

Comparative and International Education / Éducation Comparée et Internationale

Volume 33

Issue 1 *Educational Restructuring in the Era of Globalization*

Article 5

June 2017

Globalization and Citizenship Education: Implications for the Nation State

Marlene Schellenberg
Queen's University

Follow this and additional works at: <http://ir.lib.uwo.ca/cie-eci>

Recommended Citation

Schellenberg, Marlene (2017) "Globalization and Citizenship Education: Implications for the Nation State," *Comparative and International Education / Éducation Comparée et Internationale*: Vol. 33 : Iss. 1 , Article 5.
Available at: <http://ir.lib.uwo.ca/cie-eci/vol33/iss1/5>

This Research paper/Rapport de recherche is brought to you for free and open access by Scholarship@Western. It has been accepted for inclusion in Comparative and International Education / Éducation Comparée et Internationale by an authorized administrator of Scholarship@Western. For more information, please contact tadam@uwo.ca.

not a lot on C.E.

Globalization and Citizenship Education: Implications for the Nation State

Marlene Schellenberg
Queen's University¹

Abstract

This study addresses some conflicting views of education and the influence of the economic priorities of globalization on educational policy. It examines the discourse in some of the policy documents of globalizing agencies such as the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD), the World Trade Organization (WTO), the European Commission (EC), and the North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA), as well as government education policy documents from Spain and Manitoba in Canada. As a means of providing the historical and theoretical framework, and identifying the educational and academic significance of the issues of citizenship education, the study begins with a review of some of the relevant literature and the role citizenship education plays in public education in democratic states.

Introduction

There are growing concerns that as a result of globalization, the place of citizenship education in democratic nations around the world has changed and been given a subordinate role to education as a means of providing skilled employees for a competitive job market (Bruno-Jofré & Henley, 2001; Levin, 2001; Popkewitz, 2000; Taylor, 2001; Viñao, 2001). Reforms to education and throughout the public sector have been guided by economic priorities such as the need to reduce debts and deficits, increase efficiency, improve accountability, and measure performance. Thus, Pal (2001) and Levin (2001) argue that these priorities, evidence of a 'new public management' theory (NPM),

have been used to implement global reforms including changes to education.

While citizenship education has similar features in most democratic nations, traditionally it has been conditioned in every nation by that country's unique geographical, historical, cultural, political, and economic situation. The influence of globalizing agencies such as the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) and the World Trade Organization (WTO) on policy formation has emphasized the economic role for education to provide a skilled labour force for industry almost to the exclusion of education for any other purpose. This has had implications for the full expression of citizenship education in educational policy documents.

This study addresses conflicting views of education and the influence of the economic priorities of globalization on educational policy. It examines some of the policy documents of globalizing agencies, Spain, and Manitoba in Canada. Spain and Manitoba were chosen for many reasons. First, I found it necessary to select two industrialized regions from different parts of the world that adhere to regulations of globalizing agencies. Both Spain and Manitoba as a province in Canada, are members of the OECD and follow regulations of the WTO and the General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS). Secondly, both of these regions are parliamentary democracies that have moved from agrarian economies to industrialized urban economies, and Manitoba in North America and Spain in Europe are considered to be modestly economically stable. Third, both regions must consider a relatively large influx of immigrants. This affects multiculturalism policies, and, in turn citizenship education of students from diverse backgrounds.

This study examines the characteristics of the understanding of the concept of citizenship education as reflected in some of the policy documents the Manitoba and Spanish governments produced from 1994 to 2000. I argue that although the specific socio-economic and political contexts in Spain and Manitoba have conditioned the understanding of citizenship education as stated in the documents, the economic priorities of globalization have provided a powerful frame of reference for educational reform. As a result of globalization, the notion of the nation state acquired new connotations in the discourse of citizenship, and therefore the understanding of the concept of citizenship education has changed. The chief question underlying my research is to what extent have the pressures to create a knowledge-

based economy influenced the articulation of citizenship in the policy documents.

Theoretical Framework

Conceptions of Citizenship and Democracy

Legitimacy of the state determined through deliberation of its citizens is at the heart of democratic governance. Benhabib (1996) argued that free and unconstrained public deliberation about matters of common concern is fundamental to complex democratic societies and the legitimacy of public institutions. As a public institution in democratic nations, education has often reflected changes in the role of the state. While the roots of the state's role are different in modern European and American liberal democracies, as are the mediation of their citizens' concerns, both Europe and the US saw the need for the state to facilitate access to markets for goods and labour. The interests of the interventionist state have shifted, however, from democratic governance and the transfer of payments, to preoccupations with the preservation of capitalism and the dismantling of the mechanisms of transfer payments. The result has been the domination of free market and free trade doctrines. Tension exists between those who see the state's role as a provider of services such as health care and education and those who see the state as an enabler of the free market, able to contract those services from the market and for those in the market to compete to deliver services. In a market model of democracy, the citizen's most important function is that of consumer, acting out of self-interest, and a diminished capacity of collective social responsibility

Bruno-Jofré and Henley (2001) brought together Young's (1996) privatized notion of democracy and Carr's (1991) market model of democracy in a way that shows a moral dilemma. These notions of democracy allow citizens to voice their preferences and demands based on individual self-interest. Bruno-Jofré and Henley stated that, "an ethic of care attentive to individual and social responsibilities should permeate forms of power in a democratic moral society, and [they] concur with Carr when he says that social rights are not only justified on humanitarian grounds, but they are also essential to deal with social and economic inequalities that are incompatible with the tenets of a moral participatory democracy" (p. 60). The issues of voice and deliberation are central in democracy, and essential in determining matters of mutual concern.

There are various approaches to take when conceptualizing the issues of citizenship and citizenship education. In their study of citizenship debates in the United States, France, Great Britain, Australia, Canada, and the province of Quebec in Canada, Gagnon and Pagé (1999) identified four macro-components: national identity; social, cultural, and supranational belonging; effective system of rights; and political and civic participation. Young (1995), in her criticism of the concept of a market democracy, examined two notions of citizenship that provide a broader understanding of the issues facing multicultural societies: *universal* citizenship, which underpins a market democracy; and *differentiated* citizenship. *Universal* citizenship is one in which equality is viewed as sameness and difference is not recognized or valued. Equal treatment for all citizens is problematic and Young described how contemporary social movements have questioned whether justice is truly served when all are treated in the same way and difference is not recognized and protected. *Differentiated* citizenship addresses the issue of diversity. Kymlicka (1996) supported Young's conceptualization. He described how differentiated citizenship has been negotiated in Canada as a result of the recognition of English, French, and Aboriginal groups as distinct peoples or nations and is intended to accommodate these ethnic and national differences. Multiculturalism policies are meant to ensure human dignity and the recognition of difference. Both the state and its citizens share the need for these policies. The Canadian Multiculturalism Act, 1988 (Canadian Heritage Multiculturalism, 2001) and the EC's Socrates education programme (Decision no 253/2000/EC) provide direction for the ministries of education to include a multicultural dimension in their school curricula.

In order for citizens to exercise their rights, deliberate and participate in the democratic process, they must have the knowledge to do so and an understanding of the role they play, both as individuals and collectively in society. They must develop certain qualities and attitudes that allow them to engage in the interactive, democratic process. These qualities and attitudes are by and large transmitted and learned in schools. An analysis of education for democratic citizenship and curricular and pedagogical approaches would demand an understanding of the building of a polity. Thus, Bruno-Jofré and Henley (2001) started their discussion by explaining the notion of a Canadian polity: "Our understanding of Canadian polity formation in relation to citizenship education is grounded on a pluralistic moral democracy that recognizes cultural retention as a fluid process, differentiated citizenship, and a social ethic of care that gives students a

common ground in terms of who they are" (p. 51). In line with this argument, one of the conditions for schools to provide the kind of environment in which students can develop an understanding of society's pluralistic nature and work toward democratic goals is the implementation of multicultural, cross-cultural and antiracist policies that guide educational policies, curriculum development and give teachers a framework for incorporating these dimensions in citizenship education.

Much has been written on citizenship education in democratic nations, both in the Canadian and European contexts (Kennedy, 1997; Oldenquist, 1996; Sears, 1996; Sears & Hughes, 1996). Hébert and Wilkinson (2002) pointed to Osborne's (1991) work in this area. He wrote, "Citizenship is not only a status that one acquires at birth, to be recorded on a passport or in the census. It is also learned. It depends on the possession of knowledge, values and abilities that have to be taught" (p. 6). He described citizenship as a process in which people see themselves as more than consumers, but as active participants working toward enhancing democratic values. For him, schools play an important role in democratic citizenship. "The school system is one of the places where [the process] can begin. Schools must be dedicated to the promotion of a citizenship that is committed to the values of community, cooperation, participation and democracy". In his explanation of the articles of the Maastricht Treaty, which bind the EU, Növoa (2000) stated that most of the Member States agree "...that education is, by definition, the space within which national identity is constructed; public opinion places education first on the list of those sectors in which decision-making power should remain primarily on a national level" (p. 33).

Democratic values are reflected in schools through the interaction of curriculum and pedagogy, the *what* and *how* of teaching. This study does not examine the degree to which schools have been successful in teaching democratic citizenship, as research has been done in this area. Amadeo's, *et al.* (2002) study of civic knowledge and engagement among adolescents in 16 democracies found that schools did, in fact, influence student perceptions and knowledge. While their study was guided by an understanding that adolescents are influenced by public discourse and practices of society through their families, peer groups, and neighbours, they found that schools play a valuable role in educating citizens for democratic participation.

Education in Democracy – The Shift

Osborne (2001) identified three functions that schools have traditionally held in Canada and in other democratic states: 1) a cultural function to prepare students for citizenship and political participation; 2) a social function that has taught students to recognize and value difference and their unique talents and individual abilities so that they are able to make the most of their lives; and 3) a vocational function to provide training for the world of work. Bruno-Jofré and Henley (2002) stated a concern about the emphasis policy-makers have placed recently on the latter function. These authors provided an historical perspective of the functionalist role technical-vocational education has played as a tool for economic growth in Canada “by bringing to the fore the objective of regulating human capacities to serve the material conditions of the workplace” (p. 2).

The issue is not only about increasing technical-vocational education and allowing the private sector more space in public education, but turning educational services into products for export. The privatization of education today introduces industry to the provision of education in a new way and changes the notion of education as a public institution to education as a marketable product. This change allows governments to assume supervisory roles and introduces business models of performance assessment and accountability. This is done in different ways, one of which uses ‘new public management’ (NPM) theory. Pal (2001) defined NPM as “a loose framework that draws its inspiration from the private sector, and urges public sector institutions to be more businesslike through contracting out, alternative service delivery, and client/customer responsiveness” (p. 63). As well as restructuring forms of governance following business management principles, other strategies used in NPM include debt and deficit reduction and performance measurement (Lindquist, 1999).

Regarding the regulation of products for export, Taylor and Henry (2000) discussed the role of “globalizing agencies” (p. 487), a term they used to define international organizations that influence the policy-making machinery of the nation-state and “are integral to the process of globalization” (p. 488). These organizations include the OECD, the World Bank, the WTO, and the EU. The OECD, for example, stated that it “produces internationally agreed instruments, decisions and recommendations to promote rules of the game in areas where multilateral agreement is necessary for individual countries to make

progress in a globalized economy” (OECD, 2002). Taylor and Henry wrote that in many countries belonging to the OECD, educational policy focus in the last twenty years has been on vocational education and training. The OECD is also a strong promoter of school/business partnerships, urging schools to follow the management model of administration and accountability (CERI, 1992).

The positioning of education in the market place may lead to its “commodification” (Bruno-Jofré & Henley, 2002), a reciprocal opening of education to market forces, and to changes in the role of the nation state in relation to citizenship education through public schooling. Whereas education has been considered a social institution and a basic right, its commodification has the possibility of making it a product to be bought and sold by those able to pay and where the private and public sectors compete with each other in an open market. This raises questions of equity in democratic nations and has resulted in a reconceptualization of citizenship in public education. “Citizenship education has not so much disappeared from the schools as its understanding has been increasingly related to a market democracy based on the promotion of self-interest with little emphasis on the promotion of the public good” (Bruno-Jofré & Henley, 2001, p. 51). This has created a tension between private self-interest that is fostered by market priorities and education’s interest in the promotion of the common good. The shift from the notion of education as a social institution theoretically accessible equally to all regardless of difference, to education as a market commodity that recognizes difference based on customers’ different ability to pay and where this difference determines the kind of education that is accessible is problematic in a social democracy.

Methodology

In order to examine the presence of globalization and market driven ideologies in the educational policy documents in Spain and Manitoba in Canada, I used Fairclough’s (1995) model of critical discourse analysis. I treated the documents as “linguistic cultural artefacts” (p. 4), paying attention to “how links between one text and other texts and text types are inscribed in the surface of the text” (pp. 4-5). I examined the language of the policy documents of Spain and Manitoba looking for evidence of the economic language of globalizing agencies. Franklin discussed the importance of ensuring that the language we use reflects our values and beliefs. She said,

Take language, for example. One of the things that anyone who has lived under occupation will tell you is that they refused to speak the language of the occupier. That is a good lesson to remember. We, too, should refuse to speak the language of the occupier, which is now the language of the market. It's a language that reflects, as all languages do, the moral values (or lack of such values) of those who speak them. (Franklin, n.d.)

I began with an assumption that the language of economics and capitalist markets is different than the language of education as a public institution. Further, that there is a relationship between the influence of globalizing agencies on policymaking and the diminishing presence of citizenship education.

It was necessary to identify the "cultural elements" in Spain and Manitoba in this study that have conditioned and mediated the reforms to education (Bray & Thomas, 1995). I considered geographical/location, nonlocation demographic groups and aspects of education and society as well as the socio-economic and political elements. Schriewer (2000) has found that results from education research have shown uniformity in world educational systems that "indicate astonishing processes of global alignment that have taken place at different levels, and in different dimensions, of education" (p. 313).

Using the theoretical framework established above, I examined the discourse in educational policy documents, first those issued by globalizing agencies such as the OECD, the WTO, the EU and NAFTA written for economic purposes, then those of Manitoba and Spain, whose traditional intent has been to support public institutions. I examined the extent to which the language of economics has been used to reinterpret the ways in which policy makers talk about education and the impact of this language on educational discourse. I examined the relationship among the variables, such as the policymaking strategies of NPM theory and the cultural, political, economic, internal and international elements of Spain and Manitoba in Canada. In spite of all the variables and the possibility for different discourse in the policy documents, this methodology helped to focus on the high level of uniformity in educational reform. This method facilitated my search for the hegemonic use of economic priorities in the educational policy documents in both the globalizing agencies and the two countries.

Sources

Primary sources in the form of policy documents comprised the largest part of this study. To investigate the extent to which globalizing agencies influence policymaking, I examined documents from the OECD, the WTO, NAFTA and the EU. Regarding Manitoba, I included provincial policy documents, particularly the *Renewing Education: New Directions* documents issued from 1994 to 1999 while the Progressive Conservative Party was in power. Two of these major documents are *The Blueprint for Action* (Manitoba Education and Training, 1994), and *The Action Plan* (Manitoba Education and Training, 1995). With regard to Spain I examined some of the laws pertaining directly to education issued from 1990. According to Vázquez (2001), "comparative studies all concur that 1990 was the year of education reform in Spain. It was in that year that Parliament passed the Organic Law on General Organization of the Education System, known as the LOGSE" (p.11). I examined that law (Ley, 1990), the one preceding it (Ley, 1985) and the most recent law (Ley, 2002). Space restrictions here do not permit me to discuss all of the documents I examined, but I will endeavour to provide a representative example of my findings.

Globalizing Agencies and Policy Changes

Analysts for globalizing agencies invest a great deal of time and energy in studying, analyzing, and making recommendations to governments for direction they deem important for policy regarding all areas of governance. Rhetoric about global trade policies in general and educational policies specifically get bogged down in questions about *how* to regulate education for trade and obscures questions about *whether* it should be considered for trade at all. Developing a theory about globalization, Dale (2000) saw it "as being constructed through three related sets of activities: economic, political, and cultural. These may be characterized as hyper-liberalism, governance without government, and commodification and consumerism, respectively" (p. 436). He claimed that a paradigm shift has been created that has changed the role of the state both nationally and internationally. Just as Taylor and Henry (2000) did, he found that nations have ceded power to supranational bodies, which in turn has affected public institutions such as education. In *Educational Multilateralism and World (Dis)order*, Mundy (1998) also dealt with the manifestation of globalization in educational policy formation. In line with Dale's conception of the economic, political and cultural activities of

globalization, Mundy showed how educational multilateralism has responded and contributed to the broader reordering of international political, economic, and social reforms since 1945. She concluded that educational policies played a significant role in the development of a changing world economic order.

The Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development

The OECD's interest is to assist economic growth and promote the expansion of world trade. On its website, it was stated that, "the OECD produces internationally agreed instruments, decisions and recommendations to promote rules of the game in areas where multilateral agreement is necessary for individual countries to make progress in a globalized economy". Henry, Lindgard, Rizvi and Taylor (2001), in an important analysis of the OECD, found that its hegemonic discourse left no room for "critical intellectual inquiry and the fostering of an egalitarian and democratic ethos" (p. 175). Its members consist mostly of Western developed countries, with those of Asia and the developing world beginning to join, as well.

Reports ensuing from educational projects, surveys, and questionnaires conducted with governments and corporations of member countries provided a means for the OECD to function as a hegemonic tool, centralizing the debates occurring in individual countries and giving all of the diverse topics concerning education a global focus. This hegemonic role of the OECD is also evident in the conferences it organized, bringing together the various educational "stakeholders" such as, ministers of education, business representatives and policy think tanks.

More than any other document, *Education and the Economy in a Changing Society* (OECD, 1989) was the most explicit in its direction for education as a means to economic growth and security. It is the product of four years of study that culminated in a Conference of Education Ministers. It examined the relationship between education and the economy and made recommendations for the kind of education policy that would increase the emphasis on education and training. In this document the aim of education and training was to "guide the trajectory of economic growth and transform it into social progress" (p. 3).

In his address at the conference, John Dawkins, the Australian Minister for Employment, Education and Training declared that his

Ministry emphasized the job training purpose of education. He concluded that in order for workers to learn skills for the current job market and adapt to new technological changes would "require a more efficient and responsive education and training system which is more closely attuned to the needs of industry" (p. 10).

Curriculum Reform: An Overview of Trends (CERI, 1990) was based on responses from 17 member countries to a questionnaire regarding the general debate in elementary education, curriculum content, vocational education, and assessment and evaluation. Chapter 1 of the report was titled "New Directions, Old Ways" (p. 11). This was borrowed almost verbatim three years later by the Department of Education and Training in Manitoba, and *New Directions - Renewing Education* (Manitoba Education and Training, 1994) became the name of the educational reform movement there. Furthermore, the first of six priorities or "Directions" in the Manitoba reforms addressed the need for "basic" or "essential" learning to be supported by new "core" curriculum. Curiously, Chapter 4 in the OECD report addressed the search for a core curriculum. For all the claims that the OECD reports were meant to be objective and a means of reporting what was occurring in the member countries, it is evident that after the OECD report was published, at least one member country, in this case the province of Manitoba in Canada, took direction from the OECD policy recommendations and implemented reforms based directly on these documents.

In 1992, the OECD published a report, *Schools and Business: A New Partnership* (CERI), that studied what it had perceived then as the increasing "partnerships" – defined as cooperation – between ministries of education and private sector organizations and individuals. Twenty-four case studies of school/business partnerships were presented from nine OECD countries and included participants such as secondary, technical and vocational schools, small and large businesses, companies such as IBM, the Education Committee of the Business and Industry Advisory Committee to the OECD (BIAC), the Trade Union Advisory Committee to the OECD (TUAC), policy think-tanks such as the Conference Board of Canada, ministries of education, and boards of education.

The report attributed the increase in partnerships to "serious shortcomings" (p. 7) in the state's provision of service. The only explanation of those shortcomings was "in terms of preparing pupils for the workforce." There was no discourse about the aims of education in

a democratic state, or the cultural or social dimensions requiring attention. It reported, "employers have seen that the best way to influence schools is to work together with them, and schools have realized that they share many goals with employers." Education as training for the labour force was the only purpose for education addressed in this document.

More significant, however, was the role of industry in determining educational direction and policy. While the report stated that there was a "hope" (p. 7) that links between schools and business would influence business practice, the emphasis was placed on a transformation of education in the following two statements: "changes in education have in practice been the dominant objective", and "partnerships need to find ways of changing aspects of education *systems*" (emphasis in the original). These changes held implications for teaching methodology to address student learning, curriculum development to address vocational programs, teacher professional development, and school governance. The conclusion of the study began with the following quote: "*Education is too important to be left to the educators. The more people who are involved in changing it, the better*" (Mac Prescott, President, Ottawa Carleton Learning Foundation)" (emphasis in the original, p. 49). Considering the prominent place of such a bold statement, there is little doubt that the authors of this report valued education differently than educators in the schools.

The European Commission

Nóvoa (2000) addressed the implications of national identity and the Articles of the *Treaty of the European Union* (Europa, n.d.) for education. He wrote that two types of perversions occurred in education: one, an overt expanded concept of vocational training, and the other, "the development of a semiclandestine educational policy" (Nóvoa, p. 34). According to *Cooperation on Policy Issues* (Europa, n.d.), actions were developed at the Lisbon European Council in March 2000 to support the European Union's "new strategic objective for the coming decade, viz: *becoming the most competitive and dynamic knowledge-based economy in the world capable of sustainable economic growth with more and better jobs and greater social cohesion*" (emphasis in the original). It is clear that education was seen as the means to attaining a global competitive advantage.

In order "to strengthen cooperation on education and training policy, a **detailed work programme on the future objectives of education and training systems** [was to] be implemented using the '**open method of coordination**' between Member States" [emphasis in original] (Europa, n.d.). This is further supported by the *Treaty* (Europa, n.d.) that states, "The Community and the Member States shall foster cooperation with third countries and the competent international organisations in the sphere of vocational training" (150.3).

There is clear direction to the Member States to cooperate and coordinate, not only among themselves, but to cooperate with international agencies, as well. The direction from the *Cooperation on Policy Issues* developed at the Lisbon European Council to assess objectives and generate indicators supported the requirements of the OECD and its penchant for performance measurement. When one also considers the *Treaty's* policy to foster cooperation with international organizations that gives space to the policies promoted by the WTO and other globalizing agencies, it is evident that the pressure on nation states to conform came from many directions.

North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA)

Modeled on the WTO's GATS, NAFTA (1994) is a cumbersome, complicated document of over 1000 pages intended to regulate trade and provide answers to legal grievances and disputes. Proponents of NAFTA claimed that the Agreement would increase employment opportunities and strengthen the economies of Canada, the United States, and Mexico. Campbell (1994) argued that it broadened the machinery of globalization and contributed first, to the strengthening of global corporations to the detriment of the sovereign power of nation-states and secondly, to a struggle for economic dominance by the United States, Europe and Japan.

NAFTA covers many of the same areas of trade as the WTO's GATS. It includes regulations regarding "Most-favoured Nation Treatment" and "National Treatment" that bind a Nation to protect providers of service from discrimination in cases where competition exists. This means that where a service is open to competition, even where the State is a provider of that service, no one party can be favoured over any other. As soon as a service is open to private sector provision, all protection for that service is removed. Like the GATS, services such as health care and education are subject to the terms of the Agreement as soon as any parts of the service are privatized. For

example, when schools contract with telecommunications companies to provide services for Internet access or on-line courses, this service then falls under the NAFTA regulations (Campbell, 1994).

Barlow and Robertson (1994) identified three problems with the Agreement. First, Articles 1201 and 1202 address "cross-border trade in services", including education, and "national treatment status" respectively (NAFTA Secretariat, 1994). These Articles open educational services to allow private corporations the right to compete for provision of service. The second problem lies in Article 1205 which allows providers to maintain residence outside of the country receiving the service. Telecommunications play an important role in making educational services accessible across borders. Companies that market diverse products such as on-line courses, teaching materials, standardized testing materials, and news networks such as Youth News Network (YNN) all have access to the education market without the necessity of even visiting the receiving country, let alone establishing an office there. All three of these Articles allow the possibility of provision of services with no cultural sensitivity to the receiving country (Barlow & Robertson, pp. 98-103).

Chapter 10 in the Agreement presents a third problem with the extension of "procurement rights" to foreign companies to allow them to bid equally with national companies on government and Crown corporation contracts over \$50,000. Once a service has been privatized there is no possibility of returning it to a public service. Again, Barlow and Robertson found the procurement law poses a threat to the cultural integrity of a service like education.

Policy Changes in Spain and Manitoba in Canada

Spain

In 1990 the Spanish government enacted the Education Systems Structure Act (*Ley Organica 1/1990 de Ordenación General del Sistema Educativo - LOGSE*). Two of the major areas of the reforms of the LOGSE were the establishment of the structure of the current education system up to and including the secondary level, and raising of compulsory schooling to age 16. Most significantly, for students ages 16 to 18, the Baccalaureate prepared students for both University education and Advanced Specific Vocational Training, and Intermediate Specific Vocational Training that provided access to trades. All through *Educación Secundaria* students were now obliged

to select courses very carefully or be faced with limited options for career choices later on.

As the European Union continues to evolve and the questions of citizenship and identity remain in the education domain, so, too, do the questions of the European dimension in education and Spain's less than desirable success in addressing it in its educational policies, in part as a result of the influence of globalizing agencies. Vega's (2001) strongest criticisms of the changes to educational policies are aimed at more recent ones and the inadequate manner with which they address the European dimension in Spanish curricula. He claimed that the intent of the new policies is "...to undermine the political and pedagogical bases of the prior socialist reform" (p. 59). Two decrees, 3473/2000 and 3474/2000, of December 29 (Real Decreto), directly affect the Humanities (history, language and geography), specifically increasing the academic weight given to the history of Spain and reducing the hours devoted to education in values, which is where the European dimension can be so readily incorporated. In examining the curricular changes in the higher, non-compulsory level of secondary education (ages 16-18) there is evidence of an emphasis of a traditional, classical approach to the humanities, rather than a modern and European one. The only two areas where a European focus can be found are the inclusion of foreign languages, German, French, English, Italian and Portuguese, and of geography, of which an academic objective is the study of the interdependence of Spain and the European Union (Vega, 2001).

The most recent changes to education were passed December 2002 in the *Ley Orgánica de Calidad de la Educación* (LOCE) (*Ley Orgánica 12/2002*). The opening two sentences of the preamble link education to economic and social development: "Technological changes have transformed modern society into a complex reality, affected by a strong dynamic that is evident in the knowledge and information that drives economic and social development. In this new context, citizens' expectations of the education system and formation have increased substantially" (p. 45188).

The legislation raised the problem of the high rates of students who leave compulsory secondary education. As a means of addressing this problem, increased evaluation and efficiency were to be implemented in the education system. More importantly, this need to improve efficiency was linked to pressure from outside Spain and international economic competition:

Evaluation and analysis of our education system, performed by national and international organizations and institutions show evidence of worrying deficiencies with relation to our country's economic and cultural environment. This is particularly evident in Secondary Education...The students rank in the lower half of the European Union in knowledge of key subjects such as mathematics and sciences, fundamental in the social and economic reality in which science and technology are fundamental dimensions of knowledge. (Ley Orgánica 12/2002, p. 45189)

Further evidence of pressure to conform Spain's education system to economic forces outside of Spain came from the perceived need to integrate into the European context and meet the demands of employment in the future: "Full integration of Spain into the European context creates a major opening and requires greater sanctioning and flexibility in the education system... The enterprising spirit is necessary to face the evolution of the demands of employment in the future" (p. 45189) and "The law ensures parity between our education systems and those of our neighbouring countries, and at the same time guarantees basic levels from all the students, no matter their place of residence in order to obtain the 'titulación' that is valued in the entire country" (Ley Orgánica 12/2002, p. 45191). The need to improve evaluation of all dimensions of the education system was tied to the need to conform to outside regulations even more strongly through state competencies: "The exercise of the state competencies is in the hands of the National Institute for Evaluation and Quality of Education. This responds to the need to have a similar name as the other countries of the EU. Among the functions are the diagnostic evaluation of the basic competencies of the curriculum that will be done at the primary and ESO levels, as well as with the general evaluation plan of the education system and the State System of Indicators of Education" (Ley Orgánica 12/2002, 45192).

Manitoba

When the Progressive Conservative Party came to power the aims of their 'reforms' were to move Manitoba fully to a post-industrial global society by reducing the deficit, limiting and reducing taxes, and

reducing the size of the public sector (Levin, 2001). The changes to educational policy were first introduced in 1994 and were called *Renewing Education: New Directions* (Manitoba Education and Training, 1994, 1995). Over the next five years the government implemented many of the changes initially proposed such as: redefinition of essential learning or "basic education" with an emphasis on reading, writing and math; standardized testing; administrative changes that required schools to submit annual development plans; decentralization of authority through the establishment of Advisory Councils for School Leadership that gave parents and community members an opportunity to make recommendations to school boards; schools of choice whereby parents could opt to send their child to a school outside of their home division; increased emphasis and use of technology in schools; changes to the collective bargaining process for teachers and reduced teacher salaries; and reduced funding for education.

The overall theme in the *Blueprint for Action* document (Manitoba Education and Training, 1994), intended to be implemented over six years, is permeated with language about preparing students for economic participation in the future. This reference appeared to the exclusion of any other role for education. According to the policies, this emphasis on preparing students for the future has as its foundation the need to provide students with the appropriate job skills to ensure that they can contribute to the economic prosperity of Manitoba and to allow Manitoba "to compete successfully in today's competitive world" (p. 1). Skill development was to be addressed through the identification of a core education or essential learning which placed an emphasis on literacy, and achievement standards to be established by the Department of Education and measured at the end of Grades 3, 6, 9, and 12. Not only were standards to be centrally established at the provincial level, the policies also called for collaboration on areas such as "essential (basic) education", distance education and technology, aboriginal education, and assessment and performance standards, of all the western provinces and territories in Canada. This narrow focus in education on skill acquisition is evident in other initiatives in these policies. According to the document, two of the solutions to improving the education system lay in identifying essential learning and setting clear standards that could be measured. The policies identified two areas of focus: traditional learning such as reading, writing, and math; and new learning identified as communication, problem solving, human relations, and technology. There was an acknowledgement in the document that there was an expectation for

some students to fail: "Students will be expected to strive for excellence, and, because expectations will be high and because students are diverse in their skills and abilities, some students may... achieve lower grades, fail, repeat a grade or course in order to achieve the expectations" (p. 14)! It stated that schools would provide few modified programs, but students in the final two years of high school would be allowed, "to choose from a variety of courses designed for different purposes (e.g., advanced, technical, applied)".

There was a contradiction in *The Action Plan* regarding the place of social studies. The document stated, "The social studies curriculum will be revised to place a significantly greater emphasis on Canadian studies and Canadian history" (p. 5). However, even though social studies was considered to be a "core" subject, and it was to receive an increase in Canadian content, it was removed from Senior 3 as a compulsory subject: "Senior 3 social studies, with its focus on Canadian history, is now a compulsory subject, but will become optional in September 1997" (p. 9). Schools were given the choice to continue to offer it as a compulsory subject, or to offer it as an elective. It is difficult to believe there is sound pedagogical reasoning behind this decision to remove social studies from Senior 3, the subject in which we find many concepts of citizenship education can be directly addressed. On one hand, it was stated that social studies would receive increased attention and greater Canadian content, yet the very course that met these policy criteria no longer would be required by students. One is left to interpret that social studies, in fact, was not seen by the government as an "essential" subject.

"Direction 4: Parental and Community Involvement" (p. 23) in *The Action Plan* reiterated the roles and responsibilities of the Advisory Councils and elaborated the guidelines for parents, schools, and school divisions regarding choice of schools. The document stated, Manitoba Education and Training will facilitate parental flexibility in choosing a public school best suited to their children's learning requirements" (p. 26). When one considers the emphasis placed on accountability in the form of standardized testing, student assessment, school evaluation through yearly school plans, parental involvement in the Advisory Councils coupled with the initiation of school choice it is not difficult to see the strategy of the government. Parents were being given the leverage to reward or penalize schools with their child's enrolment based on a school's performance.

The question of funding was addressed in the following manner: "All provincial funding will go to the school division where the student attends school" (p. 27). This meant that schools located in areas where the population experienced greater socio-economic hardship may have had students who performed academically more poorly than did students in other areas. If parents were given the right to move their child to a different school based on the academic performance criteria of those schools, and the funding was to follow the student, the socio-economic disparities could only be expected to grow.

Conclusion

The educational aims of a nation reflect the values of its society. In a democracy that recognizes pluralism and has established moral values, these aims are the political space in which citizens develop these understandings and learn how to participate in all the dimensions of life. Education fosters human development, and social and cultural cohesion, both locally and globally. The state plays an integral role in ensuring that all citizens are given equal opportunities, based on different needs and abilities to participate fully.

The economic priorities of globalization that are dominated by a neo-liberal ideology are based on a narrow definition of citizen participation and require a new role for the nation-state. In this paradigm, the perceived need to create a knowledge-based economy frames citizen participation in economic terms and limits it to contributing work skills for a competitive job market. Economic concerns underpin all policy decisions and the state is reduced to training workers whose performance can be measured, all in the most cost-efficient manner. Public policy discourse is filled with language of private industry management theories that reduce the rights and duties of citizens to deliberate about matters of the common good, to those of customers with the ability to participate in economic markets. Further, the delivery of educational services is opened to the market, making room for the private sector to compete with states in the delivery of education.

Missing from educational policies that are written in response to globalizing influences are the goals that address citizenship education for a pluralistic moral democracy: the need for education to enable students to develop all the dimensions of their identity; to learn about collective participation and engagement; to learn to value racial, cultural, religious, physical and gender differences; and to learn how to

deliberate about the public good and hold political authorities accountable.

As the state's role in providing education changes, its citizens lose the opportunities in the educational systems to develop all the capacities required for full citizen participation. School choice, driven by a competitive market notion that offers the customer the right to shop for the best value, creates situations of inequity. A narrow definition of success that is determined by global standards does not give students the opportunity to develop critically reflective questioning minds. And the educational aim of training students as workers sends a message that their most valuable contribution is economic.

The discourse analysis in this study has examined the influence on education policies of economic priorities of globalizing agencies and the implications for a narrow understanding of citizen participation and a changed role for the nation-state. This is but a beginning and there is room to explore, for example, how the policies have been implemented, and the true degree and level of socio-economic participation students are able to realize upon graduation. To carry the study even further, it would be important to examine the role of globalizing agencies in countries relatively new to capitalism, and how these nations are mediating their influence.

Note

1. At the time of writing.

References

- Amadeo, J., Torney-Purta, J., Lehamn, R., Husfeldt, V., & Nikolova, R. (2002). *Civic knowledge and engagement: An IEA study of upper secondary students in sixteen countries*. Amsterdam: The International Association for the Evaluation of Educational Achievement.
- Barlow, M. & Robertson, H.J. (1994). *Class warfare: The assault on Canada's schools*. Toronto: Key Porter Books Limited.
- Benhabib, S. (1996) (Ed.). *Democracy and difference: Contesting the boundaries of the political*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Bray, M. & Thomas, R.M. (1995). Levels of comparison in educational studies: Different insight from different literatures and

the value of multilevel analyses. *Harvard Educational Review*, 65, 472-490.

- Bruno-Jofré, R. & Henley, D. (2001). Public schooling in English Canada: Addressing difference in the context of globalization. In R. Bruno-Jofré & N. Aponiuk (Eds.), *Educating citizens for a pluralistic society* (pp. 49-70). Calgary, Alberta: Canadian Ethnic Studies Journal.
- Bruno-Jofré, R. & Henley, D. (2002). The Canadian education industry: An historical critique. *Canadian and International Education*, 31 (1), 1-17.
- Campbell, B. (1994). *Living with NAFTA: Six years of "free trade" fallout in Canada*. Ottawa: Action Canada Network.
- Carr, W. (1991, October). *Becoming a citizen: Education in a democratic society*. Paper presented at the International Symposium on Human Development and Education, Universidad Complutense Madrid, Madrid.
- Centre for Educational Research and Innovation (1990). *Curriculum reform: An overview of trends*. Paris, OECD.
- Centre for Educational Research and Innovation (1992) *Schools and business: a new partnership*. Paris: OECD.
- Dale, R. (2000). Globalization and education: Demonstrating a "common world educational culture" or locating a "globally structured educational agenda"? *Educational Theory*, 50, 427-446.
- DECISION No 253/2000/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 24 January, 2000 establishing the second phase of the Community action programme in the field of education 'Socrates' [Electronic version]. *Official Journal of the European Communities*, L028, (03/02/2000).
- Europa. *Cooperation on policy issues*. Retrieved October 2, 2004 from http://europa.eu.int/comm/education/policies/pol/policy_en.html. European Communities.
- Fairclough, N. (1995). *Critical discourse analysis: The critical study of language*. London: Longman Group Limited.
- Franklin, U. (n.d.). *Building a people-first economy: Canada under the occupation of an army of marketeers*. Retrieved October 5, 2004 from http://www.povnet.org/human_rights/franklin.htm.
- Gagnon, F. & Pagé, M. (1999) *Conceptual Framework for an analysis of citizenship in the liberal democracies. Volume I: Conceptual framework and analysis*. Prepared for Multiculturalism Directorate and Citizen Participation Directorate (DG), Citizens' Participation and Multiculturalism and Strategic Research and Analysis (SRA)

- Directorate DG, Strategic Planning and Policy Coordination, Department of Canadian Heritage.
- Hébert, Y. & Wilkinson, L. (2002). The citizenship debates: conceptual, policy, experiential, and educational issues. In Y. Hébert (Ed.). *Citizenship transformation in Canada*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- Henry, M., Lingard, B., Rizvi, F., & Taylor, S. (2001). *The OECD, globalization, and Education policy*. Oxford, UK: Elsevier Science Ltd.
- Kennedy, K. (1997) (Ed.). *Citizenship education and the modern state*. London: Falmer Press.
- Kymlicka, W. (1996). Three forms of group-differentiated citizenship in Canada. In S. Benhabib (Ed.). *Democracy and difference: Contesting the boundaries of the political*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Levin, B. (2001). *Reforming education: From origins to outcomes*. New York: RoutledgeFalmer.
- Ley Organica 8/1985, de 3 de julio, de reguladora del Derecho a la Educación. *Boletín Oficial de Estado*, 159, (3-7-1985).
- Ley Orgánica 1/1990, de 3 de octubre, de Ordenación General del Sistema Educativo. *Boletín Oficial del Estado*, 238 (4-10-1990).
- Ley Orgánica 12/2002, de 23 de diciembre, de Calidad de la Educación. *Boletín Oficial del Estado*, 307 (24-12-2002).
- Lindquist, E. (1999). *Reconceiving the center: Leadership, strategic review and coherence in public sector reform*. PUMASGF (99)5. OECD Public Management Service.
- Manitoba Education and Training, (1994). *Renewing Education: New Directions; A Blueprint for Action*. Government of Manitoba: Author.
- Manitoba Education and Training, (January, 1995). *Renewing Education. New Directions: The Action Plan*. Government of Manitoba: Author.
- Mundy, K. (1998). Educational Multilateralism and World (Dis)order. *Comparative Education Review*, 42, 448-478.
- NAFTA Secretariat (1994). *The North American Free Trade Agreement*. Retrieved October 2, 2004 from <http://www.nafta-sec-alena.org/DefaultSite/index.html>
- Nóvoa, A. (2000). The restructuring of the European educational space: changing relationships among states, citizens, and education communities. In T.S. Popkewitz, (Ed.), *Educational knowledge: changing relationships between the state, civil society, and the educational community* (pp. 31 – 58). Albany: State University of New York Press.
- OECD. (1989). *Education and the economy in a changing society*. Paris: Author.
- OECD. (2002). Retrieved January 11, 2003, from <http://www.oecd.org>
- Oldenquist, A. (1996) (Ed.) *Can democracy be taught? Perspectives on education for democracy in the United States, Central and Eastern Europe, Russia, South Africa, and Japan*. Bloomington, Indiana: Phi Delta Kappa Educational Foundation.
- Osborne, K. (1991). Teaching for democratic citizenship. *Our schools/our selves* 3, (3) and 4.
- Osborne, K. (2001). Public schooling and citizenship education in Canada. In R. Bruno-Jofré & N. Aponiuk (Eds.), *Educating citizens for a pluralistic society* (pp. 11-48). Calgary, Alberta: Canadian Ethnic Studies Journal.
- Pal, L.A. (2001). *Beyond policy analysis: Public issue management in turbulent times*. Scarborough: Nelson Thomson Learning.
- Popkewitz, T. (2000). Globalization/regionalization, knowledge, and the educational practices: Some notes on comparative strategies for educational research. In T. S. Popkewitz (Ed.), *Educational knowledge: Changing relationships between the state, civil society, and the educational community* (3-27). Albany, N.Y.: State University of New York Press.
- Real Decreto 3473/2000, de 29 de diciembre, por el que se modifica el Real Decreto 1007/1991 por el que se establecen las enseñanzas mínimas correspondientes a la educación secundaria obligatoria. *Boletín Oficial del Estado*, 14 (16-1-2000).
- Schriewer, J. (2000). World system and interrelationship networks: The internationalization of education and the role of comparative inquiry. In T. S. Popkewitz (Ed.), *Educational knowledge: Changing relationships between the state, civil society, and the educational community* (pp. 307-43). Albany, NY: State University of New York Press.
- Sears, A. (1996). "Something different to everyone": Conceptions of citizenship and citizenship education. *Canadian and International Education*, 25, (2), 1-16.
- Sears, A. & Hughes, A. (1996). Citizenship Education and Current Educational Reform. *Canadian Journal of Education* 21, (2), 123-42.
- Taylor, A. (2001). *The politics of educational reform in Alberta*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press Incorporated.
- Taylor, S. & Henry, M. (2000). Globalization and educational policymaking: A case study. *Educational Theory*, 50, 486-503.

- Vázquez, G. (2001). The reform of the Spanish education system: An evaluation and prospective. *Encounters on Education/Encuentros sobre Education/Rencontres sur l'éducation*, 2, 9-26.
- Vega, G. L. (2001). The European Focus of the Curriculum in the Educational Reforms of Spain at the End of the Twentieth Century. In R. Bruno-Jofré & G. Jover, (Eds.), *Encounters on Education*, 2.
- Viñao, A. (2001). Do education reforms fail? A historian's response. *Encounters on education*, 2. Kingston, Ontario, Canada: Faculty of Education, Queen's University.
- Young, I. (1995). Polity and group difference: A critique of the ideal of universal citizenship. In R. Beiner (Ed.), *Theorizing citizenship* (pp. 175-208). New York: State University of New York Press.
- Young, I. (1996). Communication and the other: Beyond deliberative democracy. In S. Benhabib (Ed.), *Democracy and difference: Contesting the boundaries of the political* (pp. 120-135). Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Correspondence concerning this article should be addressed to Marlene Schellenberg. Email: marjoy@mts.net.
