**Electronic Thesis and Dissertation Repository** 

11-3-2023 11:30 AM

# Hiring Criteria and Employability of ESL/EFL Instructors in the TESOL Job Market in Canada and the United Arab Emirates

Shaden S. Attia, Western University

Supervisor: Taylor, Shelley K., The University of Western Ontario

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Doctor of Philosophy degree

in Education

© Shaden S. Attia 2023

Follow this and additional works at: https://ir.lib.uwo.ca/etd



Part of the Higher Education Commons, and the Higher Education and Teaching Commons

#### **Recommended Citation**

Attia, Shaden S., "Hiring Criteria and Employability of ESL/EFL Instructors in the TESOL Job Market in Canada and the United Arab Emirates" (2023). Electronic Thesis and Dissertation Repository. 9751. https://ir.lib.uwo.ca/etd/9751

This Dissertation/Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by Scholarship@Western. It has been accepted for inclusion in Electronic Thesis and Dissertation Repository by an authorized administrator of Scholarship@Western. For more information, please contact wlswadmin@uwo.ca.

#### **Abstract**

This study investigated the hiring criteria and employability of ESL/EFL instructors in Canada and the United Arab Emirates (UAE). It also explored challenges facing instructors in today's global TESOL job market and how instructors tackled these challenges. The study drew on intersectionality and Critical Race Theory as its theoretical framework, and a qualitative methodological approach to answer the research questions. The research questions explored similarities and differences between the Canadian and Emirate TESOL job markets, the hiring criteria in both contexts, and factors that affect program administrators' hiring decisions and ESL/EFL instructors' experiences on the job market. A variety of research methods were utilized including online questionnaires for instructors, an analysis of online job advertisements and journal reflections, and interviews with instructors and program administrators in different higher education organizations.

The findings of the study highlighted that teaching experience, educational qualifications, and teaching certification were the major hiring criteria used in both Canada and the UAE. Also, changes in the job markets were identified including changes related to Covid-19, hiring dynamics, the use of the term "native" (i.e., "native-speaker"), and degree inflation. In addition, instructors underscored challenges they faced in the job market including limited numbers of job opportunities, job precarity, low salaries, demanding interview and certification processes, and instances of discrimination.

Instructors countered these obstacles by highlighting their "non-native" status to their students and the various benefits they bring to the classroom. Instructors also proved their teaching abilities by successfully completing the teaching certification process, pursuing

higher education degrees, and securing teaching positions in different universities and colleges.

This study underscored instructors' and program administrators' voices regarding changes and challenges in the TESOL job market by offering them the opportunity to tell their stories. The study also highlighted the main hiring criteria used in the employment of ESL/EFL instructors, which should assist instructors in their job hunt and during the interview process. The minimal disagreements between instructors' and program administrators' views should offer a starting point for a discussion regarding the TESL certification and equivalency requirements, and the importance and value of international versus Canadian experience.

Keywords: TESOL, hiring criteria, job market, intersectionality, Critical Race
Theory, ESL/EFL Instructors, Program Administrators, Higher Education, Covid-19

#### **Summary for Lay Audience**

This study explored the job market in universities and colleges in Canada and the United Arab Emirates (UAE). It investigated three research questions focusing on the hiring requirements in both countries and the experiences of program administrators and English instructors who speak English as an additional language. The goal of the study was to underline the similarities and differences between both job markets and the changes in the Canadian and Emirate contexts. Another goal was to underscore the opportunities instructors have in the field and challenges they face and how they counter them. In addition, the study investigated what affects program administrators' decisions when hiring English instructors.

To achieve these goals, the researcher analyzed job advertisements for English teaching positions in Canada and the UAE and interviewed instructors and program administrators. Instructors were also asked to complete an online questionnaire and a journal reflection. The data collected from instructors and program administrators were analyzed to answer the research questions by creating categories and comparing them in the two contexts and between both groups (i.e., Instructors and administrators). The critical nature of the study required using a critical lens, which was provided by Critical Race Theory (CRT) and intersectionality. CRT is a theory that focuses on the relation between race, power, and power relations. Intersectionality is a concept, which focuses on how the relation between different elements (i.e., Race, gender, nationality, etc.) can affect individuals' experiences. These concepts formed the base for understanding the data collected and participants' experiences and stories.

The results of the study highlighted the main hiring criteria used in the job market, such as teaching experience, educational requirements, teaching certification, and high

proficiency in the English language. There was an agreement between instructors' and program administrators' views; however, a minor disagreement emerged related to Canadian versus international experience and teaching certification. Based on the findings of the study, it is important to start a dialogue between instructors and administrators to clarify any misunderstandings or disagreements. Also, it is hoped that these findings facilitate instructors' employment experiences by highlighting administrators' expectations and job market's requirements.

#### -Dedication

To the soul of my father, I hope I made you proud, Baba.

To my mother, Yousria, who never stopped cheering me on and for always being there when I needed her.

To my sister, Radwa, brother, Mohammed, baby sister, Livia, and big brother, Mo'men, for believing in me.

To my nephew, Hamza, my niece, Fayrouz, for showering me with their love and kindness.

To my two fur babies, Za'tar and Labnah, for making me laugh and brightening my journey.

To my best friends and sisters, Beyza and Malak, for always being there for me.

I am thankful above all to Allah Almighty for giving me strength to complete this journey and for surrounding me with loving and caring friends and family members.

Thank you!

## Acknowledgment

Over the past four years and throughout my PhD journey, I received guidance and support from many amazing people without whom I would not have been able to complete this journey. I am deeply grateful to my supervisor, Dr, Shelley Taylor, who was always there for me and who went above and beyond to assist me with my research and help me develop academically. I am also grateful to Dr. Paul Tarc and Dr. Pejman Habibie for their feedback and for assisting me in refining my research idea. I would like to also recognize the effort exerted and feedback provided by the defense committee.

I cannot forget to deeply thank my amazing classmates and colleagues who never hesitated to answer my questions and help me in every possible way, and who patiently endured my constant discussion of my research topic. A final thank you is due to the many amazing people in the Faculty of Education, Graduate office, and Western's libraries who facilitated my research journey.

Thank you!

# **Table of Contents**

Abstract	i
Summary for Lay Audience	iii
Dedication	V
Acknowledgment	vi
Table of Contents	vii
List of Tables	X
List of Appendices	xi
List of Key Acronyms and Abbreviations	xii
Chapter 1	1
1 Introduction	1
1 Theoretical Framework	6
1.1 Critical Race Theory	6
1.1.1 Key Tenets of Critical Race Theory	7
1.1.2 Critiques of Critical Race Theory	8
1.1.3 Critical Race Theory in Education	9
1.2 Intersectionality	10
1.2.1 Critiques of Intersectionality	11
Chapter 2	14
2 Literature Review	14
2.1 History and Evolution of Applied Linguistics	14
2.2 CRT, Intersectionality, and TESOL	18
2.3 Definitions of Racialization	20
2.4 Immigration, Employment, and Racialization in Canada	21
2.5 Migration and Labour Market in the UAE	24
2.6 Discrimination and English Language Teaching	28
2.6.1 Whiteness, ELT, and Education	33
2.6.2 Counter-narrative in Education	36
2.7 Globalization and the English Language	37
2.7.1 Linguistic Discrimination	39
2.7.2 Language Legitimacy	41

2.7.3 Discrimination and the Job Market	43
2.7.4 Covid-19 and the Job Market	52
2.8 "Nativeness" and "Non-nativeness"	54
2.8.1 What Does the Term Native Speaker Mean?	54
2.8.2 "Nativeness" and Discrimination	55
2.8.3 Counteracting the Native-Non-Native Dichotomy	58
2.9 Current Research	60
Chapter 3	62
3 Methodology	62
3.1 Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches	62
3.2 Current Research Study	63
3.3 Data Collection	66
3.3.1 Data Collection Process	66
3.3.3 Data Collection Tools	69
3.4 Data Analysis	74
3.4.1 Analysis	74
3.4.2 Data Validity and Reliability	78
3.5 Ethical Considerations	79
3.6 Researcher's Positionality and Epistemology	83
Chapter 4	87
4 Findings	87
4.1 Job Advertisements	87
4.1.1 Job Ads in the UAE	88
4.1.2 Job Ads in Canada	91
4.2 Instructors' Questionnaires Results	93
4.2.1 Emirate Questionnaire Results	94
4.2.2 Canadian Questionnaire Results	98
4.3 Journal Reflections	102
4.3.1 Instructors' Reflections in the UAE	103
4.3.2 Instructors' Reflections in Canada	106
4.4 Instructors' Interviews	108
AAI Instructors in the IIAE	100

4.4.2 Instructors in Canada	118
4.5 Program Administrators' Interviews	137
4.5.1 Program Administrators in Canada	138
4.5.2 Program Administrators in the UAE	151
Chapter 5	160
5 Discussion and Conclusion	160
5.1 Discussion of Research Questions	160
5.1.1 Research Question One	161
5.1.2 Research Question Two	167
5.1.3 Research Question Three	174
5.2 Final Reflections	184
5.3 Recommendations	187
5.4 Significance and Future Research	189
5.5 Limitations of the Study	192
5.6 Postscript	193
5.7 Conclusion	196
References	200
Appendices	210
Curriculum Vitae	255

# **List of Tables**

Table 1. Instructors' List	68
Table 2. Program Administrators' List	68
Table 3. Professional and Biographical Factors in Job Advertisements	88
Table 4. Ranking of Hiring Criteria in the UAE	95
Table 5. Ranking of Hiring Criteria in Canada	99

# **List of Appendices**

Appendices A: Instructors' Interview Questions	210
Appendices B: Program Administrators' Interview Questions	211
Appendices C: Journal Reflection	212
Appendices D: Instructors' Questionnaire Canada	213
Appendices E: Instructors' Questionnaire UAE	218
Appendices F: Research Audit Trail Checklist by Carcary (2009)	222
Appendices G: Letter of Information and Consent Instructors' Interviews	224
Appendices H: Letter of Information and Consent Instructors' Journal Reflection	229
Appendices I: Letter of Information and Implied Consent Instructors' Questionnaire	233
Appendices J: Letter of Information and Consent-Program Administrators' Interview	236
Appendices K: Recruitment Email Script for Instructors	241
Appendices L: Recruitment Email Script for Program Administrators	242
Appendices M: Recruitment Advertisement for List-servs	243
Appendices N: Recruitment Advertisement for LinkedIn	244
Appendices O: Recruitment Advertisement for Western's eCast	245
Appendices P: Mass Invitation to Participate Email	246
Appendices Q: Ethics Approval Letter	248
Appendices R: Data Collection Methods' Codes	250

## **List of Key Acronyms and Abbreviations**

AAPI: Asian American and Pacific Islander

CELTA: Certificate in Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages

CERTESL: Certificate in Teaching English as a Second Language

**CRT**: Critical Race Theory

DELTA: Diploma in English Language Teaching to Adults

Dip TESOL: Diploma in Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages

EAL: English as an Additional Language

EAP: English for Academic Purposes

EFL: English as a Foreign Language

ESL: English as a Second Language

LINC: Language Instruction for Newcomers to Canada

PGCE: Postgraduate Certificate in Education

PLAR: Previous Assessment and Recognition

TESL: Teaching English as a Second Language

TESOL: Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages

**UAE:** United Arab Emirates

#### Chapter 1

#### 1 Introduction

This research study explored the TESOL job market in Canada and the UAE, highlighting the changes in both job markets, the opportunities offered to, and challenges faced by ESL/EFL instructors, and the hiring criteria used to hire instructors in higher education. The goal of the study was to bridge any gaps between instructors' and program administrators' views of the hiring criteria and facilitate instructors' employability.

Individuals face various challenges in today's globalized world, some of these obstacles are related to discrimination and inequality, and many individuals face these issues on both the local and global levels whether in their social, academic, or professional lives. The Canadian Human Rights Commission (2010) defines discrimination as "[...] an action or a decision that results in the unfair or negative treatment of person or group because of their race, age, religion, sex, etc." (p.1). Discriminatory acts sometimes stem from a feeling of superiority which some individuals sense compared to others who are viewed as different or even inferior. This notion of "othering" was discussed by Hill (2006) when he explained how colonizers used this concept to depict those colonized as different and uncivilized, which can be seen in the misrepresentation of indigenous communities in research in the past. van Dijk (1993) referred to how othering groups or individuals is used as a "[...] justification of inequality", which occurs through "the positive representation of the own group, and the negative representation of the Others" (p.263). Reflecting on the previous statements underlines the necessity of tackling discrimination and othering to create a community guided by social justice and equity.

Previous research has focused on discrimination in the TESOL field and employability challenges faced by "non-native" and minority "native" English teachers highlighting the injustices faced by teachers regarding salaries, benefits, invitations for interviews, and language used in job advertisements (Alshammari, 2021; Flynn & Gulikers, 2001; Jenkins, 2017; Jeon & Lee, 2006; Mackenzie, 2021; Mahboob & Golden, 2013; Selvi, 2010; Tatar, 2019). The concept of being a "native" English speaker is broadly understood as speaking English as a first language or mother tongue and being a citizen of inner circle countries such as the USA, Canada, New Zealand, and Australia, where English is the primary language used (Kachru, 1985). A more detailed discussion of inner circle, "nativeness", and "non-nativeness" will follow.

This study built on the previously conducted research (Alshammari, 2021; Flynn & Gulikers, 2001; Jenkins, 2017; Jeon & Lee, 2006; Mahboob & Golden, 2013; Selvi, 2010; Tatar, 2019); however, it highlighted the experiences and voices of not only ESL/EFL instructors, but it also investigated program administrators' views of the TESOL job market, hiring criteria, and employability of ESL/EFL instructors. There are no known studies, to the researcher's knowledge, that explored English instructors and program administrators in the TESOL job market and compared their views. In addition to filling the previously mentioned research gaps, this research study compared two contexts which were not sufficiently explored, Canada and the UAE, exploring the hiring criteria for ESL/EFL instructors in both contexts and the similarities and difference between them.

There were two reasons for choosing to investigate Canada and the UAE. First, both countries have a continuous need for ESL/EFL instructors due to the increasing numbers of immigrants in Canada, and the heavy reliance on foreign workers in the UAE,

which represents an estimated 80 percent of the whole population (Mahdavi, 2013; Martin & Malit, 2017). The second reason for choosing these two countries was the researcher's familiarity and experience working in both countries, which offered her access to both contexts. Furthermore, there are multiple research studies investigating challenges English instructors and more specifically Non-native English-Speaking Teachers (NNESTs) in the job market in many countries (Derous et al., 2017; DeVaro et al., 2018; S. Guo, 2009; Liebkind et al., 2016; Syed & Pio, 2010); however, there is a lack of research studies on challenges facing EFL instructors in the UAE's job market and this research study covered this gap. Moreover, this research highlighted the effect Covid-19 had on the TESOL job market and how it affected instructors and their employment prospects, and program administrators' hiring decisions and criteria. Finally, many of the studies that utilized Critical Race Theory (CRT), and intersectionality were in the US context and some limited research was conducted in Canada; however, to the knowledge of the researcher, there appears to be no known studies that used CRT and intersectionality as a theoretical framework in the UAE, and thus this study assisted in covering this gap in the literature.

The researcher's interest in this research topic originated from an encounter with discrimination while teaching English in the UAE and where her experience and language skills were viewed as less compared to those of a "native" speaker. Reflecting on this situation for a long time, hearing similar stories from friends and colleagues, and the research conducted by different researchers on discrimination in the field of TESOL (Jeon & Lee, 2006; Mahboob & Golden, 2013; & Tatar, 2019), the researcher believes there is a need to highlight discrimination and other challenges that instructors face in today's globalized job market and understand what causes it and if there are any possible

solutions to tackle it. It is also important to understand the role the pandemic played in affecting the job market and consequently instructors and program administrators.

The previously mentioned situation is not an isolated occurrence; it is recurring, and many ESL/EFL instructors experienced similar situations in their professional lives whether locally or globally. To gain a deeper understanding of this issue and its various dimensions, three research questions were explored:

- 1. What are the criteria used in hiring English instructors in Canada and the UAE? How are these criteria viewed (e.g., similarly, or differently) by program administrators and ESL/EFL instructors in the TESOL job market?
- 2. What factors affect program administrators' hiring decisions of English instructors in the TESOL job market in Canada and the UAE?
- 3. What factors shape and influence the experiences of ESL/EFL instructors in the TESOL job market in Canada and the UAE? And what counter-storytelling can be found in their experiences in relation to dominant narratives in the field?

Investigating these questions aimed to offer deeper insights about the views of ESL/EFL instructors and program administrators of the hiring criteria and practices in Canada and the UAE and highlight any possible impact Covid-19 had on the TESOL job market. Such an understanding should provide ESL/EFL instructors with a better view of the global job market and the criteria required to find a job in both contexts, underscore changes in the job market and hiring criteria, and improve instructors' chances of getting hired. The study also offered program administrators the opportunity to voice their opinion since previous research mainly focused on instructors' experiences. Another goal was uncovering and highlighting challenges instructors face in the TESOL job market, understand the reasons behind such difficulties, and underline solutions instructors used

to deal with these issues. Finally, it is hoped that the findings of the study further deepen instructors' reflective process of their experiences on the job market and encourage them to continue being critical and proactive in the field and to fight against the stereotypes about ESL/EFL instructors who speak English and an additional language (EAL).

Several implications for research, theory, and practice can be drawn based on the findings of the current study targeting instructors, employers, administrators, and TESLcertifying organizations. Concerning research, an investigation of the TESL certification process, the rationale for requiring it, and possibilities for waiving it as requirement for qualified instructors is needed. As for theory, the use of critical theories such as CRT and counter-narratives is encouraged in the TESOL field to further investigate challenges and inequities with an end goal of bringing about change in the field. As for practice, instructors are encouraged to be agentive and critical of unfair employment conditions and advised to benefit from the power shift that Covid-19 has created in the job market (i.e., negotiating their job offers, work conditions, salaries, etc.). Offering fair salaries and job security and refraining from using hidden hiring criteria when hiring instructors are among the recommendations that employers and program administrators are encouraged to do. In addition, TESL-certifying organizations are invited to offer financial assistance and express certification tracks while considering waiving the certification requirements for instructors who have proof of educational and professional experience whether international or provincial. These three angles (i.e., theory, practice, and research) complement one another and further working on them should offer a clearer understanding of the TESOL job market and instructors' employment situation.

#### 1 Theoretical Framework

Critical Race Theory (CRT) was the main theory guiding the study, and it was interwoven with intersectionality. The following section will offer detailed information on both concepts.

#### 1.1 Critical Race Theory

Critical Race Theory is represented by "[...] a collection of activists and scholars interested in studying and transforming the relationship among race, racism, and power" (Delgado et al., 2001, p.2). The movement aims to fight for minorities' rights, and Derrick Bell, a law professor at Harvard School of Law, was the one who ignited the Critical Legal Studies (CLS) movement and later CRT, and he is considered the "intellectual father figure" of CRT (Delgado et al., 2001, p.5). Bell's resignation from Harvard came in protest to the almost total absence of black and minority professors, and the school's intention of not teaching his courses after he resigned were the two main reasons for a students' movement demanding Bell's courses on law and minorities to be taught again. Students refused to settle for the 3-week law and minorities course that the school wanted to offer instead of a full-term course, and this led the students to raise money, create their own alternative course, and invite different minority professors to give lectures about law and minorities. This movement was the start of Critical Legal Studies (CLS) which can be viewed as phase one towards the inception of CRT. CLS started in the 70s and continued through sessions, workshops, symposiums, and conference meetings led by students and professors. The movement's events tackled different topics such as race and racism and from these discussions and publications on race and critiques of CLS by members of the movement, there came the birth of CRT. In the late 80s, CRT was born, and it started as a series of workshops, which resulted in the

refinement of CRT and what it encompasses. Even though CRT's inception was in the field of law, it gradually started to affect other fields among which, education.

### 1.1.1 Key Tenets of Critical Race Theory

Different researchers discussed CRT and its key tenets, and they mainly highlighted five core principles that the theory evolved around (Delgado et al., 2001; Howard et al., 2016; Tate, 1999; Yosso, 2020). The first and main principle of the theory is centralizing race and racism while, at the same time, including other variables that intersect with them such as citizenship and class. Another key element of CRT is challenging the majority's view and having minorities' voice heard, which can be seen in counter-storytelling which is a method that Delgado et al. (2001) discussed in which minorities are provided with the chance to tell their own story and challenge the majority's version. Advocating for social justice and valuing "experiential knowledge" is another key concept of CRT, and experiential knowledge here refers to oral knowledge such as the one presented by indigenous groups or the stories that people of colour narrate about the injustices they face (Howard et al., 2016). According to Parker (1998) "[c]ritical race theory seeks to de-cloak the institutional and ideological racial purpose behind the "color-blind" myth of merit and individualism embedded in the anti-affirmative action arguments" (p. 48). Colour blindness refers to the notion of not seeing color, and merit and individualism highlight the idea of individual personal achievement which are supported by many liberals and conservatives (Bridges, 2019). Parker (1998) highlights the importance of discussing race and the inequality and injustices faced by people of colour, and underlines that colorblindness inhibits these discussions. These key tenets

highlight the importance of CRT and its role not only in uncovering and discussing racism but also in bringing about change for minorities and people of colour.

### 1.1.2 Critiques of Critical Race Theory

It is important to acknowledge the critiques that some researchers, including some critical race theorists, expressed about some aspects of the theory and how other theorists responded to these critiques. Bridges (2019) highlighted that some researchers critiqued some aspects of CRT such as storytelling, which they described as emotional and subjective and so not suitable for the legal field, and how the theory claims that people of color have one voice.

Storytelling is one key element used by many critical race theorists; however, some critics believe that these stories are difficult for individuals to "[...] engage in productive conversations about the substance of the narrative", as they are personal to every storyteller and the information will be difficult to prove or challenge (Bridges, 2019, p.72). Nevertheless, critical race theorists who support storytelling highlight the importance of these stories in helping minorities heal from racial experiences and serve a persuasive and educational function for the readers. Bridges (2019) explains that "[...] the resonance that a story produces in a hearer may be more compelling- more persuasive-than even the best statistics or doctrinal analysis" (p.65). In addition, stories are a way for minorities to have their voice heard and counter the narratives of the majorities.

Another critique which Bridges (2019) refers to is the claim that there is a unified "voice of colour", which is a notion that critical race theorist Matsuda (1987) supports. However, Bridges (2019) underlines that Delgado (1990), who is another prominent critical race theorist, rejects this idea of a unified voice, and he highlights that there are

similarities in the oppression experienced by people of colour; nevertheless, there are multiple variables that individualize each person's experience of discrimination such as gender, class, and citizenship status. These critiques of CRT underline that there are differences among critical race theorists and the views they hold about CRT; however, these critiques, in the researcher's view, enrich the theory even more and allow for more flexibility for future theorists.

#### 1.1.3 Critical Race Theory in Education

In the field of education, Howard et al. (2016) highlight the importance of moving from theory into practice and the need for teachers not only to understand what race and racism are, but also learn how to weave these concepts through their teaching in the classroom. They underline the necessity for teachers and teacher candidates to develop a "racial consciousness" which requires "self-reflection and understanding of racial realities both past and current", and the need for curriculum to reflect these concepts embedding them in their historical background (p.261). Because of this slow change in education, they emphasize how critical race theorists need to take further steps to advance the movement. For this reason, it is important to continue doing research using CRT in the field of education to further refine the theory and bring about change.

Class and gender have always been centralized by researchers in the field of education, while race was excluded, and researchers who conducted work on race in the past were often marginalized in the academic world. An example of these scholars is Woodson and Du Bois who conducted research in 1916 on race and inequalities in education for African Americans (Ladson-Billings & Tate, 1995). Phillipson (2017) highlighted that "[c]ritical scholarship is rare and generally submerged under positivistic,

empiricist blankets or intellectual theorizing or fantasizing" (p. 327). This is why CRT is extremely important in education, as it highlights the falsely advertised idea of education not being affected by race. In her book CRT: A Primer, Bridges (2019) highlighted the fact that "CRT in education interrupts this narrative [education not affected by race] by insisting that the system is racially biased" (p. 467). Understanding how race affects education and those involved in it such as teachers, students, and parents is a crucial step in breaking the discriminatory cycle that many find themselves negatively affected by and providing equal opportunities and access for all. CRT and education can provide minorities with the tools to empower themselves and get them their voice back, as understanding the source of discrimination and providing solutions for it should provide a better learning and teaching environment for all those involved in the field. Finally, while working with the idea of race in education, it is important to remember that there are other elements in addition to race and racism that affect minorities such as religion, gender, and ethnicity, and an understanding of the intersection of such elements is essential for all individuals involved in the field. Howard et al. (2016) explain that "[t]his intersectionality is under examined and, as a result, opportunities to authentically capture the breadth and depth of marginalized populations is missed or misunderstood, and efforts to capture the stories of those on the margins and reform schools that they attend are misinformed and misguided." (p. 264). In the following section, the term "intersectionality" will be further discussed highlighting its definition and critiques to the term.

#### 1.2 Intersectionality

Critical theories and the plethora of topics and critical perspectives added to linguistics in general and applied linguistics in particular allowing for the intersection of

multiple variables that were not present in previous studies during the maturation process of the field. These intersections can be represented in "intersectionality" which Gillborn (2015) identified as "how multiple forms of inequality and identity interrelated in different contexts and over time" (p.278). Critical Race Theorist, Kimberlé Crenshaw, was the one who coined this term in 1989, and she explained that it refers to how multiple variables can intersect leading to affecting certain individuals more than others such as the intersection of race with gender, religion, (dis)ability, and sexuality. She highlighted how intersectionality depicts how everyone suffers from racism differently based on the variables that intersect in them e.g., a Muslim woman wearing the veil suffers from racism differently than a Muslim woman not wearing the veil or a Muslim man (Crenshaw, 1991; Dhamoon, 2011). Intersectionality has been used in many fields including history, sociology and philosophy, and its integration of multiple variables "[...] exposed how single-axis thinking undermines legal thinking, disciplinary knowledge production, and struggles for social justice" (Cho et al., 2013, p.787). These key elements make intersectionality the most suitable match for Critical Race Theory in this study, as CRT will focus on three main variables, instructors' race, racism they face, and power relations at the educational institutes, while intersectionality will allow for the inclusion of an unlimited number of other variables such as "nativeness", whiteness, gender, age, and ethnicity, which will assist in deeply exploring and comparing ESL/EFL teachers with different experiences and from different backgrounds working in Canada and the UAE.

#### 1.2.1 Critiques of Intersectionality

Like CRT, intersectionality has been critiqued by some researchers who viewed it as lacking a clear method, having a sole focus on identity, and including an endless

number of variables. Concerning the first critique related to the absence of an "intersectional method" and clear steps to follow when using intersectionality while conducting research, Cho et al. (2013) highlighted that there is no need for clear cut rules to use intersectionality in research. They explained that researchers should choose the methodology they see fit for their study, and that there is no need to adhere to a specific method.

As for the second critique, defenders of intersectionality explain that identity is not the only focus of intersectionality and that even though many research studies using it focused on identity, this does not mean that it is the sole focus and topic of discussion. In addition, different variables that create identities, such as the role of institutions, law, and societies are part of intersectionality, which demonstrates how it encompasses a wide range of variables and is not only focused on identities per se (Bridges, 2019).

A final point that Bridges (2019) underlined was what critics of intersectionality highlighted about the intersection of an endless number of variables, which can prove to be unmanageable in a research study. She explained how critics such as Judith Butler claim that Anti-essentialism would be a better fit in research than intersectionality, because Anti-essentialism rejects categories which will solve this dilemma, as there will be no need to identify multiple axes. However, supporters of intersectionality explain that researchers should choose the variables that are most relevant to their research, and they do not need to include every single variable related to their topics. In the researcher's view, these critiques strengthen intersectionality even more, as they allow for the inclusion of multiple variables using the method that best fits the research topic, and that is why researchers should not be discouraged by these critiques when utilizing intersectionality.

The previous discussion of CRT and intersectionality underlines the various benefits of using them in the field of education to critically investigate how different variables interact and affect individuals' experiences. In the current study, awareness of how power relations, race, and racism affect individuals' experiences assisted in clearly understanding instructors' experiences on the job market and the challenges they face due to belonging to minority groups, being from certain countries, and/or having a "nonnative" status or "accent". Such understanding assisted in understanding the power program administrators have in affecting not only instructors' employment experiences but also their future decisions (i.e., pursuing citizenship from inner circle countries, seeking employment in other fields, etc.). Also, acknowledging the power relations at play in the job market helped in clearly framing and understanding instructors' counterstories and program administrators' stories. In addition, framing these stories was strengthened by being aware of the presence of different elements, which intersect shaping instructors' experiences and affecting administrators' hiring decisions. Both CRT and intersectionality thus proved to be essential in this study, as they assisted in not only better understanding the investigated research questions but also recognizing that presence of multiple variables that affect both instructors and administrators.

#### Chapter 2

#### 2 Literature Review

#### 2.1 History and Evolution of Applied Linguistics

The history of applied linguistics is not as recent as some might believe, as, even though coining the term itself was in 1948, what applied linguistics mean is far from being new (Berns & Matsuda, 2006). Catford (1998) highlighted that both linguistics and applied linguistics are evident in the work of Indian grammarians in the first millennium BC, and Kennedy (1998) underlined that applied linguistics can even be found in earlier years in the study of rhetoric in India, China, Greece, and Egypt in the eighth, fourth, fifth and second millennia BC respectively. More recently, applied linguistics can be seen in the 19th century in Europe and in the differentiation that Ramus Rask, one of the founding fathers of comparative linguistics, made between linguistics, the theoretical side of language, and applied linguistics, the practical side. In the US, in the 20th century, applied linguistics can be found in language teaching, the translation of the bible, and anthropologists' training.

According to Berns and Matsuda (2006), applied linguistics is viewed as "[...] a broad interdisciplinary field of study concerned with solutions to problems, or the improvement of situations involving language and its users and uses" (p.394). They highlighted how applied linguistics is perceived differently by researchers, as some such as Halliday and Hymes, view applied linguistics as a sub-category or a derivation from linguistics, while others view it as a field on its own open to professionals from different fields and backgrounds, not only linguists. Modern linguists such as Chomskey look at language at an "abstract, idealized level and largely ignore language as interaction, as performance" (Berns & Matsuda, 2006, p. 395). These differences in researchers'

understanding of applied linguistics should not be seen as problematic, as these different views enrich the field even more and allow for flexibility; they keep the door open whether for professionals from other fields to engage in applied linguistics or for researchers to explore topics that are not normally seen as part of linguistics.

It is evident from the historical background of applied linguistics that it continued to shift over the years evolving from being considered as a branch or subfield of linguistics to being an independent field towards the 50's (Berns & Matsuda, 2006). The evolution of applied linguistics does not only stop at being considered an independent field, but also extends to the topics it encompassed over the years. Examining the topics covered by the Applied Linguistics Journal between 1980 and 2020 shows the shift in the different topics discussed by the journal over the past 40 years. Topics ranged from discussing teaching grammar and using the communicative approach in the 80's, to language testing, yes and no questions, and second language discourse in the 90's, to changes in writing styles, language policy, and bilingual education in 2010, and finally to the more recent topics of culture, interculturalism, language ideologies and multilingualism in 2020. The range of topics covered, and depth added to the field is astonishing, and it shows the evolution of applied linguistics throughout the past decades from its infancy to maturity.

The breadth of topics covered by applied linguistics highlights how the evolution of the field expanded to reflect issues related to language and language learning and learners that were not previously discussed in the early years of the inception of the field such as identity, race, equality, and gender. Politics can be also seen reflected in research done on languages and language learning and teaching in the past decades and which represent a critical form of applied linguistics. Pennycook (2001) discussed what it means

to add the word critical to applied linguistics, and he explained that "[c]ritical applied linguistics is not about developing a set of skills that will make the doing of applied linguistics more rigorous or more objective but is about making applied linguistics more politically accountable" (p.7). Critical applied linguistics opened the door for "[...] a constant questioning of the normative assumptions of applied linguistics" (p.10), and it allowed for the discussion of topics that challenged the status quo and fought for social justice. The critical aspect of critical applied linguistics can be clearly seen in the critical theories which investigate topics that relate to social justice, equity, and equality. Such theories provided linguists and researchers with the frameworks and blueprints for exploring topics that highlight race, gender, and disability and how these variables affect language learning, learners, and educators.

CRT is one example of critical theories and even though it started in the field of law, it quickly spread to other fields in which researchers felt the need for the use of a critical perspective to empower and challenge the status quo. Education was one of the fields that embraced CRT due to the injustices that those involved in it face, i.e., students, teachers, and parents. An example of these injustices can be seen in Wink's (2011) discussion of discrimination against African Americans and the presence of more African American children in special education classes than their White counterparts. Another example is first language attrition due to the negative image disseminated about bilingual education, which in some cases lead to negatively affecting the relation between parents and their children due to the children's loss of their native language (Skutnabb-Kangas & Cummins, 1988). The need for CRT can also be seen in colonized curricula, which reflect the views and stories of the majority while ignoring and marginalizing all those who do not fit under the majority's umbrella.

The use of CRT in education is one example of interdisciplinarity, as the theory was mainly used in the field of law; however, the need for such critical perspective and theory in the field allowed for educators and linguists to adopt CRT. Interdisciplinarity allows for the integration of theories and concepts from different fields which enriches research studies by providing opportunities for using knowledge from different areas to bridge existing gaps in a specific field. Aboelela et al. (2007) stated that:

[i]nterdisciplinary research is any study or group of studies undertaken by scholars from two or more distinct scientific disciplines. The research is based upon a conceptual model that links or integrates theoretical frameworks from those disciplines, uses study design and methodology that is not limited to any one field, and requires the use of perspectives and skills of the involved disciplines throughout multiple phases of the research process. (p.341)

They referred to the importance of interdisciplinarity and how organizations such as the National Institutes of Health (NIH) views interdisciplinarity as "[...] an essential contributor to needed knowledge" and an essential part of an organization's "roadmap" (p.330).

Current research done in applied linguistics clearly shows interdisciplinarity, as researchers started merging language learning and teaching with different variables such as gender, identity, and culture, and they started exploring how these variables intersect and affect one another. Researchers not only started exploring new variables but also adopted critical perspectives that were not previously used in applied linguistics by integrating different critical theories, such as Critical Feminist Theory and CRT. The study at hand was a representation of interdisciplinarity, as it investigated an issue in the

field of education and applied linguistics by using a critical theoretical framework originally from the field of law.

#### 2.2 CRT, Intersectionality, and TESOL

The previous discussion of CRT and intersectionality underlines how both concepts share the goal of changing the status quo and highlighting the power relations that are at play in different contexts. Both terms also shed light on the presence of multiple variables with intersectionality acknowledging and allowing for the presence and interconnectedness between multiple variables and not only race and racism. Both concepts can be useful in the field of TESOL where an acknowledgement and understanding of different capitals and backgrounds that students and teachers bring to the classroom are important for improving the learning and teaching environments. The presence of variables such as race, gender, religion, culture, (dis)ability, and so forth highlight not only the connection between TESOL and intersectionality but also the need for the concept in the TESOL field. Making a connection between TESOL and intersectionality might be easier for teachers and educators to see; however, the relationship between TESOL and CRT is not always as clear and as easy to make. This relation is highlighted by Liggett (2014) who explains that there is a connection between three key tenets of CRT and TESOL. The first similarity can be seen in relation to racism and linguicism, where in CRT, racism is viewed as part of everyday life, which can be reflected in the TESOL field where linguicism has become an ordinary and normalized part of ESL learners' and teachers' experiences and which "[...] needs to be resisted, like all mechanisms that condone injustice and inequality" (Phillipson, 2017, p. 326).

The second point is connected to colonial history and the importance of knowledge about it and understanding how it affects individuals and communities. Such

an effect is not far from the ESL/EFL classroom where the effect of colonialism on different aspects of languages and language education is reflected in false beliefs of English language superiority to other languages which, according to Liggett (2014), is partly related to misleading scientific studies that were used to prove that colonizers' language entails higher intelligence. The third connection between CRT and TESOL lies in the role of narratives in both CRT and TESOL in representing different identities and reflecting personal experiences, which provides an opportunity for individuals and ESL/EFL learners and teachers to voice their opinions and show their identity.

Despite the need for CRT and intersectionality in the TESOL field, there is not enough research conducted on the topic, and educators and schools are not very welcoming of such concepts since discussion of topics such as race, ethnicity, and power relations usually "evokes racism which is often interpreted as overt forms of bigotry, rather than structural or institutional inequalities, and this undertone tends to prevent open dialogue" (Kubota & Lin, 2006, p.472). This apprehensive attitude towards the discussion of race and similar topics is shared by both teacher and students, as they were both not offered "[...] the discourse or approaches to get beyond fear and defensiveness to engage to the more substantive issues about race" (Williams, 2004, p.164), According to Kubota and Lin (2006), such discussions about race and related variables can assist in understanding identity formation in the ESL classroom, highlight the changes needed in teaching methods and the action needed to be taken by policymakers and educators. Refraining from discussing such topics in the classroom represents a form of racialization/othering not only of students' background (racial, linguistic, cultural, etc.) but also of instructors. A more detailed discussion of racialization and its definitions is offered in the following section.

## 2.3 Definitions of Racialization

There are multiple definitions for racialization with some researchers viewing the term positively, while others view it negatively. For example, Gans (2017) views racialization as a type of othering, a tool that the dominant groups use to define and group those who are different from them, which usually leads to disadvantaging them whether socially, economically, in terms of housing, support, employment, or politically, by excluding them from "citizenship rights", political life, and even punishing them harshly than other, prison sentences. Along the same lines, Inwood and Yarbrough (2010) explain that racialization involves "the use of biological criteria (i.e., phenotype etc.) to separate people into distinct groups for the purpose of domination and exploitation" (p.299). Such racialization process is executed by the "racializers" who represent the elites, community members belonging to the dominant group, politicians, or even other racialized minorities that act like the dominant group and judge and discriminate against other disadvantaged minorities. Gans (2017) highlighted that racialization can be caused by the dominant majority perceiving the racialized minorities as a threat to their lives, jobs, or both. Racialized minorities looking or acting differently and not conforming to the norms, hegemonic norms, are also among the reasons for racialization. It is a sort of exclusion of the "other" who is viewed as less and inferior (Kubota & Lin, 2006). An example of racialization and othering can be seen in the case of migrant women in the UAE, where they are described to have "[...] moral depravity, naiveté, and detached character[...]", which is used as a tool to "[...] to reinforce barriers of difference between "us" as employers and "them" as the "help" [...]", and this rhetoric also reinforces the notion of controlling these women under the guise of "protection" (Mahdavi, 2013, p.193); a more detailed discussion of the job market in the UAE will follow. Such examples of

racialization highlight its grave impact and the abuse that can happen to certain individuals or even populations due to othering.

On the other hand, Hochman (2019) views racialization more positively, and he understands it as "[...] the process through which racialized groups, rather than "races," are formed". He underlines the benefits of racialization for racialized groups who, thanks to it, can fight for themselves collectively (p.1245), and he continues to argue that racialization does not entail "racial hierarchies" (Hochman, 2019, p.1256). According to Kubota and Lin (2006), racialization "[...] does not necessarily lead to racism", as some minority groups racialize themselves as a form of resistance and to protect their identity. However, Kubota and Lin (2006) underline the connectedness between racialization and colonialism (p.477). In this study, the use of the term racialization will align with Gans' (2017) and Inwood and Yarbrough's (2010) definitions where racialization is seen as a tool of domination, discrimination, and othering against minority groups. Since in this study, the focus is primarily on the job market, examples of racialization and its manifestations in the Canadian job market will be discussed in the following part.

#### 2.4 Immigration, Employment, and Racialization in Canada

Canada is one of the major immigrant-receiving countries in the world, and the Canadian immigration system, which utilizes the point-merit system, attracts highly skilled immigrants with "high human capital" from around the world (Valenta et al., 2017). Immigration programs offered by the government provide both temporary and permanent residency, which is very different from other major immigrant-receiving countries such as the Gulf Cooperation Council (GCC) countries where permanent residency programs are not an option (Valenta et al., 2017). Despite the presence of such programs and Canada's need for immigrants in different industries, there is racialization

of skills and experience and racism against immigrants from different backgrounds and for different reasons. There is over-representation of immigrants from different minority groups among the poor and even though these individuals are highly educated, they are often employed in low paying non-unionized jobs (Go, 2005). "The colour of skill" is how S. Guo (2015) described how racialization in Canada affects how an individual's skill is viewed as legitimate, valued or not. He underlined how immigrants' skills, work experience, and knowledge are devalued, racialized, and framed as deficient, which leads to "[...] downward social mobility, unemployment and underemployment, vulnerability and commodification, and reduced earnings" (S. Guo, 2009, p.42). Also, Bauder (2003) referred to "[t]he non-recognition of foreign credentials", and how it "constitutes a massive devaluation of institutional cultural capital" (p.708).

Guo (2015) referred to how other factors such as "accent" can play a role in the racialization of skills, which is utilized as a tool to deny immigrants employment which is reflected by previous research (Creese & Kambere, 2003; Y. Guo, 2009). In addition to "accent", S. Guo (2015) explained that immigrants are trained to take up Canadian soft skills, which he believes is a process of "whitening" immigrants with an end goal of forming "white, docile corporate subjects, who will depart from their past deficiency, 'embrace' the Canadian norms, and become a 'real' Canadian" (p. 246). Furthermore, the legitimacy of immigrants' skills is also judged using different credential equivalency systems which puts immigrants in the "other" and "deficit" position (S. Guo & Shan, 2013).

Immigrants who received their education outside Canada are required to receive an Educational Credential Assessment (ECA), which is used to ensure that immigrants' "foreign degree, diploma, or certificate (or other proof of [...] credential) is valid and

equal to a Canadian one" (Government of Canada, 2020). In addition to receiving an ECA, immigrants are expected to receive certification to practice certain jobs such as receiving TESL Ontario or TESL Canada certification to teach English language to adults. These certifications use certain competency frameworks to evaluate and certify instructors. For example, TESL Ontario evaluates instructors against certain competency categories (e.g., Language theory and methodology, instructional design and delivery, digital literacy, and assessment) (TESL Ontario, 2021). Such equivalency and certification processes are a form of gatekeeping, which stop immigrants from reaching their full potential and which, according to S. Guo (2009), can be seen as a new form of "head tax", where "[...] immigration has served as a means of social, racial, and ideological control", which is similar to what is happening with immigrants nowadays (S. Guo, 2009, p. 39). On the other hand, other researchers explained that "employers may not be familiar with the content or quality of foreign educational credentials", and that is why they require certification (Banerjee et al., 2021, p.361).

To combat racialization, othering and devaluation, S. Guo (2015) and S. Guo and Shan (2013) suggested using frameworks such as CRT, which informs many fields and offers a critical perspective that fights against the status quo, and recognitive justice, which according to S. Guo and Shan (2013), "[...] seeks to increase the potency of social justice by extending its scope to include social goods (e.g., opportunity, position, and power) as well as institutional inequities (p. 469). Both frameworks can provide blueprints on how to stand up against racialization and devaluation and deskilling of immigrants.

Research on racialization in foreign credential equivalency in Canada is valuable in underlining the problems facing minorities and immigrants and pointing to how to

solve these issues; however, the results need to be reflected in policies for tangible change to happen. Rivas-Garrido and Koning (2019) shed light on how politicians refuse to acknowledge that "[...] part of the problem has to do with systemic problems of discrimination" (p.426), and they underlined the need not only for the development of policies to solve this issue but also the need for employers to change their policies and approaches towards immigrants with foreign credentials. Even with clear evidence from research and experts, politicians did not change their views and primarily blamed immigrants' lack of language skills. They only called for the facilitation of the equivalency process neglecting evidence related to discrimination focusing yet again on immigrants' personal responsibility.

# 2.5 Migration and Labour Market in the UAE

Another job market that is central to this study is the Emirate job market. The UAE is part of the Gulf Cooperation Council (GCC), which includes Saudi Arabia, Qatar, Bahrain, Kuwait, and Oman, and the GCC can be seen as the equivalent of the European Union (EU) in the Persian Gulf and is among some of the major migrant receiving countries in the world such as the USA, Canada, and the European Union (Valenta, 2017). GCC countries have seen several noticeable changes over the years, and these changes can be seen in the numbers of nationals' educational levels, women's representation in the workforce, and mortality and fertility rates (Shah, 2012). Despite the increasing number of migrants in GCC countries and the expansion of their economies, there is somewhat high unemployment rates among nationals which, according to Shah (2012), is partly due to the job preferences of nationals who prefer governmental jobs that require less effort and governments' offering good unemployment benefits.

GCC countries have similar migration patterns to the EU where migrants move from highly populated less wealthy countries to lower populated wealthy countries such as migration from Northern and Eastern Europe to Western Europe and migration from South and South-East Asia to oil rich GCC countries. Even though the reasons for migration are similar in both contexts, economics, Valenta (2017) explains that there are differences in the numbers of migrants compared to nationals in the EU and GCC countries. For example, migrants' numbers outweigh the number of nationals in the UAE, which is not the case in any of the Western European countries. In addition, migrants move within the EU countries for work; however, this rarely happens in the GCC countries, as nationals in GCC have better chances in their own countries, where they have access to work in the public sector and do not have competition as they would have if they moved to a different GCC country (Shah, 2012; Valenta, 2017; Valenta et al., 2017). These chances include secure and well-paying jobs in the public sector, where most jobs belong to GCC nationals.

On the other hand, foreign nationals occupy most of the jobs in the private sectors which include receiving a lower salary and exerting much effort, and that is why many GCC nationals refrain from working in the private sector (Martin & Malit, 2017; Shah, 2012; Valenta et al., 2017). According to Martin and Malit (2017), the number of GCC nationals and foreign nationals working in the public or the private sectors varies from one country to the other. For example, only 4% of foreign workers hold positions in the public sector in Saudi Arabia, while 57% of the public sector jobs in Qatar belong to foreigners. Nationals from GCC countries also refuse to work in specific positions which they describe as "foreigners' jobs" such as plumbers, electricians, and so forth (Shah, 2012). Foreign nationals in GCC countries are also facing additional challenges due to

localization, which refers to "the replacement of foreign workers with skilled and qualified local labour" (Swailes et al., 2012, p. 357), which aims to "[...] increase the percentage and qualifications of their national employees" (Elbanna, 2022, p.1248). Finally, an added burden to foreign nationals is requiring degree equivalency/recognition, which is similar the certification requirement in Canada. The United Arab Emirates Ministry of Education explains that their recognition service "[...] aims to provide applicants with a statement of recognition for their certificates issued by accredited universities outside the UAE. The certificate of Recognition confirms that credentials assessed comply with criteria and guidelines set by the Ministry and international academic standards" (n.d.). More information on workers' employment conditions in the UAE follows.

The United Arab Emirates relies heavily on foreign workers who represent an estimated 80 percent of the whole population and these workers come from different countries such as India, Pakistan, the Philippines, Iran, Bangladesh, and several Arab countries among others (Mahdavi, 2013; Martin & Malit, 2017). Migrant workers in the UAE follow a Kafala system, which is a form of sponsorship where migrants are "[...] dependent entirely on this person [sponsor/kafeel] not only for residence, but also for assistance in accessing services, such as health care, etc." (Mahdavi, 2013, p.185). The UAE offers millions of jobs to migrants from all over the world and, as Strabac et al. (2018) claim, the opportunities migrants offered are better than the ones they have in their countries of origin despite receiving low income and working under difficult working conditions in the receiving country. They further explain that, despite the negative image projected by some researchers, foreign workers send billions of dollars to their home countries and invite friends and family members to work in the UAE. On the positive

side, when compared to Western Countries, it can be noticed that the UAE values migrants' soft skills and entrepreneurial skills over education (Ngeh & Pelican, 2018). On the negative end, the UAE and GCC countries are like some Western countries in the presence of a stigmatized view of some jobs such as domestic workers. Such jobs "are poorly paid, often stigmatized, and unattractive for the local labor force which [...] deepens the need for a low-skilled migrant labour force in the receiving parts of the system" (Valenta, 2017, p.436).

According to Valenta et al. (2020), the UAE's migration system is temporary and permanent residency and citizenship are rarely granted, and the researchers explain that such temporary state imposed by the Emirate authorities is to keep "[...] a clear distinction between its own citizens and foreigners with respect to their access to a number of social rights, including welfare benefits" (p.184). However, workers in the UAE can prolong their temporary stays through sponsor contract renewals, family sponsorship, student visa and investment in free zones. Valenta et al. (2020) highlight that such temporary status is like some migration programs in Western countries such the Canadian Temporary foreign-worker programs (TFWP); these migration programs limit workers' abilities to bring their families and limit their stay based on a contract with their employers.

Some of the changes/improvements that the UAE is making is changing the kafala system by offering employees more freedom when changing employers and allowing them to work as part-timers without the need for permission from their main employer. In addition, mobility laws are changing in the UAE making it easier for migrants to shift from one employer to the other (Martin & Malit, 2017). Finally, Valenta et al. (2020) highlighted that migrants can remain in the UAE after retirement; however, there are specific requirements such as owning property with an estimated value of 695,000 CAD

or having savings of at least 648,000 CAD or monthly income of 7000 CAD. It is important to note that even though such requirements seem like an improvement, they do not apply to many migrants whose salaries are barely enough for them to provide for their families whether in the UAE or abroad. Due to GCC countries' restrictive migration laws and the impossibility of gaining permanent residency or citizenship, some immigrants prefer relocating to countries in the EU and North America in search for better opportunities and futures.

# 2.6 Discrimination and English Language Teaching

To complement the discussion of racialization and workers' conditions in the Emirate and Canadian job markets, it is important to understand how racialization functions in the field of education and, more specifically, in English language teaching (ELT). Racialization of skills is not confined to a specific field and can be found in many if not all fields. According to Motha (2006), "[r]acialization is inevitably salient in English language teaching. Because the spread of the English language across the globe was historically connected to the international political power of White people, English and Whiteness are thornily intertwined" (p.496). Teachers and more specifically nonnative English teachers are racialized and faced with discrimination. This is evident in the hiring process, which can be noticed in the multiple job advertisements in the Middle East and several Asian countries, where statements like "WE DO NOT ACCEPT APPLICATIONS FROM NON- NATIVE ENGLISH SPEAKERS [...]" can be frequently seen (Capitalization in Original) (as cited in Ruecker & Ives, 2015, p.742). In other job advertisements, discrimination is not overtly stated like the previous ad, as Mackenzie (2021) stated, "[o]ne reason for the lack of detail in some ads might be that recruiters are conscious of discrimination and avoid being overtly discriminatory". She

further explained that "[...] the possibility remains for recruiters to discriminate in the selection process without making it explicit in the ad". (p.8) Such discrimination against teachers sheds light on how these educational institutes view "nativeness" as a key element in hiring English teachers, which in some cases leads to disregarding qualified and experienced "non-native" applicants.

Online job advertisements were one of the sources that different researchers investigated to highlight the most important hiring criteria that organizations look for in their candidates (Alshammari, 2021; Mahboob & Golden, 2013; Ruecker & Ives, 2015; Selvi, 2010). These researchers investigated online job advertisements for English teaching positions in language centres, schools, and universities in Asia and the Middle East, and their results showed that there is a clear preference for "native" teachers over "non-natives". In some countries, "nativeness" was even more important than teaching experience and educational background (Ruecker & Ives, 2015; Selvi, 2010).

Discrimination based on "nativeness" encompassed another form of bias which was bias for natives from specific countries such as Canada, the UK and the US, and teachers from these countries were given preference over "natives" from other countries such as Ireland. (Alshammari, 2021).

Discrimination against "non-native" teachers can also be seen in the exclusion of "non-native" candidates in the initial screening, and the variation in salaries and benefits they receive compared to their native counterparts (Jenkins, 2017; Jeon & Lee, 2006; Motha, 2006; Ruecker & Ives, 2015; Tatar, 2019). "Non-native" teachers face multiple forms of discrimination in the job market, and these discriminatory practices can be seen in different phases of their job hunt. The first phase is job advertisements, which, in some cases, underline that ONLY "native" speakers can apply for English teaching positions. In

other cases, candidates may be accepted for a position, but receive less benefits than natives or be placed in a deficit position where their native counterparts are placed in leading positions even if they have less experience. Some examples of such practices can be seen in Jeon and Lee's (2006) research in which they highlighted that some countries such as China and Taiwan offer higher salaries to "native" teachers. It is important to note that recent studies in China highlight a shift in the "native-non-native" dichotomy and that some organizations are focusing more on teachers' experience and competence (Wang & Fang, 2020).

Other researchers highlighted how different organizations specify a list of countries from which candidates can apply (Mahboob & Golden, 2013; Selvi, 2010), and some of these organizations try to legitimize their advertised list by explaining that this list is due to legal working status or employment regulations (Ruecker, 2011; Selvi, 2010). These measures lead to the exclusion of qualified calibers based on discriminatory hiring practices.

Exclusion from job opportunities is not a problem faced only by "non-native" English teachers but also some "native" teachers face discrimination because of ethnicity, religious beliefs, and the form of English they use. As previously discussed, some forms of English are viewed as more "legitimate" than others such as mainstream English spoken by "natives" versus vernacular English used by "non-natives" and African American (Bourdieu & Thompson, 1991; Jenkins, 2017; Lancee, 2019; Motha, 2006). Other reasons for discrimination highlighted by "native" English teachers included schools/organizations' preference to hire teachers who can communicate in the native language or being hired to make the school look good (Villalobos Ulate, 2011). Schools hire these teachers, as they own a form of symbolic capital, which gives them status and

adds to the schools' social capital and prestige. Bourdieu (1986) defined symbolic capital as "capital – in whatever form – insofar as it is represented, i.e., apprehended symbolically, in a relationship of knowledge or, more precisely, of misrecognition and recognition, presupposes the intervention of the habitus, as a socially constituted cognitive capacity" (p. 27), and he highlighted how social and symbolic capitals are intricately connected and, like economic and cultural capitals, they offer "strength, power, and consequently profit on their holder" (p.4).

To combat the legitimacy notion, studies like Schreiber's (2019) highlighted the role online intercultural courses can play in changing the idea of legitimate and accepted English forms. She explained that exposure to varieties of English can assist in changing the idea of accepted forms of English and underlined how participants in her study mentioned the importance of using different forms of English while teaching. Such changes, in the long run, can make changes in how second language speakers of English view the idea of "nativeness" and how they view their own language and others' language use. In addition, "natives" should recognize that they are not the only owners of English, as English is an international language, and this lends everyone who uses it as its owner (Widdowson, 1994). Freeing English from such "custody" and ownership enriches it, as different users of English around the world add to it and adapt it to their own context and culture.

Holliday (2008) mentioned that many individuals connect "nativeness" to Whiteness due to colonialism and its role in projecting a certain image in the media of what a "native" looks like and the superiority and beauty of anything White over all others, which presents another reason why not being White automatically translates into not being a "Native" Speaker (NS). Liu (1999) underlined how students' views of a good

English teacher is affected by the teachers' whiteness and this phenomenon could be one of the reasons why some organizations prefer to hire "natives" over "non-natives". Another reason can be seen reflected in Harris's (1993) notion of Whiteness as a property, which clarifies how the law and daily discourse played a major role in privileging Whites which in turn is seen reflected in the hiring of White teachers, as White is viewed as synonymous to being a "NS" (Ruecker, 2011). The misconception of equating "nativeness" with Whiteness is what encourages some organizations to hire native White teachers instead of native minority teachers (Kubota & Lin, 2006). Also, some institutions prefer to hire non-native European teachers, as students and/or parents might not realize that the teacher is not native due to their own misconception about what a "NS" looks like. This attitude by parents towards "non-native" European teachers is similar to the notion of "Passing for White", which refers to African Americans crossing the "color line" between White and Black (Delaney, 2002). One can say that European teachers, in this case, are passing for "native" English teachers through crossing the "nativeness" line enabled by "[...] a physical appearance emphasizing "white" features (Delaney, 2002, p.9). Gnevsheva (2017) underlined that "passing for a native speaker of different varieties is quite common" (p.213), and that "certain settings may be more conducive to passing [e.g., family settings compared to friend settings]" (p. 225). Also, Piller (2002) referred to passing as a native as "[...] a temporary, audience-, mediumspecific performance" (p.197). However, not all instructors are able to pass for "natives" and be successful in making such a performance due to their skin color and/or "accent".

# 2.6.1 Whiteness, ELT, and Education

The idea of native speakerism and language ownership was investigated by many researchers, and they explored how an individual's "accent", race, and looks can affect how they are viewed by others (Huang, 2018; Leonardo, 2002; Norton, 1997). "Nonnative" English teachers are greatly defined by these elements, and they are viewed as outsiders who do not have the ownership of the English language. This concept of being an outsider relates back to "Whiteness" and "White Supremacy" where being labeled an outsider happens because the individual does not fit the mold of White and Western.

Gillborn (2019) defined Whiteness as "[...] a system of beliefs, practices, and assumptions that constantly centre the interests of White people, especially White elites" (p.113). Whiteness is a term that reflects colonial history and how, till now, it affects individuals' and institutions' perspectives. Harris (1993) explained that Whiteness is "resilient and adaptive to new conditions," which projects "[...] institutionalized privileges, societal norms, and racialized hierarchies to proliferate as normative and naturalized" (Christian et al., 2019, p.1735). The presence of "Whiteness" in education can be reflected in what Ladson-Billings and Tate (1995) highlighted about how being White grants individuals many privileges, which can be seen in receiving or being entitled to receive better educational opportunities. Other privileges of Whiteness include having the option of thinking or not thinking about race and the ability to take on "[...] the appearance of normal (ordinary, unremarkable, neutral, fair, orderly, objective, and so on" (Delaney, 2002, p.11). Kubota and Lin (2006) argue that Whiteness "exerts its power as an invisible and unmarked norm against which all Others are racially and culturally

defined, marked, and made inferior", and such power is used to avoid any responsibility in eliminating racism (p.481).

Whiteness affects languages and language use, and this effect can be reflected in the silencing of minorities which can be seen in assimilation policies and English and French only programs and the eradication of bilingual programs (Trechter & Bucholtz, 2001). Such policies deprive minorities from using their native languages and consequently connecting with their families' culture. This exclusion and deprivation affect not only students' language ability, L1 loss but also, they are deprived from equal educational opportunities offered to their White counterparts. Even when teachers and schools claim they are being inclusive, they do so by claiming they are being colorblind or by being equally "nice" to all students. Lynch (2018) explained how such practices are a representation of Whiteness and White power and ignoring how students come from different cultures and backgrounds is in no way inclusive.

The negative effects of Whiteness in education extends to teachers as well because teachers are, in some situations, denied jobs based on their skin color and how they do not "look like" or sound like a "native". Trechter and Bucholtz (2001) reflected on Whiteness and how:

[...] such linguistic binaries as standard/ nonstandard, English-speaking/ non-English-speaking, monolingual/bilingual, even formal/ colloquial, literate/illiterate, and written/spoken also partake of this ideology [Whiteness] though often covertly, and that it is largely through language itself that such racialized binaries come to be produced and reproduced." (p.4).

As highlighted by Lynch (2018) and Trechter and Bucholtz (2001), Whiteness, represented in White race and White identity, affects education on different levels,

curriculum, classroom interactions, and power relations, and it is important to have open discussions about it. Teachers, supervisors, and policy makers need to use a critical perspective to educate themselves and support racialized minorities who are unjustly affected by the biased and racist educational systems and curricula. Lynch (2018) suggested offering continuous supervision to preservice teachers to help them discuss Whiteness and their own race and identities, and openly discuss race, racism, and power relations, as these discussions and continuous supervision are the way to fight against Whiteness and support racialized students. This technique would benefit in-service teachers as well, as it should help them understand Whiteness and its effects in education. Lynch (2018) highlighted that "[b]y naming Whiteness, White teachers can be brought into the conversation of race, with the goal of active allyship" (p.22). Lynch's suggestions align with the critical perspective and the agency idea suggested by several researchers emphasizing the role of being critical, rejecting colorblindness and the status quo, and bringing about change in the field of education by empowering teachers and consequently students (Choi, 2016; Duran, 2019; Gillborn, 2019; Rampton, 1990; Selvi, 2009).

It is important to note that discussing topics such as Whiteness, racism, race, and related topics is not an easy task, as some might be offended by such discussion and view it as a form of racism against White people. Gillborn (2019) mentioned that, in one of his presentations, one of the audience members disapproved of the discussion's topic, which was about White racism and its effect on higher education, and he felt that the presenter was racist against the White majority. Such arguments of Whites being an ethnic group like other ethnicities, and that they are facing racism are spreading in many countries in "[...] an attempt to safeguard an oppressive and racist status quo" (Gillborn, 2019, p.115). Vaught and Castagno (2008) discussed situations when they investigated the attitudes of

teachers and administrators in an anti-bias training in two schools in the US. The researchers found that the idea of White privilege was met with denial and hostility by White teachers, who had no real understanding of structural racism and who did not view structural racism or White privilege as sources of minority students' achievement gap in schools. Matias (2013) also referred to the defensiveness of teachers who resort to "projecting White guilt towards people of color instead of positively working through the painful emotions[...]" (p.69), which is a defense mechanism that they use "[...] to self-protect their core sense of racialized White identity" (p.76).

#### 2.6.2 Counter-narrative in Education

One of the means to counteract Whiteness and provide space for students and teachers to voice their concerns, challenges, and ideas can be done using counternarratives and counter-storytelling, which represent one of CRT's key tenets. The development of counter-narratives resulted from "[t]he need to examine the lived experience of the law, and to make those experiences the basis for social change [...]" (Miller et al., 2020, p.272). Like CRT, counter-narrative started in the legal field, and then started being used in other fields such as the field of education. Using counternarratives provides an opportunity for "describing a different experience" through which "[...] those not of the dominant culture can participate in creating a new narrative that is visible to all and, perhaps, alter perceptions in their community and in the larger culture" (Williams, 2004, p.166). van Dijk (1993) highlighted that "[...] minorities or other dominated groups simply will hardly be allowed to provide a totally different version of the facts" and the use of counter storytelling can provide them with the chance to share their experiences and make their voice heard (p. 265).

According to Miller et al. (2020), "counter-narratives are important means to document and share how race influences the educational experiences of people of color, whose stories counter the stories of the privileged that are considered normal and neutral" (p.273). Counter-narratives are important in the field of education and in ELT, as they not only encourage individuals to critique unfair practices, but they also highlight possible changes that can be made (Solórzano & Yosso, 2002). These changes can play a role not only representing minority voices but also counteracting racism and racialization faced by minoritized groups.

# 2.7 Globalization and the English Language

Globalization affects all areas of life including industry, communication, and education and, according to Sifakis and Sougari (2003), the term is viewed differently based on the observer, as for some it is seen as the overpowering control of some countries over others, like in the case of the colonized vs the colonizers. While for others, it is the socio-economic threat that endangers national currency value like in the case of British Pound vs. the European Union's Euro. Another definition of globalization is one in which it "[...] looks to the pursuit of interest on the global level through the operation of unfettered capitalism" (Jones, 1998, p.143). Globalization and capitalism are both dependent on interests, and they are intricately intertwined, as globalization provides access and facilitates mobility between different parts of the world, and this mobility is of huge importance to capitalism, because it offers an easy and safe access for goods and trade. Another term that relates to globalization and capitalism is colonialism, as all three terms evolve around power and interests. Such power relations ensure that more powerful countries with strong economies collect greater benefits and control other economies that become dependent on them.

Thanks to globalization and flexibility of borders, individuals can easily access information, products, and countries; however, this flexibility was unable to stop "[...] the class, sexual, gender, spiritual, linguistic, geographical, and racial hierarchies of the "modern/colonial capitalist/patriarchal world-system" (Grosfoguel, 2011, p.8). Grosfoguel's words highlight discrimination in the modern world and how all individuals are bound to be judged and discriminated against whether this discrimination is based on the individual's race, culture, or language. The fight against discrimination in today's globalized world starts in the field of education and, with the increased numbers of immigrants, changes need to be made in the field, where there is a need for "[...] school administrators and teachers to respond by facilitating academic success for culturally, racially, and linguistically diverse students" (Liggett, 2014, p.121). This facilitation is the key for inclusion of students from different backgrounds.

Globalization played a huge role in the spread of the English language with many countries such as the US and UK preaching that "[...] English is the sole language of globalization, and in everyone's interest", which according to Phillipson (2017) "is patently false" (p. 328). Davies (2004) underlines the different views of the global spread of English, highlighting that some view it positively, because of its role in offering access to knowledge and global markets, and the power that English offers individuals. However, others oppose the expansion of English due to its role in:

[H]egemonizing of the weak by the strong, the ways in which English is used by the powerful west and their allies to dominate through globalization, much as they dominate through economic and military means. They also point to the loss of choice, first linguistic, and then, inevitably it is suggested, cultural. (Davies, 2004, pp. 438-439)

According to Safari and Razmjoo (2016), globalization and English are intricately connected, as globalization assisted in the spread of the English language and consequently the spread of English "facilitated and escalated the process of globalization" (p.148). Languages and power are closely connected, and political control is reflected in the idea of creating a "single 'linguistic community'" (Bourdieu & Thompson, 1991, p.46). The notion of political powers and language is reflected in Phillipson's (2017) words where he explains that "English is fraudulently projected as a de-territorialized language that is disconnected from its original sources and even from the driving forces behind its expansion worldwide" (pp. 315-316). This form of political domination is mirrored in many fields and can be clearly seen in the field of education. In addition, such political power is manifested in curricula, school programs, and negative views of bilingual programs, among others. Such form of linguistic discrimination is one of many types of discrimination that both students and teachers face.

#### 2.7.1 Linguistic Discrimination

Linguistic discrimination can manifest through statements like "your English is so good" or "where are you from?" which are some of the examples that Kim (2020) underlined from her experience as an Asian American and Pacific Islander (AAPI) literacy and language faculty member. She highlighted the idea of forever being a foreigner attached to AAPIs and how their use of languages other than English can be stigmatized. She explained how "[f]acility with standard American English affords social and institutional credibility within the United States, as well as in professional conversations abroad [...]" (p.371). Her ideas on invisibility of AAPIs and the stress on assimilating them reflect what S. Guo (2015) discussed about how minoritized groups' cultures and languages are viewed as different and contradictory to those of the majority

and are silenced and made invisible by pushing them towards assimilation through language use, using English, and adopting the cultural norms of the majority. Such assimilationist ideas can be mirrored in colorism, which is a term that Kendi (2019) defines as "a powerful collection of racist policies which lead to inequities between Light people and Dark people, supported by racist ideas about Light and Dark people" (p.107), and such notions are "encouraging assimilation into-or transformation into something close to-the White body" (p.110).

The concept or term of native speakerism also reflects the deficiency view of "non-natives", as they are seen as lacking compared to their native counterparts; these natives are also expected to be from White Inner Circle countries such as Canada, New Zealand, UK, UK and so forth. The term inner circle was coined by Kachru in 1985, and he introduced it as part of the "three concentric circles", inner circle, outer circle (extended circle), and extending circle (Kachru, 1990, p.5). These circles underline the "types of [English language] spread, the patterns of acquisition and the functional domains in which English is used across cultures and languages" (Kachru, 1985, p.12).

Choi (2016) shed light on how Korean teachers and students are put in the position of students compared to NSs, because "native" English speakers are represented "[...] as ideal teachers who own knowledge about language and the target culture [...] (p.74). The pursuit of "nativeness" and obsession with sounding like a "native" has led schools and different educational institutions in South Korea and in other countries to teach students slang and push them to memorize idioms to sound like a "native". Research on native speakerism clarifies the impact of discourse used by schools, educational institutes, and policy makers in shaping students' perceptions of good English and how any other form different from a "legitimate" dialect is not accepted and is

represented as less. Standard English is one of these legitimate forms of English and it represents "[...] not simply a means of communication but the symbolic possession of a particular community, expressive of its identity, its conventions, and values" (Widdowson, 1994, p.381). For this reason, other forms or dialects of English are portrayed as illegitimate and those who use it are "non-members" and outsiders. Widdowson (1994) also underlined that acceptance of new terms or words depends on who came up with it; if such a term was "coined by a non-native-speaking community" it might be considered as "not really proper English [...]" (p.383).

# 2.7.2 Language Legitimacy

The notion of language legitimacy was introduced by Bourdieu and Thompson (1991), and he explained how linguistic communities use languages in a specific form and follow specific rules in speaking those languages rendering it some sort of "code" providing such communities with authority to judge the users of the language. Thanks to this "code" or "cipher", these communities "[...] are empowered universally to subject the linguistic performance of speaking subjects to examination and to the legal sanction of academic qualification" which can be seen in standardized tests that both students and teachers are mandated to take to be accepted in university or to get a job (Bourdieu & Thompson, 1991, p.45). This form of language then becomes the legitimate and formal form which all other varieties need to be measured to and judged by.

Even in some contexts where bilingualism is viewed as accepted and/or necessary, there is a specific form of bilingualism that is "one in which people speak multiple monolingual linguistic varieties" (Heller, 1996, p. 148), which further supports the notion of legitimate language forms. Heller (1996) explains that this legitimacy is not only related to proficiency in the language but also is affected by how one speaks the language, and

whether he conforms to rules of speaking, such as not using curse words or taking turns based on the accepted model. This accepted model reflects how schools "[...] might be agents of social, cultural and linguistic legitimation, social reproduction and production" (Morrison & Lui, 2000, p.483).

Language legitimacy is closely connected to linguistic capital where a language represents a form of capital or asset that individuals make use of. Such capital, according to Bourdieu and Thompson (1991), reflects social hierarchies where those who speak the formal/legitimate form are seen as belonging to a higher class, as the form of language they use distinguishes them from others. Morrison and Lui (2000) define linguistic capital as "fluency in, and comfort with, a high-status, world-wide language which is used by groups who possess economic, social, cultural and political power and status in local and global society" (p.473). Phillipson (2009) referred to linguistic capital dispossession, which happens when the native language is replaced by English, and he emphasized the need for an "ethical alternative", where multilingualism is encouraged (p.338). This alternative can be seen in "linguistic accumulation" where English is added to a person's linguistic repertoire (Phillipson, 2017, p.323).

Linguistic capital is also connected to other forms of capital (i.e., cultural, economic, and educational capitals), which can easily disadvantage minorities, as they do not possess the majority's linguistic capital, and their own linguistic capital is viewed as deficient. For this reason, Phillipson (2017) highlights why minorities "[...] opt for the dominant language because it is felt that this linguistic capital will serve their personal or professional interests best" (p.323). An example of the power that linguistic capital affords to individuals can be seen in Hong Kong, where English was the language of the elites and the gateway to having a higher social status during the British era; however,

with the shift of power came a shift in linguistic capital from English to Chinese with the Chinese domination of Hong Kong (Morrison & Lui, 2000).

Whether a language belongs to a minority or a majority group, and whether it is spoken by millions or a handful of individuals, the language represents capital that needs to be preserved. Blommaert (2010) highlights the important role of local languages and how they represent "local repositories of knowledge", and these languages are crucial for understanding the "(local) world", and she underlines that local meaning is lost with every language that disappears. Since the current study is focused on instructors' employability, it is necessary to understand not only how globalization affects education and ELT but also how it affects the job market.

### 2.7.3 Discrimination and the Job Market

Globalization did not only facilitate the transfer of goods between countries but also facilitated the mobility of individuals. Hartung (2017) explained that countries started advertising for the idea of global citizens, and schools and universities encouraged and reinforced the ideas disseminated by their governments. The reason why the term global citizen appeals to governments is how it highlights the notion of being independent and entrepreneurial; a citizen who holds the responsibility of changing the world, which moves the responsibility of making change from a governmental and institutional level to an individual level. These global citizens are a representation of globalization and the flow of knowledge across borders; citizens who belong to more than one place and can hold more than one culture. However, when these global citizens travel from their countries for education or work, they may encounter different challenges including discrimination due to their race, ethnicity, religion, country of origin (Derous, Pepermans, et al., 2017; DeVaro et al., 2018; Leckcivilize & Straub, 2018; Mahboob & Golden,

2013). Discrimination is present and evident, and it can be through bias against a specific gender, religion, ethnicity, or race.

In the workplace, one of its manifestations can be seen in the term "lookism" introduced by Ghodrati et al. (2015). Lookism is discrimination based on looks, and it happens when hiring committees decide to hire a candidate based on the attractiveness of that candidate regardless of his or her experience and qualifications. A study conducted by Leckcivilize and Straub (2018) suggested that beauty affects all types of occupation, and more attractive individuals have better chances of getting employed. They highlighted that in the context they investigated, Germany, racial discrimination against some job applicants was partly attributed to viewing applicants from specific backgrounds as less attractive that other applicants, e.g., Turkish versus German.

Obesity is another variable related to attractiveness and beauty which affects the hiring process, and Rooth (2009) underlined that, in a field experiment conducted in Sweden, obese job applicants had lower chances of getting a callback compared to nonobese ones. Also, obese candidates were viewed as less attractive. Women were affected even more than men and obese women received less call-backs than obese men and Rooth (2009) highlighted that "[...] the results for women were driven by obesity, while the results for men were driven by attractiveness." (p.712). The results from both Leckcivilize and Straub (2018) and Rooth (2009) are also reflected in Bóo et al.'s study (2013), which highlighted how attractive individuals receive 36% more call-backs than less attractive individuals and they were also contacted sooner. The countries in which the previous studies were conducted are different, Germany, Sweden and Argentina, and the similarities in the results confirm the need for anonymous resumes, which are resumes that do not include the job applicant's picture. Anonymous resume screening was

encouraged by many researchers such as Bóo et al. (2013), Y. Guo (2009), Derous et al. (2009) and Derous, Pepermans, et al. (2017).

In addition to discrimination based on looks, religion is yet another variable that can affect candidates' opportunities of getting hired. Since some companies require a picture attached to the application, employers can know a candidate's religion if they wear the veil or a turban, and Leckcivilize and Straub (2018) explained that having policies that ban the inclusion of pictures in employment application can potentially reduce racism based on looks which can also help with discrimination based on religion. They highlighted that there is significant discrimination against women wearing the veil; however, the presence of desirable qualifications and skills increased the hijabi female applicants' opportunity of getting hired. Weichselbaumer (2020) reached similar results regarding discrimination against females with headscarves in Germany, and the results of his study showed that an applicant wearing the veil must send "4.5 times as many applications as an identical applicant with a German name and no headscarf to receive the same number of call-backs for interview." (pp.12-13). Discrimination was even higher for higher positions such as chief accountant and the applicant with a headscarf had to send 7.6 times more applications than other applicants.

Like Leckcivilize and Straub (2018) and Weichselbaumer (2020), a study conducted by Syed and Pio (2010) on Muslim migrant women in Australia underlined how females wearing the hijab (veil) were more prone to discrimination because of their dress code and stereotypes about Muslim women, and what the hijab and Islam represent. They also highlighted how multiple variables can intersect and cause discrimination on multiple levels, such as the intersection of religion, gender, and ethnicity. The multilayered discrimination faced my Muslim migrant women in Australia meant that they can

be discriminated against because of their gender, religion, ethnicity, and country of origin. On the other hand, religion was found to be useful for some migrant workers in the UAE context in which being Muslim, in addition to being from the same racial and linguistic background, helped the workers relate to their clients and business partners (Ngeh & Pelican, 2018). According to Liebkind et al. (2016), discrimination based on gender in some cases can be dependent on the type of job, as males face job discrimination when applying for positions that are stereotypically viewed as "feminine", such as secretary, receptionist, nurse. In Liebkind et al.'s (2016) study, which was conducted in Finland, Russian men faced gender-based discrimination regardless of the type of job due to the negative stereotypes about them. Surprisingly, females from both majority, Finnish, and minority, Russian, groups did not face discrimination when applying for either feminine or masculine jobs, and the researchers explain that the situation for Russian females is different possibly because Russian women are "[...] perceived as less threatening and more likeable than Russian men, regardless of the context" (p.419).

Being a female can also subject women not only to discrimination but also abuse where their reproductive abilities and motherhood can subject them to abusive and human traffic like work situations (Mahdavi, 2013). According to Mahdavi (2013), in the UAE, domestic workers are monitored by their employers because of fear they will become pregnant and have children in the host country. Employers in many cases justify control of female domestic workers claiming that it is to protect these women. Control of domestic workers and other low skilled workers can sometimes be executed through withholding the workers passport, which is justified through the kafala or sponsoring system, which is present in the UAE and almost all Gulf Cooperation Council countries (GCC) (Martin & Malit, 2017). In addition to these working conditions, domestic workers

receive very low wages which Strabac et al. (2018) claim is partially due to the workers "weak bargaining position" (p.356).

DeVaro et al.'s (2018) investigated another reason for discrimination, which is discrimination based on skin colour and they discussed how it can affect an applicant's chance of being employed in a high status and low client contact position. It was found that light-skin-toned candidates were viewed as more suitable than dark skinned candidates in a high status and low client contact position. Contrary to high status and low client contact positions, dark skinned candidates were equally viewed as their lightskinned counterparts in high status high client contact positions, which the researchers attributed to the fact that "negative stereotypes and prejudiced reactions dissipate when ethnic majority's view minorities in a more positive context" (p.873). This was also the case in Derous, Nguyen et al.'s (2009), as Arabs were equally positively rated as their mixed Arab and White counterparts in high cognitive-demanding and high client contact jobs. However, for low cognitive-demanding and low customer contact jobs, discrimination was high for Arab candidate compared to the other two groups, which could be due to "the negative stereotypes of Arab minority applicants for this type of job" (p.313). These studies connect to Nakhaie and Kazemipur's (2013) study, where they suggested that "the institutional means and cultural values of the host society tend to disadvantage the cultural values and institutional familiarities of visible minority immigrants more so than those of the white immigrants", which adds to their racialization and marginalization in the communities they live and work in.

Discrimination also manifested due to ethnic names, and Y. Guo (2009) underlined that both immigrants and administrators participating in his study explained that an immigrant's name can affect their employability. Administrators encouraged

immigrants to change their names to anglicized names to improve their chances of getting a job, and it is evident from Derous, Nguyen et al.'s (2009) study how names can affect job suitability rating. They highlighted that candidates with Arab names and affiliations received less job suitability ratings than other applicants from mixed Arab and White applicants in both the United States and the Netherlands.

Changing names was not the only thing that immigrants were asked to do. In Y. Guo's (2009) study, applicants were encouraged to give up on their culture and language to assimilate with the Canadian culture, which was viewed by administrators as contradictory to the immigrants' culture. Such an attitude reflects what Phillipson (2009) underlined where immigrants' language "[...] tend to be seen as problems rather than resources" (p.336). Unfortunately, individuals in some cases are forced to make such linguistic shift, as such change becomes a "strategy for survival" (Blommaert, 2010, p.47). The administrators' and employers' attitudes and suggestions oppose what researchers such as Selvi (2009) and Duran (2019) advocate for in terms of fighting against discrimination, creating equitable job markets, and recognizing and appreciating different cultures and languages. Contrary to the previously mentioned results, Derous, Pepermans, et al. (2017) highlighted that, in their study, ethnic names did not affect an applicant's chance of getting hired; however, they explained that "HR professionals might have been more attentive when they screened résumés with Maghreb/Arab-sounding names" due to the reporting of ethnic name discrimination in the Belgium media which could have led to the lower levels of discrimination against those applicants (p.872). Derous, Nguyen, et al. (2009) explained that in their study, even though Arab candidates were discriminated against in both the American and Dutch contexts, the reason for such prejudice differs between contexts. In the Netherlands, Arabic-sounding names were the

main reason discrimination, while, in the US, discrimination was mainly related to a candidate's ethnic affiliation and not the candidate's name. The researchers also explain how such difference can be due to the difference between contexts, because the US has a long history immigration and the candidates applying for jobs are Americans, where the candidates Netherlands are "migrants", and therefore having an Arabic-sounding name is enough to trigger discrimination.

As suggested by administrators and employers in Y. Guo's (2009) study, a worker's chance of getting a job can be affected by their name, but even if the worker changes his name and is finally able to find a job, discrimination does not end there. DeVaro et al. (2018) highlighted that employers discriminate against employees in promotions and even if two employees perform equally, it is up to the employer to promote the one he chooses, which happens to be the White or "visible" employee and not the non-White employee. Such discrimination was evident in a study conducted by Derous, Pepermans, et al. (2017), which explored the job market in Belgium and found that HR professionals showed preference for light-skinned candidates even though their dark-skinned counterparts had equal qualifications.

DeVaro et al. (2018) underlined that "[s]ome high-ability Invisibles are inefficiently denied promotions to keep their talents hidden from competing employers" (p.390).

Nevertheless, in some cases, employers offer promotions to minorities, "invisibles", when they believe that they can gain profit from these promotions. This situation clearly reflects the interest-convergence concept coined by Critical Race Theorist, Derrek Bell, where "[t]the interests of blacks [invisibles or minorities] in achieving racial equality have been accommodated only when they have converged with the interests of powerful whites" (Taylor, 1998, p. 123). A possible way out for employees is choosing companies "for

which the costs of discrimination (e.g., litigation costs, and costs to worker morale) are particularly high", as they would possibly have jobs with substantially different tasks in the different hierarchical levels, which would mean less promotion discrimination for minorities (DeVaro et al., 2018, p.424).

As Syed and Pio (2010) highlighted, discrimination in the job market is affected by the applicant's ethnicity, and this was also evident in the Swedish job market in a study conducted by Carlsson and Rooth (2007) where the researchers utilized correspondence testing to explore the presence of ethnic discrimination in two major cities in Sweden. The results of the study showed that applicants with Arabic-sounding names were discriminated against, and discrimination was higher in low-skilled jobs than in high-skilled. The study highlighted that mostly the companies that discriminate have males responsible for recruitment, and that companies with an "ethnic multitude plan" were surprisingly found to not discriminate less. Finally, it was found that the companies that discriminate against females were found to also discriminate against immigrants. Ethnic discrimination was also present among European applicants from high and low status groups. Liebkind et al. (2016) found that, in Finland, there is preference for employing Finnish candidates to Polish candidates as the latter belong to a minority group, despite being Europeans. The study shed light on local ethnic hierarchy and the role it plays in employment decisions. Similarly, Ngeh and Pelican (2018) found that employers' hiring decisions are affected by "[...] cultural and/or ascriptive (dis)similarities between employers and job applicants" (p.180); however, such effect can be beneficial for minority applicants when the employer shares their ethnic and cultural background, for example both being Muslim and/or from the Middle East. In addition, migrants' countries of origin "[...] often correlate with their skill composition and their

placement in formal and informal social hierarchies, interacting to produce highly stratified ethno-class structure", which can be noticed in the Persian Gulf region, where individuals' nationalities put them in different social hierarchies, for example nationals vs. Western migrants, workers from the Middle East vs. workers from South Asia (Strabac et al., 2018, pp.353-354).

On the other end of the spectrum, Li and Liu (2020) investigated ethnic preference and discrimination in Hong Kong, which is a newly explored context compared to the Western studies mentioned earlier on discrimination in the job market. The results of their study countered those of previous studies highlighting preference for White and Western applicants over non-White, as Hong Kong and Mainland Chinese applicants received more call-backs than their Anglo-Saxon counterparts. Li and Liu (2020) justified employers' preferences for Hong Kong and Chinese applicants because of their knowledge of Cantonese which would facilitate communication with both customers and colleagues. Despite the effect of White privilege in "socio-cultural spheres or everyday interactions", it seems that the job market, financial market specifically, is not affected by White privilege nor colonialism (p.83). However, it is important to note the study focused on college graduates and the researchers highlighted that hiring for higher positions in the industry might show a preference for White or Chinese applicants which emphasizes the need for more research on different positions to explore discrimination and ethnic preferences in higher positions.

Discrimination based on (dis)ability, nationality, religion, ethnicity, and gender was found to have a negative impact on workers whether in relation to skill underutilization, workers having more experience in relation to the work they do and have, and under-skilling, workers not receiving the training needed to do their job well.

Rafferty (2020) discussed the relation between both terms and the self-reported discrimination by workers whether the discrimination is based on nationality, sex, race, age, or ability. He highlighted that "[...] in addition to preventing people obtaining work that matches their skills, workplace discrimination also negatively affects training and broader skill development opportunities." (p.330). These findings align with Turin et al.'s (2023) study about International Medical Graduates (IMG) and the various challenges they encounter when seeking equivalency of their degrees. Turin et al. (2023) also referred to the discrimination that IMGs face, and how they feel "overqualified and underqualified at the same time" even when they pursue alternative careers (p.17).

### 2.7.4 Covid-19 and the Job Market

It is evident from the previously mentioned studies that minorities face several challenges in the workplace whether while job hunting or after hiring due to discrimination originating from a candidate's religion, ethnicity, name, or gender. Such practices affect workers' opportunities of advancement and reflect the need to make changes to the hiring process. An added variable which affected minorities' overall experiences in the job market was Covid-19. According to Hartshorn and McMurry (2020), the pandemic affected ESL instructors' job security and financial stability. Instructors in their study referred to how reduced student enrolment affected the number of classes they teach where multiple levels had to be merged due to the small number of students. Also, Almeida and Santos (2020) underlined how Covid-19 led to new forms of work, using technology, which led to the emergence of "[...] more unstable and short-term employment [...] (e.g., workers without permanent employment, platforms and call workers)", and how "[t]hese new forms of work must not be associated with precariousness and social unprotection" (p.999). Despite employment instability, Cech

and Hiltner (2022) referred to how "[...] passion for work became more important to [job-unstable workers] over the pandemic" (p.10).

Another effect that Covid-19 had on workers was what Edmond (2022) referred to as the "Great Reshuffle", which happened when some employees resigned their jobs after the pandemic lifted "in search of something more fulfilling and better suited to their values and life choices". This interpretation was reflected in Smith and Guillotin's (2022) study, which referred to how:

[t]he changing dynamic has led to a power shift that has given workers a negotiation platform that did not exist pre-pandemic. In this current environment, individuals are negotiating for a sustainable salary, flexibility, better working conditions which will lead to less stress (p.558).

The change that Smith and Guillotin (2022) referred to was related to a sense of self-worth and need to upskill after employees were released from their jobs and how this led to "redefine what requirements need to be in place for them to accept an offer" (p.557). These findings stress how the pandemic has exacerbated the already challenging job market that minority workers must maneuver. Nevertheless, these results also highlight a positive effect related to a change in power dynamics that is currently happening in the job market.

Despite the multiple challenges that minorities face in the job market, and the variables that lower their chances of being interviewed, it is worthy to mention certain strategies that can assist job applicants in case they secure a job interview. One of these strategies is self-promotion, which Higgins and Judge (2004) defined as an "[...] influence tactic that may allow applicants to manage recruiters' perceptions of P–J (person-job) fit" (p.625). According to Stevens and Kristof (1995), interviewees' "higher

levels of tactic use [self-promotion and ingratiation] were associated with more positive outcomes" (p.602). Higgins and Judge (2004) explored the relation between the two factors in the light of P-O fit (Person-Organization) and P-J fit (Person-Job) and found a weak non-significant direct relation between self-promotion and interview outcomes.

Nevertheless, the study suggested that "influence tactics have implications throughout the employment process" (Higgins & Judge, 2004, p.631).

### 2.8 "Nativeness" and "Non-nativeness"

Another manifestation of discrimination and one that can possibly affect an individual's chances of education and employment is related to language skills and language level. The following section will discuss "nativeness", what the term "native" speaker stands for, the dichotomy between being a "native" and "non-native" speaker of English, and how to counteract this false dichotomy.

### 2.8.1 What Does the Term Native Speaker Mean?

Defining and describing what a "native speaker" is not as simple as it might seem, and as Davies (2003) explains "[...] the native-speaker concept is rich in ambiguity" (p.2). He highlights that there is a tendency to use the term "NS" to mean "having language X as one's mother tongue, as one's first language, as one's dominant language, as one's home language" (p.18). According to Davies (2004), there are six different characteristics that define any NS of any language, which include acquiring the L1 in childhood, having the ability to write creatively and interpret and translate into his L1, producing language naturally, and having "intuitions" about the characteristics of the standard language grammar, and how it differs from his/her grammar.

When examining job advertisements seeking English teachers, another definition of "native speakers" can be seen, which is a citizen from the US, UK, Australia, New

Zealand, and Canada, which are the "inner circle" countries. Identifying as a "NS" requires firstly to self-identify as one, bear the responsibility of being a "NS" and being accepted by other "native" speakers (Davies, 2003). However, it is not easy for English speakers outside of the inner circle to identify as "natives", as the concept of a "NS" who is an individual from the previously mentioned countries is widely accepted and believed in by many individuals and institutions. Such belief by others affects professional users of English and makes it difficult to identify as "natives". It is nevertheless true that "[t]he native-speaker boundary is [...] one as much created by non-native speakers as by Native speakers themselves", as speakers of English from outside of the inner circle sometimes view themselves as outsiders to the English language, and they need to change this idea and view themselves as speakers and owners of the English (Davies, 2003, p.9).

### 2.8.2 "Nativeness" and Discrimination

According to Phillipson (2017), "[t]he argument that English is 'owned' by all who use it ignores the inequalities that are generated by and through English" (p. 329). An example of these inequalities is the use of the terms "native" and "non-native", which is a display of discrimination, colonialism, and capitalism. "Natives" from Inner Circle countries are represented as speaking a "legitimate" form of English and being the official owners of the English language "accents". Having a foreign "accent" is one of the reasons that affect some employers' decision when hiring immigrants, as they prefer to hire someone who does not speak English with an "accent", as "accents" are viewed "as a marker of an unwanted "Other" (Y. Guo, 2009, p. 44). Guo's study investigated the Canadian context highlighting that a "native" "accent" is used to judge an immigrant's ability and, for that reason, the administrators in his study focused on "accent" reduction to assist the immigrants they are working with in getting a job. This approach, however,

represents a colonial tool of assimilating immigrants through "accent" reduction and highlights the view of both employers and administrators of a foreign "accent" as less and deficient.

Blommaert (2010) referred to a similar point on how "accent" courses "produce a regimented subject that is subjected to rules of "normal" speech- speech that is invisible because it is uniform and homogeneous" (p.49). Also, Creese and Kambere (2003) highlighted how the system rewards those fluent in the language giving an example of the Canadian immigration system where candidates receive more points if they are fluent in English or French and having more points means a step closer to immigration. They also explained how "accents" can be viewed as borders used to alienate and "other" members of different groups such as immigrants with African English "accents". Also, having an "accent" was a reason for some employers to deny applicants job opportunities, as an "accent" was a sign of lower competency in English. In addition to being denied employment, having an "accent" can affect an individuals' chance of getting housing, as some participants in Creese and Kambere (2003) mentioned, and this rejection leads to marginalizing immigrants and placing them in an "outsider within" position. In addition, the native-like notion has a major effect on applicants getting jobs that require interaction with customers such as, customer service and English teaching jobs, as teachers' competence is partly judged based on their "accent" and "nativeness" and which jeopardizes their employment chances. Blommaert (2010) discussed the idea of "partial competence", and he highlighted how "our real "language" is a biographical given, the structure of which reflects our own histories and those of the communities in those we spent our lives" (p.103). Looking at language from this perspective creates a wider and more inclusive space for language users with different and rich capitals and repertoires.

This dichotomy of "accents" and "native" vs. "non-native" is not easy to eradicate, as capitalism plays an important role in advertising for this fallacy to flourish the English Language Teaching (ELT) field which is regarded as a major source of income for Inner Circle countries (Ruecker, 2011).

Despite discrimination that "non-natives" face and the pressure on immigrants to speak with certain "accents, it is interesting to see how, in certain instances, immigrants choose to challenge this way of thinking. For example, participants in Choi's (2016) study critically challenged the "NS" model and rejected the idea of trying to sound native by balancing their use of expressions that might make them sound "too Americanized", highlighting that their "accents" do not stand in the way of the professions and describing those who focus on "nativeness" or "accents" as "ignorant". For the participants in Choi's (2016) study, bilingualism represented the ability to produce "[...] a socially and discursively 'proper' use of two languages, knowing when and whom to use or not to use a certain language or language varieties" (p.82).

Connected to the native-non-native fallacy, Phyak (2020) referred to different marketing strategies used by educational organizations, which target international students in their home countries using signboards, which advertise for standardized tests taught by "native speaking foreign teachers". These ads stress how passing in these tests is framed as gateways to studying abroad, and Phyak (2020) added that these signboards sometimes utilize a "female Caucasian image" to further convince students (p.221). Even though Phyak's (2020) study was conducted in Nepal, such marketing techniques and modes are used worldwide. For example, Bodis (2023) referred to universities in Australia and how they frame the education experience as "[...] an idealized authentic

linguistic experience, one which may not be readily available to international students" (p.11).

# 2.8.3 Counteracting the Native-Non-Native Dichotomy

The native-non-native dichotomy and discrimination that teachers face because of it encouraged different researchers to investigate Non-native English-Speaking Teachers (NNESTs) and the discriminatory practices they face (Clark & Paran, 2007; Flynn & Gulikers, 2001; Jeon & Lee, 2006; Lancee, 2019; Tatar, 2019). These researchers, among others, explored the difficulties that NNESTs face while looking for a job and the discriminatory practices that multiple organizations use when searching for and choosing teachers. They also explored several methods to counteract the use of the native and non-native terms.

Researchers such as Selvi (2009) highlighted that such discrimination and biases must be challenged, and he underlined the importance of collaboration between NEST and NNEST to defy the Native-speaker preference and replace it with "professionalism". Similarly, Rampton (1990) suggested using terms such as "expert user" instead of "NS" and mother tongue to underline the discrimination that these terms hold. In addition, he highlighted that changing the terms cannot only be superficial and must involve "inserting or removing particular assumptions", as such "alteration can clarify or usefully redirect our understanding" (p.98). He clarified that replacing "NSs" with the term "expert" underlines that the language is learned and is not "fixed" and no one can have full knowledge of it. The terms shift the focus from "who you are" to "what you know", which should provide teachers with a fair opportunity during recruitments in contrast to being judged based on "nativeness" only (Rampton, 1990, p.99). Proficiency in the language then should not be about where you come from and whether you belong to Inner

Circle countries or not; however, it should be about having the ability to "take possession of the language, turn it to your advantage, and make it real for you" (Widdowson, 1994, p. 384). A similar notion was discussed by Sifakis and Sougari (2003) when they mentioned the use of students' first language in class while teaching English with the goal of making "[...] these learners the essential and shameless 'owners' of English as an international language" (p.67).

In addition to teachers, Selvi (2009) underlined the importance of organizations' roles in creating a more equitable job market and he explained the roles that TESOL affiliates such as CATESOL (California Association of Teachers of English to Speakers of Other Languages) and WATESOL (Washington, D.C. Area Teachers of English to Speakers of Other Languages) in shedding light on NNESTs through creating NNEST caucuses. Rivera (2022) pointed to how "[t]he beliefs of those in power are critical as they can have a long lasting, substantial impact on whether positive change is possible" (p.198). Also, Choi (2016) shed light on second language speakers of English and their role in being critical and agentive in the face of the native-nonnative dichotomy, as they have a role in constructing and reconstructing what language competency means. Exposure to multiple varieties of English can also help teachers and students in defying the standard English myth and be more accepting of the variety of Englishes, dialects, or local variation they speak. In addition, exposure to language use in different countries can assist in fighting against the "Native speaker ideologies that portray English as belonging solely to monolingual Inner Circle settings (Schreiber, 2019, p.1129). Similarly, Safari and Razmjoo (2016) underlined the importance of the inclusion of various local cultures and accents in curricula to assist learners and teachers of English in having ownership of English and to counter the hegemonic effect of Western culture, values, and powers. In

addition, they highlighted how it is critical that NNEST view themselves as equals to "natives", as this should help them in viewing "their roles as global communicators with the aim of achieving international understanding" and they will not be easily susceptible to domination and superiority by "native" speakers (p.150).

TESOL practitioners are also encouraged to understand the culture and background of different groups such as refugees to be able to support such groups and fight against any forms of discrimination that they might face. They can do so through "forming collaborative networks among colleagues and joining professional interest groups" (Duran, 2019, p.822). Like Duran (2019), Gillborn (2019) proposed different suggestions to bring about change in education, one of which is teachers forming groups of like-minded educators and start making changes in schools to support racialized minorities. He underlined that teachers need to understand the situation of minoritized groups in schools first and then act accordingly since such discussions about racism and discrimination can be tough to have and teachers need to be prepared and understand the situation well. Finally, he advised teachers to handle discussions about race, racism and discrimination with care and involve all school members in coming up with solutions and involve community members and people of color, as they fully understand the problems that their communities face.

#### 2.9 Current Research

Based on the body of literature discussed earlier, discrimination and racialization are realities that many individuals face and live with, and their effects extend to people from different linguistic, cultural, and ethnic backgrounds. When exploring the field of education and ELT, it is also clear that instructors face different challenges which are partly related to racialization and discrimination, and this is evident in the challenges they

face while looking for and applying for jobs, and even after being hired. It is crucial to develop a deep understanding of ESL/EFL instructors' job hunting and employment experiences and explore ways to tackle any challenges they might be facing in the TESOL field. In addition, it is essential to understand program administrators' points of view and compare their views with those of instructors to bridge any possible gaps between both their views in terms of hiring criteria, job requirements, and employers' needs, among others. Another point relates to Covid-19 and its possible effect on the TESOL job market and consequently on ESL/EFL instructors.

To the researcher's knowledge, this research study was the first to investigate and compare the TESOL job markets in Canada and the UAE, which are two major destinations for immigrants and foreign workers. It was also the first to explore the perspectives and stories of program administrators and compare them to instructors' counter-stories. In addition, this study was among a limited number of studies that used intersectionality to investigate the job market in the UAE and is the first, to the researcher's knowledge, to use CRT, counter-storytelling, and intersectionality to explore the TESOL job market in the UAE. Furthermore, the study added to the scarce literature investigating the effect of Covid-19 on the TESOL field, ESL/EFL instructors, and program administrators. The following chapter will offer details on the research methodology used and the various methods utilized in answering the research questions explored in this study.

## Chapter 3

### 3 Methodology

# 3.1 Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches

Creswell and Creswell (2018) highlighted three main approaches to research: qualitative, quantitative, and mixed, and these approaches represent the "[...] plans and the procedures for research that span the steps from broad assumptions to detailed methods of data collection, analysis, and interpretation" (p.50). According to Perry (2011), quantitative research emerged in the field of psychology where an interest was placed on generalizing through using statistics. As for qualitative research, it emerged in anthropology and sociology, as both fields relied on verbal descriptions. An increased interest in qualitative research started in the second half of the 20th century which was followed by "the development of mixed methods research" and this change was witnessed after a domination of quantitative research in the late 19th century and early 20th century (Creswell & Creswell, 2018, p.51). It is important to highlight that these three research approaches should not be viewed as opposites, but rather as different points on the same continuum, where research characterized by numbers and statistics falls toward the quantitative side and that characterized with "verbal descriptions" leans toward the qualitative side (Creswell & Creswell, 2018; Perry, 2011).

Researchers' choice of a research approach is affected by their topic, scope, research questions, and field of study. If the researcher aims to collect data from a large sample with a goal of generalizing the findings, a quantitative methodology will fit best; however, if the scope is to collect and uncover detailed information from a small sample, then a qualitative approach should be selected (Perry, 2011). If the researcher "[...] gathers both quantitative (close-ended) and qualitative (open-ended) data, integrates the

two and then draws interpretations based on the combined strengths of both sets of data to understand research problems", it will align with the mixed approach (Creswell, 2015, p.2). One of the main benefits of using the mixed-methods approach is that it allows the researcher to gain "[...] additional insight beyond the information provided by either the quantitative or qualitative data alone" (Creswell & Creswell, 2018, p.52).

Using any of the previously mentioned approaches requires using one or more data collection methods or techniques, which vary and differ due to the goal of each approach. For example, quantitative research utilizes tests, experiments, and surveys to collect numeric data, where qualitative research employs interviews, observations, case studies, and document analysis to collect textual data (Creswell & Creswell, 2018). According to Perry (2011), the choice of data collection technique/s depends on how well that technique answers the investigated research questions.

#### 3.2 Current Research Study

As previously discussed in the introduction chapter, this study explored three research questions, which investigated the hiring criteria in both the Canadian and Emirate job markets, highlighted the stories of administrators and counter-stories of instructors in the TESOL field, and underlined the effects of Covid-19 on the TESOL job market in both contexts. To answer these three questions, a qualitative-methods approach was used. The researcher initially intended to use a mixed-methods approach; however, due to the small sample size and recruitment difficulties, which will be discussed in the study's limitations, the data collected was mainly qualitative in nature. Hence, a shift from a mixed-methods to a qualitative-methods approach was required. The qualitative methods utilized to collect the data helped in "[...] understanding the meaning people have constructed, that is, how people make sense of their world and the experiences they

have in the world", which was extremely important in this study, as it crystallized the similarities and differences between the perspectives of both program administrators and ESL/EFL instructors, the changes they noticed in TESOL job market, the effect of the pandemic on it, and the difference between the Canadian and Emirate contexts (Merriam & Tisdell, 2016, p.15).

Qualitative research has several characteristics and some of the main features that Creswell and Creswell (2018) highlighted are related to the research being conducted in a "natural setting, where human behavior and events occur" (p.320). In this "natural setting", the researcher is considered one of the most important tools of data collection and s/he uses different tools to gather data to get a deep understanding of the issue or the phenomenon researched. Qualitative research is also flexible as researchers can modify and make changes to their study while they are conducting it to better reflect and represent what they see and what their participants share. Finally, Creswell and Creswell (2018) stressed that participants are the ones who provide meaning to the research, as they are the source of the data. They also elaborated on how researchers make meaning of the problem investigated by using different tools to frame and understand participants' view, which is then complemented by the literature.

As a researcher using qualitative methods, there is a plethora of ways to create knowledge, and this knowledge does not have to be weighed as true or false nor it needs to be restricted to specific rules or laws; it is personal, natural, and subjective, which can be reflected not only in writing but by using art, artifacts, or pictures. According to Vaismoradi et al. (2013) "[q]ualitative approaches share a similar goal in that they seek to arrive at an understanding of a particular phenomenon from the perspective of those experiencing it" (p.398).

Blommaert and Dong (2020) highlight the subjectivity aspect of research and how "[...] there is nothing wrong with such subjectivity; it cannot be avoided" (p.66). The writing style itself does not have to adhere to the "mechanistic scientism and quantitative research" and formal rules but can be bent to reflect what the researcher and participants want to say whether by using stories or narratives (Richardson & St. Pierre, 2005, p. 960). This flexibility and availability of different writing options were important aspects in this study, as participants were encouraged to tell their stories using the writing style that they were comfortable with to reflect their voice which accomplished important two qualities of qualitative research which are being natural and personal.

Reflexivity is yet another quality about qualitative research that is important, and it happens during the research process and not after, which can bring about change and improvement not only for future research but also for the one at hand. Carcary (2020) explains that "[q]ualitative research requires a researcher to engage in critical scrutiny or active reflexivity to critically assess the evidence collected, debate the reasons for adopting a course of action, and challenge one's own assumptions" (p.168). Creswell and Creswell (2018) define reflexivity as how researchers "[...] reflect about their biases, values, and personal background, such as gender, history, culture, and socioeconomic status, and how this background shapes their interpretations formed during a study" (p.381). Reflexivity entails being critical when reflecting on the self and, as Denzin and Lincoln (2005) describe it, it involves "a conscious experiencing of the self as both inquirer and respondent, as teacher and learner, as the one coming to know the self within the processes of research itself' (p.210). It is a concept which represents an important phase of qualitative research which continues all the way through the research process from the conceptualization of the research idea to the analysis of the data. According to

Holmes (2020), "[a] reflexive approach suggests that, rather than trying to eliminate their effect, researchers should acknowledge and disclose their selves in their work, aiming to understand their influence on and in the research process", and it is important to note that "no matter how much reflexive practice a researcher engages in, there will always still be some form of bias or subjectivity" (p.3).

In this research study, the role of reflexivity was very important, as the researcher brought her personal experience, previous teaching experience, and biases to the research project, which involved an instance of discrimination in the UAE. Reflecting on her previous experience assisted in moderating her biases to be able to have the biases present, but not allow them to direct the data nor the results. In addition, the data in this research study was collected and analyzed on an ongoing basis and reflexivity proved to be extremely beneficial in critically reflecting on the results while the data was being collected, which assisted in better understanding the results or asking for more information if needed.

#### 3.3 Data Collection

As mentioned in the previous section, a qualitative methodology was used to answer the research questions. The following paragraphs will provide details on the data collection process that the researcher followed, recruitment challenges encountered, and qualitative methods/tools used.

### 3.3.1 Data Collection Process

Participants in this study were program administrators and ESL/EFL instructors in higher education institutes in both Canada and the UAE. Tables 1 and 2 offer details on participants' position/title, where they were recruited from, and the data collection methods they participated in. The study explored both governmental and private higher

education institutes, universities, and colleges, that have English language programs and offer English classes/courses. To recruit participants, the researcher communicated with universities and colleges to invite them to participate in the study, and invitations were also posted on several intersections/groups on TESL Ontario, TESL Canada, and TESOL Arabia to reach a wide range of participants (Program administrators and instructors). Also, instructor recruitment was accomplished through convenience and snowball sampling by using the researchers' professional contacts and fellow instructors' contacts who work in the field. Some of the participants had experience in both contexts, Canada and the UAE, this was not intentional, as the researcher's recruitment criteria were instructors and program administrators who had experience working in one or both contexts.

During recruitment, the researcher faced different challenges, especially in the UAE, and there was a very low response rate from the universities. Before receiving ethics approval, 13 universities in the UAE were contacted after requesting ethics permission to communicate with universities to explore universities' interest in the study and additional ethics requirements they might require. However, only one university replied, and it did not qualify for the study. After receiving ethics approval, another 33 universities were contacted, part of them were previously contacted; however, either no reply was received, their reply was not relevant to the email content, or instructors and administrators declined to participate in the study; this case happened with only one instructor and one program administrator. It important to note that, one organization in the UAE replied and requested an additional ethics application; nevertheless, due to time constrains and the length of ethics application and process, the researcher decided against doing research in the organization. A final attempt to collect data in the UAE followed by

visiting the UAE and communicating with organizations again, and the trip resulted only in one interview; however, the researcher discovered that the participant did not qualify for the study.

**Table 1. Instructors' List** 

#	Pseudonym	Current Position	Recruitment Portal	Context	Journal Reflection	Interview	Online Questionnaire
							_
1	Azadeh	ESL	TESL	Canada	No	Yes	Yes
		Instructor	Canada				
2	Atefeh	ESL/EFL	TESL	Canada	Yes	Yes	Yes
		Instructor	Ontario				
3	Haleh	ESL	TESL	Canada	No	Yes	Yes
		instructor	Canada				
4	Liam	Business	Mass Email	Canada	Yes	Yes	No
		Courses'					
		Instructor					
5	Nouri	Teaching	Personal	Canada	Yes	Yes	Yes
		Assistant	Connections				
6	Irene	ESL/EAP	Mass Email	Canada	No	Yes	No
		Instructor	Western				
			University				
7	Annabel	Business	Mass Email	Canada	No	Yes	Yes
		Courses'	Western				
		Instructor	University				
8	Reda	English	Personal	UAE	No	Yes	Yes
		for	Connections				
		Military					
		Purposes					
9	Hanie	ESL/EFL	Not Stated	UAE &	Yes	Yes	Yes
		Instructor	by	Canada			
			Participant				
10	Nader	ESL/EFL	Personal	UAE &	Yes	Yes	Yes
		Instructor	Connections	Canada			

Table 2. Program Administrators' List

#	Pseudonym	<b>Current Position/ Title</b>	Recruitment Portal	Context	Interview
1	Kevin	Program coordinator (ESL department)	TESL Canada	Canada	Yes
2	Abby	Program Administrator	Not Stated by Participant	Canada	Yes
3	Carl	Program Admin	TESL Ontario	Canada	Yes

4	Natalie	Student Advisor & Program	TESL Canada	Canada	Yes
		Coordinator			
5	Aliaa	Executive Director/Program	TESL Canada	Canada	Yes
		Administrator			
6	Hana	Chair of ESL Program	Not Stated by	UAE &	Yes
		_	Participant	Canada	

#### **3.3.3 Data Collection Tools**

Narratives and Storytelling as Research Tools. This research study utilized different ethnographic tools, as ethnography and its tools have "[...] the potential and the capacity of challenging established views, not only of language but of symbolic capital in societies in general", and this critical aspect of ethnography perfectly matches the theoretical framework used in this study (Blommaert & Dong, 2020, p.10). Ethnographic techniques are also inductive methods, which helped the researcher collect and analyze data whilst minimizing any preconceived notions about instructors or program administrators to affect the study.

The ethnographic tools that were used in the study included interviews and journal reflections, narratives/counter-stories, which represent a key tenet of CRT. According to Blommaert and Dong (2020), "[a]necdotes, small stories, contain complex patterns that lead us right into the experiential world of the storyteller: his/her cultural and social codes, feeling about what is told, own position vis-à-vis the topic of the story [...]" (p.83). These stories "[...] are not merely a list of facts about the things we do, the people we do them with, where and when we do them, they also embody our understandings of those events as well as express our feelings about them" (Barkhuizen, 2016, p.28). Miller et al. (2020) highlighted that critical counter-narratives in education focus on:

[c]ritically analyzing the racialized social reality in the education system and society by narrating the authentic lived experiences of people of color,

searching for and acting upon emancipatory solutions and transforming the educational system to provide equitable education for people of color" (p.75).

Miller et al. (2020) explained that narratives can be used either as a theoretical and methodological framework, a research method, or a pedagogical tool. In this research study, counter-narratives were used as a research method using journal reflections and interview questions to collect stories from ESL/EFL instructors and program administrators. Blommaert and Dong (2020) highlighted that narratives/stories "[...] are the raw diamonds in fieldwork interview", and "[t]he reason is that in narratives, people produce very complex sociocultural meanings" (p.52). The counter-stories in this study were used with program administrators and ESL/EFL instructors to give them the opportunity to underline their perspectives and experiences on the TESOL job market. Program administrators' voices were not reflected in previous research studies, to the researcher's knowledge, and the researcher developed multiple interview questions to provide them with an opportunity to express their views, how they navigate the hiring of ESL/EFL instructors in today's globalized job market, and what factors affect their hiring decisions. In addition, previous research highlighted how ESL/EFL instructors face different challenges in the job market, and this study focused on underlining these difficulties to underscore their sources and how instructors and administrators tackled them.

To depict instructors counter-narratives/stories, the researcher used interviews and journal reflections in which instructors were asked about their experiences on the TESOL field and job market underlining their experience prior, during, and, if hired, after employment. The semi-structured interviews conducted with both administrators and

instructors offered an additional layer to the narratives. Semi-structured interviews are "a dialogue between researcher and participant, guided by a flexible interview protocol and supplemented by follow-up questions, probes and comments", and they offer the researcher the chance to "[...] collect open-ended data, to explore participant thoughts, feelings and beliefs about a particular topic and to delve deeply into personal and sometimes sensitive issues" (DeJonckheere & Vaughn, 2019, p.1).

The use of narratives collected through journal entries and interviews assisted the researcher in collecting "[...] 'subjective', interpretive collection of evidence that reflexively tells a story about social roles, social positions, social events [...]", and which highlighted the power relations and different views about the globalized TESOL job market and how it affected all participants involved (Blommaert & Dong, 2020, p.85). Also, the use of counter-stories and interviews with ESL/EFL instructors and program administrators reflected the "[...] different positions from which they see the problem and in that sense lead [the interviewer] into the way in which social structure influences the way we see the world" (Blommaert & Dong, 2020, p.58). Highlighting the different perspectives and views of different participants assisted in creating a clearer view of how the job market operates, which can assist in facilitating instructors' job hunting and initiating a dialogue between program administrators and instructors about their disagreements.

Methods and Order of Use. In addition to using semi-structured interviews and journal reflections, online questionnaires, and online advertisements were utilized. The use of each data collection tool was as follows. The first data collection method used was 25 online advertisements collected over the period of three months in both Canada and the UAE. Previous studies explored online advertisements and they represented a great

tool to understand the hiring criteria that different organizations use (Mahboob & Golden, 2013; Ruecker & Ives, 2015; Selvi, 2010). There were two main criteria used when choosing the job advertisements: 1) recruiting English instructors and 2) recruiting in higher education institutes. The advertisements were collected from universities' official job portals and online job portals such as LinkedIn, HigherEdJobs (https://www.higheredjobs.com/), and TESOL Career Center, among others. Any redundant advertisements or ones that recruit English teachers for language centres or schools were not included. The collection of advertisements happened over the period of three months (March-May 2022), and 15 job ads were collected for teaching positions in Canada and 10 in the UAE. It was not possible to collect more ads from the UAE, as the ads were either repeated on more than one website, or they did not match the study's criteria. It is possible that, during the duration of data collection, universities were not actively recruiting, and that is why there were not many job advertisements advertising for university teaching jobs.

Following the analysis of the advertisements, instructors were asked to fill out an online questionnaire about the hiring criteria and opportunities available to them in the TESOL job market. Participation in the questionnaire was voluntary and instructors had the option of choosing to participate in one or more of the data collection methods. The questionnaire used was a modified version of the one designed by Clark and Paran (2007), which was originally designed by Mahboob et al. (2004) (See Appendix D and E for Instructors' questionnaires). The questionnaire explored the British context surveying both schools and higher education institutes, and it was divided into two sections: 1. general administrative information, courses offered, the number of students and instructors recruited and their citizenship, and 2. information on instructor recruitment

and professional development (e.g., instructor selection and evaluation). Even though the questionnaire reflected some of the key points that this study investigated, certain changes were made to the questions to fit the current study, which was focused mainly on higher education organizations. One of the first modifications to the questionnaire was creating two versions, one for Canada and one for the UAE, to reflect the different English programs and courses offered, the positions held by instructors, which slightly differ between the two contexts, and where the job advertisements were posted. Another change was adding different items exploring globalization and its possible effect on the job market. Also, the questionnaire designed by Clark and Paran (2007) was distributed to recruiters only; however, in this study, a modified version of the questionnaire was designed for instructors to reflect their perspective and compare it to the views of the program administrators. Participants in the online questionnaires entered a draw for an electronic gift card.

Following the questionnaire, instructors who agreed to further participate in the study were asked to write an online journal reflection on their experiences looking for jobs, interview process, hiring criteria they believe were important to get an English teaching job in either country or whether these criteria differ from the one's employers view as important (See Appendix C for Journal prompt). Five journal reflections were collected followed by online interviews to elaborate on the journal reflections with the instructors who agree to be interviewed (See Appendix B for Instructors' Interview Questions). The interviews were also optional, and the participants who took part in the study were compensated by receiving electronic gift cards. Finally, online semi-structured interviews were conducted with program administrators (See Appendix A for Program Administrators' interview questions), and the online interviews with instructors and

program administrators (one interview with each participant) were conducted via Zoom, and the approximate duration was 30 minutes.

# 3.4 Data Analysis

As mentioned earlier, multiple research methods were utilized in the current research study (i.e., online questionnaires, interviews with instructors and program administrators, journal reflections, and online job advertisements). The aim of using a combination of methods was to triangulate the data and participants' views and offer indepth information. The first step was collecting and analyzing the online job advertisements, as this process did not require receiving ethics approval. Once the approval was received, data was collected from instructors and program administrators, coded, and then analyzed and compared to one another.

The reason for using this research design was to get a deep understanding of the hiring criteria required and reflected in the job advertisements compared to the ones underlined by instructors and program administrators. In addition, these methods offered instructors the chance to voice their opinions, reflect on their experiences, and put their experience at the forefront instead of burying their voices in the background. Finally, the inclusion of the program administrators' interviews provided them with the chance to reflect on the changes and challenges present in the job market and the hiring process of English instructors and highlighted agreements and disagreements between their views and instructors' views.

#### 3.4.1 Analysis

*Job Advertisements*. The researcher used content analysis to analyze the job advertisements, while using a critical lens to "uncover ways in which discourses create/ recreate power hierarchies in society" (Ruecker & Ives, 2015, p. 739), and its role "in the

reproduction of dominance and inequality" (van Dijk, 1993, p. 253). White and Marsh (2006) describe content analysis as a "systematic, rigorous approach to analyzing documents obtained or generated in the course of research" (p.41). The researcher then uses the data collected to make inferences "[...] to move from the text to the answers to the research questions" (White & Marsh, 2006, p.27). Different types of discourse can be used as a tool to express dominance and such dominance "has its own historical, social, political and cultural properties, and hence also different ways of discursive reproduction" (van Dijk, 1993, p.266).

Job advertisements are a form of written discourse where language is used to highlight specific criteria with an aim to recruit individuals for a specific position, and such language represents a form of power, as whoever conforms to the criteria is seen as eligible to apply for the position excluding others who do not fit the job description. As previously mentioned in the literature review, some elements in job ads can be exclusionary and biased such as highlighting the need for "native" English speakers or individuals from specific countries such as inner circle countries. Highlighting such criteria represents a form of knowledge control, which "shapes our interpretation of the world, as well as our discourse and other actions" (van Dijk, 1993, p. 258). Previous studies such as Mahboob and Golden (2013) highlighted how job ads underline the "native" criteria which projects the idea of "natives" being the models for English teaching positions and possessing the "legitimate" form of English, which excludes many others who do not fit such narrow descriptions. To best crystalize such manifestations of dominance and power, the use of content analysis was guided by the key tenets of CRT (i.e., centralizing race, racism, and minorities voices, and challenging majority's views

and misconceptions) and intersectionality to uncover any forms of knowledge control, power, or dominance enacted by organizations hiring EFL/ESL instructors.

Using NVivo, a computer software, the ads collected were coded by means of qualitative content analysis and the frequency of the different codes/themes was measured. Using the codes created and analyzing the ads assisted in highlighting the most frequent and most important hiring criteria and helped in underlining any language reflecting power or dominance, and any overt or covert discrimination or preference for instructors from specific linguistic or ethnic backgrounds.

Journal Reflections and Instructors' Interviews. Instructors were asked to write a journal reflection and there was no cap on the word limit so participants could share as much or as little about their experiences and stories as they wished. Their reflections were fleshed out in interviews in which instructors further reflected and commented on what they had written in the journals. The reflections, as mentioned earlier, represented their counter-stories/narratives, which highlighted the instructors' experiences and the challenges they faced in the job market. The interviews were audio recorded, transcribed, and coded following the same procedure as for analyzing the job ads. The codes and themes were created manually by the researchers and NVivo was used to facilitate organizing and tracking the codes. In this study, some codes were "analyst-driven" and were expected based on the interview questions and research questions such as hiring criteria and job requirements, while others were "data-driven" such as shifting from teaching to administration roles and relocating from the UAE (Braun & Clarke, 2006, p. 83). The inductive method adopted facilitated the researcher's ability to go back and forth between the data collected and the codes created, and to keep the process open for any emerging codes. Braun and Clarke (2006) have defined inductive analysis as "[...] a

process of coding the data without trying to fit it into a preexisting coding frame, or the researcher's analytic preconceptions" (p.83). An identical process was used when analyzing program administrators' interviews.

Online Questionnaire. The questionnaire adapted from Clark and Paran (2007), originally designed by Mahboob et al. (2004), was used and the data was analyzed using Qualtrics. The questionnaire consisted of a five-point Likert scale ranging from one (not important at all) to five (very important) with an added "not applicable" category. As discussed in the data collection tools' section, the questionnaire was divided into two sections: general administrative information and information on instructor recruitment and professional development. The aim of using the questionnaire was to provide descriptive statistics of the hiring criteria used by the different higher educational institutes, where they advertise for their job openings, the number of "native" and "nonnative" instructors hired, the countries they come from, and changes noticed in the job market.

Program Administrator Interviews. As mentioned earlier, the analysis of program administrator interviews was identical to the analysis of instructor interviews using content analysis to highlight possible power relations and any forms of dominance, control, or exclusion. The following section will introduce how validity and reliability were achieved and how they were used to tackle any ethical considerations such as bias. A general discussion of both concepts and their equivalent in qualitative research will be presented followed by how to achieve them in quantitative and qualitative research in general, and how they were accomplished in the current research study in specific.

### 3.4.2 Data Validity and Reliability

Creswell and Creswell (2018) explain that "validity does not carry the same connotations in qualitative research that it does in quantitative research; nor is it a companion to reliability (examining stability) or generalizability" (314). In quantitative research, validity means the ability to "[...] draw meaningful and useful inferences from scores on the instruments", and reliability refers to "the consistency or repeatability of an instrument" (Creswell & Creswell, 2018, p.250). In qualitative research, the term validity refers to "[t]he precision in which the findings accurately reflect the data", and reliability means "[t]he consistency of the analytical procedures, including accounting for personal and research method biases that may have influenced the findings (Noble & Smith, 2015, p.34). According to Noble and Smith (2015), the reliability of the data entails "trustworthiness" and means that the same or similar findings will be reached if another researcher conducts the study and follows the same steps and methods. In the current study, using qualitative methods, interpreting what participants mean, and representing their experiences were not easy tasks, as what a story or an idea meant for participants can differ from how the researcher understands and represents it. For this reason, applying different qualitative validity and reliability measures was crucial.

Some of the qualitative validity and reliability measures, which Creswell and Creswell (2018) highlighted, and which were utilized in this research study, were triangulation, detailed description of data and participants' stories, and clarifying bias. Triangulation refers to using "[...] different data sources by examining evidence from the sources and using it to build coherent justification for themes" (Creswell & Creswell, 2018, p.200). It is used by researchers not "[...] as a means of confirming existing data, but as a means of enlarging the landscape of their inquiry, offering a deeper and more

comprehensive picture" (Tobin & Begley, 2004, p.393). In the current study, triangulation was achieved by using different research methods (i.e., interviews, questionnaire, journal reflections, and job ads) and by collecting data from program administrators and instructors. In addition to triangulation, detailed descriptions were offered, and quotes were added from participants' stories to ensure the accuracy of the interpretation of the findings. All these measures were used while using acknowledging the researcher's own bias and personal experience with discrimination and challenges looking for a job in the TESOL job market, and while following a consistent and identical method when analyzing the data.

#### 3.5 Ethical Considerations

Researchers' subjectivity is an important part of qualitative research where the researcher interprets and explains the results based on his/her understanding and based on the participants' understanding. Such subjectivity in interpreting the data requires an attention to and acknowledgement of the researcher's bias. This acknowledgment "[...] creates an open and honest narrative that will resonate well with readers" (Creswell & Creswell, 2018, p.315). It is important to balance the researcher's biases and have the researcher's moral compass and ethics guide the research process.

Bias is a key ethical consideration in this research study, as the researcher's previous experience with discrimination played a role not only in the choice of research topic, but also the contexts chosen for the study. To offer more background information on the incident, the researcher was doing a part-time job in the UAE, and she worked as an English as a Foreign Language (EFL) instructor. After finishing the part-time job, she was offered an administrative position and when she asked about the reason, she was told

that the "clients" were more convinced of instructors' abilities if they are "native" speakers. That is, the organization stressed that not offering her a teaching position was unrelated to her teaching qualifications or experience; it was due to its students' preference for "native" teachers. It is therefore important to acknowledge the researcher's biases, and to be aware of and celebrate them, as this research topic is personal, and bias can never be completely eliminated.

The first way to tackle the researcher's bias was through "work[ing] the hyphen," which means:

[...] creating occasions for researchers and informants to discuss what is, and is not, "happening between" within the negotiated relations of whose story is being told, why, to whom, with what interpretation and whose story is being shadowed, why, for whom, and with what consequences (Fine, 1994, p.72).

The stories being told were an essential aspect of this research study, and when the researcher was "working the hyphen", she needed to manage her relationship with the participants and make sure that she did not "other" some of them or take sides with some participants as opposed to others. All participants in the study were given the chance to tell their stories and make their voices heard.

Furthermore, the researcher needed to watch for bias when developing the interview questions, guiding questions, and prompt for the journal reflections; that is, she needed to ensure that the questions would not lead participants to answering in certain ways. In addition, the researcher needed to be aware of the multiple roles that she played as a researcher while conducting her research. To explain, even if she was not working as an instructor, she was bringing her teaching background and her identity as a "non-native" ESL instructor to the research. These multiple identities or roles required being

reflexive throughout the research process and being mindful that she did not "other" some of the participants – be they instructors or program administrators – or represent them as the "villain" of the story (Hill, 2006).

Discussing the need to accurately represent participants' ideas, Patton (2015) reflected on the role of the researcher in analyzing and interpreting qualitative data and suggested that "[...] the real analytical work takes place in your head." By that, he means that the whole process of data analysis happens in the researcher's mind (p. 531). This realization underlines the importance of being extremely explicit when explaining and representing data to readers as they cannot understand what is going on in the researcher's mind without a clear explanation of the information. The researcher's internal data analysis process requires checking with participants, as they must have gone through a similar process when expressing their ideas; however, the researcher must be mindful that the possibility exists that there is discrepancy between what they said and how the researcher interpreted it. Carcary (2020) refers to how individuals can come to different interpretations of the same information and underlines how using an audit trail and a "reflexive journal" can assist "[...] others to trace through the researcher's logic in arriving at a particular interpretation of the data at a particular point in time and to judge the merits of the qualitative study for themselves" (p.163). Carcary (2020) defined an audit trail as "[...] a record of how a qualitative study was carried out and how conclusions were arrived at by researchers"; she also suggested that following such a process would add to the reliability and validity of the data (p.167). As explained by Carcary (2009), an audit trail can have an intellectual or physical nature:

[a]n intellectual audit trail assists the researcher in reflecting on how his/her thinking evolved throughout all phases of the study. A physical audit trail

documents stages of a research study, from identification of the research problem to development of new theory; and it reflects the key research methodology decisions (p.16).

To achieve the process of maintaining a physical audit trail in the current study, the researcher first identified the research problem and research questions, discussed the related literature review, underlined the theoretical framework, and finally provided a detailed account of the data collected, how it was analyzed, and how the interpretations were arrived at. As for the intellectual audit trail, the researcher clarified her positionality and epistemology, and decision-making process (i.e., choosing specific contexts, research methods, etc.), offered evidence for her interpretations (e.g., quotes), continuously referred to the transcripts and codes to ensure that her interpretations of participant quotes and stories were accurate and clearly contextualized. (See Appendix F for audit trail checklist developed by Carcary (2009)).

The final ethical points that will be discussed in this section involve power relations between researchers and participants and participants' privacy and anonymity. Power relations are part of the research-participant relationship. They are an important part of the relationship because, for it be fruitful for both, it is crucial that the researchers acknowledge having extra power over the participants. This power should be cautiously handled to not cause any harm to the participant. In this study, the power relations were tackled through giving as much space for participants to share their ideas using multiple data collection methods without interfering from the researcher. Finally, to ensure the protection of participants' privacy and anonymity, each participant was given a pseudonym and a master list containing all the personal details (i.e., names, professional roles, and pseudonyms) was stored separately from other study files and data collected.

To sum up, this section offered an overview of how the researcher achieved validity and reliability and how different ethical considerations were dealt with. Such ethical considerations included researcher's bias, interpretation of data, and power relations. Several measures were taken to tackle these ethical aspects and ensure the accurate representation of participants' voices and ideas including triangulation, detailed description of data and participants' stories, clarifying bias, and utilizing an audit trail. These steps ensured a high degree of validity and reliability of the data represented in this study.

## 3.6 Researcher's Positionality and Epistemology

Holmes (2020) underlined how "reflexivity and clarification of one's positionality may [...] be seen as essential aspects of the research process", and he explained that a researcher's positionality highlights how researchers' orientations are affected by the context in which they are and that "they are not separate from the social processes they study" (p.3). The choice of theory and concepts in this study was affected by the researcher's own positionality and epistemology. The researcher considers herself as a critical and social constructivist researcher who aims to create knowledge that is representative of individuals' personal experiences and assist individuals who are discriminated against to find power within themselves; this way of thinking is informed by a personal experience with discrimination which was reflected on earlier. The biased and racist acts which the researcher encountered and which many instructors face not only affect them only but also students, as they may encounter discriminatory ideas from a young age, and which can possibly lead them to believe that these ideas and related beliefs and acts are normal and acceptable. Such discriminatory acts can have long term effects on individuals, whether physically or psychologically, and that is why fighting

against these ideas and concepts is extremely important in all fields in general and in education in particular.

Social justice and reflecting instructors' thoughts and voices were two major aspects of this study; both were best served by social constructivism, as a world view, and Critical Race Theory and intersectionality, as theories. Young and Collin (2004) highlighted that social constructivism is a "sub-variety" of constructivism, and that it has both similarities and differences with social constructionism. Social constructionism "contends that knowledge is sustained by social processes and that knowledge and social action go together", and it focuses on how "[...] knowledge is historically and culturally specific", and how "[...] the focus of inquiry should be on interaction, processes, and social practices" and not merely focus on the individual (pp.376-377). Seen in that light, social constructivism offers both individuals' different worldviews and the effect of the social context where they belong, which were both needed in this study. That is, individuals' views are needed to tell their stories and the social, cultural, and political climates were also needed to frame their stories in the different contexts in which they belong. This paradigm captures individuals' conceptualization and "understanding of the world in which they live and work" (Creswell & Creswell, 2018, p.8).

Merriam and Tisdell (2016) defined constructivism as knowledge that is formed or constructed by the individuals, which entails the presence of multiple realities, as people see and interpret information and situations differently. This idea of multiple realities, individual interpretations, and social, cultural, and political effects were crucial in this study, as: 1. different contexts (the UAE and Canada) were being investigated, and the views of various participants (ESL/EFL instructors, and program administrators) in different roles are being explored; 2) it aligned with the qualitative section of the study's

methodology, which was discussed earlier; 3) the study offered instructors the chance to share their personal and real-life experiences and counter stories which are sometimes buried in the background, and 4) program administrators were also offered the opportunity to share their views and voice their opinions, as there is not sufficient research exploring this aspect of the TESOL job market.

As for the researcher's role as an insider or outsider, the researcher views herself as both. Holmes (2020) highlighted that it is important for novice researchers to underline how they view the insider-outsider role, and whether they view it "[...] as a continuum or a dichotomy" (p.7). In this study, the researcher views the insider-outsider position as a continuum moving along, depending on the situation. To explain, she was an insider given her experience working as an instructor in both countries; however, while conducting research, she was no longer teaching neither was she investigating an educational institute in which she currently or previously worked, so she was an outsider to the institutions investigated. In addition, her background as a female, a Middle Eastern, an Arab, and a Muslim framed her as an insider to the UAE context. Additionally, her status as a permanent resident and a TESL Ontario accredited instructor offered her an insider view in the Canadian context as well. Thus, when the researcher placed herself on the continuum, she was able to freely move between roles, benefiting from both the insider and outsider status and not restricting her to either of them.

In this chapter, a detailed discussion of the methodology chosen and data collection tools was offered. Also, data analysis techniques and measures taken to achieve validity and reliability were discussed. In addition, the ethical considerations pertaining to the current study were shared, while highlighting how they were approached.

Furthermore, the researcher's positionality and epistemology were clarified. In the next

chapter, findings from all data collection tools will be discussed in both the Canadian and Emirate job markets.

# Chapter 4

# 4 Findings

This chapter will highlight the findings and results from the four research methods used in this study (job advertisements, questionnaire, interviews, and journal reflections). The findings from each method in Canada and the UAE will be discussed separately, and they will be followed by a general comparison between both contexts.

#### 4.1 Job Advertisements

A total of 25 job advertisements were collected over the period of three months (March-May 2022), 15 from Canada and 10 from the UAE. The ads were collected mainly from universities' official job portals, indeed, LinkedIn, tesl.ca, jobvite.com, and timeshighereducation.com. Using NVivo, the ads were analyzed using content analysis, which was previously discussed in the data analysis section. Job advertisements from each context, Canada and the UAE, were analyzed separately and codes and sub-codes were created based on the details mentioned in the job ads. After creating the codes and sub-codes, all connected codes were organized into two major themes, 1) professional factors and 2) demographic details; these two themes were adopted from Mahboob and Golden's (2013) study. The codes and sub-codes created differed based on the context, as some ads offered more details or included additional sections that were not present in the other context; however, two main themes were created for both contexts and the codes were included under those themes. The codes for the analyzed job ads are provided under Appendix R.

The first major theme that emerged from coding the job advertisements was professional factors which included the following sub-themes: educational qualifications, years of experiences, and soft skills. The second was demographic details which included

language skills, "nativeness" and "non-nativeness", and visa status. The following table highlights the different factors and the number of recurrences in which they showed in both Canadian and Emirate job ads.

Table 3. Professional and Biographical Factors in Job Advertisements

	Factors	UAE	Canada	Total	
	Education	9	15	24	
Professional	Experience	8	13	21	
	Soft Skills	6	6	12	
	"Nativeness"	6	3	9	
Biographical	Visa	2	0	2	

In the job advertisements, professional factors were the most frequently mentioned, education and educational requirements were the most frequent (n=24), followed by years of experience (n=21), and then soft skills (n=12). The least frequent factors were the biographical ones with the terms "native" or "non-native" mentioned nine times and visa status mentioned twice. The table also underlined differences between both contexts. For example, "nativeness" and "non-nativeness" were mentioned six times in Emirate ads and three times in Canadian ads. Also, visa requirements were not mentioned in any of the Canadian ads compared to being present in two of the Emirate ads. The number of references to soft skills was six in both contexts, which shows a higher focus on soft skills in the UAE's ads in comparison to Canada's ads. The following sections will further explain the results and compare the factors in both contexts.

#### 4.1.1 Job Ads in the UAE

**Professional Qualifications.** The professional qualifications' category included the educational and professional experiences and soft skills that organizations require and/or prefer. Almost all the ads (n=9) highlighted a minimum education requirement with eight ads requiring a masters or a PhD and one ad mentioning that either an MA or a

bachelor's degree is required. Only two of the job ads required receiving equivalency from the Ministry of Education in the UAE, and three ads underlined that having a teaching or training certificate such as CELTA (Certificate in Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages), DELTA (Diploma in English Language Teaching to Adults), PGCE (Postgraduate Certificate in Education), Trinity Dip TESOL (Diploma in Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages), or an additional MA degree or a PhD is considered an advantage. In addition, three of the job ads highlighted the need for evidence of scholarly research and included statements such as "evidence of active research", "evidence of own scholarship", and "active research records and publications".

As for the professional experience, eight of the ten organizations underlined that at least 2-3 years of experience were required, and two ads underlined a bigger range of experience where one required 3-5 years and another 3-10 years. Out of the 10 ads, six specified that the years of experience need to be in tertiary /higher education context. In addition, two of the ads highlighted the need for familiarity and experience with new teaching methodologies and emerging teaching approaches such as project-based learning and blended education.

Looking at the required documents to apply for the different positions, only two out of the ten ads underlined the need for three references and teaching philosophy statements.

Finally, only six of the ads specified the position type, full time, or part time, with three full-time positions, two part-time positions and one that had opportunities for both part-time and full-time positions.

When studying the job ads, it was noticed that six of the organizations underlined various soft skills that the candidate should have and these skills included having leadership, communication, and interpersonal skills, being proactive, engaging in

personal development, and having the ability to work individually and collaboratively, among others. Professional development and being a member of a professional association was seen in two ads. Familiarity with technology and different software was also underlined and five out of the 10 job ads stressed on the importance of familiarity with different software applications such as Blackboard, MS office, and InDesign and having ability to link teaching with technology and the "integration of dynamic classroom technologies".

Demographic Details. Only two of the job ads mentioned visa status and it was for two part-time positions. The universities underlined that the positions are available to those who already have sponsorship and have a valid UAE residency, and one of the ads underlined that the candidate should provide a No Objection Certificate (NOC) from their sponsor. A NOC is a legal document that foreign workers obtain from their previous employer to be able to work for another company in the UAE, and, in this document, the employers mainly state they have no objection to the worker joining a different company.

As for language skills, six out of the 10 ads mentioned job applicants' language skills, requiring excellent oral and written skills and three of the organizations required an IELTS score of eight. One organization underlined that the candidate must be a "native" and another expressed preference for "natives" as well. The terms "native" and "nonnative" were clear in the job ads with five of the 10 organizations highlighting them by either mentioning the term "non-native", which was present in three ads or "native", which was mentioned in two ads. One of the ads highlighted in more than one instance that preference will be given to those with experience in a "North American higher education" and "those who have overseas experience", which can also entail giving preference to "natives" from North America. It was noticed that two of the UAE job ads

included equity and diversity statements; however, one of these ads highlighted that "Native English is preferred" and the other ad underlined that priority will be given to those who have "substantial experience" in American models of higher education stating that "English is the language of instruction and the workplace".

#### 4.1.2 Job Ads in Canada

The themes that emerged in the Canadian job ads were like those in the UAE with inclusivity being one of the prevalent themes in the Canadian context.

**Professional Qualifications.** The professional requirements in the job ads included educational requirements, years of experience, and soft skills. Out of the 15 ads, five of the organizations required an MA in a related field with one underlining an inprogress or completed MA; the remaining ads noted that a BA in a related field is sufficient. Ten ads mentioned certificates such as TESL Ontario, TESL Canada, or equivalent certificates and eight of them included them as a requirement. Out of the 15 ads, 12 specified having experience in teaching English for Academic Purposes (EAP) or ESL, teaching at the college or graduate levels, and/or teaching international or multilingual students. Teaching methodologies were only mentioned in one job ad, where multiple approaches were mentioned including communicative, task-based, and lexical approaches. Looking at the required documents to apply for the different positions, only three ads underlined the need for 3 references and teaching philosophy statements and/or a letter of intent. Finally, Twelve out of the 15 ads specified the position type, full time, or part time, with five full-time positions, two sessional positions, three part time positions, and two that had opportunities for both part-time and full-time positions.

As for the years of experience, 13 ads required a specific number of years of experience ranging between 1 to 5 years; over half of the organizations underlined having

two years of experience as the minimum requirement in the same or a similar role, working in a university setting, and/or teaching international students. Four ads underlined having Canadian or international experience; two ads indicated the need to have teaching experience in Canada; one indicated the need for prior experience teaching in Canada or internationally, and one underlined the need to have experienced "learning and teaching English as a non-native speaker". Only one of the ads underlined evidence of scholarly work, and another ad mentioned being "proactive about own development" as a requirement.

Seven of the 15 ads highlighted various soft skills that the applicants should have including leadership and communication skills, the ability to work in a team, and interest in promoting inclusive learning and teaching environments, among others. Digital literacy was one of the main skills highlighted in the job ads, as well as familiarity with different programs (e.g., MS Office, Zoom, Google Workspace, Learning Management System, and Customer Relationship Management). Seven ads underlined the need for digital literacy, and experience with online and hybrid lesson delivery were also indicated.

Inclusivity was one of the noticed themes in Canadian ads where equity and accessibility statements were present; five ads included an accessibility statement and seven if them included an equity statement. Five ads highlighted cultural awareness and sensitivity, with some of them underlining the need for candidates to have prior experience teaching students from different linguistic and cultural backgrounds as well as knowledge about different cultures.

Demographic Details. In nine of the ads, the need for excellent communication skills, and/or excellent oral and written skills was mentioned, and one ad stressed the need to have "native-like" fluency. The terms "native" and "non-native" were only mentioned

in two ads. One mention was related to the applicants' language fluency, and the other related to candidates' teaching or learning experiences. Neither the type of Visa nor the residency status was mentioned in any of the advertisements.

To sum up, after exploring the different themes that emerged from the job ad analysis, various similarities and differences were noticed. First, the use of the terms "native" and "non-native" was more frequent in UAE's ads than in the Canadian ads. Also, the notion of degree equivalency was present in both contexts; however, it was clearly stated in the Emirate context compared to the use of TESL certification in the Canadian ads. Inclusivity was one of the common themes between Canadian ads and a somewhat emerging theme for Emirate ads; namely, two ads in the UAE included equity and inclusivity statements, and seven Canadian ads included either one or both statements. The use of the terms "native" and "non-native" in the Emirate ads contradicted the emergent equity and inclusivity statements, as the use of these terms was present in half of the UAE's ads referring to the candidates' language proficiency. However, in Canadian ads, they were only used twice, with one of them referring to learners and one related to job applicants. "Near-native" proficiency was used once as well. Also, educational requirements were more demanding in the UAE compared to Canada. Nonetheless, half of the Canadian ads required Canadian certification such as TESL Ontario or TESL Canada compared to teaching certification in the UAE being described as additional or desirable.

## 4.2 Instructors' Questionnaires Results

Instructors in Canada and the UAE were given an online questionnaire discussing several points such as their teaching position/title, role in recruitment (if any), the English programs they taught in, the employment criteria they viewed as important, and changes

in the job market, etc. A total of eight responses were collected: three in the Emirate context, and five in the Canadian context. These responses were collected from some of the instructor participants who took part in the interviews and journal reflections and who were recruited through the researcher's personal connections in addition to recruitment ads posted on TESL Ontario, TESL Canada, an myTESOL.

### **4.2.1** Emirate Questionnaire Results

In the UAE, the results showed that the participants held different positions (e.g., ESL, IELTS and EAP instructors, or faculty members). One participant worked in a university that offered Foundation, Bridge, and Preparatory programs, and the other two worked in ESL programs. Of the latter, only one participant had any responsibility for recruiting instructors. The participants indicated that the organizations that they worked for offered different courses ranging from graduate and undergraduate English courses to general English, EAP, Business English, and study skills.

As for the number of students taught, the participants indicated numbers ranging from 500-1700. One participant indicated that s/he was unsure of the current student enrolment, but noted, "[t]he number has since been declining due to changes in course delivery and funding". Concerning where the Emirate universities recruit their students, the participants listed different countries including the Sudan, Lebanon, Seychelles, Eritrea, and Jordan. One of the participants highlighted that his/her organization "has now begun to bring in students from other countries such as Asia (South Korea, India) and places in Europe with a few students from countries such as Spain and Italy". Participants were also asked about the number of instructors at their organizations. Numbers ranged between 25-50, and one of the participants mentioned that in 2005 there were 200

instructors in the organization, but that number had since decreased to 50; however, the participant did not state the reason for such decline in instructors' numbers.

Participants were asked different questions related to recruitment, the job market, instructors' salaries, and the most important hiring criteria. They commented that their organizations used the following websites to post their job vacancies: HigherEdJobs (<a href="www.higheredjobs.com">www.higheredjobs.com</a>), TESOL International Association Career Centre, Gulf Jobs, and the universities' own websites. When discussing the most important hiring criteria, the participants mentioned multiple criteria, and ranked them from 'not applicable' (NA) to 'very important.' The following table displays the results.

Table 4. Ranking of Hiring Criteria in the UAE

#	Question	Not Applicable	Not Important	Relatively important	Somewhat important	Moderately important	Very Important	Total
1	Teaching Qualifications	0	0	0	0	0	3	3
2	Teaching Experience	0	0	0	0	2	1	3
3	Teaching Demonstration	1	2	0	0	0	0	3
4	Performance in Interview	0	0	0	0	2	1	3
5	Application Material e.g., sample lesson plan	1	1	0	0	1	0	3
6	Educational Background	0	0	0	0	2	1	3
7	Recommendation	0	1	0	1	1	0	3
8	Visa Status	1	0	0	2	0	0	3
9	Native English Speaker	0	0	1	0	1	1	3
10	Accent (British, American, etc.)	1	1	0	0	1	0	3
11	Nationality	0	1	0	1	0	1	3

Participants identified teaching qualifications, teaching experience, performance in the interview, and educational background as the most important criteria. All three participants agreed that teaching qualifications were very important. They ranked teaching experience, performance during their interviews, and educational backgrounds between moderately important and very important; two out of the three participants ranked them as moderately important, and one ranked them as very important. For the rest of the items, the participants' answers varied. For example, application material was viewed by one participant as not applicable, by another as not important, and by the third participant as moderately important. Recommendations were seen by one participant as not important, and by the two other participants as either somewhat important or moderately important. One of the participants viewed visa status as not applicable while two viewed it as somewhat important. Native speakerism was ranked as relatively important by one of the three participants, moderately important by the second participant and very important by the third. As for "accent", two out of the three participants regarded it as not applicable and not important, and one regarded it as moderately important. Finally, participants disagreed on the importance of nationality among the other hiring criteria; one ranked it as not important, another as somewhat important, and the third as very important.

When participants were asked about the different professional development (PD) opportunities for the pre-service and in-service instructors, they were given the choice to pick more than one option. Two of the three participants mentioned in-service training seminars, one mentioned peer-observation (observing other instructors), and one mentioned other forms of professional development. In terms of how to monitor instructors, they suggested student evaluations and teacher observations with three

mentioning student evaluations, and one mentioning teacher observations. Regarding salaries and benefits, one of the instructors observed that instructor salaries depend on the highest educational degree they have (MA, PhD, etc.), and three of them chose "other" underlining that salary and benefits differed based on the job title, citizenship, whether instructors were UAE nationals or non-nationals, and one participant mentioned that it was "not clear at this university" how salaries were determined. When asked about who received the highest salary among instructors, two participants reported that Emirate citizens received the highest salaries, and two indicated that "native" expatriates received the highest salaries.

The job market in the UAE was also discussed, and all the participants agreed that the job market has changed. Two indicated that it had changed during the past five years, and one mentioned noticing a change during the past year. All the participants agreed on one change; namely, the change in demand for English instructors (either increase or decrease in numbers), and two answers were given to job requirements and teacher qualifications, benefits and salaries, and demand for teachers from inner circle countries. Only one participant mentioned noticing changes related language proficiency requirements, and another referred to the change in phraseology of the job advertisements, noting that "[t]hey don't clearly say "Native", they say "high school from US, Canada, etc." Another point related to job ads was when participants were asked about the requirements posted in job ads, they mentioned overseas experience and "[l]evel of education and where [the country granting the degree], TESL certification, international teaching experience, IT experience, range of skills". Finally, when instructors were queried about students' preferences for instructors, one participant mentioned a preference for males or females "due to cultural sensitivity and student age

group." The other two participants suggested that students' preferences are related to "nativeness", an instructor's "accent" (specifically referring to an American accent), nationality, understanding of the local culture, and being multilingual.

## 4.2.2 Canadian Questionnaire Results

In the Canadian context, five instructors participated in the online questionnaire. They worked as ESL or EAP instructors, teaching assistants in different programs, three worked in University (Preparatory Program, Pathway Program, etc.), one in an ESL program at a university, and another in an EAP program at a college. As for the courses that were offered at their organizations, three instructors stated that the institution offered EAP courses, one mentioned that the organization offered Undergraduate/Graduate English courses, and the other indicated that the institute offered English for General and professional purposes. The instructors were asked about the number of students at their organizations and the numbers varied ranging from 100-10,000. They noted that students came from many countries, including the following: China, Mexico, Turkey, Korea, Iran, India, Colombia, Japan, Vietnam, Angola, Ukraine, Iran, Brazil, Thailand, and Angola. China was the only country in common in all participants' answers. In addition, when participants were asked about the characteristics students prefer in their instructors, characteristics mentioned included "nativeness", nationality, being of a specific gender, experience, and the support they would offer to students. Two of the five participants referred to the "nativeness" aspect, and another participant mentioned that "[s]tudents sometimes care about nationality and sometimes they prefer female teachers." Another participant referred to instructors' experience, command of the subject, and "support at different stages, understanding of their external factors".

When queried about the number of instructors at their organization, participants' answers varied from six to 100 instructors. As for which category represents most instructors in their institution, three instructors indicated that "natives" represented the majority with two answers for female "natives" and one for male "natives." Another participant stated that female "non-natives" represented the majority, and one instructor preferred not to offer an answer.

When asked, all five participants underlined that they did not share responsibility in recruiting instructors at their organizations, underling that their institutes used LinkedIn, indeed, and the universities' own job portal to advertise for jobs. As for ranking the importance of the different hiring criteria, the following table shows the participants' answers.

Table 5. Ranking of Hiring Criteria in Canada

#	Question	Not Applicable	Not Important	Relatively Important	Somewhat Important	Moderately Important	Very Important	Total
1	Teaching Qualifications	0	0	0	0	1	3	4
2	Teaching Experience	0	0	0	0	1	3	4
3	Teaching Demonstration	0	1	0	1	2	0	4
4	Performance in Interview	0	0	0	1	3	0	4
5	Application Material e.g., sample lesson plan	0	2	0	1	0	1	4
6	Educational Background	0	0	0	0	2	2	4
7	Recommendation	0	0	1	1	0	2	4
8	Visa Status	0	0	0	0	4	0	4
9	Native English Speaker	0	2	1	1	0	0	4
10	Accent (British,	0	2	0	1	1	0	4

	American, etc.)							
11	Nationality	0	4	0	0	0	0	4

Participants ranked the different hiring criteria from not applicable (NA) to very important and only four of the five participants provided answers for this question. Furthermore, teaching qualifications, teaching experience, educational background, and visa status were viewed by participants as important criteria. All four participants agreed on visa status being moderately important, and on nationality as not being important. Also, three of the four participants rated teaching experience and teaching qualifications as very important, and one rated them as moderately important. Answers for educational background was split in half between very important and moderately important. Teaching demonstration was viewed by one participant as not important; another rated it as somewhat important, and two stated that it was moderately important. Interview performances were rated by three of the participants as moderately important, and by one participant as somewhat important. Half the participants ranked application material as not important, one viewed it as somewhat important, and another viewed it as very important. A recommendation was regarded as an important criterion with half the participants indicating that it is very important, and the rest of the answers were divided equally between somewhat important and relatively important. Being a "native" speaker was viewed as not important by half of the participants; however, one of the participants indicated that it was relatively important, and another regarded it as somewhat important. Finally, "accent" was also rated as not important by half of the participants, and the other half was divided between somewhat important and moderately important.

Instructors were also asked about the availability of professional development opportunities. They replied that initial training, in-service training seminars, peer observations, and training offered through other universities were some of the options available. Among the methods used for monitoring instructors, student evaluations and teacher observations were mentioned by four of five the questionnaire participants. One participant indicated that a mix of both was used: "mostly student evaluations, if they don't come out as expected, they will be followed by observations." Instructors were then asked about what determines the salary received and four of the participants indicated that salaries were dependent on the highest educational degree obtained (MA, PhD). Three answers were given to years of teaching experience working at the organization, one answer was given to Native speakerism and another for the "Other" option; however, the participant did not state what s/he referred to. When discussing what which instructors receive the highest salaries, two of the answers were given to citizens/permanent citizens (natives); however, four of the participants explained that citizenship and "nativeness" do not affect salaries. Also, one participant highlighted that s/he is not aware if there are any differences, as they had no knowledge of other instructors' salaries.

There were several questions related to the job market and changes that participants had noticed. Four of the five participants indicated that they had noticed changes. One participant mentioned that s/he had noticed changes over the past two years, and three of them had noticed changes in the past five years. The participants noticed changes related to the demand for instructors, job requirements and instructors' qualifications, and benefits and salaries, and one participant underlined that there is a "demand for online teaching and less demand to work from inside the country." There answers were given to demand for ESL/EFL teachers (Either increase or decrease in

numbers), followed by two answers for salaries and benefits, and one answer for job requirements and teachers' qualifications. One participant answered "Other"; however, s/he did not indicate the specific change being referred to.

When discussing the job requirements mentioned in the job advertisement, participants highlighted experience, certification, and educational requirements, teaching experience, "nativeness", and soft skills. As for certification and credentials, participants referred to having a TESL certificate, master's degree, or receiving qualifications from an inner circle country. In addition, one participant referred to native speakerism while others mentioned communication skills and work ethics.

In conclusion, when comparing the results in both contexts, several similarities can be seen related to the hiring criteria and changes in the job market. Teaching qualifications, teaching experience, and educational background were viewed in both context as the most important hiring criteria, and demand for instructors, job requirements and instructors' qualifications, and benefits and salaries were among the most noticed changes in the job market. Some of the differences highlighted were related to (a) "nativeness" being viewed as relatively more important in the Emirate context compared to Canada, and (b) the bigger diversity of students in Canada who come from multiple countries such as China, Mexico, Turkey, Korea, Iran, India, Colombia, Japan, Vietnam, Angola, Ukraine, Iran, Brazil, Thailand, and Angola.

# 4.3 Journal Reflections

Five journal reflections were collected. These included three from instructors with Canadian experience, and two from instructors with experience both in Canada and the UAE. The same process used when analyzing the job advertisements was followed when analyzing the journal reflections, which were coded by the researcher using NVivo and

codes were then merged under different major themes. The journal reflections from each context were analyzed and coded separately and then a comparison was done between the findings reached. The codes found in the Canadian journal reflections differed from those in the Emirate ones, as the codes were created based on the information offered by each instructor participant and the degree of details offered. The codes in the Canadian context were grouped under two major themes, TESL certification requirement imposed on instructors, and the different challenges faced on the job market. In the Emirate context, the codes were groups under three major themes, job experience, gatekeepers, and job requirements, and comparisons were drawn between the Emirate and Canadian job market, as the two instructors who completed the journal reflections had experience in both Canada and the UAE. The journal reflections in the Emirate context were more detailed compared to the Canadian ones, which were short and generally focused on one incident. The journal reflections' codes are offered under Appendix R.

#### 4.3.1 Instructors' Reflections in the UAE

When analyzing the journal reflections, three themes emerged comparing both the Canadian and Emirate contexts in relation to job experience, gatekeepers, and job requirements. In her journal reflection, Hanie reflected on how she decided to return to Canada after working in the UAE for more than 15 years. Her decision was due to family obligations and her children getting older. However, when she returned to Canada, she encountered various challenges in finding a job (e.g., needing a TESL Canada certificate despite having two master's degrees, and many years of experience). She described her job-hunting experience in Canada stating,

[o]nce I began my job search [...] my positivity soon began to fade. I soon learned that institutions would not hire me unless I had a TESL certificate; regardless of

my experience, two master's degrees, and a Canadian TESL certificate from 1997, but with an institution that no longer exists.

Due to the challenges imposed on her by the job market, she mentioned having different alternatives to working in Canada (e.g., teaching Chinese university students online, which offered her the opportunity to teach many classes while staying at home with her family). The second option she considered was returning to the UAE "[...] where salaries and benefits are higher, my skills and experience in ESL and blended learning may be valued more, and opportunities are greater, although much less than 16 years ago." Also, Hanie reflected on the effect of Covid 19, and why she was skeptical of the statistics concerning the decrease of unemployment percentages. She commented on how it must be challenging for individuals to survive, and how difficult it must be for them to work multiple jobs only to make ends meet. She ended her reflection by underlining the different challenges she had met in the Canadian job market, she stated: "[...] I wonder how many people are actually receiving healthcare coverage and decent salaries [...]?"

In Nader's journal reflection, he compared the Emirate and Canadian job markets, and underlined several advantages and gatekeeping strategies in both countries. In the UAE, he underlined how governmental jobs have "[...] to be advertised through a means that is open to the public," which guarantees fairness and reduces nepotism. He added that these jobs have clear criteria "that are objective and can be checked or measured objectively," and that such criteria reduced corruption. He explained that the process was also "swift", and that salaries were fixed, so "[t]here was no room for tampering the salary grid". As for Canada, the advantages he mentioned included clear hiring criteria, a friendly work environment, and a "relaxed interview atmosphere (something lacking in many parts of the world)"; however, he underlined different issues with the employment

process. These challenges included how slow the hiring process was compared to in the UAE, pointing to the use of certain vague criteria such as "to demonstrate the ability of being a valued member of our institution," which he described as being subjective. He explained how:

[t]hese subjective criteria mean one thing only; that is, it all depends on how well you can sell yourself in the interviewing phase. This disregards how well-educated a person is or how many years of experience he has. Sometimes I think, they need a salesperson, not a teacher.

Nader also pointed to the presence of different gatekeepers in both contexts underlining that, in the UAE, nationality was used to exclude candidates who were not "native" speakers of English. He further explained how "[t]his of course was rooted in the false assumption that anyone who holds a mere passport of those countries was by default an excellent teacher of that language." He added that despite this criterion dismissing many qualified candidates, it was directly stated -- even if it is "perceived by some people - like me - as unfair". In Canada, he pointed to three main issues: "Canadian experience, the internal hiring, and [...] gender equality." He stressed that many qualified professionals "have been kept out of the job market just for being newcomers to Canada," in contradiction to the immigration system, which selected these individuals because of their qualifications and experience. He then pointed to the process of hiring internally, and how this means that some jobs are not available to the public. He elaborated by saying that "[t]his move has its logic - which I agree with to some degree - but, at the same time, it means that whoever is out will stay out. It doesn't seem fair." The final gatekeeper, which he described as "problematic" and "fiercely controversial," was gender equality. He mentioned that some organizations underline that women will be given

priority for teaching positions, and how these organizations disregard the statics about the presence of bigger numbers of women than men working as teachers and professors. He underlined that:

[t]his issue has been an arena for controversy and many male voices have been either neglected, ridiculed, or dismissed under the ready-made accusation of misogyny. So, a male teacher can be discriminated against in one country based on his nationality, and in another country based on his gender.

In this quote, Nader stressed not only on the presence of different gatekeepers in the job market but also how these obstacles differ from one context to the other. He reflected on how discrimination was the result for him, a male instructor, in either context.

## 4.3.2 Instructors' Reflections in Canada

Instructors in Canada highlighted two major themes in their journal reflections: (a) the TESL certification requirement imposed on instructors, and (b) the different challenges faced on the job market. One of the instructors, Atefeh, who used to work internationally and recently moved to Canada, underlined her frustrations when she was searching for a job. She stressed on how essential it is to have a TESL Canada or TESL Ontario certificate, despite having many years of international experience. Another participant, Nouri, described the certification process as "extremely intensive," noting that he "[...] had to do too much preparation for the classes, pass several written exams, and perform four teaching demos".

When reflecting on the job market, participants underlined several challenges such as underpayment, job precarity, a lack of stability, and exploitation of instructors. Atefeh mentioned that ESL instructors are "underpaid and not appreciated in Canada," and that "there aren't any full-time positions," which led her to "[...] think of leaving this field at

times and training for a different market." She finally stated that schools and educational institutes should "stop taking advantage of ESL teachers and offer better pay and stability." In the same vein, Nouri reflected on the predatory nature of some ESL institutions who advertise for certificates or programs with an end goal of being employed by the organization. He referred to his personal experience with a TESL program that was expensive, time-consuming, and intensive in nature and in which he was promised a job; however, in the end, he never received it. He added that there are many similar organizations that exploit instructors' need for jobs. Also, he described the interview he participated in as "a fake and dishonest prefabricated scenario to reject applicants who took part in the certificate program in the hope of getting the job", and he stressed that he "[...] realized that this is a money-making strategy not for this school but also for many others across Canada." Other participants had different experiences with certification, and they did not refer to any employment promises, which is possibly due to receiving their certification from well-known and accredited organizations (TESL Ontario, TESL Canada, etc.).

Other concerns and challenges were shared by Liam who reflected on the precarity of teaching positions and financial struggles. He expressed his frustration at being a contract instructor, and how he was viewed as "[...] an outcast as compared to full-fledged academic faculty members." He added that the nature of his international students added to his frustration where academics were not the priority for them, as they were more interested in "shopping, dining out, traveling across Canada, or anything but studies"; however, he stressed that he hopes his hard work will ultimately be recognized and compensated on the job market, stating "I was generally reassured (or at least I would

reassure myself) that the job market would adjudicate the work and study ethics of folks like them vs. hard-working folks like myself."

Instructors' journal reflections underscored the different challenges they encountered on the Canadian job market and in connection to the required TESL certification, which disregarded the international teaching qualifications, educational background, and teaching experience that instructors brought. In addition, despite being highly qualified, instructors pointed to the difficulties they experienced in finding full-time jobs and not being compensated fairly. Such challenges and pressure forced some instructors to consider leaving the TESOL field or leaving Canada in pursuit of a better-paying teaching job.

In conclusion, in their journal reflections, instructors highlighted several gatekeepers encountered in the Canadian and Emirate job markets, and they reflected on the multiple struggles they faced due to their "non-nativeness" and nationality in the UAE, and TESL certification, low salaries, the precarity of jobs, and unfair hiring practices in Canada. The instructors also compared both job markets and referred to different advantages to working in one or the other context (e.g., the friendly, relaxed interview process and clear hiring criteria in Canada compared to the quick employment process, fixed salaries, and high rate of compensation in the UAE).

# 4.4 Instructors' Interviews

A total of 10 instructors were interviewed: three in the UAE, and seven in Canada. Their experiences were primarily in higher education although some instructors had mixed experiences in both higher education and K-12. Some of the courses they taught (and still teach) included ESL, EFL, writing, English for Specific Purposes, English for Military Purposes, IELTS, and TOEFL among others. The same process used when

analyzing the job advertisements and journal reflections was followed when analyzing the instructors' and program administrators interviews, where the data was uploaded on NVivo and the researcher created codes, which were then merged under different major themes. The interviews from each context were analyzed and coded separately and then a comparison was done between the findings reached. The interviews' codes are offered under Appendix R.

# 4.4.1 Instructors in the UAE

*Instructors' Background.* In the Emirate context, the instructors had taught EFL, EAP, ESP, IETLS and other courses for between four to 16 years. All of them had international teaching experience, and two had taught in both the UAE and Canada. When asked about their educational backgrounds, all three instructors mentioned they had at least a Masters' degree and two of them had PhDs, one of them is currently pursuing his PhD. In addition, two of them underlined having either a CELTA or TESL Canada certification. Their student populations were undergraduate students aiming to improve their language skills by taking ESP, ESL, or English for military purposes, and different writing courses. Nader was the first to start working in the UAE, and he started in 2001 and continued to work there until 2012. The second instructor was Hanie, and she worked in the UAE between 2005 and 2021. Finally, the third instructor was Reda, and he worked between 2011 and 2015. Several themes were highlighted during the interviews such as reasons for leaving the UAE, gatekeeping in the Emirate and Canadian job markets, qualifications listed in job advertisements, and changes and challenges in the job market, among others, and the following section will highlight the main themes discussed.

Reasons for Leaving the UAE. One of the themes that the instructors underlined was the reason for relocating from the UAE to a different country; two of the instructors Nader and Hanie, moved to Canada, while Reda moved to Australia. The participants highlighted two main reasons for leaving the UAE which were family commitments and pursuing higher education. Hanie underlined that moving back to Canada after working in the UAE for 16 years was due to family commitments and her children getting older. As for Nader, he had multiple reasons including financial cost of enrolling his children in private schools in the UAE, desire to teach older students and gain more experience teaching adults, as part of his experience was with children, and finally pursuing graduate studies in Canada. Reda had similar goals highlighting that he wanted to follow his dream of getting a PhD and upscaling his skills, and he added that one of his aims was to "[...] be able to write [...] full research, to be specialized in one area", as his masters' degree was course-based and not research-based.

Hiring Process and Employability. Reflecting on the hiring process and employability in both the UAE and Canada, two of the three interviewees reflected on the concept of gatekeeping based on nationality, certification, and country-specific experience, among others. Hanie mentioned that when she was first hired in 2005, having certain nationalities' affected instructors' employability explaining that "it does matter where you're from [...], your passport"; nevertheless, she stated: "I think that now has also changed a little bit". Compared to the UAE, where the gatekeeper was nationality, Nader reflected on the Canadian context and how Canadian experience is used to limit instructors' employment opportunities. He added that requiring Canadian experience is a "subtle way of saying we [employers] don't accept new people to the country to work here". He elaborated on how requiring knowledge of Canadian specific platforms is

another way of gatekeeping, especially when "these platforms are used [...] in only small proportion of the companies here [...] in Canada", and how it is a sign that they are "looking at their own people". As for Hanie, she reflected on her own experience in the job market after shifting from the UAE to Canada and she stated that "[i]f you did not have a TESL certificate, you were not even contacted". She explained that despite having two MA degrees and many years of experience, not having a TESL certificate greatly affected her employability. She added that in addition to the job market being very competitive, instructors go through a rigorous employment process, interviews, and demonstration, and receive low salary.

Job Advertisements. When instructors were asked about the qualifications and experience that they would include in a job advertisement for an English instructor position in the UAE, they mentioned different points, and they also highlighted several qualities that make instructor candidates more competitive in the job market. Reda and Nader underscored that qualifications and experiences would differ based on the type of courses taught and students' population. For example, Reda stated:

[i]f I teach things in general, you need to [a] master[s] [...], you don't need like a doctor[ate], unless you want to go deep, teaching courses, phonetics, phonology, applied socio, and discourse analysis. So, it depends like what type of courses you want an instructor to teach".

Hanie also referred to the importance of experience, and she added that awareness of the culture is essential underlining that "[...] one of the first things that they [recruiters] were talking to us about was the culture in the UAE and the regulations and what you can and cannot do". In addition to having the experience and qualifications to teach and cultural awareness, instructors underscored other skills such as adaptability to change, comfort

with technology, conducting research, being organized, having confidence, having empathy, and knowledge of the subject taught. A final point that Hanie discussed, and which was specific to Canada, was having TESL certification, and she described it as an absolute requirement. Certification will be further elaborated on in the section dedicated for instructors' interviews in Canada.

Changes in the Job Market. Changes in the job market were one of the themes that instructors were asked about, and they mentioned noticing different changes over the years in the UAE. Reda referred to technology and how teaching has become highly dependent on it compared to previous years, especially due to Covid-19. Nader, on the other hand, pointed to the gradual change he noticed related to the use of the term "native" in the job ads, stressing on how previously employers directly stated in their ads that they require applicants to be "native" English speakers from specific inner circle countries. In later years, he noticed that employers "[...] didn't mention the countries specifically, but they mentioned criteria [that] is the impossible [...] to satisfy unless you are from these [countries]. For example, employers saying that they "[...] would accept anyone that got their high school from England". Also, the most recent change regarding using the "native" term was switching to the term "native-like", which he referred to as "kind of fair", and he underscored that it is a change in the right direction, where

Hanie discussed different changes that she noticed over the period of her employment highlighting that degree equivalency became mandatory in the UAE, and she underlined that this shift started 4-5 years ago. She added that when she started working in the UAE, employers required an MA; however, now " [...] they're looking for other qualifications, like experience and technology, online, blended [teaching experience].

Now, they're asking preference for a PhD or a second masters. So obviously, the standards have gone up, but the salary has come down". Reflecting on the added requirement of having extra qualifications, she stated that "[s]ometimes I don't know if it's because of actual experience and knowledge, or if it's just simply because it's saturated; there's just so many people that [...] can be employed". She added that the low payment and the added educational qualifications are shared changes for both the Emirate and Canadian job markets. Hanie also referred to globalization and the economic situation, and how some changes could be due to funding, especially in the organization in which she used to work in the UAE, and which was funded by the government. She also explained that there is a decrease in hiring instructors which could be due to outsourcing. When asked if Emiratization (localization), previously discussed in the literature, she highlighted that "[...] it's affected them more on the higher admin side, rather than actual teachers in the classroom". Finally, Hanie underscored how requiring the equivalency in the UAE is "exactly the same" as requiring TESL certification in Canada, and she referred to how it is universities' way "to see what you had and if you've met the standards".

Shifting From Teaching to Administration. When asked about possible reasons that lead instructors to shift to admin positions, instructors mentioned different points such as financial reasons, added experience, workload, and professional development. Reda highlighted that teaching is a difficult job, as instructors must deal with students from diverse backgrounds. He added that he is currently doing an admin role, not related to teaching, as he wanted to explore new areas, and he will later return to academia. In addition, he underlined that administrative opportunities are not as limited as academic jobs and that individuals working in administration are always needed. In Hanie's

opinion, some instructors leave teaching, as it sometimes involves heavy workloads and because "originally there was a bit more pay for admin positions". However, based on her experience from the UAE, now admin positions pay the same as teaching, and instructors use these opportunities as a professional development opportunity and to gain management experience, as "everybody knows in the UAE that eventually you have to go back home".

**Defining "Nativeness".** Instructors were asked to reflect on what the term "native" English speaker means to them and if they believe that instructors' English language skills are evaluated directly or indirectly when applying for English teaching jobs. Instructors did not offer a direct definition for the term, underlining that it has several definitions and they mainly reflected on the presence of the term in job advertisements, benefits of instructors who speak English as an additional language, and what recruiters/employers search for in instructors when it comes to their language skills. Nader emphasized how it is fair for recruiters to search for English instructors who are competent in the language; however, the use of the term "native" and "native-like" is not fair and the focus should be on language competency and skills not on "nativeness". He added that even though the use of native-like is an improvement, it has "the shadow of the native", and "[...] hopefully, in the coming years that they will drop the word native and focus only on the language abilities". Reda reflected on how the term "native" has multiple definitions underling that it can be a person who only speaks one language, which represents his mother tongue. He also explained that it may be related to "accent". However, having an "accent' does not mean an individual is not a "native" speaker of English, emphasizing how no one owns the language. To further clarify his point related to "accent", he referred to the richness and variability in "accents" both in Arabic and

English-speaking countries. Finally, Hanie underlined how employers define "nativeness" in terms of fluency, grammar, and vocabulary levels, and even "accent", elaborating on how evaluating an applicant's "accent" is unfair.

Evaluation of Language Skills. As for direct or indirect evaluation of instructors' language skills, Nader and Reda underlined that instructors' language skills are being evaluated; however, Hanie mentioned that it is more about teaching skills than language skills. Reda stated that instructors need to speak clearly and intelligibly as their language skills are evaluated during the interview. Also, Nader explained that when recruiters/universities notice that candidates have qualifications from non-English speaking countries, they would ask for TOEFL or IELTS results, which connects to what Reda mentioned in relation to preference for graduates from Western universities. However, Nader stated, "I see the logic in asking [...] to provide TOEFL or IELTS certificates", as employers

[...] can't guarantee that every university on the in the world is good enough to
[...] issue certificates for English teachers; sometimes, in some countries, they
need teachers, so they give the people's certificates, and they lower their criteria a
little bit, just to get like graduates going.

He then gave an example of what happened in Canada during Covid with the fast-track system of nursing students, which happened due to the need for more nurses during the pandemic. On the other hand, Hanie highlighted that what matters the most during the interview is having "a clear goal in your lesson plan, you know the methodologies that you're implementing, the kind of tasks that you use", and she underlined that that the focus will only shift to language if "something sticks out [...] that's not accurate".

ESL/EFL Students. Another theme that emerged during the interviews with instructors was related to students and it contained four sub-themes, instructors' role towards their students, students' perspective of the model English instructor, differences between students in the Emirate and Canadian contexts, and students' biases against instructors. When reflecting on instructors' role towards students, Reda highlighted the importance of offering students' a supportive learning environment that prepares them for success. He added on how such environment can be created through research and involving students in research projects. Also, he emphasized how an instructors' role goes beyond teaching a class and then going home adding that investing in students should help them have better futures.

As for students' expectations, Nader referred to students' expectations to be taught by a "native" speaker, and he elaborated on how he faced a similar situation as a student in another Middle Eastern country, where his colleagues were expecting to be taught by a British instructor and not one who shared their background. He highlighted however that such attitudes and expectations differ based on the context and whether the students are from a rural or metropolitan area. He elaborated on how "in metropolitan cities, [...] the amount of tolerance and acceptance is more, so when you work [...] in a big city, people expect differences. [...] they [don't] really show much rejection to differences". In the same vein, Reda spoke about how students might judge instructors who speak English as an additional language stating "[...] we still make mistakes, like even native speakers make mistakes, in Arabic we make mistakes"; however, that does not mean that "we are not professional". In addition, he highlighted the advantages of instructors who speak an additional language, have been through the process of learning a new language, and "understand the needs of the students more than the native speakers themselves". He

added that students want their instructors to be understanding and flexible; however, he pointed to the importance of setting boundaries and being serious. Finally, Hanie also spoke about the idea of being understanding, and she added that students want instructors who cater to their individual needs and offer them support; instructors who are sympathetic and understanding of their cultures.

The final sub-theme that was discussed in relation to students was the differences between students in the UAE and Canada, and Hanie mentioned several of them since she had experience teaching in higher education in both contexts. The first point that she discussed was the sense of independency Canadian students have, and their awareness that "they're gonna have to go and get jobs in their own". However, in the UAE, students are family-oriented and financially depend on their family, highlighting that, in the two contexts, "the pressures are different". The second difference Hanie mentioned was related to the distinction between male and female students in the Emirate context, and how their families have different expectations of them. She added that Emirate women have different goals with some desiring a sense of independence and are highly motivated compared to others who are more focused on getting married and starting families.

Finally, she explained that, in the UAE, instructors are expected to be understanding and offer individual support to each student; however, in Canada, "individual students [...] may need help, but [...] it may not be as much as students may need there".

Offering Advice. A final point that instructors were asked about was advice to instructors planning to work in the UAE, and they referred to multiple points including understanding and awareness of students' needs and language level, awareness of the culture, importance of professional development and conducting research, and pursuing teaching certification, among others. Nader highlighted the importance of having a

reflective practice and analyzing what activities were successful and which were not. Also, he added that instructors should "[...] find which certificates people look up to like, for example, the CELTA is very common in our field". Hanie, on the other hand, underlined that instructors should "be ready for the culture there [in the UAE], the attitudes are different, their [students'] long-term goals are different" and emphasized the importance of being aware of curriculum development and different learning management systems. As for Reda, he emphasized the importance of involving students in research, and he gave an additional tip to instructors in the interview process, highlighting that instructors should focus on their language use, as recruiters "particularly [...] care [...] a lot about the language, the speaking".

#### 4.4.2 Instructors in Canada

Instructors' Background. In Canada, seven instructors were interviewed, and their teaching experiences ranged from three to 22 years. Some of the participants started teaching as young as 16 years old, and they came from diverse backgrounds. All the participants had international experiences teaching in several countries such as Brazil, Turkey, Iran, China, Japan, and Malaysia, and they were highly qualified holding a combination of different degrees, MAs, PhDs, and teaching certificates. Some of the instructors highlighted that their undergraduate degrees were in different fields such as engineering, law, and communications and marketing; however, they decided to work as English instructors, which led them to pursue further education and certification related to teaching. Six of the seven instructors underlined that they have TESL certification, commenting that it is essential to find a job in Canada. The only participant who did not have TESL certification had dual certification in adult education and was currently teaching discipline specific courses, e.g., business courses. The participants taught at

different university programs, Intensive English Programs, foundation/pathway programs, and undergraduate programs, and the courses they taught varied including ESL, EAP, IELTS, business and corporate English, teacher training, and fundamentals of business, among others. When asked about their student populations, instructor participants underlined that they taught students from various backgrounds, where some were international coming from countries such as China, Jordan, Saudi Arabia, and Colombia and others were domestic students. Students were also from different ages as some were undergraduates and others had already finished undergraduate degrees and needed English courses to find jobs or pursue and/or qualify for additional educational opportunities.

TESL Certification. When TESL Certification was discussed, most instructors stated that they pursued TESL certification when they arrived in Canada, as it was essential to secure a job. One of the instructors, Azadeh, connected certification to having Canadian experience, and she explained that regardless of the number of years spent teaching internationally, instructors are required to receive certification, because it is a way to "make sure that they [instructors] are meeting some of the requirements at the Canadian universities, or colleges, just to get into the system". She added that "if you have that experience [teaching in Canada] that's of add on value primarily because of the language, and of course, the best practices [applied in the Canadian education system] that are better [...] compared to the countries outside." Other instructors agreed on this point when reflecting on Canadian and international experience, which will be further discussed later.

Receiving certification was achieved in different ways with some instructors receiving it directly by applying for certification from TESL Canada or TESL Ontario.

Others received degrees from certain universities, which automatically granted them an equivalent certification, which is accepted by TESL certifying organizations in Canada. Haleh mentioned that she received her TESL certificate by applying for Previous Assessment and Recognition (PLAR), which requires sending all educational and teaching certification to TESL Ontario or TESL Canada, and then the documents are evaluated by the organization. She explained that that the process cost her \$1,000, and she had to receive certification, as "many jobs directly say that they want that in Canada". As for Atefeh, she underlined that having a CELTA or DELTA is not always recognized in Canada and that she had to receive the TESL Ontario certificate to be able to teach and "[...] get more in the Canadian context"; however, she never faced issues teaching abroad with a CELTA or DELTA certificate. Another participant, Nouri, reflected on how receiving TESL certification is easy, and it is easy for anyone to get the certification within a month and be able to teach. He added that "it doesn't matter whether you have enough expertise" explaining that especially teaching ESL is open to people with any previous work experience, which he views as problematic. Irene also reflected on the certification process, which is not required in her home country. She underlined that the process is complex and "may not be necessarily important", but instructors "don't have a choice but to have [...] a certification like that". She finally added that she chose to do TESL Canada instead of TESL Ontario, as TESL Ontario required taking an English proficiency test, explaining that she did not "[...] want to take the proficiency tests, because it's expensive, and it takes time". For TESL Canada, at the time of her certification, an English proficiency test was not required, which facilitated the process for her, saving time, money, and effort.

Job Advertisements. When job advertisements were discussed, instructors were asked about the qualifications and requirements they would include for a teaching position in a university context, and they mentioned several points including educational qualifications, teaching experience, teaching certification, and technical and soft skills. As previously mentioned, instructors highlighted the importance of having TESL certification and Atefeh underlined that it is "considered a fortune" and, in some cases, can be more important than an MA degree. In addition, instructors underlined the importance of having at least an undergraduate degree in the field of education and having a graduate degree in an education-related field, applied linguistics, linguistics, or education, would be an asset. Having teaching experience was underscored by six of the seven instructor participants with some of them stating the need for one-three years of experience; however, Annabel stated that she is not "[...] a huge fan of [...] the [...] requirements for experience", as it disadvantages some individuals with limited teaching experience. She explained that having a "mock presentation" and teaching a class better crystalizes instructors 'skills, which is a point that Nouri also discussed. She added that for specific programs such as EAP, it is beneficial to have instructors with experience at the university context, such as being a graduate student, because they would know "[...] how things work at university level". Another program-specific suggestion was offered by Irene who mentioned that, for ESL programs, "it will be beneficial if the teachers were also immigrants, speak English as their first, third, fourth languages. [...] so that [...], they can provide [...] diverse perspectives". She also pointed to her preference for instructors with Canadian teaching experience saying: "I would appreciate that kind of experience in teaching in Canadian context and being in the country for a certain period of time, so that students can gain some information from [....] them."

Other themes that participants mentioned in relation to job ads were related to technology, pronunciation, soft skills, and research ability. Experience with technology was underlined, especially experience with Zoom, Microsoft Office, and Teams. Pronunciation was another theme and was mentioned by only one participant, Haleh, who underlined that "accurate pronunciation is very important", adding that in a job ad, she would include "[...] native or native-like pronunciation". Having soft skills such as empathy and kindness was mentioned by Azadeh who explained that it is important especially in ESL contexts where students are in a transition phase migrating to a new country and trying to support themselves and their children. Finally, having good research skills was considered important for instructors and, as Nouri mentioned, "a good teacher should be [a] good researcher".

Applicants' Characteristics. Participants were asked about the characteristics of strong instructors who would stand out to recruiters, and several of the characteristics mentioned overlapped with the previous discussion of the job ads such as soft skills and comfort using technology; however, participants added having Canadian and international experience, length of work experience, and teaching experience in different contexts, among others. Instructors emphasized the importance of being technically sound and being comfortable using a hybrid teaching mode. In addition to the technical skills, instructor participants re-emphasized the importance of having the "[...] proper educational background credential", as Liam mentioned. As for the experience, participants reflected on several aspects such as length of teaching experience, teaching contexts, ESL, EAP experience, etc., and Canadian and international experience. Azadeh underlined how in her workplace, some instructors had the chance to teach in China, which offered them "huge exposure", and she added that having experience teaching

English in Canada would facilitate getting a job internationally, as organizations "do know that the primary language [of education] is [...] English". She also pointed to how being able to speak another language can be beneficial in the classroom to better connect with students from different backgrounds. Haleh, on the other hand, spoke to the role Canadian teaching experience plays in finding a job inside Canada, and she explained that "[w]hen we arrived in Canada, they told us that all the [...] job providers, recruiters are looking for Canadian work experience". She explained that she volunteered for two months in a language school to have Canadian experience; however, she added that she does not know whether the two-month experience in Canada mattered to employers or not. She stated that, in her view, organizations "[...] do care about the 21 years of experience that I've had, all together". Atefeh also underlined how Canadian experience is important, and she was surprised how in other countries, such as Malaysia, her international experience counted unlike in Canada, where Canadian experience was more important than the international experience.

Several participants pointed to the importance of having different soft skills to be a strong candidate and a successful instructor. The skills included having empathy, and good communications skills, being approachable, knowledgeable, and having the ability to work with others, especially in the case of having a co-instructor, and being able to think fast. Being comfortable working with and being around others is one point that three participants mentioned, especially being able to work as part of a team and being "a people's person". Annabel explained that "[s]ome people are more like lone wolves or they're just not very good working with other people in general", and she reflected on how she had negative experience working with people who lack the ability to be part of a team, adding how "having the soft skills that's [...] what makes you stay in place".

Having experience teaching in different contexts was underscored by multiple participants, explaining how the context can affect the requirement needed from the instructor. For example, Atefeh stated:

[w]hen I wanted to go for private language school, they cared about [...] just ESL, IELTS, academic English teaching, but when it came to the college instructor position, it was more about working in higher education, on academic English, working with international students', [and] communication skills.

As for Azadeh, she underscored that "the exposure to a variety of classroom settings […] like the exposure to teaching multitude level of streams" is extremely important.

One of the participants referred to the contradictions between what Canadian recruiters view as a strong candidate compared to what he, as an instructor, considers as an important characteristic. Nouri noted that, in his view, a strong instructor needs to simply be a hard worker, which should crystalize his skills leading to being appreciated and valued by students. Nevertheless, recruiters who search for attracting students to their organizations hire "native" White English speakers who received their education from English-speaking countries, as he believes that "there is a stereotype that the people who come from other countries are not knowledgeable enough". He explained that "people from other parts of the world, do like to see an English name at least when they're applying to a program". In addition, he added that, as an instructor, you should know "how to sell yourself, how to talk about EDI [Equity, Diversity, and Inclusivity]" and "show no disagreement against [...] what [...] the flow of ideas [is] [...], whether it is false or true", as recruiters do not want to risk employing individuals who hold different perspectives than that of the hiring organization.

Students' Perspective. Compared to recruiters' view of strong candidates, instructors were queried on who represents an ideal instructor from the students' perspective. Participants mentioned several traits including being qualified to teach, being supportive, knowledgeable, hardworking, fair, and understanding. Some candidates reflected on how some students have preferences for "natives", male instructors, and older instructors. Azadeh stated that students need "somebody who connects with them, and understand their needs", and that in addition to being empathetic and kind, students "make sure that they're getting the right information", and that the instructors "teach them effectively". Irene mentioned that students need their instructors to offer them feedback and care for their mental health, and Annabel underlined the importance of being flexible for both students and recruiters. As for Liam, he stressed on the importance of instructors' being fair and he said, "I have always dreaded the instructor who played favorites among students". He added that instructors should have the proper educational background, the ability to explain different concepts, have a plan and outline the goal for each class, have patience, and be able to adapt to different groups of students.

Atefeh reflected on how age, gender, and "nativeness" make a difference; however, her reflections were related to her experience in the Middle East where she mentioned that "nativeness", skin colour, and appearance made a difference. She added that some students preferred male instructors explaining that "sometimes in corporate English, they prefer someone who is like male, and they take your words like more for what it's worth, rather than, you know, saying, oh, you don't know what you're doing". She finally mentioned that age represented a problem for her, especially since she started teaching at a young age; nevertheless, she stated that "[...] as you grow older and you kind of settle into it, [...] people are more easily accepting [of] you". Haleh also referred

to age and she stated, "when I was much younger, I hid my age, because I realized that this could be a problem with the students".

Changes in the Job Market. Instructors were also asked about the Canadian job market and if they noticed any changes in the job market in general or in the hiring criteria in specific in the past years. Some of them mentioned observing changes related to Covid-19, instructors, students, and recruiters, while others underlined that they have not seen any changes, at least "not openly", as Annabel mentioned. Part of the instructors indicated that the basic requirements remained the same, for example educational background and certification, and Liam mentioned that these requirements are considered a change compared to 25-30 years ago where "anyone who spoke English or had a reasonable command of English through an interdisciplinary degree could likely have been hired".

Participants mentioned some changes related to the effect of the pandemic on the teaching model, which led to technology awareness becoming a new "expectation" from instructors. Annabel stated that it is:

[k]ind of an expectation from recruiters, for example that you are more tech savvy, just because of Covid. But [...] in terms of type of teachers that they require for qualifications, they haven't changed at all, in terms of education.

Azadeh highlighted that besides technology, recruiters expect instructors to have "more [...] exposure to professional development or volunteer [experience]", due to the changes in the students' population caused by Covid-19. Referring to students' populations, she explained that previously students came from China, Japan, and Korea, but now they come from Latin America and the Middle East. She added that when Covid first hit, the

number of international students reduced which resulted in many instructors losing their jobs.

Atefeh pointed to another change, which is the precarity of ESL jobs saying:

[the] thing I've noticed the most is [how] ESL jobs have moved from full time to part time, so this is the thing, which is very inconvenient, because, you know, it's still [an] important field [...], at the same time, it's always undervalued. So, I feel like commitment to hiring someone full time is just not happening again.

Nouri referred to the same issue explaining that employers currently prefer hiring instructors "on contracts, because it is easy for them", and he added that the job market is becoming more competitive. Atefeh also mentioned that when applying for a job "it's more important to know someone and appl[y] through them rather than just go online and apply", referring to the importance of networking in the Canadian job market. This reflection by Atefeh relates to what Liam mentioned when referring to a previous work experience where his colleague was offered additional teaching opportunities, which he suspected was related to the instructor having a connection with the program administrator.

Another change that Atefeh noticed over the past year was a preference for either TESL Canada or Ontario, commenting that such preference is logical due to these organizations being supported in Canada; however, she was not sure the preference was for which of them. Haleh reflected on a more recent change related to the teaching model underlining that now more opportunities are opening for face-to-face and hybrid teaching with teaching fully online becoming less. She commented on this change saying, "I'm happy about the situation. I think there are more vacancies now". Furthermore, Nouri

referred to a new criterion that can be seen "on paper", which is Equity, Diversity, and Inclusivity (EDI) and the expectation from instructors to be familiar with the different EDI concepts and apply them in the classroom; however, he was uncertain if these concepts are genuinely applied or simply represent a façade projected by the organizations.

Reflecting on the changes in the job market and hiring criteria, Annabel explained that the changes have had both positive and negative effects, and she focused specifically on the effects of online teaching. She stressed on the flexibility that online teaching offered to instructors; however, she mentioned that "it kind of blurred [...] what is your own personal time", and "it made it kind of look like we're always on call". She also added that technology could represent an issue for instructors who are not familiar with it or dislike using it; nevertheless, she commented that technology is a reality now, and there is no escape from it.

Offering Advice. When instructors were asked to offer advice to other instructors in the field, they reiterated several points mentioned earlier in relation to necessity of having a TESL certification and required educational qualifications, ability to use technology, and having certain soft skills, such as communication skills, empathy, and open-mindedness. Also, being up to date with the field and pursuing professional development opportunities were underlined and, as Azedeh stated, it is essential to "[l]earn what is happening new in the field like, be aware of it ahead of time rather than when the time comes", explaining how this approach helped her "grow in terms of technology".

Also, more than one participant focused on the interview context and how instructors should yield the opportunity to best describe their skills, abilities, and their

experience. Liam and Atefeh discussed the importance of sharing volunteer experience, and Liam underlined that, during the interview, instructors should know what is best to share and what not to share with the interviewer/s. In addition, participant instructors pointed to the importance of developing and crystalizing soft skills during the interview, especially communication skills with students, instructors, and staff and being approachable, which is connected to what Nouri previously mentioned on the ability to "sell yourself" to be able to secure a job. Finally, Annabel underscored the importance of understanding the context the instructor will work in and how to best show their personality and ability in this context.

Interview Experiences. Instructors were asked about their experiences with interviews in Canada, and they reflected on the importance of connections in the Canadian context, the demandingness of the interviews, interview process, and benefits yielded from interviews' experience. Haleh underlined that she "applied for more than 100 jobs in Canada", adding that connections played an important role in being contacted for an interview. She underlined that if it were not for having connections, universities would not contact her. Commenting on connections, she said it "is something that I'm uncomfortable with and [...] unless someone introduces you, [...] you have zero chances", despite having high educational qualifications and extensive teaching experience. Atefeh also spoke to the importance of networking, and she reflected on how it assisted her in an interview where she already knew the person interviewing her. She explained how the interview was different than any other interview she had, where she would submit a formal application and go through the interview process. However, in this interview, she was not formally interviewed, and it was more of a discussion. She finally

commented by saying, "I thought that was such a nice change from [...] being on your toes for like an interview".

Another point that participants reflected on was how the interview process assisted them in better performing in interviews. For example, Azadeh stated that, thanks to all the interviews she participated in, she now considers herself a "veteran", and that she is better prepared for the coming interviews. Annabel referred to having "storage systems", which is a result of experience and knowledge of possible interview questions. Also, other participants reflected on how the interview process was facilitated/ complicated by the recruiters and whether they were clear about the steps that the instructors will go through. For example, Liam said that the best interviews, "[...] were the ones where the institution had a very organized way [...] of interfacing, [...] handling the candidate", where they [...] would logistically arrange, and pay for, and [...] provide reasonable supports to make the interview occur". At the other end, Nouri mentioned a negative interview experience where he was asked to do a demonstration without prior preparation, and where he was not given clear instructions on certain parts of the interview process.

Finally, some of the instructor participants reflected on what made their interview successful and they mainly focused on preparing for the interview and knowing how to answer the interview questions. For instance, Irene underlined that offering proof or evidence from her experience to support her answers for the interview questions proved to be beneficial in the interview process. Also, Azadeh underlined how instructors should not offer answers that are too detailed but leave space for the interviewees to draw conclusions from the answers. In addition, Annabel pointed to the importance of preparing for the interview by searching for possible interview questions.

Evaluation of Language Skills. After reflecting on their interview experiences, instructors were asked if they believe that their English skills are evaluated whether directly by requiring a standardized test result or indirectly during the interview. Three instructors underlined that if an instructor speaks English as an additional language, then their language skills will be assessed whether directly or indirectly. Azadeh said that interviewers use the teaching demo and interview to judge the writing and speaking skills, underlining that speaking the "[...] words clearly [...] really matters, because that is what the students are going to pick up from you". Also, Nouri underlined that instructors' language skills "will definitely be evaluated"; however, he explained that it happens more if an instructor is hired in college than a university setting explaining that in a university context recruiters know that since the instructor has an MA or PhD, they are qualified to teach. In addition, Haleh mentioned that she was asked for an IELTS test; however, she was teaching IELTS at a language school and not a university setting.

The other four instructor participants mentioned that language skills are not evaluated, and that the focus is on the answers to the interview questions and not the language skills. For example, Liam said:

[u]nless the person's English is, [...] so horrible or, or fundamentally problematic, I think [...] as a decent interviewer or as a reasonable and ethical interview, I think my focus is going to be moving beyond the person talks whether they have a foreign accent [...]. I would be more interested in hearing the actual responses to the question prompts.

Atefeh reflected on how she was asked to take an IELTS test for a certificate or for education; however, she was never asked by an employer to take an IETLS test. Despite having 12 years of teaching experience, she said that "I have studied in a country where

English is considered as a second language, but unfortunately, here [in Canada] in formal education, that's not enough. I always have to have an IELTS test for them". In addition, she referred to "accent" and that she does not believe that it is a criterion that matters for employers. Finally, Annabel also mentioned that she does not feel recruiters assess her language skills at least in the organizations that she worked with.

Benefits of Speaking English as an Additional Language (EAL). Instructors spoke to the benefits of instructors who speak EAL in relation to the diverse perspectives they offer, clear communication with students, motivating students and functioning as role models. Azadeh mentioned that being a "non-native" gives the instructor an edge compared to a "native" instructor, and she said:

I think the advantage that we have is that we become more clear with the language, because a native speaker has a certain accent [...], and [...] that sometimes is not helpful for the students. They do not grab those slangs or the way the native speaker speaks.

Irene added that being a "non-native" is beneficial for students, as it offers them multiple perspectives. Also, Annabel underlined how she intentionally mentions to her learners that she is a "non-native" to motivate them and show them that one day they can be in the same place, teaching others English even if it is not their first language. She added that being an instructor who speaks EAL shows students that they can be successful in an English-speaking country, even though English is not their first language.

**Defining "Nativeness".** An additional point that instructors discussed related to language skills was "nativeness", how they defined it, and discrimination "non-natives" encounter in the TESOL field. Atefeh underlined that she disapproves of the term "native", like the other instructors, adding that there is prejudice in the field. Azadeh

defined the term as a person who has "full command over the language" and who grew speaking this language. Annabel referred to a similar point stating that "unfortunately, it's a matter of where you were born and grew up, where you were raised", referring to belonging to an inner circle versus an outer circle country. Irene referred to "natives" as people who grew up in English speaking countries, and she drew attention to the term native-like, referring to speakers who "grew up in a bilingual education system", and she referred to herself as an example. She added that "if your native language, your first language [...] was not English, yet you're able to convey your ideas without hesitation or without any pauses", then this means this individual is a native-like speaker. As for Liam, he referred to how the term "native" has different meanings to different individuals, and how he would be offended if an employer uses this term, especially with Canada being multi-cultural and where people speak with several "accents". He finally added that "if one were to [....] somehow rank a domestic accent as somehow better than a foreign accent, I think that itself is a concern".

Discrimination and Biases. Several instructors referred to some instances where they were advised by their employers not to share their nationality or mention that they are "non-natives"; however, it is important to note that these experiences were all outside Canada. To give an example, Haleh reflected on her experience in Turkey stating,

[t]he language school where I work told me that you have to tell everyone that you're from Australia, because, like I grew up there, and they didn't want someone who doesn't have a passport. So, I had to lie about my passport just to qualify for the job.

She also mentioned that she applied for a job in the UAE and, despite matching the requirements, she was not contacted, and she inferred that it was due to not coming from

an inner circle country. She commented by saying "I don't think the passport makes you a native speaker, the way you speak does". Annabel reflected on a similar experience where she was advised not to apply for a work visa in China, despite traveling to teach English there stating, "I'm not a native speaker, like, I'm not from Canada, US, UK. Then, I would probably have a whole time explaining the fact that I would be teaching in China". Finally, some of the instructor participants reflected on how being White and having a native-like "accent" assisted them in being hired as English instructors. For example, Annabel mentioned: "I, a lot of times, I get away with […] not being […] discriminated in the field, because I'm White", and Haleh said:

As soon as I was 18, I wanted to have a job, but since I hadn't been to college or anything. There wasn't much I qualified for, but, because I spoke native-like English, I had chances to teach English. So, without any prior experience or teaching qualifications or anything, they just hired me, and I was so shocked, because this was a new realm to me.

In her quote, Haleh stressed on the importance of speaking with a "native-like" accent, which enabled her to teach the language without having any credentials or prior experience.

Reflections on Teaching Journeys. Reflecting on their teaching journey, several instructors spoke to their experience in the Canadian context, the diversity of the student population, teaching context, and challenges faced. Azadeh described her experience as "phenomenal, eye-opening, and wholesome". She reflected on the perseverance of her learners, and how they work hard to learn the language leaving their home countries. She added how her experience with the learners was inspiring for her and assisted her in learning more about her learners and the skills they need. Atefeh also discussed how the

students are very diverse, describing how in the Canadian context "you get all sorts of, [...], you get newcomers, you get refugees, you get programs that are [...] you are kind of helping beginners, and people who really need communication to survive". However, she mentioned that despite the flexibility in the classroom, it is difficult, because "there is no one way of approaching it". In addition, she reflected on how it is sometimes hard to navigate teaching in this context, as she come from a British English background, and she needs to be aware of the differences between American and British English so as not to confuse the learners. She finally described the Canadian context as "[...] a great experience in terms of [...] you're doing all these sorts of things and you're dealing with all sorts of students".

Liam and Nouri also shared several reflections on their teaching experience, and they pointed to multiple challenges they faced in their teaching experience related to the students, compensation, and volunteering. Liam underlined that when teaching undergraduate students, he noticed that they were not interested in studying and learning did not represent a priority for them, which he described as "sad to observe".

Nevertheless, he stated that this attitude could possibly be different for upper year undergraduates or graduate students. Also, he reflected on unfair compensation and how faculty members viewed him, a contract instructor, as "a second-tier type of instructor, [...] not to be taken as seriously [and] definitely paid significantly less". He added that no matter how many courses he taught, he would never be paid as much as full-time faculty members. He finally, reflected on his volunteer experience, where he referred to how he was more qualified than other instructors at the same organization and he believed that "they felt a bit threatened" by his presence.

Relocation and Career Change. Instructors reflected on two final themes which related to reasons for relocating from their home countries to Canada and possible reasons that could lead them to shift from teaching to administration. As for moving to Canada, Atefeh underlined that she is from the Middle East, and even though she was able to secure work visa "at some point, it's a bit difficult to move around", and so she decided to apply to become a permanent resident in Canada, which "is a good country to [...] restart". As for Haleh, she directly stated, "I emigrated to Canada, as I needed to get a passport, honestly speaking, to get a passport that matches my accent".

As for shifting from teaching, instructors highlighted several reasons that leads educators to leave teaching such as low salary, demandingness of the teaching roles, and precarity of teaching positions, among others. Nouri pointed to how teaching in the university and having a rich educational background does not guarantee a high income, and he complained about how, for example, "realtors with education or without education are making much more money than the university professor". Annabel referred to a connected pointed, which is the stability of managerial positions compared to teaching positions, which many of them are contract-based and how managerial positions probably offer better compensation. Additionally, most of the participants referred to how teaching is demanding in terms of students' and recruiters' expectations, evaluations that teachers go through, workload, and lack of flexibility. For example, Atefeh mentioned how as an instructor "you're constantly on", and how online teaching now offers instructors the chance to "switch-off" a bit when switching their cameras off, which is not possible in face-to-face contexts. Due to this pressure, "most people after 10 years, they're burnt out, they take a break, or they switch" to a different role. Nouri and Haleh underlined that students' and recruiters' expectations add to the difficulty of the job, and Haleh explained that "it is difficult to satisfy people", saying, "I don't get my top ratings just because the people have different expectations of me". Furthermore, Nouri highlighted that in addition to the expectation that recruiters and students have for instructors, instructors are required to go through evaluations and are expected to have knowledge of technology and EDI concepts; nevertheless, the salaries they receive does not align neither with the responsibilities nor the expectations.

When discussing possible career opportunities, some instructors referred to managerial roles, while others preferred jobs related to curriculum development and material writing, and others pointed to research as another option. For example, Azadeh mentioned that she is looking forward to managing or coordinating her program, while Irene underlined that she is not interested in admin roles, explaining that she wants the role to "be associated with teaching instructional materials". Haleh pointed to her interest in research positions, as they are "pretty straightforward compared to making everybody happy" when teaching. However, she underlined that research positions in education are scarce compared to the sciences. She finally added that she declined several offers for admin jobs, as they do not match her character.

### 4.5 Program Administrators' Interviews

Program administrators from different universities and colleges in Canada and the UAE were interviewed. Five interviews were conducted with Canadian program administrators and one with an administrator with experience in both Canada and the UAE. The program administrators were responsible for programs in different provinces such as Ontario, Nova Scotia, Saskatchewan, and British Colombia. The administrator working in the UAE had experience in multiple emirates. The participants managed

different types of programs offered to undergraduate and adult students, such ESL, EAP, and pathway programs.

When conducting the interviews, several themes were highlighted including hiring criteria for English instructors in university and college settings, changes in the hiring criteria and job market, characteristics of strong teaching candidates, and perceptions of "nativeness". Other themes emerged such as reasons for administrators to shift from teaching positions to administrative positions, effects of Covid-19 on the job market and students' populations, and administrators' reactions to stereotypes against instructors who speak EAL. Further themes were noticed in the interviews conducted with the administrator with work experience in the UAE, such as transition from UAE to Canada, difference between Canadian and Emirate job markets, and discrimination against English instructors from certain backgrounds.

# 4.5.1 Program Administrators in Canada

Program Administrators' Background. In the Canadian sample, the participants held different titles such as program administrators, coordinators, executive directors, principles, and literacy and language supervisors, and their experience in these roles were between eight months to 20 years. The participants assumed different duties depending on their position and organization they worked for, and their responsibilities included: determining hiring criteria for administrative and teaching staff, conducting interviews, managing different teaching programs, supervising the teaching staff, creating job advertisements for different positions, supervising instructors and students, creating curriculum, conducting performance evaluations and classroom observations, and liaising with different organizations to discuss funding and license requirements. Setting the job requirements was one of the points that most admins shared; however, one of the

administrators who is part of a unionized organization funded by the government mentioned that the union and funder are the ones who assume the responsibility of setting the job requirements and neither her, as the program administrator, nor her manager can make changes to these requirements.

Job Requirements in Advertisements. When asked about the requirements they include in job advertisements, the program administrators highlighted different soft skills and hard skills. As for the hard skills, they all underlined that having TESL certification is essential such as TESL Canada, TESL Ontario, or CERTESL, Certificate in Teaching English as a Second Language, and one of the administrators mentioned that having a CELTA certificate is also approved. Carl, one of the administrators, mentioned that his organization require certification as it is an accredited institution and "[....] that dictates some criteria right there; they [instructors] have to be certified, which means they need to have at least one degree, and TESOL One equivalent". This point was reiterated by Aliaa who mentioned that since her organization is part of "languages Canada, there's certain criteria, our teachers have to have [...], so they must have a bachelor's and they must have a TESL Canada equivalent certification".

Having teaching experience was another point that the admins highlighted underlining that candidates should have some teaching experience, and preference is given to those with experience in the courses they will be teaching, EAP, ESL, LINC (Language Instruction for Newcomers to Canada), etc. It is important to note that most admins did not specify years of experience required, except for one who stated that the instructors should at least have one year of teaching experience. One of the administrators, Aliaa, highlighted that she had previously attempted to hire instructors with no experience; however, it proved to be time-consuming, and she added that "[...]

we don't have the resources and time for that, so I do require some experience". Finally, some of the admins mentioned that having international experience is an asset, while others showed preference for experience in a Canadian context. The following section will further elaborate on the Canadian in comparison to international experience.

When Canadian and international experiences were discussed, most, if not all, administrators mentioned that the most important is having teaching experience whether in Canada or overseas providing that it is related to the courses they will teach, ESL, EAP, LINC, and context they will work in, teaching undergraduate, working with immigrants, etc. One of the program administrators, Carl, highlighted that it is a requirement to have overseas experience, and Aliaa also mentioned that she has preference for those with experience working in a country where they did not speak the language, as "they understand the struggle, both culturally and language[wise] [...]". Aliaa added that having such experience is valuable especially when teaching ESL courses, because "with ESL, you're not just teaching language, you're also teaching cultural inclusion. So, and they're more sympathetic and empathetic as teachers". However, Aliaa pointed to challenges related to hiring candidate who lived overseas to teach online during Covid, and she highlighted that paying them represented an issue, and that is why even if the instructors will teach online, they must be residing in Canada. Finally, Natalie underlined that having international experience is helpful whether the instructors are Canadians who traveled overseas or immigrants who, as she mentioned, "already have that cultural adaptation piece", and have the experience of adapting to a new context and learning the language.

Furthermore, administrators mentioned several soft skills and "desired" skills instructors should have. The soft skills they highlighted included having cultural

awareness, ability to collaborate with others and to self-reflect, and being receptive to feedback. Other skills included knowledge of the Canadian Language Benchmarks (CLB), and Portfolio-Based Language Assessment (PBLA), being comfortable teaching using specific textbooks, having good language skills "written and oral skills", knowledge of different settlement trends, and finally, ability to support students in class. Technical aptitude was another skill; however, Abby highlighted that it is not directly stated in the job advertisements but is something that would represent a "red flag" if for example a candidate is invited for an interview on Zoom and is unable to "figure it out". Some of these skills will be further discussed and highlighted in the following sections in relation to who is considered a strong instructor candidate.

Changes in the Job Market. When queried about the changes in the job market and hiring criteria, program administrators highlighted different points related to the effect of the pandemic, instructors' population/background, and changes in Language Canada requirements, among others. Also, some administrators underlined that the requirements and criteria remained the same. Abby stated,

I would say the only thing that has come to the forefront recently is technical aptitude, so we have a number of our staff who are older and not necessarily using technology in their lives and we struggle actually training them to use this in the classroom.

She underlined that this is not a requirement that is included in the job ads; nevertheless, it is something that they pay attention to. Natalie drew attention to another change which is related to both the pandemic and hiring requirements which is online teaching, and she stated that, in her organization, they provide support to instructors who need assistance with online delivery and utilization of different Learning Management Systems (LMS);

however, she highlighted that "just knowing how to use [different LMSs] that is a big plus right now", which connects to the technical aptitude point that Abby mentioned.

Another change that Abby mentioned was related not to the requirements, but the instructors' populations and backgrounds. She explained that, previously, applicants used to be LINC and EAL instructors; however, now, they are mainly fresh graduates, newly certified TESL instructors, and instructors with previous experiences in private schools. Abby mentioned that she does not know the reason behind the shift, and she added that hiring from this new pool requires offering them "mentorship and guidance around PBLA and CLB". As for the reason for the change in instructors' background, Natalie stated that the reason for this change could be related to the increased number of immigrants in her context, Saskatchewan, and which led people "to think and look and get into teaching things as a second language". She added that this shift has not affected anything, as she still prefers more experienced instructors who are "[...] able to handle the demands of our academic program".

Regarding the requirements, Carl, Natalie, and Kevin mentioned that nothing has changed; however, Carl highlighted one change to the requirements for certification, which in 2016 indicated that teachers to be "a Native speaker of English or demonstrate native speaker competence". However, now it has been adjusted, and certifying organizations:

[...] are not using the terminology of native speaker anymore. They just want you to be comfortable in that language, so I think that's a good direction [...] for whom English is not their first language. We've had a few of those over the years, and [...] they've been really excellent [...] teachers.

He added that this is a sign of "developing awareness" and shows slow development on part of the students' awareness as well, and he stated, "I think there probably is a little bit more awareness among incoming students as well". As for Kevin, he highlighted that the changes that happened in his department were not due to changes in the job market or criteria, but due to him taking a proactive role since he became the coordinator at his organization. He said:

I think the main change that has occurred since I've coordinated is, rather than looking for someone with more significant experience, and even overseas experience, I'm just looking for someone [...] fresh out of school, connecting with current colleges, and then having their pool of instructors available for hiring here.

Aliaa drew attention to a similar point where she mentioned that part of the changes stem from her experience and teaching background compared to the previous manager who had a management background.

When queried about the changes in the job market and hiring criteria, two program administrators underlined that Covid affected the hiring of instructors and Carl stated, "I wish I could say we've been hiring the last while; we haven't really been [hiring] much [...]". Reflecting on the effect of Covid on the students, Aliaa mentioned that the Covid situation affected the student populations in different ways, as pre-pandemic the students mainly came from China and Saudi Arabia. However, due to the political situation between Canada and Saudi Arabia and the lockdown in China, they are primarily getting students from Korea and Japan, and she stated that this situation "[...] is unique to us, because we never had those markets before", and "we're also seeing more students from Latin America". The political situation she was referring to was Canada's Foreign Ministry denouncing the arrest of human's right activists in Saudi Arabia in

2018, and as a result, "the Saudi Ministry of Foreign Affairs announced it would expel the Canadian Ambassador and freeze all new trade and investments because of Canada's "interference in the Kingdom's domestic affairs" (Deif, 2018). Aliaa added that students' ages and goals have shifted as well pre- and post-pandemic, as pre-pandemic students were between the ages of 18-22; however, now the students are over 30, already have a degree, and aim to receive a certificate of diploma from community college. She gave an example of how the "last pathway programs included students from Taiwan and Columbia and China and Nepal and Dubai [UAE], and they were people that already had a degree". Finally, Aliaa commented that "the dynamic has really changed, pre and post Covid, of our student body, and the needs of the students".

The final change that was referred to in the job market was related to the hiring dynamics and which Aliaa described as:

Something that we've never seen before. The dynamic has changed and that previously when you had an interview with someone, [...] you were waiting for them to sell themselves. The attitude I'm getting from people now [...] [is] why should I work for you?

She explained that she conducted around 10 interviews and showed a pile of files for candidates who declined the position. She added that applicants made special requests that were not discussed during the interview regarding parking for example which "are never things that were provided before" and she said that "I don't know if people become more entitled [...]. This isn't really a past, future thing. This is like coming out of Covid". Also, she explained it has been difficult finding instructors who are willing to teach on site and many of the applications she received were from candidates from different provinces and even outside Canada despite underlining in the advertisement that the

position is on site and not online. When thinking of possible reasons for this change, Aliaa mentioned "it could be financial, because people were working at home online and seeing a lot of money, so they want [...] to see that difference and expenditure". Another reason was industry-related issues as "there's no stability". She finally added that "[...] the issue that we're all facing right now is visa delays. So, I've seen more deferrals, and cancellation of classes among the schools [...] than we've ever seen in the last 10 years", and these cancellations possibly add to the instability of the teaching positions and make it difficult for administrators to guarantee work opportunities for long periods of time.

Defining "Nativeness". Program administrators were asked different question in relation to "nativeness" and how they define it, and if they evaluate the language skills of instructors who speak English as a second or additional language. As for defining the term native or native-like, Abby stated that "a native English speaker is someone who can speak and use English for most of their life at a young age and can speak with communicative competency and fluency", and "without the need to self-correct all the time". As for Natalie, she stated "I'm not a big fan of that term", and that it "really is not very realistic. So, we don't have that in any of our requirements, or it's just not a term that we use at all". She added that if she had to offer a definition of the term, it would be "not much of a discernible accent, so that these students could understand as easy as possible". Kevin shared his strong disapproval of the term, and he related it to a personal experience, which is underlined in the following quote:

I don't put that word in there [job advertisement]. That's not what I would use, because even before I had this job and were looking for jobs, I realized native is prejudiced or just bad language, that the tone is kind of odd. It has a negative connotation and [...] to me, it [means] you're looking for a White person. I mean

that that's what I feel the word native English speaker is [...]. And I do find that [...] people that have used that with me in the past, that's what they're looking for, [a] White male probably might be an accurate description of it. So, that's what I think of when I hear that [the word native], and I don't really use that term personally whenever we're posting jobs [...].

Aliaa also shared Kevin's disapproval of the term "native" underlining that she does not use the term in the job ads. She explained that she is mainly looking for clear pronunciation and that it does matter if the candidate has an "accent". She added that she especially insists on clear pronunciation if the candidate will be teaching lower levels to be able to pronounce certain vowels. However, she underlined and acknowledged that "people have stereotypes", referring to the "native-non-native" dichotomy.

Evaluating Instructors' English Language Skills. Concerning hiring instructors who speak English as a second or additional language, program administrators were asked whether they evaluated instructors' language skills directly, using a standardized test, or indirectly, while conducting the interview. None of the administrators mentioned that they formally assess instructors' language skills; however, four of them mentioned that they either evaluate their English skills, during the interview, or they look at their qualifications and/or certification, which possibly include a standardized test result. One of the administrators, Aliaa, mentioned that, even though she never encountered this "issue" of having to evaluate instructors' English skills, "it might arise if I had someone teaching literacy or lower level". She added that all the applicants that she interviewed for teaching positions and who spoke English as an additional language were highly qualified. Natalie reflected a similar point underscoring that they "[...] do pay attention to

the complexity and the level of their [instructors'] language. Again, keeping in mind where would this teacher be well suited". Carl stated:

[...] we don't have a hard fast, you know, measurements of what we're looking for, but I would want it to be high in speaking in IELTS terms. [...] I would want it to be [...] quite strong like an eight, [...] 8.5, [...] but not necessarily [...] a nine, sort of a Native Speaker [...].

## As for Abby, she stated:

There is no standardized test, and I would say that a great majority of our applicants are English as an Additional Language. I would like to say no, but I know that subconsciously we do evaluate that, and it has come up explicitly. She also added that assessing language skills "[...] comes into play for sure, has had an impact on who we hire". Finally, Kevin did not mention evaluating instructors' language skills, and he indicated that he disregards whether an instructor speaks an English as a first or additional language highlighting that the most important thing is how the instructor delivers content.

Benefits of Instructors who speak EAL. It is important to note that part of the program administrators highlighted the benefits of hiring instructors who speak EAL. For example, Abby highlighted that she prefers hiring instructors who speak English as a second or additional language, as they have had the experience learning another language. She stated, "[...] there are a lot of tips and tricks that I've learned from my colleagues that I'm just not aware of as a native speaker or things that I'm just not even aware I could even think about". She added that the instructors' experience learning English and their "knowledge of other language can play out in the way you explain things and

compartmentalize things". Finally, Carl, stated that it is a positive thing that the instructors are multilingual and speak EAL.

**Discrimination and Biases.** During the interviews, two of the program administrators reflected on students' and parents' view of "non-native" and "native" instructors, and one of them highlighted some discriminatory incidents that happened against some of their instructors who spoke EAL. When reflecting on her experience teaching in Europe 25-30 years ago, Natalie underlined that she dealt with instructors who were very experienced and had excellent English skills; however, she mentioned that "[...] the students, and maybe the parents or the families really wanted that native teacher". Carl also reflected on a similar point where he stated, "I do think they're [students] looking for a stereotypical, I think they have stereotypes about what English teacher should look like, and sound like [...]". He added that some of the students at his organizations had issues with one of the instructors, and, as he inferred from the situation, it was because "she was a young woman from the Middle East, she was wearing hijab, she didn't fit the stereotype". He added that due to their stereotypes, they did not expect to be taught by someone who spoke EAL. In addition, he reflected on another incident where he received complains about an instructor, who was also a female, Middle Eastern, and spoke EAL, and when he investigated the issues, he understood that it was due to the misconceptions that both the students and hiring organizations had about what an English instructor looks like and speaks like, which did not align with an instructor who was not only Middle Eastern but also had an "accent". He commented that he needed to explain to both students and organizations, who were Chinese in both contexts, that the instructors are excellent and doing their job well and he had to "[...] educate the students too around, "you came to Canada; this is what Canada is" and help them process out a little bit". Carl

underlined how it is "tricky" dealing with these situations, as "they hired us, they're paying us, they're the customer, you know, there's this "customer is always right", sort of thing", and how they "don't want to lose" their customers and, at the same time, they need to support the instructors and stand by them, knowing that the students are being offered the best possible service.

Accent. Another theme that emerged from the program administrators' interviews was "accent", and the term was used by four administrators when they were talking about some of the English instructors they hired and when defining the term "native". Natalie discussed how being a native entailed having "not much of a discernible accent", and Aliaa highlighted how pronunciation is what matters and not "accent". Kevin mentioned the term "accent" when talking about one of the instructors he works with and underlined that he disregards her "accent" even though it "does sometimes interfere with understanding". However, he stated that what matters is how the instructor presents the content inside the classroom, in which she is fully competent. Finally, Carl referred to "accent" when reflecting on one of the instructors at his organization who faced discrimination, and he elaborated on how he supported her and confronted the students.

Strong Applicants' Characteristics. Program administrators were asked about the characteristics of strong English instructors and what makes them stand out during interviews, and they highlighted several desirable soft and hard skills and characteristics, and recommended ways of interacting with interviewers while answering the interview questions. As for the skills, administrators underlined various soft and hard skills and among the hard skills that they highlighted was first meeting the educational and professional requirements such as having as BED degree, teaching experience, and oversees experience. The administrators explained that it is important for instructors to

have some teaching experience and knowledge of what they will teach as well and two of the administrators underscored the importance of having EAP teaching experience, as it was important for their context. Other skills mentioned included the ability to prepare assessment and adapt it based on the students' needs and level, the ability to "source information from multiple avenues", showing familiarity with textbooks whether printed or online, and finally being involved in their profession and having knowledge about the teaching industry.

The administrators also listed various soft skills such as owning up to mistakes, being aware of students' background and being empathetic, taking initiative, and being willing to learn and ask for help from both colleagues and management. In addition, they highlighted that they expect instructors to be self-reflective and honest, be able to make decisions and manage a classroom, be organized, have good communication skills, and have the ability work both independently and as part of a group. Additionally, they underscored that instructors should have good presentation skills, be able to explain complicated terms and concepts, and show familiarity with technology.

Interview Process. There were also several points that administrators reflected on in relation to what puts instructor candidates in positive light during interviews such as answering the interview questions smoothly and eloquently and showing honesty and genuine interest in the position they are applying for. For example, Natalie stated, "the way they [interviewees] handle themselves, and the way they demonstrate their knowledge and their attributes and their interest, and their passion and their experience, and the way they are honest" reinforces her positive view of the instructors during the interview. Also, other administrators spoke to how offering real examples of what instructors do in class, during the interview, positively affect the way they view the

instructors and crystalize their skills. Reflecting on his experience interviewing participants, Kevin underlined how an instructor stood out to him, as she demonstrated using different computer programs and "other interactive software programs that she used to elicit responses, [to] make it [the classroom] interactive".

To conclude, program administrators in the Canadian context discussed several topics related to the job market, hiring criteria, changes they witnessed, and skills and qualifications of strong instructor candidates. They also reflected on the concept of "nativeness", how they define it, and how they perceive it. In addition, they highlighted the desired skills instructors should have and which can increase their chances of being hired. Finally, some of the administrators referred to discriminatory incidents they witnessed both in Canada and overseas, and how they dealt with these situations. After reviewing the findings in the Canadian context, the following section will discuss the Emirate context, offer the program administrators' perspective in the UAE, and how the job market in the UAE compares to that of Canada.

### 4.5.2 Program Administrators in the UAE

The Emirate sample consisted of one program administrator, Hana, as there were several recruitment challenges, which were previously discussed in chapter three. Despite the small sample size, Hana offered such a wide perspective, as she had experience being an administrator in the UAE and is currently a program administrator in Canada. She presented her view working in both contexts, compared them, and reflected on her journey in both countries.

*Biases Against Instructors.* Hana first discussed the Emirate context and how the hiring process was affected by bias against "non-native" English instructors and "lifestyle issues". She elaborated on both points explaining that such bias, which she describes, as

"ridiculous and has no basis" was present in other countries such as China and South Korea. As for the "lifestyle issues", she explained that it was related to sexual orientation and how, as a person responsible for recruitment, "if you knew or suspected that they [male instructor applicants] were gay, you couldn't hire them". She also added how political change made it difficult to hire candidates from certain countries, and how the change of who gets hired was so sudden, commenting, "when you do a blanket thing like that, you wipe out everybody". However, she highlighted that she believes that the situation is slowly changing in relation to the lifestyle issues, native language bias, and exclusion of individuals from certain countries due to political reasons. She further elaborated on the change occurring in the UAE by reflecting on how some individuals that she previously tried to hire because they were qualified, but they were not approved due to one of the previous reasons, finally got accepted in these positions years after.

Canadian and Emirate Job Markets. When comparing the Canadian and Emirate job markets, Hana highlighted some differences related to interview questions, pace of development and change in the post-secondary education, employees' rights, and importance of employees' nationalities. As for the interview questions, she highlighted how, in the UAE, some of the questions are very personal in nature related to an applicant's marital status and number of children, and she underlined how such questions would never be discussed in the Canadian context, as they are unrelated to the job the applicant is being interviewed or hired for and are "against the Charter of Rights". However, in the UAE, these questions are part of the employment process, as the employer is the sponsor and universities offer allowances for housing and children education. In addition, she reflected on the cultural differences between both contexts and the length of the employment process of overseas candidates in the Emirate context and

the security clearances, which in some cases stand in the way of hiring excellent candidates. She underlined another difference related to support services and having better access to them in the UAE compared to Canada where budget constraints affected and limited these services.

Connections were also another point that Hana mentioned, and she underscored how during her time in the UAE, she was aware of some "people in positions of responsibility who have had lots of help [...] for getting through various credentials". She also discussed how the Canadian context is different from the Emirate context in relation to the employees' right and unions, and how in the UAE "as an employee, you had very few rights". She added that in Canada, there are laws that protect employees in comparison to the UAE, where a person in power can easily fire an employee simply for not liking them, which is a situation that she witnessed twice. Furthermore, she discussed how, compared to the UAE, hiring candidates in Canada is not dependent on nationality highlighting how "[...] you have to be eligible to work and you have to be on a visa that permits you to work, not a tourist visa, but it never [depends] on nationality".

Discrimination in the Emirate Job Market. Connected to nationality and its effect on the hiring process, Hana discussed the multiple instances of discrimination and bias she noticed in the Emirate job market and education system, and she elaborated on multiple incidents where discrimination was related to hierarchy, nationality, religious symbols, and "nativeness". She underlined that the effect of hierarchy and ranking "[...] is prolific in the UAE and among families" and how it can be noticed in the school environment where children who have and Indian or Egyptian mother "[...] are not quite the same as, you know, or you're not a real Emirati". She reflected on how the UAE wanted to educate women to be modern while also adhering to the UAE's values;

however, hiring instructors wearing the hijab was not allowed, and she related this bias to native speakerism, as "if you wear a hijab, you can't be a native speaker of English, and if you're not a native speaker, you can't be a good language teacher", which, according to her, is flawed and false. She added that despite some candidates' experience, they were denied the jobs simply for being "non-natives" of English. Reflecting on the Emirate higher education, she mentioned that the UAE is "the only country in the world where post-secondary education funded by the Government was not in the national language [Arabic]", and that "there was a backlash against that, because [...] in the early 2000", business connections were made with Saudi Arabia and Arabic was needed; however, the students were not confident in giving presentations in Arabic compared to English.

When discussing hijab and religious and cultural symbols, Hana reflected on an incident where female university students were doing a presentation in front of the Minister of Higher Education and how he "was not amused that the students covered their faces. He thought we should be beyond that. We shouldn't do this when [...] we were trying to present a progressive approach [...]". She recounted another incident that happened when hiring a Jordanian teacher for a school and when the teacher's contract was taken to the director to sign it off,

He looked at her current salary, and he looked at what she'd be making in the UAE, which is probably 3 times that, and he said, "that's too big of a jump", and he said, "she's not a teacher, make her an assistant teacher, like that.

She highlighted how the initial salary designated for the teacher was based on a salary scale aligning with the teachers' experience and education, and she underlined how she spent the following year "lobbying for her [the assistant teacher]" to receive the salary commensurate with the work she is doing, as she was doing the same work of the

teachers. It is important to highlight that despite the multiple discriminatory practices recounted, Hana, underlined how in one of the organizations that she worked at in the UAE, hiring instructors and paying them was based on experience and educational qualifications, and it was not based neither on "nativeness" nor nationality.

Changes in the Job Market. When asked about the job market and the changes she noticed, Hana underlined that the English language teachers' core competencies have not changed in the UAE. She defined these core competencies, as the skills that instructors must have. She added that she uses various questions to explore if a teacher has these skills/competencies, e.g., how instructors interact with students in the classroom, how they teach certain language skills, how they ensure students' understanding of material, and what professional development opportunities they are involved in. A more detailed discussion of core competencies will follow. Referring to the changes noticed in the job market, Hana mentioned that what has changed is "the availability of people. It's the job market, [...] and the particular whim of various HR people and directors". She stressed that in the UAE, "there's so many wild cards and unknown" and that the job market depends on supply and demand. In addition, she pointed to credentials' inflation as well and how "suddenly a master's degree is not good enough. You have to have a PhD". She elaborated on how not holding a PhD "[...] really limited me in being employable because of this credential inflation". Another point that she highlighted was how the UAE made changes to the employment law, which makes it harder for "misuses and abuses that existed in the past" to happen thanks to the new legislation. Finally, she underlined a change related to the educational requirements where around 2009, the UAE adopted a qualifications' framework, a national qualifications authority, which facilitated understanding what different certificates and

diplomas meant in relation to hours of teaching, observations, practicum, and so forth. As for changes in the Canadian context, she stressed that the core competencies are the same; nevertheless, she pointed to the effect of the pandemic, which led to a huge decline in the number of international students and the shift to online teaching. She explained that some programs "went from over 700 students in a semester to 80, to a 100", which affected the different programs and consequently the instructors, part of whom lost their jobs.

Hiring Requirements in the UAE. To be hired in higher education in the UAE, Hana underlined some general requirements related to years of experience, educational background, and instructors' core competencies. She stated that generally 3-5 years of experience in the UAE is required, preferably at the post-secondary level, and she elaborated on two types of experience "related and relevant experience" where the first refers to having experience in higher education outside the UAE, and the latter refers to having teaching experience in a non-post-secondary context. She added that, in addition to educational qualifications, related and relevant experiences are used to place instructors on the salary scale. As for the educational background, a BA and diploma were the initial requirements for English instructors, and she highlighted that a TESL Part II was accepted but not TESL Part I. She also referred to how employers in the UAE were not familiar with TESL certification, and that she needed to explain what a TESL Part II entails and how it is equivalent to a diploma, as in the UAE only diplomas were accepted. She also added that, as mentioned earlier, the UAE adopting a national qualifications' authority facilitated the process of understanding the different qualifications.

Instructors' Core Competencies and Interview Performance. Additional themes emerged in the interview related to instructors and their core competencies, interview questions used with them, and how they can stand out during interviews. Hana reflected

on a document discussing core competencies, which she worked on in the UAE and that she continues to use in Canada as well. She explained how the questions used in this document crystalize instructors' abilities, and they include behavioral-based, cultural competency-based, and professional development-related questions. She underscored that these questions draw a picture of the instructor in the classroom and their suitability for the role. She added that there are sub-competencies as well and they target the context instructors work at and their suitability to teach students from different backgrounds and ages. Hana also elaborated on how:

You want really specific questions that people are able to articulate their teaching practice, and what it looks like, and most people are very, very general. [...] there [are] certain formulas that people use. But you really have to drill down, you know, without putting someone on the spot too much.

Furthermore, she underlined that instructors are expected to stay current on the field and some of the interview questions will refer to how an instructor keeps current on their field.

Advice for Instructors. There were also several pieces of advice that Hana highlighted for language instructors both in Canada and the UAE, and she stated that as an instructor you need to

Be very specific about how you articulate your teaching practice, because how you talk about what you do in the classroom reflects your beliefs on teaching and learning. And be very aware of how we work in a post-modern, constructivist paradigm right. So many people [...] get stuck in thinking they're the imparters of knowledge rather than creating the conditions for learning to take place. [...] the best language teacher is the

one who can create that environment in their classroom, where students can take risks and not be laughed at or not be corrected.

She continued adding that instructors need to have confidence, take risks, plan, and time their lessons well and be prepared with extra activities in case they are needed. In addition, she stressed on the importance of reflecting on the pedagogy and learning science behind what is done in the class. Finally, she stressed on how students should be clear on what they have learned, reflect on it, and take responsibility of their learning by highlighting what activities they enjoyed and which they did not, what they need to learn more about, and so forth.

**Returning to Canada.** When asked about the reason for leaving the UAE after almost 20 years of working in higher education, Hana underlined two main reasons. First, she mentioned that she will not receive neither pension nor benefits no matter how many years she spends in the UAE, and she stated, "I have to go back and give back to my own country and work, so I can have a pension in my own country". Second, she highlighted that there was a lot of violence that students were subjected to by their families and that "nasty things were happening to women"; however, "there was no one to refer people to". She elaborated on the contrast between how the UAE "preaches a big storm" about human rights and tolerance and how modern and progressive they are, and at the same time the option to "refer people to counselors and therapists" was not possible. She however mentioned that, in her opinion, the situation is changing in the UAE and that the old traditions behind this abuse are changing as well. She finally added that shifting from the UAE to Canada represented some challenges for her underlining how she "completely underestimated reverse cultural shock", and she needed to re-familiarize herself with the unionized environment that she was shifting back to in Canada.

To sum up, the program administrator interviewed in the UAE had experience in both Canada and the UAE. She compared the job market in both contexts in relation to changes in the job market, hiring criteria, instructors' rights, and various discrimination incidents she witnessed. She also reflected on the reverse cultural shock she experienced upon returning to Canada, and the reasons for her return. Finally, she commented on the qualifications, skills, and experience required from instructors and how instructor candidates can stand out during the interview.

This chapter provided a detailed description of the results from the data collection tools, and findings from the Canadian and Emirate contexts were discussed separately. The following chapter will answer the research questions, utilizing the previously discussed findings, while making connections to the literature. Also, similarities and differences between results from the current study and previous research will be underlined. In addition, it will offer a personal reflection on some discussion points, and it will highlight the study's significance and limitations, suggested recommendations, and possible future research ideas.

## Chapter 5

#### 5 Discussion and Conclusion

In the previous chapter, the findings of all four research methods (Job advertisements, journal reflections, interviews, and questionnaires) were shared highlighting the results found in each context (UAE and Canada) and underlining the views of both instructors and program administrators. This chapter will cover different points, and it will first answer the three research questions investigated in this study by analyzing the results, drawing conclusions, underlining similarities between the investigated contexts and participants, and making connections to the previous literature. Second, it will offer the researcher's personal reflection by highlighting certain discussion points that are worthy of mentioning. Third, recommendations for instructors', administrators, TESL-certifying organizations, and employers will be shared and future research directives and significance of the study at hand will be underlined. Finally, a discussion of the study's limitations will follow and a postscript highlighting counterstorytelling in the current study and CRT's influence on instructors' stories and lives will be underscored.

### 5.1 Discussion of Research Questions

In this study, the following three research questions were explored:

- 1. What are the criteria used in hiring English instructors in Canada and the UAE?
  How are these criteria viewed (e.g., similarly, or differently) by program
  administrators and ESL/EFL instructors in the TESOL job market?
- 2. What factors affect program administrators' hiring decisions of English instructors in the TESOL job market in Canada and the UAE?

3. What factors shape and influence the experiences of ESL/EFL instructors in the TESOL job market in Canada and the UAE? And what counter-storytelling can be found in their experiences in relation to dominant narratives in the field?

When analyzing the findings of the three research questions and when comparing the data, CRT and intersectionality served as the guide for the analysis, where they offered a critical lens when investigating the results. CRT assisted the researcher in exploring the power relations present between program administrators and instructors, the discrimination instructor faces, and the sources of the challenges they encountered in the job market. Intersectionality played a role in exploring how instructors' nationality, skin colour, gender, religion, and foreign credentials, among others shaped and affected instructors' experiences in the job market.

## **5.1.1 Research Question One**

The first research question investigated the main hiring criteria used when recruiting English instructors in Canada and the UAE in the higher education sector, and how the criteria are viewed similarly or differently by program administrators and ESL/EFL instructors. The question was answered using data collected from job advertisements, questionnaires, journal reflections, and interviews with both program administrators and instructors. When analyzing the data, multiple common hiring criteria were highlighted in the Canadian and Emirate job markets such as instructors' educational and professional qualifications, soft and hard skills, language skills, and equivalency/accreditation. Other criteria were context-specific such as "nativeness", nationality, and Western educational degrees in the UAE, and Canadian and international experience, and experience with specific age groups and courses in Canada.

Common Hiring Criteria. In both contexts, instructors and program administrators underlined that educational and professional experiences were the most important hiring criteria/requirements for an English teaching position, which aligns with Clark and Paran's (2007) results, where teaching qualifications, teaching experience, educational background in the UK were among the main important hiring criteria underlined. Certification and equivalency were important criteria and, in Canada, TESL certification was essential to be considered for a teaching job, and a similar requirement is emerging in the UAE, which is receiving equivalency. Many researchers referred to the use of foreign credentials' equivalency as a tool to devalue and racialize immigrants' skills, experience, and education in different careers such as engineering, medical professions, managerial, administrative, etc. (Bauder, 2003; S. Guo, 2009, 2015; Y. Guo, 2009). Receiving certification and equivalency is both time-consuming and financially demanding, as instructors are subjected to different requirements such as taking additional courses, conducting classroom observations, and taking a written and/or oral English exam, among others. Even though TESL certification is required from "domestic" instructors to teach in certain provinces, these instructors have additional advantage such as receiving their degrees from Canadian universities and so they are not required to receive degree equivalency for their degrees, and they also have Canadian teaching experience. These findings highlight how instructors who were not born in Canada and did not receive their education there are disadvantaged compared to other instructors, as they must take multiple additional steps to be able to teach. When these variables intersect with being "non-native" and not having Canadian experience, being a new immigrant with no connections in the field, it can be imagined how negatively instructors' employability and employment experience, and prospects can be negatively affected.

Further information will be offered in relation to "native status" and connections, among others in the following sections.

Another common factor between both job markets was having various soft and hard skills. Experience using technology and different online platforms, Zoom, Google Meets, etc., was one of the main skills underlined, and instructors and program administrators explained that such criterion gained importance due to Covid-19 and the need to shift from face-to-face to online teaching. The results indicated that even though technology is not listed as a requirement, administrators strongly recommend that instructors have knowledge and experience using it. As for the soft skills and as previously discussed in the literature, underlining certain soft skills can be problematic, as they are "[o]ften employer-defined and locally constituted" and they "vary from one context to another " and for this reason they can be utilized as a tool to discriminate against candidates who are not familiar with them or have a different set of soft skills (S. Guo, 2015, p.246). S. Guo (2015) referred how "[t]he hidden agenda for the promotion of soft skills is the whitening of immigrants through the promotion of 'Canadian' ways of thinking, acting, and behaving" (p.246). It is important to note that the skills underlined by S. Guo (2015) such as making direct eye contact and making firm handshakes were not explicitly stated in the ads investigated in this study and the skills mentioned were somewhat universal and needed for the positions. For this reason, it is not possible to determine whether these skills, listed in the job ads and mentioned by administrators, are used to discriminate against candidates from different backgrounds or not. Nevertheless, as previously mentioned in the literature, Mackenzie (2021) underlined that discrimination is not always clearly stated, and that some employers opt for including less details in their job ads to avoid being "overtly discriminatory". Job applicants can still

face discrimination during the selection process, which draws the attention to possible hidden hiring criteria, which are not explicitly included in job advertisements, and which possibly disadvantages certain job applicants compared to others.

Context-Specific Hiring Criteria. Some of the differences that were noticed between both contexts were related to the "native status", degree requirements, number of years of experience, and national versus international experience. Even though language skills were an important employment factor, there were slight differences between both contexts in terms of the "nativeness" notion. Having high level of English language was evident and required in both Canada and the UAE, and both instructors and administrators agreed on these points. The requirements and expectations by administrators in Canada seemed more accepting and welcoming of instructors who spoke English as an additional language and/or who had an "accent". Such acceptance and inclusivity were reflected in some of the administrators' definitions of "nativeness" and their negative views of the term, underlining how it "has negative connotations" and that is why it is excluded from the job advertisements. In the UAE, even though there was a decrease in the use of the term "native" in the job advertisements, "nativeness" was required by some organizations and both instructors and administrators referred to its importance, and these results correspond to previous research on "nativeness" representing an important hiring criterion (Alshammari, 2021; Clark & Paran, 2007; Mahboob & Golden, 2013; Mahboob et al., 2004; Ruecker & Ives, 2015; Selvi, 2010). Even though not all the collected job advertisements required candidates to be "natives", "non-native" instructors were subjected to an extra criterion, which involved obtaining an IELTS test score of 8 to qualify for the job. Also, candidates with overseas teaching experience and experience in North American contexts were given preference reflecting a certain degree of

discrimination against candidates from outer circle countries. In addition, both instructors and administrator interviewed in the UAE also stressed on the importance of "nativeness" for Emirate employers. These results further align with what Alshammari (2021) mentioned on how "NS [Native Speaker] status is used as the central component and as a "certification" for English language proficiency" (p.9).

It was noticed that the frequency of using the term "native" in job ads is reducing compared to what previous research underlined and instructors and administrators referred to a change towards the use of the term "native-like" instead of "native", which they regarded as positive and inclusive. However, organizations continue to implicitly show preference for "native" candidates from inner circle countries. Also, during the interviews, one of the instructors mentioned how some organizations include certain criteria that only "native" inner circle applicants can fit such as having experience in specific contexts or receiving education from certain countries. These findings question how genuine employers are about the inclusivity of instructors from different backgrounds and if there is a real change in the use and understanding of the term "native", as despite the equity and inclusivity statements, some of the organizations explicitly discriminated against "non-native" instructors by stating that "Natives only" can apply or having "Native English is preferred".

Another difference between Canada and the UAE was related to the demandingness of the educational requirements and years of teaching experience and which was noticed in the job advertisements. In the UAE, degree requirements were more rigorous, and instructors were required to have a combination of the following: masters' degree, teaching certification, CELTA, DELTA, etc., and/or a PhD, compared to Canada where some organizations accepted a combination of a bachelor's degree and TESL

certification. These findings reflect what program administrators and instructors highlighted in the interviews and reflections regarding degree inflation in the UAE due to the higher number of qualified candidates compared to limited numbers of job openings. Years of teaching experience were also more demanding in the UAE ranging from 2-10 years, compared to Canada, where experience ranged from 1-5 years. A small number of program administrators in Canada were even open to hiring instructors who are newly certified or have one year of experience.

Specific to the Canadian context, Canadian experience was one of the main factors highlighted by the participants; however, the results gathered from the instructors contradicted those collected from program administrators and job advertisements. Instructors underlined that international experience was not sufficient to secure a job even if the instructors had the qualifications and experience needed and that having Canadian certification and experience were required. Despite having extensive teaching experience and holding masters and/or PhD degrees, instructors mentioned how they were not contacted for jobs except when they received TESL certification. Requiring Canadian experience and certification were viewed as gatekeepers for the instructors and were used as a tool for exclusion. One of the instructors referred to how it is not always direct and that organizations sometimes require knowledge of certain platforms that are only used in Canada to limit the chances for candidates with international experience. On the other hand, most of the administrators did not require Canadian experience and, contrary to what some of the instructors mentioned, some of them even highlighted that they require international experience or have preference for it, because it assists instructors in understanding the possible struggles that students experience while learning and helps them in understanding their culture. Program administrators underlined that the key factor that they search for in candidates is having experience in the same/similar context that they will teach, for example LINC, ESL, EAP, etc., whether this experience is/was acquired in Canada or internationally.

Such contradiction between the perspectives of instructors and administrators poses the question of why instructors believe that administrators prefer and/or require Canadian experience even though Canadian experience was not highlighted neither in the job advertisements nor by most of the administrators. It is possible that requiring Canadian experience is organization- or university-specific and does not apply to all educational institutes, or it can be connected to hidden hiring criteria that some administrators/organizations have and that is why this criterion is not directly included in the job ads. The notion of Canadian and international experience will be further explored in the analysis of the second research question.

Examination of the hiring criteria, which was underlined by instructors and administrators and listed in the job ads point to a certain degree of racialization towards instructors in both Canada and the UAE; however, the origin of racialization differs based on the context. In the UAE, racialization was based on instructors' race, "native" status, and nationality, which consequently led to racialization of skills due to the additional value given to experience and degrees received from Western countries. On the other hand, in Canada, racialization was mainly of skills and educational background and enforced by educational organizations, and in certain instances the source of racialization was students and their stereotypes based on instructors' "accent" and country of origin.

## 5.1.2 Research Question Two

The second research question explored the factors that affect program administrators' hiring decisions of English instructors in the TESOL job market in

Canada and the UAE. The question was answered using interview data gathered from program administrators and instructors to explore the perspective of both sides and highlight the perceived factors that instructors believe affect their hiring decisions. In the findings, program administrators in Canada underlined several factors that contribute to their hiring decision and how positively they evaluate an instructor such as demonstrating several soft skills, having volunteer experience, showing stability in previous jobs, performing well during the interview, having international experience, and having teaching experience in specific courses i.e., EAP, ESL, LINC, among others. In the UAE, the factors were related to candidates' country of origin (nationality), "native" status, current political situations in their countries and relation to the UAE, and misconceptions and prejudices about instructors who speak EAL. As for the factors that instructors mentioned, they overlapped with most of the factors already mentioned by program administrators in both contexts, and the only difference was highlighting the importance of having Canadian experience and connections in the job market in Canada.

Soft Skills. Program administrators highlighted several soft skills that they search for in the instructors they hire such as having good communication and leadership skills, being able to work individually and in groups, being proactive, engaging in professional development, and being culturally sensitivity, among others. Cultural sensitivity was one of the main points that administrators in Canada and the UAE mentioned. In the Canadian context, program administrators underlined that some of their students are immigrants and refugees who come from different backgrounds and who have different experiences, e.g., escaping from wars and conflicts, and it is thus important for the instructors to be respectful, understanding, and supportive of these students and being culturally sensitive. Since Canada is one of the major immigrants receiving countries in the world (Valenta et

al., (2017) with "almost one in four people (23.0%) are or have been a landed immigrant or permanent resident in Canada" (Statistics Canada, 2022), it is logical that program administrators highlight culture sensitivity when hiring instructors, as instructors will be expected to work with students from different cultures and backgrounds and with different lived experiences.

*Interview Interactions.* Interview interactions with instructors were one of the major points influencing the hiring decisions, and they were highlighted by both administrators and instructors. Administrators in Canada referred to interview interactions and how instructors' answers, the way they show and share their knowledge, and how they interact in the interview are factors that differentiate a strong candidate from others. Program administrators also pointed to the importance of how instructors eloquently and professionally answer the questions and offer concrete examples; this factor was also referred to in the Emirate context. In addition, interview interactions and answers to the questions were used as a sign for having certain soft skills such as having good communication skills, taking initiative, being honest, and taking responsibility for mistakes. Moreover, program administrators highlighted the importance and the benefits of having international experience, which connects again to the culture understanding and sensitivity aspects discussed earlier. Furthermore, they underlined how instructors should be confident during the interview but displaying this confidence should be balanced and not shown in a way that imply that instructors know everything. Finally, instructors' attitudes during the interview, expressing genuine interest in the job, and following up on the interview were additional factors that administrators underscored in relation to affecting their hiring decisions.

Instructors' Perspective in Canada. Compared to program administrators and specific to the hiring decisions in the Canadian context, instructors referred to how volunteer and Canadian experience, connections in the field, and self-promotion during the interview were important factors that affect the hiring decisions. Volunteering was an important factor mentioned by both administrators and instructors, and it represented an opportunity to receive Canadian experience and/or experience in specific contexts such as working with adults. Instructors advised fellow job applicants to highlight volunteer experience, which is an opportunity to underline having Canadian experience during the interview, and which can potentially improve instructors' chances of getting hired. The notion of requiring Canadian experience connects to comments mentioned by instructors related to the non-recognition of their international experience, which frustrated many of them, as they were not able to teach English without receiving TESL certification despite their extensive experiences and educational and teaching qualifications. These findings connect to the previously mentioned research on credential equivalency systems in Canada, which are used to frame immigrants as the "other" and how the equivalency system represent a new form of "head tax" used to devalue immigrants' international credentials and experience and to racialize them and their skills (Bauder, 2003; Motha, 2006; Rivas-Garrido & Koning, 2019; S. Guo, 2009, 2015; S. Guo & Shan, 2013). In this study, instructors were highly qualified holding a combination of graduate degrees, MA, and/or PhDs, and extensive international teaching experience; nevertheless, they continued to face difficulties securing employment, were required to receive accreditation, and sought Canadian experience, as they claimed it was a requirement in the Canadian job market. These finding connect back to the notion of racialization of skills underscored in the discussion of the first research question.

It is possible that employers require TESL certification because they are unfamiliar with the quality and content of instructors' foreign educational credentials, which is what Banerjee et al. (2021) referred to. Nevertheless, since skilled immigrants are required to include an Educational Credential Assessment (ECA) in their immigration application, it is unclear why instructors are required to re-evaluate their credentials and experience. Despite the previous interpretation, it is important to note that all program administrators expressed that they valued international experience, and most of them did not require instructors to have Canadian experience. Some of them also underlined that they are not the ones responsible for the job requirements listed, and others mentioned that TESL certification is a requirement due to being an accredited organization and/or being part of Languages Canada. In addition, during the interviews with the program administrators, some of shared that most of their instructors speak EAL and/or belonged to minority groups, had "accents", and had no Canadian experience, which shows that their employment standards were inclusive and did not "other" instructors with foreign experience and credentials. A possible conclusion for the contradiction between the instructors' and administrators' views concerning Canadian experience is the possible difference in requirements by different Canadian organizations where some view Canadian experience as an essential requirement while others do not.

Connections in the TESOL Field. Having connections in the field was a factor underlined by different instructors highlighting how it can offer access to possible job opportunities and can potentially facilitate the interview process. These findings align with those of Nakhaie and Kazemipur (2013) who underlined that there is positive relationship between different types of connections, i.e. with family and immediate relatives friends or involvement in associations, connections with those at different levels

of power, i.e., teachers and employers, and employment", underlining that "other forms of bridging (associational involvement) and linking (finding the job through school/teacher) social capital has positive and significant relationships with SES [Social Economic Scale]" (p.433). Connections were viewed positively by some instructors who underlined how it can facilitate the interview, which is usually time-consuming and consequently it was regarded as a positive change for these instructors. However, for others, they believed that it deprived newcomer instructors of opportunities, e.g., the case of internal job postings. The negative view by some instructors of connections is understandable, as when exploring the situation of immigrants in Canada, Nakhaie and Kazemipur (2013) referred to how visible minorities' "cultural values and institutional familiarities" are disadvantaged compared to their White counterparts. Program administrators in Canada did not refer to this point; however, in the UAE, the administrator referred to the importance of connections, and her knowledge of individuals who used these connection "for getting through various credentials".

Instructors' Self-Promotion. Instructors in both contexts referred to self-promotion, which was previously discussed in the literature, and how it is important during the interview. However, they negatively viewed this factor and, as Nader commented, "sometimes they [recruiters] need a salesperson, not a teacher". The relation between self-promotion and employment outcomes, which the instructors shared during the interviews, aligns with previous research by Stevens and Kristof (1995). Also, despite the weak connection between interview results and self-promotion, which Higgins and Judge (2004) underlined, their findings related to the influence of these tactics on the employment process align with the current study. In addition, the results of the current study corresponded with those of Higgins and Judge (2004) regarding the relationship

between P-O (Person-Organization) and P-J (Person-Job) fit and hiring decisions. That is, administrators sought instructors with past experience teaching certain courses (e.g., EAP, ESL, LINC, etc.) and certain groups of students (immigrants, adults, etc.), and they preferred hiring those instructors over others that lacked those specific experiences.

Context-Specific Variables in the UAE. In the Emirate context, the main factors that affected the hiring decisions and which program administrators highlighted were a) instructors' educational qualifications and experience, b) their background and country of origin, c) politics, and d) answers instructors provided during the interview. Degree inflation was one of the points shared by administrators and instructors, where an MA was no longer sufficient to secure a job in a university setting in the UAE, and the administrator reflected on her own experience related to how not completing her PhD limited her employment opportunities. Other factors were related to how some organizations hire based on instructors' nationality and "native" status, and aspects of the political situation in the instructor's country of origin (e.g., whether it had a good relationship with the UAE, whether there was political instability there, etc.). In addition, there were several misconceptions about instructors who spoke EAL, for example, a preference for "native" instructors, which was highlighted in the job advertisement, and which can potentially reduce "non-native" instructors' chances of being hired. The findings in the Emirate context align with previous research conducted on discrimination faced by educators in the job market due to the "native-non-native" dichotomy (Clark & Paran, 2007; Flynn & Gulikers, 2001; Jeon & Lee, 2006; Lancee, 2019; Tatar, 2019). The findings also highlight the role that country of origin, language (First language, mother tongue), and "accent" can play in who is viewed as a "native", and how these variables can possibly define who qualifies to teach English. This finding crystalized in the

Canadian context when students disapproved and complained about English instructors who were wearing the veil and had an accent, as they did not fit the "native" profile. Finally, cultural awareness and instructors' sexual orientations were additional aspects that affected employment in the UAE; however, cultural awareness was not necessarily related to classroom teaching; it also pertained to instructors' general conduct in the UAE and expectations of what they can and cannot do. As for sexual orientations, the program administrator interviewed mentioned that administrators were not allowed to hire instructors who were thought to be gay; nevertheless, it is important to note that the administrator's experience in the UAE was not recent, as she moved from the UAE over 10 years ago, and she underlined that she believes that the situation in the UAE is changing and improving.

The findings discussed in this question shed light on the presence of multiple variables (e.g., "Native" status, nationality, self-promotion, connections, etc.) that affect program administrators' decision when hiring instructors. These intersecting elements differ not only based on the context (i.e., UAE compared to Canada) but also based on who views these variables (i.e., instructors compared to administrators). This difference connects to the first research question in relation to the mismatch between instructors' and administrators' views, and it further highlights the important role of counternarratives in crystallizing instructors' experiences and views whilst offering administrators the opportunity to share their perspectives.

# **5.1.3 Research Question Three**

Question three explored factors that shape and influence the experiences of ESL/EFL instructors in the TESOL job market in Canada and the UAE, and the counterstories that were found in their experiences in relation to dominant narratives. The

dominant narrative in this research study referred to the stereotypes about instructors who speak English as an additional language and who have international credentials and experience. These stereotypes were related to how these instructors were viewed by some employers and students as less competent and/or less qualified than "native" instructors with Western credentials and experience due to their "accent", nationality, country of origin, religion, age, gender, and non-Western credentials and experience. The research question was answered by discussing the changes and challenges that the instructors faced in the job market, crystalizing how they handled these issues and counteracted the dominant narrative. Instructors' interviews and journal reflections were the main sources used to answer this question; however, some data were added from the program administrators' interviews to highlight the discriminatory actions against instructors and ways of support offered by the administrators.

Instructors' experiences on the job market were affected both positively and negatively by the various changes in the job market (i.e., degree inflation, equivalency requirements, decrease in the use of term "native" by employers and in job advertisements, Covid-related changes, and decrease in demand for English instructors). Some of these changes resulted in challenges for the instructors, while others created opportunities, and the following section will highlight the changes, challenges, opportunities, and related recommendations.

Changes and Challenges in the TESOL Job Market. Instructors referred to different changes and challenges in the TESOL job market in both contexts. In the UAE, they pointed to degree inflation, equivalency, low compensation, and "nativeness", as the main changes in the Emirate context. Degree inflation and equivalency reflected how demanding the job market was and how, despite these requirements, salaries were

decreasing compared to previous years, highlighting how there were possibly more instructors seeking opportunities than jobs being offered. Another change was related to "nativeness" and requiring instructors to be from inner circle countries, which, according to instructors and administrators, is shifting and being replaced by the term "native-like". Such shift represented a positive change for instructors and a possible sign of a more inclusive job market, which prioritized educational qualifications and experience over having a "native" status. Despite the change related to "nativeness", several instances of discrimination were mentioned by both administrators and instructors related to instructors' country of origin and nationality, and stereotypes by students who expect and/or prefer a "native" instructor with Western credentials. The somewhat positive changes underlined were not sufficient neither for instructors nor program administrators to continue working in the UAE, and they all decided to travel to other countries seeking higher education, better living conditions for their families, and citizenship to facilitate their employment and travel experiences.

In Canada, there were similar changes such as changes related to Covid-19 and its effect on the teaching mode, demand for instructors, the need for being familiar with using different online platforms, and changes in students' population. There were also challenges that instructors mentioned such as TESL certification, precarity and low compensation of teaching job, the importance of connections, and instances of discrimination towards instructors. Instructors in the study complained about how the job market is demanding while at the same time offering low salaries, which is almost identical to the Emirate context. Instructors also referred to the decrease in demand for instructors due to Covid-19 and low numbers of student enrolment, which aligns with Hartshorn and McMurry's (2020) results discussing how the pandemic affected ESL

instructors' job security and financial stability. In addition, these findings correspond with what instructors and administrators highlighted in Almeida and Santos' (2020) study in relation to the precarious and short-term nature of employment opportunities due to Covid-19. Instructors in the current study were optimistic about the job market, and they underlined that the effect of Covid is regressing, and the job market is opening. To improve instructors' conditions in the job market there are multiple steps that universities and colleges can take such as offering them insurance, employment protection, and fair salaries and work conditions. These suggestions will be further discussed in the recommendations' section.

TESL certification was one the main gatekeepers that instructors reflected on, describing it as costly and time-consuming and how it does not recognize their international experience and credentials; nevertheless, some instructors claimed that certification is somewhat a justified tool for organizations to ensure that instructors are qualified. The financial burden of certification and equivalency aligns with Turin et al.'s (2023) study, which investigated barriers facing International Medical Graduates (IMG) when pursuing equivalency for their degrees. Connected to certification, requiring Canadian experience was an additional challenge which devalued instructors international experience and credentials. The findings related to Canadian experience and the use of certification as a gatekeeper align with previous studies by S. Guo and Shan (2013) and S. Guo (2009) who referred to the use of credential equivalency as a tool for othering immigrants. Finally, networking and connections were viewed as a gatekeeper by some instructors and an opportunity by others, where some believed it was unjust to newcomers to Canada who have limited connections, while others underlined that it facilitated the interview process and provided access to job opportunities.

Countering these gatekeepers is the responsibility of not only TESL-certifying organization but also instructors in the TESOL field. For example, TESL organization can facilitate the certification process (offering financial support and/or fee waivers), and possibly re-think waiving the certification requirements for those who have international experience and credentials. Instructors also play a role in creating connections in the field by engaging in professional development opportunities.

Dominant Narrative and Discriminatory Practices. Discrimination was one of the challenges that instructors and program administrators highlighted in both contexts, and the following section will underline the experiences of instructors with discrimination and how program administrators supported instructors who faced such practices. Instructors referred to encountering discriminatory practices both in Canada and internationally due to their nationality, "non-native" status, accent, and age, gender, among others. They also used loaded language such as "outcast, dishonest, neglected, ridiculed, and dismissed" to describe the challenges they experienced and the job market, which reflected a deep sense of injustice. When reflecting on their international teaching experiences, some instructors referred to a preference for male instructors especially in corporate English, as students perceived male instructors as a trusted source of knowledge. However, specific to the Canadian context, one of the male instructors referred to preference for female instructors pointing to gender equality policies and how they limit male instructors' job opportunities. Also, another instructor referred to discrimination against instructors who speak EAL in the TESOL job market, and he explained that "people from other parts of the world do like to see an English name, at least when they're applying to a program". In addition, instructors referred to how being White and having native-like "accents" assisted them in getting hired internationally.

Such biases led instructors to conceal their real age and nationalities or lie about them to be able to secure teaching jobs and avoid discrimination. These findings align with the literature on Whiteness, White-passing, "accents" and "accent" reduction, "legitimate" dialects, and "nativeness", and how they privilege some individuals compared to others (Bourdieu & Thompson, 1991; Gnevsheva, 2017; Y. Guo, 2009; Huang, 2018; Kubota & Lin, 2006; Ladson-Billings & Tate, 1995; Leonardo, 2002; Norton, 1997; Piller, 2002). They also point to the reason for the pursuit of some of the instructors to hold inner circle passports and nationalities as, from their experience, being citizens of certain countries (e.g., US, UK, Canada, etc.) is an important criterion for some organizations in different countries.

It is possible that international students' stereotypes referred to by both instructors and administrators were related to how the English programs were advertised to them in their home countries and, as discussed by previous researchers, how some organizations focus on the use of marketing to idealize for students the experience abroad, the bright futures they can have by learning to speak English well, and the "native" instructors who will teach them (Bodis, 2023; Phyak, 2020). Results from these studies can possibly explain why some students in the current study were not satisfied when they traveled to Canada to be taught English by a "non-native" instructor. However, to clearly understand students' perspective, research is needed to explore the ideal English instructor from students' perspective, how international English programs are advertised for in students' home countries, and students' perceptions of "native" and "non-native" instructors.

Concerning the program administrators, some of them referred to stereotypes by students about their "non-native" instructors or by management/HR in their organizations,

and how they supported the instructors underlining that the discrimination was based on stereotypes and not actual issues with instructors' teaching abilities. Administrators referred to various instances of discrimination that instructors witnessed, previously discussed in the findings chapter, and how they supported those instructors in the face of the unfounded biases. These findings underscore how program administrators did not only recognize EAL instructors' experiences and were aware of different discriminatory practices instructors faced, but they also stood against these practices by supporting the instructors. Such support was in the form of hiring instructors who do not conform to the stereotypical view that some international students expect (e.g., Having "accents", speaking EAL, wearing hijab, etc.), and taking steps to ensure fair compensation. These findings align with what Rivera (2022) referred to about the beliefs of those in power and the critical role they play in bringing about positive change.

These different variables mentioned by administrators and instructors as sources of discrimination (e.g., instructors' "accent", religious attire (hijab), "non-native" status, gender, age, and nationality) not only support previous research on the presence of discrimination in the job market but also highlight how discrimination can be multilayered and how the intersection between the variables can affect instructors' experience in the classroom (Leckcivilize & Straub, 2018; Syed & Pio, 2010; Weichselbaumer, 2020). It is also evident that discrimination instructors face can originate from different sources (students, recruiters, and administrators) and differ from one context/country to the other. Furthermore, based on the findings, it can be inferred that such discriminatory practices affect instructors' employment outcomes sometimes positively and other times negatively depending on the context/country and the person making/enforcing the hiring decisions. It is thus crucial that universities and colleges set clear hiring criteria and

conform to equity, diversity, and inclusivity standards. Also, instructors play an important role in countering these discriminatory practices. Finally, it was interesting to see that despite the challenges and biases encountered in the job market, instructors were able to prove their abilities and competence in teaching and speaking the language and counter these stereotypes, and the following section will highlight some of these examples.

Instructors' Counter-stories. The instructors who were interviewed and who shared their stories and reflections came from very diverse and rich backgrounds, and they were highly qualified and had many years of teaching experience. Being able to strive against the multiple challenges they encountered in the job market was a sign of their perseverance and competence. All of them decided to leave their home countries or countries where they used to work internationally to find a place which is more inclusive where they can get a higher education degree and/or passport to easily secure a job and a better life for themselves and their families. They used different tactics to counter the challenges they faced, and the following paragraphs will highlight how they tackled these obstacles.

Instructors countered challenges related to TESL certification, "non-native" status, discrimination, and stereotypes by going through the certification process even though it was time-consuming and expensive for many of them, and they successfully completed all the requirements and most of them were able to find jobs and/or enroll in post-graduate studies. They also intentionally highlighted their "non-native" status and used it as a tool to empower their students who spoke EAL, just like their instructors. These actions taken by instructors to counter the native-non-native dichotomy align with what Choi (2016) referred to related to ESL speakers' role in being critical and agentive in the face of this dichotomy, as they have a role in constructing and reconstructing what

language competency means. Instructors also empowered themselves and showed their agency by underlining the various strengths and capitals they bring to their classes and students, explaining how they experienced learning a new language, were familiar with the different challenges learners face, and were aware of different cultures, among others. An additional strategy that instructors used was focusing on the positive experiences they have had with their students and their overall teaching experience. Also, as mentioned earlier, administrators played a role in countering the stereotypes by hiring instructors from diverse backgrounds and who spoke EAL, supporting instructors against the discriminatory practices they face, and acknowledging their potential.

Instructors in the study invested years in receiving education and work experience in the field of education which highlights their passion for teaching, and when they were asked about alternative jobs to teaching that they might consider, most of them listed education-related positions, such as, research, administration, and curriculum development. Such commitment to the field and to teaching can be possibly explained by the effect of the pandemic on job-unstable workers, which Cech and Hiltner (2022) discussed, and how their level of passion for their work increased. The increased passion is a possible explanation for why most of the instructors were not willing to give up on teaching despite the multiple challenges they faced. However, some of instructors considered travelling abroad or changing careers due to receiving low salaries, being hired on a part-time or contract basis, and having difficulty finding jobs. It is concerning to see that highly qualified instructors are considering abandoning their teaching careers after investing many years in refining their skills; however, it is not surprising as previous research (e.g., Bauder, 2003; Turin, et al. 2023) previously discussed how immigrants from different fields forsake their original careers due to high cost and effort exerted to

receive equivalency and accreditation processes. It is worthy of mentioning that changing careers is not always an easy step to do, as in Turin et al.'s (2023) study, IMGs faced various challenges including discrimination when seeking alternative jobs, and thus instructors should carefully consider the alternative paths they chose before they make their decisions.

A counter tactic used by instructors and referred to by program administrators was a high number of rejections for jobs by instructors. One of the administrators reflected on a change connected to employment after Covid-19 where instructors are making special requests and preferring to teach online instead of face-to-face. Such preference for teaching online is understandable, because working online offered instructors a higher degree of flexibility, saved them time commuting to and from work, and offered them more time with family. Such change underlines how instructors are starting to place their own conditions after experiencing the various benefits of online teaching, and it is possibly related to the Great Reshuffle and post-pandemic shift in power dynamics that Edmond (2022) and Smith and Guillotin (2022) referred to. This shift underlines the importance of instructors' critical and proactive role in bringing about change in the job market, and it should also encourage recruiters/employer to offer fair compensation and flexible work conditions.

To sum up, this section discussed the three research questions investigated in the current study, and it connected the findings to previous research. The first question underlined the major hiring criteria used in the Canadian and Emirate job markets, while highlighting both common and context-specific criteria. The second question focused on the variables that affect program administrators hiring decisions (i.e., soft skills, interview interactions, etc.) and compared them to those of instructors. The third research question

underlined instructors' counter-stories and the changes and challenges they faced in the job market.

The following section will be more personal in nature, compared to all previous chapters in the study, and this personal aspect will especially manifest in the reflection and the postscript sections. This is not to say that the previous chapters were not personal, as the choice of the study's topic stemmed from my own personal experience and interest; however, since this topic started from a personal experience, I wanted to also end the discussion of the topic by some of my personal reflections of the findings.

# 5.2 Final Reflections

Reading through the literature especially articles on discrimination and how race and racism play out in different contexts was very unsettling for me not only during the reading stage but also the writing process of the literature review. It painted a very bleak image of the world that we live in and how our experiences and lives are affected by variables that we have no control of. I felt a deep connection with the struggles that many researchers discussed about discrimination that job candidates faced because of their religion, language, accent, nationality, weight, and beauty, among others (Blommaert, 2010; Derous, Pepermans, et al., 2017; DeVaro et al., 2018; Ghodrati et al., 2015; Y. Guo, 2009; Leckcivilize & Straub, 2018; Mahboob & Golden, 2013; Rooth, 2009). Despite the frustration and sorrow that my previous personal experience with discrimination and the stories I read about in the literature, it helped me prepare for whatever my research journey brings me, which I expected to be very negative and filled with even more sad stories. Even though this was partially true due to different challenges while recruiting participants in the UAE, and the various stories told by both program administrators and instructors about discrimination and biases, I was able to notice how

awareness and knowledge allowed for many bright stories to flourish among the sad and dark ones.

By telling the stories of administrators and instructors, I believe that I countered my own fears and past experiences and reached what Wink (2011) called "conscientization", where you find the power within you and empower yourself instead of seeking the strength from an external source. The resilience that instructors showed, and the perseverance manifested in their stories showed me that discrimination is evident, which is not a surprise, however, being aware of it coupled with being proactive can unsettle its presence even if its presence is adamant and difficult to eradicate. Taking a stand and being proactive were two key powers to counteract discrimination, which clearly crystalized in this research project. Instructors' journeys proved how their perseverance coupled with agency allowed them to reach their professional and educational goals despite the multiple instances of discrimination they faced. Also, administrators' attitude and actions when supporting instructors in the face of discrimination underscored their crucial role in brining about change, which should go hand in hand with instructors' proactiveness and agency. In addition, the findings related to how instructors extended their agency to their students (i.e., highlighting their "nonnative" status) and taking steps to set their own term by refusing job offers or requesting additional benefits highlights how proactivity is a key counter-tactic that Covid-19 uncovered. These results support previous research on the role of agency and proactivity, taking ownership of the English language, empowering students, and role of those in power in brining about change (Choi, 2016; Gillborn, 2019; Rivera, 2022; Selvi, 2009; Sifakis & Sougari, 2003; Widdowson, 1994).

While acknowledging the importance of underlining instructors' journeys and the struggles they encounter due to recruiters and employers' biases, it is equally important to underscore administrators' experiences, which were almost absent in the literature. Such absence of administrators' voices and based on the findings from the current study on administrators' role in supporting instructors necessitates further investigation. Despite instructors' agency and proactivity, instructors' journeys and employment and work experiences can be facilitated if there is support from within the educational organizations and from people in power. It is important to acknowledge that the precarity of administrators' voices is not necessarily out of neglect of their experiences or an attempt to dwell over discrimination; however, the difficulties to recruit in the UAE were possibly an indication of an avoidance of discussing employment processes that administrators follow. This conclusion is not based on a mere speculation but a reflection on an interaction with an instructor in the UAE whose data was excluded due to not fitting the eligibility criteria. The instructor provided very short answers during the interview and repeatedly mentioned how certain information she provided can give away her identity. She also referred to how she was not hired because of her "native" status even though she was not asked about it. My interaction with her was very uncomfortable, as I felt a certain degree of hostility, which can possibly indicate her fear to be identified by the organization in which she works. This interaction along with the recruitment challenges in the UAE, which will be discussed later, hinted to different possibilities of why instructors and administrators in the UAE opted for not participating in the study. These possibilities include 1) instructors' fear of losing their jobs and identified by their employers, 2) administrators' effort to avoid research studies that can possibly portray them and/or their employment criteria as unfair or discriminatory and 3) a lack of interest

in research studies, which do not take place from within the organizations and which cannot be used as a positive reinforcement of their reputation and image.

A final reflection that I believe is worthy to mention and to which I referred in my findings and discussion is the notion of hidden criteria. It was difficult to draw a hard conclusion of the presence of hidden criteria, as it was not expected from administrators to simply say they use hidden to exclude certain instructors for example due to lacking Canadian experience, or being "non-natives", etc. However, it is not logical to disregard the almost unified view that instructors had about the lack of appreciation and recognition of their foreign credentials and experiences, which crystallized in requiring TESL certification and which was highlighted in the literature (Bauder, 2003; S. Guo, 2009, 2015; Y. Guo, 2009). Even though requiring TESL certification or degree equivalency in Canada or the UAE were clearly shared in job advertisements, the hidden aspect is the devalue, dismissal, and othering of instructors' degrees and work experience. Uncovering what certification and equivalency stand for should not only uncover the hidden reasons for requiring them but also should resolve the mismatch between the views of instructors and administrators. Thus, further research from within the organizations with a focus on program administrators can clarify any hidden criteria that were not evident and/or shared in the current study. In the following two sections, I will underline different recommendations and future research ideas, while underlining the significance of my study and how it added to the previous literature.

## 5.3 Recommendations

There are various steps that can be taken to address the challenges that instructors encounter in the TESOL job market. These steps are the responsibility of not only

program administrators, recruiters, and TESL-certifying organizations, but also instructors themselves. These recommendations represent a first step towards improving the employment experiences and conditions of instructors and aim to offering a more inclusive work environment to instructors from different backgrounds and experiences.

Educational organizations play an essential role in improving instructors work conditions, which can be achieved through offering instructors a form of employment protection and/or insurance during such difficult circumstances (Covid-19, low student enrolment, etc.), which can help them in having more employment stability. Universities and colleges should also fairly compensate instructors, which should urge instructors to remain in the TESOL field instead of resorting to other careers, which are less demanding and offer better salaries. In addition, employers in the TESOL field should provide instructors with flexible work conditions, which align with the current changes happening due to the pandemic (working from home, online teaching, etc.). Concerning discrimination in the TESOL job market, challenging it, and offering a more inclusive work environment for instructors are not easy tasks; however certain steps can be taken to start bringing about change. For example, educational organizations must set clear hiring criteria, no hidden requirements, and adhere to EDI standards when hiring instructors. Also, there needs to be continuous supervision from the Ministry of Education to ensure the application of these standards.

In relation to the challenges related to TESL certification, waiving, or offering financial support to instructors who are struggling financially and are unable to pay the certification fees is a possible solution, which can either be offered by TESL organizations and/or the government. Another suggestion is facilitating and/or shortening the accreditation process, which many instructors find time-consuming. Also, offering

express certification streams to instructors who have the teaching experience, qualification, and certification, whether international or provincial, should show instructors that their experience and education is acknowledged. Such express streams should also save instructors the time and effort of the accreditation process.

Finally, to complement the role of TESL-certifying organizations, program administrators, and educational organization (i.e., universities and colleges), instructors play a crucial role in countering the changes and challenges in the job market. For instance, instructors should be proactive and critical of their employment conditions and should strive to benefit from the post-pandemic power shift and negotiate their job offers to receive fair compensation and working conditions. Also, they should continue to challenge the "native-non-native" speaker dichotomy and empower themselves and their students. In addition, they should continue to develop themselves both academically and professionally by attending educational conferences, workshops, and webinars, which should offer them various opportunities to create connections in the field and improve their employment prospects.

## 5.4 Significance and Future Research

Several researchers investigated challenges that job seekers face in the job market in general (Derous, Pepermans, et al., 2017; DeVaro et al., 2018; Leckcivilize & Straub, 2018; Mahboob & Golden, 2013), and others highlighted such difficulties in the field of education (Jeon & Lee, 2006; Mahboob & Golden, 2013; Tatar, 2019). These challenges included discrimination due to race, religion, and weight, among others, and these challenges presented themselves in different phases of the applicants' job application starting from resume screening, during the hiring process, and after employment.

Researchers who conducted research on the discriminatory hiring practices encountered

by instructors in the TESOL and ELT fields highlighted the importance of rejecting such practices and underlined the need for more research that explores this issue (Jenkins, 2017; Ruecker & Ives, 2015).

There is scarcity of research investigating hiring criteria, hiring practices in the TESOL job market in the UAE and Canada, and this study assisted in partially filling this gap; however, more research is still needed in this area. Also, the study highlighted and compared instructors' and program administrators' views of the changes and challenges in the TESOL job market and the different hiring criteria, and requirements used to hire ESL/EFL instructors. To the best of the researcher's knowledge, this study was the first to represent program administrators' views in the higher education sector and compare them to instructors' perspectives in the TESOL field. Drawing such comparison was important, as it highlighted not only the similarities but also the mismatch between instructors' and administrators' views. Also, exploring these different gaps provided information on the changes, challenges, and opportunities in the TESOL field and which can be utilized to support ESL/EFL instructors who are affected by the different hiring practices, facilitate their job hunt, and initiate a dialogue between instructors and program administrators to discuss their different views, especially related to the Canadian and international experience requirement. In addition, it is hoped that the study offered instructors and program administrators an opportunity to voice their opinions about the challenges and changes present in the TESOL job market and reflect on their experiences in the field. Additionally, the findings of the study can hopefully assist instructors in better understanding the job market in both the Emirate and Canadian contexts, the hiring criteria program administrators use, and the expected and desired qualifications they search for to facilitate instructors' employment experiences. Furthermore, with the factors that shape and affect instructors' employment experiences explored and highlighted, it is hoped that they prompt program administrators and educational organizations to recognize and value instructors' international experiences and educational qualifications and certification, facilitate the certification process, and consider alternatives to the lengthy, time-consuming, and costly certification process. Finally, this study added to the limited research utilizing CRT, intersectionality and counter-storytelling when investigating the TESOL field. The study also added to CRT and intersectionality, as it underlined the need for critical theories in the filed of TESOL and contributed to highlighting how instructors' experiences in the job market are affected not only by race but also by multiple variables such as gender, skin color, first language, foreign credentials, accent, and nationality, among others. In addition, it shed light on the power relations between administrators and instructors and how administrators play an essential role in supporting instructors facing discrimination and unfair treatment.

As previously mentioned, future research is needed to supplement the recommendations suggested to instructors, recruiters, and TESL certifying organizations. For example, it is important to further explore degree assessment and certification requirements in Canada and equivalency in the UAE to better understand the reason for burdening instructors with processes that are time-consuming and costly despite instructors being highly qualified and having extensive experiences in the field. Even though recommendations were made to facilitate and hasten accreditation and equivalency processes and/or waive the accreditation fees, it is essential to investigate if instructors genuinely require them. Additional exploration of the Emirate context is needed to recruit a bigger number of instructors and program administrators with recent experience in the Emirate job market to draw clearer conclusions about the job market

and instructors' and administrators' views. Furthermore, research is needed to investigate TESL certification processes, requirements, and rationale for such requirements, and the perspective of TESL-granting organizations is needed to complement the views of instructors and program administrators. Investigating TESL-granting organizations' views represents one of the essential research gaps that require researcher's attention, as it can clarify the rationale for requiring certification and steps taken/to be taken by these organizations to assist instructors in the certification process. These organizations will also benefit from knowing how instructors feel about the costly and lengthy processes and instructors' doubts about the genuine need for such certification. Moreover, it important to explore possible solutions to manage the precarious and low-paying employment conditions that instructors referred to in the TESOL job market and how to create a more stable and financially rewarding working conditions. Finally, the use of the terms "native" and "native-like" in the UAE should be further investigated to explore whether the change reflected in some of the advertisements analyzed and mentioned by participants reflect a genuine change in the universities and colleges' requirements.

## 5.5 Limitations of the Study

As previously mentioned, there were different recruitment challenges that the researcher encountered, especially in the UAE, which resulted in recruiting a small number of participants, and due to the sample size, it was not possible to generalize the findings to either context. Nevertheless, the aim of this study was not to generalize the findings but offer a detailed description of instructors' and program administrators views, experiences, and stories using qualitative tools, interviews, journal reflections, job advertisements, questionnaires. Another limitation was related to instructors' and program administrators' experiences in the UAE, as with the exception of one instructor

who left the UAE in 2021, most of their work experiences there were not recent; however, their experiences assisted in crystalizing the challenges in the job market in the past and present, as well as the changes they noticed over the years.

Despite the limitations, the study highlighted the perspectives of not only instructors but also program administrators, whose views were not previously researched, to the researcher's knowledge. The study also drew comparisons between the views of instructors and administrators in two different immigrant-receiving contexts and compared the findings to past research. In addition, this research study was the first to compare the TESOL job markets in Canada and the UAE, and this comparison was important, as a) it highlighted the mismatch between the views of instructors and administrators, b) underscored the differences and similarities between the TESOL job markets in both countries, and c) underlined the opportunities offered to instructors and challenging encountering them in both contexts. Furthermore, the qualitative nature of most of the research methods in the study offered instructors and administrators the chance to provide detailed descriptions of their experiences on the job market and elaborate on changes and challenges present in the TESOL field.

## 5.6 Postscript

In a commercial by Google advertising for Google Career Certificate, Célian and Ruchita shared their experience pursuing the certificate. Célian started his story by saying, "[j]ust because I worked in the same field for 10 years doesn't mean it's what I was meant to do", followed by Ruchita who stated "[when] I came to Canada, I wasn't able to find a job with the prior experience I had. I needed to make a change" (Google, 2022a, 2022b). Célian's and Ruchita's statements makes one wonder, why did Célian have to give up his original career and his 10 years of experiences to achieve his dream.

Also, why could not Ruchita find a job with her prior experience when she came to Canada? What magic powers does this 6-months career certificate have that their previous years of experience in their home countries could not help them achieve?

This "quick fix" certificate seems too similar to the TESL certification process in Canada, where instructors' years of experience and education are only recognized after they teach for a few hours and conduct classroom observations in a Canadian context. Do these hours really equip instructors to teach in Canada? And does teaching in Canada differ that much from other contexts where instructors with international or even out-of-province experience have previously taught? This keen interest in equivalency and certification is even stronger in the UAE, where an MA is no longer sufficient, and a PhD is desired in addition to receiving equivalency. The question that poses itself due to such demanding criteria is, what is enough to secure a job in the TESOL field and since these jobs are that competitive, why is it that their salaries do not reflect this degree of competitiveness?

Instructors in this study left their home countries to secure jobs and in some cases to receive citizenships to have better lives; however, employers seem to continuously raise the bar with no clear reflection in job security, salaries, or benefits. The demandingness of the job market combined with students' and employers' biases and discrimination, "non-native" status, race, and countries of origin complicate instructors' employment experiences even further. These intersections were shared by instructors and referred to by program administrators, which poses the question of why does the job market continue to challenge instructors? Also, where does the mismatch in the notion of Canadian vs international experience stem from? In addition, when will the race for

higher degrees stop, and when will instructors' experience and education be sufficient for employers?

Reflecting on these questions, let's imagine how Nader's journey in the UAE would have differed if he were a "native" English speaker and belonged to an inner circle country. If his language skills and qualifications were regarded as "sufficient" and "legitimate", how would his career decisions have differed and would immigrating to Canada have been necessary? Also, looking at Hanie's experience and the challenges she faced finding a job in Canada, would returning to the UAE have been an option if she was fairly compensated for her years of experience and education? How would her choices have differed? Finally, would Atefeh continue to consider leaving the TESOL field if it was easier to secure a full-time job and if she felt that she was equally compensated compared to individuals working in other careers?

In a world oriented along the lines of CRT, inclusivity, and social justice, imagine how Nader, Hanie, Atefeh and other instructors' trajectories may have been. For example, Nader would have been able to secure a stable and well-paying teaching position which compensated him well to fund his children's education in the UAE. Hanie would have easily secured a full-time job in Canada and would not have considered returning to the UAE due to low salaries and precarious job opportunities in the field. Atefeh probably would not consider shifting to another field and would not feel unfairly paid compared to others in different fields. In a more socially just and inclusive world, all of them would have been further empowered thanks to the intersection of their rich and diverse backgrounds (linguistic, cultural, ethnic, etc.), education, and experience; their journeys would have been smoother, and their experiences and knowledge better appreciated.

These questions and counter-stories are not aimed to portray instructors as helpless nor administrators and employers as evil. The questions point to challenges and contradictions that complicate instructors' lives; challenges that are worth highlighting and investigating. The findings of this study showed perseverance from instructors' end and support from administrators 'side; however, why do these challenges persist, how can instructors' employment journeys' be facilitated, and if program administrators are not stumbling block, who is? Instructors' counter-stories highlight the multitude of intersecting variables that affect their career and education choices, where they live, what job opportunities they are offered, and even how they think. It is thus essential to be reflexive and critical and to further explore these challenges and where they are stemming from. It is also important to go beyond the hypothetical questions and move towards the practical side exploring how to facilitate instructors' employment in the TESOL job market.

#### 5.7 Conclusion

It is important to acknowledge the multitude of opportunities that globalization offers thanks to the mobility of both individuals and goods and the flexibility of borders (Grosfoguel, 2011). However, it is equally important to highlight that this mobility and flexibility brought along challenges, as not all individuals are equally offered the opportunity to cross those borders nor are they provided with the same privileges. Some of the challenges that face individuals are related to discrimination where individuals are treated differently and sometimes denied opportunities due to their race, ethnicity, gender, religion, and language abilities, among others (Derous, Pepermans, et al., 2017; DeVaro et al., 2018; Kim, 2020; Leckcivilize & Straub, 2018; Mahboob & Golden, 2013).

not offered the same opportunities as their counterparts belonging to the majority groups due to differences in linguistic, racial, or religious backgrounds (Carlsson & Rooth, 2007; Creese & Kambere, 2003; Derous, Nguyen, et al., 2009; Derous, Pepermans, et al., 2017; DeVaro et al., 2018; Leckcivilize & Straub, 2018; Rafferty, 2020; Syed & Pio, 2010; Weichselbaumer, 2020).

In the field of education, instructors also face multiple challenges in the job market due to their "non-nativeness", "accents", not being from inner circles countries or speaking a "non-legitimate" form of English (Alshammari, 2021; Clark & Paran, 2007; Flynn & Gulikers, 2001; Jeon & Lee, 2006; Lancee, 2019; Mahboob & Golden, 2013; Motha, 2006; Ruecker & Ives, 2015; Selvi, 2010; Tatar, 2019). Building on these challenges faced by instructors, in this study, I investigated the hiring criteria and practices for ESL/EFL instructors and the challenges they encounter in their job hunt in the TESOL job market in Canada and the UAE. I drew comparisons between both contexts in relation to hiring criteria and practices, changes, challenges, and opportunities present in the TESOL field, experiences of program administrators of the hiring process, and reflections of instructors on their experiences. I specifically choose to investigate Canadian and Emirate job markets because of the continuous need for ESL/EFL instructors in both countries due to the increasing numbers of immigrants in Canada and migrants in the UAE.

In the study, I used CRT and intersectionality as a theoretical framework as both concepts complemented one another offering a critical perspective and allowing for the inclusion of emergent variables. I utilized intersectionality to investigate the intersection of different elements in creating the current state of the TESOL job market and the hiring criteria used in Canada and the UAE and the variables affecting instructors'

employability. I used a qualitative methodological approach and employed different data collection methods including semi-structured interviews with instructors and program administrators, an online questionnaire and journal reflections for instructors, and analysis of online job advertisements. I employed counter storytelling, which is one the key tools of CRT, with an end goal of offering instructors the chance to tell their stories, voice their opinions, and highlight their experiences (Bridges, 2019; Delgado et al., 2017). Counter storytelling was represented in this study through using interviews and journal reflections.

In this research study, I aimed to offer program administrators with the opportunity to share their views, perspectives, and stories about the TESOL job market, which was a research gap that no previous studies covered. I strived to provide a fair representation of administrators' views without framing them as the "other", and at the same time, compared their views to those of the instructors, which uncovered multiple similarities and some mismatch between their views. With Canada being a major immigrant-receiving country and the UAE representing a major foreign-worker receiving country, it was important to compare how different/similar the TESOL job markets are in both contexts, which were also under-researched and were not previously compared. In addition, another gap that I filled by conducting this study was using a different theoretical framework (i.e., CRT, counter-storytelling, and intersectionality), which was not previously utilized when investigating the TESOL job market in the UAE. Furthermore, this framework assisted me in eliciting in-depth and critical findings compared to previous research on the job market.

Finally, in this study, I, the researcher, and instructor, set to explore a topic that was personal in nature using a reflexive process embedded in a critical and social constructivist positionality. Despite the close connection to the research, I was able to

balance my biases and achieve the goals of the study, which included 1) highlighting the major hiring criteria in the TESOL job market in Canada and the UAE, 2) draw comparisons between both context, 3) compare administrators' and instructors views. These goals were both novel and timely adding much needed findings to the current body of research. The study also offered multiple recommendations and future research idea that can advance the knowledge of the TESOL job market and improve instructors' and administrators understanding of it.

# References

- Aboelela, S. W., Larson, E., Bakken, S., Carrasquillo, O., Formicola, A., Glied, S., Haas, J., & Gebbie, K. (2007). Defining interdisciplinary research: Conclusions from a critical review of the literature. *Health Services Research*, *42*, 329–346. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1475-6773.2006.00621.x
- Almeida, F., & Santos, J. D. (2020). The effects of COVID-19 on job security and unemployment in Portugal. *International Journal of Sociology and Social Policy*, 40(9/10), 995–1003. https://doi.org/10.1108/IJSSP-07-2020-0291
- Alshammari, A. (2021). Job advertisements for English teachers in the Saudi Arabian context: Discourses of discrimination and inequity. *TESOL Journal*, *12*(2), 1-13. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1002/tesj.542">https://doi.org/10.1002/tesj.542</a>
- Banerjee, R., Hou, F., Reitz, J. G., & Zhang, T. (2021). Evaluating foreign skills: Effects of credential assessment on skilled immigrants' labour market performance in Canada. *Canadian Public Policy*, 47(3), 358–372. https://doi.org/10.3138/cpp.2021-014
- Barkhuizen, G. (2016). Narrative approaches to exploring language, identity and power in language teacher education. *RELC Journal*, 47(1), 25–42. https://doi.org/10.1177/0033688216631222
- Bauder, H. (2003). "Brain Abuse", or the devaluation of immigrant labour in Canada. *Antipode*, *35*(4), 699–717. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1467-8330.2003.00346.x">https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1467-8330.2003.00346.x</a>
- Berns, M., & Matsuda, K. (2006). Applied linguistics: Overview and history. In *Encyclopedia of Language & Linguistics*, 394–405. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1016/B0-08-044854-2/00599-X">https://doi.org/10.1016/B0-08-044854-2/00599-X</a>
- Blommaert, J. (2010). *The sociolinguistics of globalization*. Cambridge University Press. https://doi.org/10.1017/cbo9780511845307
- Blommaert, J., & Dong, J. (2020). *Ethnographic fieldwork: A beginner's guide*. Multilingual Matters. https://doi.org/10.21832/blomma7130h
- Bodis, A. (2023). Gatekeeping v. marketing: English language proficiency as a university admission requirement in Australia. *Higher Education Research & Development*, 1–15. https://doi.org/10.1080/07294360.2023.2174082
- Bóo, F. L., Rossi, M. A., & Urzúa, S. S. (2013). The labor market return to an attractive face: Evidence from a field experiment. *Economics Letters*, *118*(1), 170–172. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1016/j.econlet.2012.10.016">https://doi.org/10.1016/j.econlet.2012.10.016</a>
- Bourdieu, P. (1986). The forms of capital. In J. Richardson (Ed.), *Handbook of Theory and Research for the Sociology of Education* (pp.241-258). Greenwood.
- Bourdieu, P., & Thompson, J. (1991). *Language and symbolic power*. Harvard University Press.
- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, *3*(2), 77–101. https://doi.org/10.1191/1478088706qp063oa
- Bridges, K. (2019). Critical race theory: A primer. Foundation Press.
- Canadian Human Rights Commission. (2010). Your guide to understanding the Canadian Human Rights Act: rights, responsibility, respect. <a href="https://www.chrc-ccdp.gc.ca/sites/default/files/2020-07/chra">https://www.chrc-ccdp.gc.ca/sites/default/files/2020-07/chra</a> guide lcdp-eng.pdf

- Carcary, M. (2009). The research audit trail enhancing trustworthiness in qualitative inquiry. *Electronic Journal of Business Research Methods*, 7 (1), 11-24.
- Carcary, M. (2020). The research audit trail: Methodological guidance for application in practice. *Electronic Journal of Business Research Methods*, *18*(2), 166–177. https://doi.org/10.34190/JBRM.18.2.008
- Carlsson, M., & Rooth, D.-O. (2007). Evidence of ethnic discrimination in the Swedish labor market using experimental data. *Labour Economics*, *14*(4), 716–729. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.labeco.2007.05.001
- Catford, J. C. (1998). Language learning and the applied linguistics: A historical sketch. *Language Learning*, 48(4), 465–496. https://doi.org/10.1111/0023-8333.00054
- Cech, E. A., & Hiltner, S. (2022). Unsettled employment, reshuffled Priorities? Career prioritization among college-educated workers facing employment Instability during COVID-19. *Socius: Sociological Research for a Dynamic World*, 8, 1-13. https://doi.org/10.1177/23780231211068660
- Cho, S., Crenshaw, K. W., & McCall, L. (2013). Toward a field of intersectionality studies: Theory, applications, and praxis. *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society*, *38*(4), 785–810. https://doi.org/10.1086/669608
- Choi, L. J. (2016). Revisiting the issue of native speakerism: "I don't want to speak like a native speaker of English'. *Language and Education*, 30(1), 72–85. https://doi.org/10.1080/09500782.2015.1089887
- Christian, M., Seamster, L., & Ray, V. (2019). New directions in critical race theory and sociology: Racism, White supremacy, and resistance. *American Behavioral Scientist*, 63(13), 1731–1740. https://doi.org/10.1177/0002764219842623
- Clark, E., & Paran, A. (2007). The employability of non-native-speaker teachers of EFL: A UK survey. *System*, *35*(4), 407–430. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.system.2007.05.002
- Creese, G., & Kambere, E. N. (2003). "What colour is your English?" *The Canadian Review of Sociology*, 40(5), 565–573. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1755-618X.2003.tb00005.x">https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1755-618X.2003.tb00005.x</a>
- Crenshaw, K. (1991). Mapping the margins: Intersectionality, identity politics, and violence against women of color. In K. W. Crenshaw, N. Gotanda, G. Peller, & K. Thomas (Eds.) *Critical race theory: The key writings that formed the movement* (pp. 357–384). New Press.
- Creswell, J. W. (2015). A concise introduction to mixed methods research. SAGE Publications.
- Creswell, J. W., & Creswell, J. D. (2018). Qualitative methods. In J.W. Creswell & J.D. Creswell, *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches* (pp. 179-212). SAGE.
- Davies, A. (2003). *The Native speaker: Myth and reality*. Multilingual Matters. https://doi-org.proxy1.lib.uwo.ca/10.21832/9781853596247
- Davies, A. (2004). The Native speaker in applied linguistics. In Davies, A., Elder, C. (Eds.), *The handbook of applied linguistics* (pp. 431-450). Blackwell.
- Deif, F. (2018, August 8). 'Saudi Arabia punishes Canada for criticizing human rights defenders' arrests. Retaliation and threats should alarm all rights respecting countries. *Human Rights Watch*. <a href="https://www.hrw.org/news/2018/08/08/saudiarabia-punishes-canada-criticizing-human-rights-defenders-arrests">https://www.hrw.org/news/2018/08/08/saudiarabia-punishes-canada-criticizing-human-rights-defenders-arrests</a>

- DeJonckheere, M., & Vaughn, L. M. (2019). Semistructured interviewing in primary care research: A balance of relationship and rigour. *Family Medicine and Community Health*, 7(2), e000057–e000057. https://doi.org/10.1136/fmch-2018-000057
- Delaney, D. (2002). The space that race makes. *The Professional Geographer*, *54*(1), 6–14. https://doi.org/10.1111/0033-0124.00309
- Delgado, R. (1990). When a story is just a story: Does voice really matter? *Virginia Law Review*, 76(1), 95–111. https://doi.org/10.2307/1073104
- Delgado, R., Stefancic, J., & Harris, A. (2001). *Critical race theory: an introduction* (Third edition.). New York University Press. https://doi.org/10.18574/9781479851393
- Denzin, N. K., & Lincoln, Y. S. (2005). *The SAGE handbook of qualitative research* (Third edition.). Sage Publications.
- Derous, E., Nguyen, H.-H., & Ryan, A. (2009). Hiring discrimination against Arab minorities: Interactions between prejudice and job characteristics. *Human Performance*, 22(4), 297–320. https://doi.org/10.1080/08959280903120261
- Derous, E., Pepermans, R., & Ryan, A. M. (2017). Ethnic discrimination during résumé screening: Interactive effects of applicants' ethnic salience with job context. *Human Relations (New York)*, 70(7), 860–882. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1177/0018726716676537">https://doi.org/10.1177/0018726716676537</a>
- DeVaro, J., Ghosh, S., & Zoghi, C. (2018). Job characteristics and labor market discrimination in promotions. *Industrial Relations: A Journal of Economy and Society*, *57*(3), 389–434. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1111/irel.12211">https://doi.org/10.1111/irel.12211</a>
- Dhamoon, R. K. (2011). Considerations on mainstreaming intersectionality. *Political Research Quarterly*, 64(1), 230–243. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1177/1065912910379227">https://doi.org/10.1177/1065912910379227</a>
- Duran, C. S. (2019). On issues of discrimination and xenophobia: What can TESOL practitioners do to support and advocate for refugee students? *TESOL Quarterly*, 53(3), 818–827. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1002/tesq.523">https://doi.org/10.1002/tesq.523</a>
- Edmond, C. (2022, February 7). Explainer: What is the Great Reshuffle and how is it affecting the jobs market? *World Economic Forum*. <a href="https://www.weforum.org/agenda/2022/02/great-reshuffle-jobs-market-resignation/">https://www.weforum.org/agenda/2022/02/great-reshuffle-jobs-market-resignation/</a>
- Elbanna, S. (2022). Policy and practical implications for workforce nationalization in the Gulf Cooperation Council (GCC) countries. *Personnel Review*, *51*(4), 1248–1261. https://doi.org/10.1108/PR-11-2020-0835
- Fine, M. (1994). Working the hyphens: Reinventing the self and other in qualitative research. In N. Denzin and Y. Lincoln. (Eds.) *Handbook of qualitative research* (pp. 70-82). Sage.
- Flynn, K., & Gulikers, G. (2001). Issues in hiring nonnative English-speaking professionals to teach English as a Second Language. *CATESOL Journal*, *13*(1), 151–161.
- Gans, H. J. (2017). Racialization and racialization research. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 40(3), 341–352. https://doi.org/10.1080/01419870.2017.1238497
- Ghodrati, Z., Joorabchi, T. N., & Muati, A. (2015). The influence of globalization on "lookism" in workplace environment of different cultures. *Global Media Journal*, 13(24), 1-17.

- Gillborn, D. (2019). Hiding in plain sight: Understanding and addressing Whiteness and color-blind ideology in education. *Kappa Delta Pi Record*, *55*(3), 112–117. https://doi.org/10.1080/00228958.2019.1622376
- Gillborn, D. (2015). Intersectionality, critical race theory, and the primacy of racism: Race, class, gender, and disability in education. *Qualitative Inquiry*, 21(3), 277–287. https://doi.org/10.1177/1077800414557827
- Gnevsheva, k. (2017). Within-speaker variation in passing for a native speaker. *International Journal of Bilingualism*, 21(2), 213–227. https://doi.org/10.1177/1367006915616197
- Go, A. (2005). Moving beyond tokenism. *Canadian Issues*, 40–42.
- Google. (2022a, April 28). *Google Career Certificates / Célian's journey 30s.* YouTube. https://youtu.be/gCdtMSuM28A
- Google. (2022b, May 03). *Jumpstart your new career with Google Career Certificates*. YouTube. https://youtu.be/7j1ApF6agCU
- Government of Canada. (2020). *Educational credential assessment (ECA) for Express Entry: What it is.* <a href="https://www.canada.ca/en/immigration-refugees-citizenship/services/immigrate-canada/express-entry/documents/education-assessed.html">https://www.canada.ca/en/immigration-refugees-citizenship/services/immigrate-canada/express-entry/documents/education-assessed.html</a>
- Grosfoguel, R. (2011). Decolonizing post-colonial studies and paradigms of political-economy: Transmodernity, decolonial thinking, and global coloniality. *Transmodernity: Journal of Peripheral Cultural Production of the Luso-Hispanic World*, *I*(1), 1-36. <a href="https://doi.org/10.5070/t411000004">https://doi.org/10.5070/t411000004</a>
- Guo, S. (2009). Difference, deficiency, and devaluation: Tracing the roots of non-recognition of foreign credentials for immigrant professionals in Canada. *Canadian Journal for the Study of Adult Education*, 22(1), 37–52.
- Guo, S. (2015). The colour of skill: contesting a racialised regime of skill from the experience of recent immigrants in Canada. *Studies in Continuing Education*, 37(3), 236–250. https://doi.org/10.1080/0158037X.2015.1067766
- Guo, S., & Shan, H. (2013). The politics of recognition: Critical discourse analysis of recent PLAR policies for immigrant professionals in Canada. *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, 32(4), 464–480. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1080/02601370.2013.778073">https://doi.org/10.1080/02601370.2013.778073</a>
- Guo, Y. (2009). Racializing immigrant professionals in an employment preparation ESL program. *Cultural and Pedagogical Inquiry*, *1*(2). https://doi.org/10.18733/C3CC7X
- Harris, C. I. (1993). Whiteness as property. *Harvard Law Review*, *106*(8), 1709–1707. https://doi.org/10.2307/1341787
- Hartshorn, K. J., & McMurry, B. L. (2020). The effects of the COVID-19 pandemic on ESL learners and TESOL practitioners in the United States. *International Journal of TESOL Studies*, 2(2), 140–156. <a href="https://doi.org/10.46451/ijts.2020.09.11">https://doi.org/10.46451/ijts.2020.09.11</a>
- Hartung, C. (2017). Global citizenship incorporated: competing responsibilities in the education of global citizens. *Discourse: Studies in the Cultural Politics of Education*, 38(1), 16–29. https://doi.org/10.1080/01596306.2015.1104849
- Heller, M. (1996). Legitimate language in a multilingual school. *Linguistics and Education*, 8(2), 139–157. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1016/S0898-5898(96)90011-X">https://doi.org/10.1016/S0898-5898(96)90011-X</a>

- Higgins, C. A., & Judge, T. A. (2004). The effect of applicant influence tactics on recruiter perceptions of fit and hiring recommendations: A field study. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 89(4), 622–632. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1037/0021-9010.89.4.622">https://doi.org/10.1037/0021-9010.89.4.622</a>
- Hill, M. L. (2006). Representin(g): Negotiating multiple roles and identities in the field and behind the desk. *Qualitative Inquiry*, *12*(5), 926–949. https://doi.org/10.1177/1077800406288613
- Hochman, A. (2019). Racialization: a defense of the concept. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 42(8), 1245–1262. https://doi.org/10.1080/01419870.2018.1527937
- Holliday, A. (2008). Standards of English and politics of inclusion. *Language Teaching*, 41(1), 119–130. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0261444807004776
- Holmes, A. G. D. (2020). Researcher positionality A consideration of its influence and place in qualitative research A new researcher guide. *Shanlax International Journal of Education*, 8(4), 1-10. <a href="https://orcid.org/0000-0002-5147-0761">https://orcid.org/0000-0002-5147-0761</a>
- Howard, T. C., Navarro, O., Donnor, J., Dixson, A., & Anderson, C. (2016). Critical race theory 20 years later: Where do we go from here? *Urban Education*, 51(3), 253–273. https://doi.org/10.1177/0042085915622541
- Huang, Z. (2018). *Native and non-native English speaking teachers in China:*Perceptions and practices. Springer. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-10-5284-2">https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-10-5284-2</a>
- Inwood, J. F., & Yarbrough, R. A. (2010). Racialized places, racialized bodies: The impact of racialization on individual and place identities. *GeoJournal*, 75(3), 299–301. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10708-009-9308-3
- Jenkins, S. (2017). The elephant in the room: Discriminatory hiring practices in ELT. *ELT Journal*, 71(3), 373–376. https://doi.org/10.1093/elt/ccx025
- Jeon, M., & Lee, J. (2006). Hiring native-speaking English teachers in East Asian countries. *English Today*, 22(4), 53–58. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0266078406004093
- Jones, P. W. (1998). Globalisation and internationalism: Democratic prospects for world education. *Comparative Education*, *34*(2), 143-155. https://doi.org/10.1080/03050069828243
- Kachru, B. B. (1985). Standards, codification and sociolinguistic realism: The English language in the outer circle. In R. Quirk and H.G. Widdowson (Eds), English in the world: Teaching and learning the language and literatures (pp.11-30). Cambridge University Press.
- Kachru, B. B. (1990). World Englishes and applied linguistics. *World Englishes*, 9(1), 3–20. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-971X.1990.tb00683.x
- Kendi, I. (2019). How to be an antiracist. Bodley Head.
- Kennedy, G. A. (1998). *Comparative rhetoric: an historical and cross-cultural introduction*. Oxford University Press.
- Kim, G. M. (2020). Challenging native speakerism in literacy research and education. *Journal of Literacy Research*, 52(3), 368–375. https://doi.org/10.1177/1086296X20939558
- Kubota, R., & Lin, A. (2006). Race and TESOL: Introduction to concepts and theories. *TESOL Quarterly*, 40(3), 471–493. https://doi.org/10.2307/40264540
- Ladson-Billings, G., & Tate, W. F., Iv. (1995). Toward a Critical Race Theory of Education. *Teachers College Record: The Voice of Scholarship in Education*, 97(1), 47-68. https://doi.org/10.1177/016146819509700104

- Lancee, B. (2019). Ethnic discrimination in hiring: comparing groups across contexts. Results from a cross-national field experiment. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 47(6), 1181–1200. https://doi.org/10.1080/1369183X.2019.1622744
- Leckcivilize, A., & Straub, A. (2018). Headscarf and job recruitment—lifting the veil of labour market discrimination. *IZA Journal of Labor Economics*, 7(1), 1–32. https://doi.org/10.1186/s40172-018-0071-x
- Leonardo, Z. (2002). The souls of white folk: Critical pedagogy, whiteness studies, and globalization discourse. *Race Ethnicity and Education*, *5*(1), 29-50. https://doi.org/10.1080/13613320120117180
- Li, Y.-T., & Liu, J. C.-E. (2020). Auditing ethnic preference In Hong Kong's financial job market: The mediation of White privilege and Hong Kong localism. *International Sociology*, 36(1), 71-90. https://doi.org/10.1177/0268580920957801
- Liebkind, K., Larja, L., & Brylka, A. (2016). Ethnic and gender discrimination in recruitment: Experimental evidence from Finland. *Journal of Social and Political Psychology*, 4(1), 403–426. <a href="https://doi.org/10.5964/jspp.v4i1.433">https://doi.org/10.5964/jspp.v4i1.433</a>
- Liggett, T. (2014). The mapping of a framework: Critical Race Theory and TESOL. *The Urban Review*, 46(1), 112–124. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11256-013-0254-5
- Liu, J. (1999). Nonnative-English-speaking professionals in TESOL. *TESOL Quarterly*, 33(1), 85–102. https://doi.org/10.2307/3588192
- Lynch, M. E. (2018). The hidden nature of Whiteness in education: Creating active allies in White teachers. *Journal of Educational Supervision*, *I*(1), 18-31. https://doi.org/10.31045/jes.1.1.2
- Mackenzie, L. (2021). Discriminatory job advertisements for English language teachers in Colombia: An analysis of recruitment biases. *TESOL Journal*, *12*(1), 1-21. https://doi.org/10.1002/tesj.535
- Mahboob, A., & Golden, R. (2013). Looking for native speakers of English:

  Discrimination in English language teaching job advertisements. *Voices in Asia Journal*, *1*(1), 72-81.
- Mahboob, A., Uhrig, K., Newman, K., & Hartford, B. S. (2004). Children of a lesser English: Status of nonnative English speakers as college-level English as a Second Language teachers in the United States. *Learning and teaching from experience:*Perspectives on nonnative English-speaking professionals, 100–120.
- Mahdavi, P. (2013). "Trafficking" parenting: Migration, motherhood, forced labor and deportability in the United Arab Emirates (UAE). *Middle East Law and Governance*, 5(1-2), 173–194. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1163/18763375-00501005">https://doi.org/10.1163/18763375-00501005</a>
- Martin, P. L., & Malit, F. (2017). A new era for labour migration in the GCC? *Migration Letters*, *14*(1), 113–126. <a href="https://doi.org/10.33182/ml.v14i1.320">https://doi.org/10.33182/ml.v14i1.320</a>
- Matias, C. E. (2013). Check yo' self before you wreck yo' self and our kids: Counterstories from culturally responsive white teachers? ... to culturally responsive white teachers! *Interdisciplinary Journal of Teaching and Learning*, 3(2), 68–81.
- Matsuda, M. J. (1987). Looking to the bottom: Critical legal studies and reparations, *Harvard Civil Rights-Civil Liberties Law Review*, 22, 323-399. http://hdl.handle.net/10125/65944
- Merriam, S. D., & Tisdell, E. (2016). What is qualitative research? Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation (pp. 3-21). Jossey Bass.

- Miller, R., Liu, K., & Ball, A. F. (2020). Critical counter-narrative as transformative methodology for educational equity. *Review of Research in Education*, 44(1), 269–300. https://doi.org/10.3102/0091732X20908501
- Morrison, K., & Lui, I. (2000). Ideology, linguistic capital and the medium of instruction in Hong Kong. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 21(6), 471–486. https://doi.org/10.1080/01434630008666418
- Motha, S. (2006). Racializing ESOL teacher identities in U. S. K—12 public schools. *TESOL Quarterly*, 40(3), 495-518. https://doi.org/10.2307/40264541
- Nakhaie, M. R., & Kazemipur, A. (2013). Social capital, mployment and occupational status of the new immigrants in Canada. *Journal of International Migration and Integration*, 14(3), 419–437. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1007/s12134-012-0248-2">https://doi.org/10.1007/s12134-012-0248-2</a>
- Ngeh, J., & Pelican, M. (2018). Intersectionality and the labour market in the United Arab Emirates: the experiences of African migrants. *Zeitschrift Für Ethnologie*, 143(2), 171–194.
- Noble, H., & Smith, J. (2015). Issues of validity and reliability in qualitative research. *Evidence-Based Nursing*, 18(2), 34–35. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1136/eb-2015-102054">https://doi.org/10.1136/eb-2015-102054</a>
- Norton, B. (1997). Language, identity, and the ownership of English. *TESOL Quarterly*, 31(3), 409-429. <a href="https://doi.org/10.2307/3587831">https://doi.org/10.2307/3587831</a>
- Parker, L. (1998). 'Race is race ain't': An exploration of the utility of critical race theory in qualitative research in education. *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education*, 11(1), 43–55. https://doi.org/10.1080/095183998236881
- Patton, M. Q. (2015). *Qualitative research & evaluation methods: Integrating theory and practice* (4th edition.). SAGE Publications, Inc.
- Pennycook, A. (2001). *Critical applied linguistics: A critical introduction*. L. Erlbaum. https://doi.org/10.4324/9781410600790
- Perry, F. L. (2011). *Research in applied linguistics: Becoming a discerning consumer*. Routledge.
- Phillipson, R. (2009). English in globalisation, a lingua franca or a lingua frankensteinia? *TESOL Quarterly*, 43(2), 335–339. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1002/j.1545-7249.2009.tb00175.x">https://doi.org/10.1002/j.1545-7249.2009.tb00175.x</a>
- Phillipson, R. (2017). Myths and realities of 'global' English. *Language Policy*, *16*(3), 313–331. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10993-016-9409-z
- Phyak, P. (2020). Neoliberal placemaking and ideological constructions of standardized tests in Nepal's linguistic landscape. In Mirhosseini, S. & De Costa, P. (Eds), *The sociopolitics of English language testing* (pp.208-230). Bloomsbury. <a href="https://doi.org/10.5040/9781350071377.0017">https://doi.org/10.5040/9781350071377.0017</a>
- Piller, I. (2002). Passing for a native speaker: Identity and success in second language learning. *Journal of Sociolinguistics*, 6(2), 179–208. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-9481.00184">https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-9481.00184</a>
- Rafferty, A. (2020). Skill underutilization and under-skilling in Europe: The role of workplace discrimination. *Work, Employment and Society*, *34*(2), 317–335. https://doi.org/10.1177/0950017019865692
- Rampton, M. B. H. (1990). Displacing the 'native speaker': expertise, affiliation, and inheritance. *ELT Journal*, 44(2), 97–101. https://doi.org/10.1093/elt/44.2.97
- Richardson, L., & St. Pierre, E. (2005). Chapter 38: Writing: A method of inquiry. In N. Denzin & Y. Lincoln (Eds.), *The Sage handbook of qualitative research*, (3rd ed., pp. 959-978). Sage.

- Rivas-Garrido, C., & Koning, E. A. (2019). "We don't want to hear about discrimination": Evidence slippage and evidence invention in the politics of foreign credential recognition in Canada. *Canadian Public Administration*, 62(3), 413–434. https://doi.org/10.1111/capa.12340
- Rivera, S. (2022). Navigating race in science teacher education: The counterstory of a woman faculty of color. *Journal of Science Teacher Education*, *33*(2), 192–205. https://doi.org/10.1080/1046560X.2021.2009622
- Rooth, D.-O. (2009). Obesity, attractiveness, and differential treatment in hiring: A field experiment. *Journal of Human Resources*, 44(3), 710–735. https://doi.org/10.1353/jhr.2009.0027
- Ruecker, T. (2011). Challenging the native and nonnative English speaker hierarchy in ELT: New directions from race theory. *Critical Inquiry in Language Studies*, 8(4), 400–422. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1080/15427587.2011.615709">https://doi.org/10.1080/15427587.2011.615709</a>
- Ruecker, T., & Ives, L. (2015). White native English speakers needed: The rhetorical construction of privilege in online teacher recruitment spaces. *TESOL Quarterly*, 49(4), 733-756. Retrieved from <a href="https://doi.org/10.1002/tesq.195">https://doi.org/10.1002/tesq.195</a>
- Safari, P., & Razmjoo, S. A. (2016). An exploration of Iranian EFL teachers' perceptions on the globalization and hegemony of English. *Qualitative Research in Education*, 5(2), 136–166. https://doi.org/10.17583/qre.2016.1797
- Schreiber, B. R. (2019). "More like you": Disrupting native speakerism through a multimodal online intercultural exchange. *TESOL Quarterly*, *53*(4), 1115–1138. https://doi.org/10.1002/tesq.534
- Selvi, A. F. (2009, June). And justice for all: Building local efforts on NNEST issues. *The Newsletter of the Nonnative English Speakers in TESOL Caucus*. http://www.tesol.org/NewsletterSite/view.asp?nid=2982
- Selvi, A. F. (2010). All teachers are equal, but some teachers are more equal than others: Trend analysis of job advertisements in English language teaching. *WATESOL NNEST Caucus Annual Review*, *I*(1), 156–181.
- Shah, N. M. (2012). Socio-demographic transitions among nationals of GCC countries: Implications for migration and labour force trends. *Migration and Development*, *I*(1), 138–148. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1080/21632324.2012.709808">https://doi.org/10.1080/21632324.2012.709808</a>
- Sifakis, N. C., & Sougari, A.-M. (2003). Facing the globalisation challenge in the realm of English language teaching. *Language and Education*, *17*(1), 59–71. https://doi.org/10.1080/09500780308666838
- Skutnabb-Kangas, T., & Cummins, J. (1988). *Minority education: From shame to struggle*. Multilingual Matters.
- Smith, C., & Guillotin, B. (2022). The Impact of Workers not Returning to the job Market. *European Conference on Management Leadership and Governance*, 18(1), 553-560. <a href="https://doi.org/10.34190/ecmlg.18.1.933">https://doi.org/10.34190/ecmlg.18.1.933</a>
- Solórzano, D. G., & Yosso, T. J. (2002). Critical race methodology: Counter-storytelling as an analytical framework for education research. *Qualitative Inquiry*, 8(1), 23–44. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1177/107780040200800103">https://doi.org/10.1177/107780040200800103</a>
- Statistics Canada. (2022). Canada at a Glance 2022. https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/pub/12-581-x/12-581-x2022001-eng.htm
- Stevens, C. K., & Kristof, A. L. (1995). Making the right impression: A field study of applicant impression management during job interviews. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 80(5), 587–606. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1037/0021-9010.80.5.587">https://doi.org/10.1037/0021-9010.80.5.587</a>

- Strabac, Z., Valenta, M., & Al Awad, M. (2018). Temporary labour migration to United Arab Emirates: a complex story. *Migration and Development*, 7(3), 352–365. https://doi.org/10.1080/21632324.2017.1421603
- Swailes, S., Al Said, L. G., & Al Fahdi, S. (2012). Localisation policy in Oman: a psychological contracting interpretation. *International Journal of Public Sector Management*, 25(5), 357–372. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1108/09513551211252387">https://doi.org/10.1108/09513551211252387</a>
- Syed, J., & Pio, E. (2010). Veiled diversity? Workplace experiences of Muslim women in Australia. *Asia Pacific Journal of Management*, 27(1), 115–137. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10490-009-9168-x
- Tatar, S. (2019). Employment of English language teachers in an EFL context: Perspectives from school administrators. *Profile: Issues in Teachers' Professional Development*, 21(2), 45–61. https://doi.org/10.15446/profile.v21n2.72648
- Tate, W. F. (1999). Conclusion. In L. Parker, D. Deyhle, & S. Villenas (Eds.), *Race is . . . race isn't: Critical race theory and qualitative studies in education* (pp. 251-271). Westview Press.
- Taylor, E. (1998). A Primer on critical race theory. *The Journal of Blacks in Higher Education*, (19), 122–124. <a href="https://doi.org/10.2307/2998940">https://doi.org/10.2307/2998940</a>
- TESL Ontario. (2021). Competency Framework for Adult ESL Teachers.

  <a href="https://www.teslontario.org/uploads/accreditation/CompetencyFramework/TESL">https://www.teslontario.org/uploads/accreditation/CompetencyFramework/TESL</a>
  <a href="https://ontarioCompetencyFramework.pdf">OntarioCompetencyFramework.pdf</a>
- Tobin, G. A., & Begley, C. M. (2004). Methodological rigour within a qualitative framework. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 48(4), 388–396. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2648.2004.03207.x
- Trechter, S., & Bucholtz, M. (2001). Introduction: White noise: Bringing language into Whiteness studies. *Journal of Linguistic Anthropology*, 11(1), 3–21. https://doi.org/10.1525/jlin.2001.11.1.3
- Turin, T. C., Chowdhury, N., & Lake, D. (2023). Alternative careers toward job market integration: Barriers faced by international medical graduates in Canada. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, 20(3), 2311, 1–19. <a href="https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph20032311">https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph20032311</a>
- United Arab Emirates Ministry of Education. (n.d.). Recognition of university certificates issued from outside the UAE.

  <a href="https://www.moe.gov.ae/En/EServices/ServiceCard/pages/UniversiyCertificateEquilization.aspx">https://www.moe.gov.ae/En/EServices/ServiceCard/pages/UniversiyCertificateEquilization.aspx</a>
- Vaismoradi, M., Turunen, H., & Bondas, T. (2013). Content analysis and thematic analysis: Implications for conducting a qualitative descriptive study. *Nursing & Health Sciences*, *15*(3), 398–405. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1111/nhs.12048">https://doi.org/10.1111/nhs.12048</a>
- Valenta, M. (2017). A comparative analysis of migration systems and migration policies in the European Union and in the Gulf Cooperation Council Countries. *Migration and Development*, *6*(3), 428–447. https://doi.org/10.1080/21632324.2016.1204804
- Valenta, M., Knowlton, K. E., Jakobsen, J., Al Awad, M., & Strabac, Z. (2020). Temporary labour–migration system and long–term residence strategies in the United Arab Emirates. *International Migration*, 58(1), 182–197. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1111/imig.12551">https://doi.org/10.1111/imig.12551</a>

- Valenta, M., Strabac, Z., Jakobsen, J., Reitz, J., & Al Awad, M. (2017). Labour migrations to resource-rich countries: Comparative perspectives on migrants' rights in Canada, Norway and the United Arab Emirates. *International Journal on Minority and Group Rights*, 24(2), 150–173. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1163/15718115-02402003">https://doi.org/10.1163/15718115-02402003</a>
- van Dijk, T. A. (1993). Principles of critical discourse analysis. *Discourse & Society*, 4(2), 249–283. https://doi.org/10.1177/0957926593004002006
- Vaught, S. E., & Castagno, A. E. (2008). "I don't think I'm a racist": Critical race theory, teacher attitudes, and structural racism. *Race Ethnicity and Education*, 11(2), 95–113. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1080/13613320802110217">https://doi.org/10.1080/13613320802110217</a>
- Villalobos Ulate, N. (2011). Insights towards native and non-native ELT educators. Bellaterra: Journal of Teaching & Learning Language & Literature, 4(1), 56–79. https://doi.org/10.5565/rev/jtl3.325
- Wang, L., & Fang, F. (2020). Native-speakerism policy in English language teaching revisited: Chinese university teachers' and students' attitudes towards native and non-native English-speaking teachers. *Cogent Education*, 7(1), 1-22. https://doi.org/10.1080/2331186X.2020.1778374
- Weichselbaumer, D. (2020). Multiple discrimination against female immigrants wearing headscarves. *Industrial & Labor Relations Review*, 73(3), 600–627. https://doi.org/10.1177/0019793919875707
- White, M. D., & Marsh, E. E. (2006). Content analysis: A flexible methodology. *Library Trends*, 55(1), 22–45. https://doi.org/10.1353/lib.2006.0053
- Widdowson, H. G. (1994). The ownership of English. *TESOL Quarterly*, 28(2), 377–389. https://doi.org/10.2307/3587438
- Williams, B. T. (2004). The truth in the tale: Race and "counterstorytelling" in the classroom. *Journal of Adolescent & Adult Literacy*, 48(2), 164–169. https://doi.org/10.1598/JAAL.48.2.7
- Wink, J. (2011). Critical pedagogy: Notes from the real world. (4th ed.). Pearson.Yosso, T. J. (2020). Whose culture has capital? A critical race theory discussion of community cultural wealth. Critical Race Theory in Education, 114-136.

https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003005995-8

Young, R. A., & Collin, A. (2004). Introduction: Constructivism and social constructionism in the career field. *Journal of Vocational Behavior*, 64(3), 373–388. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jvb.2003.12.005

# **Appendices**

# **Appendices A: Instructors' Interview Questions**

- 1. Can you tell me about your teaching experience and educational and professional qualifications?
- 2. If you were to post a job ad for an English instructor role for your institution, what would the job ad say (duties, qualities, experience, etc.)?
- 3. Have the criteria for who gets hired as an English instructor changed in the last few years? For instance, has the job market changed much over the past 5 years (or decade, or...?
- 4. Have the changes affected whether positively or negatively the employability of English instructors (why & how)?
- 5. What are the characteristics and experience you believe recruiters might look for in a strong candidate?
- 6. Can you describe the best (or worst) interview you ever had with a recruiter? What made it so memorable?
- 7. What advice would you give to someone planning on becoming an ESL or EFL instructor (here or abroad)? What skills, educational and professional qualifications, and/or micro-credentials would make them most competitive?
- 8. Do educational institutes evaluate English instructors' language skills? (e.g request some sort of standardized measure (e.g., /TOEFL, IELTS, etc.)?
- 9. Do you have the impression that many applicants speak English as a home language?
- 10. Some job advertisements use the term "NS", are you familiar with the term? If yes, what does it mean and how do you define "nativeness"?
- 11. Is there something that you would like to discuss that I haven't mentioned?

# **Appendices B: Program Administrators' Interview Questions**

- 1. If you were to post a job ad for a program administrator role for your institution, what would the job ad say (duties, qualities, experience, etc.)?
- 2. Have the criteria for who gets hired as an English instructor changed in the last few years? For instance, has the job market changed much over the past 5 years (or decade, or ....)?
- 3. Have the changes complicated the recruiting process or simplified it (why & how)?
- 4. Who is responsible for determining job requirements for different positions/English teaching positions?
- 5. What are the characteristics and experience you might look for in a strong candidate?
- 6. Do you sometimes get the sense that a candidate would be a perfect fit for a teaching position or the opposite even?
- 7. Can you describe the best (or worst) interview you ever had with a potential candidate? What made it so memorable?
- 8. What advice would you give to someone planning on becoming an ESL or EFL instructor (here or abroad)? What skills, educational and professional qualifications, and/or micro-credentials would make them most competitive?
- 9. Do you evaluate potential instructors' language skills or request some sort of standardized measure (e.g., /TOEFL, IELTS, etc.)?
- 10. Do many applicants speak English as a home language?
- 11. Some job advertisements use the term "NS", are you familiar with the term? If yes, what does it mean and what does "nativeness" mean to you?
- 12. Is there something that you would like to discuss that I haven't mentioned?

# **Appendices C: Journal Reflection**

I would like to ask you to think of and reflect on one of your experiences in the job market. It could be when you were looking for a job, being interviewed or even after you were hired. Please also describe your experiences and the emotions you felt when looking for a job. What opportunities did the job market offer you and/or what challenges did it throw at you? How did you adapt (or not adapt) to changes in the job market? What difference did you make, try to make, or wish you could make to facilitate the employment or job-hunting experience?

Think of this experience as a story, your story, where the details are of the essence and where you provide a description of a situation or multiple situations and your feelings throughout. There are no right or wrong answers, as this space aims to make your voice heard as an ESL/EFL instructor. The part of the story that you want to tell is completely up to you. It is your story after all, and you can choose what to tell and what not to tell. You also do not need to offer an answer for all the previously mentioned questions. You can choose what you like to include and what to exclude.

# Appendices D: Instructors' Questionnaire Canada

There are two sections to the questionnaire: I. Administrative Information – This section asks general questions about the courses your institution provides, the students and the instructors. II. II. Teacher Recruitment/ Professional Development – This section asks for details about selections and evaluation of instructors. \* Required

Ad	minist	rative Information
Q1	What 1	kind of institution or program do you work for?
	o Univ	versity (Preparatory Program, Pathway Program, etc.)
	o Con	tinuing Education College/Institution
	o Univ	versity (ESL Program)
	o Othe	er
Q2	What 1	Position do you hold?
		Faculty member (Full Professor, Associate Professor, Assistant Professor,
	Assist	ant Lecturer, Lecturer)
		ESL/EFL Instructor
		EAP Instructor
		IELTS Instructor
		LINC Instructor
		Other
der	oartmer	Yes: I have full responsibility. Yes: I share responsibility with others. No of the following courses does your institution provide?
		English for Academic Purposes
		English as a Second Language
		English for General and Professional Purposes
		IELTS Preparation
		University Preparation
		Undergraduate/ Graduate English courses
		Other
	Appro grams'	ximately, how many students does your institution have in their English
_	•	u recruit students from a wide range of countries? (If yes, please provide of where they come from).

Q7 Which	represents Female (Note that the second seco	Non-NS)	number of in	structors in y	our institutio	on?	
Teacher 1	Recruitme	ent and Profe	essional Dev	elopment			
	LinkedIn HigherEd Indeed TESL On TESOL In Other recruiting	tario Job Boanternational A	ard Association (	Career Center	r	tions?  u consider the	
following	criteria to		<b>N.</b> T	D 1 2 1	G 1	36.1	<b>T</b> 7
		Not Applicabl e (1)	Not Importan t (2)	Relativel y important (3)	Somewha t important (4)	Moderatel y important (5)	Very importan t (6)
Teaching Qualifications		0	0	0	0	O	O
Teaching Experience		0	0	0	0	0	O
	ching astration	O	O	0	0	0	O
Performance in Interview		0	o	o	O	O	O

Application Material e.g.

sample lesson plan o

o

o

0

o

o

Educational Background	o	0	O	0	0	0
Recommendation	O	O	0	0	O	0
Visa Status	O	O	0	0	0	0
Native English Speaker	o	o	O	0	0	0
Accent (British, American, etc)	0	O	0	0	0	0
Nationality	О	O	0	0	0	0
☐ In-service ☐ Observat ☐ Opportur ☐ Other ☐ Other ☐ Student F ☐ Teacher O ☐ Other ☐ Highest e ☐ Number o ☐ Native Sp ☐ Other ☐ Other ☐ Other ☐ Other ☐ Other	instructors in your aining Program to Training Semination of other instructors for further substitute for further	ur institution nars ructors tudy our institution and benefice obtained in the organization.	ts of English (MA, PhD) unization	nitor English teachers at ye	— language —— our institution	
Q13 How many Eng	glish language ir	structors' d	loes your ins	titution emplo	py?	

Q14 Whi	ch teacher category receives the highest pay and benefits?
	Citizens/ permanent Residents (Natives)
	Citizens/ permanent Residents (Non-natives)
	Expatriates (Natives)
	Expatriates (Non-natives)
	Not Applicable
	Other
Q15 Hav	e you noticed any changes in the TESOL job market in the past couple of years?  Yes  No
O16 Whe	en did you start noticing the change?
	Past 2 years
	Past 5 years
	Past 10 years
	Other
Q17 Wha	at changes have you noticed?
	Demand for ESL/EFL teachers (Increase, decrease in number)
	Job requirements and teachers' qualifications
	Benefits and salaries
	Language proficiency requirements
	Demand for teachers from inner circle countries (US, Canada, Australia, New
Zeala	nd, South Africa)
	Other
Q18 Wha	at job requirements do you mention in job ads?
	at characteristics do students prefer in their instructors? (Multilingual, specific ationality, or accent (British, American, etc.)?
Q20 Wot	ald you be willing to participate in an interview to elaborate on your answers?  Yes  No
Q21 Plea	se provide your email address.
Q22 Wou your ansv	ald you be willing to participate in an online journal reflection to elaborate on wers?  Yes  No

Q23	Please	provide	your	email	address.

\_\_\_\_\_

Participants who complete the journal entry and interview will receive an e-gift card.

# **Appendices E: Instructors' Questionnaire UAE**

There are two sections to the questionnaire: I. Administrative Information – This section asks general questions about the courses your institution provides, the students and the instructors. II. II. Teacher Recruitment/ Professional Development – This section asks for details about selections and evaluation of instructors. \* Required

# **Administrative Information**

Q1	What	kind of institution or program do you work for? University (Foundation, Bridge, Preparatory program) Continuing Education College/Institution University (ESL Program) Other
Q2	What	Other Position do you hold? Faculty member (Full Professor, Associate Professor, Assistant Professor, ant Lecturer, Lecturer) ESL/EFL Instructor EAP Instructor IELTS Instructor Other
	Are your control of the control of t	ou responsible for recruiting English Language Instructors in your institution or nt?  Yes: I have full responsibility.  Yes: I share responsibility with others.  No
Q4	Which	Undergraduate/ Graduate English courses General English Course English for Academic Purposes Business English/ Executive English Study Skills Other
_	Apprograms	eximately, how many students does your institution have in their English?
		u recruit students from a wide range of countries? (If yes, please provide of where they come from).

Q7 Which represents the biggest number of instructors in your institution?

	Female (Non-NS)
	Male (NS)
	Male (Non-NS)
	NA
Teacher	Recruitment and Professional Development
Q8 When	re does your institution advertise vacant English Teaching positions?
	LinkedIn
	HigherEdJobs
	Indeed
	TESOL International Association Career Center
	Other

Female (NS)

Q9 When recruiting English language instructors, how important do you consider the following criteria to be?

	Not Applicabl e	Not Importan t	Relativel y important	Somewha t important	Moderatel y important	Very importan t
Teaching Qualifications	O	0	0	0	0	0
Teaching Experience	0	O	0	0	0	0
Teaching Demonstration	0	O	0	0	0	0
Performance in Interview	0	O	0	0	0	O
Application Material e.g. sample lesson plan	0	0	0	O	0	0
Educational Background	О	0	0	O	0	0

o

0

o

o

o

Recommendation		О	0	0	0	0
Visa S	Status	O	0	o	o	O
Native English Speaker		O	0	o	O	0
Accent ( Americ		O	O	0	O	0
Natio	nality	O	o	O	O	0
service ba	Initial Tra In-service Observation Opportun Other Ch of the forms in your p	onal developmenstructors in your ining Program e Training Seming Seming of other institute for further substitute	ur institution nars ructors tudy	on?		
	Teaching Highest e Number o Native Sp Other	etermine the pay experience ducational degr of years working beakerism	ee obtained g in the orga	(MA, PhD) anization		ov?
~	, ,			•	•	•
Q14 Whic	Citizens	category receive es (Natives)	es the highe	est pay and be	nefits?	

	Expatriates (Non-natives)
	Not Applicable Other
U	Other
O15 Have	you noticed any changes in the TESOL job market in the past couple of years?
	Yes
	No
Q16 Whei	n did you start noticing the change?
	Past 2 years
	Past 5 years
	Past 10 years
	Other
$Q17_{}$ What	changes have you noticed?
	Demand for ESL/EFL teachers (Increase, decrease in number)
	Job requirements and teachers' qualifications
	Benefits and salaries
	Language proficiency requirements
	Demand for teachers from inner circle countries (US, Canada, Australia, New
	nd, South Africa)
	Other
Q18 What	job requirements do you mention in job ads?
	t characteristics do students prefer in their instructors? (Multilingual, specific ationality, or accent (British, American, etc.)?
	ld you be willing to participate in an interview to elaborate on your answers? Yes No
Q21 Pleas	e provide your email address.
your answ	Id you be willing to participate in an online journal reflection to elaborate on vers? Yes No
Q23 Pleas	e provide your email address.

Participants who complete the journal entry and interview will receive an e-gift card.

# **Appendices F: Research Audit Trail Checklist by Carcary (2009)**

#### Research audit trail checklist

#### Physical audit trail

# Research problem identification and proposal development:

- Is the research problem (e.g., the gap in the existing literature) clearly defined?
- Is a research question specified?
- Are the research aims and objectives stated?
- Is a formal research proposal (as required) submitted to and approved by the relevant funding body?

#### Literature review:

- Is a literature review protocol (key steps and procedures) clearly documented and validated?
- Is the literature search scope defined?
- Are all publication sources documented (e.g., bibliographic databases, library search portals, journals)?
- Are literature search parameters documented (e.g., keyword search strings)?
- Are literature screening criteria documented (e.g., specific keywords, language, authors, date ranges)?
- Are literature quality appraisal standards defined (e.g., grounding of findings in the body of evidence)?
- Is the literature data extraction process outlined (e.g., use of coding, CAQDAS)?
- Is the literature data classification and analysis process outlined (e.g., use of thematic categories, conceptual frameworks, and concept maps)?

#### Research framework definition:

- Is a research methods strategy specified (e.g., use of interviews, focus groups, case studies, design science)?
- Is the rationale for the chosen research methods specified?
- Are notes on research trustworthiness maintained?
- Are changes to the research framework and methodological decisions over the course of the study, and the rationale for the same, documented?

# Sample selection:

- Are criteria for research participant selection defined (e.g., domain expertise, seniority)?
- Is the sampling strategy (e.g., purposive, snowball) and rationale for its selection defined?

# Evidence/raw data collection:

• Are all sources of secondary evidence specified (e.g., contextual descriptions, policy documents, research reports)?

- Are all sources of primary data specified (e.g., interview or focus group transcripts, pilot validation feedback)?
- Are researcher journals and reflections on the body of evidence recorded?

# Evidence management and analysis:

- Are all thematic codes and categories documented?
- Are memos developed to enable emerging thematic categories to be traced to the body of evidence?
- Are reflexive memos attached to the thematic categories?
- Are relationships across the thematic structure explored (e.g., diagrammatically modelled)?
- Are examples of how the emerging analysis is grounded in the body of evidence maintained (e.g., in an appendix)?

# Artefact development:

- Is the research audience and dissemination strategy specified?
- Is the research report/research paper documented in a manner that the intended research audience will clearly understand?
- Are the research findings discussed vis-à-vis prior research studies?

#### Intellectual audit trail

# Clarification of philosophical stance:

- Is the researcher's philosophical position clarified?
- Consideration of alternatives for evidence collection and data analysis:
- Is the researcher's analytical thinking and decision-making transparent during the design of the research framework?
- Is the rationale for the data management and analysis approach clearly specified?
- Is the rationale for use or non-use of CAQDAS, and the benefits of the chosen approach, specified?

# Evidence interpretation:

- Are the researcher's analytical thinking and decision-making transparent during the data analysis?
- Are researcher interpretations on emerging thematic categories recorded in memos?
- Are research findings appropriately grounded in the body of evidence (with supporting examples)?
- Are researcher reflections and insights on findings and interpretations documented?
- Are the researcher's personal assumptions and subjectivities made transparent in a reflexive journal?

# Appendices G: Letter of Information and Consent Instructors' Interviews Letter of Information and Consent

ESL/EFL Instructors' Interview

**Project Title:** Hiring Criteria and Employability of ESL/EFL Instructors in the TESOL Job Market in Canada and the UAE

### **Principal Investigator**

Dr. Shelley Taylor Faculty of Education University of Western Ontario

# **Additional Research Staff**

**Co-investigator** 

Shaden Attia Faculty of Education University of Western Ontario

Dear Participant,

You are being invited to participate in this research study, because you are an ESL/EFL instructor with current or past teaching experience in a higher education institute in Canada and/or the United Arab Emirates (UAE). The researcher is looking for individuals with experience in the TESOL field to shed light on the hiring criteria and practices, and their employment experiences in the field.

#### **Background and Purpose**

The study investigates hiring criteria and employability of ESL/EFL instructors in Canada and the UAE and aims to highlight the role that globalization might have on the TESOL job market and how it can possibly affect teachers and their employment prospects, recruiters' and program administrators' hiring decisions, and hiring criteria, and how they view their roles in the hiring process. Globalization's effect will be explored and compared in Canada and the UAE underlining any differences or similarities between both contexts. Finally, the research study will offer instructors the chance to tell their stories and put them to the forefront of the discussion giving them the tools to empower themselves. It will also provide recruiters and program administrators with the opportunity to share their story with an end goal of reaching a broad understanding of the job market from instructors', recruiters', and program administrators' perspective and bridging the gap between their views.

# **Study Procedures**

You provided your email address at the end of the online survey, indicating consent to being invited to participate in a follow-up interview. If you are selected, you will be interviewed one-on-one with Shaden Attia (Co-investigator). The interview will be conducted at a time convenient to you via online web-conferencing (Zoom). The interview will take approximately 30 minutes. You must agree to be audio-recorded and to have your interview transcribed. By providing your consent below you are allowing your interview to be audio-recorded and transcribed. Transcripts will be shared with you using a secure link using Western's OneDrive to review their accuracy. You can send any amendments or corrections to the transcript back to me in the same secure online manner. If you agree, the use of unidentifiable quotes will be used in the dissemination of the results.

If you decide to participate in an interview, I will obtain your electronic written consent (e-Consent) prior to your participation in the interview. To provide electronic written consent, I will send you a Qualtrics link where you will see the letter of information and consent form. You must read and sign the consent form at the end of this Letter of Information. Afterwards, I will sign the form, export it to a PDF, and send the completed form back to you via email.

The researcher will need to share your email address with Amazon or Tim Hortons to provide you with your compensation (\$15 e-gift card), but no information about your participation in this research will be disclosed.

If you wish to participate in a journal reflection, please email the Co-Investigator to indicate your interest: Shaden Attia

#### **Risks and Benefits**

There are no known or anticipated risks or discomforts associated with participating in this study. Please note that because we are collecting personal identifiers, there is always the risk of a privacy breach.

The possible benefits to you may be gaining more understanding of the TESOL field and the job market and how globalization possibly affects it. The possible benefits to society may be understanding challenges teachers, recruiters, and program administrators face and how to combat them, which can possibly lead to more equitable job opportunities. Also, another benefit is highlighting hiring criteria which could potentially improve instructors' understanding of the job market and consequently improving their chances of being hired.

# Withdrawal from Study

If you decide to withdraw from the study, you have the right to request by email or by phone withdrawal of information collected about you. If you wish to have your information removed, please let the researcher know and your information will be destroyed from our records. Once the study has been published, we will not be able to withdraw your information.

### **Confidentiality**

Delegated institutional representatives of Western University and its Non-Medical Research Ethics Board may require access to your study-related records to monitor the conduct of the research in accordance with regulatory requirements. The interview you will participate in will be audio-recorded and, like online shopping, teleconferencing/video conferencing technology has some privacy and security risks. It is possible that information could be intercepted by unauthorized people (hacked) or otherwise shared by accident. This risk can't be completely eliminated. We want to make you aware of this.

Identifiable information such as professional title and direct quotes will be collected to support the results of the research; however, only generic descriptions of professional role/s and de-identified quotes will be used in publications. In addition, each participant will be given a pseudonym to protect their identity. You have the right to give or not give permission to use this information. While we do our best to protect your information there is no guarantee that we will be able to do so. The inclusion of your professional role in dissemination of the results may allow someone to link the data and identify you.

The researcher will keep all personal information about you in a secure and confidential location for seven years. A list linking your study number/pseudonym with your name and other identifiers, such as contact information, organization, and professional role will be kept by the researcher in a secure place, separate from your study file. If the results of the study are published, your name will not be used.

All identifiable information will be deleted from the dataset collected so that individual participant's anonymity will be protected. The de-identified data will be accessible by the study investigators as well as the broader scientific community. More specifically, the data will/may be posted on specific databases OR made available to other researchers upon publication so that data may be inspected and analyzed by other researchers. The data that will be shared will not contain any information that can identify you.

# Compensation

If you choose to participate in an interview, you will be compensated for your time with your choice of one \$15 Tim Hortons or Amazon e-gift card.

### Rights as a Participant

Your participation in this study is voluntary. You may decide not to be in this study. Even if you consent to participate you have the right to not answer individual questions or to withdraw from the study at any time. If you choose not to participate or to leave the study at any time it will have no effect on you or your employment. You do not waive any legal right by consenting to this study.

#### **Contact Information**

If you have questions about this research study, please contact Dr. Shelley Taylor.

If you have any questions about your rights as a research participant or the conduct of this study, you may contact The Office of Human Research Ethics. This office oversees the ethical conduct of research studies and is not part of the study team. Everything that you discuss will be kept confidential.

# This letter is yours to keep for future reference.

#### **E-Consent Form**

Your signature below indicates that you have read the information above, understand that your participation in this research is voluntary, and that you have freely and willingly consented to participate in this research project. You may withdraw your consent at any time without any consequences to you personally or professionally. You will be emailed a copy of this document.

I have read the Letter of Information, have had the nature of the study explained to me, and I agree to participate. All questions have been answered to my satisfaction.

- o Yes
- o No

I agree to be audio-recorded in this research.

- o Yes
- o No

I consent to the use of unidentified quotes obtained during the study in the dissemination of this research.

o Yes

o No
Participant's First Name:
Participant's Last Name:
Participant's Signature
Today's Date (Day/Month/Year)
<b>THE FOLLOWING IS FOR RESEARCHER USE ONLY</b> (if you are a participant, please <i>skip</i> the questions below and use the arrow below to submit)
My signature means that I have explained the study to the participant named above. I have answered all the questions. Type name of person obtaining informed consent (To be completed by researcher upon submission)
Signature of person obtaining informed consent (To be completed by researcher upon submission)
Date Person Obtaining Consent Signs (Day/Month/Year)

# Appendices H: Letter of Information and Consent Instructors' Journal Reflection Letter of Information and Consent

Instructors' Journal Reflection

**Project Title:** Hiring Criteria and Employability of ESL/EFL Instructors in the TESOL Job Market in Canada and the UAE

# **Principal Investigator**

Dr. Shelley Taylor Faculty of Education University of Western Ontario

# **Additional Research Staff**

### Co-investigator

Shaden Attia Faculty of Education University of Western Ontario

Dear Participant,

You are being invited to participate in this research study, because you are an ESL/EFL instructor with current or past teaching experience in a higher education institute in Canada and/or the United Arab Emirates. The researcher is looking for individuals with experience in the TESOL field to shed light on the hiring criteria and practices, and their employment experiences in the field.

### **Background and Purpose**

The study investigates hiring criteria and employability of ESL/EFL instructors in Canada and the United Arab Emirates (UAE) and aims to highlight the role that globalization might have on the TESOL job market and how it can possibly affect teachers and their employment prospects, recruiters' and program administrators' hiring decisions, and hiring criteria, and how they view their roles in the hiring process. Globalization's effect will be explored and compared in Canada and the UAE underlining any differences or similarities between both contexts. Finally, the research study will offer instructors the chance to tell their stories and put them to the forefront of the discussion giving them the tools to empower themselves. It will also provide recruiters and program administrators with the opportunity to share their story with an end goal of reaching a broad understanding of the job market from instructors', recruiters', and program administrators' perspective and bridging the gap between their views.

# **Study Procedures**

If you agree to participate in the journal reflection, you will be sent a secure link to an online survey on Qualtrics. The journal reflection is expected to take 15-20 minutes to complete, and it will ask about your experiences in the TESOL field. If you agree to participate, unidentifiable quotes will be used in the dissemination of the results.

At the end of the journal reflection, you will be redirected to a separate survey to enter your email address to receive your 15-dollar e-gift card and where you will be invited to participate in a 30-minute interview. You may opt to only provide your email address to receive your 15-dollar e-gift card. The researcher will need to share your email address with Amazon or Tim Hortons to provide you with your compensation (\$15 e-gift card), but no information about your participation in this research will be disclosed.

If you wish to participate in an interview, please email the Co-Investigator to indicate your interest: Shaden Attia

#### **Risks and Benefits**

There are no known or anticipated risks or discomforts associated with participating in this study. Please note that because we are collecting personal identifiers, there is always the risk of a privacy breach.

The possible benefits to you may be gaining more understanding of the TESOL field and the job market and how globalization possibly affects it. The possible benefits to society may be understanding challenges teachers, recruiters, and program administrators face and how to combat them, which can possibly lead to more equitable job opportunities. Also, another benefit is highlighting hiring criteria which could potentially improve instructors' understanding of the job market and consequently improving their chances of being hired.

# Withdrawal from Study

If you decide to withdraw from the study, you have the right to request by email or by phone withdrawal of information collected about you. If you wish to have your information removed, please let the researcher know and your information will be destroyed from our records. Once the study has been published, we will not be able to withdraw your information.

#### **Confidentiality**

Delegated institutional representatives of Western University and its Non-Medical Research Ethics Board may require access to your study-related records to monitor the conduct of the research in accordance with regulatory requirements. The journal reflection you will participate in will be online and, like online shopping, technology has some privacy and security risks. It is possible that information could be intercepted by unauthorized people (hacked) or otherwise shared by accident. This risk can't be completely eliminated. We want to make you aware of this.

The researcher will keep all personal information about you in a secure and confidential location for seven years. A list linking your study number/pseudonym with your name and other identifiers, such as contact information, organization, and professional role will be kept by the researcher in a secure place, separate from your study file. If the results of the study are published, your name will not be used.

All identifiable information will be deleted from the dataset collected so that individual participant's anonymity will be protected. The de-identified data will be accessible by the study investigators as well as the broader scientific community. More specifically, the data will/may be posted on specific databases OR made available to other researchers upon publication so that data may be inspected and analyzed by other researchers. The data that will be shared will not contain any information that can identify you.

# Compensation

If you choose to participate in the journal reflection, you will receive a 15-dollar Tim Hortons or Amazon e-gift card.

#### Rights as a Participant

Your participation in this study is voluntary. You may decide not to be in this study. Even if you consent to participate you have the right to not answer individual questions or to withdraw from the study at any time. If you choose not to participate or to leave the study at any time it will have no effect on you or your employment. You do not waive any legal right by consenting to this study.

#### **Contact Information**

If you have questions about this research study, please contact Dr. Shelley Taylor.

If you have any questions about your rights as a research participant or the conduct of this study, you may contact The Office of Human Research Ethics. This office oversees the ethical conduct of research studies and is not part of the study team. Everything that you discuss will be kept confidential.

This letter is yours to keep for future reference.

# **E-Consent Form**

Your signature below indicates that you have read the information above, understand that your participation in this research is voluntary, and that you have freely and willingly consented to participate in this research project. You may withdraw your consent at any time without any consequences to you personally or professionally. You will be emailed a copy of this document.

I have read the Letter of Information, have had the nature of the study explained to me and I agree to participate. All questions have been answered to my satisfaction.  o Yes o No
I consent to the use of unidentified quotes obtained during the study in the dissemination of this research. o Yes o No
Participant's First Name:
Participant's Last Name:
Participant's Signature
Today's Date (Day/Month/Year)
THE FOLLOWING IS FOR RESEARCHER USE ONLY (if you are a participant, please <i>skip</i> the questions below and use the arrow below to submit)
My signature means that I have explained the study to the participant named above. I have answered all the questions. Type name of person obtaining informed consent (To be completed by researcher upon submission)
Signature of person obtaining informed consent (To be completed by researcher upon submission)
Date Person Obtaining Consent Signs (Day/Month/Year)

# **Appendices I: Letter of Information and Implied Consent Instructors' Questionnaire**

# **Letter of Information and Implied Consent**

ESL/EFL Instructors' Questionnaire

**Project Title:** Hiring Criteria and Employability of ESL/EFL Instructors in the TESOL Job Market in Canada and the UAE

### **Principal Investigator**

Dr. Shelley Taylor Faculty of Education University of Western Ontario

#### **Additional Research Staff**

**Co-investigator** 

Shaden Attia Faculty of Education University of Western Ontario

Dear Participant,

You are being invited to participate in this research study, because you are an ESL/EFL instructor with current or past teaching experience in a higher education institute in Canada and/or the United Arab Emirates. The researcher is looking for individuals with experience in the TESOL field to shed light on the hiring criteria and practices, and their employment experiences in the field.

#### **Background and Purpose**

The study investigates hiring criteria and employability of ESL/EFL instructors in Canada and the United Arab Emirates (UAE) and aims to highlight the role that globalization might have on the TESOL job market and how it can possibly affect teachers and their employment prospects, recruiters' and program administrators' hiring decisions, and hiring criteria, and how they view their roles in the hiring process. Globalization's effect will be explored and compared in Canada and the UAE underlining any differences or similarities between both contexts. Finally, the research study will offer instructors the chance to tell their stories and put them to the forefront of the discussion giving them the tools to empower themselves. It will also provide recruiters and program administrators with the opportunity to share their story with an end goal of reaching a broad understanding of the job market from instructors', recruiters', and program administrators' perspective and bridging the gap between their views.

# **Study Procedures**

If you agree to participate in the questionnaire, you will be sent a secure link to an online survey on Qualtrics. The questionnaire is expected to take 7-10 minutes to complete. If you agree to participate in the questionnaire, the answers you provide including unidentifiable quotes will be used in the dissemination of the results.

At the end of the questionnaire, you will be asked for your email if you would like to participate in a draw to win a 15\$ e-gift card and if you agree, you will be redirected to a separate survey to enter your email address and where you will be invited to participate in a 30-minute interview and/or a 15-20 minute journal reflection. You may opt to participate in the draw for the questionnaire only. The researcher will need to share your email address with Amazon or Tim Hortons to provide you with your compensation (\$15 e-gift card), ONLY if you are selected in the draw, but no information about your participation in this research will be disclosed.

If you only wish to participate in an interview, please email the Co-Investigator to indicate your interest: Shaden Attia.

#### **Risks and Benefits**

There are no known or anticipated risks or discomforts associated with participating in this study. Please note that because we are collecting personal identifiers, there is always the risk of a privacy breach.

The possible benefits to you may be gaining more understanding of the TESOL field and the job market and how globalization possibly affects it. The possible benefits to society may be understanding challenges teachers, recruiters, and program administrators face and how to combat them, which can possibly lead to more equitable job opportunities. Also, another benefit is highlighting hiring criteria which could potentially improve instructors' understanding of the job market and consequently improving their chances of being hired.

### Withdrawal from Study

Please be advised that your responses are anonymous, and you will be unable to withdraw your survey data once you submit your answers.

#### **Confidentiality**

Delegated institutional representatives of Western University and its Non-Medical Research Ethics Board may require access to your study-related records to monitor the conduct of the research in accordance with regulatory requirements. The questionnaire you will participate in will be online and, like online shopping, technology has some privacy and security risks. It is possible that information could be intercepted by unauthorized people (hacked) or otherwise shared by accident. This risk can't be completely eliminated. We want to make you aware of this.

### **Compensation**

If you choose to participate in the questionnaire, you will have the option of participating in a draw for a 15-dollar Tim Hortons or Amazon e-gift card.

# Rights as a Participant

Your participation in this study is voluntary. You may decide not to be in this study. Even if you consent to participate you have the right to not answer individual questions or to withdraw from the study at any time. If you choose not to participate or to leave the study at any time it will have no effect on you or your employment. You do not waive any legal right by consenting to this study.

#### **Contact Information**

If you have questions about this research study, please contact Dr. Shelley Taylor.

If you have any questions about your rights as a research participant or the conduct of this study, you may contact The Office of Human Research Ethics. This office oversees the ethical conduct of research studies and is not part of the study team. Everything that you discuss will be kept confidential.

Do you offer your consent to participate?

- o Yes, I consent
- o No, I do not consent

This letter is yours to keep for future reference.

# Appendices J: Letter of Information and Consent-Program Administrators' Interview

#### **Letter of Information and Consent**

Program Administrators' Interview

**Project Title:** Hiring Criteria and Employability of ESL/EFL Instructors in the TESOL Job Market in Canada and the UAE

# **Principal Investigator**

Dr. Shelley Taylor Faculty of Education University of Western Ontario

#### Additional Research Staff

# Co-investigator

Shaden Attia Faculty of Education University of Western Ontario

Dear Participant,

You are being invited to participate in this research study, because you are a program administrator with current or past experience working in a higher education institute in Canada and/or the United Arab Emirates. The researcher is looking for individuals with experience in the TESOL field to shed light on the hiring criteria and practices, and their employment experiences in the field.

# **Background and Purpose**

The study investigates hiring criteria and employability of ESL/EFL instructors in Canada and the United Arab Emirates (UAE) and aims to highlight the role that globalization might have on the TESOL job market and how it can possibly affect teachers and their employment prospects, recruiters' and program administrators' hiring decisions, and hiring criteria, and how they view their roles in the hiring process. Globalization's effect will be explored and compared in Canada and the UAE underlining any differences or similarities between both contexts. Finally, the research study will offer instructors the chance to tell their stories and put them to the forefront of the discussion giving them the tools to empower themselves. It will also provide recruiters and program administrators with the opportunity to share their story with an end goal of reaching a broad understanding of the job market from instructors', recruiters', and program administrators' perspective and bridging the gap between their views.

### **Study Procedures**

When invited by the co-investigator to participate in the research study, you replied indicating consent to being invited to participate in an interview. You will be interviewed one-on-one with Shaden Attia (Co-investigator). The interview will be conducted at a time convenient to you via online web-conferencing (Zoom). The interview will take approximately 30 minutes. You must agree to be audio-recorded and to have your interview transcribed. By providing your consent below you are allowing your interview to be audio-recorded and transcribed. Transcripts will be shared with you using a secure link using Western's OneDrive to review their accuracy. You can send any amendments or corrections to the transcript back to me in the same secure online manner. If you agree, the use of unidentifiable quotes will be used in the dissemination of the results.

If you decide to participate in an interview, I will obtain your electronic written consent (e-Consent) prior to your participation in the interview. To provide electronic written consent, I will send you a Qualtrics link where you will see the letter of information and consent form. You must read and sign the consent form at the end of this Letter of Information. Afterwards, I will sign the form, export it to a PDF, and send the completed form back to you via email.

The researcher will need to share your email address with Amazon or Tim Hortons to provide you with your compensation (\$15 e-gift card), but no information about your participation in this research will be disclosed.

#### **Risks and Benefits**

There are no known or anticipated risks or discomforts associated with participating in this study. Please note that because we are collecting personal identifiers, there is always the risk of a privacy breach.

The possible benefits to you may be gaining more understanding of the TESOL field and the job market and how globalization possibly affects it. The possible benefits to society may be understanding challenges teachers, recruiters, and program administrators face and how to combat them, which can possibly lead to more equitable job opportunities. Also, another benefit is highlighting hiring criteria which could potentially improve instructors' understanding of the job market and consequently improving their chances of being hired.

# Withdrawal from Study

If you decide to withdraw from the study, you have the right to request by email or by phone withdrawal of information collected about you. If you wish to have your information removed, please let the researcher know and your information will be destroyed from our records. Once the study has been published, we will not be able to withdraw your information.

# **Confidentiality**

Delegated institutional representatives of Western University and its Non-Medical Research Ethics Board may require access to your study-related records to monitor the conduct of the research in accordance with regulatory requirements. The interview you will participate in will be audio-recorded and, like online shopping, teleconferencing/video conferencing technology has some privacy and security risks. It is possible that information could be intercepted by unauthorized people (hacked) or otherwise shared by accident. This risk can't be completely eliminated. We want to make you aware of this.

Identifiable information such as professional title and direct quotes will be collected to support the results of the research; however, only generic descriptions of professional role/s and de-identified quotes will be used in publications. In addition, each participant will be given a pseudonym to protect their identity. You have the right to give or not give permission to use this information. While we do our best to protect your information there is no guarantee that we will be able to do so. The inclusion of your professional role in dissemination of the results may allow someone to link the data and identify you.

The researcher will keep all personal information about you in a secure and confidential location for seven years. A list linking your study number/pseudonym with your name and other identifiers, such as contact information, organization, and professional role will be kept by the researcher in a secure place, separate from your study file. If the results of the study are published, your name will not be used.

All identifiable information will be deleted from the dataset collected so that individual participant's anonymity will be protected. The de-identified data will be accessible by the study investigators as well as the broader scientific community. More specifically, the data will/may be posted on specific databases OR made available to other researchers upon publication so that data may be inspected and analyzed by other researchers. The data that will be shared will not contain any information that can identify you.

#### **Compensation**

If you choose to participate in an interview, you will be compensated for your time with your choice of one \$15 Tim Hortons or Amazon e-gift card.

#### Rights as a Participant

Your participation in this study is voluntary. You may decide not to be in this study. Even if you consent to participate you have the right to not answer individual questions or to withdraw from the study at any time. If you choose not to participate or to leave the study at any time it will have no effect on you or your employment. You do not waive any legal right by consenting to this study.

#### **Contact Information**

Participant's Signature

If you have questions about this research study, please contact Dr. Shelley Taylor.

If you have any questions about your rights as a research participant or the conduct of this study, you may contact The Office of Human Research Ethics. This office oversees the ethical conduct of research studies and is not part of the study team. Everything that you discuss will be kept confidential.

# This letter is yours to keep for future reference.

#### **E-Consent Form**

Your signature below indicates that you have read the information above, understand that your participation in this research is voluntary, and that you have freely and willingly consented to participate in this research project. You may withdraw your consent at any a

time without any consequences to you personally or professionally. You will be emailed copy of this document.
I have read the Letter of Information, have had the nature of the study explained to me and I agree to participate. All questions have been answered to my satisfaction.  O Yes  O No
I agree to be audio-recorded in this research. o Yes
o No
I consent to the use of unidentified quotes obtained during the study in the dissemination of this research.  o Yes o No
Participant's First Name:
Participant's Last Name:

Today's Date (Day/Month/Year)
THE FOLLOWING IS FOR RESEARCHER USE ONLY (if you are a participant, please <i>skip</i> the questions below and use the arrow below to submit)
My signature means that I have explained the study to the participant named above. I have answered all the questions. Type name of person obtaining informed consent (To be completed by researcher upon submission)
Signature of person obtaining informed consent (To be completed by researcher upon submission)
Date Person Obtaining Consent Signs (Day/Month/Year)

### **Appendices K: Recruitment Email Script for Instructors**

Hello,

You are being invited to participate in a study that we, Shaden Attia and Dr. Shelley Taylor, are conducting.

We are looking for volunteers to take part in a study about the Hiring Criteria and Employability of ESL/EFL Teachers in the TESOL Job Market in Canada and the United Arab Emirates (UAE). Your participation in this study will help us to better understand the main hiring criteria expected from ESL/EFL teachers, the employability of teachers in today's global market, and the effect of globalization on the TESOL field.

You are eligible if you meet the following criteria:

- Speak English as a Second or Additional Language
- Are an English as a Second/Foreign Language Teacher

#### **AND**

 Have current OR prior experience teaching in a higher education setting in the UAE and/or Canada.

If you are interested and agree to participate, you will be asked to complete an online questionnaire which will last approximately 10 minutes. In the questionnaire you will be asked if you would like to participate in a 30-minute interview and/or a 15–20-minute journal reflection. You can opt for participating in the questionnaire only.

If you participate in the questionnaire, you will be offered the opportunity to enter a draw to win a 15-dollar e-gift card (Amazon or Tim Hortons). Also, each interview and journal reflection participant will receive a 15-dollar e-gift card each (Amazon or Tim Hortons).

We will be sending two reminder emails: two weeks from now and one month from now. If you would like more information on this study, please contact the researchers at the contact information given below.

Shaden Attia, Co-Investigator, PhD Candidate Faculty of Education, Western University

Dr. Shelley Taylor, Principal Investigator Faculty of Education, Western University

## **Appendices L: Recruitment Email Script for Program Administrators**

Hello,

You are being invited to participate in a study that we, Shaden Attia and Dr. Shelley Taylor, are conducting.

We are looking for volunteers to take part in a study about the Hiring Criteria and Employability of ESL/EFL Teachers in the TESOL Job Market in Canada and the United Arab Emirates (UAE). Your participation in this study will help us to better understand the main hiring criteria expected from ESL/EFL teachers, the employability of teachers in today's global market, and the effect of globalization on the TESOL field.

You are eligible if you meet the following criteria:

• Are a program administrator for an English language program in a higher education institute organization in the UAE and/or Canada.

If you are interested and agree to participate, you will be asked to participate in a 30-minute interview. Each interview participant will receive a 15-dollar e-gift card (Amazon or Tim Hortons).

We will be sending two reminder emails: two weeks from now and one month from now. If you would like more information on this study, please contact the researchers at the contact information given below.

Shaden Attia, Co-Investigator, PhD Candidate

Faculty of Education, Western University

Dr. Shelley Taylor, Principal Investigator

Faculty of Education, Western University

#### **Appendices M: Recruitment Advertisement for List-servs**

You are invited to participate in a study conducted by Dr. Shelley Taylor (Principal Investigator) and Shaden Attia (Co-investigator) about the hiring criteria and employability of ESL/EFL instructors in Canada and the United Arab Emirates (UAE). Your participation in this study will help us understand instructors' employability in today's market, and globalization's effect on the TESOL field.

You are eligible to participate if you are: an ESL/EFL instructor who speaks English as a second or additional language, a recruiter, or program administrator with experience in a higher education institute in Canada and/or the UAE.

Study Details for ESL/EFL instructor participants:

Study Details for Recruiter participants:

Study Details for Program Administrator participants:

Kindly note that you may drop out of the study at any time.

### **Appendices N: Recruitment Advertisement for LinkedIn**

Are you a recruiter or program administrator in a higher education institute in Canada, United Arab Emirates (UAE), or have experience in both countries?

**OR** are you an ESL/EFL instructor who speaks English as a Second or Additional language and have experience in Canada, UAE, or both?

If your answer is yes to either question, you are being invited to participate in a study that we, Shaden Attia, co-investigator, and Dr. Shelley Taylor, Principal Investigator, are conducting.

We are looking for volunteers to take part in a study about the Hiring Criteria and Employability of ESL/EFL Teachers in the TESOL Job Market in Canada and the UAE. Your participation in this study will help us to better understand the main hiring criteria expected from ESL/EFL teachers, the employability of teachers in today's global market, and the effect of globalization on the TESOL field.

If you are interested and would like to know more information about the study and what you will be expected to do, please contact me directly **through LinkedIn or via email.** 

Study Details for ESL/EFL instructor participants: Study Details for Recruiter participants: Study Details for Program Administrator participants:

#### **Further Contact Information**

If you have questions about this research study, please contact Dr. Shelley Taylor.

If you have any questions about your rights as a research participant or the conduct of this study, you may contact The Office of Human Research Ethics. This office oversees the ethical conduct of research studies and is not part of the study team. Everything that you discuss will be kept confidential.

# Appendices O: Recruitment Advertisement for Western's eCast

You are invited to participate in a study conducted by Dr. Shelley Taylor (Principal Investigator) and Shaden Attia (Co-investigator) about the hiring criteria and employability of ESL/EFL instructors in Canada and the UAE. Your participation in this study will help us understand instructors' employability in today's market, and globalization's effect on the TESOL field.

You are eligible to participate if you are: an ESL/EFL instructor who speaks English as a second or additional language, a recruiter, or program administrator with experience in a higher education institute in Canada and/or the UAE.

For further information, please contact Shaden Attia.

#### **Appendices P: Mass Invitation to Participate Email**



# Invite-to-Participate Mass Email Recruitment (Faculty of Education-Students)

Study Title: Hiring Criteria and Employability of ESL/EFL Instructors in the TESOL Job

Market in Canada and the UAE

**Principal Investigator**: Dr. Shelley Taylor

**Student Investigator**: Shaden Attia

**Subject Line**: Mass Email Recruitment

Dear Faculty of Education Students,

You are being invited to participate in a study about the Hiring Criteria and Employability of ESL/EFL Instructors in the TESOL Job Market in Canada and the United Arab Emirates (UAE). Your participation in this study will help us to better understand the main hiring criteria expected from ESL/EFL teachers, the employability of teachers in today's global market, and the effect of globalization on the TESOL field.

We are recruiting participants from three different groups:

- **ESL/EFL instructors** who speak English as a second or additional language, with experience in a higher education institute (university or college) in Canada and/or the UAE.
- **Recruiters** with experience hiring ESL/EFL instructors in a higher education institute in Canada and/or the UAE.
- **Program administrators** with experience managing an ESL/EFL program in a higher education institute in Canada and/or the UAE.

#### For details on each of the three categories, please check the following links.

- Study Details for participants who are ESL/EFL Instructors:
- Study Details for participants who are Recruiters:
- Study Details for participants who are Program Administrator:

<u>For instructors</u>, if you volunteer to participate in the study, you will first fill out a questionnaire, which takes approximately 10 minutes. Then, you will complete a journal reflection, which should take approximately 15-20 minutes, and finally you will be invited to attend an online interview session. The interview will be one-on-one, approximately 30 minutes, and conducted via Zoom.

<u>For Recruiters</u>, if you volunteer to participate in the study, you will first fill out a questionnaire, which takes approximately 10 minutes. Then, you will be invited to

attend an online interview session. The interview will be one-on-one, approximately 30 minutes, and conducted via Zoom.

<u>For program administrators</u>, if you volunteer to participate in the study, you will be invited to attend an online interview session. The interview will be one-on-one, approximately 30 minutes, and conducted via Zoom.

**Compensation:** If you participate in the questionnaire, you will be offered the opportunity to enter a draw to win a 15-dollar e-gift card (Amazon or Tim Hortons). Also, each interview and journal reflection participant will receive a 15-dollar e-gift card each (Amazon or Tim Hortons).

If you would like more information on this study and if you are interested in participating, please contact the co-investigator, Shaden Attia, or the principal investigator, Shelley Taylor.

Thank you for taking the time to read this email. Best Regards, Shaden Attia, Co-Investigator, PhD Candidate Faculty of Education, Western University

Dr. Shelley Taylor, Principal Investigator Faculty of Education, Western University

# **Appendices Q: Ethics Approval Letter**



Date: 4 July 2022

To: Dr. Shelley Taylor

Project ID: 120291

Study Title: Hiring Criteria and Employability of ESL/EFL Instructors in the TESOL Job Market in Canada and the UAE

Short Title: Hiring Criteria and Employability in the TESOL Job Market

Application Type: NMREB Initial Application

Review Type: Delegated

Full Board Reporting Date: August 5 2022

Date Approval Issued: 04/Jul/2022 11:25

REB Approval Expiry Date: 04/Jul/2023

Dear Dr. Shelley Taylor

The Western University Non-Medical Research Ethics Board (NMREB) has reviewed and approved the WREM application form for the above mentioned study, as of the date noted above. NMREB approval for this study remains valid until the expiry date noted above, conditional to timely submission and acceptance of NMREB Continuing Ethics Review.

This research study is to be conducted by the investigator noted above. All other required institutional approvals and mandated training must also be obtained prior to the conduct of the study.

#### Documents Approved:

Document Name	Document Type	Document Date	Document Version
Western's eCast Ad	Recruitment Materials	04/Apr/2022	1
Email Script for Instructors	Recruitment Materials	04/Apr/2022	1
Email Script for Program Administrators	Recruitment Materials	04/Apr/2022	1
Email Script for Recruiters	Recruitment Materials	04/Apr/2022	1
Instructors' Interview Questions	Interview Guide	04/Apr/2022	1
Recruiters' Interview Questions	Interview Guide	04/Apr/2022	1
Program Administrators' Interview Questions	Interview Guide	04/Apr/2022	1
Recruitement Ad for List-servs	Recruitment Materials	04/Apr/2022	1
Recruitment Materials LinkedIn	Recruitment Materials	04/Apr/2022	1
Instructors' Questionnaire Canada	Online Survey	09/Jun/2022	2
Instructors' Questionnaire UAE	Online Survey	09/Jun/2022	2
Recruiters' Questionnaire Canada	Online Survey	09/Jun/2022	2
Recruiters' Questionnaire UAE	Online Survey	09/Jun/2022	2
Instructors' Journal Reflection	Other Data Collection Instruments	09/Jun/2022	2
Letter of Information and Consent Instructors' Interviews	Written Consent/Assent	09/Jun/2022	2
Letter of Information and Consent Instructors' Journal Reflection	Written Consent/Assent	09/Jun/2022	2
Letter of Information and Consent-Program Administrators' Interview	Written Consent/Assent	09/Jun/2022	2
Letter of Information and Consent-Recruiters' Interview	Written Consent/Assent	09/Jun/2022	2
Letter of Information and Implied Consent Recruiters'	Implied Consent/Assent	09/Jun/2022	2

1	Questionnaire			
- 1	Letter of Information and Implied Consent-ESL_EFL Instructors' Questionnaire	Implied Consent/Assent	09/Jun/2022	2

No deviations from, or changes to the protocol should be initiated without prior written approval from the NMREB, except when necessary to eliminate immediate hazard(s) to study participants or when the change(s) involves only administrative or logistical aspects of the trial.

The Western University NMREB operates in compliance with the Tri-Council Policy Statement Ethical Conduct for Research Involving Humans (TCPS2), the Ontario Personal Health Information Protection Act (PHIPA, 2004), and the applicable laws and regulations of Ontario. Members of the NMREB who are named as Investigators in research studies do not participate in discussions related to, nor vote on such studies when they are presented to the REB. The NMREB is registered with the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services under the IRB registration number IRB 00000941.

Please do not hesitate to contact us if you have any questions.

Sincerely,

Kelly Patterson, Research Ethics Officer on behalf of Dr. Randal Graham, NMREB Chair

Note: This correspondence includes an electronic signature (validation and approval via an online system that is compliant with all regulations).

# Appendices R: Data Collection Methods' Codes

# **Codes for Job Advertisements in Canada**

#	Codes	Sub-codes
1	Additional Qualifications and	
	Certification	
2	Benefits and Compensation	
3	Canadian and Overseas	
	Experience	
4	Cultural Sensitivity	
5	Digital Literacy	
6	General Job Description	1) Job Summary 2) Main Responsibilities
		3) Position Title 4) position Type
7	Inclusivity	1) Accessibility Statement 2) Equity and
		Diversity Statement
8	Job Requirements	1)Educational Requirement 2) soft skills
		3) years of experience
9	Language Skills	Native and Non-native Terms
10	Personal and Professional	
	Development	
11	Teaching Methodologies	

# **Codes for Job Advertisements in the UAE**

#	Codes	Sub-codes
1	Application Package	1) References 2) Teaching Philosophy
2	Diversity &	
	Employment Equity	
	Statement	
3	Employer Description	
	& Details	
4	General Teaching	1) Start Date 2) Package and Benefits 3)
	Position Details	Supervisor 4) Position Title 5) Position Summary
		6) Position Type
5	Job Description	
6	Job Requirements	1) Additional Teaching Qualification 2)
		Application Package 3) Degree Requires 4)
		English Language Requirements 5) Equivalency
		7) Qualifications and Experience 8) Years of
		Experience

7	Native and Non-native	1) Native Term 2) Non-native Term
	Terms	
8	Personal and	
	Professional	
	Development	
9	Research and	
	Publication	
10	Short-listed Candidates	
	Statement	
11	Teaching Approaches	
	and Methodologies	
12	Technology Use	1) English Language and Technology 2) Software
		Programs
13	Visa Requirements	

# Codes for Instructors' Journal Reflections in Canada

#	Codes
1	ESL Jobs in Canada
2	Job Requirements in Canada
3	Relocating to Canada
4	Struggles in the Job Market

# Codes for Instructors' Journal Reflections in the UAE

#	Codes
1	Canadian Job Market Positive Aspects
2	Alternative to Teaching in Canada
3	Canadian Job Requirements
4	Covid-19
5	Gatekeepers in Canada
6	Gatekeepers in the UAE
7	Job Hunting Experiences in Canada
8	Reasons for Leaving the UAE
9	Instructors' Work Experience
10	Instructors' Years of Experience in the UAE

# **Codes for Instructors' Interviews in Canada**

#	Codes
1	Advice to Other Instructors
2	Benefits of Non-native Instructors
3	Canadian Job Market Requirements
4	Changes in the Job Market and Hiring Criteria
5	Corruption and Connections
6	Courses Offered or Taught
7	Covid-19's Effect
8	Effectiveness Of Current Research Study
9	Effects of Change In Job Market or Hiring Criteria
10	Evaluating Instructors' English Skills
11	Instructors' Responsibility
12	Instructors' Qualifications and Requirements
13	Instructors Background and Experience
14	Interview Experience
15	Journal Reflections (Sub-codes: Issues with Students, Issues
	with Volunteer Experience, Unclear Pay)
16	Nativeness
17	Qualities Of Strong Teaching Candidates
18	Reflections On Teaching Journey
19	Shifting From Teaching to Administration
20	Students' Population
21	Students Perspective of a Model Teacher
22	TESL Certification
23	Reasons for Relocating to Canada

# **Codes for Instructors' Interviews in the UAE**

#	Codes
1	Advice to Instructors
2	Asking about Researcher's Ethnicity and language
3	Biases Against Instructors
4	changes in job Requirements, Hiring Criteria, and Job Market
5	Courses and Students' Population
6	Covid-19's Effect
7	Difference Between Emirati and Canadian Students
8	Evaluating Instructors Language Skills
9	Hiring Situation in the UAE

10	Model English Teachers (Students' Perspective) Sub-code:
	Instructors' Role Towards Students)
11	Nativeness and Benefits of Non-native Instructors
12	Qualities of Strong Teacher Candidates
13	Reasons for Returning to Canada
14	Requirements and Qualifications listed in Job Advertisements
15	Results of Requiring Equivalency
16	Shift from Teaching to Administration
17	Relocating to Canada or Another Country
18	Teaching Experience and General Background

# Codes for Program Administrators' Interviews in Canada

#	Codes
1	Reactions to Stereotypes and Biases
2	Administrators Responsibilities and Duties
3	Administrators Job Titles
4	Administrators' Years of Experience
5	Canadian Experience VS International Experience
6	Changes in the Job Market (Sub-code: COVID-19's Effect on
	Hiring Criteria)
7	Characteristics of Strong Candidates
8	Courses Offered
9	Hiring Process
10	Instructors' Job Requirements and Qualifications (Job
	Advertisements)
11	Instructors Support at Work
12	Instructors Speaking English as an Additional Language
13	Nativeness (Students Perception)
14	Perceptions and Definitions of Nativeness
15	Students Populations
16	Biased Incidents with Instructors
17	Transition from Instructor to Coordinator

# Codes for Program Administrators' Interviews in the UAE

#	Codes
1	Administrators' Job Title
2	Advice To Instructors
3	Arabic Language Use
4	Changes in The Job Market
5	Changes Noticed Shifting Back to Canada
6	Considerations When Hiring in the UAE
7	Credential Inflation
8	Differences Between the UAE and Canada
9	Discrimination in the UAE
10	Education-related Issues in the UAE
11	Instructors' Core Competency
12	Interviews and Questions Asked
13	Nativeness And Non-Nativeness
14	Pandemic's Effect
15	Reason For Returning to Canada
16	Requirements For Instructors

#### **Curriculum Vitae**

Name: Shaden Samir Attia

**Postsecondary** University of Western Ontario

**Education and** London, ON, Canada

**Degrees:** Ph.D.: Educational Studies (2019-2023)

American University in Cairo

Cairo, Egypt

Master of Arts: MA TESOL (2013-2015)

University of Ain Shams

Cairo, Egypt

Bachelor of Arts: Italian Language and Literature (2005-

2009)

Honours and

Awards:

Research Grant for Emergent Issues and Priorities

offered by Ontario Secondary School Teachers'

Federation (OSSTF)

2022-2023

Ontario Gradate Scholarship

2020-2021, 2022-2023

Merit Fellowship, American University in Cairo

2013-2015

Foreign Language Teaching Assistant Scholarship, Fulbright, and International Institute of Education (IIE)

2012-2013

**Related Work** 

Writing Professor **Experience:** 

School of Language and Liberal Studies, Fanshawe

College

2023- Current

Research and Administrative Assistant

Resilience Counseling Research & Consultation

2022-2023

Teaching and Research Assistant University of Western Ontario 2019-2023

Assistant Lecturer British University in Egypt 2016-2018

ESL Instructor American University in Cairo 2015-2019

Research Assistant American University in Cairo 2013-2015

Academic Services Reviewer

NYS TESOL (2022)

Robert Macmillan Symposium in Education (2021) Centre for Educational Research on Languages and Literacies (CERLL)

Committee Member & Volunteer
Robert Macmillan Symposium in Education
2020-2023

Centre for Educational Research on Languages and

Literacies (CERLL)

2020-2023

Mentor & Program Coordinator Mentorship Program 2019-2023

#### **Publications:**

Attia, S. (2022, February). [Review of the book: *Critical Race Theory in Education*, by D. Gillborn & L. Parker]. TESOL International Association Higher Education Interest Section (HEIS). <a href="http://newsmanager.commpartners.com/tesolheis/print/2022-02-03/5.html">http://newsmanager.commpartners.com/tesolheis/print/2022-02-03/5.html</a>

Attia, S. (2021). [Review of the book: *The transformative power of language: From postcolonial to knowledge societies in Africa*, by R. H. Kaschula and H. E. Wolff]. *Linguist List*. <a href="https://linguistlist.org/issues/32.2007/">https://linguistlist.org/issues/32.2007/</a> (Publication Date: April 15, 2021)

Attia, S. (2021). [Review of the book: *Critical race theory: A primer*, by K. M. Bridges]. *Race and Justice*, 1-4. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1177/2153368721993532">https://doi.org/10.1177/2153368721993532</a> (Publication date: February 10, 2021)

Attia, S. (2021). [Review of the book: *The sociopolitics of English language testing*, by S. Mirhosseini and P. De Costa]. *Linguist List*. <a href="https://linguistlist.org/issues/32/32-2159/">https://linguistlist.org/issues/32/32-2159/</a> (Publication date: January 13, 2021)

#### **Guest Lectures**

- Attia, S. (March 07, 2023). Refugee Youths Navigating Post-Secondary Education: From Fear to Agency. Invited address to Dr. Shelley Taylor's 9625 class, Faculty of Education, Western University, London, Ontario, Canada.
- Attia, S. (February 25, 2023). The How, What and Where of Conferences. Invited address to Robert Macmillan Symposium of Education's volunteers, Faculty of Education, Western University, London, Ontario, Canada.
- Attia, S. (January 12, 2022). How to Write a Comprehensive Exam. Invited address to Dr. Shelley Taylor's 9715 class, Faculty of Education, Western University, London, Ontario, Canada.
- Attia, S. (January 28, 2020). How to Design Mixed-Method Research. Invited address to Dr. Zheng Zhang's 9678 class, Faculty of Education, Western University, London, Ontario, Canada.

#### **Conference Presentations**

- Challenges and Opportunities in the TESOL Job Market: Stories and Reflections by Instructors and Administrators (Poster Presentation): Canadian Association of Applied Linguistics, Toronto, Canada, (May 27-29, 2023)
- Refugee Youths Navigating Postsecondary Education: From Fear to Agency: TESOL Convention, Portland, USA, (March 21-24, 2023)
- Counter-storytelling as a Social Justice Pedagogy: TESOL Convention, Portland, USA, (March 21-24, 2023)
- Shifting Paradigms for Teaching Youth Refugees at the Postsecondary Level: NYS TESOL 52nd Annual Conference, New York, USA (Nov 3, 2022) [Copresenter]
- Critical Race Theory and Intersectionality: ESL Classrooms and Students' Capital: NYS TESOL 52nd Annual Conference, New York, USA (Nov 3, 2022)
- Globalization and Education: Discrimination and Privilege, CERLL, OISE, ON, Canada (May 8-9, 2020)
- Globalization and Education: Discrimination and Privilege, Robert Macmillan Symposium in Education, London, On, Canada (March 27, 2020)
- Attia, S., Caetano, S., Law, E., Medina, M. R., Viana, G. (2019, December 6)
   Cars-carpooling Awareness and Ridesharing Services [Poster Presentation].
   HUBBUB, London, ON, Canada. https://citystudiolondon.ca/projects-list/transportation-team-cars-carpooling-awareness-and-ridesharing-services

- Attia, S., Caetano, S., Law, E., Medina, M. R., Viana, G. (2019, November 29).
   Cars-carpooling Awareness and Ridesharing Services [Poster Presentation].
   Innovation Works, London, ON, Canada. https://citystudiolondon.ca/projects-list/transportation-team-cars-carpooling-awareness-and-ridesharing-services
- Foreign Language Anxiety in the Egyptian ESL Classroom: Perceptions, Attitudes, and Solutions, BUE-Nile TESOL, British University in Egypt, Shorouk city, Egypt (March 27, 2017)
- Foreign Language Anxiety: Teachers' Perceptions, Attitudes, and Roles, Nile TESOL/AUC Conference, New Cairo, Egypt (January 26-27, 2015)
- Foreign Language Anxiety: Teachers' Perceptions, Attitudes, and Roles, TESOL International Association Regional Conferences, National Institute of Education, Singapore (December 3-5, 2015).