The Implementation of TES: A case Study

Ahlam Ayoub, The University of Western Ontario

Supervisor: Dr. Jun Li, The University of Western Ontario

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Doctor of Philosophy degree in Education
© Ahlam Ayoub 2022

Follow this and additional works at: https://ir.lib.uwo.ca/etd

Part of the Teacher Education and Professional Development Commons

Recommended Citation
https://ir.lib.uwo.ca/etd/9057

This Dissertation/Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by Scholarship@Western. It has been accepted for inclusion in Electronic Thesis and Dissertation Repository by an authorized administrator of Scholarship@Western. For more information, please contact wlsadmin@uwo.ca.
Abstract

In the Middle East and North Africa (MENA) region, including Palestine, the current teaching reforming trend towards international accountability, standards adoption and borrowing for presumed “best practices” in teacher education (development and teaching) is grounded by economic globalization. The Palestinian Ministry of Education and Higher Education (MoEHE) has been committed towards attaining such a movement and objectives. Within the aim of qualifying teachers, a number of substantial policies have been launched, including the most important initiation of the national “Teacher Education Strategy” (TES). This study analyzes TES implementation process for reforming teacher education, particularly the rationality, dynamism, and complexity of the implementation. The main question being addressed is, “How has the MoEHE implemented the national TES and its recommendations to reform teacher education in Palestine since mid-2010?”

Based on the case study methodology and utilization of a multi-disciplinary framework (critical & rational), the researcher gathers and comprehends the data. Various methods for data collection are applied, such as Zoom interviews and document analysis. The adopted analytic model allows the researcher to look into the implementation process through examining the communication system and delivery structure, the policy strategies and objectives, the implementer's roles and disposition, the characteristics of the implementing agency, and the environmental variables, particularly the socio-economic and political factors, and the evaluation and outcomes. However, throughout the tremendous efforts of reforming teacher education, neoliberal policies, outsider impact, and the political and economic instability in Palestine have complicated the evolution of the Palestinians' vision and philosophy for education. Despite many accomplishments, the core element of TES objectives has not been achieved yet. A number of implications and recommendations by this research are presented to contribute to a resolution of teacher education reform matters in Palestine and the world.
Keywords: teacher education reform, teaching profession development, teacher qualification, professionalism and qualification, international trends, globalization.
Summary

The Palestinian MoEHE has been committed towards attaining international teaching reforming trends. Throughout the last decade, many efforts for reforming teacher education have been introduced. The outsider’s impact and the economic and political contradictions in Palestine have prevented the evolution of Palestinians' vision and philosophy, and many efforts have failed to widen the improvement of teacher education to a large-scale production. Substantial policies have been launched qualifying in-service and pre-service teachers and most importantly the initiation of the national “Teacher Education Strategy” (TES). Thus, the purpose of this study was to analyze the TES implementation process, particularly the rationality, dynamism, and complexity of the implementation of policy process. Thus, the study aimed to understand the following question: How has the MoEHE responded to the national TES to reform teacher education in Palestine since mid-2010?

This research employed a case study methodology and utilized a multi-perspective framework (critical & rational) in addition to the analytical model which the researcher developed to gather and comprehend the data. It is a distinct method of policy analysis that allowed the researcher to understand the chain of complex reciprocal actions dependent on a sequence of events. On the one hand, the public policy is rational because it is aimed at achieving specific goals. Moreover, due to the dynamic nature of policy development and the need to accommodate conflicting interests of multiple stakeholders, understanding the implementation of the public policy necessitates critical thinking. The researcher conducted Zoom interviews and document analysis to gather and comprehend the data collection. The adopted analytic model allowed the researcher to look into the implementation variables, such as the policy delivery structure and communication mechanisms, the characteristics of the implementing agency, the policy strategies and objectives, the implementers' involvement and dispositions, and the environmental variables, such as the socio-economic, and political factors that hindered the TES implementation. A number of implications and recommendations are provided for future studies and policy analysts.
Dedication

I dedicate this dissertation to my best friend, forever partner, and husband, Mohammed, who supported me in all stages of our shared life, even in the most critical times. I dedicate this dissertation to my mother’s soul, Rasmia, who motivated me to pursue a lifelong learning, and seek new knowledge. Lastly, I dedicate my dissertation to my children, Rami, Ibraheem, Nadeen, and Zina, who have become independent, mature individuals whom I hope to have a bright future full of success and happiness.
Acknowledgements

This degree would not be accomplished without the special support and inducement from teachers, friends, and family. Thus, I would like to acknowledge the distinctive effort of special individuals who contributed to my transformative journey and helped me become a researcher rather than only a student. I have been fortunate enough to work with the best in the field of CPELS and policy analysis; Dr. Jun Li, my expedition supervisor; Dr. Tarc, and the ultimate supporting Dr. Larson. I would like to express my sincerest thanks to my supervisor Dr. Li for his guidance and contributions, supervising my learning endeavor, and assisting to overcome the difficulties and challenges that came with this project. I would like to thank Dr. Tarc at the Faculty of Education for his knowledgeable advice on this journey. He provided me with many recommendations and suggestions to allow much successful experience. I am thankful for Dr. Larson, my first teacher in the program with her demonstration of care and kindness, especially shown throughout her unforgettable course. I am also thankful for my colleagues for being supportive and present with their promptly valuable feedback. I am also indebted to my husband, Mohammad, who has been my backbone and source of unconditional support throughout this journey. My appreciation also goes to my mother’s soul, Rasmia, as a model of inspiration and motivation for any achievement in my life. Her love and support for learning has kept me working hard. She has been my passion and moral assistance throughout life. I would also like to express my appreciation for the support I received from my friends. They provided encouragement along the way and were patient with my attempts to balance our friendship with my full-time studies. To all my friends: Thank you for the continuous reminders to “just get it done”, and your sense of humor that has helped me cope during crunch time. I would also like to give a special thanks to my brother, Ibraheem, who was very supportive from the beginning of my journey for education, and my children who inspire me every day by sharing their thoughts and dreams with me. Through them, I have learned to pay careful attention to their thoughts and feelings as I attempt to discover how they learn. Last but certainly not least, I am always thankful for my sisters for appreciating my love for education and their ever present love and support. Thank you everyone for the guidance, support, and the years of faith in my ability to achieve this PhD degree.
Table of Contents

Abstract .................................................................................................................................................. i
Summary ............................................................................................................................................... iii
Dedication ............................................................................................................................................... iv
Acknowledgements .............................................................................................................................. v
Table of Contents ................................................................................................................................ vi
List of Tables ........................................................................................................................................ xii
List of Figures ....................................................................................................................................... xiii
List of Appendices ............................................................................................................................ xiv
List of Abbreviations ........................................................................................................................ xv
Chapter 1 ............................................................................................................................................... 1
  1 Introduction ...................................................................................................................................... 1
    1.1 An Overview .............................................................................................................................. 1
    1.2 Policy Problems and the Study Purpose .................................................................................... 4
    1.3 Research Questions ................................................................................................................... 7
    1.4 The Significance of the Study ................................................................................................ 8
    1.5 The Organization of the Paper ................................................................................................ 9
Chapter 2 ............................................................................................................................................... 12
  2. Palestine’s Socio-economic, Political, and Education Context .................................................. 12
    2.1 An Overview ........................................................................................................................... 12
    2.2 Socio-economic Context ......................................................................................................... 13
    2.3 Legal and Political System Development .............................................................................. 15
    2.4 The Palestinian Authority’s Political System ....................................................................... 17
    2.5 Quasi-Political System: Superstructure and Matrix of Control ........................................... 18
    2.6 A Political System with Contradictions ............................................................................... 20
2.7 Political and Economic Constraints ................................................................. 21
2.8 The Political Influence on Education ............................................................... 21
  2.8.1 Foreigners Control ....................................................................................... 21
  2.8.2 Threatening Policies of Occupiers ............................................................. 22
  2.8.3 Centers of the National Resistance Against Occupation ......................... 25
  2.8.4 Instability in Decision Making ................................................................. 27
2.9 Legacy of Teachers and Higher Education ..................................................... 28

Chapter 3 ................................................................................................................ 31
3. Literature Review ................................................................................................. 31
  3.1 Teachers New Identities for Professionalism ................................................. 32
    3.1.1 Teachers as evaluators .............................................................................. 34
    3.1.2 Teachers as members of a professional community that fosters
collaboration, innovation, and continuous improvement .................................. 36
    3.1.3 Teachers as problem solvers ................................................................. 37
    3.1.4 Teachers as co-learners ......................................................................... 37
    3.1.5 Teachers as professional knowledge builders ........................................ 38
  3.2 Teacher Professionalism and Reform Process ............................................... 39
  3.3 Perspectives on Teacher Professionalism and Reform Policies .................... 41
  3.4 Teacher Professionalism in the MENA Region .............................................. 44

Chapter 4 ................................................................................................................ 47
4. Teacher Education Reform in Palestine ............................................................. 47
  4.1 TES Towards Economic Development ......................................................... 47
  4.2 The Rationale of the Strategy ........................................................................ 48
  4.3 Objectives and Goals of Teacher Education Strategy ..................................... 49
  4.4 TES Four Components and Recommendations ........................................... 51
  4.5 MoEHE Interventions, Projects and Achievements ....................................... 53
6.4.2 Institutional Mission, Goals, and Strategies ................................................. 96
6.4.3 Implementers and Participants as Stakeholders ........................................... 96
6.4.4 Outcomes and Evaluations ........................................................................... 97
6.4.5 Socio-Political and Cultural Confluence ..................................................... 97
6.4.6 Confluence with Various Educational Policies ............................................. 97

6.5 Comparison to Previous Models .................................................................... 98

6.6 The Research Analytical Model and Identified Variables .............................. 98

6.6.1 The Communication and Delivery Structure ............................................. 100
6.6.1 The Policy Goals and Objectives ............................................................... 101
6.6.2 Involvement and Implementer’s Disposition .............................................. 102
6.6.3 The Characteristics of Implementing Agencies .......................................... 102
6.6.4 Outcomes and Evaluations ........................................................................ 103
6.6.5 Economic, Social, and Political Conditions .............................................. 103

6.7 Conclusion ....................................................................................................... 104

Chapter 7 .............................................................................................................. 106

7. The Communication System and Delivery Structure ........................................ 106

7.1 The MoEHE’s Administration System and Structure ........................................ 106

7.1.1 An Overview .............................................................................................. 106
7.1.2 A Vertical Structure and Transformative Style .......................................... 108
7.1.3 Collective Effort Toward the Decentralization System ................................ 110

7.2 The Communication System & Enforcement Mechanisms ........................... 112

7.2.1 A Top-Down Flow ..................................................................................... 113
7.2.2 Participatory Approach ............................................................................. 115
7.2.3 Toward a Modern System and Governance ............................................. 117

7.3 Ambiguity in the Vision of New Identity ....................................................... 120
7.3.1 An Overview ................................................................. 120
7.3.2 Teachers’ Traditional Role Versus Modern Roles ................. 122
7.3.3 Economic and Political Restrictions ..................................... 124
7.3.4 Lack of Social Justice ..................................................... 126
7.3.5 Centralization Inertia Versus Modern Decentralization .......... 126

7.4 Mal-alignment of TES Objectives and Outcomes ....................... 127

Chapter 8 ........................................................................ 134
8. The Dynamism of the TES Implementation Process ......................... 134
  8.1 An Overview ................................................................. 134
  8.2 Macro Level: The Role of Leaders ....................................... 136
  8.3 Micro level: The Role of Implementers .................................. 138
  8.4 The MoEHE’s Collective Involvement: Units & Directorates' Role .... 144
  8.5 Overlapping of Roles & Responsibilities .................................. 146
  8.6 Lack of Consensus on Preferred Reforms .................................. 149
  8.7 Official Evaluation Process .................................................. 153
  8.8 Personal Assessment ......................................................... 157

Chapter 9 ........................................................................ 163
  9.1 The Capacity Problem: Political and Resource Restrictions .......... 163
  9.2 Socio-economic Inequality: A Conflicting Situation ..................... 168
  9.3 National Aspiration Versus the Dominant International Role .......... 171
  9.4 Authoritarian System: Contradictory Directions ......................... 174
  9.5 Dispositional Conflicts: Reluctant Attitudes ............................... 177

Chapter 10 ........................................................................ 182
10. Reflection and Conclusion ...................................................... 182
List of Tables

Table 4.1 .........................................................................................................................58
Table 4.2 .........................................................................................................................59
Table 5.1 .........................................................................................................................65
Table 5.2 .........................................................................................................................77
List of Figures

Figure 6.1 .................................................................................................................. 93
Figure 6.2 .................................................................................................................. 95
Figure 6.3 .................................................................................................................. 100
Figure 7.1 .................................................................................................................. 110
List of Appendices

The Interview Guide ..............................................................................................................224
Ethics Approval Letter 1 ......................................................................................................227
Ethics Approval Letter 2 ......................................................................................................228
## List of Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ADE</td>
<td>Assessment &amp; Evaluation Department</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADMPD</td>
<td>Assistant Deputy Minister for Planning and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AMIDEAST</td>
<td>America-Mideast Educational and Training Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AQAC</td>
<td>Accreditation and Quality Assurance Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BC</td>
<td>British Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BL</td>
<td>Basic Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BODs</td>
<td>Board of Directors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BOTs</td>
<td>Board of Trustees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BWI</td>
<td>Britten Washington Inc</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CDTP</td>
<td>Commission for Development of the Teaching Profession</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEU</td>
<td>Central European University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CoHE</td>
<td>Council of Higher Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPT</td>
<td>Collaborative Projects in Teaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CTPC</td>
<td>Class Teacher Professional Certificate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DoP</td>
<td>Declaration of Principles Accord</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DSQ</td>
<td>Directorate-General for Supervision and Qualification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EFDSD</td>
<td>Education for Sustainable Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EFA</td>
<td>Education for All</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EFTs</td>
<td>Education Faculty Teams</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ELCC</td>
<td>Educational Leadership Constituent Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMIS</td>
<td>Educational Management Information System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU</td>
<td>European Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GCC</td>
<td>Gulf Cooperation Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDs</td>
<td>General Directors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GIZA</td>
<td>The Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HEC</td>
<td>Higher Education Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HEIs</td>
<td>Higher Education Institutions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILO</td>
<td>International Labour Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILOs</td>
<td>Intended Learning Outcomes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IMF</td>
<td>International Monetary Fund</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

xv
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>IMO</td>
<td>International Monetary Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JFA</td>
<td>Joint Financial Arrangement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LC</td>
<td>Legislative Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LoI&amp;C</td>
<td>Letter of Information and Consent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MAT</td>
<td>Master of Arts in Teaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDO</td>
<td>Millennium Development Objectives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MENA</td>
<td>Middle East &amp; North Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M&amp;E</td>
<td>Monitoring &amp; Evaluation Department</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOE</td>
<td>Ministry of Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOEHE</td>
<td>Ministry of Education &amp; Higher Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MSN</td>
<td>Model Schools Network</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCATE</td>
<td>National Council for Accreditation of Teacher Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGOs</td>
<td>Non-governmental Organizations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NIET</td>
<td>National Institute for Education Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OCT</td>
<td>Ontario College of Teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OECD</td>
<td>Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OPT</td>
<td>Occupied Palestinian Territories</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OSI</td>
<td>Open Society Institute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PA</td>
<td>Palestinian Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PEP</td>
<td>Paris Economic Protocol</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PFDP</td>
<td>Palestinian Faculty Development Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PLC</td>
<td>Palestinian's Legislative Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PLO</td>
<td>Palestinian Liberation Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PNC</td>
<td>Palestinian National Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>QIF</td>
<td>Quality Improvement Funds</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>QSQT</td>
<td>Quality Systems for Quality Teachers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TECG</td>
<td>Teacher Education Consultative Group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TEIP</td>
<td>Teacher Education Improvement Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TEP</td>
<td>Tertiary Education Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TERG</td>
<td>Teacher Education Reference Group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TES</td>
<td>Teacher Education Strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acronym</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TVET</td>
<td>Technical and Vocational Education and Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UAE</td>
<td>United Arab Emirates</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNESCO</td>
<td>United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNICEF</td>
<td>United Nations Children's Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNRWA</td>
<td>United Nations Relief and Works Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>US</td>
<td>United States</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USAID</td>
<td>U.S. Agency for International Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WB</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 1

1 Introduction

As an introduction to this paper, this chapter presents a brief overview of the general Palestinian context of teacher education reform, including the importance of conducting an implementation study and its contribution to the field of policy implementation, as well as a glimpse of the study’s theoretical framework and the study methodology. Then, it reviews the research’s problem and purpose with a brief justification of the duplication matter of this study, followed by the research questions and significance. Finally, it outlines the structure of this paper.

1.1 An Overview

Teacher education reform is an active movement across the world. However, the policy initiation, decision, and implementation for reforming teacher education is influenced by various factors. In Middle East and North Africa (MENA) region, including Palestine, reforming standards, such as “best practices” in teacher education and development depend on the global economics (Zajda, 2020). Similarly, regulatory mechanisms of the teaching profession, such as accreditation of teacher qualification, licensing and evaluation are influenced by controlling bodies, the majority of which are international organizations with influence over the global economics (El-Kogali & Krafft, 2019). Global and national interventions that aim to reform teacher education in Palestine have been on the ascent after the establishment of Palestinian Authority (PA), and the agreement between the Palestinian Liberation Organization (PLO) and Israel in 1993. Thus, the Palestinian Ministry of Education and Higher Education (MoEHE) (herein referred to as the Ministry sometimes) has been committed towards attaining the Education for All (EFA) movement, the Millennium Development Objectives (MDO) and the 2030 sustainability development objectives. Since the MoEHE found that approximately 80% of the Palestinian teachers do not possess a degree in education, and within the aim of qualifying those teachers (MoEHE, 2011a), tremendous national and international development projects, including donor-funded projects by the UNESCO, World Bank, and U.S. Agency for International Development (USAID), have targeted
teacher preparation, as well as holistically shaping education policies. For example, a number of substantial policies have also been launched, such as upgrading the national curriculum, reforming teacher education institutions, and, most importantly, the development of the national Teacher Education Strategy (TES) (herein referred to as the Strategy). TES is a result of the efforts of the MOEHE as well as the intellectual sector, as influenced by global players during policy formulation and implementation (Albadawi & Sabbah, 2022). The Strategy admirably outlines a view of what constitutes good pre-service and in-service professional development with a particular focus on the role of higher education institutions (HEIs), in addition to improving the management of teacher education.

As Palestine continues with its efforts in reforming teacher education, the impact of outside influences is evident. Not only have the outside forces complicated the vision and philosophy of Palestinian education (Paine & Zeichner, 2012) they have also failed to achieve large-scale development (Shinn, 2012). In general, the impact of globalization and Western education models of democracy have led to social, cultural, and political changes while the countries continue to struggle within the global economic context (Zajda, 2020). Even where minor changes have been witnessed, their pace and capacity vary everywhere. In some cases, the education systems adopted modifications successfully while others rejected them (Tatto, 2006). In this respect, the current development of teacher education in Palestine has remained unclear in the last ten years, as there is a deficiency of empirical proof that identifies the efficacy of reforms (Harzallah, 2018) on the teachers’ learning and skills. Little empirical attention has been given from scholars to the Palestinian teacher education reform and implementation process. Various reports and publications by national and international donors identified possible policy implementation problems, but few have provided empirical evidence of how national initiatives of teacher education reform have been implemented over the last decade (Qumsiyeh & Isaac, 2012).

Thus, it is important to examine the TES implementation process as the MoEHE has been reforming teacher education in Palestine since mid-2010s. Du Plessis (2019) found the policy implementation concept to involve actions by both public and private individuals
whose actions are determined by the objectives set in earlier policy decisions. The actions are two-fold; one-time efforts and continuing efforts after achieving changes envisioned in prior policy decisions. McDonnell and Weatherford (2016) argued for the importance of researchers understanding a chain of complex reciprocal actions dependent on a sequence of events. Thus, implementation research is a critical aspect in analyzing the rationality, dynamism, and complexity of the policy process.

Additionally, this study contributes to the learning and advancement of knowledge in the field of policy implementation by shedding light on the “rationality, dynamism and complexity” of the Palestinian case which has not been studied before (Li, 2016). Palestine has been under Israeli occupation for more than seven decades. The historical, economic, political, social, and global conditions play a dominant role in every aspect of Palestinian life, and particularly in their educational policy development and implementation. Because of that, the Palestinian teacher education reform process is considered a complex case and matter. It is a great necessity to comprehend the implementation process within such a complicated context. Thus, this is the first study with this purpose, and which offers pioneering research findings for others to follow. It contributes to the larger scale of the reform process in Palestine and is pivotal to intellectuals and policymakers as it provides a better understanding on how TES has been implemented. Exploring the surrounding issues will inform policymakers in drafting influential policies which contribute towards the resolution of teacher education reform matters in Palestine and around the world. More importantly, I believe being able to offer this pioneering study will empower researchers for more necessary empirical studies in developing countries, particularly in the MENA region.

Mainly drawing on the work of Li (2016), this research utilized a multi-perspective framework and an analytical model through which the researcher developed to gather and comprehend the data. In this perspective, the policy analysis approach of this study considers both the traditional and the critical framework as an ideal direction to investigate in-depth the rationality, dynamism, and complexity of the TES implementation process in Palestine. Employing a case study method within an inductive perspective allowed a significant and deep understanding of the case (Yin, 2017). Zoom
and semi-structured interviews, and document analysis methods were employed in the data collection process. Ultimately, the data was gathered, and then emerging themes were organized, analyzed, coded, and interpreted to reflect both the stated goals and theories of the study.

1.2 Policy Problems and the Study Purpose

The role of teachers in reforming education cannot be undermined. According to Belsito (2016), teachers have an important role in facilitating the quality of education and student achievement. On the one hand, Darling-Hammond and Lieberman (2012) indicated that teacher education reform was considered a “training problem” and a “learning problem” in Westernized countries. In this respect, it is quite devastating that teachers in Palestine did not possess international standards of modern educational trends (UNICEF, 2011). Additionally, the MoEHE found that approximately 80% of Palestinian teachers are unqualified (do not hold an educational degree based on the TES new definition) and tend to utilize traditional tests, rote learning and ignore the incorporation of differentiated practices of learning (MoEHE, 2005; MoEHE, 2011b). Furthermore, Akesson (2015) indicates that teaching methods that utilize old-model pedagogy identified in teacher-centered styles that simultaneously underestimate learner-centered approaches. A study by the Ministry of Palestinian Education in 2011 found that “active student involvement” only presents 12 percent of the whole learning process in classrooms (Hashwah, 2011b). Additionally, these old teaching methodologies have restricted opportunities for critical thinking, creativity, innovation, and independent learning (MoEHE, 2018). It is very unfortunate that Palestinian students' performance in various subjects is below the rate of both regional and international levels (MoEHE, 2014b, 2017b, 2018). As a result, the MoEHE found that Palestinian teachers' education is tenuous and needs development.

On the other hand, Datnow and Hubbard (2016) found that policymakers target educators as the main problem as they can be responsible for poor or strong student performance. Thus, by observing reforming teacher education in various Western countries, Darling-Hammond and Lieberman (2012) theorized that the problem is in fact a “policy problem” (p.168). In this respect, Palestinians are not an exception; the policy problems are not unusual considering their efforts to implement TES. A number of consecutive policies
have been launched since 2010, and TES (including subsequent amendments) have been involved in remodeling the national curriculum, reforming teacher education providers, and qualifying in-service and pre-service teachers. However, in spite of all these efforts, the implementation of teacher education policies has remained critical. Policy making and policy implementation, according to Pülzl and Treib (2017), are two processes that require each other to be complete, with the implementation process putting reform proposals in a policy into practice. In this respect, both policy and its implementation are inextricably intertwined as policy goals are linked to policy consequences (Li, 2016). Therefore, implementation research is critical aspect in analyzing the rationality, dynamism, and complexity of policies processes. However, empirical research on how different institutions and agencies have been implementing the policies of teacher education reform is scarce in Palestine. Various reports and documentary publication by national and international donors identified possible implementation problems, but few have provided empirical evidence of how national and international initiatives of teacher education reform had actually been implemented or highlighted their effectiveness over the last decade. According to the National Study of Undergraduate Teaching Practices in Palestine, there is limited research which contributes to the academic growth, particularly in the social sciences (Cristillo, 2009). Thus, the development of teacher education in Palestine has remained uncovered as national and international implementers have failed to widen the improvement to a large-scale production (Shinn, 2012). Shinn noticed that the international scene and low-capacity building have limited the development of teachers in Palestine. In summary, the study's purpose is to examine the implementation process of TES and related interventions for teacher education reform in Palestine since mid-2010. The main research question being addressed for this study is: How has the MoEHE implemented and responded to the national Teacher Education Strategy (TES) and its recommendations to reform teacher education in Palestine since mid-2010?

The research was inspired by Li's (2016) study, which examined the implementation process of education reforms in China. Li (2016) examined three key dimensions, i.e., “rationality, dynamism, and complexity” of teacher education policies using a multiperspective framework before developing an analytical model for analyzing data and findings, while analyzing the implementation process of education reforms in China. The
study employs a similar structure, beginning with a multi-perspective approach to data collection and comprehension, followed by the development of an analytical model to examine the TES implementation process in Palestine. However, as with Li (2016), the current study has adopted from Li’s (2016) model to ensure it fits the context of Palestine, whereas Li's model was tailored specifically to China's context.

For several reasons, the duplication of Li’s (2016) study is justified by this study. First, the current study has similar goals to Li’s study of examining the implementation process of teacher education reforms. Furthermore, both Li’s study and the current study employ a multi-perspective approach that provides the necessary data and comprehension to create the necessary analytical framework. Second, in both studies, the goal is to create an analytical framework that is appropriate for the context. This influences the decision to make changes to the model variables. For Li’s (2016) model, different models, such as Van Meter and Van Horn (1975) and Sabatier and Mazmanian (1980), among others, had to be considered in designing a more comprehensive model for the context of China, making it easier for the current study, which takes into consideration Li's (2016) model as discussed in Chapter 6. As a result of the similarities in purposes and the use of a multi-perspective approach, it was only fair to base the current study on Li’s (2016) study.

Other than the similarities in purposes and approaches, other factors influenced the need for duplication. Duplicating a study in research refers to repeating procedures from a previous study if the conditions that informed the previous study are similar to the current study (Perry et al., 2022). As was the case in China, understanding the factors influencing the implementation process of TES teacher education reforms is critical because it will serve as the foundation for future improvements. Moreover, the credibility of a study is established when it can be duplicated under similar or closely related conditions (Nosek & Lakens, 2014). The conditions in China and Palestine were not fully similar but closely related, which informed the need to adjust some variables as will be discussed in Chapter 6.

Study duplication can take the form of either direct or conceptual duplication. A direct duplication, also known as an exact duplication, entails repeating a procedure to the
greatest extent possible due to the similar or close similar condition of studies (Machery, 2020). This necessitates the use of similar procedures, data collection methods, and data analysis techniques. A conceptual duplication, on the other hand, necessitates using different methods to repeat the same study. The current study is more of a direct duplication of Li's study. As a result, the current study applied Li's (2016) research, albeit in a different context with some equivalent circumstances. Employing Li's (2016) study in the current research was beneficial for a number of reasons. First, it enabled the identification of parameters for both the implementation context of TES and the Palestinian context in general. This proved useful in analyzing the rationality, dynamism, and complexity of the interdependence of the teacher education reform process and the Palestinian environment. Second, just as Li's (2016) model aided in understanding China's teacher education reforms towards a modern era and within the international context, the current study proved useful in understanding the implementation process as a push towards the international trends for reforming teacher education. As a result, the current study was not aimed at confirming or expanding on Li's claims (2016). Instead, it was drawing on Li's (2016) research to create an analytical model that was appropriate for the context of Palestine.

In conclusion, the purpose of this research is to critically analyze the implementation process that includes the rationality, dynamism, and the complexity of the policy implementation. In other words, it sheds light on the MoEHE’s communication and delivery structure, the dynamic process aimed at grasping the personal and collective roles of leaders, administrative and teacher educators, as well as review the TES interventions and achievements implemented at the MoEHE’s micro levels. Furthermore, taking into consideration the complexity of the implementation process, the study examines the impact of key environmental factors, such as the economic, social, and political conditions, among others.

1.3 Research Questions

The research question is about how the MoEHE has implemented and responded to Palestine's national Teacher Education Strategy (TES) to reform teacher education in Palestine since the mid-2010s. To answer this central question, I fractured it into a
number of subordinate questions based on different theories and purposes. These sub-
questions include:

1) How has the MoEHE implemented TES recommendations with responses
   (programs and projects) in order to achieve the TES objectives?

2) How have TES and its recommendations been delivered to implementers, and
   how have they interacted with each other and how were the implementers kept
   informed?

3) How have the key implementers (leaders, administrators and educators) been
   involved individually and collectively in the implementation process of the TES
   and its related interventions?

4) What implications and recommendations may be drawn from the Palestinian case
   of teacher education policy implementation?

1.4 The Significance of the Study

The Palestinian teacher education reform process presents itself as a complicated and
unrevealing matter. Global, socio-economic, and political contexts play a largely
determined role in every aspect of Palestinian life particularly on education. First, as
stated, the main goal of this research is to reveal how the MoEHE has responded to
implement TES and how global, social, political, and economic contexts have impacted
the implementation process. Pülzl and Treib (2017) indicate that studying the
implementation process allowed for the revelation of policy problems that researchers
neglected during planning stages. Since implementation studies are scarce in Palestine,
this study investigated the environmental factors that deeply impacted the implementation
process. This study is essential to understanding the rationality, dynamism, and
complexity of such a process. Thus, I believe the study contributes to the larger scale of
the reform process. Second, despite the fact that the paucity of empirical studies on the
topic is a challenge, it presents a great necessity to explore the rationality, dynamism, and
complexity within which the policy has been implemented. Hence, this dissertation is the
first attempt with this purpose and the first to offer pioneering research findings for others
to consider. It will also be pivotal to intellectuals and policymakers as it will provide a comprehensive view on how TES has been implemented. Exploring such a matter will inform them in drafting influential policies that can resolve the teachers’ education issues in Palestine. According to Lunn et al. (2017), changing epistemic cognition forms the basic foundation of developing new experiences in implementing teacher reforms. The finding drawn from this study can contribute to breaking the domination of Western models (Kincheloe, McLaren, & Steinberg, 2011) of teacher preparation and sheds light on the marginalized experience of the MENA region, particularly Palestine’s implementation process. I believe this research presents a distinct perspective and brings a marginalized viewpoint into the policy field. As a Canadian Palestinian novice researcher who has been studying and living in Canada, this pioneering research offers a Middle Eastern lens rooted deeply in a marginalized case and examines the socio-economic and political factors that need to be dismantled for the Western universal arena. Palestinians have lived under colonial powers for centuries and currently live under the longest apartheid regime, spanning more than seven decades. This struggle has affected life in many aspects, particularly education and any future of development.

1.5 The Organization of the Paper

This dissertation is organized into ten chapters. Chapter 1 presents the study introduction which includes a brief overview, the policy problems, and the purpose, significance, and research questions of the study. Chapter 2 provides a detailed review of the Palestinian context that outlines the socio-economic and political background of Palestine, including a comprehensive elaboration of the development of the PA’s legal and semi-political system, which is characterized by a number of contradictions and constraints, namely the limitations imposed on its economic and political capacity (power and resources) and the lack of geopolitical power and control due to the Israeli occupation. Subsequently, the chapter delves into the impact of the political situation on education, followed by a detail of the legacy of teachers and higher education and the current data on higher education institutions and teacher qualification development. Chapter 3 sheds light on relevant literature from the international perspective with regard to the contemporary teacher professional roles and professionalization direction, then it reviews relevant research on
teacher education reform in the MENA region through an elaboration of how regional policymakers and implementers have responded to international calls and policies for teacher education reform in their respective contexts. Chapter 4 presents a comprehensive review of the rationale behind the Palestinian national teacher education reform movement and the Teacher Education Strategy's (TES) objectives, its four components, and the MoEHE’s interventions and programs, followed by a presentation of an initial results brought by the implementation of TES. Chapter 5 addresses the MoEHE as the case study of this research, the study’s methodology and elaborates on the data collection procedures, such as the methods used, accessibility, and selection of the case study and participants. Furthermore, it addresses the researcher identity and positionality and the study's ethical matters and limitations, while the data analysis section details the coding procedures, triangularity and reliability. At the end, there is an informative section on the MoEHE which includes a review of its historical background and development, administrative, legislative and governance details, a brief of its five units and its strategic goals toward TES implementation. Chapter 6 presents distinct theoretical perspectives for policy studies, including the rational and critical assumptions for this research. It also presents the study analytical model with six variables of data collection, analysis and the presentation of findings. The chapter elaborates on how the analytical model was selected and how it guides this research to pinpoint the key units of data collection and analysis for the practical function of the study. Chapter 7 examines how the TES was delivered from the top level to the MoEHE’s micro level, how the key implementers were informed about TES components and how they were communicated with each other to implement TES objectives. It starts with an introduction to the MoEHE’s administrative system, including how the vertical and authoritarian style of communication as well as the collective effort towards decentralization were employed. Then, it describes how the MoEHE’s objectives and outcomes deviated from the intended goals of transforming teacher role and modernizing the teaching profession due to various factors. Chapter 8 investigates the dynamic lobe of the TES implementation process conducted by the MoEHE’s units and directorates, starting with the involvement of the MoEHE’s various implementers individually and then collectively by summarizing their roles and interventions in several programs and projects, as well as their achievements in these
endeavors. It further elaborates on how the implementers could not reach a consensus on a preferred reform approach, as well as how their roles and responsibilities overlapped due to a number of different factors. Chapter 9 examines the unfavorable environmental barriers that affected TES implementation outcomes, which include the MoEHE’s capacity problem caused by the political and economic restrictions, the persistence of the authoritarian system, the dominant role of the international community and its imposed agendas, and the dispositional conflicts encapsulated in the traditional teacher role.

Chapter 10 critically reviews and reflects upon the study findings. Thus, both the rational and critical perspectives summarize the rationality, dynamism and complexity of the TES implementation process. The contrasting power and limitations of the two frameworks and the functioning analytical model are presented as well. Finally, a number of implications and recommendations for policymakers and researchers are proposed leading up to the paper’s conclusion.

Up to this point, this chapter provides a review that includes the general context of Palestine, the policy problems, the study purpose and significance, the research questions, and the paper structure.
Chapter 2

2. Palestine’s Socio-economic, Political, and Education Context

2.1 An Overview

Palestine is considered a state under occupation according to the United Nations General Assembly No 19/67 in 2012 (Isaac et al., 2019). One of the challenges in the country is compromised security due to the Israeli occupation, which has led to the constant violation of the Palestinians’ rights. The atrocities attributed to the colonial settlements have seen the country experience a breach of international laws and conventions, apartheid laws, and human rights violations (Amnesty International, 2022). The apartheid wall has been built within the country’s land forcefully. There are constant attacks and sieges in the Palestinian Gaza strip (MoEHE, 2018). Since the inception of the Palestinian National Authority in 1993, there have been heightened security issues within the country (PCBS, 2020a). The Israeli control of the external borders has worsened the situation. The occupation has affected the custom duty collection as well as the movement of goods and people (Rigby, 1994). The separation wall and more checkpoints have raised tension and affected the economy of the country. In 1995, the signing of the Oslo II Accord divided the West Bank into areas A, B and C, to be administered and controlled by the Palestinian Authority, the Palestinian Authority and Israel, and Israel, respectively. As it stands, the Israeli-controlled Area C includes nearly two-thirds of the West Bank and is rife with humanitarian challenges. For instance, over one-third of Palestinians residing in these territories lack access to primary schools and over half the population lacks access to water sources and basic healthcare services. Most pressingly, children must travel long distances or cross checkpoints to receive school education, posing a risk to their safety as well as their personal development and future prospects (Anera, n.d.). Additionally, Jerusalem does not have Palestinian autonomy or representation (MoEHE, 2018). The region’s overall assessment is that the country has an unstable political and economic system due to the Israeli occupation and colonial settlers (MoEHE, 2015).
2.2 Socio-economic Context

Palestine is located in Western Asia on the Eastern Coast of the Mediterranean Sea all through to River Jordan. The geographical location of Palestine is at the center of Asia and Africa, which makes it a significant link between the two continents. In addition to geographical proximity, Palestine has religiously and historically significant cities; Jerusalem is the most important city of the three monotheistic religions. PCBS (2019) estimated the Palestinian population in the world to be 13.7 million as of the end of 2020. The occupied Palestinian Territories (OPT) alone have about 5.1 million people, split between the Gaza Strip with an estimated 2.05 million and the West Bank with an estimated 3.05 million people. The same report indicates that the majority of the Palestinian population are young people. In 2020, the age group of (0-14 years) was estimated at (38.0%) of the population, with 41.3% in the Gaza Strip and 36.1% in the West Bank. Only 3.3% of the population was older than 65 years of age. The annual growth rate of the population in Palestine is 2.5%.

The nature of the data means that there is a need to consider the rise in the young population. The young population is projected to be 6.9 million by 2030 and a further 9.5 million by 2050. However, researchers project that the fertility rate in the country is likely to decline, which is expected to change the demographic structure and dynamics. Such changes would increase the number of older adults and decrease the number of young people. PBCS reports estimated that there will be a decline of the people below 15 years to 35% by 2030, and a further decrease to 25% by 2050. On the contrary, there will be a significant increase in the working population (15 to 64), likely to increase from the current 57.8% to 61% by 2030, and a further increase of 67% by 2050.

These demographic changes have significant implications on different aspects of the economy. When there is an increase in the working people, it means that there is a likelihood that the dependency ratio is likely to decrease. Another important effect can be seen in the education sector; there is an estimated increase of the pre-schoolers to higher education students from the previous 2.1 million in 2015 to a projected 2.8 million in 2030, representing a 33% increase. The number of school-going students is likely to increase by 54% to 2 million in 2030. The government, therefore, would need to work
closely to change the school structures and infrastructure, as well as build new schools that could accommodate the new group of students. The PCBS (2020) statistical information shows that there would need to be more than 100 new schools annually between 2015 and 2030 to meet the upcoming demand. Similarly, there will be a need to have a new level of economic development to meet the social and economic demands of the new population structure. The fast population growth and change in the composition of the population demand proper strategies in healthcare, education, food, energy, and all sectors that would offer economic growth and meet the population’s needs.

According to the MoEHE (2018), the economic growth in Palestine is mainly dependent on Israeli occupation control and domination. Israeli control of the Gaza Strip and Area C of the West Bank has been a critical problem for the Palestinians. More specifically, land confiscation, economic restrictions, and controlling of natural resources and water have limited the economic growth of Palestine for years (PCBS, 2019). Despite the long-standing conflict, there have been signs of positive growth in the Palestinian economy. In 2019, the GDP of Palestine was at $15,829 million, which was a higher value compared to the GDP value in 2018. However, the per capita in 2019 was at $3,378.3, which was a lower value than the per capita in 2018. However, the Grand National Income had a GDP of $18,415.6 million in 2019 with a 3,930 per capita. The Gross disposable income in 2019 was also recorded at $19,960.7 million in 2019, but a higher GNDI per capita was recorded at 4,260.1 in 2019. These are significant economic indicators that are affected by the population changes in Palestine (PCBS, 2019).

The participation rate in the economy of the country is also different from the changes in the population. As of 2019, the labor force participation rate for people above 15 years was 44.3%. However, the female gender represented a relatively low rate (18.1%) compared to their male counterparts (69.9%). The unemployment rates have also been going down in recent years, not to mention that the employed population is mainly waged. 71.4% of the employees in the country are waged employees. The Palestinians working in Israel or are in regions considered as Israeli settlements are waged employees. On the other hand, employment opportunities among the youth are relatively low. In
2019, the youth between 15 and 24 years averaged an unemployment rate of 40.1% (PCBS, 2018).

According to PCBC (2019), the government needs to work on how to change the situation in a bid to improve revenue collection. For instance, there are strategies to expand the tax base, improve commercial and financial relations with Israel through specialized negotiation committees to solve pending problems and improve transfer of clearance taxes, and improve tax clearance. Additionally, some policies seek to control the expenditure. The austerity policies reduce unnecessary expenditure, keep the public expenditure under check, and ensure stable employment for the citizens. The country also seeks to relieve debts and create a good margin for borrowing (PCBS, 2020a). These actions are likely to help promote the country’s economy and improve the overall employment rate (PCBC, 2019).

2.3 Legal and Political System Development

There is a heavy history of politics and legal structure contradiction in Palestine. During the last century, a collection of emerging military laws replaced the Ottoman laws, starting in 1922 with the British. Through the British Mandate, Israel was brought into existence on the majority of land of historical Palestine in 1948 (Robinson, 1997). Consequently, what was left of historical Palestine, such as Gaza Strip, was ruled by Egyptians who restored legislations that went into effect alongside existing laws and legislations of that particular time. Similarly, West Bank, which was annexed to Jordan, became subject the laws of Jordan. After the occurrence of war in 1967, West Bank and Gaza Strip were occupied by Israel and became subject to military laws. For more than a century, the people of Palestine had failed to attain statehood (Robinson, 1997).

In 1988, the Palestinian Liberation Organization (PLO) convened in Algiers and delivered a declaratory notice of independence. The notice demanded an independent judiciary, a constitution, the right to equality, and freedom of expression. It also deemed the state of Palestine as a reference to all Palestinians (including refugees) throughout the world. Since the PLO controlled neither territory nor population, this declaration seemed premature (Robinson, 1997). In September 1993, and after the Palestinian first Intifada
(uprising), Israel and the PLO signed the initial Oslo Agreements, which later created the Palestinian Authority (PA), a political body concerned with the civil law and politics of Palestine. A supportive body to the leadership of Palestine present at that time was formed through the election conducted for the Palestinian Legislative Council (PLC) in early 1996. The Legislative Council for Palestine was formed through the Interim Agreement on the West Bank and Gaza Strip with the mandate of adopting the rights and the duties of the Authority of Palestine. By 1997, a full version of the Basic Law (BL) was passed by the democratically-elected Legislative Council, and was later adopted and approved by the then President Arafat in 2002. The constitution underwent several amendments in the years 2003, 2004, and 2005. After the 2006 election was held in Palestine, the Islamic Political Movement (Hamas) won the election and took over the political power, resulting in the withdrawal of the donors and imprisonment of elected deputies of Hamas by the state of Israel. Hamas managed to take control of Gaza Strip, which has remained the case until present time, while the West Bank remained under the Palestinian Authority’s rule, represented by President Mahmoud Abbas’s government (Khalil, 2013). As a result, he issued decree-laws, established an emergency government, and nominated a new judicial council, new judges and police officers, etc. However, both regions are still considered the “Occupied Palestinian Territories,” while Gaza Strip is under full siege by the state of Israel. In any case, Hamas leader Haneyyeh rejected the new decrees, considered them illegal, and claimed his government to be legitimate. Despite many attempts between Hamas and Fateh (the president’s party) to reach an agreement, both governments insist on their point of view. Since then, the international actors returned to provide aid to the Palestinian Authority (led by Fateh party) in the West Bank. On the other hand, Gaza remained under Israeli siege and most of Hamas’ Legislative Council members have been detained in Israeli prisons. As a result, the Palestinian Legislative Council has not convened since then, while President Abbas could not call for a new election. In summary, the Palestinian Authority existed as a temporary political body which lasted for extended intervals of time. Thus, the Palestinian Basic Law, including the creation of the legal and political bodies, has been in place indefinitely (Khalil, 2013, p.13).
2.4 The Palestinian Authority’s Political System

According to Khalil (2013), even though it is only the sovereign state that is supposed to have constitutional powers to conclude how a government should exercise it, the Palestinian Authority is regarded not to possess such powers because it has yet to attain statehood. In 1993 after the Oslo agreement, the Palestinian Liberation Organization (PLO) authorized the Palestinian Authority to govern the occupied Palestinian Territories after Israel partially withdrew from the West Bank and Gaza Strip. The PA governs the OPT through the legislature, judiciary, and executive branches, just like any other state to fulfill its obligations. For example, the legislative body of Palestine is called the Palestinian National Council (PNC); it comprises of the parliament (PLC) and executive committee presided over by the chairman (the executive authority). Additionally, there are military courts regulated by the PLO penal and procedural codes of 1979 (Khalil, 2013).

Basically, the Basic Law addresses the legitimacy of the Palestinian Authority in playing its role of exercising its authority over a small part of land and its subjects. It defines the form of government and its political system which was endorsed by the PLC. It also establishes the major structural principles that rule the relationship between the three branches of powers: executive, legislative and the judiciary. Under this law, the Cabinet (council of ministers) is given the role of executive and administrative power. It allows the Prime Minister to exercise authority over the council of ministers. On the other hand, the powers of the President under the Basic Law include the power to issue decrees without approval by the Prime Minister or any other ministers in the Cabinet. The President also has the power to declare a state of emergency, meaning he has the authority to exercise executive power solely. Additionally, the president of the Palestinian Authority is elected by Palestinian citizens without the confidence of the Palestinian Legislative Council.

In other words, the BL defines the Palestinian Authority political system, but it allows for two distinct interpretations of the constitution (Khalil, 2013). On the one hand, the 2003 Basic Law amendment provided the Prime Minister, who is the head of the Cabinet of the Palestinian Authority, to perform a collegial duty. This means that the PLC is not the
only entity with the power to appoint ministers. The Cabinet stands at the top of the executive committee and is responsible for the functions that have delegated by the PLC, which is constituted just like a parliament. On the other hand, the presidential system does not allow the combination of the different interpretations of the constitution as per the requirements of the parliamentary system and the fact that the legislature and the executive bodies are separate and must therefore have separate functions. Thus, the members of Parliament cannot serve in the cabinet.

This indicates that the system of Palestine is made in such a way that it does not purely constitute what a parliamentary system should have because it is comprised of the head of the state who obstructs legislation, issues decrees without any rules, declares state of emergency, and appoints judges and other officials without approval of other bodies.

Lastly, the election of the president of Palestine is done in a direct manner and allowed to have powers in both the executive committee and the cabinet. This can be said to be similar to the French semi-presidenti al structure, where the president has the authority to perform his executive powers without involving the cabinets and can only get assistance from the council of ministers who have no say whatsoever on what the president does (Khalil, 2013).

2.5 Quasi-Political System: Superstructure and Matrix of Control

 Politically, Palestine is a quasi-state, also called a state-like entity. It lacks the autonomous sovereign powers that full republics enjoy across the world. The “quasi-political system” (Khalidi, 2017) was an outcome of the Declaration of Principles Accord (DoP), was politically recognized as the Oslo Accord (I and II), between the PLO and Israel that was signed in 1993. The accord led to the acknowledgment of PLO as the negotiating partner for Palestine but did not give Palestine the full status of a state (Klein, 1997). Following the accord, the PA was formed in 1994 and tasked with the responsibility of limited self-governance (Robinson, 1997). Although yet to realize its freedom as a state with the authority to make independent decisions, it was the first time in the history of Palestinians to have some control over its constituents and land. The signing of the Oslo Accord was politically significant as it led to two major political
developments in the history of Palestine. First, the accord created a way for the return of the external Palestinian leadership (Parsons, 2005). With the accord in place, PLO leadership that was residing as refugees and expatriates in Tunisia moved back to the occupied Palestinian Territories. Secondly, the return of the PLO leadership from diaspora marked as the first time that the PLO leadership was functioning on Palestinian soil (Parsons, 2005). These factors played significantly in giving the PA a partial role of governance that was granted under the Oslo Accord. Forming PA was a new dawn in Palestine as it marked the beginning of what resembled a formal government. With the PA in place, Palestine’s government with partial authority was put in place and had all the three branches of the executive, the legislature, and judiciary (Frisch & Hofnung, 1997). Further, the newly-formed government also for the first time formed a “legitimate” security force that was functional in the West Bank and the Gaza Strip. To demonstrate recognition of the PA, Israel surrendered civil power and redeployed its troops from Areas A and B and kept them in Area C of OPT (Frisch & Hofnung, 1997). The new responsibilities were critical as they gave the government “legitimacy” to effectively function. The newly-formed government had 13 security forces while the executive was made of 21 ministries (Parsons, 2005, p. 141–155). Despite the progress, the quasi-nature of political system of the PA still limited its powers which to an extent limited Palestine’s ability to make independent decisions for its prosperity.

Due to the PA’s limited governance Palestine affairs, the country’s political system was compromised as it was held captive by Israel. Different authors used different terms to describe the situations based on different perspectives. Khan et al. (2004) connotated the term “superstructure” to describe Israel’s control over Palestine while Halper (2006, p. 62–74) used the term “matrix of control”. Though different terms, both illustrated the undermining of Palestine’s sovereignty in the hands of Israel. It not only cripples the power of the PA but any future possibility of its control. Halper indicated that Israel applies the “matrix of control” on Palestinians to penalize them “if they do not comply by using different mechanisms, such as torture, administrative detention, land expropriation, building settlements and closures” (Halper 2006, pp. 63–65). Consequently, the PA found it challenging to govern not just local affairs, such as security and the economy, but also meaningful foreign relations that served Palestine’s interest (Roy, 2007). The only areas
the PA has partial impact on were education and health, but it has no control over its population, resources, and land. The governance structure denied PA getting domestic sovereignty in order to determine the direction of local political affairs (Telhami, 2001). Consequently, the wall and hundreds of checkpoints greatly weaken geographical unity as the government does not have a connection between Gaza Strip and the West Bank, and between West Bank cities, including Jerusalem (Halper, 2006).

2.6 A Political System with Contradictions

The contradiction that is surrounding Palestine's political system has made governance of the country as one of the most complex in the world. It is both complex and confusing. Viewed from a confusing perspective, the Palestinian semi-political system is a mixed system as it is primarily a presidential system but with a strong parliament. On the other hand, the world is in a post colonialism era, but for Palestine, the country is still under the control of Israel, and therefore, in the colonial era. Although a state, the country is technically a colony of Israel denying PA the ability to exert its powers on important issues, such as human rights, resources, and borders (Robinson, 1997; Halper, 2006). Palestine political system is complex in the sense that it establishes the PA government, including its ministries and appointed ministers, but they must seek permission from the occupier before making any foreign moves. Second, although the PA has its forces, the priority of the security is not in the interest of Palestinian citizens, but Israeli settlements (Halper, 2006). Additionally, the political system of Palestine is divided politically and geographically into two entities of Gaza Strip and West Bank (Jerusalem is not included) with two governments that claim to pursue Palestinian cause (Frisch & Hofnung, 1997). Hence, although with the functions of managing key institutions, such as the Statistical Bureau Center, PA has no control over its population, natural resources, and borders. It is a government with no authority of its own as all authority lies with Israel, creating a modern colony and colonialist dynamic. It makes it worse that the international community led by the US continues to ignore the situation as they are doing little with their vast powers to ensure the sovereignty of Palestine is respected (Khalidi, 2017). Hence, politically, Palestine’s quasi-political system where the local government is controlled by Israel makes it unique in the whole world.
### 2.7 Political and Economic Constraints

The external control of Palestine has limited the country, both politically and economically. As a result of Israel’s influence over Palestine’s local affairs, Palestine has become both economically and politically dependent (Halper, 2006). The Oslo Accord might have led to the formation of an internal government, but the real political power remains with Israel. Similarly, the 1994 Paris Economic Protocol (PEP) that was created to ensure PA has economic control has not lived to its expectations. Instead of Israel allowing PA to control its affairs, it has created a powerless political system that governing the OPT on its behalf. Contrary to what PEP was expected to achieve in terms of ensuring PA has powers over monetary and fiscal policies, industrialization policies, and labor issues, it has become a channel through which Israel controls the economics of Palestine (Dana, 2020). In other words, PEP has institutionalized the Palestinian economic dependency on Israel thus effectively restricting the PA’s capacity to pursue independent macroeconomic policy (Dana, 2020, pp. 251-252). Hence, PA has become an entity under the Israeli control promoting colonist’s agenda in Palestine. Thus, the Palestinian Authority (PA) is initially limited in its authorities to spheres, such as education and culture, health, social welfare, direct taxation, tourism and the public order, including the ability to establish a strong police force (Klein, 1997).

### 2.8 The Political Influence on Education

#### 2.8.1 Foreigners Control

There is a significant relationship between the politics of Palestine and education. According to Shore (1996), “Politics and education are inseparable. Education is, in its essence, political because the education process is a meeting place between man and society. Education is a joint development for society and the individuals in it, and the future of both is shaped in an educational process.” The relationship between politics and education helps explain the role of the institutions in shaping the country’s political system. The foreigners mainly administered the education system in Palestine since a century. The modern and formal education in the country developed as a reaction to the Ottoman Empire control and later during the British mandate.
During the British control, there was a deliberate expansion of education because of the civilian demands. According to Mahshi and Bush (1989), despite the inadequacies of government education by the British, the traditional value of education, especially formal schooling, was strengthened over time. Formal education was perceived as a means for securing white-collar jobs with a steady income, and to enhance their social status, in a predominantly peasant society. Formal education, therefore, becomes a consequence of the British efforts. In 1948, after the establishment of state of Israel and its control on the largest part of historical Palestine’s land, West Bank region governed by Jordan, and Gaza Strip governed by Egypt. Both parts had schizophrenic education systems. Thus, both the Jordanians and Egyptians administered a different type of education system. In 1967, after the Israeli side won the war and occupied the two areas, the administrative terms of reference remained those of the Jordanian and Egyptian systems till 1994 when the MoEHE was established and took control of the management and curriculum development. In addition, United Nations Relief and Works Agency (UNRWA) established schools and administration for Refugees Camps in the new occupied areas of Gaza and West Bank as well as Jordan, Syria, and Lebanon.

2.8.2 Threatening Policies of Occupiers

According to the MoEHE (2018), the Israeli life-threatening policies have impacted the Palestinians' aspects of life, particularly education. They have been under strict rules, with the military waging violence against many generations (Klein, 1997). The military orders of occupier affected the education system significantly. The Palestinian education process has mainly been affected by education center demolition, closure, and siege policies (Halper, 2006). The affect of such policies can be seen in a massive disruption of learning activities. On the one hand, the pre-existing structure and the administrative system of occupiers were imposed on Palestinians. With that structure, there was a centralized system of management of education. The centralized system meant that the decisions like hiring and firing of teachers were under the military order. According to Mahshi (2009), in most cases, it was pointed to the “security reason” as the reason for dismissal. There was difficulty in hiring teachers from different districts. The teachers were nominated by the Palestinian district directors of education but would only work
after approval by the Israeli authorities. There were common cases of mistreatment of teachers, like placing them on probation. Under probation, the teachers had to be given additional training and undergo an assessment before getting appointed. Even after passing the tests, there was a need to pass through military intelligence that had the right to appoint or refuse. The teachers employed did not have proper working conditions, no employment rights or regulations, and the mandate and responsibilities were not well-defined practicing (MoEHE, 2010a). Consequently, the teachers were de-motivated, frustrated, and had no satisfaction. In addition to the teachers, the Israeli administration also decided the decisions like building or expanding schools.

On the other hand, the political and military influence on education had a significant impact on the physical and financial components of the schools. The teachers, staff, and students in schools were vulnerable. the MoEHE did not have much influence over these issues even though they were clear. Additionally, the salaries and remuneration strategies of occupier for the teachers had affected the learning process (MoEHE, 2010a). The teaching profession was challenging and poorly paid. UNRWA and government teachers receive relatively lower pay compared to private schools. Most teachers could not sustain the cost of living owing to the high economic costs. Many of the degree holders opted to leave the country to neighboring countries where they can get paid much better than Palestine. The poor economic status of education made it difficult for people to own the education status in Palestine. Most teachers quit teaching and took alternative or part-time jobs in a bid to earn better. According to the UNESCO report 25/August/1989: 132 Ex/12), most teachers opted for menial jobs in construction sites, making it very difficult to perform to their level best in classes.

Additionally, between 1948 and 1994, Palestinians were taught the Egyptian curriculum in Gaza and the Jordanian curriculum in West Bank territories. Both curricula were taught on the need to remain culturally relevant but had little to do with nationalism. The Israeli did constant censorship and ensured what was taught did not contribute to nationalist efforts. The military orders ensured no materials to teach on Palestinian culture, and roots. For instance, they required all reading materials, including books and periodicals, to pass through the military for approval. Any work that pointed to Palestine
history or culture was systematically removed and denied entry that made Palestine reference. Teachers were also restricted from short or long professional training.

Through years of controlling the Palestinian education sector, the Israeli occupation’s administration largely restricted professional development for teachers and did not encourage any forms of training and professional development. Similarly, the participation of Palestinian educators in the development of the education system and curriculum was also restricted by the Israeli administration. While some school supervisors tried to change the circumstances, the efforts were significantly limited by inadequate resources, skills and support. Only in some cases, the teachers chased opportunities to get training abroad. However, these changes were not easy to make, teachers had to forgo appointments and salaries to help joining the in-service training programs. The frustrations and challenges to hearing and advancing the in-service training for the Palestinian teachers have led to poor teaching methods and poor classroom management techniques. The Educational Network Report (1992, p.5) observed that classes in Palestine were handled “in an authoritarian manner with the teacher as an expert who lectures to students and gives them traditional worksheets to complete.” There is no creativity in the teaching and learning process in the Palestinian educational system.

In the present day, the most affected areas from the Israeli occupation are Area C and East Jerusalem, where the Israeli exercised full control. The soldiers and the military force violated residents’ fundamental rights and, by extension, affected learning in these areas. Thus, there are no construction schools in areas Area C and Jerusalem, making the region has low accessibility to education. Many Palestinian teachers and students have been denied access to teaching and learning facilities. The school administrators in these areas have been prohibited from the equal budgets and supplements as Israeli citizens. For example, Israeli control of East Jerusalem has affected the Palestinian education curriculum implementation. Most Palestinians' schools have been under pressure to implement the Israeli curriculum. The Israeli control has been a challenge because it makes them responsible for resources like printing textbooks and publications. The result is a curriculum that is skewed towards teaching the views of the Israeli administration.
Part of what has been perpetrated in these regions includes the need to delete Palestine’s identity and justification of the failure to the owner of the citizen’s rights. Imposing siege in areas C and Gaza strip and banning the entry of structure materials necessary for building and rehabilitating schools has made it challenging to promote education in the Gaza area. Also, the disruption of communication facilities has affected how the education process would be implemented.

2.8.3 Centers of the National Resistance Against Occupation

After 1967 war, the West Bank (including Jerusalem) and Gaza strip became under Israeli control. Palestinian people faced challenges in protecting what was left for them, so women organizations, trade unions, or representations were generated. The Palestinian Liberation Organization abroad was formed to represent the Palestinian people and help guard the territories and lead the struggle against the Israeli occupation. The academic institutions of higher learning became bearers of national consciousness, centers of resistance and contributors to state formation” (Bruhn, 2006). As a result, the education sector became a significant factor influence in the country’s political sector. During the time, higher learning institutions offered degrees in areas like science and engineering, administrative sciences, economic, arts, education, and humanities (Bruhn, 2006; Hashweh et al. 2003). Institutions of higher learning were centers of the youth who had come from different social background. Thus, these institutions of higher learning being just centers of education, they were also regarded as the centers of national resistance and political struggle. They set the base and laid foundations that united all Palestinians in both the urban, rural, and refugee camps to create an environment of unity. Thus, a central role the institutions of higher learning were playing in the political struggle.

The Palestinian universities began to demonstrate this role of national resistance particularly in 1987 during the first intifada. The universities served to spread out the knowledge on the national consciousness. The trend continued through to the second intifada. There was an emergence of vibrant local Palestinians who were part of the university bodies. The academicians played a crucial role in stimulating “new political realities, power struggles, and gender and class stratification,” which led to them” ‘becoming a new center of authority in Palestinian society” (Mazawi & Yoge, 1999).
The professors who were active at the first intifada got high profile roles in the Palestinian National Authority. Some of them include Seri Nseibeh of BirZeit University, Abdul Sattar Al. Qasem of Annajah University, and Hanan Ashrawi of BirZeit University. The Palestinian universities worked hard in the political struggle to unite Palestinians, resist Israeli occupation, preserve their identity, and build the nation. However, the Israeli occupation instigated violence, imprisoned staff and students, assaulted and assassinated activists, and outlawed any form of activism. Almost all the heads of West Bank student councils were among the detainees. The net effect was the disruption of studies, with universities closing for months through military orders to punish the students and staff (Rigby, 1994). In 1988, there was a four-year shutdown of Palestinian institutions of higher learning (Watzman, 1993). During the time, the Israeli authorities also banned more than 2,000 books. There were more education materials prohibited, and the government imposed high taxes on publishing educational materials.

In addition to the disruptions, there was a significant level of interference with the possible support system directed to Palestinians. The Israeli occupation blocked the financial flow abroad, including the neighboring Jordan (Abu-Lughod, 2000, p.88). These activities led to Operation Cast Lead in 2009. During the time, there were lives lost and property destroyed. Lendman (2010) reported the death of 98 students, five teachers, and 454 students injured. Similarly, there were six universities destroyed. The campaign on the right to education by Birzeit University led to the incarceration of more than 411 students (Abu-Lughod, 2000).

After the violence, the Ministry of Higher Education was critical of the effect of the Israeli on higher education. As a result, the ministry reported on “the Effect of the Israeli Occupation on the Palestinian Education”. The report estimated the damage at the time to be worth $ 7,888,133 (RecoNow, 2016). According to Taweel (2007), military order number 854 called on all universities to pay annual permission fees for operation. Similarly, more than two thousand scholars were expelled, including professors and students, including members of Palestinian cultural and professional organizations. Some of the Palestinian elite members were apprehended by the military and taken out of the country to the borders of Lebanon and Jordan. Despite the remarkable development of
higher education institutions and the significant contribution they have made, they have yet to play a critical role in the national resistance against the on-going Israeli occupation.

2.8.4 Instability in Decision Making

There is a conflict in the decision-making process in regard to the relationship between the Ministries of Higher Education and the Ministry of Education. Traditionally, the two ministries were integrated. However, in 1996, the Ministry of Higher Education was established to take charge of higher education matters. Later, the same ministry was expanded to include science and research. In 2002, a cabinet change led to the integration of the two ministries in what would be referred to as the Ministry of Education and Higher Education. In 2003, the Council of Higher Education was reactivated and mandated to develop and implement the general policies on higher education. Similarly, the Scientific Research Council was tasked with researching possible educational approaches to improve higher education. Licensing and Accreditation of the institutions of higher learning were delegated to the Accreditation and Quality Authority. Other developments included the student fund created to help cover the burden of education to the students. In 2012, the Ministry of Higher Education was later separated from the Ministry of Education. It was meant to help create a focused approach in developing and implementing plans in the institutions of higher learning through the Higher Education councils. The Ministry of Higher Education was also meant to play a supervisory role in public administration bodies, to help them establish challenges and make plans to achieve the same. In 2019, the ministries were integrated into one. By 2019, the two ministries were later separated. The interchange of the two ministries indicates the challenge Palestine is getting in integrating and coordinating functions related to education.

The current Palestinian cabinet has given special importance to scientific research by separating public education from higher education and adding scientific research in the name of the new ministry to become the Ministry of Higher Education and Scientific Research. It is responsible for building a creative research system that responds to local requirements and global trends (MoEHE, 2017a). Additionally, the Ministry is constantly developing and implementing policies that would distinct educational regulations and institutions roles in the best interest of collective Palestinians' people. However, there is a
continuing challenge in establishing the powers of the Ministry of Education in enforcing the regulations and directives. The level of political interference and economic instability within the context has complicated matter, especially when this context to be assumed as a case to break plans and procedures. More important and according to the MoEHE (2017a) this system needs to ensure the sustainability of funding and the proper use of this funding, in addition to other equally important factors, including creating a research environment that meets the needs of the local community.

2.9 Legacy of Teachers and Higher Education

Since the Ottoman Period, the role of teachers has significantly changed over time. Between 1869 and 1917, the teachers within the community enjoyed the privileged status. The teachers were instrumental in clarifying the legal and religious works through the teachings and writing (Mazawi, 1994). However, the teachers’ roles became politicized (Tibawi, 1956). During the British mandate between the years 1917 and 1948 teacher's social status had improved at the local community level. After the creation of Israel in 1948, and occupying West Bank and Gaza Strip in 1967, Palestinian’s teachers have a significantly different political, demographic, and socio-economic status that effectively undermined the role of teachers in the community (RecoNow, 2016). Thus, teachers took a major and an active role in forming and running the national movement for Palestinian Independence.

Under the administration of the Israeli occupation in the West Bank and Gaza Strip, the education system in Palestine was neglected for a long period of time. There were no plans for expansion and maintenance of the facilities. Between 1967 and 1993, the Israeli occupation led to challenges for teachers with security issues leading to low motivation. There were frequent disruptions of schooling activities, inadequate resources, low training, and the constant repeal of the curriculum to suit the needs of the Israeli occupiers. At the height of the first Intifada from 1987 to 1993, the Israeli authorities led to the closure of schools for more than two years. During the time, teachers joined the National Leadership of the Uprising even though the Israeli administration prohibited the teachers from participating in such activities. Despite the difficulties, teachers led the local community of the educational activities in teaching the students. The prolonged
school closures were a punishment against teachers, and as such, it led to poor quality of education and their socioeconomic condition. The Israeli military ensured that teachers and students who organized themselves were suspended, exiled, dismissed, or imprisoned. These were the main challenges that the teachers faced during the time. In addition to the reprisals by the military, teachers also had to contend with issues like low salaries and lack of timely payments. Teachers were not allowed to promote their culture, values, identity, and aspirations. As such, the main curriculum used in teaching within Palestine was irrelevant to the needs of the young Palestinians (Nasru, 1993). Thus, there were no distinct teacher roles, and their role was constantly diminishing both at the school and society levels. Palestinian teachers did not have proper status in the community economically, socially, and politically. They were supposed to play a key role in the implementation of the curriculum. However, at the time, the professional enthusiasm had been eroded (Nusseibeh and Anthony, 2007). Many teachers perceived a rigid system, inadequate resources, low training programs, a complicated bureaucracy, and conventional supervisory models. According to UNESCO (1995), most teachers who opted to assist in Palestine were mainly diploma holders. Less than one-third of the teachers were university graduates.

Furthermore, Palestine's higher education is relatively new, due to the continuing obstacles that have been hampered and delayed the educational development in all its stages. Only in 1950s, there were efforts to improve the teacher education systems. There were only two-year colleges through initiatives advanced by families, religious groups, or the United Nations Relief and Work Agency (UNRWA). The program aimed to offer teacher training programs and nursing education and ensure technical and vocational education in the regions (Hashweh et al., 2003; Bruhn, 2006). The colleges continued to exist until the time when there were fully-fledged universities in the 1970s. Additionally, the political and social realities of Palestine have affected the perception and desire of the Palestinians to seek higher education. For instance, the political dismemberment of mandatory Palestine that came through the class structures influencing both the Gaza Strip and the West Bank affects the education system. Abu-Lughod (2000, p.8) observed that the Palestinians sought higher education because of multiple motives. These included the value of learning as conferred by the upper-class status, as most of the upper-class
members had higher education. Also, there was an expanded market into the Arab states that needed skilled workers. More important, the 1948 and 1967 defeat of Arab states and consequences caused by Israeli control were mainly attributed to the difference in the level of education. As a result, the Palestinians are slowly attaching the effects of education to superiority.

Currently, a clear statistic indication of the progress in higher education development that was experiencing as a result of reforms in the sector. In summary, the latest data available from PCBS (2020a), indicates that there are 49 higher education institutions (HEIs) in OPT in 2020/2021 including 16 traditional universities, 16 university colleges, and 17 community. More than 221,000 students are enrolled in these HEIs. There are 23 community colleges offering educational programs, with 28,971 students enrolled in education programs (male 6,049, and female 22,922). It is estimated that the total enrollment rate for the age group of 18–24-year-olds is more than 25.8%.

At this point the chapter presented a comprehensive review of Palestine's geographical, demographic, economic, and political contexts. This includes the legal and political development of the PA semi-political system. It is described as a superstructure and matrix of control system, and is characterized by political and economic limitations and contradictions. It also presented the political influence of the occupier and its threatening policies on education. The teachers' and higher education legacy are also presented with a highlighting of the privilege of pursuing higher education, and how higher education have been playing as a center of political struggle and resistance.
Chapter 3

3. Literature Review

The impact of globalization in the world including MENA region is profound through changes at the economic, social, educational, and political levels. In this respect, the nation states act to remain competitive in the dynamic and changing economy as they push towards Western-influenced models of democracy that shape the values of societies that they must adapt to make such a transition (Tattoo, 2006). In other words, in this complex and dynamic world, there are major dimensions that have become an important focus of our daily lives. Technological advancements, social, education, and health matters are the most common variables. Therefore, social policies widely cover social welfare and other government activities to influence our life. A good example is when the government sets policies and legislation concerning marriage and divorce and reinforces culture and the arts. On the one hand, the state government is mandated to intervene in matters concerning economic liberty and individuals' freedom and rights. Hence, public interventions and government support fulfill the social institutions' role. Whenever public policies are enforced, they have direct and indirect social impacts, and the outcomes become the moral responsibility of the government to act. For example, the government has a significant role in ensuring that the needs of teachers are met. On the other hand, the national and international governments and corporations have improved teacher professionalism and suggested comprehensive teacher education reform.

The educational reforms comprise initiatives that empower teachers, promoting their participation in decisions that affect their profession (Pineda-Báez & Andrews, 2019). According to Li (2016), teachers have become the main target for teacher education reform and the teachers’ professional roles are realized by their new identities which have been under construction for decades. As a result, this will build a significant transition in the education sector, promoting a holistic approach and application. Additionally, the super structural organizations have been an essential engine within the movement of redefining teachers’ identities and reforming teaching profession in the new global economy. The core trends of this movement concentrate on the related norms and perspectives, such as accountability, professional certification, performance-based
evaluation, and improvement of “best instructional practices”. Therefore, it's essential to conceptualize and understand how teachers' have been identified and how professionalism and reform process has affected the teachers and the education system across the world. Thus, this chapter presents in detail a number of contemporary teacher identities, a discussion on teaching professionalism and reform process followed by perspectives both of the international organizations as well as around the world. Then, it reviews literature that reflects how MENA countries including Palestine have pushed towards a new era as they reform teacher education and their professional teaching systems.

3.1 Teachers New Identities for Professionalism

The education campaign in the US led by Horace Mann was one of those things that led to the huge educational opportunities for American children which triggered the idea of a democratic system and the growing need for an economy that needed skilled workers (Li, 2016). With the expanding economy governments were forced to ensure that they made the education system at the primary and secondary levels grow (Titu, 2019). With all these changes taking place the demand for the changes in the roles of teachers also increased, and the increased growth of informational technology in our societies made the demand for teachers even more (Titu, 2019). According to Stronge (2018), teachers were tasked with the role of spreading moral values and knowledge as well as ensuring the development of society as part of their profession.

During the past decades, the idea of teachers’ professional identity had drawn widespread focus and has become one of the main areas of research. As stated by Karaolis (2019), there are a few existing studies in various countries the teacher’s professional identity has been considered as the main factor to help understand the professional lives, career decision-making, effectiveness, professional growth, and attitude toward changes in the education sector. Teacher identity is a broad topic, but it is important to understand that it has an impact on student teachers’ learning and on the professional growth of practicing teachers. Teachers play a very significant role in the lives of students, and it has been confirmed that effective teaching is the basis of successful education systems. After all,
teachers in the nineteenth century were the key drivers of changes in the practical learning and teaching processes through their new identities (Karaolis, 2019).

The reality of teachers’ professional identities has continued to change with time, and it is mainly composed of their beliefs and perceptions about who they are and their roles as teachers, which is crucial for them to manage during these changing times. According to OCED’s teachers’ policies, teachers are no longer belong to a group of educated people in a world comprised of uneducated people they are groping for personal and professional authority in an education system that keeps changing (Vokatis & Zhang, 2016). Teacher professionalism is important for various reasons, and according to Quay (2016), more focus has been given to a number of ways in which teachers are prepared by teacher education. The 21st-century schools that can accommodate the learning of all children are dependent on highly qualified and committed teachers and it is through the commitment of these teachers that will enable shape the future generations (Stronge, 2018). Though not much realized the training, orientation, and professional growth that teacher’s experience is very significant in the educational reforms (Quay, 2016). This makes new identities for teachers and ways of changing their roles in the classroom practices are matters of concern for policymakers globally. According to Suarez and McGrath (2022), research on the professional identity of teachers is very crucial to policymakers and the community as well. They continue to state that more research and information on teacher identity and teaching approaches can lead to teacher introspection, reflection, and their educational career.

There have been various discussions and debates on teacher identities and how they can be modified at all levels to ensure that learners benefit as well as the entire community and how to turn teachers into professionals through teacher education. According to UNESCO as cited by Li (2016), there are two main roles of teachers in the educational reforms, which are to be both subjects and agents of change which makes the entire teacher professionalism development field very challenging and one that constantly grows. Frequent debates and conferences led to the identification of teachers as professional evaluators, co-learners, innovators and researchers, problem-solvers and barrier-breakers, and knowledge builders.
3.1.1 Teachers as evaluators

Teachers are a significant resource and are expected to improve the education standards in schools. Over the past few years, teacher evaluation has become one of the key focuses of educational policies debates and research efforts. The attention that has been paid to teacher evaluation has raised multiple questions on how evaluation and student outcomes are connected. According to Goe et al. (2016), there is value-added research which shows sizeable differences among teachers in their ability to assist students to learn at high levels and not just across schools but within schools. The differences established lie at the center of the current approaches to measuring teacher effectiveness through teacher evaluation. Evaluation is a significant tool that can help teachers improve but the challenge is that school leaders do not have the proper training on how to use the evaluation results as a guiding tool for teachers toward professional growth. According to McFadden & Williams (2020), meaningful teacher evaluation entails an accurate appraisal of the effectiveness of teaching, its strengths and areas for development, followed by feedback, coaching, support, and opportunities for professional growth. Goe et al. (2016) also state that there are two main reasons why the role of teachers as evaluators is important. Firstly, it is because the role aims at improving the teacher’s own practice through the identification of strengths and weaknesses which will help in promoting professional growth, mainly known as the improvement function. Secondly, the aim is to ensure that teachers perform at their best ability to promote student learning, known as accountability. Liu et al. (2019) states that when the evaluation is done for improvement, the provided feedback is helpful for teachers as it enables them to discover areas they need to work on and how they can do so to help their students. Thus, teachers benefit from learning about their practices and reflecting on them.

Teacher evaluation may help better the relationship between the teacher and their learners and enable them to discover their areas of weakness and also their strengths. According to Cohen & Goldhaber (2016), classroom observations are some of the best sources of information to help teachers in their professional growth. The observations help in the collection of crucial data about the teacher-student relationship and the learning environment. They further state that the evidence obtained from these observations
including evidence of students learning the conversations may help teachers pay attention to whether the students are learning and not only focusing on their own instruction. Teacher-student relationships have been identified as important in ensuring the students’ success, and various studies have continued to emphasize the same. The learning environment that teachers create and maintain is crucial and essential for student learning to occur and this can be observed through direct observation. The information collected from the observations can be used by teachers to establish strategies to promote positive interactions which will promote better learning outcomes and reduce negative ones (Goe et al., 2016). Evidence from student learning and the information from observation can be useful in helping teachers make informed decisions regarding professional learning.

Darling-Hammond (2016) acknowledges that there are challenges facing the teacher evaluation system, as policymakers and even the teachers themselves cannot fully agree on what exactly constitutes effective teaching. White (2018) says that different researchers have established definitions, rubrics, and frameworks on the same to differentiate between poor, mediocre, and effective teaching, which is the main purpose of a good evaluation system. While state governments have played a significant role in teacher preparation and certification policies over years, they have delegated the teacher evaluation policies to the localities and over the years actors in this field have changed. White (2018) states that there are a series of programs launched by different governments. For instance, the USA federal government introduced Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA) program which emphasizes state teacher evaluation and tenure to enhance student achievement. According to Suarez and McGraths (2022), policymakers require empirical evidence of teachers’ professional identity to develop policies and strategies that contribute to the teaching workforce. It is important that school leaders are provided with knowledge, skills, and the will to engage with education policymakers as this will enable achieve the best results. In conclusion, the role of teachers as professional evaluators is that the process promotes improvement and accountability. Teachers play a significant role in ensuring student achievement thus policymakers should ensure they pay attention to the needs of the teachers and involve them even in decision making to promote a connection between the policies and teaching to achieve their goal with the learners.
3.1.2 Teachers as members of a professional community that fosters collaboration, innovation, and continuous improvement

According to Vokatis & Zhang (2016), teachers’ innovative collaboration with colleagues and considering themselves as not only teachers but also researchers is a major aspect of who they are as professionals. Here teachers see themselves and their profession as part of a professional community of teachers they work with, and everyone has an interest in their career and making it better. All teachers also agree that such a professional group is crucial to the innovation and improvement of their careers. Conducting professionally-oriented discourse regularly in their knowledge building meetings which promotes their collaborative problem-solving and creation of new ideas enables them to discover and shape their identity as professionals. At these meetings, they are able to learn from their colleagues as they exchange their classroom designs, insights, and challenges to enable them to develop better understandings and strategies to be more productive. The community whose aim is to excel in teaching enables them to share both their success and failures and this is one of the ways that promote improvement in their teaching practice. Since learning is considered a lifelong process and it is therefore important that meaningful and continuous opportunities that provide professional development for teachers are offered to enable them better their expertise skills and this is also achieved in these teacher communities.

Teachers establishing a common understanding that risk-taking is unavoidable in the experimentation of new approaches ensures that the teaching practice is improved (Vokatis & Zhang (2016). Vokatis & Zhang (2016) state also that teachers who identify themselves as researchers are able to research their own identity and role, and that working with other researchers is an important aspect of good teaching that enhances innovation, refinement, and change. According to Messikh (2020), educational research can be helpful in giving the teacher an opportunity to develop their critical thinking skills to become effective and self-reliant problem solvers to the unique challenges that no other person can better understand in the classroom, thus making them enthusiastically involved in the structuring and sharing a more comprehensive perspective of education.
This way it greatly contributes to the improvement of higher standards and greater accountability for school improvement and teaching excellence.

3.1.3 Teachers as problem solvers
Morris (2019) states that when teachers develop innovative practices in line with their goals of teaching it requires them to face and address various challenges and barriers that result from contexts, such as time limits and school schedules, technology errors, subject area limitations, and age differences. These problems can pose a challenge to the teacher’s professionalism and teaching practice. However, instead of being weighed down by the challenges, they should become active in problem and barrier solving. Thus, there are various strategies that have been made to ensure the continuity of knowledge building possible among different students and in classrooms and teachers realize that solving these problems is part of their teaching role and identity. The various problems that are experienced in this profession should not be a hindrance to providing quality education and thus teachers understand their role well as players in addressing them (Morris, 2019).

3.1.4 Teachers as co-learners
According to Santosa (2022), when teachers identify their role as co-learners, they are able to develop symmetrical relationships with students so that they can achieve the highest level of responsibility for learning and improving their knowledge. As Vokatis & Zhang (2016) state, teachers who identify themselves as co-learners who see their students as members of the research team promote collective knowledge building. When teachers are identified as co-learners, the policy enhances the best practices and leads to consistency in the teaching and learning process. Jacobs et al. (2016) also state that when teachers perceive themselves as members of a classroom community who co-engage in the fostering of knowledge and problem-solving with their students. The teachers are not the center of the class but are a member of the class community and this way they do not assume to know everything; they also learn in the process. Santosa (2022) further states that the teaching process becomes impactful when teachers have close relationships with their students, enabling them to know them better and so that they can motivate them.
The role of teachers as co-learners enables them to honor their students as research team members who can propose goals and research topics, develop theories and experiments, and create collaborative groups (Vokatis & Zhang (2016). This is crucial to the teaching process as teachers are made aware of the struggles and interests of their students. They believe that students can have a high-level responsibility in the classroom to come up with questions and ideas and they communicate this trust during class activities and by encouraging them to ask questions that would help them develop their skills.

According to Suarez and McGraths (2022), there are various actions that can be adopted by policymakers to develop the role of teachers as co-learners, in that they should assist teachers and the teaching profession establish strong professional norms, knowledge, and skills. Also, they should develop incentives and organizational conditions that encourage teacher and student learning in schools.

### 3.1.5 Teachers as professional knowledge builders

According to Tan et al. (2016), an important aspect of teacher identity and what they aim at achieving in their profession is that they see themselves as professional knowledge builders who made a commitment to explore the various innovative visions of teaching to create new opportunities for building knowledge and enhancing development among students. Vokatis & Zhang establish that teachers see themselves as teachers who are supposed to ensure the whole development of the learners, and see learning as a lifelong process not limited to the curriculum. As part of their role, they are supposed to cover qualities beyond the curriculum content, such as creative problem-solving skills, intellectual thinking skills, open-mindedness, and collective responsibility (Tan et al., 2016). These qualities are important as they promote student development and enable them to engage in productive knowledge building. Teachers are responsible for developing their students’ curiosity as the curriculum limits this aspect. For instance, they are required in the classroom to encourage students to ask deeper questions and participate in curiosity-driven inquiries. This way quality education and student achievement are achieved.
3.2 Teacher Professionalism and Reform Process

Education has become the main reform topic in most countries and there has been serious international and regional competition, especially in this globalization era. The process has left most of the roles to teachers, while international policies and practices in educational reform have paid attention to the importance of teacher professionalism and lifelong professional growth for teachers to better the students’ achievement (Nairz-Wirth & Feldmann, 2019). In line with different previously discussed identities and roles, the teaching profession has unique characteristics that differentiate it from other professionals. According to (Li, 2016), “teacher professionalization is an educational and societal process by which teachers gain professional quality, characteristics, status, and privilege” (p.83).

The teaching profession has always been under a process that seeks to enhance teacher quality, their professional status, as well as the labor force. According to Wardoyo & Herdiani (2017), teacher professionalism has been extensively observed since the 1960s and improved on various occasions due to the growing needs in education, which has been a challenge to both the government and the educators. The professional teachers’ identity is set in a fast-paced and ever-changing environment and the recent pandemic is one of the most suitable examples of the disruption of the educational sector.

Teacher professionalism has been improved and suggestions for comprehensive teacher education reforms have been made by various national and international governments, as well as different corporations (Wardoyo & Herdiani, 2017). The UNESCO and OECD have held various meetings to discuss educational reforms, such as those that empower the teachers and enhance their participation in decisions that affect their careers. The intergovernmental conferences have mainly been held to ensure quality education and promote the welfare of the teachers by calling for crucial changes in the recruitment processes, training, development, and the role of teachers in the education system (Morales, 2016). The main reasons are to ensure a meaningful change in the education sector, the need for a whole approach, and applying teacher’s professionalism.
UNESCO (1966) has established that coming up with a professional growth plan is an effective way of helping the teachers define specific goals and objectives which are related to the major educational goals. The various conferences held globally have confirmed the importance of teachers and how we can adapt and change to develop effective professionals. With the changes in the modern age, such as industrialization and urbanization, there is a need to improve some aspects of the teacher’s professionalism (Wardoyo & Herdiani, 2017). This calls for the need to acknowledge the need for teacher professionalism process reforms and boost the ability of teachers to meet their goals and objectives.

Based on the reports from UNESCO regarding educational reforms, it is important that the government offer support to the teachers in using their skills and knowledge in their careers and discussing the issues that affect the education system. According to Toledo et al. (2017), there is a need to develop policies and initiatives that address teacher salaries, as that would help motivate teachers to improve their professionalism and the establishment of important perspectives and skills affecting their practice. It is also important that with the current changes in the society and the economy that policymakers assess and review the needs of the teachers and students regularly. For instance, conducting sub-skill reading evaluation scores would help teachers realize areas to spend quality time to meet the needs of their students (Toledo et al., 2017). According to UNESCO, the delegation of duties and responsibilities would help improve the educational systems and the welfare of the teachers. Effective professionalism would ensure that the learners’ needs are acknowledged and that the teachers appreciated (Darling-Hammond et al., 2019). There are some traditional policies of teaching that should be wiped out, such as they believe that teachers are aware of subjects, they can teach but instead the teacher should be able to define the techniques and subject matter to promote an effective learning process (Vokatis & Zhang, 2016). The extent to which the teacher will succeed will be determined by their ability to understand and appreciate their professionalism.

In regard to the educational programs, teachers are responsible for making the right decisions on professionalism for them to recognize the different learner outcomes and
expectations. Based on professionalism, teachers can use their experience and skills to offer practical actions and services that will help improve the potential of educational system objectives and goals (Schleicher, 2016). As curricula continue to change, the educational system should have programs, research, and policy developments that aim at solving the problems that hinder the stability of the education system and achieving the desired results (Schleicher, 2016). Policies and programs are important as they help teachers set targets on how they can make their profession better and apply their skills to get the best results.

The governments should acknowledge teacher professionalism as a global problem and find better ways to improve the quality of teachers. The International Bureau of Education paid attention to improving the economic, social, and professional problems of the teaching profession (Li, 2016). The UNESCO also provided some recommendations on teachers’ professionalism and suggested that teaching practice should be acknowledged by the public service making the government responsible for promoting the teacher’s professionalism for the sake of the learners. According to Vokatis & Zhang (2016), the OECD has also been at the forefront of seeking reforms of the teachers’ policies and they sought to transform the responsibilities, recruitment policies, training, and development of teachers.

3.3 Perspectives on Teacher Professionalism and Reform Policies

According to Nairz-Wirth & Feldmann (2019), despite the many challenges imposed by globalization and the competitive economies, most national governments in different regions have considered bettering the teaching identities as part of their educational policy agendas. Teacher professionalism reform process has been taking place in various countries, such as China, Canada, USA, UK, Japan, among others. However, teacher professionalism has been different in each of these countries, thus shaping the education systems differently (Murray, 2017).

Canada has been one of the regions where its international reputation has been excellent compared to other educational systems in the world. According to Yang & Zhu (2021),
the teacher education reforms that have for the longest time existed in Canada have been said to play a very significant role in student learning and in the policies implementation of provincial governments. In Canada, there are two main factors that make teacher education reforms different across various areas. Here teachers are not seen as government employees, thus leaving education as the responsibility of the province (Li, 2016). According to Li (2016), teachers are organized into territorial and provincial associations which are responsible for developing teacher professionalism. For example, Alberta, a Canadian province, has been said to perform well in the international measures of education reform for more than a decade; it was identified in the OECD’s PISA (Programme for International Student Assessment) results as one of the best-performing school systems in the world (Yang & Zhu, 2021).

Unlike in Canada, the US federal government plays a modest role in the preparation of teachers. The federal government uses an institutionalism approach as stated by Li (2016). In 1983, the National Commission on Excellence in Education came up with a document that addressed the need for imperative school reform. This report focused on the importance of teacher professionalism in offering quality education to students. The decision was backed up by the Carnegie Task Force which stated that reviving education in the US was necessary to promote educational excellence and teacher professionalism (Hytten, 2017). The formal institutions and corporations collaborated with the federal government and together they shaped the education system structure in the US through the teachers’ welfare (Li, 2016).

On another note, China has had significant strategies for reforming the education system. Teacher professionalism can be changed through their various policies in recruitment and the use of teachers in today’s modern era (Wardoyo & Herdiani, 2017). There was the establishment of a licensing system that ensured all teachers received the right qualification. For instance, teachers of higher education level are supposed to attain a 4-year degree (Li, 2016). According to Baris & Hasan (2019), the government offers teachers the necessary training permits to enable them to improve their professional qualifications and also ensures teacher professionalism, development of teacher
competencies, and offers an experimental foundation within the framework of the common professional development.

In Japan, the education system has adopted the progressivism perspective, and reforming educational policies are required to recognize that teachers should be equipped with adequate knowledge and skills by making their training and internship periods longer (Fredriksson et al., 2020). The Japanese government continues to emphasize the teachers’ education and aims at providing world-class teachers (Li, 2016). The different ministries in the country also work together to develop policies and reforms that will transform the education and school system in the country. Yamanaka & Suzuki (2020) state that the education reforms made in Japan, especially in the 21st century, were implemented to improve teaching styles by ensuring that the transition from cramming to helping students acquire the ability to learn and think on their own. The reforms also recommended that a well-rounded holistic education is enhanced by promoting partnerships between school communities and organizations.

Unlike Japan, the UK government adopted the institutionalism perspective in matters of education. It adopted a national set of teaching standards that aim to address teacher competencies and skills but also their attitudes and pedagogical practices. In the past few years, the government has made efforts to expand the education system and teacher professionalism which has excited teachers due to the government’s decision to prioritize the education system (Li, 2016). The standards set by the government are aimed at ensuring teachers discover their roles and help them improve so that they can promote student achievement. Teachers have also been empowered so that they deliver quality education making learners benefit which makes the demand for UK graduates rise in the international market. The UK has also collaborated with international partners to ensure meeting the learners’ educational needs. The institutionalism perspective will be helpful to the UK teachers’ professionalism as it will enable the country to achieve changes necessary in the education sector.

In conclusion, the national and international governments should work together to comprehend teacher professionalism and reform policies. They should pay more attention
to both the external and internal needs of teachers and ensure they establish an education system that consolidates both the learners and the teachers. Policymakers should also be on the frontline of creating positive unions and movements that delve into the needs of teachers. It is also important that the financing departments collaborate so as to make it possible to implement reform policies. However, the responsiveness may be shaped by the crucial output of the financing departments to implement and reform policies. Although history has dictated traditional beliefs and approaches towards the education system and teacher professionalism, institutionalization and governance models constitute an effective path towards formulating a revolutionary vision. These will change how teacher professional models drive an innovative, elective, and ideological vision.

3.4 Teacher Professionalism in the MENA Region

Over the last two decades, countries in the MENA region have a common imperative to ameliorate the quality of their education system, particularly teacher roles and the teaching profession as a modern system. According to Shinn (2012), teacher education reforms in the MENA region imitate international trends for renewing the teaching profession and improving teacher roles. For example, teacher education reform processes in MENA countries, including Palestine, have promoted the ILO/UNESCO recommendations, and therefore have adopted several international projects and programs as committed to participating in international movements. Despite that the significant improvement in terms of expanding school enrollments, reducing gender disparity (World Bank, 2008), and enhancing the quality of education, particularly teacher preparation as national priority, the capacity and pace of this change is not the same everywhere (Yinger, 1999). Some education systems grasp the modification of these new models while other systems reject it, and for others the tendency to revert towards familiar arrangements is the case (Tatto, 2006).

For example, Harold & Stephenson (2010) investigated the development of United Arab Emirates (UAE) novice teachers who engaged in a university seminar to develop their knowledge and skills that can assist in reforming instructional production. The finding represents various themes in regard to value and interests, such as issues related to language and cultural challenges and how these barriers prevent the development of
genuine changes. In addition, Lightfoot (2015) discussed a number of issues related to the policy implementation for educational reforms in Sangon. This research discussed how educators promote and develop teachers' skills that imitate the international agenda and policies as part of reforming their instructional policies and programs. The results showed that educators in this country still embrace the conventional epistemology rather than the new neoliberal dialogue in their attempts of reforming educational policies and programs. It revealed the complexity of the reform process - particularly the amendment of legislation by policymakers and institutional leaders.

Another study was conducted by Romanowski (2017) who examined the impact of the neoliberal educational leadership domination on the accreditation process in the Gulf Cooperation Council (GCC) area. In this study, the author attempted to understand how the Educational Leadership Constituent Council (ELCC) standards will be adopted in accrediting teaching programs in this region. His aim was to investigate how these new dominant standards that were invented in Western countries by NCATE can suit the GCC contexts. The findings of the study revealed that few of these outsider standards are incorporated and reflected in the accreditation process. However, the complicated contexts and cultural differences limited a full conceptualization of those constituents. Moreover, Chapman & Miric (2009), in their study discussed Galal's framework and encouraged policymakers in MENA regions to develop new strategies for instructional dilemmas in the region. Using document analysis, and interviewing policy makers in MENA region, the study found that there is an organizational problem associated with problematic resource allocation. The authors suggested that despite the profusion of resources in this region, these organizational problems prevent real change and reform. The authors encouraged policymakers and leaders in this area to develop strategies that could solve distribution issues standing in the way of reforming the educational system and improving the learning process.

This chapter provided a comprehensive elaboration of the modern teacher roles through their identities, as well as the teacher professionalization and reform process. It discussed the theories of teacher identities, how the teaching profession has changed over time, and
how it has impacted the reform movement. Additionally, various perspectives from different countries including those within the MENA region were presented.
Chapter 4

4. Teacher Education Reform in Palestine

4.1 TES Towards Economic Development

The economic context of Palestine depends on several factors, with education being key among them. The two sectors of economics and education are closely connected, meaning that the success of one depends on the success of the other. According to MoEHE (2017b), the level of education dictates the skills of employees which influences the production patterns in the economy. Further, the level of education determines the awareness levels in the country which are vital in determining the sustainability of products and the responsibility of the nation in the effective management of waste. With appropriate skills from the education sector particularly teaching forces, industrial development becomes a reality and foundation on which a country transforms its economy (MoEHE, 2017b). The close connection between education and the economy makes it vital for the MoEHE to align its educational policies, such as TES and its curriculum initiatives, to match economic demands in terms of skills required in the labor market to ensure sufficient and quality human capital. According to the MoEHE’s strategic plan of 2014, when the country aligns its educational policies to economic demands, Palestinians will have a better chance of increasing the level of innovation and embracing of technological advancements to drive the economy. Based on that, the MoEHE has given a great amount of consideration to teacher roles through their identity and level of professionalism.

In consideration of the promotion of the ILO/UNESCO Recommendations Concerning the Status of Teachers, the MoEHE has implemented several interventions and committed to fulfill those recommendations. For example, TES objectives for reforming teacher education are a reflection of these recommendations. According to the MoEHE (2011a), teacher identity and educational programs should be developed, while existing teacher education programs should be upgraded to meet TES recommendations and conform to relevant policies. Eventually, the MoEHE’s strategic plan of 2017-2022 also adopted the
2030 Education Framework for Action, especially goal “4c” in regard to qualifying teachers in Palestine (MoEHE, 2017a).

Furthermore, and due to the value of education in developing the economy, the Ministry of Finance and Planning offers tremendous support to the Ministry of Education and Higher Education (MoEHE, 2017a). Key areas of support include making financial resources available to support the educational policies and agendas, developing the organizational structure of the education sector, and providing technical and fiscal aid (MoEHE, 2017a). The MoEHE recognizes the importance of having functional and dynamic policies for promoting innovation and creativity, as both are needed to have a strong and growing economy. However, resources remain a key challenge to ensuring that the interrelationship between education and economic sectors would lead to huge economic success.

To this end, strong coordination exists between Palestinian Authorities and international institutions that support the educational goals of the country. For instance, the partnership between the PA and global organizations has proven to be a close one in the areas of adult education and TVET and Educators Development (MoEHE, 2017a). Some of the most important global partners include AMID EAST, UNESCO, UNICEF, the German Institute of Adult Education, and UNRWA. Others include the Arab Partners that support the Joint Financing Arrangement (JFA) and the World Bank (WB) which continues to provide financial resources and technical support for major educational policies. Moreover, independent states including the Arab States, the British Council, and China continue to show their support by offering different types of support to improve the level of education in Palestine.

4.2 The Rationale of the Strategy

As stated previously, the Palestinian Authority managed to gain control of small areas (area A and B) of the occupied Palestinian Territories in 1994. The long absence of political stability and security that led to the degeneration of the education infrastructure, resulting in the need for the creation of an emergency plan by the MoEHE to ensure that educational sector, such as infrastructure, curriculum and teacher training system has
been set up. Due to international interest in supporting the PA, there was a restoration of strategic planning within the PA in 2008. The MoEHE committed towards ensuring the “Education for All” movement and meeting the Millennium Development Objectives (MDO) (UNESCO 2008b, p.4). Thus, the national plan for “Education for All” aimed to achieve the educational goals in the line with the goals pledged during the International Forum for Education held in Dakar, Senegal in 2000. This plan was introduced at the Paris Conference in 2007 where it received financial backing by the international donors. Additionally, several educational strategic plans have launched after 2010.

According to the MoEHE (2017a), “the Palestinian education system requires a clear and agreed upon vision with obvious skills, knowledge and values that are suitable for the 21st century and would be considered a springboard for restructuring the education strategies and activities” (p.37). The most significant challenges that faced the educational development process were the improvement of the content, methods and teacher education programs which was seen as critical. Perhaps the most influential factor in the process was selecting and educating pre- and in-service teachers. A pressing need emerged to develop a national strategy for teacher education, and UNESCO responded positively to this demand, which led to the preparation of a new strategy. Participation in developing this strategy was large by the civil society. A 14-member committee known as the Teacher Education Reference Group (TERG) was formulated, including expertise from UNESCO, the MoEHE, UNRWA, higher education institutions, and NGOs. Their main task was to create recommendations to identify current trends using statistics and previous studies on the topic. Another committee known as the Teacher Education Consultative Group (TECG) made up of 30 members from higher education institutions, directors at the Ministry, administrators at UNRWA, civil society, and a number of teachers’ unions. In addition to that, reports were developed, feedback was provided to TERG, and a semi-final draft was sent to 93 Palestinian educators and related persons for feedback (Shinn, 2012; Burke, 2020).

4.3 Objectives and Goals of Teacher Education Strategy

The Teacher Education Strategy (TES) was launched in 2008 and adopted an immense capacity-building challenge targeting more than 55,000 teachers. TES aims to elevate the
quality and scope of the teaching profession in Palestine (MoEHE, 2011a). According to
the MoEHE, the TES mission was stated as the following:

To develop the human educational cadre, in particular teachers, so that they can advance along
with their students towards excellence and distinction.... TES harmonizes in-service and pre-
service teacher education towards attaining good outputs that can assist the students and reinforce
the role of teachers in a comprehensive development process... this can also give room to
modernizing the educational systems in accordance with the accelerating scientific and
technological advancements. (MoEHE, 2008, p.7)

As part of its efforts, the Commission for Development Teacher Profession (CDTP)
delivered a critical evaluation of the teaching occupation and outlined specific
recommendations by offering a specific perspective of how to professionally develop in-
service and pre-service teachers, with an elaboration of the function of higher education
providers, as well as enhancing their management system. More attention has been given
to the quality of teacher preparation by teacher education institutions in terms of teacher
roles and their professional matters. TES recommendations mirror international trends
and policies that regulate the teaching profession and new teacher identities. Palestinian
policymakers have adopted new attributes for teacher preparation. TES recommended
new identities and roles for teachers to be adopted by the educational sector. This new
teacher identity requires them to play the role of the facilitator, and the students to
assume a major role in the learning process. Moreover, the new teacher vision has been
integrated into the MoEHE’s plans aimed at developing and qualifying both experienced
and novice teachers (e.g., MoE, 1999; the MoEHE, 2011c, 2014a, 2017a). According to
the MoEHE’s strategic plans, teacher professional development programs should be
developed and old programs must be upgraded to meet TES recommendations and
components. Additionally, following TES recommendations, numerous institutes have
been established to advocate for teach education reform projects. According to the
strategy document (MoEHE, 2008), “this strategy aims to develop sufficient and efficient
teachers in order to improve the learning opportunities for all Palestinian students in all
schools” (p.16). In addition, the TES constitutes four definite components aimed at
reforming teacher education.
4.4 TES Four Components and Recommendations

Regarding pre-service teachers, TES aimed to upgrade and develop teacher education programs at HEIs and recommended to create and promote a national framework for teacher education. Its recommendations included: 1) The CDTP and AQAC should set up standards that align with the new vision for accrediting teacher education programs; 2) The CDTP should set the minimum required standards for the teacher education programs, curricula, teaching, and learning methodologies; 3) HEIs should identify the types of teacher education programs to be created and organized in alignment with TES principles; 4) Besides that, HEIs should ensure that the necessary human, material, and financial resources are available for efficient research and networking; 5) HEIs should collaborate with the MoEHE and other stakeholders to single out schools that would be used to pilot these programs; 6) HEIs should ensure the application of new and older programs while AQAC should review the applications and approve candidates that meet the standards; 7) HEIs should accept students and run programs that have met the accreditation standards.

On the other hand, the MoEHE aimed to qualify in-service teachers. Therefore, TES recommended that the CDTP should be in a partnership with the AQAC to set up accreditation standards for providers of in-service teacher education activities and mentors in schools. It was required to set up capacity-building measures to train educators and identify the educational institutions that responsible to design and offer the educational qualification diploma for in-service teachers. Also, it was planned to design and offer qualification programs for in-service principals, managers, administrators, and educational supervisors. This partnership includes the international community and the MoEHE. Therefore, they were required to set up specific education accreditation to ensure that teachers receive their qualifications by merit. An induction program for new qualified teachers should be conducted in partnership with the MoEHE, UNRWA, higher institutions, and private schools. Furthermore, measures (mechanisms and methods) that would guarantee continuous professional development should be utilized to identify the needs of qualified and experienced teachers. Last but not least, continuous research and experimentation in the research systems and operations should be implemented.
Regarding transforming the teaching profession into a modern system, TES recommended conducting studies to assess working conditions and whether teacher salaries need to be increased. A scale of rating the career development of teachers should be undertaken to rate their progress in the profession; TES recommended creating specific standards for each rank according to the school level and specialization. Besides that, TES recommended identifying the evaluation process mechanisms aimed at granting teachers a practicing license for their profession. Furthermore, qualification measures should be developed to evaluate the effectiveness of the broad educational certifications. This ensures the improvement of the process of selecting and recruiting teachers. The role of teachers’ unions should be enhanced as well.

Finally, in regard to the decentralization goal, including the organization and supervision of the teacher education process, it was recommended that higher education institutions should set up internal measures to guarantee and improve the quality of teacher education programs. This requires institutions to ensure that their training programs are in line with the requirements and regulations set up by AQAC. Students with the required competencies should be motivated to enroll into teacher education programs especially male student teachers. The MoEHE should collaborate with HEIs to conduct studies and research on the quality of teaching standards and the effectiveness of teacher education programs. This involves ensuring that there is a balance between available demand and supply of teachers. TES advised to continue supervising the professional development of teachers, so various units within the MoEHE to be specified with the role of supervision, accreditation, organization, and provision of in-services teacher programs. The HEIs in partnership with the MoEHE's units should offer continuing professional development programs and activities. It was suggested that supervisors and principles should audit the needs of teachers in educational settings to identify measures to improve teaching as a profession. TES also recommended that the MoEHE and other related agencies should create capacity-building measures that would ensure continuous career development for principles and education administrators. Capacity-building by AQAC should ensure frequent auditing of teacher education programs and identifying ways to improve teacher education programs, as well as the creation and implementation of the Educational Management Information System (EMIS). This would ensure the creation of a modern
decentralized system at the MoEHE to ensure that the needs of teachers are identified and that measures are set up to manage them.

4.5 MoEHE Interventions, Projects and Achievements

A large-scale effort has been made by the MoEHE, HEIs, and local and worldwide partners in implementing the TES objectives by providing technical and financial assistance to projects and programs developed specifically for the implementation of TES objectives. According to the MoEHE (2011a), eight major projects and programs were developed and contributed to TES implementation process.

First project is the Tertiary Education Project (TEP). It was launched in 2005 and extended to more than ten years. Funded by the WB and EU, its objectives were to improve the policymaking environment for management and governance of tertiary education. The project aimed to increase the external and internal effects of tertiary education and create enticements to provide improvements to the quality, equity, and relevance of tertiary education to meet the socio-economic needs of the Palestinian population. An important component of the TEP was the Quality Improvement Funds (QIF) which was introduced to ensure the growth of teacher education institutions and teaching programs throughout Palestine. The main goal was to ensure that these programs are relevant to the job market and the demands of the economy are competitive by international standards and are able to create income-generating opportunities in the West Bank and Gaza Strip. During the fourth cycle of the project, QIF areas included programs for secondary schools (grades 11-12), upper basic schools (grades 5-10), upper basic levels (teachers of a specific subject area), unqualified but experienced teachers, and special education teachers. To improve the quality of education and the quality of technology education, six programs were introduced by the HEIs. These programs were utilized in the practical side of teacher training programs, tertiary science programs, and web education. QIF initiated its sixth cycle of the plan in 2010 to 2012 that aimed to improve education programs, such as science education, technology, social science language arts, and foundation disciplines, such as philosophy.
Second program is the Quality Systems for Quality Teachers (QSQT). This program began in 2009, was funded by European Union (EU), managed by UNESCO, and endorsed by the Ministry of Education (UNISCO, 2008b). The project's objectives were to improve institutional capacity and management of the teacher education system, to improve the status and motivation of teachers, and to enhance the relevance and coherence of the trained teachers in professional development programs. This initiative allowed some of the members of the MoEHE to pursue their PhDs in recognized institutions in Egypt and Jordan. Besides that, educators from HEIs were granted PhD scholarships to enhance their knowledge of human resources at teacher education facilities (MoEHE, 2011a). For example, educators were involved in courses like special education and ICT. Besides that, through these programs, educators from HEIs were able to be involved in international conferences about education, like the UNESCO Education for Sustainable Development Conferences. Partnerships between HEIs and European teacher education faculties were also enhanced by the program.

Another project is Teacher Education Improvement Project (TEIP), which was funded by the World Bank that launched in 2010. One of the main objectives was to improve the competencies and skills of classroom teachers (i.e., teachers teaching grades 1-4) who lack appropriate qualification and did not meet the new standards for teacher certification. The competencies were developed by CDTP and supported by UNESCO (MoEHE, 2011a). This objective was achieved through two types of interventions targeting teacher educators, student teachers, and unqualified practicing teachers. This project was to be implemented through supporting investments for the improvement of the quality of school-based practices and through supporting HEIs efforts in increasing the professional knowledge and skills of class teachers.

Additionally, the English School Partnerships project that began in 2008. It was implemented by the British Council in coordination with the MoEHE and UNRWA as part of the MENA regional project. The main goal of this program was to provide training for the English Language student teachers, and allow working teachers to have access to resources. The project also provided training for trainee teachers and undergraduate English students. The British Council has been involved in the running of
critical English language and teacher training program for the MoEHE and UNRWA’s in-service teachers. They were inline with the government’s goal of ensuring continuous improvement of students learning through enhancement of teacher and supervisor skills (Iter et al., 2015; Dajani, 2015). More than 5,000 teachers were supported from the program by the end of the 2010 academic year. It was planned for more than 10,000 English teachers to attend the training in the following years.

Another project is the Quality of Education for All through Partnership Project. Bethlehem University, with the support of the Spanish Non-government Organizations, implemented this intervention. It started in 2007 and ran through extended years. Its main objectives were to enhance Palestine's children's quality of education and to increase education that supports the integration of democratic standards and human rights through the creation of partnerships and active learning in schools. A number of interventions were implemented, including professional development, mentoring of teacher activities, and attendance of educational conferences and forums that would benefit teachers and students in public and private schools. Members of the HEIs also were benefited from this program through developing teaching skills of various subjects, such as English, Arabic, Math, and Science. Furthermore, the group was involved in the design of teaching resources in the Bethlehem University campus and other partner schools. The Zou’rub Teachers Resource Center was created. Additionally, the MoEHE supported the funding of another phase of the project expansion as a pilot model for national educational reform. This project was initiated in 2010 and commenced in 2014. The project includes more goals, such as the inclusion of students who have learning challenges, technology synchronization development, and the inclusion of modern learning methodologies and critical thinking theories.

Furthermore, the Model Schools Network (MSN) project was launched in 2007 and ran through 2012. Funded by the USAID and administered by AMID EAST, its aims were to create and manage institutional capacity in the school systems of Palestine (MoEHE, 2011a), as well as monitor and evaluate the teacher development programs. Its main objective was to develop a school improvement network to serve basic education level, as it introduced new approaches and contexts to train in-service teachers and engage schools.
in community development and extracurricular interventions. In partnership with the MoEHE and several organizations in Palestine, the MSN program was implemented. During its conception, the MSN program supported numerous private schools in the West Bank and Gaza by providing scholarships to students and a number of in-service teachers. The program was implemented in several public schools by engaging the MoEHE through District Leadership Teams, School Improvement Teams and DSQ supervisors. These measures were setup to ensure commitment to institutionalization and enhance the rate of some of the factors of the project that would be implemented in the long term.

Additionally, the Palestinian Faculty Development Program (PFDP) was developed in 2005 and administered by AMID EAST and Open Society Institute (OSI) to increase the capacity of the higher education sector and address long-term concerns on improvement in learning and teaching practices. PFDP was created under three main objectives: 1) Promote professional development through PhD fellowships and conferences; 2) The Revitalize and reform teaching in social sciences and humanities. This was achieved by the provision of these seminars: Excellence in Teaching, Master Trainers, and English for Academic Faculty, as well as seminars at Central European University; 3) Promote an institutional culture of learning and teaching. This was achieved through creating teaching centers, providing faculty grants, and giving out academic awards.

In addition, PFDP supported in-service teachers’ development and the Masters of Arts in Teaching (MAT) program which opened in 2009 at Al Quds University - Bard College. Al-Quds Bard selected students to receive full scholarships through AMID East's USAID-OSI grant. The expanding population of MAT graduates became a larger teaching community and the MAT faculty and graduates contributed to professional development initiatives for teachers throughout the region to foster and sustain continued school improvement. The program was structured around five disciplinary areas: Biology, English Literature, General Science, Mathematics, and History. It allowed its graduates to apply their new skills immediately in the classroom. Subsequently, these teachers served as mentors for MAT students including pre-service teachers. There are hundreds of students currently enrolled in the MAT. The majority is teachers, but also included are supervisors and principals. Moreover, a main goal of the PFDP was to build
the capacity of mid-level administrators within the MoEHE. Thus, Master’s degrees in educational administration, educational leadership, curriculum design, education policy, education technology, school counseling or special education for teachers and principals of public schools and Ministry of Education officials are developed.

Lastly, the Netketabi was a unique program aimed at representing a multi-dimensional opportunity for all Palestinian youth and children to acquire 21st-century skills. Its main objective was to provide Palestinian children with over 280,000 net book computers along with other services to students, such as net book maintenance, call centers, and content development. It aimed to benefit the students, teachers, parents, community centers, and members.

4.6 Initial Results Brought by the Implementation of TES

The MoEHE annual reports showed significant progress demonstrating the importance of education reforms in the previous 10 years in Palestine. Based on the latest MoEHE report (2018) as shown in table (4.1), the percentage of qualified teachers enrolled in professional education programs increased, as reflected in the National Institute for Educational Training (NIET) which administers qualification training for unqualified teachers. Qualified preschool teachers (all women) reached 31.6%, while those with continuous professional educational program were at 27% (MoEHE, 2018). Also, the percentage of qualified teachers of the Basic Cycle reached 68.3% and 51.5% for continuous professional education programs (MoEHE, 2018). The Basic Cycle for degree students actively involved in the classroom reached 13.2%, a low rate going by the expectations of the reforms (MoEHE, 2018). However, the actual time for teachers in the classroom reached a high of 74.4%, and 23.7% for students (MoEHE, 2018). For teachers, they spend most of their time in the classroom posing questions and lecturing, while spend it reacting and responding. Overall, student initiatives were at a low 3%. Additionally, the qualified secondary teachers reached 38.8% and 23.4% for trained teachers in the continuous professional development mentor programs (MoEHE, 2018).
Table 4.1

The Percentage of Qualified Teachers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program</th>
<th>Classification</th>
<th>Percentage of qualified teachers 2018/2019</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Qualification</td>
<td>Pre-school</td>
<td>31.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Basic Cycle</td>
<td>68.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Secondary</td>
<td>38.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional</td>
<td>Continuous professional education</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>for preschool</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Continuous professional education</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>for Basic Cycle</td>
<td>51.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Continuous professional education</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>for secondary</td>
<td>23.4%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: The Percentage of Qualified Teachers of 2018/2019

Regarding the management aspects of governance and accountability of the Ministry practices, the report showed a total percentage of 51.9% as in table (4.2). From the findings, it is important to note that results were the highest at the school level, reaching 74.3% compared to 55.2% at the Ministry and 53.4% at the Directorates (MoEHE, 2018). Hence, although progress was evident, more reforms are still needed to make the Palestinian education system more effective.
Table 4.2

*Management Aspects of Governance and Accountability*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Practice level</th>
<th>Percentage of the Practice</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>School</td>
<td>74.30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ministry</td>
<td>55.20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Directorate</td>
<td>53.40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>51.9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This chapter presented the teacher education reform movement in Palestine, including the rationale behind TES initiation, followed by the objectives of the process and key interventions and programs resulting from the movement, while the last section provided initial TES results. The next chapter will explore the methodology of the study, including an elaboration of the data collection methods and the data analysis procedures and techniques.
Chapter 5

5. Methodology and the Implementation Case

This Chapter presents the study methodology by defining the case study and discussing the justification of utilizing the case study methodology and why it is appropriate for this research. It presents the data selection procedures - including the selection of the case study and participants and access to the field. Then, it elaborates on the data collection techniques that include the data collection instruments and the procedures for conducting interviews of the participants. Additionally, it elaborates on the data management procedures and analysis, including coding strategies followed by a brief review of the researcher's personal interests and positionality, along with ethical matters and limitations. Lastly, this chapter provides an elaboration on the MoEHE as the study case of this research, which includes a brief review of the MoEHE’s background and historical development, its governance structure, administrative system and legislation framework, an introduction to its units and its strategic goals towards TES.

5.1 Definition and Design of the Case Study

The case study approach is suitable for an investigation that purposes to carefully scrutinize a phenomenon or problem within a given setting and time period. In most scenarios, a geographic entity or group of people is chosen as the theme of the study. According to Yin (2017), case study research is an empirical review that examines an existing phenomenon (the case) within it a real-life setting where the borders amongst phenomenon and the context sometimes are not obvious and in which various sources of data are employed. Additionally, case studies help in identifying essential relationships, processes, and factors (Rashid et al., 2019). Simultaneously, implementation studies traditionally have employed case study design to comprehend the dynamic process of the implementation (Goggin et al. (1990)).

Therefore, this research employed a case study methodology that uses a multi-perspective framework, through which I gathered and comprehended the collected data. By employing this approach, the inductive perspective provided a significant and deep understanding of the case. This approach was useful to my research, permitted the study
to highlight parameters of both the teacher education strategy implementation and the Palestinian educational context at large. In this sense, it allowed an analysis of the rationality, dynamism, and complexity of inter-relatedness of teacher education reform process within the complicated environmental context of Palestine. An important key to my research is the way the selected case “MoEHE” has implemented TES to reform teacher education in Palestine since 2010.

5.2 Data Selection Procedures

5.2.1 Selection of the case

The sampling techniques were employed for selecting the case study and interviewees as demanded by the nature and purpose of this research. According to Palinkas et al. (2015), purposeful sampling helps in selecting data with sufficient depth for a study. Additionally, selecting a case with prosperous capacity and input allows a great and deep understanding of the importance of the problem and helps the purpose of the study (Patton, 2014). Therefore, the research selected the MoEHE because it has the most relevant and critical information in regard to TES implementation. Selecting the MoEHE as the case of this study allowed for the identification of participants who know the deep and rich information of the TES implementation process. The MoEHE has been the main implementer and one of the most useful information providers. In this respect, and according to Hashwa (2011b), five major bodies are engaged in the TES implementation: the state, HEIs, schools, international organizations, and community in general. The state refers to the policy officials responsible for educational development in Palestine. This includes critically the MoEHE and its major units, such as the NIET, DSQ, CDTP, AQAC, as well as its most important developmental projects. Thus, the MoEHE is the major and the largest implementer and representative of TES implementation. In this regard, the MoEHE is represented the state that announced TES in 2008. Since then, the development and enhancement of teacher education reform in Palestine has been one of the main priorities and responsibilities of the MoEHE. Therefore, the MoEHE was critically and purposely chosen as the case for this research. Due to the nature of considerable large groups of involvement, this research focused only on the MoEHE and its affiliated units as the case study for this research. In addition, due to the restricted
circumstances and procedures the researcher had for collecting data, the single case was reasonable for me to collect sufficient data within time frame constraints, considering research instruments and global and environmental circumstances. Since this study looked for in-depth descriptive interpretations of the rationality, dynamism, and complexity of TES implementation to reform teacher education, it adopted the theoretical sampling technique with multiple strategies for the selection of interviewees.

5.2.2 Participants selected

According to the MoEHE (2011a), TES was administered and implemented by the following groups: leaders and administrators and educators from the upper and micro level of the major directorates and units of MoEHE, such as NIET, DSQ, CTDP, AED, and AQAC. These directorates were critically and conveniently selected as mentioned to cover the three major groups of implementers of the TES (leaders, administrators, and educators). Thus, this study employed the notional sampling technique with the diverse design in selecting the participants of the study, such as, the critical, convenience, and snowball samplings.

Critical case sampling ensures that the participants chosen for an investigation can create a strong impact and provide useful insights on other similar cases (Etikan et al., 2016). In this regard, Patton (2014) indicates that the investigation of a critical case does not amount to a logical generalization about all possible cases, but the technique can be used to ensure the participants' knowledge is the most critical about the implementation process. Thus, using this strategy assisted in identifying the most possible and influenced implementers from the MoEHE’s various units and levels. The MoEHE implementers, such as leaders, administrators, and educators who have the strongest involvement and they were the most responsive to TES implementation inquiries were selected.

Another strategy was used as it permitted the researcher to contact samples that were more attainable. The convenience strategy was an advantage for this study, and as the researcher, I used my familiarity to access the MoEHE's key individuals who had greater impact within the implementation process. Liu (2018) described such “elites” as useful for interviews as they are more knowledgeable and occupy critical positions which makes
their experiences beneficial to a particular area of study. Moreover, this process also employed snowball sampling, which is a no probability sampling technique that ensures subjects in the existing study recruit future subjects as a strategy of having strong subjects in the final sample (Parker et al., 2019). Thus, selecting participants as leaders, administrators, and educators who are the most involved from various departments allowed accessing a strong knowledge and information in regard to TES implementation. According to Hennink et al. (2020), participants with a better understanding of the study setting and topic are useful in collecting and interpreting the research data. These strategies of samplings that were employed enabled the researcher to recruit participants with more involvement in the implementation process of TES and it allowed to purposefully seek those who were vital to the study's purpose and frameworks.

In conclusion, TES implementation took place at the MoEHE units and directorates. Selected interviewees from the MoEHE’s directorates and distinct levels were assigned to specific roles (MoEHE, 2011a) and recruited to cover the TES implementation’s major path and projects. Critical case sampling was employed to ensure that the MoEHE as the study case created useful understanding and that the selected participants are the most representative of the implementation process. Other strategies, such as the convenience and snowball samplings, assisted in selecting the potential and most valuable participants from the three groups (leaders, administrators, and educators) at various levels. In short, the aforementioned strategies were employed to select the MoEHE's key individuals who had greater involvement and knowledge of the implementation process.

In consideration of the nature and purpose of this study, which is to examine the implementation process of TES (not the development or policymaking process), I deliberately and conveniently recruited interviewees from all the MoEHE's levels. To this end, the study recruited 16 participants who have special and critical involvement and knowledge of the TES implementation process. This included leaders, such as assistant deputy ministers and general directors, administrators of varied units, and educators from the training units. All the participants at the time of the interviews were employees of the MoEHE except one administrator who moved to work as a consultant in private educational sector but was nevertheless heavily involved in the implementation process.
Using the study's selection strategies and design, five leaders were selected to participate in this research (four males and one female). In general, leaders are defined as senior members at the senior level of the MoEHE for making decisions and governing the implementation of the national policies, including the implementation of teacher education strategy. Leaders in this study consist of two deputy assistants and three general directors. Leaders as general directors are defined as directorate directors (managers) and regularly participate in decision-making in regard to their directorates' responsibilities. They are also responsible for setting and reviewing policies, developing and planning programs, as well as preparing and following up with the Minister and deputy assistants about these responsibilities and activities. Eight participants (five males and three females) were administrators. The administrative position is categorized into two levels: The top level consists primarily of the head of the departments, and the second level represents the coordinators and secretaries of the directorates. The primary responsibility of the head of the departments is to lead and direct specific programs and activities related to TES recommendations. The second tier of administrators was tasked with following up on TES-related daily activities, coordinating with other departments, and arranging actions to implement specific tasks accordingly. Three educators were interviewed in this study (two female and one male). These participants are mainly from the training institute. The participants in this study at this level consist of individuals who hold teaching and training positions. Their main responsibilities are defined by designing and developing training materials, training teachers, and evaluating teacher skills development. Some of them hold an administrative position in addition to their training role.

As shown in Table 5.1, of the 16 interviewees there were five leaders (as senior leaders and general directors); eight administrators (as heads of departments and coordinators); and three educators (as teachers' trainers). Among the 16 interviewees, nearly one-third were female, nearly one-third were leaders, 2 were assistant deputy ministers, 3 were general directors at the MoEHE’s directorates, more than one-third (8) were administrators, and less than one-third were educators. Additionally, the majority of the interviewees hold at least a Bachelor's degree and at least one-third of them hold a
Master's degree or a PhD. It is important to indicate that most of the participants among the administrators and educators hold more than one position within these categories.

The impact of the dual role of implementers holding two positions will be discussed in detail in chapter 8 under the discussion of the overlapping roles and responsibilities within the implementation process.

**Table 5.1**

*The Participants Profile*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Groups</th>
<th>Pseudonym</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Age Domain</th>
<th>Experience in Years</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Leaders or General Directors</td>
<td>Ali</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>45-55</td>
<td>15-20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Jamal</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>40-50</td>
<td>15-20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Muraad</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>40-50</td>
<td>15-20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sara</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>40-50</td>
<td>15-20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tamer</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>50-60</td>
<td>20-25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administrators</td>
<td>Ihab</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>35-45</td>
<td>5-10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mahdi</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>45-55</td>
<td>5-10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mohand</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>35-45</td>
<td>10-15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mustafa</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>35-45</td>
<td>10-15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Rami</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>40-50</td>
<td>5-10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Reema</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>35-45</td>
<td>10-15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sama</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>40-50</td>
<td>10-15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Shaheera</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>35-45</td>
<td>10-15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Category</td>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Age Range</td>
<td>Contact Time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educators</td>
<td>Fadi</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>35-45</td>
<td>5-15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hala</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>35-45</td>
<td>5-15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hana</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>35-45</td>
<td>10-15</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Note: A profile of all participants from the three categories: leaders, administrators, and educators.*

5.2.3 Access to the Field

As a researcher, I had easy access to the MoEHE contact information and interviewees for this study. As stated, I worked years ago in the Palestinian educational system and at the MoEHE for several years. I still have friendly relations with a number of the MoEHE employees which enabled me to contact key individuals to conduct this research. On the one hand, sharing old experiences at the MoEHE facilitated communications with interviewees who I believe were trustworthy, open, reflective, and transparent. On the other hand, the process of translating the quotes was not easy as they gave the interviews in the spoken Arabic slang dialect. Using the literal translation from Arabic to English altered the meaning of some quotes and created confusion when reading them in English. Generally speaking, I tried to translate the quotes so that they reflected exactly what the participants said in Arabic. But in some cases, the translation focused on delivering the correct and exact meaning for the quote rather than translating it literally.

5.3 Data Collection

5.3.1 Instruments

Two methods were employed in this research: Zoom interviews and document analysis, while phone calls and e-mails were used as instruments for recruiting interviewees. I began communicating with several key individuals at the MoEHE in July 2020, but it was not until November 2020 that I selected the study participants and began interviewing them. Thus, the interviews were conducted between November 2020 and March of 2021.
Zoom meetings were prepared instead of on site and in-person interviews due to the Covid-19 pandemic and related travel restrictions. The purpose of the interviews was to gain an understanding of how the MoEHE implemented and responded to the TES recommendations. The interviews covered topics such as how the MoEHE implemented and responded to TES components, how it communicated and informed the relevant parties of TES components, and the entailed tasks at both the unit and directorate levels.

It highlighted the role of the implementers in the implementation process within the Palestinian context. Thus, the organization of the informal and semi-structured style was a proper approach for this research because of its suppleness and it allowed for an interchange of information (Yin, 2017). In other words, this research utilized informal interaction as the major principle guiding interview techniques and standardized open-ended questions (see Appendix -A for the interview protocol). Employing an informal conversational approach allows the researcher to explore the topic while ensuring high levels of flexibility. According to Agrawal (2019), such an approach is vital in giving the researcher the freedom to explore information in whichever direction that serves the purpose of a study. As a result of utilizing this approach, it became manageable to discuss the project components with the planned time. On the other hand, the standardized open-ended questions ensured uniformity during the interview with different participants.

In addition to the interviews, document analysis was also a complementary method for the data collection process. Basically, the document analysis includes reviewing the MoEHE reforming documents, such as TES documents, international evaluation reports for TES's programs, the MoEHE's strategic plans, teacher's new standards, M&E reports, PCPS reports of (2019, 2020a, 2020b) among others. This strategy is based on the proposition that employing diverse methods would provide affluent data collection for the study (Li, 2016). In this respect, Palinkas et al. (2015) emphasized the importance of combining different methods in comprehending complex topics. This approach was used as an attempt to collect as much information and data about the nature and development of how the MoEHE responded to implement TES programs and projects. These documents covered information about the MoEHE programs that set up to achieve TES goals and objectives. Additionally, the achievement that was brought by those projects
and programs of TES were reviewed. The documents were collected from different resources and analyzed to understand in-depth the implementation process.

5.3.2 Interviews

Interviews were carried out at several units and levels of the MoEHE correspondingly. Interviewing participants from the distinct units and levels, such as leaders, administrators, and educators allowed the researcher to explore different angles and pursue a holistic understanding of the TES implementation process. For instance, interviewing of participants who occupied the most important roles in the TES implementation process provided the researcher with broader dimensions and worthy information for the implementing process.

All the participants were interviewed informally by applying Zoom technology. They were interviewed once for approximately two hours, except two participants (one leader and one administrator) who were interviewed a couple of times for an hour. The first interview with those implementers did not cover all the components of the discussion and there was a need to address that in more detail. The researcher outlined and prepared the same questions that were based on the interview guide with a similar sequence for all interviewees. All the interviews were audio-recorded with interviewees' previous written consent, not to mention oral consent was acquired at the scene when the interviewees' preferred video calls to be played. All interviews were conducted using mainly the Arabic language and some English terminologies. Participants were informed to request interpretation for any terminologies that were used as necessary. Most of the participants had a very good understanding of English, except for a few who required some explanation when English was used.

Additionally, to ensure the reliability and validity of the collected data as “a chain of evidence” (Yin, 2017, pp. 127–128), several strategies were followed in the data collection process. Phone calls and emails were exchanged with interviewers to verify the transcribed drafts. In addition, various sources of documents were used in collecting data. Thus, the interview transcripts and these documents were triangulated to ensure data precision and narration. Finally, to ensure quality control over the reporting sources and
Despite the complication and difficulty of the process, repeated reviews and checks were conducted for “case study protocol” (Yin, 2017, pp. 84–94), including research questions, methods, and triangulation.

5.4 Data Analysis

As in a qualitative study, there is no solitary “right approach” to analyze data, rather than appropriate instruments that are relying on methodology and research purpose. The inductive approach is used to analyze data and is based mainly on classifying the raw data into main categories, then identifying the emerging themes and concepts into these categories (Azungah, 2018). In respect to the nature of the study, I employed the most suitable techniques for comprehending the occurrences and meanings of progressive and action-driven procedures. The most crucial was the analysis that took place during the study process and afterward, both in situ as well as post hoc. In situ, the data collection was discussed with the MoEHE’s interviewees, whereas post hoc reasoning leaded to the creation of discernments and assumptions concerning the process as well as its influences. Thus, the primary analysis began immediately when the interview was completed. Then data were transcribed from the taken notes and audio-recordings repeatedly. A rich dataset was collected for the purpose and nature of this research, namely tens of hours of audio recordings and more than 100 pages of transcripts in Arabic as well as English.

The analysis aims to acquire meaning from the collected data - and then to create, arrange, and code themes to reflect both stated goals and the theories of the study. Hence, the collected data was analyzed using an inductive process of identifying themes that supported by excerpts of the data, the theoretical frameworks, and analytical models.

The main findings were identified from the emerging and proposed themes based on the theories and study goals and at the end were interpreted and coded. The collected and supportive data for the coded themes add validity and credibility to the research findings. According to Blair (2015), coding refers to formal representation of analytical thinking, making it critical to have suitable coding techniques to ensure the most suitable is used in providing the best findings. Moreover, Creswell and Creswell (2018) indicate that
analyzing qualitative data obligates paying attention to texted data and preparing answers to study questions. Therefore, the study questions directed the data collection process and the grasping of definitive findings. Thus, in addition to the analytical model that was developed, the process of analysis also considered the themes that were persistent by the interviewees and the documents which were not highlighted directly in the theoretical frameworks. Ultimately, general dimensions were proposed from the data analysis and then coded. The analytic model for this study allowed me to look into several dimensions that are essential in understanding the TES implementation process. Based on the inspired analytical model of Li (2016) and the new developed model for this study, a major of six variables identified as the following: 1) Policy delivery and the MoEHE’s communication structure; 2) TES goals and objectives; 3) Involvement and implementers’ interaction and perception; 4) Evaluations and outcomes; 5) Characteristics of the implementing organization and resource availability, and; 6) Environmental challenges, such as the economic, political, and resource conditions (please refer to Chapter 6).

5.5 The Researcher Personal Interests and Positionality

I was born and brought up in Palestine. After completing studies at lower levels, I managed to enroll at Palestine’s Al-Najah National University. After my graduation from AL-Najah National University with a BA in Psychology, I taught for twelve months in a Palestinian private school, then performed duties as an educational counselor for the Ministry of Education and Higher Education in Ramallah for four years. Besides that, I dedicated myself for long period of time to work with women and human rights organizations which aimed at endowing and refining learners, women, teens, and marginalized persons in society. Hence, I am pleased that I took part in the fragmented education system of Palestine, while at the same time endeavored to bring forth liberty and help revolutionize the entire civil renaissance, especially under ongoing oppression. I was able to enhance mutual co-existence with other educational planners while I was carrying out duties as a volunteer with teachers and educators. This period enabled me to interact with renowned stakeholders in the education sector, a situation that helped in building my efficiency and effectiveness in the matters of educational planning and
implementation recently. Consequently, sharing skills and backgrounds concerning the educational structure helped in simplifying information delivery to contributors.

In 2004, I abandoned my occupation in Palestine and eventually settled in Canada. While in Canada, I spent close to 10 years working and volunteering, a process which involved accomplishing tasks with dissimilar agencies like communal and social institutions. Eventually, I was able to pursue a Master's degree in Education from the University of Western Ontario. As a Palestinian researcher residing in Canada, I have to turn out as a liberationist to improve the education sector for minorities around the world. Education enables individuals to realize that it is crucial to demand their rights. Likewise, I contemplate that education can also liberate people from oppression by first transforming the entire system and structure. I have always believed that teachers are the most influential factor that impacts the quality of education as well as the students' achievements. However, teachers should enhance their role, skills, and knowledge to improve the quality of education.

Conducting qualitative research requires the researcher to be aware of their own position throughout the study. Furthermore, the opportunity to return to Palestine and renew dialogue with educational stakeholders honed my communication skills with them. Thus, sharing experiences within the education system might facilitate communications with participants for this study. Thus far, even though I shared old familiar and contextual educational issues with the Palestinians, I trust that numerous modifications have been implemented in the entire education system. Similarly, the teachers' careers in Palestine and other parts of the world have also transformed to a greater extent. Therefore, I do not deliberate my efforts to be categorized as an insider academician. I am not currently an insider even though I had a chance to return to Palestine and work with a number of Palestinian educational organizations over the last decade. I believe, to such a degree, being familiar within the setting of the study and participants might facilitate communication with the participants and allow it to comprehensively describe the Palestinian context and the results of the implementation process (Toy-Cronin, 2018). In this respect, Gümüşay and Amis (2021) emphasize that the capability of the researcher to engage in the research is more essential than being an insider with a researched
community because this engagement obliges researchers to comprehend the research problem and context, as well as establish a relationship with participants. Accordingly, the position of being an outsider allowed me to draw an objective and reflexivity position (the reflex analysis to an acceptable level about the process of change regarding TES implementation and its impact on teacher development). While conducting this research and collecting data, I was not involved in any educational, administrative, or political activities related to the implementation process in Palestine. Therefore, there is a minimal risk to the participants. Consequently, this outsider position might also strengthen the creditability of findings of the study.

5.6 Ethical Matter and Limitations

Regarding the ethical issues, the letter of information and consent about this study was provided and introduced to the interviewees before they made a commitment to be involved in it. Thus, they were informed about the methodology, purpose of the study, data collection, and procedures. They were asked to sign a consent form for voluntary participation in this study. Interviews with participants were recorded with their consent. In addition, they were assured that they have the right to withdraw from the study at any time without harm. To protect their confidentiality, the participants were informed that no one other than the researcher may listen to the recording or use the raw data. Thus, their names were substituted with pseudonyms during the analysis and for future dissemination of the results of the study. However, the participants were informed that using pseudonyms may not fully protect their confidentiality and so they made the choice whether to participate or not in the study.

The study's findings are significant but they are not without limitations. According to Saidin (2016), insider researchers have the advantage of understanding the research population and are consequently more likely to interpret findings in the appropriate context. Insider researchers can define their study backgrounds and at the same time infer their discoveries. Sharing old experiences within the education system might facilitate communication with participants. Yet, in spite of this familiarity, I believe that a recent, diverse change has taken place in the education system and the teaching profession has been transformed in Palestine in the last ten years. Therefore, I do not categorize myself
as an insider academician. Additionally, I am not currently involved in any educational, administrative, or political activities for TES implementation process in Palestine. Therefore, there is a very minimum risk to the participants.

Thus, the researcher is an outsider to the research project but had to keep an objective position because sharing old experiences within the education system might reveal a potential bias for study findings. Despite the potential for bias, the objective standards necessary for the validity of the findings have been maintained. An act of developing into a prolific scholar from a similar social studied clutch is not as imperative as the scholars’ capability to take part in their study. On the one hand, the investigator’s commitment necessitates thoughtfulness of the study issues which can be noted by creating associations with the participants (Milner, 2007). This situation also obliges researchers to comprehend the research problem and context. Consequently, this outsider position it might strengthen the creditability of findings of the study. On the other hand, external researchers may attempt to compare a study group to other experiences. While the focus of the study was on education reforms in Palestine, the researcher made comparisons to the reforms in China's education system, albeit with context-appropriate modifications.

It must be noted that the application of a single-case method may be limited. Findings from a single-case study are group-specific, making them non-generalizable (Gustafsson, 2017). Consequently, the findings may not be applicable to other contexts in the absence of consideration of context-specific generalization issues. In Palestine, for instance, economic and political factors had a substantial effect on education reforms, whereas in China, culture was the most influential factor. Other factors may also be significant in other contexts, necessitating adjustments to the analytical framework each time the study is applied to a new context. Thirdly, there are limitations to the study's findings due to doubts regarding the credibility of the respondents. Because they have lived under Israeli occupation for many years, many Palestinians are still wary of interacting with outsiders (Abrahams, 2020). In other words, the human nature in general and because of the political and cultural contexts that may influence the participants’ conditions, the collected data may be affected to be untrustworthy, or the respondents might have had reservations that may have affected the quality of their responses.
In conclusion, the study would have been enhanced if the researcher had visited Palestine in person. A researcher is well-positioned to receive responses from all relevant respondents by visiting the site of a research project. Some respondents who are unable to utilize virtual technologies are excluded when virtual interviews are used. During the research period, the COVID-19 pandemic ravaged the globe and many nations, including Palestine, restricted entry. Therefore, the researcher could only collect data via Zoom technology. A one-year postponement of the study and a trip to Palestine would have delayed the findings and incurred huge costs that were beyond the scope of the research, resulting in both time and financial constraints.

5.7 The MoEHE as the Case Identified for this Study

5.7.1 A Brief Background and Historical Development

Following the Oslo agreement that led to the formation of a quasi-political system in Palestine, the PA emerged as the highest level of authority in governing Palestine affairs. With its new mandate, the PA’s role in the education sector began in 1994 when it formed the Palestinian Ministry of Education and Higher Education. It remains of historical significance considering it was the first major decision by the PA in Palestine following the Early Transfer of Authority Agreement between Israel and the Palestinian Liberation Organization. As per the agreement, the Palestinian Authority had education as its largest delegated responsibility from the Israeli control which made it necessary for the PA to create a whole ministry. The PA saw it necessary to have a full ministry for education as a way of ensuring it put in place effective policies that were needed to bring reforms and improve the quality of education in Palestine.

On the one hand, the PA deemed it necessary to divide the ministry because education was a priority from the outset. The authority took a significant step in 1996 when it established a new ministry called “The Ministry of Education and Higher Education and Research.” The new ministry assumed responsibility for higher education, while the mother ministry changed its name to “the Ministry of Education” and focused on basic education. In 2002, the two ministries were merged into a single ministry known as the Ministry of Education and Higher Education (MoEHE, 2008). A decade later, in 2012,
the PA reverted to its previous position by separating the Ministry of Higher Education from the Ministry of Education, before re-integrating them in 2019. Despite the 2019 decision, the ministry has been divided to have two education ministries. On the other hand, Palestine education was in ruins when the PA took over the Ministry of Education and major reforms were required to meet the needs of the country. Education in Palestine, like other areas of public service, were centralized under Israeli control. As a result, most institutions in the sector were neglected in terms of both human resources and infrastructure. When Israel occupied Palestine (West Bank and Gaza Strip) in 1967, the education sector was in the hands of a few foreign officers working as civil administrators. The few administrators had hiring and firing authority over teachers, as well as decision-making authority without consulting with other Palestinian stakeholders in the country. The centralized approach harmed Palestinian education greatly because most decisions and policies implemented were unresponsive to Palestine's educational needs.

Thus, when the Ministry of Education assumed responsibility, one of the most difficult issues to address was education curriculum. At the time, the country had two curricula in different parts, with the Egyptian curriculum applicable in the Gaza Strip and the Jordanian curriculum applicable in the West Bank. As a result, the Ministry of Education made curriculum integration a priority. In response, a five-year plan was implemented from 2000 to 2005. During this time, the plan implemented a single curriculum for grades 1 through 11. In 2006, the ministry completed the grade 12 syllabus, which was then implemented through scholarships in the following years. The ministry included Civic Education, Technology, Christian Education, Arts and Crafts and National Education in the new curriculum. More changes included the introduction of English Language in the first grade rather than the fifth, as previously stated. After 2007, the second strategic plan was launched followed by the third and fourth in 2014 and 2017.

5.7.2 Legislation, Administration and Governance of the MoEHE

Prior to the Oslo Accord, foreign policies had a significant impact on Palestinian governance. Since 1967, the education sector has been governed by Jordanian and Egyptian laws, as the primary curricula in the West Bank and Gaza Strip were
respectively followed. However, with the establishment of the PA, which formed the MoEHE, things took a new turn. Beginning in 2004, the PA prepared a draft Law on Education with the approval of the PLC. The law established education as a fundamental right and charged the Ministry of Education with ensuring and guaranteeing that all citizens, including students, professionals and people of all ages, have access to it. The law was later amended by the Amended Basic Law, which made basic education not only a right, but also a requirement for all Palestinians. To ensure that everyone meets the mandatory requirement, the amendment included the basic education in Palestine. The law states that, “Every citizen shall have the right to education. It shall be compulsory until at least the end of the basic level. Education shall be free in public schools, institutes and institutions.” The law has been ratified and approved by the Council of Ministers making it part of the core laws that govern the country.

According to the law, there are two levels of education: Pre-school age for which the children aged between 3 years and five years are admitted, and General Education from the 1st grade to the 12th. General Education is also divided into two stages: (a) Basic Education: This is the compulsory level of education from grades 1 to 9. There is the lower basic from grades 1 to 4 and the upper basic from 5 to 9. The lower basic level of education was also referred to as the preparatory, while the upper basic education is an empowerment. (b) The Secondary Stage: This is the take-off level of 10, 11, and 12 with various divisions. At this stage, there is Vocational and Technical Education and Academic Education. Vocational and Technical training comprises of commerce, apprenticeship, home economics, tourism, local industries, and agriculture. Furthermore, the academic education splits into the human sciences and the scientific streams, with the students having the choice to choose.

In this regard, the schools are classified into clusters: Government, private, and UNRWA. The table below (Table 5.2) shows the outline of statistics based on PCBS data of 2019, 2020a, and 2020b. The data shows the governance of the education sector has the 73.4% under the national government, UNRWA administered 12.1% whereas the private sector accounted for 14.4% of the total number of schools. By scholiast year of 2020, there were
2,259 schools with more than 859,245 students. The total number of teachers at all stages was at 59,346 teachers representing a significant increase.

**Table 5.2**

*Number of Schools and Supervising Authorities*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Supervising Authority</th>
<th>Government</th>
<th>UNRWA</th>
<th>Private</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Schools</td>
<td>2,259</td>
<td>372</td>
<td>443</td>
<td>3,074</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students</td>
<td>859,245</td>
<td>327,210</td>
<td>270,963</td>
<td>1,309,165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage Schools 19/20</td>
<td>73.49%</td>
<td>12.10%</td>
<td>14.41%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teachers’ 19/20</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>59.346</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Note: Number of schools by Supervising Authority 2019/2020*

Furthermore, the PA through the MoEHE has made additional changes in the education sector by amending education laws to meet Palestine's needs. The 2018 and 2019 amendments were drafted and approved by the Council of Ministers recently. The most recent amendments vested the MoEHE with the responsibility of directing education in Palestine, including the administration, organization and growth of the education sector. Directly, as is the case with public institutions, or indirectly, as is the case with private institutions, the MoEHE manages the education sector. The roles of the Ministry of Education and Higher Education apply to all education sectors, including preschool, grades 1 through 12, and non-formal and higher education institutions including technical and vocational institutions. In addition to its management responsibilities, the Ministry of Education and Higher Education engages other government institutions, civil society, and international organizations to ensure effective planning of the education sector. In addition, the MoEHE drafts and enacts regulations for higher education institutions. The
Ministry of Education and Higher Education partially funds non-governmental higher education institutions. Even though higher education is largely autonomous, it must still adhere to the rules established by the Ministry of Education and Higher Education and implemented by the deputy minister for Higher Education in accordance with the Higher Education Law of 1998. The law of 1998 grants citizens access to higher education and provides a framework for the implementation of higher education and its legal standing. Since the passage of the 1998 law, higher education has been divided into four categories: government institutions, public institutions founded by non-government organizations, united nation (UNRWA) institutions and private institutions.

On the one hand, the higher education system is the responsibility of the MoEHE and governed at two levels; macro and micro. The first level includes the Ministry of Education and the Higher Education (MoEHE), the semi-autonomous Accreditation and Quality Assurance Commission (AQAC), the Council of Higher Education (CoHE), and the Education Committee at the legislative council of Palestine (MoEHE, 2008). The micro level of the governing forms within the HEIs include: The College Deans’ Committee and the Boards of Trustees (BoTs) for public Institutions; and the Board of Directors (BoDs) for private ones. The institutes of higher education are usually governed by boards of directors.

The Accreditation and Quality Assurance Commission was established in 2002 with the mandate to permit HEIs and its activities upon being advised by the Advisory Council of Higher Education (MoEHE, 2008). The Accreditation and Quality Assurance Commission comprises a chairman who is an appointee of the Minister and other 12 professional board members and has been given the role of adopting the conclusive decisions on issuance of a license and accrediting HEIs programs. The board members include four members representing the local colleges, three members connected to the organization of Palestine, two members from the Ministry of Planning, one from the lower sectors of education, and the other one from UNRWA. The AQAC performs its duties under the supervision of the Ministry of Education and Higher Education as directed by the Minister.
In the 1970s, the advisory Council of Higher Education (CoHE) was established as a governing body with the responsibility to coordinate, supervise, and fund HEIs that existed before the foundation of the PA. CoHE was reactivated under Higher Education Law No 11, in 1998. In 2003, the CoHE continued its existence based on the bylaws drafted by the MoEHE. According to these bylaws, the Minister of Higher Education became the head of the Council and was assisted by the presidents of universities in public and private institutions. Other positions include undersecretaries from the ministries of Planning, Education and Higher Education, and Finance. The colleges and communities would also have representatives in the Council. The draft law gave the Council of Higher Education the mandate:

1. To develop, ratify, and approve higher education policies.
2. To develop a way of assessing all aspects of education and guarantee coordination between the institutes of higher learning.
3. To establish the rules and principles of admission and assessment of students every year.
4. To review and renew the annual budgets of higher education institutions.
5. To discuss and assess annual reports by institutions of higher learning to establish the work in progress and ensure that they comply with the rules and regulations based on the policies of higher education.
6. To approve of the policies that touch on student assistance programs.
7. To ratify and promote the education policies at the national level at the institution.
8. To look into the use of funds within the institutions of higher learning.

In addition, The Council of Higher Education is instrumental in distributing government support and funding within institutions of higher learning. It also looks into the loan policies and ratifies the admission policies. The Council also looks into the cost of living and economic conditions and prepares the standard cadre scale of expenditure in all public universities. Law No.11 of 1998 mandates the legal framework for the establishment of CoHE. Through the law, CoHE is headed by the ministers under the ministries of Education Higher and Education. Other members include heads of universities, eight academics,
secretary-general, deputy ministers in planning, finance, and two-year community college deans. The law is there to help higher education promote the need for people to pursue higher education. The Law of Higher Education of 1998 set the legal status of its institutions and provided the legal framework for its organization and management” (MoEHE, 2008).

The amendment of the Higher Education Law No.6 of 2018 grants every citizen the right to complete his higher education (Article 2). The law clarifies the legal status of higher education institutions and provides them with the legal framework for organization and management. The law defines four governing bodies in the institutions of higher learning. These are:

1. Governmental: The PA which helps with financing under the Palestinian MoEHE. It operates in both Gaza Strip and West Bank regions.
2. United Nations of Relief and Works Agency (UNRWA): The main provider of education for Palestinian refugees in Palestine and the Arab regions. It facilitates free primary and secondary education for refugee children. Additionally, they offer technical and vocational training for Palestinian youth, trains teacher and provide scholarships for refugee students.
3. Private Agencies: These include education foundations, religious groups, charity organizations, individuals, and companies that offer support to the education process in the country.
4. Public: Institutions that were set up before PNA. They are non-profit organizations that charity institutions mainly own. They only get partial funding from the government.

In conclusion, the MoEHE is the overarching body in charge of overseeing and governing education in Palestine. The Ministry performed most of the roles of education system authorized by Palestinian Authority which it has been facilitating the human resource roles, including the need to administer the salaries for the government-employed teachers. Additionally, the ministry's role is to develop education policies for all educational levels, from preschool to higher education. The policies not only provide
enrollment opportunities for all citizens, but they also help to improve educational quality by developing an effective human workforce comprised of teachers and administrators.

5.7.3 The MoEHE’s Units and Strategic Goals towards TES

In 1994, the PA gained control of the education system. Its largest responsibility in the nation is the education sector, which it carries out through the MoEHE as a major stakeholder. The MoEHE became the most critical body in the education sector. It took responsibility for the administration and funding public schools in addition to supervising private schools (MoEHE, 2020). However, the ministry would have to confront and solve the challenges that have faced the education system over time and develop a new system to unify the entire education sector. Thus, the entire school system has been gradually unified and adheres to the same curricula, identical class periods, and structure.

Furthermore, the MoEHE is committed to ensuring that all Palestinian citizens are capable of carrying out their responsibilities in an efficient and competent TES (MoEHE, 2018). Therefore, the ministry is responsible for appointing teachers, training in-service teachers and establishing pre-service teacher education programs to ensure that all teachers have the necessary skills to carry out their responsibilities. After the initiation of TES in 2008, the MoEHE has taken substantial steps to set up the essential departments and units, such as NIET, DSQ, CTDP, AED, and AQAC. These units play key roles to implement the national educational policies, to enhance the quality of education and to ensure the teacher education reform process. Thus, there are five major units that were related to the TES implementation process.

The Commission for Developing the Teaching Profession (CDTP) has been the one of the main units that responsible for TES implementation. It was established in 2009 and has integrated into the MoEHE structure while CDTP Advisory Board took responsibilities in reviewing policy changes, such as standards, teacher rank and promotion, and code of conduct, among others. The commission was assigned to submit recommendations to the MoEHE and develop program standards for various teacher education programs at HEIs, including special education and school counselors, as well as continue the teacher professional development and principal and supervisor
educational programs. The process also included identifying the teacher rank promotion requirements according to learning level and taught subject and setting up the regulatory mechanisms for evaluation and teacher licensure.

Second, the Accreditation and Quality Assurance Commission (AQAC) was established in January 2002 to develop the quality of Palestine’s higher education programs and institutions by reviewing the standards for existing programs and developing new mechanisms and assessment procedures. It was also given the responsibility to license and accredit new academic programs.

The third unit is the Directorate-General for Supervision and Qualification (DSQ) whose main objective was the supervision of teachers. DSQ has over hundreds of supervisors (subject and resident supervisors) working across the MoEHE’s directorates (Mudieriat), and each directorate has a staffed DSQ division of subject supervisors. DSQ has two departments: Supervision and Teachers and Principals Qualification. A usual role of DSQ supervisors is the training of the directorates' teachers, including one-on-one coaching. It was also involved in programs related to TES, such as, WB Teacher Education Improvement Project, Al Quds University BARD’s Master of Arts in Teaching program, Bethlehem University in-service teacher qualification program, and AmidEast’s MSN Program in-service teacher development.

Additionally, the National Institute for Education Training (NIET) was established 2004 and taken responsibility in 2005. Its main responsibility is to focus on professional development programs. In regard of TES, NIET was strongly involved in WB programs by supporting TEIP implementation. Its main role concentrates on building the MoEH’s HR capacity and providing at least four accredited professional development diplomas. Currently NIET administers eight professional development programs, four of them are accredited by AQAQ and four have been developed. Finally, the Assessment and Evaluation Department (AED) serves a role in conducting assessment and preparing indicators provided to policy committee assisting in decision making. AED is an essential MoEHE body which participated in TES implementation and its linkages to assessment and evaluation.
In conclusion, the development of the education sector made paid off and helped it become a leading sector in providing services provided by PA. Preliminary MoEHE data for 2020/2021 indicates that the number of newly-enrolled students in various education programs has increased to 13,398 students with 6,432 enrolled in the education programs at traditional universities, 771 in universities colleges, 401 in community colleges, and 5,794 in Al Quds Open University. These HEIs for the same year graduated 9,896 students with 5,458 from traditional universities, 527 from university colleges, 54 from community colleges, and 3,857 from Al Quds Open University.

Aside from developing a framework and ensuring that the education sector has the necessary human resources, the ministry also evaluates higher education institutions. There are two levels of evaluation: internal evaluation and external evaluation. Internally, the assessment focuses on students, staff, and faculty, as well as quality assurance of documented work and identifying areas for improvement. External assessment, on the other hand, includes quality assurance features to ensure that the quality of education provided in institutions of higher learning serves the purpose of educating Palestinians. The key features of the external assessment ensure that "fitness for purpose" and "standard-based" approaches are used appropriately, and that both accreditation and quality audit options are used (Al Subu, 2009; MoEHE, 2020). External evaluations apply to all educational institutions, whether public or private, university or non-university, and all academic and vocational education programs. Institutions that provide education in Palestine are subject to external evaluation by the Ministry.

In summary, the chapter discussed key topics in regard to the research methodology from the selection of the study case (MoEHE) to the data selection, collection, and management procedures. It began with an elaboration of why this research utilizes the case study method, then explained the selection procedures of the case study and participants. Afterwards, it presented the data collection methods and techniques, including the interviews and interviewing the participants, the data management methods, the researcher's personal interests and positionality, and finally the ethical matters and limitations of the study. The last section provides a brief background and history of the case study (MoEHE), then it elaborates on the MoEHE’s national legislations,
administrative system, and governance structure, followed by the MoEHE’s units and its strategic goals toward TES. Chapter 6 will present a comprehensive review of the theoretical framework with a presentation of the analytical model and its six research variables.
Chapter 6

6. Theoretical Frameworks

This chapter introduces the theoretical Framework including the analytical model that is employed in approaching the study on teacher education reform in Palestine. A theoretical framework serves the important purpose of connecting a researcher to existing knowledge about a research topic. According to Cox et al. (2021), a theoretical framework holds for a research study's theory, making it easier to explain the underlying problem that the study is attempting to solve as well as the efficacy of the suggested solutions in resolving the problem. Unlike other social science research topics, policy research, such as the current study, necessitates a variety of inquiries in order to gain a better understanding and analyzing of a policy and its effectiveness in implementation.

Dunn (1994), cited by Li (2016), defined policy analysis as a social science discipline that uses multiple methods of inquiry to communicate policy-relevant knowledge. In order to understand how to effectively implement a policy within its context, theoretical frameworks for policies take a multi-perspective approach.

A multi-perspective approach to policy analysis involves the interaction of various ways of understanding the policy implementation process. A multi-perspective approach, according to Figueiró et al. (2022), entails having multiple “understandings” as a means of elucidating what is functionally operational about a policy. Furthermore, according to Li (2016), a multi-perspective approach is an interdisciplinary inquiry into a social reality with the goal of gaining a comprehensive and alternative understanding of the policy implementation process. It is a distinct method of policy analysis based on the policy's rationality, complexity, and dynamism. As stated in Chapter 1, the goal of this research is to look into the implementation of the TES policy in Palestine, specifically the complexity, dynamism, and rationalism of the process. As a result, this study inspired by and duplicated Li’s (2016) framework in designing an analytical model effective for investigating the TES implementation process within the context of Palestine.

Although not novel, the use of a multi-perspective approach to understanding policy implementation has had a significant impact on reforming and developing valid theories.
As mentioned, Dunn (2016) defined policy analysis as a multidisciplinary inquiry process in assessing the relevance of a particular process in the context of analyzing a policy using the multi-perspective approach. On the one hand, such a process can be overly descriptive by focusing on causes and consequences (Elyan & Al-Doulat, 2021). Theoretical frameworks that adhere to such designs are regarded as traditional and appropriate for social sciences. Public policies, on the other hand, such as education policies, are complex in nature and will thus involve multiple issues beyond the traditional process's "cause" and "consequence" simplicity. As a result, because government policies involve a wide range of social and economic issues, complex frameworks are also required to gain significant insights into the implementation process (Li, 2016). Because TES is a government policy, it will necessitate a sophisticated theoretical framework that takes into account all of the issues that arise in the context in which a policy is implemented.

So far, it has become clear that a public policy, which is the context of the current study, is advocated to apply multiple perspectives for a variety of reasons. First, a public policy is rational because it is aimed at achieving specific goals that are extremely important to the public (Li, 2016). According to Andrews (2017), rational decision making is a type of behavior that is appropriate for achieving specific goals within given conditions and constraints. Second, due to the dynamic nature of policy development and the need to accommodate conflicting interests of multiple stakeholders, implementing a public policy necessitates critical thinking. According to Han and Mills (2021), a dynamic policy allows policy implementers to make changes based on changing circumstances, requiring a policy to be both flexible and adaptive. The dynamic element acknowledges that policies affect different people with different interests, which may change over time. Finally, implementing a public policy is difficult. In the context of complexity, Li (2016) argued that implementing a public policy involves a plethora of issues within the public sphere, all of which have significant implications for the policy, such as the prevailing political and economic factors. Palestine's TES policy for education reforms fits the three categories of describing a public policy, making it critical to understand its implementation process from multiple perspectives.
Li's (2016) model was built on previous theoretical models while studying the implementation of education policy in China using a multi-perspective approach. First, Li's (2016) model was inspired by a rational framework that focused on human behavior in policymaking. The rational framework was built on the assumption that human behavior is rational on purpose (Jones, 2017). Second, the model constructed from the critical framework, which was more concerned with issues of ‘power and justice’ in the context of the policy’s implementation (Ramahi, 2019). Furthermore, the model borrowed from Van Meter and Van Horn's (1975) policy implementation system, which was limited to the economic, social and political conditions affecting policy implementation, as well as Sabatier and Mazmanian's (1980) model, which recognized the effects of political and environmental factors (Li, 2016). As a result, adopting a single model was obviously insufficient nor effective, driving Li (2016) to rethink ideas from various systems by designing a new theoretical framework to contextualize educational reforms in China. The impact of culture on implementing education policy was one of the most critical components introduced in Li's (2016) model, a dimension that was missing in previous models. According to Weiner and Higgins (2017), culture has a significant impact on influencing teaching and learning and, as a result, on implementing education reforms. As a result, Li's (2016) model was created specifically for studying China's educational reforms. As a result, despite being a good theoretical framework, developing a model for understanding the implementation process of education policy reforms in Palestine requires adjustments and redesigning.

In keeping with the current study's goal, an effective theoretical framework will aid in scrutinizing and gaining insights into how the MoEHE has responded to the implementation of TES policy in Palestine. The model must address the elements of rationality, dynamism, and complexity, as these three have been found to be critical in determining the effectiveness of government policy (Li, 2016). Concentrating on the three elements will aid in ensuring that a new model recognizes the differences between China and Palestine and transforms Li's (2016) model to make it applicable in the Palestine context. Palestine, as a unique country, has unique factors that necessitate a theoretical framework that is sensitive to the underlying factors in order for the framework to have a significant impact in interpreting and evaluating the implementation
process. Shinn (2012), for example, expressed concerns about the influence of international actors, such as the World Bank in Palestine education reforms, a factor that did not exist in China education reforms. Thus, the unique factors that China faced at the time of Li’s (2016) are different, necessitating adjustments to ensure a new design based on Li’s (2016) model but focused on understanding the education policy implementation process in the context of Palestine. As a result, understanding the role of the rational framework, critical framework, and Li’s (2016) education reform model in developing an effective theoretical framework for understanding education policy implementation in Palestine is critical, as they form the foundation of a redesigned model specific to Palestine's context. The end result is with a new theoretical framework with new variables that aid in understanding the process of TES policy implementation in Palestine.

6.1 The Concept of Perspective and Multi-Perspective Approach

As stated in the introduction to this chapter, a multi-perspective approach serves as the basic foundation of a framework for understanding the process of TES policy implementation in Palestine. In addition to understanding why such an approach is more effective than the most conventional concept of perspective, it is also important to develop an understanding of why such an approach is more effective than the most conventional concept of perspective. In social science research, a perspective is defined as a way of viewing the phenomenon under investigation that is based on predetermined philosophical assumptions that guide the researcher's thoughts and actions (Seck & Honig, 2012). Perspective, as defined by Joel Charon, an American sociologist, is a position in which individuals stand when creating knowledge about a reality (Charon, 2012). According to his understanding, human beings perceive reality through various lenses, resulting in various ways of making sense of reality. In academia, the various ways represent different disciplines that are important in creating important insights about a research topic. The current study is concerned with comprehending the policy-implementation process as a topic that can be viewed or comprehended from various perspectives or disciplines. As a result, developing a theoretical perspective makes it
easier to have a theoretical perspective useful in understanding a policy implementation process.

Regardless of how important a perspective is in understanding a policy, researchers must remain open to multiple ideas and approaches to understanding a policy and its implementation. Indeed, Charon (2012) criticizes using a single perspective to understand a policy because it limits the level of understanding that others are likely to have when using multiple perspectives. As a result, researchers need to employ multiple perspectives, introducing the concept of a multi-perspective approach to understanding the policy implementation process. A multi-perspective approach, according to Li (2016), is an interdisciplinary approach used by researchers to create an understanding of societal reality. In contrast to the single perspective approach, a multi-perspective approach allows a researcher to gain an understanding of social reality through the use of various disciplines, resulting in a more meaningful understanding of the topic under investigation. Levin and Greenwood (2011) argue that a multi-perspective approach is important for developing valid theories and methods of understanding reality. As a result of the expanded application of education to social issues, the concept has grown in importance in education. Furthermore, using a multi-perspective approach is more consistent with a research framework that refers to simplified representations of real-world aspects (Figueiró et al., 2022). In the same way that frameworks aid in the creation of relationships between various elements and how they contribute to the development or understanding of a topic of study, the multi-perspective approach aids in the creation of an understanding of a policy. As a result, a more effective framework for understanding the implementation process of TES policy in Palestine has developed through a multi-perspective approach. Having identified the multi-perspective approach in developing a theoretical framework for the current study, this study calls for the further integration of rational and critical frameworks to more comprehensively understand TES policy implementation in Palestine. Both the critical and rational are significantly desirable because both assumptions enable this research to include various dimensions of the implementation process.
The Rational Model of policy interpretation, which has its roots in the classical model of economics, employs scientific methods to solve policy problems (Li, 2016). The rational framework assumes a policy that is driven by means-ends, goal-oriented, and follows a linear progression (Khan & Khandaker, 2016). As a result, a policy implementation process must include a predetermined goal as well as a step-by-step process for achieving the goal. Using the rational approach is thus beneficial in developing the theoretical framework that highlights the steps involved in implementing TES policy in Palestine. Thusly, teacher education reform process in Palestine must be influenced by a significant local and international effort towards the country's drive to international imperatives. The rational perspectives are presumed due to their strong capacities for looking into the rational implementation of TES process that has been implemented by the MoEHE. In relation to teacher education reforms in Palestine, the rational framework plays an essential role in examining the goals and objectives of the policy as well as the interventions by the MoEHE. Here, policy actions are considered as the acute approach of fulfilling stated goals through the identification and elimination of the causes of problematic elements. This means that action theories can function as conceptual schemes. The assumptions of this rational framework need to be comprehensively employed in order to determine how they can compromise the efficiency of the policy implemented. Aside from the relevance of a linear approach, a public policy must be viewed in the context of the political and social activities in which it is implemented. As a result, it is critical to employ the critical framework as well.

Various educational initiatives can be seen as an echo to a power conflict and a struggle over social, political, economic, and cultural change. Critical frameworks, according to Li (2016), look into the dynamism of a policy by recognizing the value-laden approach of policies and the competing interests of stakeholders involved. In this respect, using the critical framework, a policy implementation process must consider the politics and economics of the environment in which the policy is implemented. According to Levin and Greenwood (2011), a policy's implementation process is only as good as the environment in which it is implemented. As a result, the implementation process will differ from one country to the next due to differences in political and economic conditions. Palestinians, as they have been under colonial power and are now under the
longest apartheid regime in the world, is apparently quite distinct from that in the USA, Europe, and China. Thus, the critical approach aiming for conceptualization of the Palestinian case calls for an examination of how the TES was implemented “against new forms of domination,” in consideration of environmental factors and external “global imperatives” (Taylor et al., 1997). From this lens, critical policy analysis, as for the Palestinian teacher education reform, is not viewed as a response from a homeostatic system to a functional mismatch that arises periodically. Instead, the changes are seen as continuing struggles where the interests of the individuals are conflicting, or there is contradiction among the stakeholders in consideration of political and economic restrictions and global imperatives. On the one hand, the teacher education reform at the national level conflict is proposed based on insights regarding the contradictions that exists between key players therefore it gives valuable insights on the nature of teacher education system in Palestine and the appropriate way to make informed reforms. On the other hand, the external influence of international forces on Palestinian's educational reforms, and as an essential context that might complicate the process, critical policy analysis has been a useful lens in understanding the dilemma of educational reforms in Palestine as a developing country. Thus, reforming teacher education in Palestine has been directed by strong international trends toward standardization, and the professionalization of teaching work. The conflict approaches provide that there are contradictions between three key sectors; education, super-structural institutions, and the state. Thus, in Palestinian case, the critical lens gives helpful insights into the international influencers of changes in the teacher education reform process. It also shows the motives behind various multinational organizations towards influencing educational reforms. The education system particularly teacher education reform in Palestine is examined in regards of those external organizations that have gone to the extent of imposing policies on the Palestinian reform process. This approach may help to understand the environmental contexts, and the nature of these factors.

6.2 The Fundamental Analytical Factors

Aside from rational and critical frameworks, an effective framework must also consider various analytical models. While frameworks aid in the development of relationships,
analytical models introduce assumptions into a framework that validate a theoretical model (Nilsen, 2020). One of the most important models for policy analysis is that of Van Meter and Van Horn (1975), which takes into account various variables that influence policy implementation. According to the model, a policy must remain responsive to transformations, goal agreements among participants, and policy consensus in terms of goals and objectives. As in figure 6.1, Van Meter and Van Horn's (1975) model was thus based on six variables: standards and objectives, resources, inter-organizational communication and enforcement activities, characteristics of implementing agencies, economic, social, and political conditions, and implementers' disposition. The model's emphasis on the connections between the elements involved in the decision-making process is significant. There is also the Sabatier and Mazmanian (1980) model, which has seventeen variables divided into three categories: tractability, a policy's ability to structure and control the implementation process, and political environment elements. Both models see policy implementation as a top-down and forward mapping procedure that necessitates a hierarchical structure to be effective (Pülzl & Treib, 2017). Despite the models' relevance, they were not without criticism, such as a top-down communication flow that ignores the relevance of grassroots staff ideas during the implementation process. Thus, as developed by Elmore (1978) model, the four organizational models examine the implementation process through the lenses of a systems management model, bureaucratic model, organizational development model, and conflict and bargaining model were also considered by Li (2016) in consideration of the critical perspective.
The previous analytical models and frameworks served as the foundation for Li's (2016) analytical model. Li's (2016) model focused on addressing the criticism leveled at previous models while designing a model with variables appropriate for the Chinese context when designing his framework. As a result, Li's (2016) model as in figure 6.2 took into account the variables and connections of other elements. For purposes of this study, the theoretical framework is based on Li's (2016) model, with the assumption that because the model is the result of combining previous models and frameworks, it takes into account all of their concerns. However, given that Li's (2016) model was designed specifically for Chinese education reforms, a new model tailored to the Palestinian context is required. As a result, when designing the framework for the current study, the multi-perspective approach covered and the Li's (2016) model were the most important aspects to consider. In particular in the following section, the framework explains Li's (2016) model, how it differs from previous models, how it is used in designing a new model, and how the new model differs and why.
6.3 Li’s (2016) Operational Analytical Model

Li’s (2016) operational model was created by combining Van Meter and Van Horn’s (1975) model, Elmore (1978) and Sabatier and Mazmanian’s (1980) models that included rational and critical frameworks in their designs. As a result, the model was an improvement on previous models that focused on addressing limitations while incorporating the cultural context of China, the country in which Li was explaining the implementation of education reforms. As shown in Figure 6.2, Li’s (2016) model had six variables, a two-way policy flow, a top-down direction, and communications as the main elements at the core of the framework. To ensure the model's rationality, dynamism, and complexity in explaining the implementation process of China's education reform policy, the model paid special attention to the policy actors' backgrounds, involvement, interactions, and attitudes (Li, 2016). Furthermore, the model acknowledged the critical role of sociopolitical factors, cultural patterns, and social change in influencing policy implementation. The six variables in Li’s model include: 1) Confluence of various educational policies; 2) Socio-political and cultural confluence; 3) Institutional mission, goals, and strategies; 4) Policy flow communications; 5) Implementers and participants; 6) Outcomes and evaluations (Li, 2016, pp.114-117). While analyzing the six variables is critical in understanding Li’s model in interpreting policy implementation process, special attention will be placed on elements that Li’s model maintained, as well as the new elements he introduced to understand the similarities and differences and achieve an understanding of how Li’s model was developed to fit China’s context.
The Six Dimensions of Li’s Model

6.4.1 Policy Flow and Communication

According to Lewis (2019), the clarity with which a public policy is delivered has a significant impact on how implementers interpret the goals, their role, and their productivity. Li’s (2016) model communication dimension is based on Van Meter and Van Horn's (1975) model, which stated that policy goals must be clear in terms of standards and objectives to achieve consistency, and Jenkins (1978), who identified policy initiation, implementation, and termination as critical stages that are dependent on communication quality. As a result, the communication dimension was important in Li's model because it looked at how national education policy was communicated, the channels used, and how stakeholders involved in education reforms were satisfied. According to Lewis (2019), communication is an important pillar in policy reforms because it simplifies the complexities for implementers, making it easier to follow,
understand, and deliver. As a result, the communication element was critical in Li’s model because it assisted in interpreting how implementation process participants understood the process and their role in it.

6.4.2 Institutional Mission, Goals, and Strategies

A policy's success or failure is determined by examining the consistency of the policy in achieving the predetermined goals. According to Enders et al. (2013), if a policy achieves the predetermined goals, it is an indicator of efficient and effective strategies, as well as the correct path toward an institution achieving its mission. The dimension was thus important in Li’s model because it described what the reforms were to achieve and the path that was to be taken to achieve that goal. Li (2016) was inspired to create the dimension by Van Meter and Van Horn's (1975) model, which examined performance using performance indicators, and Sabatier and Mazmanian’s (1980) model, which examined policy efficiency by comparing policy goals and outcomes. As a result, Li used institutional mission [China HEIs as the institution] as the goals of policy reforms and reforms as the strategies for accomplishing the mission.

6.4.3 Implementers and Participants as Stakeholders

There are important stakeholders in every policy implementation process, including those implementing the policy as implementers and those benefiting or planning the policy as participants. Policy implementation is a unitary activity from a rational standpoint, but from a critical standpoint, policy implementation is a political arena (Li, 2016). As a result, the dimension examines the roles of leaders and administrators as policy implementers, as well as faculty as participants in the policy implementation process. While incorporating the dimension, Li (2016) was guided by Elmore's (1978) argument that identified implementers' and participants' responses as having a significant influence on the policy implementation process. The dimension's main goal was to examine the rationality of a policy while also recognizing the political implications during the implementation process.
6.4.4 Outcomes and Evaluations

Whereas goals were important in defining the expected outcome, the dimension of outcomes and evaluations was required to determine the reality of the policy's impact and how it compares to the predetermined goals. Rationally, outcomes and evaluations measure a policy's consistency, whereas critically, outcomes and evaluations measure a policy's justifiability in the context of its implementation (Li, 2016). Li's model used policy outcomes to measure changes brought about by educational reforms in China, while the dimension of evaluation was important in presenting the perspectives of various stakeholders on the outcomes of the education reforms after the policy was implemented (Li, 2016). As a result, the dimension was used as a post-analysis dimension in determining the effectiveness of a policy after it was implemented.

6.4.5 Socio-Political and Cultural Confluence

Culture plays an important role in education. According to Souto-Manning (2010), culture has a significant influence on teaching and learning, making education reforms important within a cultural context. Sabatier and Mazmanian (1980) argued in their model that resources and attitudes are important variables influencing policy implementation. Although not directly referring to culture, Van Meter and Van Horn (1975) argued that stakeholder perception influences other policy dimensions. Van Meter and Van Horn (1975) identified the most critical elements as policy cognition, policy response, and intensity of response. As a result, Li (2016) was persuaded to interpret the policy implementation process while taking cultural values, political tensions, and behavioral patterns into account to effectively understand the impact of education reforms in China.

6.4.6 Confluence with Various Educational Policies

Finally, policy implementation in a country is inextricably linked to other existing policies. According to Li (2016), when investigating the effectiveness of policy reforms, it is critical to understand the challenges affecting the reforms as a strategy for identifying areas for potential future improvements. Using a multi-perspective approach, the dimension of convergence with various educational policies was sought to comprehend
factors that could impede or facilitate education teacher reforms in China. As a result, Li (2016) employed the dimension in determining potential areas that will necessitate additional reforms.

### 6.5 Comparison to Previous Models

Li’s operational framework, as a model developed from previous models, shares many similarities with the existing models. First, Van Meter and Van Horn's (1975) model inspired the components of institutional objectives, communication, and sociopolitical influences. Furthermore, the model contains significant elements from both the rational and critical perspectives of a theoretical framework. By studying educational reforms in the context of confluence from various education policies and sociopolitical factors within the context of China, Li’s (2016) model draws closer attention to the rationality, dynamism, and complexity of a policy. In addition to similarities, Li’s (2016) model added new dimensions to understanding the implementation process of education policies. While Van Meter and Van Horn (1975) and Sabatier and Mazmanian (1980) did not pay special attention to the element of culture, Li’s (2016) model gave the influence of culture a more prominent role in implementing education reforms. Objectively, the cultural element was introduced after ensuring that the implementation process was within the context of China, as cultural values and attitudes differ from one culture to the other and have different impacts on teaching and learning (Souto-Manning, 2010). As a result, understanding how Chinese culture influenced education reforms was critical to provide an accurate assessment of China’s teacher reforms.

### 6.6 The Research Analytical Model and Identified Variables

An operational analytic model is important for explaining teacher reforms in Palestine and how to effectively implement them and achieve the desired results. According to Li (2016), policy implementation and policymaking are intertwined processes in which policy outcomes are associated with predetermined goals. Furthermore, an effective model must take into account the socio-political changes that are occurring in the environment in which educational reforms are taking place. With this in mind, an operational analytical map for policy implementation must consider a policy's rationality,
collectiveness, and responsiveness in the context of the environment in which it is implemented. Thus, Li (2016)'s Operational Analytic Map serves as the foundation for creating an operational map for the current study. Using Li’s (2016) map is critical as it ensures the rational and critical thinking frameworks are part of interpreting the policy implementation process of the current study. So far, the emphasis has been on existing frameworks that investigate policy reforms. Based on the information gathered, it is clear that the implementation process of a policy will differ from one context to the next due to various factors that are unique to a specific state or region. As with Li's (2016) model, it was specifically designed for China due to the unique challenges that education reforms in China faced. As stated in the introduction, the framework for this study is based on Li's (2016) model, with modifications to fit the Palestine context. As a result, the current study's model, like Li's (2016), will have six variables, some from Li's model and some new to reflect the Palestine context. As shown in Figure 6.3, the six variables for this study are as follows: 1) Involvement and Implementer's Dispositions; 2) Economic, Social, and Political Conditions; 3) Policy Goals and Objectives; 4) Characteristics of Implementing Agencies; 5) Outcomes and Evaluations, and; 6) Communication and Delivery Structure. The six variables and their interactions form an effective model for comprehending the implementation of effective teacher education reforms in Palestine.
6.6.1 The Communication and Delivery Structure

The manner in which a public policy is communicated to implementers is critical. Because communication plays an important role in policy implementation, it is one of the variables retained in Li's (2016) model. According to Lewis (2019), policy communication is not only important in assisting stakeholders in understanding goals, but it is also critical in ensuring clarity of stakeholders' roles in achieving policy goals. Furthermore, the channels through which important aspects of a policy are communicated play a critical role in determining the efficiency and effectiveness of the communication process, which is at the heart of accurately implementing a policy. Communication
activities and structures in Palestine concern how the MoEHE ensures that all stakeholders, individually and collectively, understand TES implementation requirements. The communication activities of TES implementation in Palestine are especially important given a large number of stakeholders involved and the diverse interests and roles they may have in Palestine's educational reforms. As a result, it is the MoEHE's responsibility to ensure that communication activities and structures are consistent and clear to avoid any ambiguity that could jeopardize the TES policy reforms. As illustrated in Figure 6.3, communication is not only top-down but also bottom-up, as in Li's (2016) model, as the MoEHE implements the policy with the input of all stakeholders, including grassroots' implementers especially teachers, who are directly expected to use the reforms to improve their status as well as the quality of education delivered in Palestine. Also, the communication variable involves international communication between the MoEHE and international stakeholders that have a role in Palestine’s educational reforms. As a result, the communication structures allow for both backward and forward communication movement, as well as international communication to ensure that all stakeholders are involved and working toward a common goal of achieving TES goals and objectives.

6.6.1 The Policy Goals and Objectives

The goals and objectives of a policy play an important role in guiding policy implementers' actions. The variable is also taken from Li's (2016) model and is critical during the assessment process to determine whether or not a policy is successful. According to Birkland (2015), policy goals and objectives serve as the foundation for developing performance indicators that evaluators use to assess policy consistency in serving the intended purpose. In the context of Palestine, the study includes the variables of goals and objectives to identify and assess the programs and projects put in place by the MoEHE to implement TES reforms. The goals and objectives are evaluated based on their alignment and consistency with the of Palestine's education reforms outcomes. Teacher's new role and teaching profession development as main goals of TES were assessed based on their consistency with the outcomes.
6.6.2 Involvement and Implementer’s Disposition

Implementers play critical roles in the policy implementation process. First, their reaction to a policy will determine their willingness to implement a process. Implementers can respond positively, negatively, or neutrally to a policy implementation process, according to Li (2016). When implementers respond positively, high levels of commitment will be achieved. TES is examined using a variable that focuses on the perception of policy implementers toward policy implementation. Second, the role of the implementer is crucial in determining their involvement and contribution to the policy implementation process. As a result, the variable is used critically to investigate the MoEHE’s power and capacity in implementing education reforms. As a result, as illustrated in Figure 6.3, implementers are studied in context as the primary stakeholders initiating, and implementing policy reforms. Their reaction to policy reforms determined the goals and objectives, and their role and involvement also aided in explaining the significance and consistency of the goals and outcomes in reforming teacher education reforms in Palestine. The level of compliance of the implementers, their beliefs, acceptance, consistency, and access to resources all are important in understanding the policy implementation process. Besides the significant impact of implementers in achieving education reform in Palestine, the involvement of the international community must also be noted due to the international community’s political power over Palestine and international funders, such as UNESCO, World Bank, and NGOs, among others (Shinn, 2012). This explains why the whole design of understanding the policy implementation process is viewed under the confluence of the international community. The politics and economics of Palestine are dependent on international players make their involvement in educational reforms of greater significance.

6.6.3 The Characteristics of Implementing Agencies

During the policy implementation process, the characteristics of implementing agencies have a significant impact. Background, interactions, and attitudes were identified as some of the major characteristics influencing policy implementers in Li’s (2016) model. The implementing agencies' rationality or critical perspective on the policy can have a significant impact on how they perceive the complexity of implementing the policy.
Similarly, bureaucracies and hierarchies can influence decision-making, which has a significant impact on the implementation process. Additionally, the economic and political restriction within the PA political system and characteristics of implementing agencies including international community was an essential factor in this study. As a result, as illustrated in Figure 6.3, the variable of implementing agency characteristics, structure and capacity has a significant impact on how policy goals and objectives are implemented in the Palestine context.

### 6.6.4 Outcomes and Evaluations

The current study's framework includes the variables of outcomes and evaluations, similar to Li's (2016) model. According to Henry et al. (2013), policy outcomes aid in determining the efficacy of the strategy used in policy implementation, whereas policy evaluation aids in improving policy designs and implementation processes to achieve better outcomes in comparison to the predetermined goals. For the current study, the outcomes have examined from two different perspectives. First, the outcomes of the implementation process have explored in terms of the TES policy's consistency in achieving its goals and objectives. The viewpoint represents a rational approach to policy implementation. Second, implementers' personal perspectives have highlighted in light of the authentic changes that TES implementation brought about teachers' education in Palestine. The second viewpoint is based on a critical assessment of the policy. As a result, the goal of the first evaluation is to determine the implementer's rationality in implementing the policy, whereas the goal of the second evaluation is to have a critical understanding of the policy in terms of impacts on teachers' education, teachers' and teachers' socioeconomic development as the core elements of change in Palestine.

### 6.6.5 Economic, Social, and Political Conditions

The most significant difference between Li's (2016) model and the current study's model is the economic, social, and political conditions introduced in the current study as one of the main dimensions. In Li's model, these conditions were replaced with the cultural context which was introduced as having a significant impact on policy implementation in China. However, the cultural context of Palestine is not introduced explicitly and
separately from the economic and political conditions, not to mention it was also incorporated into other dimensions as well. On the one hand, the cultural aspect in this study can, in fact, be accounted for by the centralized characteristics of the implementing agencies or by the traditional attitudes of the implementer's dispositions.

Palestinian education, on the other hand, is heavily influenced by the country's complicated politics, which is confronted with post-colonialism from Israel (Shinn, 2012). Furthermore, the policy implementation process necessitates a significant investment of resources that the country's government cannot manage on its own. As a result, it is dependent on international funders, such as the World Bank, UNESCO, the IMF, the EU, and non-governmental organizations (NGOs) (Shinn, 2012). Because Palestine's political, social, and economic conditions are unique and complicated, they have a greater impact on policy implementation. The importance of economic, social and political conditions, as illustrated in Figure 6.3, implies that they are critical in determining the goals and objectives of the implementation process and they may impede real changes in TES implementation process. As a result, the policy's implementer, the MoEHE, must collaborate with international economic and political actors to make resources available in order to set goals and objectives for education reforms in Palestine.

6.7 Conclusion

The chapter's goal was to discuss the theoretical framework to aid in the interpretation of the TES policy implementation process in Palestine. The chapter presented Li's (2016) model to design the policy, which was useful in examining policy implementation in China. The chapter assumed Li's model to have taken care of preceding interests and frameworks, such as Van Meter and Van Horn's (1975) model, Sabatier and Mazmanian's (1980) model, the rational framework, and critical framework, among Elmore's and others, while designing the framework. The study’s model adopted six variables from the previous models, particularly Li’s. However, in contrast to Li’s (2016) model, the current study’s paradigm does not include culture as an independent dimension. Instead, the cultural aspect is integrated in the economic, social, and political conditions, the implementer’s involvement and dispositions, as well as the characteristics of the implementing agency. In addition to adopting Li’s (2016) model, the design employs a
multi-perspective approach to gain a thorough understanding of all factors influencing the implementation process. In the end, this framework has reflected the rationalism, dynamism, and complexity of policy implementation in Palestine.
Chapter 7

7. The Communication System and Delivery Structure

This chapter discusses the delivery of TES as the national policy for teacher education reform in Palestine through the MoEHE’s various levels. In other words, how the public policies were delivered from the MoEHE’s upper level to the lower level, or within different levels of its units and directorates. Thus, it illustrates the MoEHE’s organizational structure and style, communication and enforcement mechanisms, follow-up activities applied across units and directorates, as well as how these units and directorates (implementers) were interacted with and kept informed. This illustration serves as the first unit of analysis that sheds light on the complexity of the implementation process and analyzes how the MoEHE’s officials have facilitated the implementation process and aided subordinates (administrators and educators) in understanding policy objectives and strategies. Consequently, the examination of communication structure and style is the first effort to understand the rationality, dynamism and complexity of the TES implementation process. While it discusses the main objectives of the TES as a second unit of analysis, it elaborates how the MoEHE’s mission and outcome of the new teacher role has drifted and become inconsistent in responding to TES requirements for teacher education reform. Thus, this chapter begins with a review describing the administrative system and structure of the MoEHE, then it presents the type of the communication mechanisms that have been employed in policy development and the TES implementation.

7.1 The MoEHE’s Administration System and Structure

7.1.1 An Overview

The Oslo Accords led to the establishment of the first Palestinian Ministry of Education and Higher Education (MoEHE) in 1994. Consequently, there was a transfer of authority of the education system from the Israeli government to the Palestinian Liberation Organization. The MoEHE took over the education system from the military administration with much of the activities delegated to the PA. At first, the MoEHE was there to act based on both the Egyptian and the Jordanian laws which were influential in
the Gaza strip and West Bank regions. By 1996, the Ministry of Education and Higher Education and Scientific Research was established and took over the rest of the functions at the higher institutions of learning, while the original Ministry of Education continued to maintain other educational roles. The Ministries have since been merged and divided at different times as the country continued to find its footing in developing the education system. The PA has undertaken efforts to ensure that students go to school irrespective of age, social standing or professional category.

Thus, the MoEHE leads the educational sectors as the official body responsible for running, planning, organizing and developing all educational activities through direct management and supervision. The supervisory role includes technical and vocational education, planning and budgeting. In addition, the national strategic planning effort is led by the Minister of Education and Higher Education, through the planning and budget group. It engages with civil society, international organizations, and the private sector in the planning and development process. Additionally, higher education institutions work within the premise of the laws and regulations developed and enacted by the MoEHE. MoEHE partially supports and funds non-governmental HEIs. Those institutions are independent, but they have to apply the MoEHE’s legislative framework represented by the Assistant Deputy Minister for Higher Education (ADMHE). As mentioned in chapter 5, the PA enacted the Law on Higher Education which gave Palestinians the chance to access education and offered them the legal status of learning in any institution within the country. The organization and management of education within the country would also be part of the new law amendments in 2018 which recognized four different types of HEIs: governmental, public (established by non-governmental organizations-NGOs), UNRWA and private institutions. Most universities in occupied Palestinian Territories are public. According to RecoNow (2016), and in accordance with international norms, the Law on Higher Education No.11 of 1998 combines two approaches:

1. Central national planning and supervision by the MoEHE and council for HEIs and self-management.
2. Self-monitoring and self-control at the institutional level.
With such a framework, the HEIs have autonomy to handle the management and the educational process. They are responsible for ensuring the proper enrollment of staff members, admission, examination of students, and granting students their diplomas and degrees. Additionally, the distribution of higher education institutions according to their management is as follows: 11 governmental institutions, 17 public institutions, 17 private institutions, and 4 UNRWA institutions. The Higher Education Law also defines the types of higher education institutions and classifies them as follows: 1. Universities consisting of three, or more than three colleges that grant bachelor's degrees or higher; 2. University colleges that offer academic, technical and professional programs and grant intermediate diplomas through two or three-year programs, or bachelor’s degrees; 3. Polytechnics which grant diplomas or bachelors' degrees and higher degrees in professional and technical fields; 4. Community colleges that offer vocational or technical programs of no less than one year. The 49 Palestinian institutions of higher education in the West Bank and Gaza Strip are considered young institutions. More than 221,000 students were enrolled in these institutions in 2020/2021, and it is estimated that the total enrollment rate for the age group of 18–24-year-olds is more than 25.8%, which is considered a relatively high percentage according to international standards, especially compared to the Middle East and developing countries in particular. Similarly, the MoEHE is mandated to supervise and maintain different phases of education in Palestine, as it must ensure the implementation of new developments in the educational sector (MoEHE, 2011a). Moreover, it is given the mandate to ensure that those offering services in the education sector are regularly trained and have the experience to offer quality services to the learner so that Palestine has qualified citizens who can compete with others globally (MoEHE, 2008). For example, it takes on overseeing and banding together pre-service teacher programs as provided by the law (1998). Furthermore, it has to ensure that teachers are available by appointing them as necessary.

7.1.2 A Vertical Structure and Transformative Style
This section illustrates how the MoEHE’s communication style has been taken as a rational, efficient, and systematic way of policy delivery, and communication. As shown in figure 7.1, the MoEHE’s hierarchy of decision-making is usually top-down and linear.
The MoEHE’s structure operates vertically and is largely based on a transformative style of information delivery and communication. It employs a traditional vertical mode of operation and integration across subjects and departments. Decisions are often taken based on hierarchical position, not argumentative value and do not always involve the most informed stakeholders in decision-making discussions (MoEHE, 2013). The top level of the MoEHE makes decisions pertaining to what its departments are to implement, and which of its plans and strategies are a priority for implementation.

According to the MoEHE (2011a), policy development at the MoEHE level is the responsibility of the Policy Committee, made up of the Minister, Deputy Minister, four specialized Assistant Deputy Ministers, as well as the Director General for Infrastructure. The MoEHE Minister is maintained at the top level of the Ministry as well as the CoHE. Additionally, as a member of the top National Ministry Council, they regularly grant governmental agreement and support educational policies including TES and its implementation. They oversee the policy direction of discussions and their milestones. In regard to TES, the executive level has two tiers; the first one is the responsibility of the Assistant Deputy Minister for Planning and Development who orchestrate all TES activities, supported by various General Directorates (GDs) that report directly to the Minister. The GDs of various units are considered the main players tasked with following up on TES related programs, which include the NIET, CDTP, DSQ, AQAC, AED, among others. Another tier which is not included in this study consists of various local and international committees and task forces set up specifically to support TES. For example, the general committees, such as the National Taskforce on Teacher Education represents all local stakeholders that communicate about the implementation of the TES, and the International Advisory Committee on Teacher Education provides a forum for input from international stakeholders. Another level of governance which is not included in this study resides with the HEIs and their boards of trustees, where decisions are made about education program offerings in support of TES objectives (MoEHE, 2011a).
Figure 7.1

The Organization Structure of the MoEHE

Note: The figure is adapted from the MoEHE website, General Administration of Educational Planning Studies. Department / Documentation Department Third Edition / 2020 and designed by Ayoub from http://www.mohe.gov.ps/

7.1.3 Collective Effort Toward the Decentralization System

Centralization refers to the vertical and centralized organizational structure of the Palestinian political and government system. The characteristic of this structure is the
confinement of the decision-making role to a few individuals at the top level, and the lack of the delegation of authority to the micro level. In this respect, the long history of oppression of the Palestinian people has promoted the characteristics of this hierarchical structure. This history maintains more privilege for top level governors and governmental authorities and raises the value of obedience. Thus, the granted privileges for top level government have impacted the “socio-economic status and power relation in society” (Li, 2016). Traditionally, people in MENA countries including Palestine respect, value and pursue higher rank in society. For example, many employees of civil and governmental organizations are always seeking a higher position in their career. Consequently, it has become the dominant mentality of people to pursue higher position in society. Thus, in MENA societies including Palestine, traditional values are centered on respect of the top-level leaders and seniors and compliance with them, and, more importantly, encouragement of collective action instead of that of the individual. The positivity of such values can be seen in many collective actions particularly in pursuing national requirements, such as freedom, justice, and equity that are upheld by profound traditions.

In other words, the MoEHE’s centralized system occasionally plays a positive role in the TES implementation process. It may have contributed to “maximizing agreement” on TES goals and objectives and maintained momentum for effective implementation (Van Meter and Van Horn (1975, p. 460). On the one hand, historically, Palestinians have faced tremendous political and economic hegemony and usually overcame and coped collectively with such challenges. Regarding TES implementation, the implementers may have found the goals of TES as a solution that contributes to teacher education development and “social equilibrium” (Li, 2016). Thus, TES was a reflection of an agreement between the PA and civil society, namely intellectuals and the international community. For example, the MoEHE adopted numerous interventions and policies that aim to develop direct service delivery programs. It has shifted the ministry management into a results and accountability-based approach which it is supposed to encourage a higher degree of decentralization and community participation. Additionally, it has adopted a major objective to institutionalize the procedures of the sector-wide concept through a pooled financial agreement, or a “Joint Financial Arrangement” through
coordination with the different donor partners (Germany, Norway, Finland, Ireland and, more recently, Belgium).

According to the MoEHE (2017b) and most interviewee observations, there is a noticeable improvement in reforming the governance and management system as an effect of the collective effort of the TES implementation. Leader Muraad summarized some of these improvements and the collective effort of the MoEHE:

The MoEHE has been working at improving administrative capabilities, as hundreds of administrators and technicians have been trained so the number of administrators and technicians who received specialized training in their field increase annually... training programs are provided with specialized courses for administrative and technical staff, linking these programs to the adopted policies for the decentralization purpose... in addition, MoEHE has developed job descriptions of all Ministry employees in cooperation with the General Personnel Council, so these training programs have been reviewed and developed periodically, and funds have been made available for training.

In addition, new strategies have been collectively implemented for the improvement of financial resources in collaboration with international partners. GD Ali summarized the MoEHE’s effort in establishing the “JFA” group. He put it in the following way:

The MoEHE developed regulations to improve the administrative and financial performance of the education system... for example, the “Joint Financial Arrangement” is an important approach in enhancing relations with community as well as improving collaboration mechanisms between the Ministry and international partners... I believe such strategies would be very beneficial in making education services more efficient, effective, and transparent, and improving accountability for the long term.

In the same direction, Administrator Mahdi observed that the MoEHE also reformed the legal ground in order to build a modern teaching profession. He explained how the Ministry bravely endorsed amendment law in this regard:

New laws of education provision and higher education were finalized in line with international approaches and were ratified regularly... for example the law of 2017 and 2018 includes a lot of detail around the necessary steps to add legitimacy to the work of the MoEHE especially regarding the teaching profession... now it is possible to go forward in this component.

7.2 The Communication System & Enforcement Mechanisms

As stated previously, Van Meter and Van Horn (1975, p.466) pinpointed that robust execution requires strategy objectives to be unmistakably perceived by implementers. In other words, the examination of both the policy path and communication style is very important to understand the complexity of the implementation process (Li, 2016).
Communication is a key tool by which the policy goals and objectives are delivered, and implementers are kept informed about it. Thus, the following topics represent the first unit of analysis that examine the accuracy, effectiveness, and consistency of the MoEHE’s communication system that was used to inform the implementers about the TES standards and objectives. It investigates how TES was introduced and facilitated to implementers via the MoEHE’s higher level. It also presents which model of communication has been employed to deliver TES and keep stakeholders informed.

7.2.1 A Top-Down Flow

In detail, the governmental official communication structure including the MoEHE utilizes a vertical communication flow through a top-down style. Despite the fact that the MoEHE adopted a decentralization approach, decisions regarding TES objectives and strategies are taken at the higher level of the MoEHE’s policy committee, which consists of the Minister, Deputy Minister, and four specialized Assistant Deputy Ministers. The MoEHE Minister must endorse decisions and support educational policies to be implemented. Most often, after a national policy or law is formally endorsed by Ministerial Council (the Cabinet) and the Minister of Education, common mechanisms of communication are routinely employed by the higher level of decision-makers.

Basically, an official correspondence system is employed by sending a signed letter, or “Ketaab” in Arabic which literally means “the book” in English. The purpose of the “Ketaab” is to inform stakeholders about the policies, decisions, laws, regulations, instructions, legislations, and political mandates appropriate to a particular scenario. In general, stakeholders receive the signed letter “Ketaab” from the top level of management in order to proceed in any activities.

In terms of the routine communication for supervising activities and managing programs and projects, General Directors (GDs) take on a leading role facilitating related procedures and activities. GDs employ numerous communication mechanisms at the directorate level. The implementers, such as the head of departments, administrators, and educators are requested to attend special meetings, workshops, or micro-training sessions for discussion of their tasks. On the other hand, some of them may be invited to in-person
meetings with their GDs. Some other tasks may be coordinated by phone and email in addition to field visitation, brochures and websites uploading documents. In summary, the centralized style of communication and these participatory mechanisms are most likely employed for facilitating TES implementation. However, the official letter “Ketaab” that is ratified by the top positions is a must to release any tasks or policies and is politically powerful and authoritative, and has an effective impact on the implementation process and implementers. Thus, it is a common form to engage stakeholders (e.g., schools, directorates, universities and all governmental organizations, etc..) in getting acquainted with the policy obligation of the higher-level authorities.

When interviewees were asked about the MoEHE's communication mechanisms that they experienced in the TES implementation and about its effectiveness, accuracy, and consistency, they all confirmed the importance and effectiveness of the official letter received from the top level. They also mentioned the effectiveness of the participatory approach of communication that is routinely employed on a regular basis, such as meetings, coordination between directorates and administrators, e-mails, and phone calls (the Educational Information System is an official tool for uploading regulations and guidelines on the MoEHE’s website). For them, these forms were regularly applied and routinely used in delivering the national policy of teacher education reform at various levels. In addition, most participants agreed that the systematic communication procedures of delivering policies, particularly the official letter “Ketaab” from the upper level through other layers is obligated and powerful and effective to guarantee compliance and commitment to key requirements of policies.

Most of the 16 interviewees described how the official correspondence “Ketaab” was an essential mechanism through which the national policies were disseminated to lower levels. For example, GD Jamal assured that the centralized communication style of the MoEHE was common and the most effective form for informing implementers about policies and ensuring their commitment:

The MoEHE leaders usually communicate with units and directorates by sending official letters about decisions and requirements... In regard to TES implementation every directorate has its own responsibilities based on higher-level decisions and leadership... responsibilities can't be clear and formal without this formal way... It is good to know that the MoEHE leaders use various kinds of mechanisms including participatory types, but when the leaders want to be sure that the grassroots
level gets the information correctly and efficiently it is important to make it official... These are our norms and everyone is comfortable keeping it this way.

Leader Muraad agreed with GD Jamal about the importance of the major style of the communication and its mechanisms that most implementers are familiar and comfortable with. He also confirmed the usage of the participatory style by saying:

Daily official correspondence is a major way of communication at all levels and it is the way everyone is familiar with and accepts... the MoEHE utilizes it for informing its employees about policies and tasks. Other forms of communication were applied as well in the TES implementation process, such as visitation field work, meetings with implementers and so on, but to engage employees in the process and make them do their job officially and effectively, first the “Ketaab” is necessary and the most effective form in showing seriousness.

In addition, despite that interviewees of General Directorates (GDs), Administrators and Educators have different roles in the TES implementation, they all confirmed that the official correspondence “Ketaab” is the most practiced form of communication from the upper level of the MoEHE to keep other employees informed about its policies, including TES components. For example, GD Sara noted that this style “serves and informs the employees at her directorate to learn about particular objectives in relation to their roles.” In addition, she observed that the “Ketaab” is “powerful and authoritative.” Another example was provided by Administrator Ihab who found that the central government’s policy must be passed down from the top level (minister or assistant deputy minister) in a very official and structured way to be taken seriously and have a strong impact on implementers because other mechanisms were helpful but not as powerful as the signed official “Ketaab.” He explained:

The “Ketaab” is the first step for releasing a project or a process. It is an official and powerful way that everyone respects and accepts what it does include... It's not a secret that when we have a letter from the “Wakeel” (the assistant deputy) the job would be more reliable... The official letter between departments is an important method of communication for everyone to be informed and the intended goals to be achieved... I believe releasing a “Ketaab” is the first step that should be used to ensure everyone's respect and comprehension... Apparently, I don't see any barriers in this mechanism.

7.2.2 Participatory Approach

On the other hand, large participation in developing various programs was one of the MoEHE’s enforcement mechanisms and follow-up activities to inform stakeholders and make sure instruction is delivered consistently and effectively. The MoEHE has adopted a decentralization approach in the implementation process of its strategic plans. Thus,
participatory involvement to share decision-making was mentioned by most interviewees, but none questioned or denied the fact that the centralized style, such as releasing an endorsed “Ketaab”, is still the norm and more common. However, the most essential decisions at all tiers are linearly channeled, even though there were various participatory mechanisms that were mentioned. For example, Educator Fadi presented some examples of these participatory methods and for what specific tasks they were used:

After releasing the Ketaab, the institute routinely coordinates with a number of directorates and administrations to follow-up with TES tasks and decisions... As we train school teachers, we need to work with other directorates... for example, one of the tasks is to identify unqualified teachers in schools and this task needs a lot of coordination between parties, such as arranging training sessions, and documenting the number of trained teachers... It’s right that the MoEHE adopted a decentralization approach, delegated some authorities and prompted participatory methods like mass discussion, and meeting and training workshops but the “Ketaab” by the top level has always been a must so far.

Administrator Mohanad also provided examples of the participatory approach that is used between the MoEHE’s top level and employees. He also believes that the official “Ketaab” of communication is the most reliable and protectable form, particularly for the lower level of employees. For him, despite that there is always an open path of communication between upper and lower levels, but the official communication form would not necessarily hold the grassroots’ employees accountable for any unpredictable results. He explained:

The MoEHE units and departments share information in varied ways, such as open discussion meetings and training workshops and so on... It is good to know that accessing the email addresses for all employees allows everyone to communicate with each other - even with the minister if they want. There are no shut down windows... but using the “Ketaab” as an official correspondence for important matters that is reliable and effective... when the employees receive a ratified letter from the level above it is safe for them to go forward with the requirements... so they don't have to worry or be accountable for possible mistakes.

In this respect, leader Muraad was more conservative and found that despite the necessity of utilizing a participatory style toward the decentralization goal, upper-hand decisions are preferred in particular controversial situations. He found that some decisions must be kept at the upper level because of their sensitivity within the Palestinian context. Leader Muraad put it as follows:

I know that there is a necessity to promote the adopted decentralization approach and there is just a small margin of delegation from the top level to lower levels like school administration and
teachers, but most sensitive matters, such as the financial and curricula handling decisions must be held by the top level.

7.2.3 Toward a Modern System and Governance

Despite the fact that most of the interviewees deemed the official correspondence channel a necessity and a representation of power and authority, at least a third of them notably went beyond the norms and found that the centralized system within such an approach is not effective anymore. They believe that a system based on teacher accountability and performance is not relevant to the Palestinian context and would not elevate the quality of teacher performance or the teaching and learning processes. They also believe that the MoEHE needs to establish a solid ground for a coherent modern system and governance that is inclusive of all stakeholders through collaboration, coordination and evaluation approaches, unlike the outsider models. Some interviewees discussed the reasoning behind this situation and found that the culture and the system of oppression that has lasted for more than a century is the reason behind it. For example, leader Tamer explained how the MoEHE’s centralized system maintains authority in upper-level hands, but he critically analyzed the strong root of this system through the history and culture of oppression that has dominated for centuries. He said:

It is obvious that the correspondence form of communication is admired by everyone... implementers on the grassroots level are in a comfort zone and get familiar with such kinds of forms... and the top level maintains it as it gives them authority... the history of oppression and the centralized political system in Middle East countries and Palestine particularly has been devoted to a one-man leader... for example we used to have the mother and father to be the authority in our houses and whatever they demand or say we have no choice except to obey... This symbolic model is common everywhere, but it needs to be adjusted... I know it's not easy to replace it in a few years...We first need to change the mentality of people to accept and begin using the alternative of new communication and authorities.

Educator Hala also encouraged the usage of alternative forms of communication and coordination that she believes are modern and reliable as she has experienced in her career. She criticized the centralized system that depends only on teacher performance as it is not suitable for the necessity of change, and therefore should be replaced with a modern decentralized system based on coordination and evaluation approaches, which are more suitable to the Palestinian context. She expressed it as the following:

It is obvious that the centralized system and its approaches are not suitable anymore and introducing new alternatives it is a must... it has allowed a larger margin of decentralization and it
may improve the management and governance of the MoEHE gradually... when I began my position, our unit applied various participatory methods to inform me about TES requirements so I was invited to observation activities, micro-training sessions, etc... I worked and coordinated with teams on different tasks, such as preparing training materials and training content, and that was very effective in learning about different policies and taking on more responsibility.

Administrator Shaheera also agreed about promoting new alternatives by encouraging the delegation of authorities to other grassroots levels. She put it as follows:

As long as our department is part of the Ministry, we have to participate and follow the traditional regulations and instructions... it is necessary to add an official look at the instructions and regulations, but other ways should be given a real chance... our leaders need to be determined and to delegate more authority in the decision-making process to all levels and parties.

In fact, a few of the 16 interviewees adopted a radical response in regard to the centralized system of communication and its deficits in bringing real changes. For them, even though the centralized communication forms tended to be a politically acceptable method for stakeholders to passively receive official information and requirements, they suggested that the decentralized and participatory approach should be strongly encouraged by applying effective coordination and evaluation systems, seeing as there is a commitment to developing modern systems of management and governance. Educator Hana was unhappy with the dominant traditional system that has impeded real development. She found that teachers and supervisors at the grassroots level are the least informed of TES details and have not been included in the decision-making process from the beginning of the implementation process. Here are her observations:

Official correspondence seems to be a major instrument of getting information from the central government about policies, but it has actually become insignificant, especially on the lower level of schools and staff... Most stakeholders at this level usually seek alternatives to be part of decisions and policy formulation, development and evaluation... unfortunately some key stakeholders, especially in the grassroots don’t understand the government policies and some details can't be informed by this kind of approach... for instance, many supervisors, principals, and teachers are confused about their responsibilities and roles as just and only as respondents in regard to TES components... it seems that leaders didn’t do enough to distribute and coordinate details of TES objectives on this level and they did not take evaluation process systematically.

Administrator Mahdi also denied the effectiveness of this system in the reform process by pointing out that it is “not effective at all.” He observed that the majority of stakeholders were informed about TES clearly only by participatory mechanisms where individuals sometimes found information on the MoEHE’s website or by collaboration between each other. In this regard, he further added:
I actually learned about TES through participating in a number of activities and researching by myself for information... I believe it is rare for most employees to know about the details via the official routes which are there only to provide the headlines of these decisions or requirements... but for details of TES, they knew about that by reviewing documents that were distributed through websites or by collaboration between each other in specific activities.

In summary, communication is a key tool by which policy goals and objectives are mapped out for implementers. On the one hand, the MoEHE’s units and programs have routinely adopted common official forms of communication by which implementers became familiar with the national policies of teacher education requirements. Although all interviewees agreed that the official correspondence “Ketaab” was an obligation that should be combined with various participatory mechanisms as both integral to each other, many of them called for a cautious, critical attitude toward continuing to depend on the centralized system as it has failed to improve the MoEHE’s governance system. In other words, most of them found that the centralized system accurately and effectively delivered TES objectives to stakeholders. However, they viewed it critically, claiming that restricting decision-making to the upper leaders is antithesis to the modern decentralization approach that encourages coherent governance and coordination.

In conclusion, most interviewees believed that the communication methods functioned well. It also appeared that the MoEHE officials have adopted and applied what they believe is possible to be effective and efficient for the TES implementation processes.

Despite the effectiveness or ineffectiveness of this style of communication, the centralized system was under question as it upholds power and authority in the upper hands of the MoEHE for implementing governmental policies, including TES. However, TES for teacher education reform was delivered successfully to the MoEHE stakeholders who accepted and understood the requirements of the strategy. Several approaches were employed in the delivery process, the centralized or participatory mechanisms. Thus, no matter how it was delivered and how the stakeholders have responded to it individually, from interviewees input, all of them confirmed that they all collectively and strongly integrated not only “vertically but many times horizontally” as pointed out by Hofstede (2001, p. 228). These approaches are often considered as a normal style and are widely familiar and acceptable in the Palestinian history, and culture of the society.
7.3 Ambiguity in the Vision of New Identity

7.3.1 An Overview

In the early years of its administration, the MoEHE chose to characterize teachers as unqualified human resources (they do not hold an educational degree based on the new TES definition). This description was associated with the traditional identity and role that emphasizes the use of the traditional learning methodologies, while ignoring the incorporation of differentiated practices of learning (Ezzine, 2009). In this respect, Akesson (2015) indicates that teachers who utilize old teaching approaches usually adopt an authoritative role, rather than the role of the facilitator that encourages student-centered approaches. The MoEHE estimated low student involvement in the learning process (MoEHE, 2011b). Throughout the years of Israeli administration, teachers were neglected at both the training and socio-economic development levels. For example, teachers were suffering because of the bureaucratic system, the low quality of learning and teaching and pre-operational programs. Teachers attended only limited hours of training programs that were lacking any practical methodology. Additionally, teachers were supposed to play a key role in the implementation of the national curriculum as well as other related developments. However, at the time, the impact of the occupation and its systematic restrictions on Palestinians and their national movement for independence and self-determination eroded their enthusiasm and ability to participate in the decision-making process. This situation impacted teacher skills, motivation, confidence, creativity, and identity. Thus, the role of teachers was diminishing at both the school and societal level. The Palestinian teachers did not have proper status in the community in regard to economic, social, and political dimensions (Shinn, & Assaf, 2010). Because of this situation, Halstead & Affouneh (2006), indicated that the Palestinian teacher education is tenuous and needs further development.

Therefore, the MoEHE paid specific attention to teacher preparation - particularly the development of the new vision, identity, role, and profession over the last ten years. For example, the MoEHE’s mission in the third EDSP attempted to shift priorities from a focus on access to education to raising the quality of education, particularly with regards to teacher identity and role. According to the MoEHE (2014a), the third EDSP of 2014-
2019 “Palestine 2020” shares the same vision as the second EDSP (2007-2011) but is guided towards “a results-based, student-centered, and inclusive education system that provides 21st century relevant education services at all levels with high quality and full equity considering individual needs and being at the heart of the political, economic, and social development both within and for Palestine” (p.22).

In this regard, the most significant simulation for teacher education development was introduced in the TES initiative to improve the content, methods, teacher education programs, and management at HEIs, not to mention improve the teachers’ overall socio-economic status. Moreover, TES’ objectives specifically mirrored international trends and policies that regulated the teaching profession and attempted to modernize teacher roles. TES confirmed the mission of the MoEHE but clearly defined the new teacher identity specifically by stating its vision to improve their professional role as follows:

To prepare teachers who are able to commit to their students, and towards educating all of them, facilitating their normal and comprehensive development... possessing general knowledge and subject matter knowledge, being able to use a variety of teaching methods, transferring knowledge, improving and developing the students’ life-skills, including problem solving and critical thinking… bearing the responsibility of monitoring and guiding their students’ learning... and being able to think systematically about their practices, learning from their experiences, and continuing to develop professionally during their service. (MoEHE, 2011a, p. 24)

According to this vision, TES recommended new roles for teachers to be adopted by the education sector. The new identity assigns teachers the role of facilitators, and the students a major role in the learning process. It also encourages teachers to be particularly knowledgeable in their subject matter, aware of differentiated teaching methods, and to be problem-solvers, guiders, and researchers about the learning experience and continuation of learners.

On the one hand, the TES’s vision for reforming Palestinian teacher roles is true that it is a reflection of the MoEHE’s mission. More important, it is a response to the global trends toward the greater accountability and performance of teachers, and toward international regulatory mechanisms for development a modern teaching profession. This new vision has been mightily directed the TES implementation process that aimed at developing and qualifying both experienced and novice teachers. Additionally, TES follow-up initiatives represent a huge effort that is associated with international donor support to reform
teacher education in Palestine. On the other hand, when interviewees were asked about the MoEHE’s efforts towards TES achievement, most interviewees agreed that there was a strong commitment by the MoEHE towards TES implementation process and therefore there was a tremendous improvement at the four components of TES (qualification process of pre-service and in-service teachers, teaching professional development, management, and capacity building as discussed in Chapter 4). However, they observed also that through the last ten years, the MoEHE gradually lost its commitment and direction toward a clear action towards the new teacher characteristics. They believe that the actions of the MoEHE of developing new teacher roles have been shifted and became deviated from the stated vision in its original form. It appears that despite the long implementation process, including different actions specifically to lever changes in teaching and learning styles, this direction was not satisfied.

7.3.2 Teachers’ Traditional Role Versus Modern Roles

While the MoEHE’s vision statement directed its efforts towards changing the traditional identity and role of teachers, it remained ambiguous and inconsistent in terms of specifying real actions to implement the new teacher roles and international trends regarding teacher identities as stated in chapter 3 (as professional evaluators, co-learners, innovators, researchers, problem-solvers, barrier-breakers, and knowledge builders). These trends were discussed with the interviewees to determine whether Palestinian teachers assumed the modern roles, but they reported observing a lack of significant change to new teacher roles and identity. The proposed vision and role, especially in classroom practice, was a real concern for most of interviewees. Neoliberal best practices were observed on several occasions, albeit accompanied by noticeable deviation and contradiction. This had a negative impact on the establishment of a modern and solid teacher profession that reflects a new role for teachers or the international trends for teacher new identities. For example, GD Sara expressed her opinion regarding this issue as follows:

Teacher preparation of the new roles and a modern profession is important part of TES, but more focus has been given to the logistic preparation programs of teacher education. Teacher education standards, frameworks and teaching approaches are developed but could not lead to teacher self-analysis, reflection, and development of their professional growth… Unfortunately, the traditional role of teacher as authority is still dominating.
In more detail, GD Ali explained how the teacher role as an effective evaluator is important to the effectiveness of the learning and teaching process, but in his opinion, it has deviated from the real purpose in most attempts. He explained his view as follows:

In Palestine student evaluation by teachers has become one of the key developments of the teaching and learning process and has given a lot of attention to educational policies and developers because we know that student evaluation is a significant indicator that can help teachers improve their teaching skills and roles... the challenge is that MoEHE capacity is limited to offering suitable training on how to use this tool as a guide for teachers toward development of their new profession. Evaluation skills may develop a healthy relationship between the teachers and their students and help them to determine learners' weakness and strengths, but teachers are not there yet to do that in a proper way, and they need a lot of effort and resources to be there.

Administrator Rami explained that M&E Department has established a “questions bank, rubrics and evaluation framework” in order to develop effective teaching and evaluation tools, but the teacher's way of evaluation has raised serious questions on how the evaluation process should be and how important for teachers to assist their students to learn at high levels. He stated that the current evaluation approaches are “old fashioned.” On the other hand, some interviewees expressed concern about the development of more important roles against the traditional profile of teachers. They believe that the MoEHE’s leaders should encourage and promote the teachers’ collaborative relationship with the community, as well as with the students in schools when developing the teaching and learning process, including problem-solving matters. Thus, such a relationship may help them explore and form their characteristics as professionals. Administrator Sama provided some suggestions and elaborated on this point by saying:

The teachers’ relationship with the educational community being collaborative through participation in meetings and conferences is very important and is a huge concern for TES and policy makers... they should be promoted to learn from such experiences and from each other, as they also share and exchange knowledge about difficulties and success. Therefore, this would help them in developing international and modern roles and identities. I think teachers in Palestine can make this happen (be collaborative, problem solvers or maybe knowledge builders). However, (the process) needs systematic management to achieve that, so that such experience and knowledge can be managed, documented, saved and exchanged.

In this regard, Educator Hana agreed with the previous input and critically viewed her opinion by suggesting a number of recommendations as the following:

The MoEHE’s leaders, policymakers and staff can work together in schools and across the community by adopting specific actions to develop new roles for teachers like reflective workers and/or co-learners. Additionally, teachers as problem breakers may establish solid professional standards, frameworks and skills, and they learn from each other and from their mistakes. More
importantly, leaders should ensure that teachers have fair incentives and that their professional conditions are also satisfied.

Additionally, GD Sara emphasizes the importance of the teacher’s identity as a researcher or reflective member. She was optimistic that teachers in Palestine can develop the new characteristics, especially since many of them join qualification programs which require them to work on gaining such skills. She elaborated on that by stating the following:

You know that many teachers have been joining the qualification programs, and by doing that they must submit a graduation research project from their own experience. Many teachers also joined international competitions and conferences through such projects. I mean, the teacher’s identity as a researcher is very important and the MoEHE supports developing this role. I am not saying that all teachers admire or appreciate those roles, but we are working along with leaders and educators on developing the teachers’ new skills and knowledge.

7.3.3 Economic and Political Restrictions

Additional to the discussion of the teachers’ modern roles through changing their identities and whether or not Palestinian teachers possess them, most of the 16 interviewees questioned the feasibility of the MoEHE’s strategic actions. In this regard, MoEHE working plans for teacher education reform seemed inconsistent with the national policy’s requirements due to several unfavorable factors that affected the TES implementation process. For them, most of these factors are embedded in Palestine’s economic and political restrictions and instability. Therefore, the teachers’ socio-economic status is characterized by the lack of social justice, and the domination of a culture of oppression.

A few of the 16 interviewees indicated that despite the MoEHE’s vision and mission sharing some common views with TES regarding teacher roles, the MoEHE’s revised plans and follow-up actions have not aligned with the requirements for the intended goals. This situation is most likely the impact of the PA’s limited budget and power; the PA decision is economically dependent on international aids and politically restricted by Israeli policies. As a result of this situation, teachers continue to be underpaid and schools continue to be under-resourced. Leader Muraad expressed his opinion in the following comment:

As stipulated in its strategic plans, the MoEHE’s recent mission encourages an approach that pushes implementers, especially teachers, to practice new and modern attributes, for example
registering teachers in the qualifying programs that promote the TES teacher new identity. However, the effectiveness of this attempt always depends on the PA budgeting matter and how many teachers can be attending every time... I witnessed a lot of successful stories but we know some factors are dominating and hampering real change... even though there was some change in teachers’ incentives or payment which is happening sometimes but I think the important matter is for the upper level of management and international actors to act because it's related to the funding and politics.

GD Jamal agreed with leader Muraad about the limitation of financial resources, but he was particularly frustrated with the PA lack of autonomy and control over political matters, land annexation, and utilization of resources. For example, he thinks that while it is true that the international community provides financial aid to the PA, but at the same time they create political pressure which mimics the Israeli occupation’s agendas. He put it by saying:

The Ministry adopted essential strategies and actions to develop new teacher identities and this should be reflected in adopting a modern curriculum, learning and teaching methodology, and management style... unfortunately everything depends on the PA’s capacity of control and donors strategies... for example, the aim is to transform teachers to be facilitators and students to be active learners but everything is based on changing the whole situation for Palestine to be politically independent and control their matters... The question here is, does the PA, including the MoEHE, have control on their land to build new schools without Israeli state demolishing them or are students and staff free in their movement? I don't think so.

In this respect, Educator Fadi went further and criticized the whole process of changing teacher roles in favor of new ones and into a modern profession based on accountability and teacher performance. He said:

The construction process of the new teacher identity that is guided by the international community and grounded on Westernized trends is really unrealistic and comes with an expensive cost on the Palestinian people and education system and potentially this reform is not decisive or necessarily associated with improving the social justice for teachers or Palestinians in general... I believe that the super organizational engine directed by Westernized models and approaches toward a modern education system for accountability and performance is not really suitable to Palestine contexts and won't meet teacher’s conditions, dispositions and it is not necessarily creating a really progressive teacher education system... I believe a collective consciousness should focus on raising the Palestinian liberation and human rights.

In conclusion, most interviewees agreed with Educator Fadi, as they found that the teacher education reform process and the effort of establishing a modern teaching system difficult or irrelevant to the Palestinian context, especially due to the political and economic context. The lack of funding, negative impact of the occupation, and the imposed international agenda played an adversary role against the Palestinians’ priorities.
of achieving national liberation, an independent economy, and securing their human rights.

7.3.4 Lack of Social Justice

While many interviewees deemed that it was unavoidable that the goals of teacher education reform would go astray, some interviewees were more critical of it. Administrator Mustafa held the opinion that the ambiguity in developing new teacher roles has introduced new challenges to the economic status of teachers. He expressed that “neglecting to link teacher qualification programs with a clear incentive and career advancement system undermines the socio-economic status and social justice experienced by teachers.” Therefore, it is noticeable that “teachers lost their motivation for teaching and joining the qualification programs.” Educator Hala also believes that the whole process of transforming teacher roles was not accompanied by a salary increase or any improvement to their social status. She expressed her opinion in the following:

I know there is a necessity to change and develop teachers' role and profession… the formulation of the teacher new identity may bring some hope for change, but in these difficult circumstances of Palestine, this change becomes costly, and perhaps uncritical and unnecessarily directed to enhance teachers' social justice.

Administrators Sara agreed with previous comments and added the following:

The MoEHE aims to develop teacher autonomy, but due to the rigid centralization, the low salaries of teachers and poor resourced schools, the new approaches can't bring real change.

7.3.5 Centralization Inertia Versus Modern Decentralization

Administrators Reema and Shaheera and Leader Tamer noted that the ambiguity surrounding the new teacher role could be traced back to the centralized system where teachers are oppressed and underpaid. Neoliberal best practices may be utilized at times, but the traditional method and vertical style have been persistent against the development of a modern profession. The centralized system associated with the traditional features was maintaining its dominance. Administrator Shaheera provided the following comment.

We have to admit that we can't change the old norms if we (MoEHE) don't change the whole system that usually promotes the traditional thinking about a teachers' role... We have to think
outside of the box, and this will not happen if the center and top level of the system has not changed its doctrines and type of ruling.

Administrator Reema added the following in this regard:

There has been a lot of contradiction in regard to expecting a modern system including teachers' new roles, such as a reflective role where teachers should learn from their experience... It's not enough to teach teachers how to teach without allowing them a chance to make mistakes and learn from that - it just won't happen without delegating them more decision-making authority and space to make their own decisions.

In summary, the MoEHE’s vision must become less ambiguous in its definition of teacher roles, translate it into a clear direction, and promote real actions towards developing modern systems and teaching practices. It seems that the MoEHE’s strategies deviated from the national policy’s requirements for teacher education reform. After more than a decade of the TES implementation, the MoEHE has not reached its main goal yet. It is also observable that despite the ambiguity and the deviation from this goal, most interviewees showed a strong understanding and recognition of the necessity for change. However, most of them preferred to have a new system that is tailored to their own pace and context, and that allows for more autonomy without foreign intervention, as that has not brought social justice for teachers nor for Palestinians in general.

7.4 Mal-alignment of TES Objectives and Outcomes

The implementation of a public policy may be analyzed from various angles, but it must be judged based on its outcome which is usually determined by investigating the consistency between its objectives and the result (Birkland, 2015). Thus, a large scale of interventions took place since the launch of the TES in 2008. This push to reform Palestinian teacher education as mentioned previously is a reflection of the global effort toward greater accountability and performance. On the one hand, the International Monetary Fund (IMF) adopted the teaching professional development and has recommended the development of an incentive structure to have a wider salary scale. This is also an initiative of an earlier proposal by UNESCO that tied salary scales to licensing schemes (UNESCO 2008a, 2008b). Besides the UNESCO recommendations, the World Bank has supported an alternative project that uses competency-based
approaches in measuring knowledge and tying the knowledge levels to an incentive structure (Kelley and Odden 1995; Elmore 2008).

On the other hand, the MoEHE’s strategies have been directed towards achieving TES objectives and goals, while several interventions (see Chapter 8) were adopted to reform Palestine’s teacher education. TES components constitute a foundation for promoting teacher education development by the MoEHE in Palestine. These interventions were designed to achieve the four components of TES as detailed in Chapter 4: the development of the pre-service teacher education at HEIs, in-service teacher qualification programs, teaching professionalism, including incentive and promotion system, and a measurement mechanism of teacher performance, and lastly the management of the teacher education system. For example, the CDTP has a major role in the development and improvement of the teaching profession. It was tasked with the responsibility of governing, monitoring, and implementing teacher profession components supported by UNESCO (UNESCO, 2014). This includes the funding and building of teacher education programs with core objectives that include the development of a national qualification framework and professional teaching standards. Also, through the funding, licensing mechanisms for teachers were in place, policies have been standardized for education faculties, and a proposed process exists for hiring new teachers by the Ministry (Shinn, 2012).

Another example, following the TES publication on March 5, 2010, the Ministry held a joint event in Ramallah and Gaza for UNESCO’s World Teacher’s Day to mark a new beginning for Palestinian education. The event was well attended with more than 120 teachers and education professionals in attendance. Improving the teaching profession was the main agenda. As an outcome, the event led to an introduction of a policy paper to guide professional development and make World Teachers’ Day an annual event in Palestine. To show its significance, the event was attended by education representatives from the Ministry, EU, UNESCO, Palestinian Teachers Union and UNRWA and broadcasted in two films. It did not only bring together education stakeholders, but also gave birth to a new beginning with an agenda to improve education professionalism in Palestine. In this respect, MoEHE and international donors also focused on revamping
universities teacher education programs and their curricula, as well as improving teacher and faculty knowledge and skills through various training initiatives (e.g., TIEP that was discussed previously in this paper). Teacher professional diploma programs by WB with HEIs and NIET have qualified a large number of teachers, with more than 4,800 teachers qualified by HEIs. Moreover, the MoEHE prepared a proposal for increasing the teacher salary that would be linked to performance (MoEHE 2012), and more recently, the PLC endorsed the educational law of 2017, 2018, and 2019, including the development of the ranks system.

When interviewees were asked about the outcome that was brought by TES objectives and implementation of components, particularly in regard to the modernization of the teaching profession, two-thirds of the interviewees indicated that the development of the teaching profession has not been placed in parallel and prioritized with other components, especially the provision of teacher qualification programs. They observed a strong improvement in the provision of the teacher qualifying programs for pre-service and in-service teachers. However, despite this big leap, they remarked that a modern teaching profession has not been established yet. In other words, more than 10 years after the launch of the strategy, one of the core elements which aims to create a modern teaching profession remains incomplete. This essential delay of the development of the modern teaching profession raised serious questions from interviewees about the integrity of the whole implementation process to be achieved successfully. How and why? For them, there is a lack of the integration of TES components particularly the alignment of the component of the teaching profession development with providing teacher qualification programs. In other words, linking teacher's training programs with a career advancement scale including promotion and increments system remains a major challenge for a successful outcome of TES objectives and goals. The MoEHE’s leaders have been reluctant to adopt clear policies and pay attention to transfer the teaching profession into a modern system that matches international trends as stipulated in the mission and objectives of TES. Thus, as a result most interviewees noticed that there is an inconsistency between what was planned in regard to the teaching profession, and the outcome - and this was because of varied factors.
In detail, GD Sara indicated that leaders only focus on providing teachers with new competencies through qualification programs that only emphasized teacher accountability and performance without a sufficient budget for developing the teachers’ socio-economic status, which contradicts the national policy’s requirements for teacher education reform in full over the long term. She explained her opinion in the following words:

The teaching profession component as stipulated in TES has not drawn serious attention and MoHEH only cares about providing training for teachers without paying attention to other components... I know that there have been a lot of improvements so far... standards and competencies were developed... ranks are classified... a Law was passed but the application of career scale measures most likely depends on the budget... teachers are underpaid and only receive occasional incentives while teachers seek improvement of their status... promotion and salary are always a problem and it's essential to address this problem.

In addition, leader Tamer found that despite the tremendous effort made by the MoEHE to reform the teacher status, the uncertain political and economic environment embodied by the endless Israeli occupation further illustrates how complicated developing the teaching profession continues to be, and how remarkably dependent Palestine still is on international resources and donors. He explained his point by stating that:

Palestinians including the government and leaders definitely know the problem, but the solution is not in their hands... nobody can effectively solve the profound problems (which is the occupation and Palestinian independence) … However, the MoEHE through the last ten years accomplished a lot in term of TES goals... teachers' standards and ranks system are announced... laws were passed but when it comes to the budget and resources everything turns upside down and we are back to the zero point.

Administrator Rami’s critical review was consistent with the previous interviewee’s input as he underscored that the teaching profession development was significantly inconsistent from the requirement of the TES goals, and this inconsistency has had a negative impact on the implementation as a whole. He confirmed the strong conditional relationship between the ongoing economic and political restrictions and the delay of the application of the career advancement scale and incentive system. He stated the following:

Palestinians are under occupation...we have no real control on water resources, land annexation, tax returns, border movements, and we cannot guarantee the implementation of any plans except what we (Palestinians) are allowed from Israeli occupier... the MoEHE works hard toward the development of all aspects of TES, and it has achieved a lot of things but some aspects still require a huge budget and a capable political authority and this can be only by free polity… we all know that the teacher salary has improved dramatically and positively over the last ten years but this transformative project needs stability and certainty in regards to economic and political matters… we should not expect more than this extent in the current circumstance... this is why the teaching profession has not evolved yet.
A few of the 16 interviewees were extremely critical and believed that the MoEHE has not accommodated the large number of TES objectives or met the needs for the socio-economic development for teachers as a result of international circumstances and the imposed agendas on the Palestinian educational system. In other words, they believe that implementing teacher education reform by drawing on international trends, such as “best practices”, and transforming the teaching and learning system to simulate the Westernized models may not be in the best interest of Palestinians or even relevant to their context. Leader Ali made the following comment on this matter:

It is not the Ministry that does not want to improve the teaching profession... Actually all the processes and the idea of reforming is the effect of the global system, as it imposes its vision and agenda on us (Palestinians)... this situation has complicated the implementation process… we are part of a global situation and we have to follow... we have to understand we are the Palestinian still under occupation… international trends, standards and aids may solve some educational issues but in many cases the outcome may not suitable for our context ... we may need to develop something new that fits our circumstances, something help us to grow gradually and first solve our fundamental problems.

In addition, some of interviewees observed that the delay of the development process of the teaching profession has greatly undermined the socio-economic status of teachers in society. The low salaries of teachers and their socio-economic condition limit the possibilities for young people to choose the teaching profession as a career. Educator Fadi suggested the following:

Before thinking about the deep problem and its solution that sometimes are not on our hands but simply and temporarily the provision of the teacher’s training programs should be linked to an advancement and promotion process in teachers' career paths. This will provide teachers with the suitable competencies and improve their status in society... the absence of concrete plans for the teaching profession development particularly employing a career scale that linked to the training programs… In general, depending on teachers' development knowledge only raises serious questions about the integrity of the whole process as the MoEHE has not paid enough attention to build a contemporary teaching profession yet and this goal should be clearly addressed.

According to the MoEHE (2017b), there is a key challenge has faced teaching profession recruitment mainly for the basic education sector. The M&E report (MoEHE, 2017b) outlines the most important indicators regarding this issue as the following:

Young people are less inclined to go into the teaching profession; there is an increase in the number of teachers who prefer to leave teaching once they have another job opportunity; teachers’ burnout (exhaustion, frustration, dissatisfaction) impacts their’ performance strongly; and there is an increase in the number of teachers who is taking on a second job after working hours to meet life basic needs, especially male teachers.
In conclusion, for many of the interviewees, the teaching profession objective as stipulated in TES recommendations has not been prioritized with other components - especially the provision of teacher qualification programs and therefore the outcome of this objective has been inconsistent with what was planned and intended. For most of the interviewees, despite the MoEHE’s tremendous effort to improve the quality of teacher education, the uncertain political and economic environment (unfavorable factors) influenced by the ongoing Israeli occupation and the imposed agenda of the international forces further complicated TES implementation process. A critical review by interviewees has strongly underscored that the MoEHE’s goal and outcome in regard to the development of the teaching profession has deviated significantly from the requirements of TES. Additionally, most of them found that the MoEHE should face and analyze the real problem behind such a deviation, which is most likely to be the Israeli restrictions and the imposed agendas of international donors.

At this point, the chapter first reviewed the political and the administrative structure of the MoEHE, and how it employed a vertical, linear policy flow for implementing TES. It shed light on the MoEHE's communication forms and mechanisms that were utilized to deliver TES components to the implementers. Most interviewees found that the MoEHE’s system was effective as it ensured the implementers' official reception and a successful delivery, but the delivery of this system raised questions from the majority of implementers about its feasibility and clarity to reflect authentic changes as required by TES recommendations to reform the teacher education system. In other words, most interviewees found that the vision and intended goal of TES (that was meant to create a new teacher identity and modern teaching profession) has deviated and been inconsistent with the TES outcomes, and that was a result of the intertwining of unfavorable factors, such as the uncertainty of the economic and political condition, the dominant centralized system, and the socio-economic inequality issues. The next chapter will discuss the complexity of the dynamic process of TES implementation for teacher education reform in Palestine. It will formulate more units of analysis, review the implementers’ individual and collective involvement, and how they respond to TES objectives and goals. Furthermore, it will describe the compound course of interventions and achievements of aimed at enhancing the teacher education reform process in Palestine, as well as present
the interviewees' points of view regarding the official evaluation system of the MoEHE and TES implementation.
Chapter 8

8. The Dynamism of the TES Implementation Process

This chapter investigates the dynamic range of the TES implementation process at the micro-level of the MoEHE, particularly its five directorates and units, namely the CDTP, NIET, DSQ, AQAC, and AED (see chapter 5) and offers several units of analysis for this dynamic process. It presents the first unit of analysis by examining how the MoEHE’s implementers at the macro and micro levels (leaders, administrators, and educators) have involved themselves individually and collectively in varied roles. Then it presents how the MoEHE's main directorates and units have collectively and rationally participated in a number of programs and interventions as a reflection of the MoEHE’s strategies and actions towards TES implementation. In addition, it critically highlights how the roles of implementers in different units overlapped and clashed in many aspects and how this conflicting condition has impacted the whole implementation process. Other than looking at the details of the units' involvement, the achievement that has been brought by the implementation will be summarized as part of the MoEHE's interventions. Furthermore, this chapter presents another unit of analysis by shedding light on the evaluation process of TES implementation, and how TES goals and teachers' socio-economic status was assessed at a personal level.

8.1 An Overview

In general, five major categories are engaged in the implementation of the TES, which are: 1) The state; 2) Higher education institutions (HEIs); 3) Schools; 4) Donors and development agencies; 5) The community. The state refers to government officials responsible for education. They include the MoEHE Minister and his Deputy Ministers, the Legislative Council, and major units, such as the DSQ, CDTP, and the Projects Department. Other key institutions representing the state include the International Advisory Committee for Teacher Education, the National Task Force on Teacher Education, and the MoEHE Policy Committee. The committees help government officials in making important reforms in the education sector. Higher Education Institutions include universities and all colleges that offer tertiary education including NGOs and the
Council of Higher Education. The tertiary institutions have education faculties composed of students and educators. Educators implement education reforms while students are the beneficiaries of TES and a representation of the future. Schools and learning institutions for primary education include more than 3,500 KGs including hundreds of thousands of teachers and pupils. Donors and Development Agencies are external institutions that contribute to education development in Palestine. They include international institutions, such as the World Bank, the European Union, UNESCO, and AMID EAST. Also, individual countries through agencies, such as the US through UNSAID, Germany through the German International Cooperation and Spain theory the Spanish Cooperation fall in this category. Community are stakeholders not directly involved in education reforms but have significant influence. Teachers’ unions protect the interest of teachers, graduates join HEIs teacher education programs, and parents guide students in making education choices.

As mentioned in chapter 5, and due to the nature of the large categories of involvement, this research focused only on the MoEHE and its affiliated units as the case study for this research. According to the MoEHE (2011a), the Ministry of Education and Higher Education (which is sometimes represented in this paper as the Ministry) governed the TES implementation by three layers: 1) The national level represented by the Policy Committee (PC), made up of the Minister, Deputy Minister, and four specialized Assistant Deputy Ministers, as well as the Director General for Infrastructure; 2) Ministerial level represented by Assistant Deputy Minister for planning and development supported by the general directors of various specialized units and directorates - CDTP, AQAQ, NIET, DSQ, AED; 3) The third level of governance resides with the HEIs and their boards of trustees where decisions are made about education program offerings in support of TES. Because the MoEHE is the case study of this research, the third level of HEIs boards of trustees is not a concern for this research. Thus, it is necessary to know that this case study concentrates on the Ministerial level, which includes key players of the MoEHE - leaders and implementers include both administrators and educators.

TES implementation relied vertically on its leading role at the upper level of the Ministry in making decisions and governing the implementation initiatives. The MoEHE leaders
within the policy committee played centralized roles in making decisions and planning. However, the MoEHE adopted a strong plan toward a strategic goal of system decentralization and leaders have been pushing hard to share decision making and employing a participatory approach. The MoEHE’s leaders and implementers have marshaled their own capacity and resources that are bolstered by technical and financial support from international bodies through projects and programs specifically designated to support the TES implementation. These initiatives required both leaders at the upper level and executives as implementers at the micro-level. Usually, the MoEHE leaders played centralized and dominant roles in the decision-making and planning of the implementation. They routinely made decisions according to their positions and associated political power, while at the units and directorates level (the implementers) played substantial assistant roles for carrying out whatever measures and actions were required by their senior leaders. Although they were involved in the implementation process through different roles, in many examples these roles were overlapped and conflicted. However, the role of both the leaders and the implementers were played effectively in maximizing the TES implementation recommendations. Before summarizing the role of each directorate and unit, I first summarize the roles that were played individually. These players represent the leaders from the upper level who played a leading role through the Minister, and the Assistant Deputy Minister (which are sometimes represented in this paper as Deputy). The second line including general directors (GDs), administrators, and educators from the MoEHE’s various units and directorates who played an executive role in addition to other administrative and teaching roles.

### 8.2 Macro Level: The Role of Leaders

Two leaders from the top level were part of this study. The upper level of leadership is categorized into two roles: political and executive. On the one hand, the political leading role played by the MoEHE Minister as a member of the national ministerial Cabinet and the head of the educational Policy Committee. The Minister usually grants the government agreement and provides political support to the policies’ directions including TES and its implementation. He also oversees the discussion of milestones and supports
the adoption of policies and processes. Leader Muraad emphasized the importance of the political support from the government under Ministry leadership and he provided some examples of this support and involvement of the Minister and Policy Committee, such as overseeing the direction of TES implementation. He explained:

In regard to TES, the Minister politically represents the governmental level of Ministerial Council (Cabinet) in regard to all the decisions that are made at this level… As a member of the Palestinian Ministerial Council and the Policy Committee he delivers the governmental decisions, and from the beginning of TES, the government strongly supported it - particularly its objectives… I think without this support, I mean the governmental support by the Minister it has not been possible to achieve anything so far… For example, the national educational reforming teams in the country under his leadership are playing a very essential role in daily decision making, and providing direction to the development of the components of TES.

Leader Tamer also confirmed the importance of the supporting role of the Minister and Policy Committee as it impacts the direction of the policy planning and implementation. He further added:

The Minister of Education is the government representative of the Cabinet who leads the Policy Committee and the MoEHE’s planning process, and without the political support from the top level of the Ministry for these plans it won't be easy for anyone to go forward... The Minister is always in sight and sound and on top overseeing the TES implementation direction... The Minister also is one of the most influential intellectuals in the country and he knows the problems within the system... he has a progressive reforming vision for the teaching profession, and he is always on the top of his work.

On the other hand, the executive role of leaders consists of two lines. The first one is performed by the Assistant Deputy Minister of Planning and Development who takes charge of the overall planning and development of the proposed initiatives. As a head of the development and planning team, the Assistant Deputy’s primary role entailed orchestrating TES activities and leading critical policy actions supported by GDs (Hashwa, 2011b). Most interviewees also added that the Assistant Deputy played an essential role of in directing most of initiatives and plans. Leader Muraad summarized the responsibilities of the Assistant Deputy, which include developing plans, arranging resources, consultation, and seeking technical assistance from the international community. He explained:

The MoEHE’s GDs under the Assistant Deputy of planning and development supervision were part of the working groups who developed and orchestrated many implementation initiatives... he with the GDs have been leading and directing regular activities and initiatives... under his supervision for example, TERG and TECG were formed, these committees had to arrange meetings and workshops continuously to review situational analyses and assess challenges that
may be encountered... so at the end under his supervision these committees had to make decisions, and propose specific guidelines, arrange resources and offer consultation from the international community.

Administrator Mustafa supported the previous observations and detailed them with more examples of the MoEHE’s initiatives and how these initiatives were implemented under the leadership of Minister and Assistant Deputy supported by GDs:

Many examples can be provided about the supportive involvement of the top level of leaders in the decision making and planning of TES... the MoEHE’s leaders and GDs worked with UNESCO by implementing various programs... For example, QSQT by WB, supported components related to capacity building of the MoEHE and in-service standards and framework development...Thus top leaders and GDs identified and developed a number of teacher education programs, in addition to their consultation task with international community on the core standards and frameworks, such as the promotion of ILO/UNESCO Recommendations Concerning the Status of Teachers.

The second category at the executive level (which is not a case for this study) was fulfilled by various heads of committees and set up specifically to support TES. For example, the general committees, such as the National Taskforce on Teacher Education represents all local stakeholders that communicate about the implementation of the TES, and the International Advisory Committee on Teacher Education provides a forum for input from all international stakeholders (Shinn, 2012).

8.3 Micro level: The Role of Implementers

Various directorates and units were tasked with the implementation of several programs and projects related to the implementation of TES components, namely NIET, CDTP, DSQ, AQAC, and AED. Furthermore, implementers at these directorates consisted of three tiers: general directors, administrators, and educators. Three GDs, eight administrators, and three educators participated in this study. The GDs in particular were required to assist the Assistant Deputy passively or actively in decision-making and carrying out the strategic planning role. The other implementers, such as administrators and educators were assigned to specific tasks toward achieving TES components and related programs at the directorate level. Thus, implementers as GDs confirmed that they were part of the decision making, and consultation groups at the leading level and under the supervision of the Assistant Deputy Minister. For example, GD Sara mentioned that she participated strongly in the major committees and taskforces that were responsible for
making decisions and planning the TES components. Her comment is presented in the following:

Working groups were formed from different units and society. The working groups were comprised from the MoEHE’s GDs, Deans of educational colleges at HEIs and the UNRWA teacher training colleges. The teams’ main tasks were to make decisions and for example to develop outlines and frameworks for in-service and pre-service teachers... Decisions had to be made based on analyzing the situations and according to varied evaluation materials… We had to come up with working plans for all units and determine their responsibilities... for example HEIs and the MoEHE’s units like NIET, and CDTP developed the in-service teacher frameworks. This included the development of courses, curriculum and so on.

Additionally, GD Jamal summarized his responsibilities in decision-making in the following comment:

As a GD, I have worked with HEIs and the community to make essential decisions in regard to TES implementation... Decisions were made on developing specific standards, frameworks, teaching and learning methodologies for teacher education programs like those for special education, leadership, and counseling... For example, CDTP developed standards of teacher ranks, and NIET prepared teacher training logistic tasks, such as drafting, interpretation, certain reports, plans, or policy documents.

Although GDs had a major role in assisting the Assistant Deputy in making decisions and consultation tasks, another role was mainly played by them in directing and facilitating daily tasks at the directorates' level of their units. This formal role can be categorized as the following: (1) A routine job given their leadership and direction to assigned tasks. Their main responsibility was to implement plans determined from the upper level; (2) An effort to integrate policy goals into their directorates and departments by facilitating plans and interpreting them into specific tasks based on main TES components; (3) A special involvement in the directorates' daily administrative activities, such as organizing meetings, workshops and teaching sessions, and discussions. For example, GD Jamal indicated that in addition to the decision-making role, he had to play many roles, such as arranging team meetings and facilitating daily activities that assist in informing and directing staff towards the implementation tasks of the TES main components. He concluded his responsibilities as follows:

On the directorate level my responsibility as a director related to tasks, such as arranging weekly meetings and planning activities... Meeting with experts and consulting with them about the new options of the teaching profession system, so I had to play more than one role - sometimes I was a director, and sometimes an administrator, and sometimes a facilitator.
GD Ali was also involved in many tasks and roles. He elaborated on his responsibilities as the following:

GDs had to play doubled roles... In addition to decision making role, such as participating in the Education Faculty teams (EFTs), the international community and the local technical assistance providers... As a director I had to lead and facilitate a lot of tasks, such as conducting seminars, and workshops that were organized under the auspices of varied initiatives... I had to lead, direct and facilitate daily plans and arrange meetings that related directly or indirectly to the main goal at the end.

The second category of implementers was filled by administrators, namely as heads of departments and coordinators. Although they were required to participate in the decision-making process by discussing certain policy direction and initiatives that directly affected their responsibilities, their roles were mainly played within their directorates and departments. On the one hand, leaders and GDs usually planned the major directions for department responses, and administrators were usually involved in administrative or instrumental tasks and carried out whatever measures that were required by directors on the other hand. They worked on assignments which can be classified as follows: (1) Coordinating with other directorates; (2) Facilitating specific tasks, such as supervising the professional programs, developing the teaching profession, etc...; (3) Organizing logistics, such as preparing materials, making calls, arranging meetings or workshops, as well as monitoring different activities and evaluation. Administrator Ihab summarized his administrative role in the organizing logistics tasks with the following comment:

I have played many roles in implementing TES so far... for example logistics preparations such as participating in designing modular programs and monitoring pre-service programs to be delivered to teachers by HEIs and defining the type of Certificate for participants… Other responsibilities were related to specific tasks, such as administrating assessment and so on.

Most of the administrators in this research disclosed that their roles overlapped with others sometimes. For instance, Administrator Mustafa has carried out many responsibilities related to the TES interventions at the administrative level. He indicated that his involvement usually was in coordinating tasks and arranging logistical tasks in relation to the WB programs’ development and the practicum programs. He was among those invited to join planning teams for several projects in addition to his responsibilities at the directorate. This dual involvement and multiple responsibilities as mentioned
previously was true for most administrators at most of the units. He explained some of the tasks and roles through the following:

A number of supervisors from the directorate had to meet weekly with university specialists and international bodies to coordinate logistical matters, prepare training sessions, arrange technical assistance and evaluate teacher's learning... these roles on many occasions overlapped with others... for instance many implementers and units had worked on the same tasks with different views and direction, and this overlapping condition complicated the entire implementation process.

Another example of the dual role is provided by Reema who was actively engaged in monitoring the progress of the implementation, collecting data about training teachers and student achievements. Administrator Reema explained how she was engaged in multiple tasks, such as preparing annual reports and gathering statistical information among other tasks.

Annually reports were done by collecting information and preparing assessments... This process was our job as administrative, and it is done to provide our leaders with scientific information that helps them in making decisions... we provided them with these statistics in order for them to review plans and revise them... Of course, this task is not the only one, there were many other tasks requiring coordination with the other directorates and arranging meetings for staff and so on.

The third category of implementers is the educators who were actively engaged in educating and qualifying teachers. Their responsibilities included teaching teachers, arranging teaching sessions, preparing training materials and evaluating teachers and training sessions. Despite the fact that their main role was centered around teaching teachers in the professional development sessions, they also assisted administration teams in other tasks. The three educators in this study revealed that they sometimes played an administrative role in addition to their basic teaching task. Educator Fadi found that his dual role sometimes created a conflicting situation between the different directorates or within the same department. He explained:

I have been playing many roles in addition to teaching and training teachers - I had to participate in administrative work, such as arranging materials and assessing teacher training in addition to various logistical and technical jobs.

Another example of the dual role was provided by educator Hana who expressed that she played multiple roles to compensate for the deficits in the MoEHE’s staff and capacity. Educator Hana detailed that her position required her to play formal and informal roles, such as a coordinator sometimes or an interpreter in addition to the role of trainers, and
that dual role was causing a conflicting situation within the directorate or with other directorates. She stated it in the following:

Teachers came to the programs to learn new skills and this was my responsibility to do but sometimes we as educators have no choice but to do other jobs than teaching... sometimes I have to do administrative work like filling out paper work, interpreting documents, coordinating with other directorates, and arranging logistical matters... I had to work with other units on different projects but this sometimes caused a lot of conflict as an educator with a specific job description.

Educator Hala also mentioned playing a dual role especially when the department needed expertise in drafting and editing certain documents like reports and plans. In addition, she found that such a situation was confusing and overwhelming but was necessary and acceptable to ensure successful implementation. In this regard, she stated the following:

I am probably among those who are intensely involved in many kinds of tasks for the policy’s implementation.... I always play multiple tasks besides teaching, I draft teaching materials, evaluate forms, and sometimes coordinate tasks with other departments... My responsibility is not only teaching classes and leaving, but the most important job is to provide my best in the best possible way.

Critically, the dual or multiple roles for many implementers was unpleasant and caused frustration for most of them especially as they had not received any promotion or incentives for conducting additional tasks. Administrator Sama mentioned that a large amount of funding for TES implementation went to technical and logistical matters - and that was the decision of the donors, and this was managed and determined by the MoEHE’s upper executive level. She explained as follows:

A lot of external funds for implementing TES components were spent on technical and logistic items and the implementation process was managed directly by leaders and supported by international committees. Many grassroots implementers had no benefits and received nothing even though they worked harder than anyone else... They were overwhelmed with many tasks and responsibilities that were exhausting.

Some of the educators and administrators who were interviewed expressed their frustration about the dual role for many implementers. They think it caused conflicting situations which have affected them more than upper-level employees who usually guarantee their positions, benefits and higher salaries. Administrator Mahdi commented with the following:

Everyone knows how things happened in those days... grassroots employees such as supervisors and teachers were the most involved in implementing the MoEHE’s interventions, but they were
Some interviewees went further and believe that the donors’ policies and management were directly and indirectly responsible for the conflicting condition, particularly between implementers of TES and in society. On the one hand, Administrator Rami stated that “the international donors imposed their political and economic agenda, and therefore they placed pressure on the MoEHE’s leaders.” In his opinion, their interest is different than the Palestinians’ national agendas and it caused negative consequences on the grassroots implementers who have been struggling to change their status in the era of globalization. Educator Hala explained that the struggling situation of employees at the grassroots level is “very observable and unfair”. She elaborated how teachers were part of many national strikes in protest of their unfair and unfavorable situation. She continued by saying:

This situation of injustice has manifested itself on many occasions... Teachers went on strike several times to obtain better conditions and increase their salaries... I know they had occasionally received random promotions, but the reality is darker...The limitations in resources, and economic and political instability has affected the implementers strongly - especially teachers - and their socio-economic status has deteriorated despite the outside solutions that were provided.

In summary, most interviewees repeatedly confirmed that the implementer role entailed working concurrently on multiple tasks or in varied positions between the three categories. The GDs’ main role was to assist the upper level in decision-making and consultation, but they also played a major role in the management and direction of assigned TES components at their directorate level. The administrators’ main role was to carry out various administrative tasks which were planned by their directors and upper-level leaders, namely logistic, technical, and coordination tasks, including supervisory and administration related tasks. While the educators' main role was to carry out teaching tasks, yet they were involved in many administrative tasks as well.

Apparently, most interviewees in the three categories of this research found that their individual and collective roles resulted in positive outcomes. Implementers individually marshaled their efforts and played various roles. Most of them mentioned that they were invited to join several projects and duties and because of that, they observed how these responsibilities sometimes resulted in a conflicting and confusing situation. More
importantly, they expressed their frustration with the unjust situation that left many teachers struggling, particularly at the grassroots level, leading them and their union to go on strike many times to decrease the income and benefits gap. As a result of this struggle, implementers at the grassroots level have sometimes reached settlements with the MoEHE’s upper level, including occasional salary increases and promotions, but they believe the main problem remains unsolved.

8.4 The MoEHE’s Collective Involvement: Units & Directorates' Role

There are major MoEHE bodies (directorates or units) as mentioned in chapter 5 which were assigned essential roles and worked collectively to support the implementation of the TES recommendations and objectives (MoEHE, 2011a).

Four staff from the CDTP participated in this study and they mentioned many of the following interventions and involvements. In consideration of the promotion of the ILO/UNESCO Recommendations Concerning the Status of Teachers, the MoEHE implemented various interventions with support from international bodies, such as UNESCO, Amid East and GIZA (MoEHE, 2011a). Under the aim of standards and framework setting, the QSQT program developed a framework that was certified by the CDTP advisory board in 2011. Under their supervision, teacher’s professional standards and principles were set up. The process was a collaborative effort with a curriculum development working group that was comprised of deans from the educational colleges at the HEI’s and UNRWA teacher training college. The team created a framework for developing in-service programs that enable teachers who were under qualified to meet TES standards. A proposal also was provided by CDTP which sought to create management mechanisms for licensing teachers work. According to the proposal, teachers that have attained all the requirements set out in by the TES should be awarded the Professional Teachers Certificate. Teachers that did not attain these requirements had until 2020 to attain these requirements.

According to the observations and involvement of two interviewees from AQAC that participated in this study, there was tremendous progress in strengthening the capacity of
the MoEHE to enhance the policymaking environment and management of tertiary education. Under the umbrella of the TEP project and to improve the policymaking environment, and the governance of tertiary education, the Council of Higher Education (CoHE) and AQAC were involved in formulating the educational policy framework in West Bank and Gaza. Besides that, these agencies were involved in the formulation of recommendations for the new academic higher education programs and the accreditation of these programs at HEIs. Studies were conducted by these groups included evaluating higher education institutions that offer BA and MA degrees. AQAC has gone over the various types of programs offered at HEIs and addressed the issues of naming and distribution. Furthermore, AQAC was involved in the formulation and release of the National Council for Accreditation of Teachers Education (NCATE) standards.

Four staff from the DSQ participated in the study and observed many of the following actions and achievements. The DSQ was involved in the management and running of various phases of the West Bank’s TEIP project. For example, DSQ was involved in identifying measures that can be utilized to improve the “school-based practice” of Pre-Service Teacher Education programs. In this regard, the MoEHE selected a number of HEIs and schools to assess varied types of approaches over the course of two years. International technical assistance was provided to the MoEHE and HEIs with designing, testing, and evaluating the school-based practice program, using well established and proven international practices. Furthermore, the program was forwarded to District Leadership Teams, School Improvement Teams and Inclusion of the DSQ supervisors to ensure that some of the aspects of the project are retained.

Four participants in this study are from the NIET. Since 2004, NIET has been registered to administrate all training programs that have been undertaken by the MoEHE. Trainers at the NIET were accredited to train school principals in accordance with the principles' competency profile. In collaboration with NIET, a technical aid from recognized international institutions was provided to HEIs to create assessment tools and design modular programs. From 2011 to 2014, NIET supervised TEIP program that was tasked with the development and upgrading of skill sets among teachers. Furthermore, it upgraded the qualification of more than four thousand under-qualified teachers who teach
grade one to four to the required professional competencies. NIET with Education Faculty teams (EFT’s) has overseen this program that was provided at teachers' education colleges (Hashwa, 2011b). As a result of this program, teachers were granted a Class Teacher Professional Certificate that ensured their qualification.

Additionally, two interviewees from AED participated in this research. AED built the learning and teaching package of assessment that would develop qualification modules for teachers' qualification programs at HEIs. It has also created achievement indicators that would assess students and contextual settings. Furthermore, AED was registered for two major tasks that include developing an assessment strategy and the national item bank that enables more rapid and cost-efficient test development (MoEHE, 2011a). AED organized various conferences that would ensure assessment and evaluation to ensure constant assessment measures in the Palestinian territories.

In summary, while implementers were actively or passively involved in the implementation process, they were often overwhelmed and confused by the many conflicting and overlapping roles. Most of the interviewees in this study found that their dual role sometimes caused conflicting relationships between the different directorates or within the same department. The following section highlights some examples of the conflicting situation between MoEHE units. For example, NIET is the official unit that is registered for providing teachers' training, but DSQ consists of two departments, one is for supervising and the other for teachers’ qualification. Thus, the DSQ role in teachers' training sometimes is conflicted with NIET role as it supposed to be the only unit that is responsible for teachers' training.

### 8.5 Overlapping of Roles & Responsibilities

Another factor that interviewees brought up in regard to the implementers' involvement is the overlapping of responsibilities and roles between the different units. According to Shinn (2012), “with the confusion over responsibilities and roles, the MoEHE focused on revising teachers' knowledge and skills by borrowing the best international models and content without sufficient attention to the coordination and integration of responsibilities” (p.22). According to the interviewees, the matter was concentrated around those who
train teachers, supervise them, and measure and assess their performance. Thus, the lack of coordination and integration between various units has been a confusing weakness of the TES implementation process through the MoEHE’s interventions. More importantly, most of them observed that the overlapping of roles and responsibilities led to individual and collective conflicts between the TES implementers, especially at the grassroots and upper levels. However, they expressed different perceptions regarding the cause and consequences of this situation.

On the one hand, some of them found that the internal policies and regulations pertaining to the responsibilities and roles encouraged the overlapping condition. The MoEHE’s higher level regulated general administration’s roles of its units, such as NIET, DQS, CDTP, ADE, and AQAC in the book of Instruction and Regulations (MoE, 2020). For example, NIET is regulated as the main entity to register and train in-service teachers and provide them with professional development diplomas. Regarding the same matter, DSQ was also tasked with the role of teacher training by providing training via workshops in addition to its main supervisory role. There are two departments under its umbrella (supervision and qualification). Additionally, several local and international institutions and agencies play the role of teachers' training in varied subjects and via different funds. Administrator Ihab expressed his criticism about the overlapping condition in responsibilities of the teachers' training at the directorate level especially between the NIET and DQS units. It is observed that the MoEHE’s instructions and regulations led to a state of overlapping and as a result to conflict and struggle between MoEHE's units either individually or collectively. He explained:

> There are many parties of the MoEHE that are regulated to get involved in a specific job - I mean providing teacher training, and therefore implementers have experienced many incidents of conflict and confusion. Supervisors and trainers in NIET and DSQ are responsible for key pieces of TES implementation... They follow regulations and do the best they can, but some responsibilities are confusing and overlapping… Some departments should stick to one job only.

Administrator Mustafa explained how DSQ has been involved uniquely in several projects in addition to supervising and training teachers. He observed that this involvement positively impacted TES implementation, but perhaps their overlapping role with NIET in regard of the development of teacher competencies has complicated the
implementation process. He suggested that in order to end the confusion around roles and decrease conflicts between implementers, it is important to specify responsibilities and present that in clear instructions and budgets. He stated his opinion in the following:

Despite that NIET is assigned for a specific training role, DQS worked on similar role... An example of the overlapping and conflicting issue can be seen in the development of teacher standards and competencies... At the beginning when the teacher competencies were projected by WB programs, DQS had also developed different standards, it was a big conflict about which to follow, their standards or WB competencies. Now this conflict is kind of settled, but the deeper problem still exists because some regulatory mechanisms and budgets in regard to specific responsibilities for those who train and those who supervise teachers is still unresolved so far, and I think our leaders need to be brave and make clear adjustments particularly at the policy and regulatory level.

In addition, Administrator Rami continued by explaining the conflicting situation with the following:

Despite that the old Minister appointed the responsibility of training to NIET, we need a clear declaration of the key roles across the MoEHE's units - especially training and supervision duties... Those who work directly with teachers should be identified by clear and specific budgets.... We also need a united vision and agreement about most of the details so we can settle any conflicts.

Administrator Shaheera envisioned that the overlapping in responsibilities and roles is related to the MoEHE’s limited capacity and to the political and economic instability that has a profound effect on teacher socio-economic development, especially at the grassroots level. However, she found that specifying clear instructions and allocating a dedicated budget would enhance the capacity-building process, especially when leaders use the full potential of the ministry's experts and take into account their social justice. She commented in the following:

I don't want to claim that I know everything, or we can solve everything, but you know the problem is deeper than publishing a book of regulations or enacting a law - we know the complication of the economic and political situation and we know also that the MoEHE capacity to change this situation is limited... I believe at least when everyone is responsible for what they do, this will lead us forward positively as we move one step closer to our goal... A key point of success is identifying specific regulations about everyone’s responsibility and bringing out their potential and expertise.

On the other hand, several interviewees pointed out that the aforementioned confusion and overlap is rather due to external interference that has impacted all aspects of Palestinian life. Thus, they believe that international agencies have always imposed their vision and regulations. Since the MoEHE’s capacity and budget is limited, it has no
choice but to accept donor conditional requirements, even when they sometimes cause a conflict of interest, especially in regard to Palestinian patriotic and international agendas. The most obvious example was provided by Administrator Sama who clarified as follows:

It is obvious that the conflicting situation is all about the funds and when they provide the money there is a conditional term... The problem occurred because the MoEHE needs financial support in order to reform teacher education but by implementing neoliberal policies and agendas rather than our (Palestinian) view, estimate, and national rights, then conflicts occurred... Because of international pressure, we still lagged behind and we are paralyzed and can't regulate ourselves - clearly, we are confused and our capacity has been limited.

To conclude, there is significant overlap and confusion between implementers caused by internal and external conditions. The internal conditions consist of the MoEHE lacking the capacity to employ and specify clear policies, roles, and responsibilities on the one hand, and lacking the resources and budgets for the development process on the other. The external conditions consist of the imposition of the international agenda regarding Westernized models and their respective implementation approaches on the one hand, and the economic and political instability as a result of Israeli occupation on the other hand. Thus, most of the interviewees suggested that the MoEHE should invest in its potential and expertise. The MoEHE’s upper level should adopt a stronger coordination and integration approach and find solutions that fit the Palestinian context and needs.

Despite this conflicting and confusing situation that is witnessed between the implementers themselves or with international actors, all of them are marshaled passively or actively to reach the same objectives of the TES implementation process.

8.6 Lack of Consensus on Preferred Reforms

Having covered the causes of the overlapping condition, many interviewees were also critical of its consequences on the TES implementation process. They had no doubt that the absence of a clear linkage between and within key Ministry departments, particularly at the level of training and supervision, have not only hampered the general TES outcome but also impeded quality improvement, notably the process of transferring knowledge and the skills from the teacher training programs to the classroom setting. First example of that was provided by Educator Hana who has been training teachers for many years. She
believes that the core element of training programs is to transfer the new teaching attributes (competencies) to the classroom setting. She insisted that the process of transformation required the MoEHE’s leaders to specify who is responsible for such a process which has not been clearly addressed yet. In detail, her concern is about the supervision role that is supposed to be specified to ensure the teachers' gained attributes are carried over to real learning and teaching environment. She believes that the development of this role is still more akin to taking “baby steps” with more work to do. She presented her opinion in the following:

In the training programs we do everything to make sure teachers learn appropriately, such as teaching new concepts and methods... the MoEHE’s trainers use modern methodologies in teaching, but we do not have any authority, and mechanisms to ensure the teacher's attributes are transferred to the real setting (classrooms)... As educators we do not know how they apply the learning knowledge and skills... This is the responsibility of other departments (Supervision Department). ... Supervising teachers in their classrooms is a key element for sustainability... unfortunately, there is a lot of confusion around such an issue.

Another example expressed by Administrator Mustafa who observed that the MoEHE’s key implementers should coordinate and develop a mature relationship based upon a preferred reform of methods to sustain the teachers’ gained teaching attributes. He believes that achieving this goal requires stronger involvement by the district supervisors who have a direct relationship with teachers and are responsible for coaching and evaluating them. He pointed out that supervisors have not been involved appropriately in the reform process as they should be. For example, the number of supervisors who joined the early stages of WB training programs were not sufficient. He explained:

After training teachers, some of them became knowledgeable about the new content more than their supervisors because of the limited number of supervisors who joined the training programs, such as TEIP... So sometimes this created tension between the two parties... I know that supervisors are the most knowledgeable and have expertise in many educational matters, but I think they need to be on the same page in regard to teachers' qualifying knowledge and skills... the MoEHE's staff, such as supervisors, principals, district directors, and administrators must be in agreement with the instructional practices and evaluation methods and what skills they expect teachers to acquire.

The same point was also presented by Administrator Mohand who observed that it is necessary to establish common understanding and knowledge among school implementers, namely mentors, principals, and teachers regarding the learning and teaching processes, as well as the required instructional standards and competencies for
their success. In other words, a lack of unity regarding preferred strategies led to the impediment of large-scale reform. Shinn (2012) suggested that district supervisors and school principals are supposed to assume a major role in the mediation of professional development and the application of the new teaching skills in the classroom setting. Their potential role in providing instructional leadership and coaching for teachers is significant. However, their overlapping involvement in training and long-standing practice governed the interaction between them which is not based upon a mutual understanding of how to achieve teacher competencies and raise student achievement.

Leader Tamer commented in this regard as the following:

It is obvious that the mismatch between the roles of these entities has to do with the Ministry's traditional practices. Ministry traditional practices have tended to relegate supervisors to the role of trainers, inspectors, and evaluators for teacher performance. Principals are still managers and can't fully support teachers in a healthy teaching environment. It is simple principals cannot be both supporters and school managers at the same time; and the worst is that the old tradition is still dominating so many district officials as they still play the role of bureaucratic gatekeepers.

Administrator Ihab also suggested expanding the new teacher competencies to be shared from a larger scale of educational teams. He explained:

Beyond training teachers how to teach differently, the system needs to support teachers in their classroom settings so that they can solve problems of practice based on the new learning concepts. This requires those administrators who are involved with teachers in schools to be trained as well, and to get involved in all aspects of change. I mean the concepts of new identity, methodology, and pedagogy of learning. We need to spread the word of these modern concepts, regulations and guidelines. To date, the Ministry’s senior leadership may have developed such a vision internally but has struggled to get everyone to agree on a formal agenda for learning and teaching action.

In addition, Educator Hala described how teachers are reluctant to join the training programs because they are frustrated by the confusing role of supervisors and principals who assessed their performance by using different forms which are not linked to the “index competencies” that were developed by WB. She opined that those supervisors neglected working on the sustainability of the teacher characteristics necessary to increase teaching quality.

Some teachers do not show enthusiasm for joining the training programs - why? They think that the content of the programs is a repetition of other programs, and it's not beneficial because their supervisors at the school don't assess them based of the quality of learning or their mastery of the teachers' competencies - instead they assess them based on restrictions to the curriculum textual completion and using long practicing teaching skills and norms.
In this respect some interviewees insisted that evaluation approaches that are based on a broad effort of collaboration and coordination, such as the M&E reports where everyone participate should be developed and form key indications for real change. Administrator Reema observed that the evaluation approaches should be an essential tool for improving a coherent governance and system. These approaches should not only adhere to the Westernized models of accountability and teacher performance. For example, M&E reports and approaches provide detailed analyses and suggestions about the whole educational process. She stated:

Evaluation by the M&E department has been an essential process working on the evaluation of teacher qualifications and it should be considered with more seriousness in order to create a solid measurement and management system and aligned framework including responsibilities... M&E reports have assessed and shared recommendations… Thus, we need to ensure that this result brings action and feedback.

In this perspective, Educator Hala also observed that teachers have no motivation to join the continuing qualification or professional programs - not only because they don't agree with supervisors about how to practice and evaluate their competencies - but also because they have not gained any financial benefits or advanced their career. He elaborated in the following:

Teachers, even though they were granted a qualification certificate, experienced no difference in their salaries or their career scale. And because of the struggling and conflicting situation about their benefits and positions, on many occasions it has led them to join strikes to increase their salaries or advance their careers, and as a result they sometimes won a few battles.

On many occasions, the interviewees discussed and agreed with Educator Hala's observation about the conflicting situation between the upper level and lower-level implementers regarding financial benefits and positions through the implementation process. Administrator Mustafa mentioned the conflicting situation in the following:

Everyone knows that the conflicting and struggling situation especially between teachers and the upper level has been an endless dilemma and I believe without ending the profound problem, which is the instability in economic and political situation, nothing would be effective even though there was some settlement and gaining.

In conclusion, most of the interviewees observed that the disagreement issue has hampered the development and application of a clear vision and direction for teacher identity, especially in the classroom setting. Particularly, there has been a lack of
consensus on preferred approaches between the training and supervision departments on teacher competency programs, the measures taken to determine how students have to learn and how teachers have to be evaluated, and which approach have to be followed. More importantly, there is a clear conflicting relationship between the lower and higher levels regarding gaining benefits and positions in the TES implementation process. This situation has affected teacher motivation for joining the qualification programs and reaching an agreement between the learning and teaching staff about their competencies and evaluation approaches.

Therefore, interviewees emphasized adopting evaluation approaches that are based on a strong governance and management system where students and teachers practice their autonomy on the learning and teaching process and build a high-quality schooling system that stands solidly on their own contexts and needs. The next section sheds light on the official and personal evaluation process.

### 8.7 Official Evaluation Process

In addition to the previously-introduced Assessment and Evaluation Department (AED), the MoEHE established the Monitoring and Evaluation Department (M&E) within the General Directorate of Planning in 2009. The main goal of the monitoring and evaluation system is to assess the MoEHE’s educational strategic plans, including TES objectives and goals. In general, the official evaluation process at the MoEHE is arranged in two internal forms: The process of the overall job performance evaluation is organized annually to evaluate the performance of all the MoEHE employees, but the most generic one is conducted by the department of Monitoring and Evaluation. A third form of evaluation is occasionally arranged and published by the local and international specialized partners or consultants and this process usually takes the form of ad hoc sector reports to assess or review the final achievement of the programs or projects.

The MoEHE’s annual job performance evaluation is applied at the Ministry's directorates and departments to evaluate the performance of all staff, including leaders, administrators and educators. The job performance evaluation process is conducted by each directorate separately even though the ministry adopts a similar form for all positions despite any
differences in the performance and rank of these positions. The job performance evaluation form is utilized at times by the units to evaluate training programs, workshops, and the performance of the providers. Thus, most interviewees described this job performance evaluation process as ineffective. GD Sara stated that it is “solemn, ineffective, and not being really powerful in bringing any real change.” GD Ali also described it as “useless and it is conducted in a bureaucratic way and without any authentic purpose.” Additionally, Administrator Mahdi described it as being “conducted routinely to follow up with the top-level requirements more than to pursue changes.” Administrator Sama described it as “an official way to claim that we do everything correctly even when there is no difference to claim.”

However, the M&E system along with its periodic reports provides in-depth and precise indicators (quantitative and qualitative) and data that offers clarification of the status and the underlying conditions of the plans and proposes recommendations necessary to enforce the tangible interventions that may bring change as described by the MoEHE (2018). This is done through the process of monitoring several performance indicators for each of the programs. The indicators cover the objectives of the Strategic Plan Programs (Pre-School, Basic education, Secondary Education, Vocational Education, Non-Formal Education, and Governance and Management). In 2017, indicators were added for Higher Education and the reality of education in areas that are subject to Israeli military occupation violations (MoEHE, 2018). Moreover, the M&E reports provide an evaluation for the annual work plans based on the international criteria of relevance, efficiency and effectiveness. Indicators were monitored at two levels: goals and objectives. They were separated into key performance indicators and sub-indicators. The M&E system of 2017 has 107 performance indicators distributed amongst the Educational Strategic Programs. They are split into 50 quantitative indicators, 51 qualitative indicators and 6 implementation indicators. As for the programs, the total numbers of indicators for the programs were as follows: Preschool 14, Basic Education 27, Secondary Education 23, TVET 14, Non-Formal 6, Governance and Management 11.

In general, the M&E evaluation system was described by most interviewees as the most realistic and effective form of evaluation. According to the MoEHE (2017b), the goal of
this system is to boost the Ministry’s results-based management and strengthen internal accountability in the education system. Most interviewees found that the system (along with its issued reports) is “an effective tool for giving several indications that assist in the strategic planning process and redirect the plans regularly” as it was put by Administrator Reema. In addition, it was described as presenting “an accurate control of procedures, a high trust and technical professionalism of the annual report team, and a strong contribution to the credibility of the results and data” (MoEHE, 2017b). However, most of the interviewees believe that the system has not been comprehensively addressed yet.

The leaders of the MoEHE are reluctant to invest in the results of this evaluation tool to bring a real change. In this regard, Administrator Reema described the situation in the following:

M&E system is supposed to be a key source for the decision-making process at all levels to assess the appropriateness of adopted policies by verifying the relationship between implementation and results... We (leaders and administrators) are proud of this system as it is well-developed and unique in our region, but it has a way to go, and there are many issues to be addressed in this regard.

Additionally, some interviewees found the capacity of leaders in making real change to be lacking and observed that the centralized system with its ingrained bureaucratic procedures may complicate any positive results. This situation is best described by leader Tamer who put it in the following way:

Although there is some evidence of the influence of M&E reports, such as changing the design of future plans and adopting new policies that should make some change, but unfortunately no measures are built into the management operations to ensure that annual M&E findings are taken on board. Leaders may discuss the reports but there is no evidence that the results bring appropriate corrective actions by them.

The external evaluation form is usually conducted by ad hoc local or international organizations, such as UNISCO or WB for specific programs or projects. In addition, the MoEHE was involved in hiring external specialized consultants and assigning an internal unit of the MoEHE to do an ad hoc evaluation. For example, TEIP published a number of reports for WB programs over the last ten years (e.g., World bank, 2011a, 2011b, 2011c, and 2014; Hashwa, 2017). Generally, by most interviewees, the external evaluation form has it special effect and is considered more “powerful politically” as it puts pressure from the donor community on policy makers” as described by Leader Muraad. However, some
interviewees found that the external evaluation process sometimes brings unrealistic demands, particularly when it comes to the complexity of the Palestinian political and economic context. Some of the international demands were seen as conflicting with the issues of Palestinian autonomy and independence, or unrealistic considering the economic and political instability. In this respect, Administrator Mohanad described the external evaluation reports as “biased and unrealistic dealing with the sensitive political issues and can't meet the economic and national requirements.” For example, there is huge pressure from donors to replace sections of the curriculum, such as certain Palestinian historical accounts and cultural values. Administrator Sama elaborated in this regard by stating the following: “We (Palestinian) can't accept this kind of demand and pressure... No one is allowed to toy with the future of our generations or change the fundamentals of our cause and historical accounts.” In this respect, Administrator Rami put it as the following:

How would the Ministry fulfill unrealistic demands when we (Palestinians) are under continuing pressure... Even some reports highlighted positive and realistic recommendations, but unfortunately because of our sensitive context they produced negative conflict around the implementation and this affected the performance of everything.

In general, all the participants agreed that all forms of evaluation are supposed to serve as powerful and effective tools for providing accurate feedback which would help in adjusting and refining the MoEHE's plans and decisions. However, none of them have functioned fully in that way. On the contrary there is a lot of change needed around the evaluation concept, purpose and approaches. They believe that most of the evaluation approaches failed to bring a large-scale “authentic change” and for all stakeholders, partners, and decision-makers. It has not been as effective as intended in changing the traditional mentality around the teacher’s authoritarian role, especially when teachers still are underpaid and schools are under-resourced. This effectiveness was questioned by many, such as GD Ali who elaborated with the following:

Isn’t the purpose of the evaluation process and its reports to generate effective intervention and help reform the education system? But what difference has it made? So far it has all failed to help the ultimate goal of the TES project as it is supposed to build new generations who are able to compete locally and internationally, and to develop new cadres (teachers, administrators) that understand its new role as it is stipulated in TES documents...With such circumstances where teachers work at under-resourced schools and have not been satisfied with their social status and
payment, in addition to fact that the learning and teaching process is kidnapped from outsiders with limited resource availability, I think the future is not promising.

In conclusion, the Ministry of Education and Higher Education seeks to strengthen its organizational role in the educational sector by institutionalizing the educational strategic planning process, leading it to adopt a number of evaluation instruments including the M&E system. The evaluation process identifies a necessity to develop sound project management by applying result-based designing, management and monitoring systems to every project. This also will require training for all project implementers (MoEHE, 2018). However, the process has been very slow because of the lack of funds, the domination of the centralized system, and the dark picture painted by the economic and political instability conditions. On the one hand, and for all the interviewees, this dark picture is embodied in the PA’s limited control over resources and governance, such as water resources, land annexation, and border movement, as the Israeli occupation controls every aspect of Palestinian life and imposes systematic policies that stifle any chance of salvation for Palestinians. On the other hand, the MoEHE has not succeeded in achieving its intended goals because of the dominant nature of the centralized system, in addition to Israeli economic and political hegemony. Therefore, the decentralization process is still in its infancy. In this respect, most interviewees questioned the capacity of their organization to promote the institutionalization project and the result-based approach. Therefore, they suggested that the evaluation tools including the M&E system must be promoted by building a coherent governance system that encourages collaboration and integration between all stakeholders.

8.8 Personal Assessment

All interviewees in this research were asked about their personal assessment of the TES implementation outcome. Most of them generally expressed a positive response. For instance, Administrator Sama put it as follows: “The implementation of TES so far is challenging but certainly the quality of education has improved a lot in Palestine compared to ten years ago before the establishment of TES.” Educator Hala was also quite optimistic:
Definitely significant changes have been brought by the implementation process - for example more teachers get qualified every year, NIET leads the process of teacher qualification and CDTP developed teachers' standards and criteria for promotion, ranks and so on.

Educator Hana also expressed a positive view similar to Educator Hala:

No one can deny the positive difference that has been brought by the implementation of TES... New education programs have been developed and others were upgraded... All units of the MoEHE have been involved strongly and actively to achieve the goals of TES.

However, a few of the 16 interviewees were uncertain or conservative about the outcomes of the implementation process and some provided a negative expression and described major challenges in regard to developing new teacher roles, building a modern teaching system, and improving teacher's economic status and so on. First, some of them believe that many teachers gained a lot of new attributes after receiving their diploma, but they don't fully reflect those new attributes within classroom settings, GD Sara expressed her opinion by saying:

The new attributes have not been fully gained by all teachers yet and no actions directly addressing the new role to ensure real application in the classroom environment.... The percentage of teachers who take the diploma programs is considerable, but I think some of the new attributes such as those of facilitators, reflective workers and researchers that were supposed to evolve towards a more comprehensive direction are not there yet.

Administrator Sama mentioned that many teachers have gained a lot of positive attributes and remarkably won regional and local awards but the majority of them required a lot of development:

Many teachers won regional and local awards, but the majority need a lot of development... It is clear that the new vision in regard to teacher identity was deviating from its original concept.

In this regard, some participants critically summarized the reason behind this situation and provided critical suggestions. They believe that the TES vision has not been acknowledged by some implementers especially supervisors who are directly in touch with teachers. Therefore, no real actions were taken, especially in the teaching and learning environment. Moreover, none were specifically aimed at changing mentalities or designed around their role as evaluators, reflective workers or problem solvers (as mentioned in chapter 3). For GD Jamal, the proposed teacher attributes were not linked operationally or conceptually with the development of the curricula, and testing and teaching methods at the supervisory level as he elaborated:
The supervision department has been using old style of supervision and no change is noticeable in the mentalities of who are conducting such tasks... Evaluation mechanisms to measure how teachers do apply the new skills after being granted their diplomas are somehow ignored or not stressed by the supervisors and administrators... I know there are a lot of adjustments in the curricula, teaching methods and evaluation forms but a lot is needed in this regard.

Administrator Mustafa agreed with GD Jamal as both believe that the new teacher roles as facilitators and reflective professionals have not been acknowledged yet. Critically, GD Mustafa criticized the whole process of teacher education reform and found that such international approaches based on teacher accountabilities and performance are not able to address the teaching and learning problems in the classroom, nor are they able to change the old-fashioned way of teaching. Moreover, he described it as “a distorted reform process because it can't guarantee a progressive education system,” and added: “We need to address the original problem, which is a political background imposed by the Israeli occupation and its impacts on every aspect of our life.” Other interviewees were more critical of the outcomes, especially concerning student achievement. When asked if the TES implementation had a positive or negative impact on student achievement, Administrator Reema found no positive change in this regard:

I agree there is a noticeable percentage of qualified teachers who took the specialized programs (including pedagogy, and teaching methodology) but in terms of student learning achievement? I have no answer...what I know is that students both internationally and regionally still ranked at the bottom... They have lagged behind in many subjects so far.

When asked about the positive change in the teaching profession and teachers' socioeconomic development, all the interviewees agreed that there is no authentic application on the ground of the promotion and ranking system despite the theoretical development steps in this respect. They believe without enacting the new law in regard to the career scale promotion, the teachers' socio-economic status “would be jeopardized,” as described by Educator Fadi. Administrator Sama explained that the “teachers' socio-economic development should be expected through the application of the ranking and promotion system and enactment of the Laws of 2017, 2018 and 2019. However, nobody wants to admit the importance of enacting the law and improving the system, and even if they did, they would say that we don't have a miracle solution.” In this regard, Educator Hana questioned the credibility of depending only on the professional development programs to make real change. She asked:
How many teachers attended the qualification programs compared to the number of teachers who saw a parallel change in their socio-economic status? The difference is huge, right? So far, there is no action directly linking teacher development programs to the ranking and incentive system so even if teachers go to these programs and get the diploma, there is no change in their ranking scale and therefore no change in their socio-economic status... Why is this?... I know there is no negative intention by implementers including leaders and international providers but when everyone ignores the complex reality then the outcome would be unproductive... Ironically, we only focus on building the skills and knowledge of teachers without paying enough attention to link these programs to the promotion ranking system.

In this respect Educator Hala expressed a serious concern about this issue and put it in the following way:

The problem is we (implementers) don't know what was came first, the chicken or the egg... On the one hand, I mean delaying the application of the ranking system and not linking it with teacher's qualifying programs hardly affects teacher motivation to join these programs... On the other hand, there is a need to make the change authentically, not only on paper... Teachers' status as part of the whole population of Palestine must be developed and when Palestinians become free their conditions will be changed too and teacher’s socio-economic status as the others can be positively changed and this is the ultimate goal and the purpose of the whole strategy.

Similarly, most of the interviewees expressed a negative attitude toward delaying the application of the ranking and promotion system. However, they observed that the PA’s budget allocation system usually pumps more resources into programs other than TES, as well as ministries other than the MoEHE. Educator Mahdi mentioned that the MoEHE is one of the largest ministries in the country that hires a mass of employees, but it doesn't receive the largest budget comparatively. He put it in the following way:

The unequal distribution in society is ironic; it is obvious that the MoEHE has not been applying the promotion and ranking system and linking it with teacher development programs because of the budget allocation shortfall... We know that the MoEHE is one of the largest ministries, yet it does not receive the largest budget.

Administrator Ihab was frustrated by this situation which has no chance for change and said: “I don't know who is to blame... but I think the financial and political unsolved condition is the reality that we have to deal with.”

In summary, most interviewees found the implementation of TES components satisfactory despite the described challenges, as they provided in-depth analysis and elaboration of the real situation of success and failure of the implementation. As stipulated in the MoEHE report, TES focused on the development of:

Human educational cadre, in particular teachers, so that they can advance along with their students towards excellence and distinction.... TES harmonizes in-service and pre-service teacher education
towards attaining good outputs that can assist the students and reinforce the role of teachers in a comprehensive development process... This can also give room to modernizing the educational systems in accordance with accelerating scientific and technological advancements. (MoEHE, 2008, p. 7)

Basically, the MoEHE’s individuals and units were committed to implement the major components of TES. Thus, most of them recognized and appreciated the large improvement of the four TES components (qualification of pre-service, and in-service programs, modernization of the teaching profession, as well as management and capacity building process) but they remarked that major challenges hampered authentic changes in core elements of the strategy. Most of challenges were embedded in environmental variables which affected the whole process of the implementation as well as the outcomes of TES. In consideration of the context of Palestine, the unavoidable condition - particularly the political and economic condition contributed directly and indirectly to the outcomes of TES. For most of the interviewees, the new teacher role is clearly a new concept for the Palestinian educational culture and has not replaced the teachers’ traditional role. In addition, the teaching profession has not been transformed into a modern teaching profession where teacher's status has evolved. Thus, they perceived that the actual outcome of the implementation showed shortcomings.

In conclusion, when reviewing the stakeholders’ involvement individually or collectively, it is clear there is a positive and large-scale involvement which reflects a significant impact on the success and failure of the implementation. However, there was overlap and confusion regarding the roles and responsibilities of implementers. Although both level of implementers marshaled their effort collectively and agreed to work together to achieve TES goals, there is a noticeable disagreement on preferred objectives between the grassroots level and leaders. To fulfill the implementation requirements of TES, MoEHE led broad interventions, such as adopting a wide range of programs for upgrading and qualifying pre-service and in-service teachers, building the capacity of teacher education management, and distinguishing new features of the profession by developing a modern system. The achievements and changes brought about rationally by TES implementation have been remarkable, but they are inconclusive in terms of teachers practicing new characteristics or improving student achievement and the teachers' socio-economic status.
Thus, this chapter highlighted how the MoEHE has employed what was assumed to be the most efficient implementation by adopting strategies and evaluation tools that may be suitable to such complex conditions. But the intervention strategies and outcomes were viewed differently by various interviewees, mainly as effective, despite that many events failed to achieve the core elements defined by the TES recommendations. The next chapter will continue to critically probe the stakeholders’ perceptions and unfavorable institutional and environmental aspects that have hampered TES implementation. These factors include the capacity problem as a consequence of the economic and political restrictions, the negative effect of the centralized communication structure and mechanisms, the effect of the imposition of the international agenda, and the dispositional conflict of the implementers. Thus, both the MoEHE and the international community must make a greater effort toward adopting an overall approach dealing with TES recommendations so they can be achieved at a larger scale and more successfully.
Chapter 9

9. A Complicated Implementation Process

Over the last ten years, the Palestinian MoEHE shifted its priorities from a focus on access to education to raising the quality of education. The Teacher Education Strategy and the follow-up interventions, as reviewed in Chapter 4, represent the MoEHE’s effort accompanied by a push from international donors to reform teacher education in Palestine. In this regard, interviewees observed a strong improvement at the four TES components (see Chapter 4), such as upgrading pre-service programs and qualifying in-service teachers, modernizing the teaching profession, and building up the MoEHE’s management and capacity. However, these efforts have highlighted unavoidable challenges stemming from environmental variables which affected the entire implementation process and TES outcomes.

As introduced in the analytical model for this study in Chapter 6 (the Theoretical Framework), several variables were identified as critical to understand the performance of the TES implementation. Thus, this chapter presents a number of units of analysis to fully understand the complicated aspects of the implementation process, including several unavoidable factors that played a major role in the process and impacted its success or failure (Van Meter & Van Horn, 1975, p. 474). Most of these aspects stem from the MoEHE’s capacity problem, particularly the economic and political restrictions, the socio-economic inequality as a conflicting situation, the dominant international role versus national aspiration, the communication challenges that are represented by the centralized system, and lastly, the dispositional conflicts which hampered achieving an authentic change.

9.1 The Capacity Problem: Political and Resource Restrictions

According to Van and Van (1975), “successful implementation is a function of the implementing organization’s capacity to do what it is expected to do.” Thus, the ability to implement policies may be hindered by varied factors as “overworked and poorly trained staff, insufficient information and financial resources, or impossible time constraints” (p.480).
In other words, the unstable political and economic conditions imposed by the Israeli occupation and the prolonged struggle to achieve national independence affect the different aspects of life in Palestine. Despite this fact, the Palestinians' resilient education system is responsive to rapid global changes and prepares individuals for a better future. The MoEHE’s duty is to provide the backbone, the leadership and the implementation drive and capacity. However, restrictions on the political and economic capacity (power and resources) within the PA, including the MoEHE as an affiliated institution, has completely affected the TES implementation. Therefore, TES has not been comprehensively achieved yet.

In this regard, it is important to clarify the contradictions regarding the PA’s political condition and the reflection of that on the MoEHE’s capacity as a governmental institution. On the one hand, the PA including MoEHE faces institutional incapacitations that have their origin in the country’s quasi-political system. As mentioned previously in chapter 2, West Bank and Gaza strip has been considered according to the United Nations General Assembly No 19/67 as occupied Palestinian Territories (OPT). Since 1967 and due to the Israeli occupation, the immense challenges of political insecurity and economic instability have been faced by people of the territories (MoEHE, 2018).

According to Amnesty (2022), the OPT have been experiencing a breach of international laws and conventions due to the colonial activities especially Israeli settlers in OPT (West Bank, East Jerusalem and Gaza strip). The apartheid wall has been imposed and extended on OPT land without any agreement with the PA (Amnesty, 2022). Since the Oslo agreement between Israel and the PLO, many security issues have been highlighted. Israeli controls more than 60% of the land including external borders, the custom duty collection, movement of goods and people as well as many economic and political authorities (Khalidi, 2017). Additionally, The Palestinians in Jerusalem do not have any political representation or autonomy (MoEHE, 2018).

Although the PA’s efforts in authorizing and implementing neoliberal policies should promote the education sector and lead to economic prosperity, its dependency on donor funds has been hampered by US pressure and the political and economic structural realities of Israeli occupation (Klein, 1997). The PA lacks the power and structural
capacity to control its resources and harness them towards Palestine’s priorities. Consequently, the PA depends on donor resources which have contributed to the minimalization of its “policy space” in the implementation processes (Klein, 1997). This limitation means that the PA is lacking policy tools required to effectively enact a large-scale implementation of more traditional neoliberal policies. Despite the “policy space” limitation (particularly fiscal, where it sometimes has some reach) of the PA in the education and economic sectors, the nature of the political system remains the most crucial determinant to the success of the implementation of the neoliberal agenda. The 1994 transfer of power as per the Oslo agreement should have been a sign of more freedom to come, but in reality, it has held the country hostage to its colonizers (Khalidi, 2017).

Most interviewees discussed the capacity limitation within the PA and the MoEHE as a major invincible barrier that has played strongly in the implementation of TES. In their point of view, despite the fact of that there are great donor aids that have contributed to implement TES components, the PA’s political and economic structure has prevented the MoEHE from achieving large scale improvements. Why? On the one hand, most of them found that the PA’s political structure under Israel’s control only allows limited political and economic space to implement the neoliberal reforming strategies. For example, Leader Muraad assumed that “the Ministry has adopted clear policies of the sector-wide approaches through the financial convention of the Joint Financial Arrangement from various countries with different international and local partners.” He also observed that the MoEHE’s leaders showed a strong desire and adopted various policies to raise the quality of education system. However, they are hindered by the lack of funding. The nature of aid is usually determined by the donors and is restricted by Israeli policies on entry of any supplies and equipment needed for development. He elaborated by adding that “sometimes it’s impossible to receive budgets for schools in Jerusalem and the old city of the Southern Neighbourhood of Hebron.”

Thus, this challenge has severely hindered the planning and performance processes. Teacher education reform depends entirely on donor capital, while it also requires political and economic stability and sustained resources in order for teachers to achieve a
decent social and economic status in society. In addition, several interviewees mentioned how the Israeli government controls the PA's budgeting and financing process through custom duty taxes which it withholds as a form of political pressure. They observed how this situation deeply affects the MoEHE’s budgeting plan and payment. The governmental employees' salaries sometimes are put on hold for months until the Israeli government releases the tax returns “Maqasa” to the PA. As a result, many times the PA was late to pay its employees and was forced to do so in installments. Leader Tamer indicated that “the MoEHE’s employees on the grassroots are the most vulnerable to such a crisis than others in higher ranks.” Thus, the limited financial resources, especially by money withheld by the Israeli government affected the most vulnerable groups (especially teachers) and hampered their socio-economic growth. GD Jamal was very critical about it. He insisted that “the wide spectrum of objectives with the ongoing financial crisis is an impediment for the teaching profession and teachers' socioeconomic status development.”

On the other hand, several interviewees were pessimistic and found that given the PA's lack of ability to control its affairs, the likelihood of such reform taking place in Palestine would be unrealistic. GD Ali was frustrated by the PA’s limited autonomy, especially in the economic and political space due to the Israeli restrictions on its budgets, trade and border movement. He commented with the following:

The PA and its ministries certainly suffered of budget limitations because of the political restriction on Palestinians by Israeli occupation that controls everything - merchandise, taxes, and even what to eat and what to do.... We struggle with this condition and the Ministry implements a lot of strategies either in planning or bringing aids but rather it's an intractable problem and it has become eternal since this endless occupation has control of all the resources and our life.

In this regard, Administrator Ihab indicated that “despite the huge international technical and financial involvement supporting TES implementation, the financial resources of the MoEHE have been always lacking.” The ongoing political and economic crisis has impacted the integrity of the implementation plans, particularly at regulatory levels. For example, teacher career scale development and application, which in his opinion “raises serious concerns for participants about the integrity of the whole process.” He also showed his frustration in the following:
Whatever the Ministry aims, it won't work unless this occupation comes to end and when Palestinians control their affairs, then everything is possible, for example the MoEHE has been trying to build the teacher career system that gives teachers what they deserve but this needs stability politically and economically and unfortunately our (Palestinians) choices are limited.

In addition to the critical political factors, some interviewees observed that the MoEHE is reluctant to employ the laws pertaining to teacher advancement system and this is very much tied to the shortness of internal budgets within the Ministry of Finance and the Palestinian Authority. The success of the implementation depends on the availability of financial resources from the national budget. The MoEHE allocates resources in the education sector on the basis of eight strategic programs of infrastructure, equipment and learning materials, planning teacher training, counseling and school health, curriculum, TVET and higher education, and HR management (MoEHE, 2011a). The eight programs are allowed to have a maximum of 10 major activities with four receiving funding every financial year (MoEHE, 2011a). The funds are not just from the Ministry of Finance but also other national and international actors including donor-supported projects and the Joint Financing Agreement. For example, in 2011, the eight programs received USD 136 million with TES receiving 4.5% of the amount (MoEHE, 2011a). In every financial year, programs, such as infrastructure receive a huge allocation as they involve physical developments compared to TES that involves “soft” activities.

With the lack of budget within the allocation system, Administrator Sama observed that the MoEHE has wanted to enforce the whole package of TES components, such as career scales for teacher promotion. However, the deficit in the Ministry’s internal budget has prevented the enactment of the amended law of 2017, 2018 and 2019 and the development of its organizational structure. She put it in the following way:

> TES recommendations emphasize the importance of the development of the teaching profession and the Ministry over the last years already has developed teaching standards and promotion and ranking systems... I know that leaders wanted to regulate a modern teaching profession but unfortunately on the ground the Ministry incapable of meeting the financial needs for this plan… everyone knows that the MoEHE has attempted to calculate the needs but couldn't allocate such budgets for this purpose... It is further than its capacity... with scarce resources the large-scale development including updating structure is impossible for now, receiving aids helped but without solving the real problem a failure is our destiny.
In this respect, Educator Fadi also indicated that the MoEHE is one of the largest ministries of the PA that hires a large number of employees, but it doesn't receive a sufficient and fair budget from the PA. He observed that “despite the large sum from the government into the MoEHE’s implementation projects including TES, this budget is still insufficient compared to the large number of its employees and projects.”

In summary, most of the 16 interviewees stated that the MoEHE’s limited capacity along with the impact of the political and economic restrictions to be the decisive factors which made it unavoidable for TES goals to go astray. Most of them believe the limited capacity problem will not be solved without fundamental solutions that target the original cause of the problem, aka the Israeli occupation that systematically limits the capacity of the Palestinian political bodies and their systems. For them, it is essential to end the occupation so they can thrive and build their own country including a modern educational system where leaders and teachers have full autonomy over their curriculum and affairs. Additionally, while most interviewees appreciated the international community’s financial and technical contributions, they also believe it needs to do more toward ending the Israeli occupation and be more understanding of the sensitive issues. After all, this sensitive issue has complicated the teacher education reform process and prevented teachers from forming their own vision and strategies that are more relevant to their context and circumstances. In the next section the socio-economic inequality situation as a second challenge will be presented.

### 9.2 Socio-economic Inequality: A Conflicting Situation

Due to the limited capacity and autonomy caused by the political and economic restrictions and instability, MoEHE has become incapable of accommodating or meeting the needs of its employees, particularly at the grassroots level, namely the teachers who are the target of the TES reform process. On the one hand, most interviewees confirmed the importance of job satisfaction as an essential piece of the success of TES implementation. According to most of them, and despite the random salary increases for teachers especially after participating in many strikes that were organized by the teachers' union as a response to teachers’ socio-economic inequality, the status of teachers has not been significantly improved by the TES implementation. For example, many teachers and
implementers at the grassroots level are under-paid and constantly struggling for an
increase to their salaries and are often looking for another job to enhance their living
status. Leader Tamer found that in comparison with other high-ranking professions,
teacher income is noticeably low. He said:

Implementers at the grassroots level, especially teachers, found themselves in a conflicting
situation... their social and financial status has been at stake and it is not looking promising... It
was common for them to fight for increasing their salaries and benefits.

Many interviewees agreed with the previous opinion, explaining how implementers have
participated in union strikes against the domination of the higher level in order to increase
their salaries and position of employment. They observed that teachers are often looking
for alternative solutions, such as seeking higher positions or finding another job in
addition to teaching. GD Sara elaborated on this matter in the following:

Teachers have been struggling to enhance their working conditions because they need to make a
living... They need additional income, like all other grassroots of the governmental
employees... I know this has been the condition for many... I am not blaming anyone, but this
situation is the effect of the economic and political crisis and it's heavier on teachers' who have
struggled the most by this situation.

According to GD Ali's input, the low income of teachers, especially males who are the
only providers for their family (one goal of TES is attracting males to the profession),
influenced their satisfaction with their job, or their relatively social status. This dissuades
parents from encouraging their children to choose teaching as a profession and keeps
secondary school students away from choosing teaching as their future profession. In
addition, Administrator Mahdi indicated that, “teachers’ salaries do not differ according
to the school level in which they teach, the subject that they teach or even the level of
training that they receive.” He observed that, despite their engagement in the qualification
programs and development process, their rank won't be changed and they won't receive
promotions. Thus, he thinks that the injustice of this situation has caused a lot of tension
and conflicts between the different layers of implementers. He believes that “in many
cases, the only promotion for trained teachers is to move to work in other higher positions
in the educational system as administrators, supervisors or principals (and such roles are
limited in number).” This is mainly due to the delay in the career development of teachers
since the teacher’s professional programs are not linked to the career ladder.
On the other hand, some of the participants have criticized the whole process and questioned the seriousness of the PA, especially the upper level of the MoEHE and its policies. They indicated that despite varied attempts by the upper level of the MoEHE to solve the income inequality issue, they found the conflicting situations are stronger than the MoEHE’s capacity to handle. How and why? For some of them, the MoEHE’s approach to budget allocation and drafting laws is not satisfactory. Administrator Reema observed that the budget allocated to the MoEHE by the government is not fair given its large number of employees compared to other ministries. She put it in the following:

I know that the MoEHE receives a big budget from the government but in regard to the large mass of employees in comparison with other ministries. It is unfair, insufficient and should receive more than that... teachers are suffering and others have more than their needs.

Additionally, Educator Hala observed that MoHE policymakers were reluctant to apply the ratified law that may decrease the income gap between various ministries and employees particularly between the grassroots and upper levels. She put it in this way:

There's a serious problem and we need to think broadly, the PA must enforce the laws that may solve the income gap problem in society... Teachers as grassroots implementers are the most vulnerable and if we compare their salaries with others in the high ranks in this society, we found that their income is very low - no one can live with 2-3 thousand shekels these days.

In summary, the socio-economic inequality - especially between the higher level and grassroots implementers - was the key challenge that has faced the TES implementation and has constituted an impediment to its success. With its limited capacity and resources, the MoEHE failed to allocate sufficient budgets and enact the law aiming to narrow the income gap between employees. Interviewees explained how the grassroots implementers - especially teachers - were the most affected by such a challenge as they suffer from this condition and it is observed in different ways. Therefore, teachers and their union initiated alternative solutions. Either they found new and better-paying jobs, or they went on strike to demand better salaries and positions. In many cases, their efforts paid off and their salaries increased.
9.3 National Aspiration Versus the Dominant International Role

In consideration of the historical and political condition, donor engagement is driven by the economic imperatives of ensuring the PA is stable in running the OPT’s affairs, regardless of the colonial actions of Israeli occupation against Palestinian sovereignty (Dana, 2020, p. 252). Many political activists criticize the effectiveness of donors’ neoliberal policies arguing that these policies only maintain the injustice status quo in OPT since they are conditioned with the Oslo framework - the Paris Economic Protocol (PEP) of the 1994. According to Dana (2020), the colonial dynamics interplay softly with the donor dominant role and aids in shaping the “crony capitalism that promotes neoliberal governance, private sector-led development, lax regulatory mechanisms for investors and a regressive taxation regime” (p.252). International aids are more focused on capital investors that invest in large-scale projects in the service at the expense of the agriculture and industrial sectors that OPT needs the most. Just as important, donor support to the private sector is tied to the progress in the public sector as PA’s bureaucracies, social provisions, employment services and security forces remain the foundation of a stable OPT. Consequently, donors are doing little in exposing the challenges experienced by the PA, including corruption, repressive security and authoritarian character. According to Turner (2016), donor support continues to act as a layer of pacification to the PA’s challenges in the pretense of pursuing political and economic stability in OPT. This has reduced donor funding to the private sector and extension for forming collusive networks that favor a few elites at the expense of the majority (Dana, 2020).

Thus, for most of the interviewees, the effectiveness of donor funding from international stakeholders will only become relevant and effective if they are carried out in a framework other than the Oslo Accord that reduces Palestine to a modern colony of Israel. On the other hand, and as mentioned previously, the notion behind teacher education reform is drawn from international trends, such as the “best practices” of Western models, which do not necessarily guarantee the equality of teachers or the establishment of a modern educational system that rises to the challenges of this era.
Despite of all of that, in general interviewees acknowledged the necessary involvement and the function of the international aid for implementing Palestine’s national policies including TES. However, they also recognized the impact of this role that contributed to minimize Palestinian’s policy extent and freedom to determine their own capacity. Hence, they provided many examples of the conflicts between the MoEHE and international donors, particularly around issues that reflect Israeli desire and intention. Leader Murad explicitly explained how the MoEHE stood up against international pressure to change contents of the Palestinian curriculum which reflected the Palestinian history of Nakba (Catastrophe); a historic event where hundreds of Palestinian villages were destroyed and hundreds of thousands of Palestinians were killed or expelled from their land in historical Palestine (Israel today) in 1948. Educator Hana provided another example of this conflict when she explained how international donors insisted on changing the names of funded schools and projects because they represented Palestinian national icons and commemorated national catastrophes.

Other interviewees found that the limitation of the national political and economic extent may encourage the condition of injustice and inequality in society. In this respect, they believe that the international policies have been reluctant to fairly deal with the sensitive issues and challenges within the Palestinian political and economic condition in addition to imposing external constraints that aligned with unfair Israeli policies on Palestinians. For example, Administrator Mustafa believes that these dominant international policies have created a new Palestinian class “elite” and broadened the division between social classes in society, including within the education system. He asserted that the international trends for reforming teacher education are not guaranteed to bring a collectivist social justice especially for teachers, instead those trends and standards like “best practice” have created essential conflicting relationships beside noticeable agenda contradictions between donors and Palestinians, which on the other hand have affected TES implementation negatively. He put it in the following way:

Everyone knows what's happening in the world in these days and we are (Palestinians) particularly suffer the most because the problem is tripled, occupation, social class division is getting wider and poverty rates became higher... This is happening here in the Palestine because a new class “elite” that was created by international neoliberal policies and by the new money... We did not experience anything like this division 20 years ago... Now people suffer from injustice situation
and young people are desperate to find a job and unfortunately many people are getting down on the list of poverty because of Israeli and international domination and its effect.

Others went further and criticized the PA’s dependency on these superstructure organizations and their policies. They suggested that the PA and the Ministry should decrease the international dependency and aids and create their own vision and practices. They observed that international policies not only created conflicting situations in TES implementation, but also a wider division between social classes in society as they are insensitive to the political Palestinian context. For example, Leader Muraad believes that the international educational standards and teacher education trends, such as the new teacher roles and profiles are not relevant to the current Palestinian context and Palestinians need to apply what it fits their circumstances.

The donor community has brought a new vision for teachers' education... It is true that many initiatives, such as the professional development programs by the HEIs and the MoEHE helped in enhancing teachers' knowledge and skills. However, significant capacity building of the Ministry has been lacking especially with the continuing economic crisis for the PA which led to extra conflicts and increases income gap between classes in society.

Similarly, Administrator Shaheera expressed a similar point of view:

The reforming movement of teacher education is a reflection of international trends... The international community has its own vision and standards that sometimes dominated the Palestinian vision and sometimes their policies may not be sensitive to the political and economic needs of Palestine... the MoEHE led the reforming movement through ad hoc initiatives funded by them and it has obligated to follow their standards without considering the possible feasibility of these standards in our society.

In this regard, Villegas-Reimers 2003; Darling-Hammond et al. (2005) indicated that “individual and collective measures, sensitively designed for the local context, can drive successful teacher professional development and strengthens the teacher's affiliation with his foundation and promotes professional justice.”

In summary, most interviewees discussed the challenge that was created by the imposition of the neoliberal policies on the teacher education reform process. They thought that the international trends that were introduced by the super-structural organizations has complicated the Palestinian national reform process. On the one hand, these policies of the international donors were insensitive to Palestinian context and culture, particularly by encouraging the creation of new social classes “elite” and
increasing social divisions. On the other hand, they found that international actors should deal fairly with the sensitive issues of Palestinian cause, such as their right of independence and autonomy over their land, water, commerce, movement and so on. In their opinion, international actors should support the Palestinian right of self-determination over their educational vision, national curricula and governance. Thus, receiving support from international communities should take of consideration of the Palestinian needs and desires as a key tool that would enhance Palestinian independence and end the occupation that is considered responsible for all the problems and challenges. The next paragraph discusses another factor that complicates the process of TES implementation which is deemed to be the communication challenge which is represented by the MoEHE’s authoritarian system.

9.4 Authoritarian System: Contradictory Directions
Chapter 7 elaborated on how the MoEHE’s centralized system sometimes positively maximized the agreement of implementers. However, this section will detail how the inherited hierarchical and centralized system is a key challenge for TES implementation, as it employs an authoritarian style for delivering information and communication between the TES implementers. In other words, this system did not always positively impact the implementation process as observed by most of the research participants. They found that the MoEHE actually worked to develop a new management system and proposed various plans of decentralization, but after more than ten years, the MoEHE has not met this goal. For them, the centralized system has permeated throughout the implementation process, as well as produced contradictory directions and incompatible requirements. Examples include incomplete capacity building, delays in adjusting the organizational structure, and excessive application of formal and bureaucratic procedures.

On the one hand, the capacity and resources building process has been inadequate and it has been a major challenge for the MoEHE’s leadership. Most interviewees observed that despite that the MoEHE intervened to build its capacity and resources by training a mass of moderate and grassroots levels of administrators, the ministry was incapable of meeting the intended goal logistically and financially. Thus, after more than a decade of TES implementation, the authoritarian structure is still dominant and the decisions are
often made based on hierarchical positions, not argumentative values and do not always involve the most informed individuals in the decision-making process. In this respect an elaboration and some suggestions were provided by GD Sara:

After all of these years, there is a confusion over authority and responsibility on all levels, decisions are still centralized therefore there is a need for new directions, and budgets... We may need an emergency plan that ensures new strategies and paths... For example, capacity development process should include wider of moderate level to partake in the institutionalization of the training courses to better serves the needs of the employees in varied directorates.

In addition to the financial and logistical difficulties that hampered the capacity building project of the MoEHE, it seems that the MoEHE’s leaders are reluctant to delegate authorities to the grassroots level. Some interviewees observed that the actual authority to make major decisions around issues of instructional policies, curriculum, pedagogy and evaluation remains highly centralized within the top level of the Ministry and ignores the micro level, such as schools, directorates, and supervision and training departments. Leader Muraad detailed his opinion as the following:

Leaders are reluctant to provide clear leadership directions towards the decentralization approaches, so their actions are not the most conducive to ensure the decentralization plan and change... It is because they are not reflecting a well-established understanding of the roles and authorities within key Ministry departments, universities, districts and schools. Simply put, leaders need to engage the grassroots and branches in this reform around taking responsibilities in every aspect, such as how students learn, and in which ways they learn, and who responsible to evaluate such change and when it is to occur.

Moreover, GD Ali encouraged the delegation of authorities as it is reinforced by M&E evaluation reports. He also highlighted the significance of the authority’s delegation process from upper level of leaders particularly to the administrators, such as the principals and school specialized staff:

Principals must be allowed greater autonomy, flexibility and support from the higher administrative levels and the MoEHE. International initiatives invest in school principals and clusters of teachers who are responsible for teachers’ professional development programs in schools... In this respect, M&E and international evaluation reports suggest that where principals and teachers have taken the role of leadership at the schools’ level would be empowering everyone because they know the schools’ specific needs and target staff weakness as well, and this in the long term would show positive results in regard to the MoEHE’s decentralization goal.

In this respect, Administrator Ihab suggested that the MoEHE should invest in its employees' competencies to enhance internal learning and build institutional capacity. He recommended that “investment in accumulating the technical and administrative
expertise of teachers, principals, and heads of departments at various directorates is a key step toward capacity building and to compensate the MoEHE’s weakness and deficits.”

On the other hand, Administrator Mohand criticized the dominant and the bureaucratic role that district supervisors have played in the implementation process. He observed that the current centralized function of district supervisors is “ineffective and causes administrative burdens on school administrators, principals and teachers.” He provided some suggestions in this regard:

Supervisors must play the role of consultation and service providers - not to be mandatory quality controllers of teacher’s performance... School staff should be given a larger margin of autonomy and let them learn from their mistakes... Unfortunately, the supervision department did not involve strongly in the training programs that were provided by WB at the universities and therefore some of them did not change their perception about learning and teaching methodology- they still play a traditional role that is most likely exclusive to being inspectors instead of being supporters.

Another manifestation of this system includes the delay in announcing the MoEHE’s structural modification which has been a major challenge for its decentralization project (MoEHE, 2018). Many interviewees mentioned that the organizational structure modification project and its final version has not been published until this moment or introduced to the MoEHE employees yet. GD Jamal detailed his perception:

Everyone knows that the MoEHE’s top level works on developing a contemporary organizational structure and leaders know the necessity of modifying the structure of the Ministry and declaring suitable responsibilities for its affiliated departments. This kind of adjustment would redefine the role of the employees at the directorate level, but unfortunately this version has not been accomplished yet.

Additionally, the third main manifestation of the MoEHE’s centralized system as described by interviewees is the bureaucratic style and excessive formality. They observed there is exaggeration of some procedures, such as attending too many meetings or sometimes paying too much attention to the forms of the official correspondence “Ketaab”. An example was provided by Educator Hana:

School’s principals are required to deal literally with the disclaimer requirement... For example, if they need to get rid of any damaged materials, such as books or furniture they have to officially inform the higher directorate and they have to wait at least two months until they can proceed... Ironically when they get rid of those materials after the two months of waiting sometimes, they are held accountable and they might get punished for proceeding without written permission even when they are allowed, as stipulated in the documents.
Educator Hala also found that some employees (particularly teachers) are overloaded by “administrative agendas and paperwork that is left disregarded.” Administrator Shaheera also criticized the overloaded training programs that are imposed on the employees. She explained how implementers were sometimes required to attend many programs due to donor preconditions. In her opinion, these programs are not based on their needs and necessities - instead they represent their political agenda. She commented on that through the following:

> Sometimes employees are exhausted and overwhelmed by attending some training programs... These programs are offered from different agencies without any consideration of their need, so they have no say to refuse them... I am not saying this is always happening, but unfortunately our needs sometimes go in different directions... I know without the donor help the MoEHE could not achieve that much, but there are sensitive matters that the international community must consider.

### 9.5 Dispositional Conflicts: Reluctant Attitudes

Van Meter and Van Horn's (1975) highlight in their model the essential impact of the implementers’ disposition regarding the policy implementation process to be effectively and successfully delivered and implemented. They also indicate that implementation may fail because implementers refuse to do what they are supposed to do. “Dispositional conflicts” occur because subordinates (implementers) reject the goals of their superiors (Van Meter and Van Horn, 1975). Goals and objectives may be rejected for numerous reasons, for instance they could offend the implementers’ personal values or extra organizational loyalties, violate their sense of self-interest or they alter features of the organization and its procedures that implementers desire to maintain (Kaufman, 1971).

Thus, this section briefly presents the implementers' perceptions toward one of the core elements of TES which is the new teacher role. Drawing on Li’s (2016) model, this study theorized that the stakeholders’ perceptions influenced by environmental factors that have negatively impacted the implementers' disposition toward TES components. Although most interviewees displayed strong comprehension and acceptance of the TES components, particularly the new teacher role concepts, they were not confident in the potential of its successful application in teaching and learning settings. They believe that the MoEHE has successfully led the TES implementation process toward the development of qualification programs, teacher education standards and frameworks,
incentives, licensing system, and the mechanisms for measuring teacher performance. However, they found that the environmental factors embodied in the economic, social, and political conditions have affected the implementation of TES components, and therefore the core elements of the TES remain incomplete. Why? One of the essential challenges was the traditional concept of the teacher role as practiced by the majority of stakeholders, namely teachers, supervisors, principals, and students. For example, the new teacher role requires teachers to not serve as authorities, but as organizers, facilitators, and guiders. In reality, students and educators from all levels, including colleges and universities, were familiar with the traditional teacher role as a transmitter of knowledge whose main responsibility was to transfer knowledge and serve as an authority over student learning. This condition was reviewed by Leader Tamer:

We have a real problem about our perception of the full implementation of the new teacher identification... For a long time, the learning and teaching system has been a reflection of the traditional social and cultural beliefs and it's common for teachers to show authority and to be the center of the class over everyone... This culture discourages students to develop their inquiring abilities especially being active learners... So, the common teacher role is to be lecturing students, and giving instruction then students to be only receivers, listeners and notes takers... In this system, submissive tests are the norm so testing student’s knowledge requires students only to memorize the knowledge to get high grades.

In addition, GD Sara provided more examples of the traditional concept of learning and how it permeates through the MoEHE’s teaching and learning environment. She put it this way:

This situation is everywhere in your house where your parents have full authority and you (kids) have to obey... We (leaders and trainers) have been trying to change the traditional concept of learning and teaching, but it won't change overnight... From my experience, teachers come to training sessions with a stubborn mindset and they think there is nothing new they want to learn... Honestly sometimes they haven't changed their attitudes until the end of the program.

Educator Hala complained that the traditional style of teaching and learning persists because there has not been any serious policy or effort to discard it, not to mention the implementation mechanisms have not emphasized the new role over the old-fashioned and familiar teaching practices, especially in the real learning and teaching settings. She explained her point as follows:

We train teachers to use new concepts and pedagogies but when teachers go to classrooms and teach, they try to teach differently and make changes in the classroom settings but it's not easy for them with the different mindset of other staff and the long-time and familiar teaching strategies...
Teachers are required to complete the content of the books literally and follow the supervisor requirements strictly... It's the system, policies and its instructions that needed to be changed to apply the new concept reality.

Educator Hana was the most enthusiastic about the new teacher role; she believes in the necessity of building a modern system, including its new trends. At the same time, however, she was extremely frustrated with what could be feasible in reality. She critically noted that the national policy of teacher education reform had placed more pressure on trainers and teachers than supervisors and administrators, even though they were supposed to play a major role due to spending more time leading teachers in their classrooms:

Educators train teachers on the new concepts and its methodologies but unfortunately, they (trainers) don't have any authority to guarantee its application, such as conducting a visit to support the learning process in real settings.

Her view was shared by most of other interviewees. Educator Fadi explained the following:

Teachers are reluctant to attend the training programs because they find no point in learning new concepts where the old customary practices prevent them applying what they have learned in the classroom... Sometimes teachers have difficulty fitting new practices into the learning environments because sometimes they are not allowed.

Other interviewees provided more examples about the long and dominant practices. Administrator Shaheera commented:

Sometimes teachers who took the training know better how to practice the new concepts and methodology than their supervisors or principles but their focus only on passing the evaluation process that is conducted by district supervisors where teachers are obligated to cover the curriculum and follow supervisors' instruction - not applying new concepts.

In the same direction, Administrator Sama found that without making major changes to the teachers' socio-economic status and then challenging the status quo, it would not be possible to transfer the new conceptualization of teaching practices and teacher roles to be applied in classroom settings:

The new teacher vision application has to put more social responsibilities and pressures on all of us... Teachers' roles must shift teachers' status too... In other words, to solve the problem it means better qualified teachers with better social status. Once the teachers' status is changed the new concepts will be transformed.
Leader Tamer is one of the many interviewees who questioned the entire reform process based on Western paradigms, including the new teacher roles of the, questioning the possibility of their practical application. Both GD Ali and Administrator Mahdi’s views echoed his concern about the feasibility of the new teacher roles. All of them insisted on the necessity of a new plan that is able to constitute a system of collaboration and coordination under comprehensive and consistent governance, away from relying on the outsider view of the accountability and performance approaches.

Leader Tamer elaborated as the following:

Under the current situation, I feel that more pressure has been put only on teachers... We (leaders) know that most of the teachers have developed higher qualifications nowadays, but do they sustain the skills and knowledge, has teachers’ professional knowledge and teaching capability improved accordingly? We commonly observed that many teachers and administrators gained stronger educational qualifications than before, but ironically, actual teaching quality deteriorated.

In this regard, Administrator Mustafa added the following:

It is not odd that our (Palestinian) teachers do not apply what they learned at the qualifying programs, and this is because we don’t have a good governance and effective coordination system... We unfortunately rely on outsider's view and plan and what we do is just provide them with numbers to prove that our teachers are qualified but is this the reality? I don’t think so.

In summary, most interviewees positively support the MoEHE’s reform movement to elevate Palestinian teachers to a greater level of accountability and performance. Additionally, they showed positive perceptions toward TES components and the new vision for teacher professional role and found that the MoEHE has led TES implementation process successfully. However, they were uncertain about the feasibility of the new roles’ application in classroom settings, as they believe it is conditioned on the potential change in the environmental factors. In this respect, Van Meter and Van Horn (1975), indicated that “the lower the intensity of implementers’ attitudes toward a policy, the greater the negative impact on their ability and willingness to be involved in the policy implementation” (p.472). Since most interviewees (leaders and implementers at the grassroots) showed a reluctant attitude toward the proposed new role of Palestinian teachers and the core aspects of the reform process, their involvement actually impacted the TES implementation process negatively.
Up to this point, the chapter has discussed key determinants, including the PA’s capacity problem, which is associated with Palestine's political and economic restrictions, the challenge of socio-economic inequality, the domination of the centralized system, and how the international community’s imposition of their power and agenda has brought about reluctant and uncertain attitudes and dispositional conflicts. These unavoidable factors have impacted and affected the success or failure of the TES implementation process. They have played together and created contradictory situations throughout the implementation process and have prevented a large-scale development of the TES.

Although the teacher education reform process has been successfully implemented, the core elements of TES have not been accomplished yet. The unfavorable environmental variables have acted in an opposite direction affecting the success of implementation. All of these determinants have created noticeable barriers throughout the implementation process, creating ambiguity in the direction of the implementation and inconsistencies between intended objectives and outcome. At the end interviewees as leaders and implementers were working collectively to implement TES objectives, but they believe without solving the fundamental challenges, the reform process would be jeopardized.
Chapter 10

10. Reflection and Conclusion

10.1 The Palestine's Case of Policy Implementation

This study aims to provide a comprehensive understanding of the rational, dynamic, and complex pieces of TES implementation. The case study of this research was designed to explore how the MoEHE has implemented and responded to TES recommendations for reforming teacher education in Palestine since mid-2010. In this final chapter, the overarching research question and the findings of the data analysis will be summarized. This reviews the multi-perspectival approach, which consists of the rational and critical frameworks in addition to the reference analytic model of this study to analyze the main factors that have impacted the implementation process of TES in Palestine. Additionally, this study proposes a number of implications and recommendations as future references for the policy analysts and researchers. Major themes of the implementation process have been examined and explored to be addressed in the following discussion.

10.2 TES Implementation: Goal-Directed Actions

As mentioned previously in this paper, the rational framework suggests that human actions are considered being purposively rational because public policy is aimed at achieving specific goals that are extremely important to the public concern (Li, 2016). Andrews (2017) indicates that the rational decision making is a type of behavior that is appropriate for achieving specific goals within given conditions and constraints. Thus, TES implementation process including its initiation, formation, and achievement was directed by the MoEHE and rationally was enacted by individual and collective actions towards specific goals and outcomes. As mentioned previously, Palestine’s socio-economic and political structure is described as a vertical mode and the decision-making process is a top down and centralized style. This applies to the nature of the MoEHE’s administrative frame that is influenced and dominated by the international forces and communities. It is also essential to take into account that the long history of the political conflict between Palestinians and Israeli occupiers, in addition to the nature of the PA’s quasi-political system derived from the Oslo Accords have both affected every aspect of
life in Palestine. Thus, the economic and political instability and limitation of resources have encouraged the continuation of the centralized and bureaucratic system, including the MoEHE’s administration under the PA’s leadership. On the one hand, the necessity for the PA to modernize the education system and align it with international educational models has generated a collective response led by the MoEHE and international actors to support the national requirements to enhance the quality of education, including reforming teacher education in Palestine. According to the MoEHE (2017a), “the Palestinian education system requires a clear and agreed upon vision with obvious skills, knowledge and values that are suitable for the 21st century and would be considered a springboard for restructuring education strategies and activities” (p.37).

As mentioned previously, the impact of globalization on Palestine’s education reforms cannot be ignored. The outside forces have not only complicated the vision and philosophy of Palestine education (Paine & Zeicher, 2012), but also had significant impacts in the social, cultural, and political aspects (Zadja, 2020). In particular, the Westernized models have had significant impacts on educational reforms in Palestine (Shinn, 2012). For example, the Palestinian national plan for “Education for All” aimed to achieve the educational goals in the line with the goals pledged during the International Forum for Education held in Dakar, Senegal in 2000. This plan was introduced at the Paris Conference in 2007 where it received financial backing by international donors since 2008. Additionally, the MoEHE’s strategic plan of 2017-2022 was aligned with the national commitment to the United Nations General Assembly 70\text{th} development plan “transforming our world”: 2030 agenda for sustainable development and to the framework of the Sustainable Development goals approved at New York Summit in 2015 and international obligations towards achieving the fourth goal of the Incheon/Korea Declaration of May 2015.

The most significant challenge that faced the Palestinian educational development process was the improvement of the content, methods and teacher education pre-service and in-service teacher’s programs which was seen as critical. Thus, TES has been formulated by the MoEHE to lead the national effort to enhance teacher education. TES for reforming teacher education specified it objectives “towards attaining good outputs
that can assist the students and reinforce the role of teachers in a comprehensive
development process... This can also give room to modernizing the educational systems
in accordance with accelerating scientific and technological advancements” (MoEHE,
2008, p. 7). The launching of this project aimed to harmonize several initiatives that
include in-service and pre-service teachers. Hence, the national initiatives began with the
rational identification of the situational analysis of teacher education. For example, the
Teacher Education Reference Group (TECG) was formulated that included 14 experts
from UNESCO, MoEHE, UNRWA, higher education institutions (HEIs) and NGOs.
Their main task was to create recommendations to identify current trends using statistics
and previous studies on the topic (Burke, 2020). Another committee known as the
Teacher Education Consultative Group (TECG) made up of 30 members from higher
education institutions, directors at the Ministry, administrators at UNRWA, civil society
and some teachers’ unions. A semi-final draft was sent to 93 Palestinian educators and
related persons for feedback. In 2007, with support from the international community
especially Norway and World Bank, Palestinian “elite” within the HEIs, civil society
finalized the TES, based on the identification of these problems, the implementation
objectives and programs for teacher education were laid out by policymakers.

Then, pragmatic and strong collective actions including civil society and educational
intellectuals were promoted by the MoEHE toward enhancing teacher education and were
driven to transform teacher education system particularly teachers' role from a traditional
model to a new modernized system. For example, the QSQT program was one of the
main programs among many others to improve teacher education by the Ministry of
Education in partnership with UNESCO (MoEHE, 2011a). TES implementation has
formed a foundation for promoting and improving teacher education in Palestine. Many
developments were administered by the CDTP. Following its publication on March 5,
2010, the Ministry held a joint event in Ramallah and Gaza to mark UNESCO’s World
Teacher’s Day and a mark of a new beginning to Palestine education. The events were
well attended with more than 120 educators and professionals who had discussed the
teaching profession development as the main agenda. As an outcome, the events led to an
introduction of policy paper to guide teacher's professional development and announced
the World Teachers’ Day as an annual event in Palestine. To show its significance, the
event was attended by education representatives from the Ministry, EU, UNESCO, Palestinian Teachers Union, and UNRWA and broadcasted in two films. It did not just bring together education stakeholders but gave birth to a new beginning with an agenda for improving education professionalism in Palestine.

The national teacher education reform process was warmly embraced by all of the interviewees in this study. The transformation of the traditional teacher education system into a new modern system which includes the new teacher roles as described by the TES document was applauded by implementers and made sense to them, as well as the collective effort toward implementing TES components. They fully understood why the reform was initiated from a rational viewpoint, noting that the reforming objectives were necessary for teacher education development to be transformed into a new modern system in order to improve teachers' education and their socio-economic status as it proposed at the ILO recommendations. To ensure an effective process for the TES implementation, a number of communication mechanisms and delivery forms were employed by the administration of the MoEHE. In fact, the communication system was effective for most interviewees as it succeeded in delivering the main TES goals and enforced its implementation requirements at the various units and departments. By utilizing a vertical (centralized), and collective style, the MoEHE ensured that implementers were able to act passively and collectively to implement TES recommendations. Most implementers responded that they were routinely required to carry out whatever the MoEHE’s upper levels asked them to do, and they did follow their requirements. For example, the MoEHE and its units, such as NIET, CDTP, AQAC, were assigned to administer a number of programs and projects alongside with international financial and technical support, such as TEP, TEIP, and QSQT for (developing the skills and knowledge of the unqualified in-service teachers, upgrading and standardizing pre-service programs at HEIs, and strengthening the MoEHE’s capacity building of management and governance).

Achievements were observable at most of the components of TES by the MoEHE’s units as a corollary of the implementation of varied programs as planned. For example, as they were supported by the international community, HEIs and CDTP have developed
frameworks and standards for new pre-service and in-service programs; NITE administered professional development programs for in-service teachers; AQAC upgraded and developed teacher education programs at HEIs. Moreover, leaders at the top level adopted significant approaches, such as the direct service program delivery system, the monitoring and evaluation (M&E) tool to enhance and evaluate the outcome of TES implementation. In the case of Palestine's national reform of teacher education, rational and collective policy actions are clearly observable and measurable. From its initiation to implementation and evaluation, the national policy of teacher education reform has clearly followed a linear, sequential, and logical path by implementing specific goals and adopting specific programs and projects. Specifically, it is means-ends driven and follows a goal-directed principle. There are many cause and effect links between the rationality of actions, interventions, and achievements. The implementation has been designed in stages in a linearly-advancing policy flow employing the most suitable, obligated, familiar, and effective communication forms.

From this perspective, the study finding and interpretation, however, sometimes is insufficient and inadequate to answer why the intended outcomes were not strictly consistent with the intended international and local expectations as originally planned. On the one hand, the Rational Framework grounds itself in the obsolescent rationality of “zombie categories” (Kemper and Loureiro, 2002; Beck, 2003, p. 202), resulting in simplistic, deterministic, and law-like policy actions. For example, it often ignores the dynamism and complexity of Palestine's context, such as the socio-economic inequality and political instability or the conflicting relationship and overlapping roles and interests among various stakeholders including international actors. On the other hand, the Rational Framework is ignoring the uniqueness of different countries and the need for policy reforms tailor-made for specific environments (Verger, 2014). Therefore, the Critical Framework presents an alternative interpretation and sheds light on the dynamic and complex aspects of this implementation. This is when the implementation outcome sometimes becomes inconsistent with the assumptions made to overcome the weaknesses in the analysis of the rational framework.
10.3 TES Implementation: A Dynamic Process

Critical frameworks, according to Li (2016), look at the dynamism of the policies by focusing on the value-laden approach of policies and the competing interests of involved stakeholders. Using the critical framework, the policy implementation process must be examined by considering the politics and economics of the environment in which the policy is implemented. In other words, the policy action is a dynamic process of a transformation process that is driven by various variables (social, economic, and political) in which interest and power relationships are contradicted. Social, economic, and political tension was witnessed in the implementation process and greatly shaped the outcome of TES implementation. This was particularly evident in the power struggle relationship between the MoEHE’s stakeholders (general directorates and units, schools, and grassroots implementers) at the macro and micro levels on the one hand, and between the MoEHE and international players on the other hand. In particular, the scarce resources, lack of funding, political and economic restrictions, instability, and the manifestations of the MoEHE’s centralized system have strongly impacted the outcome of the TES. In fact, the MoEHE’s authoritarian structure and the dominant international role led to tension and overlapping. The scarce resources and the economic and political restrictions led to a conflicting relationship between implementers at the micro-institutional level regarding the responsibilities and benefits, leading to the marginalization of teachers and their socio-economic status. At the grassroots level, teachers in particular have had to fight in different ways to secure their income and positions.

First, most of the interviewees observed a strong and negative impact by the profound political instability and economic restrictions. These environmental factors particularly the lack of resources and funding has hampered any authentic progress for developing a modern teaching profession, including a promotion and incentive system. With scarce resources, the limited governmental budget, and restricted international support, the MoEHE was not able to proceed with what CDTP have proposed in regard to the ranking and promotion system. Therefore, the provision of the teaching professional development programs has not been linked with a promotion and ranking system and thus, the
teachers’ salaries have not increased. As a consequence, interviewees observed clearly that teachers have been struggling and reluctant to join these programs and many of them are still unqualified. More important, with the continuing political and economic crisis, implementers observed that teachers have not been satisfied with their income and social status which led them to join the union strikes or jump from one job to another to enhance their socio-economic status and to improve their living conditions. With low teacher motivation, students' achievement also has lagged behind compared to regional and international benchmarks. On the other hand, interviewees observed that the large-scale interventions combined with scarce resources and the political tension caused by the Israeli occupation have complicated the implementation process and placed critical pressure on the MoEHE’s leaders and implementers. For example, leader Tamer insisted that the MoEHE had no choice due to the complex reality associated with an ongoing occupation that has retained the incapability of PA’s quasi-political system, not to mention the continuing financial crisis caused by the economic and political instability. Thus, the MoEHE has no choice but to accept what international donors were offering and imposing. This situation has created tension, conflict and inconsistency between the interest of the MoEHE’s leaders and the international donors. He put it as follows:

Most of the time the Ministry with the political and economic crisis has no choice but to accept the conditional offers that provided by the donor community but sometimes it's not acceptable, especially when it comes to issues that may affect our sensitive causes as we (Palestinians) have our national goals and views.

Moreover, the inherent administrative system of the MoEHE rationally and effectively has served as an engine to hold implementers at the directorates and units’ level responsible for the implementation of the teacher education reform. The MoEHE adopted as possible various tools to ensure a smooth delivery and reliable communication mechanisms. However, such an engine (the authoritarian and centralized system) was not effective towards approaching the MoEHE’s decentralization goal. Most of interviewees indicated a significant delay and reluctance in authority’s delegation from the top leaders to implementers at the grassroots level. Most of the interviewees have witnessed examples of overlapping and conflicting situations around responsibilities and roles between implementers particularly the supervision and training parties. Moreover, as described by most of interviewees, the implementation of TES to reform teacher
education was hampered by the MoEHE’s hierarchical system, which was described as a formal and bureaucratic that put more pressure on implementers and delayed the progress of core components of TES. In addition, there was a delay in the publication of the organizational structure development which also affect the performance of implementers in many aspects.

The contradiction in the Palestinian socio-economic and political structure alongside the authoritarian culture (Stewart, 2016) has promoted an income gap situation. The unequal relationship between the social groups of the implementers was demonstrated by teachers and employees who have been struggling in their careers jumping between jobs and pursuing higher administrative positions (as supervisor or principal) to lever their socio-economic growth. It has encouraged a power conflicting relationship particularly between implementers at the grassroots and leaders of the MoEHE. Generally, teachers and employees at the grassroots level appreciated their essential role that was being exploited relentlessly, and fought against the hegemony as they were oppressed systematically. They were no longer satisfied with their passive roles and the unequal economic and political status. It is witnessed by interviewees that teachers' union has announced a number of striking waves during the last ten years during the time of implementation. Thus, those who are at the bottom of the social groups took tangible actions to fight against the socio-economic inequalities. They executed bold strategies, such as launching a public opinion movement, and collective bargaining to fight against the inequalities they experienced in their relationship with the top level. As a result, changes have occurred in power and economic status between grassroots level and their leaders. The MoEHE provided teachers with incentives on many occasions. In other words, grassroots individuals constantly struggle over inequality in their relationship with dominant actors either locally or internationally and intensely show how the notion of teachers as transformative intellectuals (Aronowitz & Giroux, 1985) has been realized in the implementation process.

From the Critical Framework, the implementation of the national teacher education reform is no longer seen as merely a set of rational collective behaviors. Instead, visible and hidden economic and political tensions and conflicts are seen as universal, pervasive,
and embedded throughout the process, and policy actors are all have become political in nature (Li, 2016; Ramahi, 2016). Through all the steps of policy initiation, formation, implementation, then to the outcomes and at last the evaluation process, stakeholders, especially the exploited and oppressed implementers, fought against the status quo for changes in their socio-economic status. In this sense, the implementation is a dynamic and complex process as institutional transformation intersected with environmental factors (Li, 2016). The Critical Framework provides an alternative lens to look into the dynamism and complexity of the implementation process, through which the MoEHE responded to TES toward achieving teacher education reform.

10.4 The Analytic Model of this Study

This study was drawn on Li (2016) by developing a functional analytic model for this study to help the researcher organize the study concepts and understand in detail the implementation process in Palestine. Employing this model allowed the researcher to analyze and organize a number of themes in order to shed light on the rationality, dynamism and complexity of TES implementation. In other words, it was combined with the multi-perspectival approach (critical and rational) to investigate the effectiveness of the delivery system and communication structure, examine the contradictory and conflicting situations and to shed light on the complexity and challenges of TES implementation.

Besides the importance of the linear approach, the process of TES implementation is considered in the context of the social, economic and political activities in which it is carried out. Thus, by developing the analytical model, the researcher was able to investigate the main environmental influences, such as the economic, social and political conditions and its impact on TES implementation process at the MoEHE level. In particular, due to the quasi-political system of the Palestinian Authority, and the uniqueness of the economic and political situation that has been affected by the Israeli occupation, the implementation of TES is considered problematic in such a context. In addition, the scarcity of resources, the disposition of implementers, and the function of international actors played an important role in determining the various aspects in which TES has been implemented. In other words, economic, social, and political conditions are
key factors that have impacted the outcomes of public policies (Van Meter and Van Horn, 1975).

Palestine has had a long history of political and economic instability going back more than 100 years. This study includes a special focus inquiring about the extent to which such condition has influenced the implementation process. All interviewees’ responses, undoubtedly, were strongly shaped by the political and economic instability that is embedded in the Israeli occupation and the culture of the official-centralized and bureaucratic structure of the MoEHE. Administrator Mohanad put it this way:

No one can ignore the effect of the political and economic instability that is maintained and associated with the culture of the bureaucratic, and centralized structure in this country. This effect can be seen in all aspects of our (Palestinian) life... To make a change we need to change this condition, but unfortunately the reality of this situation can’t be dismantled in a day and a night especially with the strong global hegemony.

In detail, this model allowed paying serious attention to the rational interpretation of the TES implementation (projects and programs) of teacher education reform, such as various interventions of upgrading pre-service programs, qualifying in-service teachers, developing the teaching profession, and decentralizing the MoEHE’s management system. On the other hand, it allowed for examining the complicated aspects of the transformation process of modernizing teaching profession and the developing teacher socio-economic status. Thus, it allowed for analyzing the inconsistency between the objective and the outcome of the teaching profession development and pointing out to the ambiguity of the MoEHE’s vision and actions towards the teacher role as proposed by TES vision and recommendations. As described by most of the interviewees, the negative impact of environmental and global factors has intersected with the centralized procedures and the lack of delegation of authorities from the upper level to the grassroots level, which as a result impacted the implementers’ responses and the MoEHE’s capacity-building process. In addition, a conflicting and struggling situation between implementers was witnessed as a consequence of the environmental factors such as the economic restrictions and political instability by Israeli occupation among others. However, it is clearly observed that there was a positive influence by the centralized system that guided implementers to act collectively in “a national mood” which led them
towards national and normative benefits. In this context, interviewees presented the positive perception associated with the traditional administrative structure as manifested in the implementation of TES interventions. Interviewees expressed a normative “common mood” in responding to the ordinary challenges and formed a collective agreement towards the achievement of TES objectives as a national imperative.

In conclusion, the developed analytic model steers this study toward the examination of the socio-economic and political complications embedded in the TES implementation process. However, the analytic model also has its limits. For example, unlike in Li’s (2016) model which had explicitly introduced culture as a main dimension, the model for the current study implicitly discussed the cultural impact. It highlighted its aspects under the economic, social, and political conditions, the characteristics of the implementing agencies, the implementers’ involvement and disposition, as well as in many units and events through other variables. Moreover, the model does not focus on the adjustment or revision of the national policy for teacher education reform, nor does it pay sufficient attention to how resources, especially international financial resources, are collected or allocated in TES implementation. These shortcomings limit the power of interpretation offered by this model.

10.5 Recommendations for Authentic Implementation

The implementation of Palestine’s national TES to reform teacher education offers a great opportunity to alternatively examine policy implementation from both the Rational Framework and the Critical Framework. It also provides a great opportunity to see how environmental factors play a critical role in the success or failure of policy implementation. Thus, this research presents a number of implications and recommendations for the consideration of policy implementers and makers. These implications pertain to the significance of consistency between the policy objectives and outcomes, the effectiveness of the communication mechanisms in clarifying policy objectives and bringing about a genuine change, the necessity of paying serious attention to the implementers’ perception and the implementing agencies’ capacity, as well as the essential role of the evaluation process in planning and implementing public policies.
10.5.1 The Consistency Matter

Although the implementation process may vary from one context to another, its success or failure is commonly studied by examining the consistency between implementation outcomes and policy goals (Li, 2016). In addition, in the view of Van Meter and Van Horn, “the higher the goal consensus is, the larger the amount of change (policy outcomes) will be, and vice versa” (p.460). When this study examined how the MoEHE responded to implement TES objectives (the four components), it observed a weakness in the consistency of the implementation of TES objectives in regard to their outcomes, especially in terms of the teaching profession development that associated with a defined direction as stipulated in the TES document. More specifically, the original goal for reforming the teaching profession has deviated from the ultimate outcome of TES. Additionally, the proposed teacher role as mentioned in the TES vision document has become ambiguous in terms of realizing the intended teacher attributes, and this confusion has had a negative impact on the large-scale implementation of TES.

Additionally, interviewees of this study observed that leaders at the upper level were reluctant in taking needed actions to modernize the teaching profession within a progressive teaching system. Therefore, the teaching profession has not developed in a parallel direction with other TES components toward an authentic transformation. In other words, the teaching profession component which recommends adopting a modern system with clear promotion and ranking mechanisms has not been achieved yet. In addition, the transformation of the teacher role as per the proposed concepts has not been realized yet, and therefore the TES objectives have not fully met. GD Jamal noticed that the delay in the implementation of the ranking and promotion system discouraged teachers to join the professional development programs and therefore the development of the new teacher roles as mentioned in TES vision have marginalized at the outcome. He insisted that “without a clear recognition of the significance of the promotion system and linking it with the professional development programs, the intended outcome can't be achieved at all.” He added, “if the upper level has not taken serious steps by enacting related laws and modernizing the teaching profession in this regard, TES objectives remain incomplete.” As reported by many interviewees, the lack of consistency between
goals and outcomes, it is greatly contributed to the unsatisfactory in regard to the development of the profession and new teacher roles.

Therefore, the first recommendation for policy implementers and makers is that they must seriously recognize the important of consistency of the policy objectives and outcomes. In other words, if the MoEHE intends to develop the teaching profession, policymakers and implementers should pay attention to the significance of the consistency between the objectives and outcomes. More specifically, they must pay attention to the implementation of the advancement career system as a core element for authentic change in new teacher roles, and the development of teachers’ socio-economic status. The application of the ranking and promotion system can also contribute to the decentralization goal, improve the quality of education and achieve the job satisfaction for teachers. Applying financial incentives and promotion system may be as important to their intrinsic interests as designing teacher professional development programs that caters to the teachers’ professional needs (Darling-Hammond et al. 2016). Thus, linking career progression with training programs will motivate employees to join the training programs and improve their performance as well. Additionally, it strengthens teacher's affiliation with own foundation and promotes professional and social justice.

In conclusion, most interviewees agreed that it would be an incomplete process to reform the teaching system without a real development of the teaching profession, including the application of the advancement career scale to elevate the socio-economic status of teacher. Administrator Mustafa observed that the MoEHE has been implementing TES recommendations which only provide incentives for teachers occasionally. Regrettably, the continuing economic crisis that the PA experiences because of the Israeli occupation restrictions and it's forcing policies has incapacitated MoEHE from accommodating and meeting the needs of the socio-economic development for a large scale of its employees.

10.5.1.1 The Communication Manner

According to Van Meter and Van Horn (1975), the delivery of public services is influenced by the manner in which goals are communicated to implementers. Standards and objectives have their indirect impact on the disposition of implementers through
inter-organizational communication activities. Clearly, the implementers’ responses to the policy will be based in part on their perception and interpretation of its objectives. In detail, variation can be seen in implementers’ support for the public policies in terms of their understanding and interpretation of the goals and objectives, and by which manner these objectives are communicated. This is no guarantee that good communication necessarily contributes to a positive disposition on the part of implementers (Li, 2016). According to Li (2016), teaching and learning process depends on the behavioral characteristics of individuals which are highly associated with their culture. Thus, the method of communication used in the implementation of public policies must take into account the culture of the stakeholders involved in the implementation of the policy.

Therefore, with the current study, the cultural aspect is discussed through the economic, social and political conditions dimension and the characteristics of the implementing agencies which has significant impacts on the communication manner. In other words, the characteristic of the implementing agencies and the structure of communication as a major dimension of this study is an essential indication for an effective or ineffective interaction, and plays an important role in the delivery, accuracy, and consistency of the policy objectives. For example, the MoEHE (2015) indicated that there is dysfunctional communication within the education sector leading to conflicts and inefficiencies. Moreover, there is a deficit of roles integration, inclusive planning process, and reaching desired results due to poor communication between the Director General of Planning in the Education Ministry and Heads of Planning in the Directorates. In this regard, most interviewees questioned the effectiveness of their role, particularly coping with the centralized system which was strongly challenging the decentralization direction and approach. Worse than that, some participants who were interviewed perceived the current administrative system as a bureaucratic stronghold discouraging or even it is suppressing their involvement. For example, educators experienced very limited involvement in decision-making matters. They observed that if the MoEHE’s leaders delegated more authorities to the grassroots level, such as schools and principles, many conflicting events could have been prevented. Thus, the second recommendation for policy makers and implementers is to pay attention to the communication manner in which policy objectives
are transferred to implementers, and to the extent of its clarity, accuracy and consistency (Van Meter and Van Horn, 1975, p. 479).

10.5.2 The Dispositional Conflicts

According to Li’s (2016) model, the disposition of implementers is a key indicator for public policy to be effectively delivered since all other components must be filtered through their perception. In this regard, a number of variables in the current study model directly influenced the perception of implementers and affected their willingness to implement the policy objectives. These variables may include the resource availability to implement the policy and the freedom of implementers in making their contribution to the policies. Thus, dispositional conflicts may happen when the implementer’s role is not recognized as a result of not having an opportunity to set their views or the insufficiency of resources throughout the implementation process (Kaufman, 1971). In this respect, most interviewees held conservative perceptions which are not about the TES objectives themselves but the international constraints and their enforcement mechanisms (technical and financial support) as they have not paid attention to the Palestinians’ sensitive issues. In their perception, donors were not considering the Palestinian's history and political reality of Israeli occupation and therefore a number of contradictory and conflicting issues were witnessed in implementing TES. In other words, the international community finances only projects based on their agendas and use their support as a political pressure.

In conclusion, transforming the Palestinian educational features to meet the international educational trends would be only fake and incompatible processes without taking in consideration the effect of environmental factors, namely the political situation and the economic limitation of the PA as a result of the Israeli occupation, which have led to this state of instability. Additionally, interviewees realized the necessity of financial and technical support of donors but in the other hand they ensured that it's insufficient in regard to the economic and political restrictions. For example, the new teacher role as a reflection to global trends sometimes cannot be feasible in Palestine's condition. They believe that without changing this condition, TES objectives would not be possible to be realistic. Thus, another recommendation would be that the policymakers and international players should pay attention to the implementers' perceptions that may have caused a
dispositional conflict. In other words, it is essential to dismantle and recognize the 
challenges that influence the implementers' disposition and perception. For example, 
Palestinians have been facing tremendous challenges concerning their national 
independence and their right of self-determination, including the determination of 
suitable educational vision and philosophy. Leader Tamer put it as the following:

It is difficult to assess the TES outcome and we (MoEHE leaders) don't know how many teachers have 
really changed their perception and to which extent, but we know for sure we need a new strategy that 
comes out and fits our context and condition... Plans must take in consideration the national need of 
autonomy as well as the freedom of making our own mind without pressure or political extortion.

10.5.3 The Capacity Issue

Following modification of Li’s (2016) model, the analytical model for the current study 
includes the characteristics of the implementing agencies as one of the major factors that 
determining the effectiveness of the implementation of the policy. According to Van 
Meter and Van Horn (1975), effective implementation is counted on the implementing 
agencies' ability to accomplish intended outcome and their capacity may be affected by 
unfavorable variables. In their model, they claimed that the characteristics of the 
implementing agencies, such as the socio-economic and political structure, “the style of 
the communication and leadership, and the level of organizational control of the 
implementing agencies have profound effects on the implementation process” (p.477). 
Thus, the implementing agencies' capacity may be affected by these variables. In this 
study, the socio-economic condition and political influences had a significant role in 
determining the capacity of implementing agencies in TES implementation process. In 
detail, the centralized administrative structure of the MoEHE and the tangled political 
and economic context have profound effects on the implementation of the TES. For 
example, the MEHE leaders have been reluctant to delegate authorities to the grassroots 
level, thus causing an overlap of roles and responsibilities among the implementers.

According to the MoEHE (2015), there is lack of communication between the MoEHE’s 
top level and the field (i.e., districts and schools) in planning and decision making, which 
is linked to the current organizational structure and its inability to adapt in order to meet 
the results-based approach. The MoEHE also indicated that the lack of clarity of roles, 
responsibilities, and authorities are some of the frequent problems experienced by Heads
of Planning in the Directorates leading to ongoing conflicts between the Ministry and its departments. Largely to blame is the inadequate training of the Heads that makes them incapable of performing up to the Ministry standards. Therefore, to achieve the TES’ goals, improving the implementing agencies’ characteristics must be considered more seriously, and the PA’s economic and socio-economic and political structure, including the MoEHE’s structure and capacity, must be given more attention in the implementation process. There is an urgent need to restructure the MoEHE’s structure and governance style which are supposed to be grounded in collaboration and integration. It also needs to reorganize the involvement of stakeholders and delegate more authorities to the grassroots level to increase its capacity, efficiency and effectiveness in implementing public policies. Thus, this study recommends that policy actions must be oriented to pay attention to the organizational modification of the implementing agencies' characteristics, as well as the economic and political context that affects their capacity in achieving the policy goals.

10.5.4 The Evaluation Purpose

In policy study, evaluation is widely accepted as a crucial step to ensure successful implementation. Evaluation system and its approaches is an important indicator to examine the quality of policy implementation. For example, Henry et al. (2013) acknowledged policy evaluation to be critical in aiding the improvement process of the policy designs and implementation process. Evaluation outcomes give the needed inputs to address weaknesses in the policy and achieve predetermined goals of it. Similarly, Li’s (2016) model considers evaluation as a critical component of policy implementation as it provided feedback needed for making major policy revisions. Therefore, the MoEHE's major official and non-official forms of evaluation are discussed in this paper. It adopted M&E system, the regular and periodic evaluation process on job performance and the ad-hoc evaluation conducted by the local or international organizations. On the one hand, the M&E system was greeted by most interviewees but some of them described it as a “bureaucratic process” as it put pressure on implementers while neither its indication has been taken seriously by the planning and decision-making team nor can cover essential issues in the job performance. The job performance evaluation was criticized also by
interviewees as “an ineffective procedure.” Additionally, there was much criticism of the external reports since their findings are involved a margin of bias and unrealistic expectations in regard to the feasibility of change. Apart from the forms of evaluation, all sixteen interviewees confirmed that the evaluation outcome has not been taken seriously from the upper level, which as it supposed toward reconsideration for meaningful changes and allowing a higher-level transparency in the implementation process.

Moreover, based on interviewees' perception, there is a lack of effort to take full advantage of the M&E findings and incorporate them within the Ministry’s planning and budgeting cycle, which hinders the realization of desired results. Thus, evaluation process should aim to strengthen the decision-making process through evidence-based findings during the planning time. It should allow an internal accountability reference in term of performance and outcome so decision makers may revise, set, and communicates new strategies and goals (MoEHE, 2015). Thus, another recommendation is that evaluation is a crucial step and necessity to be augmented for an authentic change. Both internal and external evaluation must complement each other and assist in policy revision. Moreover, evaluation should employ a new approach that accommodates the implementers' circumstances as well as adopt a collaborative and integrated approach that is not reliant entirely on the outsider view of accountability and performance style.

10.6 Research Recommendations for Future Studies

Up to this point, what could be suggested that future research can conceive and assemble? Thus, the next section provides key recommendations that might be suitable for several future studies.

10.6.1 Comparative Studies is Recommended

Li’s (2016) analytical model inspired the current study as both studies served a similar purpose in comparison. While Li’s (2016) model looked at the process of implementing education reforms in China, the current study looked at education reforms in Palestine. Both studies used a multi-perspective framework to investigate the dimensions of rationality, dynamism, and complexity of teacher education reforms, which influenced the development of an analytical framework for data analysis. Thus, the analytical models
used in both studies were based on previous models, with Li's (2016) model being based on models, such as Sabatier and Mazmanian (1980) and Van Meter and Van Horn (1975), among others, and the current study's model being based mainly on Li's (2016) model. For both studies, it was necessary to ensure that it was tailored to the study's context. For example, in Li's (2016) model, the cultural variable was introduced explicitly, which was not a major aspect of previous models, because culture had a significant impact on teacher reforms in China. Similarly, it was necessary to include the variable of economic social and political conditions in the current study because it has a significant impact on how education reforms are implemented in Palestine. As a result of the similarity in purposes, the current study matches Li's (2016) study with a few adjustments for contextualization purposes.

The importance of duplicating Li's (2016) study in achieving the current study's goals cannot be overstated. Morrison (2019) claims that duplicating a study allows other researchers to test the findings. As a result, duplication in research ensures that researchers are honest, which gives readers confidence in the findings and their applications. Thus, the duplication of Li's study was crucial in ensuring the current study's findings could be tested in order to establish their credibility. As a result, because Li's (2016) model was useful in examining education reforms in China, duplicating it was critical in examining education reforms in Palestine. Future studies that seek to examine education reforms can modify the current study's analytical model in the same way that the current study duplicated a model from a previous study with a similar purpose. As the variables of the current model are relevant to the context of Palestine, it will be necessary to modify the variables in the study to ensure that they are applicable to the new study. In the context of China for instance, Li (2016) had to introduce the variable of culture as a main dimension, whereas for the current study, the cultural dimension was introduced implicitly within the economic, social and political conditions and the characteristics of the implementing agency among others. Therefore, the model can be applied to future studies, but variables must be modified to ensure that they are relevant to the context of the study. This will help in having comparative studies where countries with the same context to those of China and Palestine or different can be analyzed. Implementing the recommendation for comparative studies will play a critical role in ensuring the study
design is not just limited to a single country but applicable to all countries across the world.

10.6.2 A Multiple-Case Design is Recommended

This study employed a single-case design and purposefully selected the MoEHE as an information-rich case for an in-depth elaboration of the TES implementation process for reforming teacher education in Palestine. Although this single-case design greatly benefits this study in term of the limited time and restricted possibilities of conducting on-site interviews, it also has some unavoidable weaknesses. A single-case design is vulnerable indeed by nature, and possibly not be fully representative. In other words, it provides a weak basis for generalization to other unsimilar settings. To minimize the possibilities of misrepresentation, a multiple-case design to include more settings is recommended for studies in the future. According to Stake (2013), multiple-case designs enhance the ability of generalizing findings while maintaining in-depth description. Maintaining that multiple-case design has some obvious advantages. Yin (2017) points out rightly the distinct advantage of a larger body of evidence – often considered more compelling – and that the overall study is therefore regarded as being more robust (pp. 56–63). TES implementation is not limited to the MoEHE setting but includes a large range of involvement, such as key private sector of HEIs, and international programs and projects. Although the MoEHE represents the largest involvement of stakeholders and the most influential implementer for developing teacher education in Palestine, the finding of this typical case purposefully identified and selected by this study. Although, the finding of this study may be generalized to similar settings and a larger extent, but a multiple-case design consisting of larger involvement of stakeholders would definitely enhance the transferability of the finding and the implications unearthed by this study to greater institutional settings.

10.6.3 Studying Intersectionality with Various Other Policies

The operational analytic model of this study allows the researcher to examine a number of environmental and unfavorable variables and investigate how they have affected the implementation process of reforming teacher education in Palestine. Many other
educational initiatives and policies may have intersected with TES implementation and affected the outcome of it. On the one hand, the international community has been involved in many programs and projects that may create many cases for studying the implementation processes. On the other hand, many other national policies were introduced and may have intersected with the TES implementation. For example, the MoEHE has launched large-scale strategies, such as the development of school curricula and upgrading higher education programs, which may have overlapped and intertwined directly or indirectly and positively or negatively to create contextual barriers hindering the effectiveness of the TES implementation. While this study has paid some attention to such factors, the extent to which the policies intersected with TES or other policies and strategies remains unclear. As Birkland (2015) concludes, the relationship of one policy to another is crucial in achieving policy goals (p. 274). Therefore, the confluence of related policy actions and factors occurring at the same time must become an imperative for policy studies in the future.

10.7 The Palestine Case: A new Perspective

This study may bring a new perspective for policy analysis and policy implementation studies. It employed a multi-perspective approach that includes the critical and rational frameworks to examine key dimensions of TES implementation. The adopted approach in the study enables policy researchers to deepen their understanding of policy actions in a complementary and more balanced way, for they can unearth. Indeed, Charon (2012) criticizes using a single perspective to understand the policy because it limits the level of understanding that others are likely to have when using multiple perspectives. In this sense, the Rational Framework and the Critical Framework together can offer a much richer and more comprehensive understanding of policy actions, since each of them has both strengths and limitations.

On the one hand, the Rational Framework allows us to view the implementation actions as a thematic, rigorous, and empirical process directed by scientifically defined objectives and recommendations that are driven by a means-ends relationship. In the Palestine's TES implementation case, the defined problems of the teachers' profession and teacher education, the linearly path of the initiation, formation, and implementation of TES, and
the national effort supported by international theories, such as EFA, MDO and UNISCO ILO and recommendations, were all presented through the Rational Framework which has spectacular likelihood adoption for policies research to employ. The Rational Framework, however, is often criticized for being more idealistic while putting less consideration on reality (Li, 2016). Other perspectives may have stronger potential in some aspects to look at and examine the dynamic and contradictory elements. That why the Critical Framework is an option that may allow the researcher to focus on the dynamic range of the implementation process. The power of the Critical Framework enables policy researchers to pay more attention to the dynamic and complex range, instead of being completely focused on the linear, logical policy order. In the Palestine's case, various stakeholders actively seek their diverse political or personal values in relation to the MoEHE’s transformation process. The scene from this framework, has presented various inconsistencies and conflicts that are embedded in the centralized system, socio-economic inequality, economic and the political instability that have affected the TES implementation process. In addition, the Critical Framework views implementers' involvement and roles as an instrument to dismantle the unequal status quo and achieve a new model of transformation that is beneficial to all stakeholders. For example, stakeholders (implementers and leaders) have struggled to transform both their organizational and individual socioeconomic status. Such struggles can easily find their way into the policy implementation process with significant impacts.

Viewed from the Rational Framework, the implementation of the TES for reforming teacher education is understood as a linearly developed process to resolve the situational analysis problems of the teacher education system and has led by the MoEHE and international players. The policy implementation is advanced actions that applied to meet the necessity and possibility for change. The Critical Framework suggests that the stakeholders of the implementation are unnecessarily acting in harmony and collectively and in a preferred way. Rather, there are diverse and conflicting issues where everyone is struggling for their individual justifiability, benefits, and status. The implementation process becomes a contested ground through which various benefits and insufficient resources are redistributed among different groups and levels. Battling interventions, implementers' dispositions, powerful forces, and some counteractive factors, such as the
environmental variables all contribute positively or negatively to TES outcomes. Other interventions and policies in the context of Palestine’s, such as HEIs programs, WB interventions, and other local initiatives, may be explored by utilizing the multi-perspective approach in order to add more deep understanding about the formation and implementation of these national policies.

However, the multi-perspectival approach does have limitations for policy analysis, Charon (2010) implies that any one particular perspective will always limit what one can see, “since other perspectives – many of which may also be right – cannot be considered at the same time” (p.4). In this study, it is obvious that the overwhelming influence of many environmental factors over all aspects of the implementation at the MoEHE could be impossible to fully analyze by only the multi-perspectival approach, which the study framework is limited to rational and critical perspectives. It is true that there are obvious constraints to the examination of the Palestine policy case through the lens of these Frameworks alone. Additionally, in practice the multi-perspectival approach demands stronger theoretical groundings of policy studies and thus often challenges the analytic capacity of researchers, especially when they are constrained by what they can do in terms of time, space, budget, etc.

10.8 Conclusion

This study employs a multi-perspectival approach (rational and critical frameworks). It is an attempt to examine how the MoEHE has implemented and responded to TES for teacher education reform in Palestine by focusing on the rationality, dynamism and complexity of the implementation process. These three elements were found to be pervasive throughout several variables of the analytical model as it is illustrated in the MoEHE case study. There are at least three intertwined core features that are evident in the study approach to policy implementation.

Firstly, there are the strong effects of environmental factors, such as the economic and political instability imposed by the Israeli restrictions, the PA’s unique political system and the centralized structure, including the MoEHE’s vertical administrative system. This unique structure was witnessed in many features of the TES implementation process.
Sometimes, it played a positive role in the success in its success by encouraging implementers to show commitment toward top-level decisions and pursue common actions collectively toward the national mood for implementing TES objectives. Such influence, or patterns of collective action, serves as a kind of national interest (consensus) which shapes the attitudes and preferences of all implementers regarding the best outcome of the policy implementation. However, it did not always play a positive role as proved to be challenging and acted against the consistency of achieving the TES core objectives in a large-scale implementation. More specifically, it permeated the implementation process for teaching profession transformation as carried out by the leaders and implementers.

Secondly, the Palestinian model of policy implementation is rationalized as a scientific approach through the MoEHE and the participants’ commitment toward the EFA movement and UNISCO ILO. This movement constitutes a contextual consensus for the implementation of TES as supported by the international donor community which effectively assists implementation in a rational and logical path with collective actions.

Lastly, harmony needs to be negotiated and achieved to ease tensions that exist pervasively in the complex process of the policy implementation. The dynamism of tension is deeply embedded in the overlapping of the roles and responsibilities of the implementers’ (units and departments) as “political creatures”, the impact of bureaucracy and formality of the centralized system and the challenges imposed by environmental factors, such as economic restrictions and political instability. The latter have also created a conflict of interest between the stakeholders and international actors around the scarcity of resources which prompted a backlash against the imposed agenda and direction of the implementation process. All of the aforementioned have resulted in a complicated dynamism out of which both positive and negative effects emerged.

Of course, it is common in any given context to encounter ideological discourses, normative values and socio-economic struggles in policy actions. However, the unparalleled political system and economic conditions imposed by the ongoing Israeli occupation, as well as its impact on every aspect of Palestinian life (socially, politically,
and economically), have undoubtedly crippled the reform process. Additionally, the traditional centralized system, officialdom, the fever towards implementing the international trends and the commitment to or rejection of them make the Palestinian model of policy implementation notably unique. As Darling-Hammond and Lieberman (2012) reaffirmed, the need to build a stronger teaching profession requires different countries to “learn from each other about what matters and what works in different contexts,” a deeper understanding of the possible strategies “for making major improvements in teachers’ learning opportunities and a clear theory of change for how to bring these strategies about” (p.169). Paine (2013) further argues that an interaction of global and local discourses is needed for the preparation for good teachers. The evidence garnered from the Palestine's case in the unique context may provides a frame for looking critically at this experience of how national initiatives be implemented into other projects through policy implementation. The insights presented in this study shed a new light on policy studies of teacher education reform in particular and policy actions more generally, which may be transferable to other contexts seeking to nurture teacher education systems and achieve educational excellence in a global age.
Bibliography


Development, 41, 192-199.


with a focus on management education. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 130539.


Li, J. (2016). *Quest for World-Class Teacher Education?* Singapore: Springer.


Paine, L., & Zeichner, K. (2012). The local and the global in reforming teaching and teacher education. *Comparative Education Review*, 56(4), 569-583. [https://www.journals.uchicago.edu/doi/full/10.1086/667769?casa_token=M8P0HtgC-uoAAAAA:JAnOvUpZN8SGz1ZnSpIf1QHUuQyKCMWy_9oSGw2tmo8TP1_sXvCVOY6gIKFq9Epuf89ZlgHHVAtuCDE](https://www.journals.uchicago.edu/doi/full/10.1086/667769?casa_token=M8P0HtgC-uoAAAAA:JAnOvUpZN8SGz1ZnSpIf1QHUuQyKCMWy_9oSGw2tmo8TP1_sXvCVOY6gIKFq9Epuf89ZlgHHVAtuCDE)


Appendices

The Interview Guide

The interview will be carried out at a number of MoEHE programs, correspondingly. Three to six key-policy makers, two to four administrative, and two to four teachers' educators will be interviewed 1-2 times with each interview lasting around an hour. The informal and semi-structured kinds seem proper for my research aims as a result of its suppleness and allowance of in-depth, an interchange of concepts. I will employ some techniques such as a research guide with interview (appendix A for interview questions). In this regard, employing the interview guide approach allows the researcher, me, to explore the topic but also remain flexible to discuss other topics that come out through the interview.

According to Wengraf (2001), four standards for in-depth interviewing are required. They are "research-oriented questions, a face-to-face interactive conversation, semi-structured, and going into matters in detail" (pp. 3–6). Thus, an in-depth interviewing strategy will be applied and the interview questions will be designed to be "an open ended, semi-structured, flexible and improvisatory" as suggested by Wengraf (2001, p. 5). In addition, Patton (2002) suggests three basic recommendations for open-ended interviews. For example, the informal conversational interview, the general interview guide, and the standardized open-ended interview that will be considered in my study (pp. 341–348).

The following questions will be included in the three different approaches as an interview guide:
### APPENDIX A: A DRAFT OF DATA COLLECTION SCHEME: INTERVIEW QUESTIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PARTICIPANTS</th>
<th>NUMBER OF PARTICIPANTS</th>
<th>UNITS</th>
<th>SOME SUGGESTED RESEARCH QUESTIONS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Policy players        | 3-6                    | MOEHE, Intellectual sectors  | 1. Can you discuss the kind of initiatives/policies regarding teacher Ed reform, especially TES?  
2. What do you think about the Palestinians’ context of the TES (social, cultural, economic and political)?  
3. What is the rationale behind this initiative/policy?  
4. How do you see/evaluate the potential of the success or failure of the implementation process? |
| Administrators        | 2-4                    | MoEHE Units & Programs       | 1. As an administrative, can you explain to me how MoEHE deliver its policies (specific communication tools)?  
2. How do you evaluate this way of communication? In other words, to which extent is this way effective? How do you evaluate the effectiveness of the delivery process?  
3. Based on your review/understanding of the MoEHE documents and TES recommendations, what do you think about the institutional mission, goals and objectives of MoEHE for implementing TES?  
4. How do you see your role in the implementation process?  
5. Reviewing key actions and projects in order to implement the TES recommendations, how do you evaluate the desired outcomes/actions that have been taken on different university levels and various units such as NIET? |
APPENDIX A: A DRAFT OF DATA COLLECTION SCHEME: INTERVIEW QUESTIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PARTICIPANTS</th>
<th>NUMBER OF PARTICIPANTS</th>
<th>UNITS</th>
<th>SOME SUGGESTED RESEARCH QUESTIONS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teacher Educators</td>
<td>2-4</td>
<td>MoEHE Units &amp; Programs</td>
<td>1. As an implementer for the TES recommendations, how do you engage in the implementation process of TES?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2. What role have you played or have already played?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3. What is your opinion about the actions, goals, mission of MoEHE in regards to TES recommendations for Teacher Ed reform?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4. How do you evaluate the actions and changes that have been taken place regarding teacher Ed reform and what has been done so far?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5. As an implementer /educator, what challenges (barriers) have you faced and how do you solve these challenges (awareness, the quality of the program, political and economic tensions, cultural impacts, stakeholders’ attitudes)?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*All of these questions will be delivered separately and won't be as multiple questions.
Date: 24 June 2020
To: Professor Jun Li

Project ID: 115146

Study Title: "The Implementation of the Palestine's National Teacher Education Strategy: A Case Study."

Short Title: TES Implementation

Application Type: NMREB Initial Application

Review Type: Delegated

Full Board Reporting Dates: 03/Jul/2020

Date Approval Issued: 24/June/2020 17:53

REB Approval Expiry Date: 23/June/2021

Dear Professor Jun Li,

The Western University Note-Medical Research Ethics Board (NMREB) has reviewed and approved the WMRE application form for the above-mentioned study, as of the date noted above. NMREB approval for this study remains valid until the expiry date noted above, conditional to timely submission and acceptance of NMREB Continuing Ethics Review.

This research study is to be conducted by the investigator noted above. All ethical and institutional approvals must also be obtained prior to the conduct of the study.

Documents Approved:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Document Name</th>
<th>Document Type</th>
<th>Document Date</th>
<th>Document Version</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TP TES Imp 2 APPENDIX A Interview Q2</td>
<td>Interview Guide</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TP TES Imp 2 APPENDIX B Focus group guide Q2</td>
<td>Focus Groups Guide</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TP Telephone Script 2</td>
<td>Recruitment Materials 15/July/2020</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TP Recruitment Exam 2</td>
<td>Recruitment Materials 15/July/2020</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TP Verbal Script 2</td>
<td>Oral Script 15/July/2020</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TP LOI and LOC Interviews 2</td>
<td>Written Consent/Assent</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TP LOI and LOC Focus group 2</td>
<td>Written Consent/Assent</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

No deviations from or changes to the protocol should be initiated without prior written approval from the NMREB, except when necessary to eliminate immediate harm(s) to study participants or when the change(s) involves only administrative or logistical aspects of the trial.

The Western University NMREB operates in compliance with the Tri-Council Policy Statement Ethical Conduct for Research Involving Humans (TCPS2), the Ontario Personal Health Information Protection Act (PHIPA, 2004), and the applicable laws and regulations of Ontario. Members of the NMREB who are named as investigators in research studies do not participate in discussions related to, nor vote on, such studies when they are presented to the REB. The NMREB is registered with the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services under the IRB registration number IRB 0000000314.

Please do not hesitate to contact us if you have any questions.

Sincerely,

Katelyn Harris, Research Ethics Officer on behalf of Dr. Raulda Graham, NMREB Chair

Note: This correspondence includes an electronic signature (validation and approval via an online system that is compliant with all regulations).
Ethics Approval Letter 2

Date: 1 June 2021
To: Professor Jun Li
Project ID: 115145

Study Title: "The Implementation of the Palestine's National Teacher Education Strategy: A Case Study".
Application Type: Continuing Ethics Review (CER) Form
Review Type: Delegated
Date Approval Issued: 01 Jun 2021
REB Approval Expiry Date: 24 Jun 2022

Dear Professor Jun Li,

The Western University Non-Medical Research Ethics Board has reviewed this application. This study, including all currently approved documents, has been re-approved until the expiry date noted above.

REB members involved in the research project do not participate in the review, discussion or decision.

The Western University NMBREB operates in compliance with the Tri-Council Policy Statement Ethical Conduct for Research Involving Humans (TCPS2), the Ontario Personal Health Information Protection Act (PHIPA, 2004), and the applicable laws and regulations of Ontario. Members of the NMBREB who are named as investigators in research studies do not participate in discussions related to, nor vote on, such studies when they are presented to the REB. The NMBREB is registered with the U.S. Department of Health & Human Services under the IRB registration number IRB 00000941.

Please do not hesitate to contact us if you have any questions.

Sincerely,

The Office of Human Research Ethics

Note: This correspondence includes an electronic signature (validation and approval via an online system that is compliant with all regulations).
## Curriculum Vitae

Name: Ahlam Ayoub  
Post-secondary: Al-Najah National University  
Education and Degrees:  
- Nablus, West Bank, Palestine  
  - 1985-1992 B.A. The University of Western Ontario  
    - London, Ontario, Canada  
    - 2009-2012 M.A.  
    - The University of Western Ontario  
      - London, Ontario, Canada  
      - 2018-2022 Ph.D.  
Honours and Awards:  
- Province of Ontario Graduate Scholarship  
  - 2020-2021  
- Social Science and Humanities Research Council (SSHRC) Doctoral Fellowship  
  - 2010-2011  
Related Work Experience:  
- Teaching Assistant  
  - The University of Western Ontario  
    - 2010-2010  
- Teaching Assistant Advanced  
  - The University of Western Ontario  
    - 2022-2022