to provide care</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adult child-elder</td>
<td>The worker</td>
<td>Protecting personal well-being (the worker)</td>
<td>Exercising agency</td>
<td>Power gained in an asymmetrical employer-worker relationship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>No action taken</td>
<td>Remaining vulnerable</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5.4 Summary

This chapter has focused on the influence of the worker on domestic and family caregiving dynamics and how these dynamics are negotiated in the context of domestic employment. In the employer-worker relationship trajectory, an initial transition stage, characterized by language acquisition and training, tends to lead to a quasi-familial bond, lending the worker a sense of belonging. By integrating the worker into the family, the employer aims to maintain a good work and family environment and to
ensure the worker’s provision of good care. By offering good care and cultivating a
quasi-familial tie, the worker attempts to seek stable employment and a good working
relationship. Both parties practice strategic ‘boundary work’ to meet their own needs.
However, quasi-familial relations and integration are not universally prevalent. Some
employers reinforce asymmetrical employer-worker class and ethnic relations by
perpetuating the worker’s sense of exclusion in the household.

The worker-elder relationship trajectory often begins with poor communication
cau sed by the worker’s language barrier; over time, this issue is resolved. When
receiving good care, the elder often becomes emotionally and physically dependent on
the worker. Such dependency indicates how, over time, the worker reconfigures the
family caregiving relationship.

The analysis of conflict in domestic care reveals the complexity of caregiving and
employment relationships. Direct third-party, and indirect third-party and two-party
conflict can undermine quality of care, domestic labour relations and family ties. The
participants in this research described different strategies to restore family peace and
ensure continued provision of good care.
Chapter 6: TRANSNATIONAL FAMILY AND CARE

Chapter Four and Five focus on family negotiations of care and caregiving dynamics before and after the migrant worker’s arrival, whereas this chapter highlights the relationships between migrant workers and their own family members before and after their departure. I analyze how migrant workers negotiate their own family relations and responsibilities as daughters, daughters-in-law, wives, and mothers. This includes scenarios that have not yet been studied fully, that is, those pertaining to care for an elderly relative. This analysis explores the dynamics and trajectories of transnational family ties. To begin, I examine how migrant workers negotiate their family responsibilities in preparation for overseas work and how these arrangements are modified in the event of contract renewal. Next, I focus on how migrant workers fulfill their maternal responsibilities within the phenomenon of global care chains. I also consider how various types of remittance transfers by migrant workers shape and reconfigure the dynamics of kinship ties at home. Finally, I propose a potential relationship trajectory that may apply to long-term migrant workers who are simultaneously attached to two families, one related by blood and marriage and the other constructed socially through live-in care work.

6.1 Negotiation of Overseas Work

Prior to departure, most of the migrant workers I interviewed negotiated overseas work with their family members. Data revealed that migrant workers’ marital status
shaped the negotiation process. Among married migrant workers, six reported that their families either showed support or remained neutral to their migratory decision:

Interviewer: Did you discuss your plan with your parents?
A-sheng: Yes, I did. They’re getting older and can’t do anything to help me, so they let me decide.

Interviewer: How did your parents-in-law feel about your decision?
A-sheng: They told me that it’s my own career, so I should be responsible for it. They didn’t object to it.

Interviewer: Did you discuss working overseas with your husband before you came to Taiwan?
A-zhen: Yes, I did. I got his approval before taking the job. He was also aware of the difficult living conditions in Vietnam, so he supported my plan.

On the other hand, 10 reported initial objections from parents, in-laws or husbands, who later came to approve:

My parents-in-law didn’t want me to come here because of the distance and language issue. They worried that I might have an adjustment problem or be poorly treated. However, they wanted me to think twice and discuss it with my husband first. Later, everyone thought that I should give it a try. If I made money, I could send some home; if not, I could always return. (A-juan, 40 years old)

Initially, A-juan’s in-law family viewed migration as risky, but later acknowledged its potential to improve the household economy. Two other migrant workers convinced their parents by emphasizing their responsibility for the support of their own children:

Initially, my parents didn’t want me to leave Vietnam, but after I told them my own family responsibility, they then respected my decision. (A-bi, 35 years old)

My parents disapproved of my choice of working in Taiwan. They thought that it’s unsafe to work overseas and worried that I might encounter some problems. I told them that I’m married and have my own family to look after. If I want to provide a better life for my daughter, my husband and I must undertake all the life hardship. They eventually let me make my own decision. (A-huan, 31 years old)
Another two migrant workers described how they negotiated international labour migration on working abroad with their husbands:

Initially, my husband didn’t approve, but I told him that we wouldn’t have money to pay for kids’ schooling. Then, he said, “Ok, you can go but only for two years. (A-hui, 40 years old)

Initially, my husband didn’t want me to leave because he was afraid that he couldn’t take good care of our kids. Then, I asked him to be patient and told him that if other families could handle the issue of childcare when the wife was absent, why couldn’t we? Finally, he let me go. (A-tsuen, 37 years old)

While negotiating overseas work, three of the migrant workers claimed to be the primary family breadwinner because of their husband’s poor health:

I told myself that I must go to Taiwan to earn money; otherwise my husband and I couldn’t afford our children’s education. My husband’s health wasn’t so good, so if he wanted to work overseas, he wouldn’t pass the medical examination required by Taiwan. (A-tsuen, 37 years old)

Interviewer: Does your husband work too?
A-shui: Yes, but he doesn’t earn much. Because he’s not in good health, he mainly stays home.

In these cases, adverse economic conditions in Vietnam coincided with the husband’s poor health, making it necessary for the wife to take on the main breadwinning role by working abroad.

Leaving the country to work required negotiating domestic care responsibilities with their husbands. Eleven workers in this study shared a common view that they must redefine their gendered role and relation with their spouses in order to meet the family’s multiple needs. This spousal negotiation process marks a salient transition in the lives of migrants’ families:
Interviewer: What did your husband feel about you working here?
A-nan: He said that both of us had to endure the pain of family separation. He agreed to take care of our children while I am working in Taiwan.

After I left, I told my husband that we shared a difficult task together. I also told him, “When I’m not around, you have to play both the role of mother and father.” He agreed with my expectation. (A-sheng, 41 years old)

In both families, husbands accepted a new family role while their wives were away.

When husbands provided good child care, migrant workers gained a sense of relief and were able to concentrate on their work. Two participants illustrated this point:

I constantly ask my husband to be a moral role model for our children when I am away. He knows I often worry about whether children misbehave. He promised me that he would take good care of them and asked me to focus on work and stay healthy in Taiwan. (A-chao, 47 years old)

I know it’s not easy for my husband to take care of my children. You know children nowadays are much harder to raise. They are easily misled, but my husband ensures that my children distinguish rightdoing from wrongdoing. Thus, I can then focus on work here without worrying about them. (A-juan, 40 years old)

A new gendered division of labour emerged in these married migrant workers’ families: women engaged in paid work overseas, whereas men primarily stayed home and provided child care. This gendered work arrangement represents an adaptive strategy that migrant women and their husbands deployed for their families’ economic survival.

Three migrant workers explained that during their absence, their husbands fulfilled the essential role of disciplinarian. When they learned that children were well-behaved, they expressed appreciation of their spouses:

My husband stays home and looks after children.... I know it’s not easy for him because children nowadays are much harder to raise, and are easily misled. My husband makes sure that they distinguish right from wrong. (A-juan, 40 years old)
When I left, my son was eight and my daughter thirteen. My husband took great care of them. Without him, I don’t think they’ll behave themselves. (Fan-jie, 42 years old)

When I first came here, my sons were still young (my eldest was 12 and youngest son was 5). I feared no one could discipline them. Because of my husband’s help, I was relieved that my kids didn’t misbehave. (A-nan, 39 years old)

However, one worker noted that her husband experienced difficulties during the transition to a new division of labour:

My husband is not content with his life right now. When we were together, I could help him a lot with many things. We shared the household tasks together after work. After I left, he had to do those things by himself. In Vietnam, child care by men is rare. It’s mostly done by women. He feels uneasy without me around. (A-dan, 46 years old)

Another worker reported that her husband did not provide adequate child care when she was away:

I once asked my nephew to bring some money to my husband so he could buy milk for our daughter. I thought he did, but he didn't do so. I argued with him on the phone and asked him why he didn’t buy milk for our daughter and lied to me. (A-huan, 31 years old)

Both cases show that the gender transfer of domestic responsibilities between the migrant wife and the stay-at-home husband must be negotiated. In the case of A-huan, her husband’s inadequate child care may imply his resistance to the new gendered role in the family.

Non-married migrant workers revealed different family dynamics when they discussed how they made arrangements for overseas work. One widowed participant explained why her siblings opposed her intention of working abroad:
All of my brothers and sisters were all against my idea of working in Taiwan. After my husband passed away, I moved back to my parents’ house with my children. None of my siblings lived there because of their work, so they preferred me to stay home and look after my parents. Eventually, my mom agreed to let me go because she knew that if I remained in Vietnam, I wouldn’t be able to support my children’s education and would have a difficult life. (A-jing, 42 years old)

As a widow and the only child who cohabited with the aging parents, older siblings expected A-jing to assume the primary caregiving responsibility. Prior to working abroad to provide better child support, A-jing had to renegotiate her filial care responsibility with her parents. In contrast, the two divorced migrant workers in this study received family approval. One of them commented:

My dad encouraged me to work abroad. He said, “Why don’t you go to Taiwan and earn money to support your sons. I told him that I was too scared to go because I might face a lot of hardship… My older brother and sisters all thought it was better for me to go too. They said, “If you don’t go to Taiwan, then you wouldn’t be able to pay for your sons’ school.” After I got everyone’s support, I then decided to come here. (A-bei, 45 years old)

A-bei was the only study participant who received full family approval and encouragement for overseas employment without having to negotiate it.

The families of never married women who chose to migrate varied in their response. In one case, the family reacted negatively:

None of my family thought it was a good idea to work in Taiwan. They said, “You are getting older. Don’t go anywhere but get married. I replied, “No, I don’t want to and if I have money, I can be independent.’ They know that I’ve been working away from home for many years, but I’ve made up my mind already. If I stayed in Vietnam, I would make little money. (A-tang, 34 years old)

A-tang acted against her family’s will and showed strong self-determination. By gaining financial independence instead of marrying, she altered the normative life path which
the family expected her to follow. Another unmarried migrant worker also illustrated this life path by participating in overseas work:

My dad became disabled after the Vietnam War. Since then, my mom’s been taking care of him. My mom does farming for a living. She’s 53 years old, so it’s hard for her to find a job elsewhere. I’m the oldest child in the family, so I have to be the family breadwinner. My priority is to improve my family’s life, so marriage is unimportant to me right now even though my mom and brother expect me to get married. Anyway, they all agreed to let me come to Taiwan. (A-xiang, 29 years old)

A-xiang demonstrated a strong responsibility to support her family. Unlike A-tang, she received her family’s approval for working abroad.

As part of negotiating transnational family ties, migrant workers also assured families that their work situation was fine. Although many encountered mistreatment, eleven of them chose not to disclose the truth:

Interviewer: When you experience the hardship here, do you tell your family? Fan-jie: No. I always tell them that my life in Taiwan is fine and everyone treats me very well. If I don’t lie to them, they’ll worry about me. When I first arrived, I cried a lot, but I didn’t tell my family because they’d worry about me. I always lied to them that my life in Taiwan is great and the family I work for treats me very well... I know I shouldn’t have lied to them, but it was difficult for me to tell them the truth. (A-shui, 40 years old)

By lying, migrant workers aimed to protect their families’ emotional well-being. To ensure that the migrant workers could focus on work, their family might also choose not to share everything. One of the migrant workers recalled:

Nine months after I moved here, I learned that my husband was killed in a car accident. When I first got here, I didn’t have a cell phone, so I hardly spoke to my family. Before I knew about his death, my parents-in-law always lied to me. They told me that my husband got busy at work, so he was not able to answer my call. One month after his passing, my sister told me the truth (A-yun, 46 years old)
To consistently provide family’s basic necessities and support children’s education\textsuperscript{11}, all of the migrant workers who participated in this study chose to renew their contract. Eight of them negotiated the renewal with their family and reported their family’s eagerness to see them return:

Interviewer: Did you discuss with your spouse before renewing the contract?
A-bi: I certainly did. He didn’t want me to come again. I said, “If you want me to return, I would.” No couples like to be apart. However, we were concerned about the kids’ future, so he asked me to think twice before the renewal. Although I let him decide, I had made up my mind. Ultimately, he was convinced that my renewal would be better for our family.

My husband used to try to convince me to go home. He thought that it’s better for us to work together despite the economic hardship in Vietnam. I felt pain in my heart when I left him behind, but I told myself, “It’s alright and at least I can make more money here” I told my husband that he must take good care of our children. (A-juan, 40 years old)

Because I didn’t make much money in the first contract, I chose to come here again. My husband wasn’t very happy with my decision and said, “You’ve been away from for too long and taking care of our sons by myself was difficult.” I asked him to be patient and told him that I wanted to stay working for a few more years to improve our living condition. After I cheered him up, he told me that he’d take good care of our sons. (A-xian, 47 years old)

In these cases, migrant women took the lead by negotiating a contract renewal. They rationalized their extended stay in Taiwan as economic necessity, setting the pain of separation aside. They not only acknowledged their husbands’ efforts in child care but also considered the quality of this care before renewing the contract:

\textsuperscript{11} In Vietnam, the government implemented ‘user fees’ for primary and secondary education in 1989 to shift the cost of schooling from the state to the public. As a result, for the majority of Vietnamese households, children’s education is a major expenditure and often requires financing (Bélanger & Liu, 2008).
My husband is taking a heavy family responsibility too. He’s playing both fatherly and motherly figures. If he failed to take good care of my children, I wouldn’t come to Taiwan today. (A-hui, 40 years old)

After my first contract, I felt so relieved because my kids didn’t misbehave themselves. Therefore, I felt more comfortable going back to Taiwan again. Without my husband’s help in child care, I might not extend my contract. (A-nan, 39 years old)

While meeting family’s economic needs, four of the migrant workers also stressed the importance of maintaining a good, harmonious and trusting family relationship:

Fortunately, my husband and children behave themselves, so I can be carefree while working here. To support my family, I have no choice but to leave my family behind. On the other hand, if I simply work without maintaining a good relationship with them, it doesn’t matter how much I have earned because I may ruin my family relationship. A good relationship is something that you can’t buy with money. (A-shui, 40 years old)

Money isn’t everything. If you have money, but fail to manage your family relationship, it’s not worth making more money. I want to have a harmonious family. (A-chao, 47 years old)

My husband and I trust each other very much. We speak to each other on the phone a lot and talk about children’s life and my work. We keep close contact with each other whenever important family issues come up. (A-sheng, 41 years old)

While taking on the primary breadwinning role, these migrant workers also endeavoured to contribute to maintaining family cohesion. Attempts to negotiate a balance between work and quality of family ties are a common aspect of migrant care workers' experience.

6.2 Negotiation of Maternal Responsibilities

Once migrant workers left home, their family situation is persistently affected by their absence, even after their return. Physical separation alters the mother-child
relationship of migrant workers who became part of 'split households', and they must therefore negotiate with their kinship groups in order to fulfill their dual obligations.

Migrant workers who had children of pre- or primary-school age justified their absence in terms of their home family's economic well-being:

Three years ago, my young daughter cried all the time whenever I called. Now, she understands that, because of my work overseas, she and her brother can go to school and have a better life. I also told her that I didn’t intentionally leave her and her brother. (A-hui, 40 years old)

I keep in touch with my children by phone. I often explain that my absence is not because I didn’t want to take care of them, but because I wanted to pay for their education and have a better life. I want my children to understand why I must go abroad for work. The Vietnam War has left our country poor for decades. (A-zhen, 47 years old)

Interviewer: What do you say to your children when you call them?
A-nan: I said, “Mom is working hard in Taiwan. If I stayed in Vietnam, I wouldn’t be able to make enough money to pay for your education and the family’s living conditions would never improve.

While these migrant workers found leaving their children difficult, they emphasized economic incentives to justify why they were willing to endure the sorrow of separation.

They demonstrated self-sacrifice to fulfill their maternal duty:

For my children’s future, I’ll make sacrifices and endure all the hardship. No matter what happens to me, I’ll succeed. (Fan-jie, 42 years old)

In Vietnam, I did not make much money. Being a mother, I want to give my children a better life, so I decided to work in Taiwan and make more money. (A-sheng, 41 years old)

However, one of the migrant workers in this study talked about the emotional difficulty after her arrival in the host country. Her daughter then convinced her to stay in Taiwan in order to improve the family’s economic condition:
Initially, I really missed home and told my daughter that I wanted to return in two months. She then responded, “Mom, our living condition is still poor, so don’t come home yet. If you return now, then we won’t be able to pay off the debt. Don’t worry about my brother. I’ll take good care of him. You have to be patient with work in Taiwan.” After hearing her words, I decided to stay longer. Otherwise, I’d have gone home already. (A-zhen, 47 years old)

In this case, the daughter provided timely emotional support when her mother experienced unrest during her early transition to overseas employment. The daughter also offered practical support in the form of taking care of the younger brother. This suggests that mother-child negotiation of absence can go both ways.

Modern communication technology plays an important role in helping migrant women and their children to negotiate long-distance relationships. After a period of work in Taiwan, migrant workers in this study obtained access to a landline or mobile phone. Telecommunications replaced mail, which was usually the initial means of communication when workers first relocated, and eased the difficulties and pain of separation:

After working in Taiwan for six months, I started to be concerned about my children because I couldn’t be with them. I didn’t have a mobile phone, so I communicated with my family through regular mail. Six months later, I finally had one and so was able to call my family. (A-tsuen, 37 years old)

The following narrative shows how advancements in communication technology have improved the quality of family contact between migrant workers and their children:

On my arrival, I didn’t have a phone line in Vietnam, so I only sent photos home. I didn’t write any letters to my children because they were too young to read. My relatives explained to them why I left. As they got older, they learned how to write letters to which I would reply. The cell phone allowed me to send them text messages. Now we can see and talk to each other over the internet. My older sister has a computer, so my children can use it to connect with me. Madam lets me use her computer. (A-bi, 35 years old)
Besides regular communication, migrant workers with children back home all tried to compensate for their absence by sending gifts. They sometimes attached symbolic meanings, such as genuine care and love, to certain items:

My children received new shoes and hats from me. By sending these presents, I want them to know that I still remember them. It makes me happy when they tell me that they love their presents. If I simply sent my husband money instead of sending the presents myself, they might think these presents were actually from their dad. (A-hui, 40 years old)

Interviewer: Do these gifts have special importance?
A-tsuen: Yes. I told my children, “It’s not easy for me to leave both of you behind and work abroad. Cherish everything I have given you.” I sent them higher quality pencils that would help them to write homework more tidily.

For both migrant workers, the ability to send gifts rewarded their physical hardship and sacrifice; they had incalculable emotional value and offered migrant workers a means to stay connected with their children from afar.

Migrant workers also used gifts as incentives to encourage children’s scholastic performance:

Interviewer: Did you ever send presents to your children?
A-xiang: Yes, if people I know are returning, I ask them to bring presents back for me. I told my son that if he passed the high school admission examination, I’d buy him a new computer. When he did, I immediately bought him one and set him another goal. “If you can attend a university, I’ll buy you a new cell phone.”

Most migrant workers hoped that their work abroad would aid their children’s educational performance, and emphasized that educational achievement would effectively improve their life chances:

I didn’t receive much education myself, but I want my children to get as much schooling as possible. (Fan-jie, 42 years old)
I often tell my sons, “You are now grown-up and should learn as much and earnestly as possible, or you won’t be competitive in the labour force. Having higher education is better for you.”... When they were younger, I asked them to help me on the farm. At the time, I told them, “We had to spend much time and energy on the farm, but we made little money. You guys must study hard or you may end up working here too. My son responded, “Yes, mom. I want to attend university because I don’t want to work on the farm.” (A-chao, 46 years old)

A-chao wanted her children to avoid economic hardship and gain social mobility. She regarded education as effective human capital transferable to their career outcomes.

For these migrant workers, investing in children’s education by providing tangible financial support and reinforcing the value of education was also a way of fulfilling their maternal responsibilities.

Migrant workers also negotiated their long-distance relationship with children by setting clear expectations about their behaviour, especially when concerning achievement in education. Four of them commented:

I told my son, “Mama is working very hard in Taiwan, so you should do well at school. (A-xian, 47 years old)

I set them a goal to accomplish and I told them that I want to see the result once I return and I don’t want them to upset me when I see them again. (A-su, 40 years old)

Mom works hard to pay for your schooling and build a big house for you. I want you to study hard and achieve your goal without constantly changing direction in your life. I always tell my children to finish their homework before doing anything else. (A-sheng, 41 years old)

I told my children to get as much education as possible and I’ll earn as much as possible to pay for them. I hope they won’t have to work overseas like me (A-jing, 42 years old)
The women I interviewed reported feeling rewarded when their children met their expectations:

My daughter got a scholarship and even represented her school in a writing competition! She’s gifted at writing. When I first returned to Vietnam, her teacher told me that she placed second in her class! I’m very proud of her. Her success helped me to deal with hardship here. (Fan-jie, 42 years old)

I once phoned my son’s teacher and inquired about his school marks. I was told that he’s always at the top of his class. I’m proud of him and not worried about his schooling. (A-sheng, 41 years old)

In these two cases, children’s success helped migrant workers to cope with hardship and stay focused on work.

Migrant workers also felt responsible for their children’s moral education. They constantly encouraged children’s proper behaviour, monetary management, the protection of home and responsible friendships:

I want my children to behave themselves, to avoid bad habits, and to protect our house. My son once said, “Mom, I don’t close the door when I sleep at night because we don’t have any valuable items.” I responded, “No, you must lock the door!” (A-tsuen, 37 years old)

When I discover that my children have misbehaved, I demand that this won’t reoccur. I advise them how to use time wisely, to help their father and grandmother when needed, to be careful about whom they’re with at school -- to prefer those who like to study -- and stay away from trouble makers. (A-nan, 39 years old)

Interviewer: Did you also tell your sons how to spend their money?
A-chao: Yes, I told them that instead of buying unnecessary things, they should only buy what’ll help them to study more efficiently. I want them to know it’s not easy to earn money.

I ask my daughter to keep track of her personal spending. When my son is older, I’ll ask him to do the same. I want them to manage their own money well. I also asked my children to be more assiduous about doing household chores and not to rely on their father all the time. After entering the work force, they’ll have to look after themselves. Since they were kids, I’ve trained them to be independent. (Fan-jie, 42 years old)
These migrant workers inculcated such values as thriftiness, thoughtfulness, and independence in their children. Well-behaved children provided their mothers with a sense of relief and accomplishment and helped to eliminate a social stigma that might be attached to their mother being absent:

Many people blame the absence of the mother for children’s misconduct. My son felt that he must perform well at school, so nobody would blame me. His teacher appreciated my efforts to educate him even when I was away. My neighbor also told me the same thing. They found out that my sons could discipline themselves. I felt relieved after hearing those comments. (A-nan, 39 years old)

Despite their absence, these mothers were sensitive to public scrutiny back home, feeling that the quality of their mothering was judged based on their children’s behavior in the public realm, such as in their schools or neighbourhoods. When their children were positively evaluated, mothering from a distance became a source of pride for these workers even as it caused grief over long periods of separation.

Many migrant women also reported their children’s sadness due to years of separation. Thus, migrants also negotiated their absence with their children in order to make them feel better. One common conflict occurred when children of migrants experienced discomfort, unease and even abandonment:

My younger daughter misses me a lot and often asks me to return. I said, “Mom is working hard and I’ll buy you a lot of presents.” She said, “Mom, I don’t want anything but you. You haven’t been home for a long time. Do you still care about me?” She knows that I left her when she was only six. I often cry after talking to her on the phone. I said, “If I didn’t come here and work, we wouldn’t have money to survive, so please forgive me.” (A-rong, 46 years old)

When I told my children I wanted to stay in Taiwan for a couple more years, they all cried. They asked me to return as soon as possible. I told them,
“Mom is still young. If I don’t make more money now, how can I pay for your future schooling?” On the other hand, I realized that I’d been away for too long which isn’t good for them. (A-hui, 40 years old)

When my son was younger, he kept asking me to come home; this made me very sad, yet I realized that I needed to be patient. However, as my children got older, I started to worry about their future. I felt guilty because for a long while they were young I was away from them. (A-shui, 40 years old)

These accounts illustrate migrant workers’ constant struggle between maintaining their family’s economic survival and attending to their children’s emotional needs. Despite sadness and guilt, most continued to sacrifice for their family’s financial needs.

Nevertheless, once the perceived emotional cost of separation reached a certain threshold, some migrant workers chose to return home even though they were allowed to stay up to nine years according to the current policy. One migrant worker said:

My son confided he was upset I was away, and so I had to talk frequently with him. I promised to return home this year. Although I know that I could remain a further two years in Taiwan, I’ve decided caring for him is necessary. If anything bad were to happen to him while I was not there, I’d regret it; making more money would not be worth it. My children’s future is more important than money right now. My son said, “Mom, you’re more important than anything else.” Immediately after realizing his feelings, I decided to return before his birthday. Hopefully I’ll be his best birthday present. He has awaited my return for over 7 years, so I don’t want to disappoint him again. (Fan-jie, 42 years old)

One of the care workers in this study had a different migratory trajectory. As a widow who had two grown-up and financially-independent children, she had fewer family obligations and thus chose to maximize financial gain in Taiwan. She commented:

Unlike my Vietnamese friends I met here, I don’t have a husband; my children are all grown-up and have their own family, so I don’t feel like returning to Vietnam soon, but I don’t know if the government will allow us to stay longer. (A-yun, 46 years old)
Children’s transition into independent adulthood not only enhanced A-yun’s income-generating opportunity, but also provided her with freedom and autonomy. A-yun became less involved in her children’s lives after they started their own families. Three other migrant workers in this study instead chose to help their grown-up children engage in migratory work:

My younger son is also in Taiwan. He’s been working in a factory for two years. I paid the broker fee and it cost me 6000US dollars to get him over here. (A-bei, 45 years old)

Three years ago, I told my son about working in Taiwan. “Mom will work for a few more years. Would you also like to work in Taiwan?” I asked him to decide whether to go to graduate school or to start working. He told me that he’d like to give it a try…. I’m very happy to see him in Taiwan because I’ve been away from him for so long. I could only hear his voice from the phone. Now, I have my son living close to me. (A-chao, 46 years old)

Both migrant workers were involved in their children’s transition into adulthood. A-chao felt it necessary to negotiate this work opportunity with her son because it was considered a major life change. Also, helping her son to gain financial independence in the same country was considered a strategy for accomplishing a family reunion.

6.3 Negotiation of Family Care: The Transnational Care Chain

I now explore how additional players are involved in the ‘care chain’. Many migrant women employed to care for elders in Taiwan were responsible for looking after dependent family members prior to their departure. When the core family caregiver was absent, alternative family care was needed and had to be negotiated. In the following, I show how migrant women negotiated their care responsibilities with other relatives as a means of managing the intergenerational ambivalence caused by their
overseas employment. I also show how global care chains occurred when migrant workers received help to meet care needs at home while serving elders abroad. One side of this care chain comprises multiple care transfers (both child and elder care) within the migrant worker’s kinship network.

6.3.1 Child care

Most migrant workers in this study relied on other relatives in addition to their husbands to look after their children:

Interviewer: A-zhen, how do you arrange child care when you are away? 
A-zhen: My daughter is attending high school and she’s now living with my sister because her place is closer to the school. My sister is her guardian. My son is still living with his dad who supervises him and makes sure he studies hard.

Interviewer: Who cares for your children? 
A-bi: My husband and father-in-law. Because my parents live next door, my kids can also eat and sleep there. My sister also helps them with their homework. My family jointly shares child care. Although I feel bad that my children can’t be with me, I’m not worried about them.

When I left, my children were still young; both my mother and sister-in-law look after them for me. Without their help, I wouldn’t be able to work here. (A-hui, 40 years old)

When making child care arrangements, these migrants called upon both patrilineal and matrilineal kinship groups. They remained informed about their children’s situation; other relatives ensured that maternal responsibilities were fulfilled and essential child care was provided.

In two of the cases, when the husband passed away during the migrant’s absence, family-in-laws became the primary source of care:
I’m close to my in-laws. Ever since my husband passed away, they helped me look after my family. My brothers-in-law and their wives also help so I don’t worry about my kids while I’m in Taiwan. (Yuan-yuan, 46 years old)

Since my husband’s death, my parents-in-law have helped me to look after my sons. They live next to our house; my mother-in-law come over and cook for them…. I have a great relationship with my in-laws. They have three daughters-in-law and told me that I’m their favorite one. (A-yun, 46 years old)

In both cases, migrant workers’ strong emotional affinity with in-laws eased care transfer. Patrilineal kin members made a concerted effort to nurture and care for migrants’ children when they were away.

The pre-migration marital status of care workers influenced which members of their kinship groups participated in care transfers during their absence. Those who had divorced tended to request help from their natal families. One participant noted:

My parents and siblings treat my son very well and always buy things he needs. My brother and I built my parents a house, where they live with my son. My mom prepares meals for him…. Although my sisters are busy, were my son to be sick, one of them would take him to the hospital. (A-jin, 51 years old)

A-jin’s case exemplified a clear division of child care labour: housing by A-jin and her brother; food and other daily necessities by parents and other siblings; and transportation and care during sickness by her sister. When asked about who provided primary child care, A-jin stated:

Mostly my mom, but my brother and sisters come over whenever they have time. They help my parents with laundry and daily shopping. All live close by except my oldest sister who lives 30 kilometers away.

A-jin’s parents provided primary care for her son, whereas her siblings provided supplemental assistance. When divorced mothers migrate, maternal responsibilities are
no longer bounded by the mother-child relationship, but involve multiple extended family ties in a matrifocal kinship system. In one case, the migrant worker relied on different family members to perform the role of maternal surrogate:

**Interviewer:** Who took care of your sons after you left Vietnam?
**A-bei:** My dad used to look after them. After he died, one of my sisters took care of them. When they lived with her, she prepared meals, did the laundry and ensured they did their homework. I asked her to look after my sons, so I can be carefree while working abroad.

In this case, serial rather than simultaneous caregiving was provided by multiple members of the natal family.

While working abroad, one migrant worker reported that older children also took on part of the caregiving responsibilities for younger siblings:

When I first left, my son was still young, so my daughter, who is 9 years older than him, took care of him for me and acted as if she were his mother. Now, they’re very close to each other. (A-zhen, 47 years old)

In this case the worker’s daughter was only ten years old, and her son only one, when she left. While the daughter provided care to her younger brother, A-zhen also asked adult family members to check on them:

I also asked my mother-in-law and brother-in-law to come over and see if my children are doing alright. (A-zhen, 47 years old)

A-zhen described the only family care network involving both child and adult caregivers.

---

**Table 6.1: A Summary of Alternative Care Arrangements in Migrant Workers’ Families**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Alternative Child Care Arrangements</th>
<th>Source of care</th>
<th>Implications</th>
<th>Alternative Elder Care Arrangements</th>
<th>Source of care</th>
<th>Implications</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Husband as the primary caregiver</td>
<td>Social versus biological mothering</td>
<td>1. Husband</td>
<td>Intragenerational transfer of filial care</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Help from both patrilineal and matrilineal families</td>
<td>Good care demanded</td>
<td>2. Children</td>
<td>Multi-generational transfer of care</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Help from patrilineal family</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Help from matrilineal family</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Sibling care (the older for the younger)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 6.1 provides a summary of alternative child care arrangements. The diverse arrangements negotiated by migrant workers and their families shared two common themes. First, ‘social mothers’ supplemented biological mothers. The former involves one or, more often, multiple kin members, who provide quasi-motherly care. Maternal care became a shared experience within these families. Second, regardless of how alternative care was achieved, all of the care workers interviewed were very concerned with providing the best replacement care possible within their kinship groups. Having confidence that it was being provided to their children was a source of considerable consolation in the face of the emotional burden of separation. The need to provide child care maintained family bonds not just between mother and children, but among her siblings, parents, and in-laws as well.

6.3.2 Elder care

Academic research on transnational motherhood usually focuses on migrant workers’ children and thus overlooks the other dependent family members who may also require care. Prior to departure, some migrant workers also cared for their parents or in-laws. Their participation in overseas employment made it necessary to arrange the provision of alternative elder care. One married migrant worker recalled:

After my brother-in-law’s death, my mother-in-law’s health declined and she moved into our house. I cared for her until I left for Taiwan. When I’m away, my husband looks after her. (A-nan, 39 years old)

This change in the elder’s living arrangement led to an intragenerational transfer of filial care. The sharing of parental care among sons observed in Taiwanese families (see Chapter Four) also occurred in this Vietnamese family. A-nan also demonstrated ‘gender
transfer of filial care’. The daughter-in-law became the primary caregiver after the arrival of the elder. Migration then reversed that ‘gender transfer’: A-nan’s husband reassumed his filial care responsibility when she was away.

Another type of elder care rearrangement occurred in the form of a ‘skipped generation’ household, where a caregiving relationship developed between the elderly parents and children of the migrant workers:

After my husband passed away, I moved to my parents’ house. They helped me to raise my children…. After my dad had a stroke, I looked after him for two years. When I’m away, my mother cared for him. When my children were older, they provided help to their grandparents. (A-jing, 42 years old)

A-jing exemplifies reciprocating multi-generational family care over time. She relied on her parents for child care early in life and cared for her father until her departure. Grandchildren later provided elder care. Family members acquired different roles in the caregiving relationship, from being a care recipient to being caretakers or vice versa. This complex care arrangement occurred after three key transitions in A-jing’s life: change in marital status, living arrangements, and international migration.

Intergenerational reciprocity of care between grandparents and grandchildren was also observed in another case:

Interviewer: Who looked after your children when you first left home?
A-ting: My mother-in-law did when she was in better health. She’s getting older now, so I often ask my children to take care of their grandmother. After school, they help her to prepare dinner.

Similar to A-jing, A-ting demonstrated multi-generational interdependency in care over the family life course.
In another case, although actual elder care was not involved, the migrant worker still had to negotiate the cost of elder care from afar:

After I arrived in Taiwan, my father-in-law got sick and needed money for his medical treatment. I discussed it with my brothers- and sisters-in-law and told them to try their best to cover the expense and that I’d cover the rest. In the end, they only contributed a little bit and I paid most of it. (A-zhen, 47 years old)

Despite various care dependencies between different family members over the life course, in all cases these dependencies constituted a transnational elder care chain:

Migrant workers sought substitute family caregivers to ensure that elderly parents or in-laws were cared for while serving elderly clients overseas. Table 6.1 summarizes observed types of alternatives for elder care.

For others, elder care was not an issue. Three of the migrant workers reported that while working abroad, their parents or in-laws were healthy and remained independent and did not require care:

My parents-in-law are in their 80s, but they’re still healthy and self-dependent (A-yun, 46 years old)

Interviewer: Do your parents need care? A-shui: No, they are in good health, so they don’t need someone to look after them.

My father-in-law passed away and my mother-in-law is very healthy. She can still work on the farm. That’s why I don’t need to worry about her while working here. (A-chao, 47 years old)

Although over half of the migrant care workers in this study did not discuss elder care needs back home, those who did helped us to explore an emerging dimension of global care chains. Figure 6.1 shows different care transfer processes in both family of
definition and origin and how they are negotiated in the context of transnational labour migration.

**Figure 6.1: The Configuration of Global Care Chains**

- Taiwanese families
  - Elders
  - Migrant care worker
  - Adult children/employers

- Vietnamese families
  - Migrant’s children
  - Migrant’s relatives (patrilineal & matrilineal)
  - Migrant’s parents & in-laws

**Regional Economic Inequalities**

### 6.4 Remittance Transfers, Allocation and Management

Studying the transfer, allocation and management of remittances (portions of the migrant workers’ pay) is also part of understanding transnational family ties. Family members had unequal access to the migrant workers’ income. In all marital status categories, 13 of the 23 migrant workers in the second phase of fieldwork sent money to ‘other relatives’ (e.g., siblings, parents or in-laws). Ten of the sixteen married migrant workers sent it to their husbands (see Table 6.2). Whether the husband had access to the remittances reveals gendered power relations as reflected in how migrant workers negotiate budgeting, financial planning and daily expenditure with their spouses.
Table 6.2: Primary Remittance Recipient by the Migrant Worker’s Marital Status

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Other relatives (siblings/parents/in-laws)</th>
<th>Husband</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Married</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Divorced</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Widowed</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subtotal</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

When married migrant workers became the main household income earner, five of them claimed that they took decision-making power from their husbands. By controlling the household revenue, they limited the spouse’s autonomy in daily spending:

Interviewer: A-bi, can you tell me who decides how money will be spent in the household
A-bi: My husband doesn’t have much money with him, so if he needs to buy something, he must discuss it with me first, especially when it involves a major purchase.

Interviewer: Are you the primary household decision maker now?
A-juan: Yes, I am because I’m the family’s primary breadwinner. My husband can’t do anything without my approval. If he wants to buy something, he’ll discuss it with me first.

Migrant workers’ primary control over the revenue produced by their labour indicates a gendered power relation at the household level. One of the migrant workers described how this relation changed after migration:

When I was in Vietnam, I had to listen to my husband all the time because he was the head of the family. All I did was to work on the farm and look after children. Now, I feel that I have more control over him. I told him, “If you take care of our grandchildren and behave yourself at home, I’ll give you a monthly allowance”. (A-dan, 46 years old)

The financial autonomy A-dan gained from overseas employment allowed her to alter her subservient role. A-dan experienced a turning point in which working abroad provided her with a means to enhance her household position. She not only became in
charge of the household finance, but was also able to assess, reward or punish her husband's conduct. Migrant workers who claimed to be the household decision-maker also worried that their husbands might misspend remittances, and thus sent their income to a reliable family member:

I don’t let my husband manage the money because I fear that he may lend it to friends and we may not be able to get it back.... I used to send money to my sister-in-law when my brother worked overseas. Now he’s back and manages the money for me.... Ever since our childhood, we’ve been very close to each other. (A-tsuen, 37 years old)

Interviewer: A-xian, to whom do you send the money? A-xian: I always send it to my mother and she deposits it into the bank for me. Interviewer: Why don’t you send money to your husband? A-xian: Well, if he needs money, I’ll ask my mom to give it to him...I’m afraid he may misuse it when I’m not around. I’ve told him that my mother’s in charge of the money and that if he needs money, he can discuss it with me.

Both migrant workers kept strong ties with their natal families after marriage, which then became a primary source of assistance in remittance management.

By contrast, four of the migrant workers reported that they preferred collective decision-making despite their primary breadwinner status:

My husband feels that he should be the family breadwinner, but I’m taking this role right now instead. Despite being the family breadwinner, I don’t exercise power over him. (A-nan, 39 years old)

When my husband and I have more money, we can do more things, but I don’t see myself overpowering him. If you have more money, but fail to maintain the marriage, it’s not worth making more money. Although I earn more money, I still discuss it with him in terms of household budget and spending. We respect each other. (A-chao, 46 years old)

A-chao regarded the exercise of power as a threat to her marriage. Mutual respect brought her and her husband equal status and stabilized their marital relationship. Her
effort to involve her husband in family financial matters kept the married couple an egalitarian decision-making unit. In these cases, migrant workers' full trust in their husbands facilitated a collective decision-making process, which required that husbands have access to their wives’ incomes:

Interviewer: A-ting, can you tell me who makes the household decision when you’re away?
A-ting: When building a new house or purchasing anything major for the house, my husband and I discuss and reach an agreement together. I only send money to my husband. He never misspends the money, so I fully trust him. We always let each other know how to spend the household income.

In one case the husband was granted only partial access to his wife’s income:

I don’t send much money to my husband. I told him, “It’s not because I don’t trust you, but I’m just afraid that you may overspend it.” I want to save some money for my retirement, so I send most of my earnings to my sister, but my husband doesn’t know this at all. If he finds out, he’ll think I don’t trust him at all and our relationship may be ruined. (A-chao, 47 years old)

A-chao worried about her husband’s potential poor spending habits. To protect her financial interest while avoiding marital conflict, she strategically negotiated with her sister by not fully disclosing remittance allocation to her husband.

There were two cases in which migrant workers’ husbands remained primary household decision-makers despite their wives being the family breadwinners:

My husband and I discuss everything together, but he’s the one who makes the final decision. He seeks my opinions when needed but I believe that he can make the right decision, so I mostly let him decide on things at home. If I feel something’s wrong, I’ll let him know. (A-shui, 40 years old)

I regard my husband as the head of the family even though he knows that I’m quite capable of making some of the decisions by myself…. I don’t want him to feel inferior to me. No matter how much money I make, my husband remains the household head. (Fan-jie, 42 years old)
By acknowledging their husbands as household head, A-shui and Fan-jie reproduce the patriarchal family structure. The husband’s primacy in dealing with household affairs remains even though he might not engage in paid work. Both migrant workers avoided taking over household decision-making in order to protect the husband’s position. This ‘protection of patriarchy’ strengthened the decision-making power of the male household head.

Divorced and widowed migrant workers, on the other hand, automatically became the primary household decision-makers and enjoyed their autonomy in managing their income. Nonetheless, they relied on a trusted relative to manage remittances in their absence:

Interviewer: To whom do you send the money?
A-bei: I send money to one of my older sisters who manages my money. She buys what I request and advises me what the best deals are, as she’s better informed than me. She accounts for these purchases and whenever I return, she shows me the records.

I always send money to my oldest sister who then allocates the money to my family. All my siblings know that I asked her to manage my money. After discussion with her, I determine how much money to allot to each sibling. She saves the rest in my account. (A-jin, 51 years old)

One migrant worker sent money to a particular female sibling, the primary helper during her absence:

Interviewer: To whom do you send the money?
A-jing: I always send money to my fourth oldest sister, but I decide how money is spent. I’d talk with her before purchasing anything. I also tell her to give each of my kids a monthly allowance. If there’s money left, I ask her to save it in the bank.

Interviewer: Why to her specifically?
A-jing: She’s the one who always helps me out in the family.
A-jing regarded her sister as a trusted proxy who could attend to her needs, and assist her in providing financial support to the children back home.

The two single migrant workers reported that they sent money back to their mothers who helped them to manage it. One of them commented:

I send some money back home to help my family and I save some for myself. My mom was sick for a while, so I paid for her medical bills. Health care is expensive in Vietnam. I have no choice but to be the family breadwinner. I want to fulfill my filial piety. (A-xiang, 29 years old)

For A-xiang, sending remittances provided her with a means of being a ‘dutiful daughter.’

Remittances are not only a form of financial assistance, but also a means for migrant workers to reinforce a good family relationship:

Interviewer: Do you also help your siblings financially?
A-shui: Only when they experience financial difficulties, such as medical expenses. Whenever New Year arrives, I always send them some money. We’re very close to each other; that’s why I help them out when they are in need.

Ever since my husband passed away, my mother- and brothers-in-law and their wives have helped me to take care of my family. That’s why I can be carefree in Taiwan. We’re very close to each other, so whenever I have extra money left, I always send it back to them. (Yuan-yuan, 46 years old)

In this case, remittance transfers were also in exchange for child care and thus mutually benefited the migrant and her family members.

Narratives consistently showed that migrant workers relied on a ‘need-based’ assessment to determine their level of assistance to their family members:

Interviewer: Do you lend each of your siblings an equal amount of money?
A-jin: No. It depends. If one has more children to support, I’ll lend him/her more. My oldest and second sisters have a higher salary, so I don’t transfer money to them.
Whoever in my family needs financial support, I’ll ask my husband to transfer money to him/her. When my husband tells me how much money is needed, I’ll send the money back home. (A-su, 40 years old)

One time, my older sister told me that she needed help to build a house, so I sent money to her. My youngest brother had little money, so I gave him more. His brother made more money, so I gave him less. (A-xian, 47 years old)

These migrant workers allocated remittances to their siblings based on equity. They assessed each other’s financial standing to make a fair share of their financial gain. They all attempted to improve their family’s collective economic well-being.

The non-economic aspects of remittance transfers are summarized in Table 6.3. These cross-border economic transactions shed light on the dynamics of transnational family relationships. The relationship negotiation of remittances occurred in a social context that reconfigured and reinforced family ties and gender relations while serving to maintain strong kinship ties between migrant workers and their natal families. In various ways, migrant workers actively engaged in household affairs from afar.

Table 6.3: Remittances and Family/Gender Relationships

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Social Aspect of Remittances</th>
<th>Married Migrants</th>
<th>Implications</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Primary recipient</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other relatives (siblings, parents, in-laws)</td>
<td>Wife as the primary decision maker/ help from siblings (proxy)</td>
<td>Gender power relation shifted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Husband</td>
<td>Collective decision making (trust, mutual respect)</td>
<td>Egalitarian spousal relation sustained</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Husband as the primary decision maker</td>
<td>Traditional patriarchy reproduced</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Non-married migrants (single, divorced, widowed)</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Primary recipient</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other relatives (siblings, parents, in-laws)</td>
<td>Help from siblings, parents or in-laws (proxy)</td>
<td>Enjoying a sense of autonomy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Being a ‘dutiful daughter’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Reinforcing a good family relationship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Exchanges for family care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Needs-based transfers</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
6.5 Multiple Family Ties

So far, this chapter has shown how migrant workers negotiate family responsibilities and relationships through a wide range of transnational activities. Next I explore how migrant workers perceive and negotiate multiple social ties in different locations across geographical distance over time. Eight of the migrant workers in this study felt that they had become simultaneously connected to the host family and the family of origin:

Because I’ve been in Taiwan for a long time, when I return to Vietnam, I’ll miss being here. This Taiwanese family treats me very well and makes me consider Taiwan my second home. (A-hui, 40 years old)

I feel that my employer’s family is just like the one in Vietnam. Everyone here treats me very nicely. This is like my second home! (A-shui, 40 years old)

Both migrant workers developed an emotional attachment to the country of employment, expressed through the notion of a 'second home' and, indicating a sense of multiple belonging:

Interviewer: Do you now feel that you have two homes?
A-tang: Yes: one in Vietnam and the other one here (Taiwan).... A-ma is like my mother and treats me like her youngest daughter. For me, there are no differences between both homes. It’s basically like transferring the housework from Vietnam to Taiwan.

A-tang expressed her feeling of belonging to two ‘homes.’ Despite their geographical distance, she perceived both to have a similar significance. While serving the elder, she perceived ‘home’ to be the site of household activities and thus regarded both equally.

Migrant workers with a feeling of multiple belonging could possibly establish a
‘transnational bi-familial tie,’ that is, a simultaneous attachment to the employing family and family of origin:

Interviewer: How do you feel about your employer’s family?
Yuan-yuan: I see this family just like my Vietnamese one. I don’t distinguish between them. If anything goes wrong in both families, I’ll worry about both.

However, this tie might evoke conflicting concerns for migrant workers: a fear of failing to meet care needs of ‘loved ones’ in two families. One respondent observed:

For a very long period of time, I’ve been away from home and rarely see my family. Thus, I’m very concerned. On the other hand, I’m also worried about Papa’s and Auntie’s health in Taiwan, so I feel torn between two families.
(A-jin, 51 years old)

A-jin simultaneously felt emotionally pulled in two directions by virtue of feeling responsible for two families. Despite migrant workers’ sense of bi-familial belonging, they might not attend equally to the care needs of both families. When this occurs, they must negotiate care responsibilities:

After I finished the second contract, my mother-in-law asked me to return. I first told her that I would, but I changed my mind. I added, “I’m still young and healthy and I’d like to work for a few more years. Also, Madam and Sir’s sisters begged me to stay longer to care for A-ma, so could you please help me to take care of our family?” (A-chao, 47 years old)

Interviewer: To which family are you giving more attention now?
A-jin: The one in Taiwan.
Interviewer: Why?
A-jin: Although life in Vietnam is difficult, my parents and son are cared for by my siblings, so I’m not worried about them. However, Papa’s children are too busy with their work to care for him…. Auntie’s husband has passed away and her children chose not to provide care. I’m very sympathetic to her.

Both migrant workers continued to work abroad and meet the care needs of their employer’s family, because they assumed that the re-negotiated caregiving roles of
members of their family of origin were meeting the needs of their children and parents or in-laws at home.

Several migrant women describe how macro-level constraints, specifically, Taiwanese labour regulations, create a situation in which the ties developed with members of the employing family are not sustainable over time:

When I’m here, I miss my Vietnamese home, but when I’m in Vietnam, I miss my daily routine in Taiwan.... I feel that I’m taking care of two families. I work hard and prepare daily meals for this family. In Vietnam, my children miss me and want me to return home. Eventually, I have to return and reunite with my family. (A-dan, 46 years old)

A-dan’s ‘transnational bi-familial tie’ comprises biological kin and ‘social kin’. However, her temporary work status and Taiwan’s denial of permanent residency make that tie precarious and transient. Once she completes her renewal contract, she must return home. Another worker observed:

Interviewer: What will you feel after you finish the last contract?
Xiao-ba: I’ll miss this family a lot, but what else can I do? I can only keep in touch with them by phone and ask them if everything is alright. When I return home next time, I’ll call A-ma right away.

Xiao-ba’s narrative reflects an important transition which is likely to apply to all of the migrant workers in this study. State policies force them to live in the home of their employer and the elder, but they also determine their ultimate separation. In response to this reality, three of the migrant workers expressed their concern about the quality of care by their prospective replacement:

After I return to Vietnam, I’ll be very concerned about A-ma because the new care worker may not be able to take good care of her. I also worry if the new worker can get along with A-ma. (A-yun, 46 years old)
After I leave, I’m afraid that the new worker may not be able to provide good care to the elders and then I’ll be concerned about them. (A-jin, 51 years old)

I hope A-ma will stay healthy. Before I leave, I’ll ask her to be careful when she deals with the new care worker. She needs to learn how to work with a new carer. (Fan-jie, 42 years old)

Another migrant worker planned to volunteer advice to the new worker on how to best meet the needs of both the elder and the employer’s family:

Interviewer: How do you feel about your ultimate return to Vietnam?
A-zhen: I know that my employer will eventually hire someone else. I’ll worry about the quality of care because the new worker may not know how to meet A-gong’s needs. I’ll tell her everything she must know before I leave.
Interviewer: What will you tell the new worker?
A-zhen: I’ll ask her to pay attention to the details of her work and not to rush everything. A-gong and my employer may not be happy if she fails to meet their expectation and their relationship may also be compromised.

These migrant women were concerned that the new worker could also provide ‘good care’ to the elder and the family they had served for years, and considered ensuring this their responsibility. In this way, the obligation developed as part of their bi-familial ties led them to continue to have a sense of filial duty to their employer and elder client even after the termination of the employment contract.

Six of the migrant workers discussed contract termination as an important transition in their migratory trajectory. Regardless of whether they developed a quasi-familial tie with the host family, they all had to return home. They awaited reunions with their families and looked forward to resuming their family caregiving obligations after long separations:
After I finish my last contract, I’d like to return and be with my family. Maybe, I’ll have a grandchild after I go home! (Xiao-ba, 38 years old)

I know I’d like to earn more money, but I prefer to go home and take care of my own family. I’ve been away from them for too long. My children are getting older and they really need my care and company. (A-shi, 40 years old)

While state policies constrained migrant workers’ further income-earning opportunities, they also felt obligated to care for their family, suggesting that a new life course transition will follow after long-term migration.

**6.6 Summary**

Women who work as care workers abroad negotiate their family relations and responsibilities transnationally. Marital status plays a role in shaping the processes and outcomes of negotiations that determine the conditions of cross-border paid work, as well as the distribution of domestic and care responsibilities. Married migrant women who negotiated their departure with their husband also sought approval from their natal and husband’s family, whereas non-married migrant workers only discussed it with their natal family. Overall, data show that initial and continued migration is not individually determined. The decision to work overseas, as well as the subsequent arrangements that this decision makes necessary, are negotiated within the kinship group.

Migrant workers also engage in various transnational activities to assure their children that their mothers remained connected with them. When migrant women are the core family caregiver, they negotiate alternative care with other relatives back home. This is a case of how they manage intergenerational ambivalence during their absences from home.
Migrant workers’ diverse family ties and dynamics shape various alternative care patterns while they are away. Both child and elder care rearrangements in migrant workers’ families constitute part of global care chains. Specific cases of care transfers are the meso-level outcome of labour migrations, which are caused in part by macro level pressures resulting from regional economic inequalities. The latent consequences of migration, including the need to negotiate care transfers, are a significant aspect of the phenomenon of migrant labour.

Remittance transfers provide another context in which migrant women negotiate transnational family ties. In particular, the analysis of remittance sending and management processes reveals relationship and gender power dynamics. Paying attention to the social dimensions of remittances help us to further understand the complex webs of migrant workers’ family relationships and the ongoing negotiation processes that involved multiple family members.

Finally, migrant women negotiate multiple social ties over time. Although Taiwan’s foreign labour policies are a factor in constructing ‘transnational bi-familial ties’, they also make attachment to the Taiwanese family precarious and unstable in the long term. The multiple senses of belonging expressed by migrant workers provide an example of how labour policy, familial and quasi-familial ties, and personal identity are interconnected.
Chapter 7: DISCUSSION & and CONCLUSIONS

In this concluding chapter, I highlight the key findings and combine observations concerning Taiwanese families and the Vietnamese workers that they hire to care for their elders. I then discuss how my conceptual framework applies to my findings. While assessing the contributions of this research to the study of family ties and care, I identify emergent issues and questions which could create avenues for future research and theorizing. Finally, I consider relevant policy implications and share some reflections on my research process.

7.1 Major Findings

This thesis has six main findings. First, my qualitative data reveal the continuous multi-generational living arrangement to be the most common living arrangement in Taiwanese families when parents receive care. This reflects the dominant norm of the stem-family household structure (see Table 2.2) in which the elders typically continue to cohabit with one particular son, daughter-in-law and their grandchildren. This analysis enhances our understanding of Taiwan’s unique process of fan-jia (Cohen, 1976:57), namely, the subdivision of the kinship system into smaller family units over the family life course. While in some families, it is the oldest male child who is the co-resident son, in others, it is the last married son who continues to live with the elders. Although uncommon, when a son remains single, he typically stays at his parents’ home and provides care to them when needed. In one of the families, the co-resident son is the only male child who chooses a career close to parents’ home, so he continues living with
them and offers them help later in life. In another family, the co-resident son is the one with whom elderly parents prefer to live. In this situation, it is the elders’ own choice rather than a male child’s attributes that makes this living arrangement. Finally, in this study if one is the only son in the family, he continues to live with his parents to fulfill his filial duty.

Unless the son is divorced, he and his wife typically reconcile the demands of care and paid work together by altering their own employment situation and deciding who will provide primary care to the elder. In this reconciliation, different types of household care arrangements occur: care is either provided primarily by the son or by the daughter-in-law or, in most cases, equally shared by both parties. My analysis does not examine the caregiving experience of men or women separately but focuses on the ways that individuals negotiate structured gender relations (Connidis & Kemp, 2008) and cultural norms lead to specific care arrangements.

The second finding reveals several salient factors involved in the dynamic negotiation processes of care arrangements before the arrival of a Vietnamese care worker. Prior to seeking paid help, siblings ‘work out’ their filial care responsibilities typically by helping each other out. Quality of sibling ties, in particular, affects the level of their collaboration when their parents become dependent. With strong sibling ties, adult children are often committed to support each other by providing physical and financial help. Regardless of whether a daughter-in-law is helping her co-resident husband take care of his parents, married and unmarried sisters are more likely than married brothers who live apart from their parents to help the co-resident brother
provide care. In this study, it is a brother who usually has the main care responsibility, but he is more likely to receive help from his sisters as secondary caregivers than from other brothers. My observation differs from Western research which finds that sisters are more likely than brothers to assume the primary filial responsibility and seek assistance from other siblings when parents require care (Matthews, 2002).

Although sibling collaboration is the most commonly observed family care arrangement, some adult children provide little mutual support under particular circumstances. First, sibling tensions, caused by their father’s uneven distribution of family wealth during the process of fan-jia, make brothers, in particular, unwilling to provide care. This is one special case where sisters would step in and take over the filial responsibility from their brothers who choose not to fulfill their traditional filial duty because they did not receive the family assets from their father. Second, limited financial resources also discourage some siblings from providing care. Third, geographical distance hinders some siblings from fulfilling their care responsibilities. When the last two conditions occur, care responsibilities primarily fall on one or two brothers who accept unequal levels of support from those siblings who have fewer resources and live farther away.

All families in this study experience a care transition in which they ultimately hire a foreign live-in care worker to care for their elders. This care arrangement is typically negotiated among adult children. Typically, the co-resident son takes the lead by proposing this paid care arrangement to his siblings although in some cases, the daughter-in-law also participates in this decision-making process, especially when she
commits to her filial duty. Usually with the support of all of his siblings, the co-resident son begins the procedure of hiring the care worker. In two particular situations, siblings did not engage in this process. First, some siblings chose not to get involved in the negotiation process due to the financial pressure of pursuing this care arrangement. Second, negotiation did not occur among siblings due to family tensions created by the unequal division of family wealth. In this situation, brothers who are the major recipient of family assets hire the foreign care worker.

The main rationale for adopting this alternative care arrangement is to preserve the in-home care tradition based on the cultural ideal of filial piety while continuing to participate in the workforce. Choosing this alternative care option also means rejecting other care arrangements such as nursing homes which many of the families perceive to be morally inappropriate.

This study shows a continued process of family negotiations after the worker’s arrival. Findings illustrate that unless one experiences financial difficulties, adult children, typically sons, share the cost of the worker’s salary. While married daughters are not expected to assume this cost, exceptions do occur when their brothers require financial assistance. This is the case in which siblings share the cost, allowing those of modest means to afford a worker. Once families hire the worker, members of the employing family continue to engage in care and negotiate the care tasks with the worker. Generally, Taiwanese adult children provide routine support (e.g., grocery shopping, transportation aid for hospital visits), whereas the Vietnamese worker provides the intensive personal care (e.g., bathing, feeding, or toileting).
Third, my findings address how domestic paid care is negotiated between Taiwanese employers, elder care recipients, and Vietnamese workers. When Taiwanese families hire Vietnamese care workers, an employer-worker relationship trajectory begins. This relationship does not remain static, but evolves as both parties adapt to each other for mutual benefits. Typically, the employer relies on the worker to provide ‘good care’ to the elder. In turn, the employer exercises ‘instrumental personalism’ (Hondagneu-Sotelo, 2007; Lan, 2003a) as a strategy of establishing a quasi-familial relationship with the worker, hoping that she will be loyal to the family and provide quality care to the elder. On the other hand, the worker aims to keep her job by providing ‘good care’ through her demonstration of proper physical care and emotional care, which is a form of ‘labour of love’ (Folbre & Nelson, 2000). Both parties seek to satisfy their goals by negotiating what constitutes ‘good care.’

At the same time, the worker and the elder adapt to each other as they work out their caregiving relationship over time. Typically, the social distance between these two parties is heightened by the worker’s initial language barrier. However, by improving language proficiency and, more importantly, by providing ‘good care’, the worker tends to make the elder become physically and emotionally dependent on her. As a result, the elder typically sees the worker to be the primary caregiver in the family care network over time.

Fourth, my findings also demonstrate conflict situations that occur and disrupt the continued provision of good care. Conflict evolves in the forms of direct three-party encounters, indirect three-party encounters and two-party encounters (see Table 5.2).
The three parties, Taiwanese adult children, the worker and the elder, typically work out their problematic relationships when conflict arises. In the worker-elder conflict situation, the employer typically intervenes by either comforting both parties, or by seeking justice for the worker, as seen in the case of the elder’s abusive behaviour, to restore family peace and ensure the worker’s continuation of good care. When conflict occurs between the worker and the employer, the worker seeks alliance with the elder who has become dependent on her as a strategy to bargain with the employer, such as requesting more pay. Reaching an alternative employment agreement alleviates their interpersonal tension. In another worker-employer conflict situation, the worker chooses to accept the unfair treatment by her employer to ensure that the elder continues to receive good care. When tensions become irresolvable, all three parties take no further action and accept the conflict situation until the contract ends. Although uncommon, the worker can also resist her employer’s domination by threatening to quit her job to alter her subordinate household position.

Fifth, my findings demonstrate the dynamic negotiation processes of family care and kinship ties among the Vietnamese workers. Vietnamese care workers face very different life circumstances from their Taiwanese employers under which they negotiate responsibilities in their own families. While they work abroad to provide economic support to their families, they remain responsible for child care. To resolve the ambivalence of earning income overseas and being absent from their children, they work out their care responsibility with their husbands who typically agree to assume the primary care obligation. This work-care arrangement or ‘adaptive strategy’ (Moen,
2003:245; Moen & Hernandez, 2009:273) differs from the Taiwanese context where family elder care is typically shared by married couples who later employ foreign workers to help them care for their elders.

Vietnamese migrant wives also negotiate child care assistance with family members in both the patrilineal and matrilineal families during their absence. This adaptive strategy helps to resolve the contradictory demands of work and family obligations among Vietnamese workers and the ambivalence of trying to help the family through work abroad and being absent from the daily lives of their families. Although uncommon, some Vietnamese workers also must negotiate support for the elderly relative both before and after their departure to Taiwan. Typically, their husbands or grown-up children help them to fulfill their elder care responsibilities while working abroad.

A key method of negotiating care arrangements and kinship ties by Vietnamese care workers is through remittance transfers. Vietnamese workers use their earnings as an exchange with their husbands and other family relatives for child care, and as a means to engage in mothering by defining earnings as a vehicle for providing for their children’s future, such as education. Sending remittances also provides a way of fulfilling filial obligation, especially for unmarried workers. For Vietnamese workers who choose not to let their husbands manage the income for fear of their misspending, strong kinship ties these workers developed with members in their natal families before they leave become a primary source of assistance in remittance management.
Sixth, my data illustrate how the negotiation of care arrangements simultaneously involves families in two geographical regions. Over time, many Vietnamese workers develop strong ties with members in their host families in addition to those with their own families. These multiple attachments leave some workers feeling emotionally pulled in two directions and responsible for two families. This is a case where workers experience competing loyalties while reconciling the care demands in both situations. However, whether there is adequate care at home and financial necessity are the main drivers of prolonging their stay in Taiwan. For example, some attempt to return home to resume their care responsibilities, whereas others plan to work longer to earn more money, especially if their children receive proper support from their extended family members at home or require no care after they reach adulthood.

To summarize, findings of my thesis consist of three main aspects of negotiations that are all connected in the local and transnational contexts of care. Taiwanese families negotiate care arrangements for their dependent elderly members; Taiwanese employers/elders and Vietnamese care workers work out their work relationships; and Vietnamese care workers negotiate their work and family responsibilities with their family members from afar.

7.2 Discussion

Family living and care arrangements in Taiwan, and foreign work and subsequent family arrangements in Vietnamese families are the outcome of dynamic negotiation processes, shaped by the macro context of filial norms and structured social relations, particularly class and gender; the meso context of competing life domains, such as paid
work and family care; and the micro context of kinship ties, interpersonal interaction and agency exercised by individuals.

The combined perspective of life course and ambivalence sheds light on how cultural and societal shifts in Taiwan, transnational labour migration among Vietnamese women, and structured social relations create continuity and change over time in the lives of family members, and contradictory demands of paid work and family care experienced by individuals. Individuals typically negotiate those contradictions with their family members both intergenerationally and intragenerationally in order to reduce work-care conflict. The outcome of the negotiation marks the transition in work, care and family arrangements observed in the Taiwanese, Vietnamese and transnational contexts in which global care chains emerge.

The Confucian ethos of filial piety that one provides help to one’s dependent parents continues to influence Taiwanese care practices later in life. Adult children negotiate this cultural norm of ‘intergenerational contract’ (Greenhalgh, 1985) in the face of societal changes. My findings enhance our understanding of this contract by situating it in Taiwan’s gender-based elder care arrangements.

While the patrilineal structure of parent care where at least one son shoulders the primary caregiving responsibility remains, which son in the family continues to live with the elderly parents and provide care later in life is negotiated in the meso-level context of household structure and kinship systems and the micro-level context of intergenerational relationships and employment demands. When sons hold the primary responsibility for elder care, the tradition that the daughter-in-law provides the actual
care (Liu & Tinker, 2003; Liu & Hsieh, 1995) does not always apply. This finding suggests that the ‘gender transfer of filial care’ (Lan, 2002) is not universal in Taiwanese households mainly because of changing gender relations. With the improvement in their socio-economic status, daughters-in-law may not necessarily engage in family care alone, but are likely to have paid work from outside the home. Likewise, men do not necessarily stay away from the private life domain, but also share the burden of family care with their wives. Both sons and daughters-law experience ‘intergenerational ambivalence’ (Curran, 2002; Lüscher & Pillemer, 1998; Willson et al., 2004) as they attempt to meet economic demands and the care needs of their elderly relatives. One way to resolve such ambivalence is to reconstitute the household division of labour.

In the context of sibling networks, brothers and sisters work out their share of filial responsibilities. In this study, brothers with more financial resources are more likely to carry the responsibility of elder care; sisters with more financial resources also provide help to the brother who is the primary care provider of the parents. This observation indicates the interplay of gender, class, and the life course principle of linked lives (Heinz, 2001; Moen, 2003; Settersten, 2003) in the family negotiation process, which explains varying levels of care engagement among adult children. Although ‘intragenerational ambivalence’ (Bedford & Avioli, 2012) occurs when a lack of collaboration among siblings and family tensions disrupt the cultural ideal of cooperative family elder care, it is ultimately negotiated among family members to ensure that their parents receive support when they require care.
When dependent elders require permanent or intensive around-the-clock assistance, family-provided care is not always sustainable. To resolve intergenerational ambivalence created by the contradictory demands of paid work and familial obligation shaped by the cultural ideal of filial piety, some Taiwanese families now seek help by hiring a foreign live-in care worker, an alternative that creates employment opportunities for women from less developed economies seeking to support their families. In this thesis, hiring migrant labour in Taiwan and selling one’s labour in Vietnam exemplify market forces which offer families in both contexts a means of negotiating work and care arrangements. How people in both regions strategize is also shaped and influenced by structured social relations, particularly class and gender, welfare state policies, the labour market system and regional economic inequalities. These macro-level factors condition the choices individuals or families can make to achieve their goals.

In Taiwan, hiring a foreign live-in care worker through an international labour market reflects a macro context of class divide between families who can afford private in-home care and families who cannot. Class differences among family members also shape a micro context of negotiating the costs of this alternative care arrangement among siblings. Families’ recruitment of a foreign care worker is not only a strategy of preserving home as an ideal place for care (Teo et al., 2006; Weicht, 2010), but is also a response to state policies’ failure to provide around-the-clock care to families with dependent elders. This need for such care is also a response to Taiwan’s current domestic care labour market in which inexpensive native-born care workers are lacking.
My thesis sheds light on the growing phenomenon of Taiwanese families hiring a foreign care worker by simultaneously studying the macro, meso and micro contexts of the elder care labour shortage. My multilevel analysis highlights this alternative care arrangement as the outcome of negotiating intergenerational ambivalence among adult children. As they negotiate such ambivalence, they are also influenced by structured social relations, particularly class, state policies and labour market system as well as family ties. My findings reveal individual experiences and household and family dynamics of negotiating care arrangements in the micro context without taking a deterministic view of structural factors. All levels of analysis are important to understanding the negotiation of family ties and care over the life course.

Market forces create a major care transition as well as a continuity of kinship ties in Taiwanese families. My findings suggest that although hiring a foreign care worker reconfigures family care arrangements, the care worker does not entirely replace family caregivers. Therefore, the concept of ‘market transfer’ (Lan, 2002) inadequately describes the care situation because it implies a simple transition from informal to formal care. Despite the hiring of the care worker, family members continue to provide care to the dependent elder. This observation highlights the idea of shared care, that is, care provided by both family members and the worker to the elder. Shared care demonstrates the complementarity of informal and formal care support that often takes place over the life course (Connidis, 2010:271). Considering shared care also means recognizing both kinship ties and market forces as significant parts of family negotiation processes that are part of the care transition in Taiwan.
Market forces not only connect people with purchasing power with people who sell their care labour in the macro-level context of global class structure, but also create complex social and class-based power dynamics in the meso-level context of domestic labour relations. My third finding that the Taiwanese employer and the Vietnamese worker adapt to each other for mutual benefits illustrates that both parties negotiate their class and power relations by performing different ‘boundary work’ (Lan, 2003a), leading to contradictory employer-worker relationships. While the initial unequal power relationship may persist and perpetuate strict class boundaries, it may also dissipate and blur when intimacy develops in the employer-worker relationship (Stiell & England, 1997). My findings indicate that the experiences of the employer and the worker are not isolated from each other, but are derived from the macro-level context of class structure from which power differentials between both parties emerge, the meso-level context of labour relations in which the power relations are negotiated, and the micro-level context of interpersonal ties and human agency in which both parties interact and construct the meaning of their relationship over time. Taking this multi-level analysis, along with the life course principle of linked lives, avoids the application of the domination-subordination perspective to the entire employer-worker relationship trajectory.

For example, observing the micro-context negotiation of good care in this study sheds light on the macro context of class relations and the meso context of domestic labour relations. By treating the worker as a family member, the employer expects her to provide good care to the dependent elderly family member while he or she can
participate in paid work outside the home. By offering good care to the elder through proper physical care and the exercise of ‘labour of love’ (Folbre & Nelson, 2000), the worker aims to strengthen her relationship with the employer in hopes of securing her employment. Both parties exercise agency but in different ways to meet their own objectives. These negotiations also serve as a mechanism for managing the ambivalence of contradictory expectations in the worlds of home and work.

Despite potential exploitation and interpersonal conflict as a result of the inherent employer-employee class asymmetry highlighted by critical feminists (Elias, 2008; Parreñas, 2000), over time both parties become mutually dependent through their relationship with the elder. This observation situates the life course principle of linked lives particularly in the meso-level context of domestic labour relations. Contradictory but mutually dependent relationships found in my study constitute an ambivalent, triangular relationship developed in everyday life. My study thus contributes to the existing knowledge on domestic labour relations (Cheng, 2006; Constable, 2007; Hondagneu-Sotelo, 2001; Lan, 2006) by linking the social and power dynamics between the employer and the worker with the dynamics of family caregiving ties. These dynamics do not occur separately, but are constantly intertwined, shaping the family caregiving relationship trajectory.

In the Vietnamese context, earning an income is the primary concern for many families. Since 1986, the state has shifted to a more market-oriented economy, thus leaving the household to assume the responsibility for most aspects of social welfare (Barbieri & Bélanger, 2009; Kokko & Tingvall, 2008). Families, especially women from
disadvantaged social classes, see market-driven, female-dominated overseas jobs as a family’s strategy for economic survival. Women’s response to the global demand for feminized labour, such as care work, leads to the feminization of labour migration (Curran et al., 2006; Dodson, 2008; Ford & Piper, 2007, Piper, 2004) in which women have increasingly become core participants in the international labour market. Market forces perpetuate the transnational migration of poorly paid care labour primarily involving women. This mainly results from ‘global patriarchal capitalism’ (Liang, 2010:8) in which the labour of women from the periphery economies continues to be exploited in the gender-divided core economies. For example, in Taiwan migrant workers are placed and frequently exploited in gender-specific occupational niches which are often classified as the secondary sector of the segmented labour market (Bulow & Summers, 1986; Dickens & Lang, 1988; McDonald & Solow, 1985). While regional economic inequalities sustain the flow of labour migration between the core and periphery economies, labour brokers in both Taiwan and Vietnam serve an important mechanism of importing foreign live-in care worker from the periphery to the core economies (Bélanger, 2008).

Although market forces offer Vietnamese women a means to support their own families, that is, by selling their care labour to Taiwanese families, they also create ‘intergenerational ambivalence’ (Curran, 2002; Lüscher & Pillemers, 1998; Willson et al., 2004) as these women, during their absence, face competing demands of income earning and family care responsibilities. My findings illustrate that they resolve such ambivalence by negotiating multiple family responsibilities as mothers, wives, daughters
or daughters-in-law with their husbands and extended family from afar. This finding on mobilization of family care labour by Vietnamese women prompts us to reconceptualize ‘transnational motherhood’ (Hondagneu & Avila, 1997) in the context of labour migration. When a mother is not present due to working abroad, other ways of ‘mothering’ are negotiated. The mother negotiates agreements with other family members to provide parenting to her children. My study thus corroborates previous research that finds that when mothers are absent, the mothering process extends beyond the migrant-child dyad and encompasses multiple ties negotiated in the family care network (Akesson et al., 2012; Drotbohm, 2012). These ties, as shown in my findings, also serve to meet the care needs of elderly family members when Vietnamese women are away from home, highlighting the continuous intersection of multiple linked lives over the life course of migrants’ families.

In addition to care arrangements, remittance transfers also highlight Vietnamese women’s attempts to maintain continuity in the face of a major disruption in family life. My study moves beyond the purely economic function of remittances, to which abundant research has attended, to the ‘social meaning of remittances’ (Thai, 2012). Remittances are the primary form of financial support by which migrants continuously provide to their families in the homeland. These ties are continuously negotiated whenever remittances are transferred. For example, Vietnamese migrant women use them as a tool to re-negotiate their gender relations with their husbands, as a means to reinforce their maternal responsibilities despite their absence from their children, or a way of strengthening pre-migration kinship intimacy with their siblings. By placing
remittances in the macro-level context of structured social relations, the meso-level context of family life and the micro-level context of kinship ties and human agency, my research contributes to the sociological understanding of remittances.

While Taiwan and Vietnam provide different social and geographical contexts for understanding the negotiation dynamics of family care arrangements, they do share similarities. Families in both regions show evidence of the convoy model of social support (Kahn & Antonucci, 1980), in which the configuration of the family care network changes over the life course. This is also an outcome of how family members negotiate their care responsibilities and is related to the macro-level context of cultural norms, gender relations, state policy and labour migration, the meso-level context of work and family and the micro-level context of kinship ties. Therefore, instead of treating work and care as a binary contradiction, my thesis shows that social forces create multiple contradictions that both Taiwanese and Vietnamese families must negotiate. The perspective of multiple-structured conditions (Wang, 2007) highlights the complexity of negotiating paid work and care over the life course.

My findings also highlight Vietnamese women’s sentimental attachments to the host and their own families which I call a ‘transnational bi-familial tie’. This tie connotes a particular type of transnational family that entails biologically determined and socially constructed relationships, providing a contrast to previous research (Bélanger & Linh, 2011; Hondagneu-Sotelo & Avila, 1997; Parreñas, 2001; Piper & Roces, 2003; Silvey, 2006; Waters, 2005; Yang & Lu, 2010). Although the meaning and experience of transnational family ties in this study is negotiated in the micro-context of interpersonal
ties, it cannot be discussed in isolation from the broader social structure. For instance, while Taiwan’s policies, such as the live-in requirement for domestic workers, often foster the development of intimacy and quasi-familial ties between the Vietnamese worker and the Taiwanese family, they also require that the worker’s contract be short-lived, restricting her from attaining permanent residency. As a result, socially constructed intimacy between employer and employee or employee and the elder are often transient. Furthermore, this intimacy may not apply to undocumented migrant care workers because they are not subject to the live-in requirement imposed by the Taiwanese government due to their ‘free’ status in the illegal migrant labour market (Lan, 2007).

The idea of ambivalence weaves through the entire thesis in the exploration of both Taiwanese and Vietnamese family care. Studying how ambivalence is negotiated allows us to see different choices people make to sustain their family life. Based on my findings, ambivalence was first observed among Taiwanese adult children and Vietnamese migrant workers in their intergenerational and intragenerational relationships, the competing demands of paid work and family care, and in domestic labour relations. Structured social relations and transnational migrant labour are at the heart of the contradictory situations that families in both countries must negotiate. Family life comprises neither stability nor conflict alone, but both (Connidis & McMullin, 2002; Lüscher & Pillemer, 1998) and must be negotiated among family members over time. This perspective enriches the life course study of family relations by linking family ties with the broader social structure (Connidis, 2012). The ways that individuals resolve
ambivalence lead to different care transitions in this study. In Taiwan, a shared care arrangement between adult children and the Vietnamese worker is negotiated in order to support dependent elders. In Vietnam, extended kin provide unpaid care to dependent family members of Vietnamese women who provide financial sustenance by working abroad. In this study, exploring how individuals negotiate ambivalence reveals ways in which they continue to interact with others over time to maintain their families.

Second, emotional ambivalence was observed among Vietnamese workers in a transnational context. While working abroad, they suffer the pain of long-term separations at the same time that they demonstrate toughness and perseverance in efforts to secure income for their distant families. This emotional ambivalence results from an interplay between persistent regional economic inequalities and human agency these workers exercise to reduce their families’ life course risk.

Emotional ambivalence was observed in another transnational context. My findings on the transnational bi-familial tie expressed by Vietnamese workers not only suggest their competing loyalties to the host family and their own families, but also indicate sociological ambivalence created by their contradictory demands of care responsibilities and financial necessity. My findings show Vietnamese workers’ attempts to resolve the competing care demands of two families – their own and their employer’s. This is a case where Vietnamese women experience ambivalence because they feel responsible for continuing to provide good care to the elder in the host family while also wanting to resume care or see their children from whom they have been separated for years.
Whether these women continue to perceive the financial need, whether they receive help with child and elder care from their extended family, and whether their children require care after years of absence, all help us to understand their decision to return home or continue to work in Taiwan. This observation is interpreted in the macro context of class, meso context of work and family and the micro context of social ties and family relationships.

Third, a multi-level ambivalence was observed through the transnational context that links the common experience of contradictions shared by individuals in two different geographical regions. Synthesizing my findings reveals the phenomenon of ‘global care chains’ (hereafter, GCCs) (Hochschild, 2000; Yeates, 2004, 2012), that is, a series of interpersonal relationships that are connected across the globe based on paid and unpaid care work, as the outcome of negotiating ambivalence that simultaneously involves Taiwanese and Vietnamese families. Although people in both countries respond to structural and institutional ambivalence differently based on their global class position and gender, that is, one by hiring paid care and the other by selling care labour overseas, they all experience this care transition as a method of resolving contradictory demands of labour force participation and familial responsibility. This observation enhances our understanding of GCCs: They are not simply the manifestation of multiple local and transnational care transfers, but involve more complex processes of negotiating ambivalence at the macro, meso and micro levels over time.

While previous work conceptualizes GCCs as multiple personal links based on a gender-specific process of care transfers primarily involving women (Hochschild, 2000;
Yeates, 2004), my thesis reveals a gender-mixed care transfer process in the GCCs, and considers the dynamics of family ties as relevant to understanding how people negotiate the competing demands in life.

Moreover, I extend the concept of GCCs by including the dimension of the ‘transnational elder care chain.’ This contrasts with previous research that mainly focuses on child care (Hochschild, 2000; Yeates, 2004). Including this additional dimension of GCCs suggests that there are multiple ambivalent intergenerational ties that migrant women must negotiate while working abroad. This may include the demand for both child and elder care when they are away. Recognizing multiple care needs in the migrant’s family means seeing care as involving multiple complex relationships and responsibilities in the kinship network. In my findings, strong family ties facilitate Vietnamese migrant workers to mobilize care support at home during their absence which, in turn, reduces ambivalence as a result of working abroad.

Although GCCs continue to resonate in the migration literature (Huang et al., 2012; Raghuram, 2012; Yeates, 2012), not all cases in my study were implicated in GCCs, and some of those were so for a limited time. Similarly, not all migrant workers (i.e., 4 out of 40) have dependent children or elders who require care when away, suggesting that not all migrant women experience work-care conflict during their absence. Applying the GCCs construct with caution is necessary to avoid reinforcing dominant heterosexual and gender assumptions that impede us from capturing the diversity of transnational family ties (Yeates, 2012). Additionally, we must understand that the GCCs are not static. My data illustrate that as migrants stay abroad for years, the demand for child
care decreases, especially after children enter early adulthood. Likewise, the demand for elder care may also decrease, if the elders pass away during the migrants’ absence. In my study, marital status, the duration of overseas employment and stages of migration, all significant aspects of the life course perspective, have been taken into account in order to refine the existing conceptualization of GCCs.

7.3 Reflecting on the Research

As population aging accelerates in Asia Pacific, scholars have devoted increased attention to this region’s care configurations (Chan, 2006; Hermalin, 2002; McDaniel, 2009; Ng, et al., 2002). By situating aging and family ties in demographic, social and policy contexts, their work examines how changes in household structures, work and gender relations alter traditional configurations of filial obligations and challenge families to meet these obligations in these new contexts. My study contributes to the current discussion by showing how such challenges apply to Taiwan and by revealing how families ‘work out’ (Finch & Mason, 1993) their care responsibilities and arrangements over time while facing these changes. Although employing a foreign care worker as a means to resolve the contradictory demands between family care responsibility and paid work (Constable, 2007; Huang et al., 2012) is not a new phenomenon in Asian-Pacific families in Taiwan, Hong Kong and Singapore, my study documents the macro-, meso- and micro-level processes that enhance our understanding of how and why some families adopt this alternative care arrangement, and the outcome and social ramifications associated with this arrangement. Based on the experiences of employers and migrant care workers in 23 Taiwanese households,
my thesis provides an original contribution to our understanding of the local and transnational context of family care, with particular attention paid to the negotiation processes involved in arranging care for an older family member in Taiwan and negotiating transnational care jobs among Vietnamese migrant workers.

Conducting this research has been a rewarding learning experience. My initial interest in migratory care labour inspired me to explore why Taiwanese families purchase in-home private care services. While studying this trend, documenting family histories provided me with insights into caregiving dynamics as these occurred over time. My conceptual framework combines the strengths of various approaches previously employed in sociological research: the life course approach; gender; class, ambivalence, and the transnational framework.

The life course approach highlights both continuity and change in family care arrangements, and the intersection of multiple life courses when care is negotiated among family members. Gender relations are key to understanding the division of care negotiated between sons and daughters-in-law and between brothers and sisters. The concept of ambivalence assists me in studying how societal changes, adverse economic conditions and structured social relations create contradictions, that is, sociological ambivalence, at the macro and meo levels that are negotiated by family members at the micro level in the context of Taiwanese and Vietnamese family care. Class captures the global context of unequal resources in which economically advantaged families in well-developed countries are able to purchase the care labour of women from economically disadvantaged families in less developed countries, and the meso context of employer-
employee power relations negotiated by both parties at the micro level. Finally, the combined perspective of ambivalence and transnationalism helps to reveal the global care chains and the negotiation of kinship ties and contradictory responsibilities among family members across significant distances. The conclusions I have drawn contribute to our understandings of ‘sociological ambivalence’ (Connidis & McMullin, 2002) and ‘global care chains’ (Hochschild, 2000; Yeates, 2004) by broadening their application and showing their relevance to very different social contexts.

Furthermore, my analysis provides an effective means of connecting familial and caregiving relationships across multiple geographical contexts. By including a geographical perspective, this thesis enriches sociological analysis of the dynamics of caregiving relationships, and challenges a pan-Asian cultural assumption that Taiwan and Vietnam share the same kinship and informal support systems.

Although this research was prepared carefully, a number of important limitations and shortcomings need to be considered. My study sampled Taiwanese adult offspring mostly from the 1950s to 1970s birth cohorts. However, as urbanization continues, people, especially those in younger cohorts, are becoming more involved in the mobile labour force. Therefore, whether my findings apply to those born after the 1970s, and whether they apply across major metropolitan and rural areas, are both worth exploring. A mixed-methods research approach combining a large-scale survey and in-depth interviews would be useful to answering these questions. In addition, my samples only included families with mixed-gender siblings. Hence, how family care negotiations and transfers occur in sons- or daughters-only families is worth exploring. To capture
this particular population of interest would require a purposive-sampling research design.

Second, my findings are limited because of the small sample, the reliance on one group of migrant workers from Vietnam only, and the fact that the analysis only includes interview data from employers and migrant workers. Expanding the sample size, conducting a similar study with other foreign care workers from the Philippines and Indonesia, and considering the voices of elders and of other household members would provide additional insights about the complexities of negotiating caregiving. For instance, the ambivalent triangular relationship can be further explored in multi-generational households, where domestic dynamics may involve more than the employer-worker-elder triad. This potential empirical observation requires a detailed case study that follows a given family over time in order to understand how multiple lives are linked and influence one another in the private space of care.

Third, my findings rely on one case study, and thus its conclusions may not apply to migrant care workers in other countries. For instance, Bangladeshi women working in families of the Gulf region often encounter exclusion, exploitation and abuse in the employer’s household (Rahman & Bélanger, 2010). Notions, such as ‘fictive kin’ and ‘transnational bi-familial tie’, do not capture all migrant women’s experiences. Similarly, the socially constructed intimacy derived from this study may not be commonly experienced by Filipino workers in Hong Kong (Constable, 2007) and Indonesian workers in Singapore (Ueno, 2009), who instead have reported more harsh forms of discipline and control in the private workplace than Vietnamese workers in my study.
Fourth, my findings on the long-term impact of labour migration on family members in the homeland were limited because they were only drawn from the voices of Vietnamese migrant workers. Using the life course approach and including the voices of children, adult offspring or even elderly relatives of migrant workers would enrich our understanding of the trajectory of the transnational family ties and the life transition that those individuals experience in the face of a major disruption in family life. Hence, future research should explore the long-term impact of labour migration on the migrants and their families when they return to their home country.

The findings of this thesis have several policy implications. Because of the lack of government subsidies available to offset the cost of employing a care worker, this care arrangement primarily caters to those with the necessary resources. To reduce the financial burdens of disability or chronic illness among individuals and their families, the government is planning to launch a universal ‘Long-term Care Insurance’ program in 2016 (KMT, 2012) which includes ‘home’, ‘community’ and ‘institutional’ care services (Department of Health, 2012). How the government incorporates the current foreign live-in care worker program into the national elder care regime will be a key public debate. Will those who have become highly dependent on their long-employed foreign care worker be willing to switch to the government-run care system? Although this system will standardize publicly accessible care options, will it provide equivalent care to families that are currently receiving primary help from a foreign care worker? The state must take these concerns into account when making this policy transition. This requires
careful planning to ensure that the new care delivery system will adequately meet the interests and care needs of families from all income groups.

A Taiwanese scholar, Wang (2010), suggests that by including the services provided by foreign workers in the ‘Long-term Care Insurance’ program, the government can accommodate families’ care arrangement preferences; under this central care management and delivery system, foreign care workers would receive proper training and work closely with local in-home care providers. Treating both types of care workers equally helps to recognize the former’s contribution to the public care system; for instance, foreign care workers should have a choice to live on their own instead of being forced to live in the private household of their employer. This can potentially prevent migrant workers from being exploited and reduce the ‘run-away’ problem. Finally, I agree with Wang’s (2010) proposal that foreign care workers be directly recruited at the national level. This will prevent transnational labour brokers from taking financial advantage of already economically vulnerable migrant workers. If the Taiwanese government ensures the fairness of the broker fee, it can in turn hinder the growth of the profit-driven brokerage system.

Lastly, the government could provide language training programs to reduce foreign care workers’ initial communication barriers and improve their job efficiency. Such programs should continue to help them to further enhance communication with the care recipient and other members in the host family. In addition, with better language proficiency, workers would be better informed about policies regarding their rights in
Taiwan and be able to exercise them when encountering unfair treatment in private households.

### 7.4 Closing Words

Qualitative data in this study have shown that families in Taiwan and Vietnam engage in complex negotiations in order to meet the care needs of their dependent family members. For Taiwanese families who can afford it, hiring migrant workers is an effective strategy for managing the ambivalence of cultural and social shifts and traditional care practices. Statistics indicate that the hiring of migrant workers will be a growing trend. While the general public stereotypically views migrant care labour as unskilled and disposable, many of the families in this study greatly value their care workers and consider them highly skilled. It is, therefore, important to recognize the ‘hidden’ contribution of migrant workers and re-assess their economic and social value in the care economy. The official label *wailao* should also be reconsidered due to its negative and alienating connotations, an observation that has prompted Japan and many Western countries to use ‘guest worker’ as a neutral category to identify temporary migrant workers. While transnational NGOs and activists continue to fight for the rights of migrant care workers, local researchers must continue to further understand their diverse work experiences.

As long as the global demand for reproductive labour and regional economic inequalities persist, women from less economically privileged countries will most likely continue to migrate for the sake of their family’s survival. While sending countries need migrant women’s remittances, receiving countries have come to depend on their
inexpensive care labour. Narratives such as those collected in this study provide an effective means to understanding the lived experiences of those who seek care providers and those who seek employment. The personal accounts in this study provide valuable perspectives on our understanding of the multifaceted negotiations that families undertake when fulfilling their care and economic needs in both local and transnational contexts. My study demonstrates that care is not a private family matter; it occurs in the context of cultural and societal expectations regarding elder care, the structured social relations of class and gender, state policies and the international labour market.
References


Hermalin, A.I. Ofstedal, M.B., & Shih, S. (2003). Support Received by the Elderly in Baoding: The View from Two Generations. In M. Whyte (Ed), *China’s Revolutions and Intergenerational Relations* (pp. 121-142). Ann Arbor, MI: Center for Chinese Studies, the University of Michigan.


Appendix A: Interview Guide

First Fieldwork Interview Guide

Study Participant: Vietnamese Migrant Workers

1. Brief biographical information
   What is your marital status?
   Do you have any children?
   What is your current age?

2. Personal Work History and Job Characteristics
   How long have you worked in Taiwan?
   Have you worked elsewhere before you came to Taiwan?
   What made you decide to work in Taiwan? (e.g., motives)
   Did you know anyone here before you coming to Taiwan?
   Could you please tell me about your job duties?
   How many hours do you work per day? And do you have a regular day off?
   How do you assess your workload?

3. Perception of one’s own well-being
   How do you perceive your life and overall well-being in Taiwan?
   In general, are you happy with your current work condition?
   Do you have any concern regarding your work or other life conditions in Taiwan?

4. Employer-Employee Relationship
   Do you get along with your employer? Tell me about your relationship with your employer.
   If you live with other household members, how do you get along with them?
Do you feel comfortable with your employer? Anything you do not like while working for your employer?

Do you share concerns or worries that you have with your employer or other household members?

5. Establishing social networks/ network building

Did you get to know other people through your employer or his/her family members?
Do you know other migrants from Vietnam or other countries in Taiwan?
How did you meet them and where did you meet them for the first time?
Do you keep in touch with them on the regular basis? If so, how?
Where do you usually meet with other domestic workers or other migrant workers?
What do you talk about when you meet with other migrant workers?
Do you share your concerns or problems with them?
Have you ever discussed your concerns and problems with your recruitment agency? Did they direct you for help?

Second Fieldwork Interview Guide

Study Participant: Taiwanese Employers

1. Demographic Information

2. History of Family Elder Care

Could please you begin by telling me about the history of your family elder care?
Can you tell me who looked after the elder when s/he first needed care?
Why did the elder require care?
How long has s/he been cared for before the arrival of the foreign worker?
Over the years, how did you and your siblings work out the care responsibility?
Who did what? What about now?
How often do your siblings contact your parents? Ways of contacts? How is each sibling’s relationship with the dependent parent(s)?
Can you tell me if your sibling ties have changed since your parent(s) required care? In which ways?

Do you and your siblings encounter any problems or conflicts in terms of cooperation in parent care?

Any reason why a particular family member assumed the majority of caring tasks? Is there a difference in the kinds of care that your siblings provide to your parent(s)?

3. Living Arrangement

Could you please tell me about the living arrangement?
How is the current living arrangement decided?
Who made the decision? Any collective agreement among siblings?
Reasons why the current living arrangement is made?

4. The employment of a Vietnamese Live-in Elder care worker

How did your family come to hire a live-in care worker?
Who hired the worker and who paid for her salary?
What elder care tasks is the worker responsible for? Who assigned the tasks to the worker?
How long do you plan to hire the worker? And why?
What role does the worker play in elder care?
Was there another caregiver before the current one?
Could you tell me your family’s relationship with the worker since she is hired?
Any changes in sibling ties since the worker is hired?
Did the worker change the family relationship?

5. Employer-employee relationship

Could you tell me about your relationship with the worker since she was hired?
How was it in the beginning? Over time? What about now?
What has been good about it? What has been difficult?
Do you know about this worker’s family and her situation in Vietnam?
If so, what do you know about?
How did you manage the care when the worker went home for a visit?

6. The Perception of Filial Piety

What is your view of filial piety?
How does hiring a live-in worker fit with your view of filial piety?

Study Participant: Vietnamese Migrant Workers and Elders

For workers:

1. Demographic Information

2. Decision Making Process

What made you decide to work in Taiwan (e.g., motives/incentives)?
How did you decide on migrating to Taiwan for work?

3. Personal Work History and Job Characteristics

How long have you worked in Taiwan?
Have you worked in other countries prior to coming to Taiwan?
Did you know anyone here before coming to Taiwan?
Can you please tell me about your job?
How do you assess your workload?

4. Perception of Personal Well-Being

Can you please tell me about your life in Taiwan?
What is good and not so good about it? What do you like and don’t like about it?
Can you tell me about your work conditions? How do you feel about them?
Do you have any concern regarding your work or other life conditions in Taiwan?
What have you learned after working in Taiwan for years (e.g., personal growth)?

5. Employer-Employee Relationship

Can you tell me about your relationship with your employer?
How was it at the beginning? How has it changed over time? How is it now?
Can you tell me about the other people who live here and your relationship with
them? Do you get along with them?

Do you feel comfortable with your employer? Is there anything you do not like while working for your employer?

Is there someone with whom you share your concerns and worries in this family?

6. Relationship with the Dependent Elder

Can you tell me about your relationship with the elder?

How was it in the beginning? Has it changed over time? How is it now?

In your opinion, what constitutes good quality of care?

7. Family Ties and Household Organization

Can you tell me about your family and the relationship with them?

How did the division of household labour change after you left?

Who manages family affairs when you are not around?

Do you continue to get involved in the family decision making? Conflicts or tensions?

How do you make up for your family when you cannot be with them?

How and how often do you contact your family?

What do you talk about when you talk to them over the phone?

How do you show your concerns/love to your family when you are away?

When you encounter hardship during your migration process, have you ever sought emotional support from your own family?

8. Remittances

How do you spend the money you have earned in Taiwan?

Who is managing the money you sent back?

How does the remittance improve your family’s living condition?

How is your family’s living condition compared to that in other households in your neighbourhood?
For elders

1. Who took care of your before this worker arrived? How did this worker help you? What tasks did she do for you?
2. How do you feel about this worker helping you?
3. Can you tell me about your relationship with this worker?
4. How was it in the beginning? Has it changed over time? How is it now?
5. How do you view this worker? Do you think of her as your employee? A friend? A family member? Why?
6. How is your relationship with your children (anyone you are closer to?)
7. Did your relationship with them change after the worker was hired?
Appendix B: Ethics Approval

Office of Research Ethics
The University of Western Ontario
Room 4180 Support Services Building, London, ON, Canada N6A 5C1
Telephone: (519) 661-3036 Fax: (519) 850-2445 Email: ethics@uwo.ca
Website: www.uwo.ca/research/ethics

Use of Human Subjects - Ethics Approval Notice

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Principal Investigator: Dr. D. Belanger</th>
<th>Review Level: Expedited</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Review Number: 12621S</td>
<td>Revision Number: 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Review Date: May 11, 2010</td>
<td>Approved Local # of Participants: 0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Protocol Title: Migration, Gender and Transnationalism in Asia: Labour Migration, Cross-border Marriages and Trafficking</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department and Institution: Sociology, University of Western Ontario</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sponsor: SSHRC-SOCIAL SCIENCE HUMANITIES RESEARCH COUNCIL</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethics Approval Date: May 11, 2010</td>
<td>Expiry Date: June 30, 2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Documents Reviewed and Approved: Revised study end date.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Documents Received for Information:

This is to notify you that The University of Western Ontario Research Ethics Board for Health Sciences Research Involving Human Subjects (HSREB) which is organized and operates according to the Tri-Council Policy Statement: Ethical Conduct of Research Involving Humans and the Health Canada/ICH Good Clinical Practice Practices: Consolidated Guidelines; and the applicable laws and regulations of Ontario has reviewed and granted approval to the above referenced research(s) or amendment(s) on the approval date noted above. The membership of this REB also complies with the membership requirements for REB's as defined in Division 5 of the Food and Drug Regulations.

The ethics approval for this study shall remain valid until the expiry date noted above assuming timely and acceptable responses to the HSREB's periodic requests for surveillance and monitoring information. If you require an updated approval notice prior to that time, you must request it using the UWO Updated Approval Request Form.

During the course of the research, no deviations from, or changes to, the protocol or consent form may be initiated without prior written approval from the HSREB except when necessary to eliminate immediate hazards to the subject or when the change(s) involve only logistical or administrative aspects of the study (e.g. change of monitor, telephone number). Expedited review of minor change(s) in ongoing studies will be considered. Subjects must receive a copy of the signed information/consent documentation.

Investigators must promptly also report to the HSREB:

a) changes increasing the risk to the participant(s) and/or affecting significantly the conduct of the study;
b) all adverse and unexpected experiences or events that are both serious and unexpected;
c) new information that may adversely affect the safety of the subjects or the conduct of the study.

If these changes/adverse events require a change to the information/consent documentation, and/or recruitment advertisement, the newly revised information/consent documentation, and/or advertisement, must be submitted to this office for approval.

Members of the HSREB who are named as investigators in research studies, or declare a conflict of interest, do not participate in discussion related to, nor vote on, such studies when they are presented to the HSREB.

Chair of HSREB: Dr. Joseph Gilbert
FDA Ref. #: IRB 00000940

Ethics Officer to Contact for Further Information

Janice Sutherland (jsuther@uwo.ca)  
Elizabeth Wambolt (ewambolt@uwo.ca)  
Grace Kelly (grace.kelly@uwo.ca)  
Denise Grafton (dgrafton@uwo.ca)

This is an official document. Please retain the original in your files.
Office of Research Ethics
The University of Western Ontario - Support Services Building, Rm 4180 - London, Ontario N6A 5C1
Telephone: 519.661.3036 Fax: 519.850.2466 Email: ethics@uwo.ca

Continuing Ethics Review ~ NMREB

Return completed form to the Office of Research Ethics by: **April 30, 2010**
Failure to complete and return this form in a timely manner may result in withdrawal of ethics approval.

Return Signed Original ~ DO NOT FAX

Principal Investigator: Dr. D. Belanger
Sociology, University of Western Ontario

Study Title:
Migration, Gender and Transnationalism in Asia: Labour Migration, Cross-border Marriages and Trafficking

Approval End Date: October 31, 2010  

**NOTE:** To **EXTEND** the approval end date complete the End Date Extension Request on the reverse of this form.

To **CLOSE** this study file complete the End of Study Summary Report on the reverse of this form.

A)  ✓  STUDY STATUS - Indicate the current status of the study

- **Completed** (If study is complete, fill out the End of Study Summary Report on reverse).
- **Continuing** (Complete the balance of the form - Section B and C.)
- **Start still pending** (On an attached sheet indicate why the study has not started.)
- **Study not to be started** (On an attached sheet indicate why study is not to be started. N.B. The ethics approval for the study will be withdrawn. If you want to proceed with the study in the future you must reapply for ethics approval.)

B)  The following questions are to be completed only for studies that have started. Please respond for **YOUR SITE ONLY.**

1. How many potential subjects were approached to participate?  
   42

2. How many participants consented to participate?  
   42

3. How many participants actively withdrew from your study? Please describe the circumstances leading to withdrawal on a separate page.  
   0

4. How many participants remain to be enrolled at your site?  
   50

5. What is the date or version of the Letter of Information for your site?  
   May 20th, 2009

C) On an attached sheet please provide a brief synopsis of progress to date with an emphasis on any problems encountered during the conduct of the research.

D)  

Signature of Principal Investigator (Local)  

[Signature]

Date  

May 4, 2006

ORE Office Use  

ICD Version  

not given

Local  

SR Frequency  

Total  

Annual  

ISO: NA

End of Study Summary Report / End Date Extension on Reverse

Form 3-F-003  

NMREB SR Form (2004.01-31)
STEPHEN LIN

EDUCATION

2008-2013  Doctor of Philosophy – Sociology (Specialization in Ethnic Relations and Migration), University of Western Ontario
            (Comprehensive Exams in Qualitative Methods and Migration)

2007-2008  Master of Arts – Sociology
            University of Western Ontario

2002-2007  Bachelor of Arts (Highest Honours) – Sociology
            Carleton University

HONOURS AND AWARDS

2011-2012  Graduate Student Teaching Award, University of Western Ontario

2009-2010  Graduate Student Teaching Award, University of Western Ontario

2009-2010  Migration and Ethnic Relations Scholarship, University of Western Ontario

2007-2013  Western Graduate Research Scholarship, University of Western Ontario

2006-2007  Deans’ Honour List, Carleton University

RESEARCH EXPERIENCE

2010-2011  Research apprenticeship under the supervision of Dr. Hongzen Wang & Dr. Wenhui Anna Tang National Sun-Yat sen University, Taiwan
            Research Analyst, “Welcoming Community Initiatives”
            Chaired by Dr. Victoria Esses
            University of Western Ontario

2009-2010  Research Assistant, “Migration and Transnationalism in Asia”
            Chaired by Dr. Danièle Bélanger
            University of Western Ontario

            Chaired by Dr. Andrea Willson
            University of Western Ontario
TEACHING EXPERIENCE

2013-2014  Sessional instructor: Quantitative Research Methods
Department of Sociology, University of Western Ontario

2011-2012  Sessional instructor: Introduction to Sociology
School of Liberal Studies, Conestoga College, Kitchener, ON

2011-2012  Teaching assistant: Quantitative Research Methods
University of Western Ontario

2009-2010  Teaching assistant: Quantitative Research Methods
University of Western Ontario

DEPARTMENTAL SERVICES

2011-2012  Departmental Graduate Student Representative

2009-2010  Graduate Student Mentor

2009-2011  Graduate Student Program Ambassador

PUBLICATION


CONFERENCE PRESENTATIONS


PROFESSIONAL AFFILIATIONS

Canadian Association of Asian Studies – Graduate student member