10-5-2010 12:00 AM

Cambodian National Education Policy: Global Wants and/or Local Needs?

Kelly T. Crowley Dr., *The University of Western Ontario*

CAMBODIAN NATIONAL EDUCATION POLICY: GLOBAL WANTS AND/OR LOCAL NEEDS?

(Spine title: Cambodian Education Policy: Global Wants, Local Needs)

(Thesis format: Monograph)

by

Kelly T. <u>Crowley</u>

Graduate Program in Education

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment
of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy

The School of Graduate and Postdoctoral Studies
The University of Western Ontario
London, Ontario, Canada

THE UNIVERSITY OF WESTERN ONTARIO
SCHOOL OF GRADUATE AND POSTDOCTORAL STUDIES

CERTIFICATE OF EXAMINATION

Supervisor

_____
Dr. Marianne Larsen

Supervisory Committee

_____
Dr. Suzanne Majhanovich

Examiners

_____
Dr. Vandra Masemann

_____
Dr. Allan Pitman

_____
Dr. Goli Rezai-Rashti

_____
Dr. Frank Schumacher

The thesis by

Kelly Tracy <u>Crowley</u>

entitled:

Cambodian national education policy: Global wants and/or local needs?

is accepted in partial fulfillment of the
requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy

Date_____   _____
                                              Chair of the Thesis Examination Board

Abstract and Keywords

This thesis is broadly concerned with the impact of globalization on education policy making in Cambodia, a post-conflict, developing country. Cambodia's education system was almost entirely wiped out by the 1990's because of various military and social conflicts that had plagued the country. As such, Cambodia provides an excellent case of post-conflict educational reconstruction. The thesis will explore how multinational financial organizations such as the World Bank and Asian Development Bank are influencing the direction of national education policy in Cambodia, using a globalization theoretical perspective. The focus will be on a policy analysis of several key policy documents and directives from the multinational organizations and Cambodian government. Through this analysis three themes become apparent. These include the marketization of education, partnerships, and the purpose of education in Cambodia. These themes present a complex picture of an education system in transition under the influence of national and international needs and desires.

Keywords: Cambodia, education policy, post-conflict, education reconstruction, multinational organizations, policy analysis, globalization, neo-liberalism

Acknowledgements

I would like to take this opportunity to extend my thanks to all of those fantastic individuals who gave their time and energy to help me succeed with this project. First, I am forever grateful to my wonderful thesis supervisor Dr. Marianne Larsen for all of her patience and guidance. I could never have done it without your insight and help. You have taught me the value of perseverance and I am a better person for it.

I would also like to thank my thesis advisor, Dr. Suzanne Majhanovich. I have truly enjoyed the opportunity to work and travel with you. I will always cherish the memories of Hong Kong and Cambodia and Sarajevo and am so lucky to have shared those special times with you. I learn so much each time I am in your presence.

I am also very grateful to all of the professors at the Faculty of Education at the University of Western Ontario for all of their insight and intelligence. I also extend thanks to my fellow PhD students, who made class and life so interesting and enjoyable these past four years.

Dedication

This thesis is dedicated to the most important people in my life, my family. To say that this has been a long journey is an understatement. All of you have followed and supported me each step of the way. It hasn't been easy but without you it would have been impossible. First to my parents, Christine and Snowden. Thank you for always loving me unconditionally and supporting me in everything I do. I couldn't do any of this without you, nor would I want to. To Rob, Emily, and Jamie thank you for being patient and supportive. To Richie, my travel partner and most faithful companion (à la Jane Austen). You give me total support and love, which I sometimes don't deserve. I really am the luckiest sister in the world. To Ella and Caeden, who even on the toughest of days could bring a smile to my face just by being there. To my Nan who would listen every time I tried to explain what I was working on, thank you for being there. To my husband Robert, who was so supportive every time I had to go and do work. To my father-in-law Bill, who showed me true grace and courage these past few years. To everyone we lost, here's to you all. Finally, to my grandpa who remains the inspiration behind all I do. You were, and always will be, the greatest teacher I ever had. I love you all.

Table of Contents

List of Tables

List of Figures

List of Abbreviations

3rd ESP – 3rd Education Strategic Plan 2006-2010
ADB - Asian Development Bank
APEC - Asia-Pacific Economic Co-operation
ASEAN - Association of Southeast Asian Nations
CAS - Country Assistance Strategy
CMDG - Cambodian Millennium Development Goals
COBP - Country Operations Business Plan
ECE - Early Childhood Education
EQAO - Education Quality and Accountability Office
ESDP II - Second Education Sector Development Program
ESSP - Education Sector Support Program 2006-2010
EU - European Union
FTI - Fast Track Initiative
GATT - General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade
IDA – International Development Agency
IMF - International Monetary Fund
MDG - Millennium Development Goals
MoEF – Ministry of Economy and Finance
MoEYS - Ministry of Education, Youth, and Sport
NAFTA - North American Free Trade Agreement
NAS - National Assessment System
NATO - North American Treaty Organization
NEFA - Cambodian National Education for All Plan
NGO – Non-governmental Organization
NPRS - National Poverty Reduction Strategies
OECD - Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development
PCR - Pupil Class Ratio
PRSP - Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper
PTR - Pupil Teacher Ratio
RGoC – Royal Government of Cambodia
UNESCO - United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
UNICEF – United Nations Children's Fund
UNTAC - United Nations Transitional Authority in Cambodia
USD – United States Dollar
UXO – Unexploded Ordnance
WB - The World Bank
WB ESSP - World Bank Education Sector Support Project
WTO - World Trade Organization

Preface

Every study needs a starting point and the starting point of this thesis rests in a native son's passion for his homeland and his willingness to share this passion with an eager graduate student. This passion was contagious and my interest in the Cambodian education sector developed alongside my friendship with a Cambodian doctor who was forced to flee the country in the 1970s after his parents were killed by the Khmer Rouge and he was targeted. Dr. Rethy Chhem's family was targeted because both his father and mother were educated at university and held middle-upper class positions in society. As a result, they were prime targets of the Khmer Rouge regime (1975-1979) who were agrarian communists. According to Khmer Rouge doctrine, intellectuals had no place in a pure agrarian society. As a result, families like the Chhems were hunted down and executed. Son Rethy managed to get on the last plane out of Phnom Penh and found his way to Paris where he eventually received his medical degree and two other subsequent PhDs and now works for the International Atomic Energy Agency in Vienna. His heart has always remained in Cambodia and he openly and eagerly encourages students he meets to learn about and visit the country.

I met Dr. Chhem at the University of Western Ontario in my first semester of PhD study and took an interest in Cambodia right away, particularly in the education sector which had been so purposely targeted by the Khmer Rouge, the Vietnamese occupiers (1979-1989) and later, international donor agencies (1991-2008). I first traveled to Cambodia in January of 2008. During this trip, I saw several schools and learned more about education in the country firsthand. Due to the fact that over 50 % of Cambodia's

population is under the age of 15, I feel that educational reconstruction in the country is

an important area of study and one that I am acutely interested in.

Chapter 1: Introduction

The focus of this study will be on the development of the education sector in post-conflict Cambodia, of what in this situation could be called a post-genocidal Cambodia. Education is a vital force in a post-conflict country, and this is particularly so in the case of Cambodia, where the entire educational system was destroyed during the war-torn years of the Khmer Rouge and Vietnamese occupation.

In this study several key questions are addressed. These include:

- To what extent is globalization influencing education policy development in post-conflict Cambodia?

- How have multinational agencies influenced national education policy making in post-conflict Cambodia?

- Whose needs are addressed in the policy documents and directives?

- What have been the consequences of international influence on Cambodian national education policy?

These questions were addressed through a policy analysis of several key national education policy documents, such as the 3rd Education Strategic Plan, the Education Sector Support Program, and the National Policy of Non-Formal Education that dictate the direction of Cambodian national education today.

When exploring these questions, I situated my research within a comparative and international education framework. The primary methodologies used were case study and policy analysis. Specifically, I utilized a vertical case study approach within a comparative and international framework (Vavrus and Bartlett, 2006). In order to understand the data that emerged, I used a content analysis method.

This thesis presents an analysis of the influence of various multinational organizations on national education policy development in post-conflict Cambodia. Cambodia's recent educational history has been wrought by periods of and attempts at complete destruction. For this reason, it makes re-development particularly difficult and as a result Cambodia presents a compelling example of the complexities associated with post-conflict reconstruction in a globalized world. It was only thirty years ago that all intellectuals and educators were targets of the Khmer Rouge regime. To this day, it remains a challenge to find local teachers in Cambodia with any kind of teaching experience. In addition, over half of the Cambodian population remains under the age of 15 (MoEYS, 2005a). Given this number and the lack of Cambodian educators and educational expertise, the assistance of multinational organizations has been readily accepted by successive governments since 1989.

There are three principal time periods and regimes that will be discussed in this thesis. These are: the Khmer Rouge regime (1975-1979); the Vietnamese occupation (1979-1989); and the democratic Cambodian Kingdom (1993-2008). The primary focus will be on the final period, the transition, and Cambodia's return to a "peaceful" kingdom. In relation to education, the Khmer Rouge period was characterized by a complete destruction of the education system and systematic execution of people associated with education. While the subsequent Vietnamese occupation led to a slight increase in the number of basic educational facilities, education was used primarily for ideological rather than practical purposes. When a temporary United Nations (UNTAC) backed transitional government took over Cambodia in 1991, the rebuilding of the education system became a major focus. Principally, the new governments were interested in establishing a capitalistic mindset to help Cambodia prepare to enter the world market system. Thus,

from the outset, the educational reforms in post-conflict Cambodia have been intimately tied to changes in the economic and political structures of the country.

After any armed conflict there is a strong emphasis on the rebuilding of social institutions, including education. The process of rebuilding gets particularly complicated when multinational organizations are providing the financing and resources for the rebuilding, such as was occurring after 1991 in Cambodia. Allen (2006) feels that the increased influence of multinational groups in rebuilding national public institutions complicates the formulation and administration of these institutions. The complications arise because of three distinct changes. The first is due to the changes in the basic governance of public institutions and levels of accountability. As Allen (2006) states, "Seldom is a public institution accountable to only one body. Today, the accountability on important issues is local, provincial, national, and increasingly international" (p. 135). Secondly, the presence of multinational organizations in post-conflict rebuilding complicates public institutions, such as education, because it is not always clear who is in charge (Allen, 2006). Finally, complications arise as multinationals demand decentralization and an increase in private access to previously public sectors (Allen, 2006). This is a particular issue for the rebuilding of the education system in post-conflict countries like Cambodia.

Education becomes particularly important in post-conflict societies for a variety of reasons. Degu (2005) feels that education can help to break the cycle of conflict, or it can fuel the old conflict or start a new one, since education is so strongly connected to the roots of many conflicts. These roots include: recognition of identity, cultural development, and community survival; access to political power; and ideological orientation (Degu, 2005). Degu (2005) believes that education's tie to conflict creates a

situation in which education reform is more political than pedagogical. In addition, he goes on to state that in a post-conflict country education reform is often put on the back burner as political and economic reform becomes the priority (Degu, 2005). As a result, when education reform is undertaken, the decisions are made more for political and economic reasons rather than for educational reasons alone (Degu, 2005). All of these issues have been present in the Cambodian situation, and the educational reforms have been intimately tied to the political and economic goals of the major multinational financial agencies that have provided funding for educational reconstruction in the country. These trends informed the theoretical approach used in this thesis.

The theoretical approach used in this study focused on theories about globalization. Globalization is a much discussed and defined concept. This thesis accepts the view that globalization is a process that influences political, economic, cultural, and geographic realities in all nations, regions, and districts. The process of globalization has increased as the flow of capital, ideas, organizations and people has taken on a distinctly global form (Moghadam, 2005). Theories about globalization hold that current trends in the economic, political, and cultural spheres of society are creating fundamental changes in forms of governance and social life. Researchers of globalization see these trends as creating an increasing connectivity between all nation-states and this connectivity is leading to new roles and positions for national governments. Globalization as a process is cyclical and involves economic and political life in a world system of nation-states and multinational organizations.

Due to the research questions addressed, this study has been divided into several sections. The first section (chapters 2-5) will deal with the technical aspects of conducting this study. Chapter 2 provides a brief historical background about Cambodia

in order to help readers contextualize the processes discussed in this thesis. Chapter 3 discusses several key theories about globalization, specifically different theoretical understandings of the concept and the definition of globalization used in this thesis. Chapter 4 focuses on the methodological approaches used in this thesis. These include case study, policy analysis, and content analysis. Following this in chapter 5 will be a review of the major literature surrounding post-conflict reconstruction, multinational organizations, and rebuilding in Cambodia.

The second section of this thesis (chapters 6 & 7) deals directly with the policy documents that were examined. This section includes chapter 6, which focuses on the results of the document content analysis conducted on the multinational organizations documents that deal with funding related to education in Cambodia. The World Bank documents that were analyzed were the: Cambodian Education Sector Support Program (World Bank, 2005a), Country Assistance Strategy for the Kingdom of Cambodia (World Bank, 2005b), and the Ethnic Minorities Action Plan (World Bank, 2008). The Asian Development Bank documents were: the Country Operations Business Plan: Cambodia 2008-2010 (ADB, 2008), Second Education Sector Development Program (ADB, 2004a), and the Country Strategy Program (ADB, 2004b). In addition the Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (IMF, 2006) from the International Monetary Fund, the Country Programme Evaluation Royal Government of Cambodia from UNICEF (UNICEF, 2005), and the Participation of UNESCO in the Education Sector Working Group (UNESCO, 2004) were also included in the content analysis. This is followed by chapter 7 which focuses on the results of the document content analysis conducted on the Cambodian government policies. These policies include: the 3rd Education Strategic Plan (MoEYS, 2005a), the Education Sector Support Program (MoEYS, 2005b), Education for All

National Plan 2003-2015 (MoEYS, 2003), Policy for Curriculum Development (MoEYS,

2004), Child Friendly School Policy (MoEYS, 2007), National Policy of Non-Formal

Education (RGoC, 2002), and the Law on Education (RGoC, 2007).

In the final section of this thesis (chapters 8 & 9), I analyze my data. Chapter 8

presents an analysis of the similarities and differences that exist between the various

documents. The discussion in this chapter revolves around several key themes that

emerged in the documents and how they are understood differently or similarly by the

various organizations and what that means for national education policy in Cambodia.

Chapter 9 returns to the research questions. In this chapter, I seek to continue my analysis

by answering my research questions. Intertwined throughout the chapters will be an

examination of the role of globalization in the development of national institutions in

post-conflict, developing countries.

Before moving into any form of analysis, a brief history of Cambodian social,

political, and educational history will be provided to give the reader an appropriate

context in which to situate the discussions present in the following chapters.

Chapter 2: Background on Cambodia

The ancient history of Cambodia is filled with rich characters and the rise and fall of the powerful Angkor kingdom. This history could fill a vast array of books and since this thesis explores the development of more recent educational policies, this review will begin by exploring the colonial period in Cambodia and move onto the present situation.

2.1   *The colonial period*

Cambodia was a French protectorate from 1864-1953 (Chandler, 1994). Like most colonial situations, the French presence in the country bought huge changes to Cambodia. Some of those changes were more welcome than others, as shall be discussed below.

The arrival of the French in Southeast Asia in the early 1860's had actually been a political, social, and territorial relief to the Cambodian monarch, King Norodom I. Prior to French intervention, Cambodia was being ripped apart by its two neighbouring powers, the Siamese (Thais) and the Vietnamese (Martin, 1994). Due to the internal and external pressures from the conflicts with Siam and Vietnam, King Norodom I was eager to find a way out of his country's present dilemma. As a result, he signed an initial treaty of protection with France in late 1863 (Ayres, 2000). The French were quite happy to have influence in Cambodia, as they saw the country as a geographical foothold in the region and they were particularly interested in the country's close location to the wealthy Mekong Delta. However, direct French interest in the country only really emerged in 1884 after the Sino-French War (Martin, 1994). A new treaty in 1884 allowed France to gain political and economic control over all of Indochina (3 Vietnamese territories, Laos, and Cambodia). Despite the fact that French intents in Cambodia were not of the purest

Figure 1: Map of Cambodia

variety, becoming a French protectorate actually saved the country from disappearing

altogether (Martin, 1994). Had it not been for the French protectorate status, Cambodia

would have most certainly been absorbed into the Siamese or Vietnamese kingdoms.

Despite the fact that the French had saved Cambodia from political and territorial

annihilation at the hands of Siam and Vietnam, the colonial power did little to improve

the daily life of the average Cambodian. According to Martin (1994), "France's

intentions were certainly not pure, and few projects of real benefit to the Khmer people were carried out during the entire ninety years" (p. 32). This certainly was the case in education. For the most part, education in Cambodia during the French colonial period was scant and geared primarily to the needs of the elite (Bray and Bunly, 2005). The few secular schools that were established were only open to the children of French residents, the Cambodian elites, and others who were in the area to assist with the administration of the protectorate (Ayres, 2000). The fact that Cambodia remained a protectorate in the first twenty years of French rule was a key factor in the determination of the direction of education. The French did not undertake a policy of assimilation, as they had in neighbouring Vietnam, and therefore they had little use for a mass education system (Ayres, 2000). The wat, or pagoda, would be the primary source of education for most Cambodian children (Bray and Bunly, 2005).

The arrangement of pagoda schools seemed to work for both the French and the majority of the Cambodian population (Dy, 2004). The Cambodians were allowed to maintain a key link between village life and religion while the French were able to extend the availability of education at a relatively low cost (Bray and Bunly, 2005). The French did attempt to modernize the pagoda schools after World War I. The primary reason being that the pagoda schools did not fit the Western view of formal schooling in that there was not a set curriculum or timetable (Ayres, 2000). The new "modernized" pagoda schools offered a curriculum similar to French schools, however it was blended with local religious studies and Khmer was the language of instruction (Bray and Bunly, 2005). As a result, the teachers primarily remained monks. The popularity in using pagodas for education was evident in their expansion throughout the colonial period. For example, in the 1930's alone, the number of pagoda schools rose from 225 in 1932 to 908 in 1938

(Ayres, 2000). In contrast, the number of French primary schools remained at 18 between 1932 and 1938 (Ayres, 2000).

At the end of the colonial period, education in Cambodia remained closely tied to Buddhist ideals and Khmer remained the language of instruction. In general, the French did succeed in implementing a partial Westernized curriculum into the pagoda schools. In summary, although the French did not create the infrastructure of a modern education in Cambodia, the French did lay the intellectual foundation of such a system.

2.2   Independence

Cambodia gained independence from France in July of 1954 through the Geneva Agreement (Seo, 2006). On the surface, the period directly after independence (1953-1969) was one of relative peace and security in Cambodia. The country embarked on an ambitious development agenda, which included the expansion of formal education. Greater emphasis was placed on the construction of state schools that would operate in parallel to the modernized pagoda schools (Bray and Bunly, 2005). Demand for state education increased throughout the post-independence era as masses of Cambodians started to believe in the notion of education as a means of upward social mobility (Ayres, 2000).

However, the post-independence Cambodian governments were ill equipped to deal with the increasing demands for mass formal education. Problems existed in finding trained personnel to run the schools, supplies to operate the schools, and most significantly, money to fund the schools with. By the mid-1950's UNESCO was sending researchers to Cambodia to assess the situation. This was the first time the organization had gotten involved in Cambodian educational affairs (Ayres, 2000). The recommendation of UNESCO was that the expansion of the education system in

Cambodia had to be gradual and done within the economic realities of the state. In addition, the UNESCO researchers recommended that a curriculum had to be created that reflected the needs of Cambodia (Ayres, 2000). However, the Cambodian government, lead by King Sihanouk, paid little heed to UNESCO's call for restraint and expanded schooling beyond its means.

The purpose of the expansion was to develop an educated work force throughout the country. King Sihanouk set about instructing the building of a vast amount of schools. Between 1955 and 1968, the number of primary schools went from 2, 731 to 5, 837 and the number of lycées (secondary schools) went from 10 to 180 (Pellini, 2007, p. 176). However, quantity does not necessarily equate to quality. Pellini (2007) explains that, "The implementation according to this strategy had serious limitations since it was not conducted according to the financial and human resources available to the government, teacher training lagged behind, and the school syllabus was copied from the French one" (p. 176). Therefore, the physical infrastructure was far outstripping the human component of the education system. As a result, the strong human elements of excellent teachers and strong administrators became concentrated in urban areas where rich elites were able to pay for better education (Verkoren, 2005). The curriculum also became geared toward urban economic issues despite the fact that the majority of the country was rural (Verkoren, 2005). Many of the students who did graduate ended up finding that their education did not serve their economic and employment goals. So, the education reforms of the 1950's and early 1960's did little to improve the economic well being of the country and only served to exacerbate the rural-urban, elite-peasant divide (Verkoren, 2005).

One key development during this time involved the attempt to expand the teaching profession. Teacher salaries were increased in hopes of luring quality

individuals into the field (Bray and Bunly, 2005). The attractive salaries and opening of

the field did attract some newly returned, French educated individuals into the teaching

profession. Many of these individuals were anti-monarchy and would form the basis of

the Cambodian communist party. One would lead a mass genocide in the coming decade.

His name was Pol Pot.

However, as had been predicted, the rapid development of post-independence

Cambodia could not be maintained and the political and economic instability it caused

threw the country into chaos.

2.3   The "Dark Years" (1975-1979)

The 1960's were a tumultuous time in Southeast Asia and it would be impossible

for Cambodia to avoid the turmoil. As was just discussed, the Cambodian government of

King Sihanouk had overextended itself financially and politically. It would be

completely unable to deal with explosive international situations occurring around it.

Specifically, the global divide between communism and capitalism (Seo, 2006). In

Southeast Asia, this divide came to a head in Cambodia and its neighbour, Vietnam, with

the onset of the American-Vietnam War. Between 1970 and 1975, Cambodia was

embroiled in an undeclared war (Mysliviec, 2003). When the conflict started, the

development aid Cambodia had been receiving ended. This incapacitated an already

weak government.

In 1970, a military coup toppled the Sihanouk government. General Lon Nol, a

pro-Western figure, took power in 1972 (Seo, 2006). However, this government was

incredibly unstable and a communist guerrilla group backed by China, the Khmer Rouge,

fought a successful civil war against the government. In 1975, the Khmer Rouge defeated

Lon Nol's government as the Americans fled Southeast Asia. Their leader Pol Pot established a communist government and so began the "Dark Years" in Cambodia.

The failure of the post-independence educational reforms was highlighted by the groups that led the coup in 1970 and were echoed by the Khmer Rouge. They cited education as a major failure of the royal government (Pellini, 2007). The coup, and its subsequent collapse, issued in the darkest period for the Cambodian education system and the people who worked within it. As Geeves (2002) describes, education went from crisis to catastrophe. The catastrophe came in the form of Pol Pot and his Khmer Rouge regime (1975-1979). The Khmer Rouge were agrarian communists who wanted to get rid of the educated elite. Ironically, many of the Khmer Rouge leaders had been educated at elite schools in France (Duggan, 2003). At their core, the Khmer Rouge were xenophobic and anti-intellectual. They were a home-grown genocidal organization who emerged and were supported by local Cambodians who were disillusioned with the government of King Sihanouk.

According to Duggan (2003), "The heavy investment in education during the 1960's did not improve the economy and well being of the Khmer and under Pol Pot this was used as an excuse to destroy the economy, the educated and the sector itself" (p. 416). Between 1975 and 1979, formal schooling came to an end as schools were either closed or destroyed (ADB, 1996). Also, all intellectuals and teachers were summarily hunted down and executed or they fled the country. It is estimated that 75-80% of Cambodia's teachers and higher education students and 67% of primary and secondary students fled the country or were killed during this time (UNESCO, 1991). All universities, except for one, were closed. Thus by 1980, there were few people left in Cambodia with any type of educational experience, let alone any educational expertise.

The Khmer Rouge regime systematically destroyed the structures and individuals involved in the education system.

By the end of the 1970's Cambodia would trade a dictator for occupiers, as their traditional enemy, the Vietnamese toppled the Khmer Rouge ushering in another unstable period in the country.

2.4   The Vietnamese Occupation

Cambodia and Vietnam are geographic neighbours in Southeast Asia. As such, there has been, and continues to be, a complex and volatile relationship between the two nations. Both started the 20th century as part of French Indochina. Therefore, they shared a common colonial system and also a common fight for independence. This fight for independence began in both Cambodia and Vietnam in 1946 (Morris, 1999). However, even within this fight against a common colonial power, there was dissension particularly on the Cambodian side. A great deal of Cambodian resentment toward the Vietnamese had emerged because of the colonial realignment of territory (Morris, 1999). The French realignment allocated several former Cambodian provinces to Vietnam. According to Morris (1999), "This amputation of territory was formally recognized by a series of treaties signed by the French without the consent of the Cambodian king" (p. 32). Beyond the territorial realignment, the French also assigned Vietnamese administrators to run several key institutions in Cambodia. All of this tension served to enforce long standing simmering anti-Vietnamese sentiment, even as the two nations fought the same colonial power.

The eventual break from France was anything but smooth and peaceful for both Vietnam and Cambodia. A conference in Geneva from May 8th to July 21st, 1954 was intended to settle issues in Indochina and eliminate French rule in the region (Nguyen-vo,

1992). Although it did serve to end colonial rule, the territorial and administrative settlements from the Geneva conference only exacerbated tensions between various governments including those of Vietnam, Cambodia, and China.

These new upsets would lead to conflict once again by the 1960's and 1970's. Vietnam and Cambodia would get caught up in the Sino-Soviet divide in this time period. This was because the Soviet Union, fearing American influence in the area, threw their support to the communist regime in North Vietnam while the Chinese government chose to support the Cambodian Khmer Rouge regime (Nguyen-vo, 1992). On top of this was the American military intervention in the region and eventual financial support to "democratic" Cambodian parties. The coup in 1970 in Cambodia allowed for greater American support and their presence in the nation continued until they departed the region in 1975. This conflict filled period of history also lead to the emergence of extreme nationalist and communist groups, including the Khmer Rouge in Cambodia. According to Hervouet, "No sooner had the last US helicopter beat a hasty retreat in 1975 then the first signs of conflict between the Vietnamese and Cambodians began to appear" (1988, p. 6). Border disputes broke out right away and there were incursions into each other's territory. However, the last vestiges of peace disappeared when the Khmer Rouge systematically executed ethnic Vietnamese within or just along the Cambodian border (Morris, 1999).

On December 25, 1978, the Vietnamese army launched an attack on Cambodia (Hervouet, 1988). The army leaders knew they had Soviet support for their action because the Soviets were still worried about US influence in Cambodia and Southeast Asia generally. Within two weeks, the regime of the Khmer Rouge had collapsed, Vietnamese forces occupied all of Cambodia and a weak puppet government was in charge in Phnom

Penh. What followed was 10 years characterized by a guerrilla style war between Vietnam and Cambodia that benefited neither side (Morris, 1999).

When the Vietnamese toppled the Khmer Rouge regime in 1979, there was little left of the education system in Cambodia. The Khmer Rouge had felt that the only valid type of education should be conducted in factories and co-operatives and this education should consist of basic literacy and manual work (Duggan, 2003). This was the situation facing the Vietnamese backed government. Reports of educational changes and rejuvenation during the Vietnamese occupation (1979-1989) are varied. There was certainly an increase in the number of operating basic educational facilities. A shift in educational philosophy occurred during this period as well. Education was to be used for ideological, rather than economic, purposes. Education was to be a way to legitimate a new socialist state (Pellini, 2007). As a result, there was a great deal of community involvement in rebuilding given the socialist nature of the new state.

However, once again just because a school is open, it does not guarantee a quality education. According to Duggan (2003), "It was during the 1979-1986 period that quality provision problems emerged, became manifest and, in some cases, remain permanent. Those quality provision concerns included large numbers of unqualified teachers, an absence of curriculum and relevant and quality teacher training programs and high wastage and drop-out rates at all levels" (p. 418). Despite efforts, expansion in higher education was slow and almost non-existent outside of Phnom Penh (Duggan, 2003). So, at the end of the Vietnamese occupation, there had been slight gains in the quantity of educational opportunities. However, the education system was filled with unqualified teachers and was in no way helping Cambodia develop a revitalised economic workforce or social system.

As was discussed above, the Vietnamese were occupiers of Cambodia between 1979 and 1986. Yet, beyond that, the two countries had a very tumultuous relationship and history of animosity. Therefore, it is of little surprise that education, and social infrastructure in general, during this time was not a priority. There was continuous social unrest in the country. The rebuilding necessary after the Khmer Rouge regime was beyond the mandate for an occupying force in a traditionally hostile environment. Therefore, by the time of the Paris Peace Accord in 1991, Cambodia had been in crisis for over two decades and the education system remained in ruins.

2.5   *United Nations Transitional Authority in Cambodia (UNTAC) and beyond*

In October of 1991, representatives from 18 nations came together to broker a peace agreement between Vietnam and Cambodia (Nguyen-vo, 1992). For the following two years, the United Nations took direct control of Cambodia, as both Vietnam and Cambodia fought to be accepted into the international community. There was great international pressure to conform to the newer, open reality of a *glasnost* world environment. After 1989, there would be an increasing effort on both the Vietnamese and Cambodian governments' behalf to live up to international expectations in relation to their economic and political systems. After nearly thirty years of war, conflict, and isolation, the two countries were in desperate need of an economic revival to guarantee their survival.

The first step in that revival was supposed to be the implementation of a United Nations transitional government (UNTAC). The establishment of UNTAC had been the culmination of three years of negotiations on how to proceed in Cambodia after the Vietnamese withdrawal. The purpose of UNTAC was that it was to be an international control mechanism that would operate and control the Cambodian government and

institutions while preparations were made for general elections (IPS and UNITAR, 1995). It would take two years for the preparations to be completed.

In general, UNTAC was a very complex operation in a complex environment and this situation resulted in its slow progress. UNTAC involved the deployment of 15, 900 military personnel, 3,600 civilian police, and 1,020 civilian personnel from over 30 countries (IPS and UNITAR, 1995). UNTAC's mandate involved, "major tasks in institution building and social reconstruction as integral parts of a peace-building 'package' designed to secure an end to armed conflict, and a transition to genuine democracy" (1995, p. 4). It was a tall order and the time span to achieve the initial goals was very short. Needless to say there were some serious shortcomings in the mission. Specifically, the civil administration failed to gain control over the key areas of government, including education. Therefore, once again, education became embroiled in the political, social, and economic turmoil encompassing Cambodia.

However despite overall shortcomings, some achievements were made under UNTAC. As per its official mandate, the attempted rebuilding and development of Cambodian social structure and institutions became the key focus for the temporary United Nations transitional government. Since the country's economic and social structure had been a socialist model under Vietnamese control (at least until 1989), the focus was on establishing a capitalistic mind set as Cambodia prepared to enter the world market system. Thus, from the outset, the educational reforms in post-conflict Cambodia were intimately tied to changes in the economic and political structures of the country and the world beyond.

However, economic progress was slow and it was deemed by those in control that a properly run and structured education system was the way to improve economic

productivity. The financing for the rebuilding would have to come primarily from other nations and multinational financial organizations. Throughout the 1990s, these institutions were becoming deeply ingrained with neo-liberal ideals and these would become an elemental condition of the loans to developing nations such as Cambodia.

When Cambodians elected a new government and restored the monarchy in 1993, it officially became an independent kingdom-nation once again. However, the influx of multinational and international agencies into the social, political, and economic structures of the country did not stop with the dismantling of UNTAC. What the Paris Peace Accord of 1991 did do was to officially mandate international influence over Cambodian domestic affairs in the name of development. Ayres (2000) lists five main characteristics of the educational sector during UNTAC. These are: 1) the State of Cambodia still maintained official control over education; 2) there was an increased presence and profile of NGOs in the education sector; 3) education was in a terrible mess in the country; 4) educational development was haphazard with no clear plan or direction; 5) multinational organizations gained a say in the future direction of education in Cambodia through their funding. Through these processes, it is clear to see where the contradictions lay. The State of Cambodia, although officially still in charge of education, was becoming increasingly dependent on multinational financial organizations to reform and run their education system, and NGOs to staff the education sector. So many different groups were getting involved in education in Cambodia that there was little surprise that no clear direction was developed and the system remained obsolete and unmanageable.

This has then been the situation in Cambodia since the first democratically elected government came to power in 1993. This is the legacy of the policies under study in the following chapters. This background was intended to show how multinational and

international influence in the country has shaped the direction of domestic policy in

Cambodia. Today, 16 years after the first election, Cambodia still struggles with its

developing post-conflict status and the difficulty of balancing domestic needs with

international demands. In the next chapter, I will examine theories about globalization

and connect them to the situation in Cambodia.

Chapter 3: Theories about Globalization

Since the end of the Second World War there has been an increased interest in theoretical perspectives that explore the impact of global forces on national and local life. Of particular interest for many scholars is the increased impact of international economic, political, and cultural changes on national social institutions and ways of life. One of the main questions these theories seek to answer is how and why do the global trends affect the local? However, despite a similar overall interest, scholars examining global forces vary greatly in their approach and overall perspectives. In order to understand the role of international organizations on Cambodian educational policies, it is important to engage with theories of globalization. As a result, this chapter will lay out how globalization theories can be used to analyze education reform. To do this, the chapter will be broken into several sections. First, I discuss what globalization is and the economic, political, and cultural effects of globalization. Then I turn to different theoretical conceptualizations of globalization, including the hyperglobalist, sceptical, and transformationalist perspectives. Next, I address globalization and comparative and international education. Finally, I explore the relationship between policy, reform, education and globalization. Most importantly this chapter aims to set out the theoretical approach I intend to use in this thesis.

3.1 What is globalization?

Within globalization theories there is much debate about what the term globalization does and should encompass. What exactly is globalization? There are many definitions of the term in the literature. One principal consistency between varying definitions of globalization is that it involves processes that are spread out across most

areas of the world and are therefore global. In his definition, Gutek (2006) states that,

"globalization operates worldwide as a process but this process functions within

particular context such as individual nation-states or regions" (p. 100). This is a good

definition in that it recognizes globalization is a process that spreads worldwide.

However, this definition fails to indicate how globalization operates and through which

sectors and its impact.

Globalization involves economic, political, and social processes and these should

be recognized in any understanding of the concept. Each of these is discussed in detail

later in this chapter. Almost all views of globalization emphasize the economic elements

of globalization. The economic ideals and processes can include an emphasis on the

movement of capital and labour as a flexible workforce. For example, Herman (1999)

states that globalization is "an active process of corporate expansion across borders" (p.

40). Utkin (2001) states that globalization is a "metaphor, invented for clearing up the

essence and understanding of the nature of modern capitalism" (p. 9). In addition,

Titarenko (2002) sees globalization as a process when "the world economy and the

association of the countries become a unified whole, which integrates regional branches

of economy on the continents and in large countries of the world" (p. 54). These

definitions see globalization as tied directly to capitalism. However, to see globalization

as a solely economic process or simply as the spread of capitalism is an error. In any

definition of globalization, it is essential to recognize the political and cultural elements

of the process as well.

Suarez-Orozco and Sattin (2007) recognize the cultural element of globalization.

They state, "Globalization is the ongoing process of intensifying economic, social, and

cultural exchanges across the planet" (Suarez-Orozco & Sattin, 2007, p. 7). Meanwhile,

Gunn (2005) states that globalization is about changes in technologies and

communications, which inevitably lead to changes in cultural beliefs and practices. These

cultural aspects generally relate to the notion of the global village; that is, a global

community connected through time and space by technology, migrations, and the media.

For this project, the view of globalization to be employed is that it is a process of

increased interconnectedness between all nation-states brought about by important

changes in the economic, political, and cultural spheres of societies. Moghadam is

another researcher who sees globalization this way. She states that globalization is "an

overall political, economic, cultural, and geographical process in which the flow of

capital, ideas, organizations, and peoples has taken on an increasingly global form"

(Moghadam, 2005, p. 17). Here globalization is described as a process that is spreading

to many areas of the world. The definition also recognizes the economic, political, and

cultural elements of the process, all of which interact to impact the manifestation of

globally driven ideals across boundaries. This conception does not limit the levels of

analysis to nation-states, an important consideration when exploring the impact of

multinational organizations on national education policies.

When conceptualizing the process of globalization, Monahan's (2005) work is

very useful. Monahan states that the process of globalization is a multi-layered

phenomenon. He goes on to say that globalization can be thought of as "transparencies

laid on top of one another, each contributing to the final if never complete visible picture"

(Monahan, 2005, p. 5). Within these layers it will be possible to "perceive the local in the

frame of the global just as readily as the global in the local, and the same for all

intervening layers, whether deictic (the nation, city, organization) or disciplinary

(political, economic, cultural)" (Monahan, 2005, p. 5). This conceptualization allows one

to see blurred boundaries and the interconnectedness of all the elements and groups that are involved in the process of globalization. The following section will examine how various researchers interpret and theorize about globalization and its effects.

3.2 *Theoretical conceptualizations of globalization*

Given the varying views of what exactly constitutes globalization, it is of little surprise that there are many different theoretical conceptualizations of globalization. One of the key questions any theory of globalization seeks to address is how and why global trends affect local practices and policies and vice versa. In an influential book Held, McGrew, Goldblatt and Perraton (1999) broke theoretical conceptualizations of globalization into three broad categories. These are: the hyperglobalist, the sceptical, and the transformationalist. Each of these will be analyzed and discussed in the following section.

3.2.1 *The Hyperglobalists*

Hyperglobalist theories hold that the processes associated with economic globalization have led to a world system in which the nation-state is no longer a viable political, economic, or cultural unit. They see this development as a positive thing. Researchers such as Reich (1991), Ohmae (1990), and Waters (1995) feel that globalization equates to the demise of the nation-state as a political, economic, and cultural entity altogether. According to Green, these theories of globalization "predict the end of the national economy and the end of the nation-state as the primary unit of political organization and loyalty" (1997, p. 130). Ohmae (1990) argues that globalization creates a borderless world characterized by cultural hybridization and hence the nation-state has no valid purpose for being. Hyperglobalists see the world economic market as the primary driving force behind any political and cultural changes that may occur. Economic

changes are celebrated as creating new avenues for human progress (Held, McGrew, Goldblatt and Perraton, 1999, p. 3).

In sum, hyperglobalists see globalization as primarily an economic process that has led to the creation of a global market system in which the nation-state is no longer a useful or valid entity. Yet, this is an extreme view and this writer prefers to view globalization as a change in the place and role of the nation-state, rather than the complete elimination of the nation-state altogether.

3.2.2   The Sceptics

In contrast to the hyperglobalists, the sceptics hold that the modern manifestations of globalization discussed in the literature are nothing more than a myth and a recognition of an interconnectedness between and among nations that has existed since the nineteenth century. Like the hyperglobalists, the sceptics rely on a primarily economic argument. Researchers such as Hirst and Thompson (1999), Gordon (1988), and Boyer and Drache (1996) say that the current economic environment has led to an increase in regionalization and this regionalization has actually led to less integration among all nations and therefore global interconnectedness has stayed stagnant or even decreased over the last half century.

In terms of the role of the nation-state, the sceptical approach to globalization holds that nation-states are more necessary now than ever before since the whole process of international trade and relations depends wholly on the regulatory power of national governments (Held, McGrew, Goldblatt, and Perraton, 1999). Therefore, this is another fundamental difference between the sceptics and hyperglobalists. However, just as with the hyperglobalist approach, this thesis holds that the sceptical conceptualization is flawed because although global exchanges have been occurring since the turn of the

nineteenth century, the pace and extent of these exchanges and connections have greatly

increased with the advent of new technologies that have diminished the time and space

between nations and people.

3.2.3   The Transformationalists

As is suggested by the name, transformationalists hold that globalization is a

driving force behind major transformations in the political, social, and economic world

order. Researchers such as Dale (2000), Green (1997) and Daun (2002) argue that

globalization has led to a situation in which there is no longer a clear distinction between

international and domestic, and external and internal processes. The global and the local

are increasingly linked.

The transformationalist approach is still in line with the understanding of

globalization used in this thesis. Daun states that that process has two dimensions: scope

and intensity (2002, p. 3). *Scope* refers to how international trends have spread

geographically while *intensity* refers to how ingrained and accepted these trends have

become within national contexts. This is an important point for the research in this study

which hypothesizes that international trends in education reform have spread to influence

Cambodian national education policy in a significant manner.

One of the key tenets of the transformationalist theoretical conceptualization is

that it recognizes the continuing importance of the nation-state in determining what

occurs within national boundaries. For example, Cambodian national education policy is

restricted to the Cambodian nation-state. However, the transformationalists balance this

view with a recognition that there is an expanding jurisdiction for institutions of

international governance and financing (Held, McGrew, Goldblatt, and Perraton, 1999).

Organizations such as the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund have

reconfigured the political and economic landscape and therefore national governments can no longer be seen as wholly independent units.

As shall be discussed in a later chapter, multinational financial organizations are now active partners in the policy making process in Cambodia. The nation-state exists but in a transformed manner. This transformed nature of the nation-state impacts the direction of national policy and social services in addition to the economic and political sectors of society. Therefore, this thesis holds that the transformationalist conceptualization of globalization can best address global processes of educational reform. This is because it still recognizes the nation-state as a viable, but transformed, entity. The national, or state, governments are the ones that create educational policy. Tranformationalist conceptions of globalization allow for the exploration of the nation-state's role in education policy reform while recognizing that globalization has led to the expanding role of multinational organizations in influencing domestic matters such as education. The thesis then will follow a transformationalist theoretical conceptualization of globalization because it allows for the recognition of an increased pattern of globalization in a world where nation-states still maintain a good deal of control over domestic matters but are becoming increasingly influenced by financially powerful multinational organizations. This theoretical conceptualization will be situated within the field of comparative and international education.

One important understanding of globalization is that it is an ongoing process. To understand fully the process of globalization it is necessary to take into account the economic, political, and cultural effects on society that are brought about by the activities associated with increased connectivity between and among diverse nations on a global scale. These will be discussed next.

3.3   Economic Effects of Globalization

3.3.1   A Global Market System

In the current economic system, there is a drive among politically and economically powerful nations and multinational organizations to unite the majority of the world's independent states in one large market driven economic system. In this capitalist world, the attempt is made to find more consumers to purchase an ever increasing amount of products and services. Even countries which appear to be outside of the most intensive areas of exchanges are impacted by the global changes associated with the current economic system (Daun, 2002). This is because these countries, although on the outskirts of the most intensive areas of economic action, are unable to remove themselves from the larger processes that are occurring around them.

Scatamburlo-D'Annibale and McLaren (2008) state that, "Ours is a world internationally connected but dominated by the whims of the capitalist class and corporate globalization; a world where the profit motive reigns supreme and where it subordinates every area of society and every corner of culture; a world where the many are oppressed for the benefit of the few" (p. 140). Modern capitalism has effects on both developed and developing countries as they are both part of a financial cycle of giving and receiving which has political and social consequences in addition to the obvious economic consequences. Developing countries are dependent on the developed nations and multinational organizations for financial support to rebuild many elements of their society including education. Developed countries are willing to provide this support as long as it is financially profitable for them to do so in the long run. The dependence of developing countries has led to a cycle of exploitation with developed countries using their financial leverage to impose oppressive restrictions on developing countries as conditions on large

loans. The Structural Adjustment Plans of the World Bank and International Monetary Fund, and their successors the Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (which will be discussed in greater detail in a later section), are prime examples of how rich developed countries impose unrealistic restrictions on developing nations through their offers of financial assistance. These types of loans dictate how the money is to be spent. This process includes how much money will be spent on what social services and how these social services will be operated. Ultimately, the lending organizations and nations decide how key areas of a receiving nation's society will be operated and these decisions are made with little concern about local context and needs. Therefore, many outlined programs are unsuccessful and developing countries remain trapped in a cycle of poverty and dependence.

One of the most important developments in the current economic system is the rise of multinational organizations and corporations. As of 2000, half of the world's one hundred largest economies were corporations (Starr, 2000). This economic prominence has led to political and social dominance for these large multinational organizations. Their reach extends beyond their originating national borders and can be felt on most continents. This leads to a situation where local control over national and state economies has become outdated with corporate control over local economies becoming the norm, particularly in the developing world (Scatamburlo-D'Annibale & McLaren, 2008). These large corporations and multinational organizations bring many things to the nations they operate in. Of course, primarily they bring their money and financial backing but they also bring their social and economic ideals. Since the mid-1980s many corporations and multinational organizations have followed a series of principles that have become known as neo-liberal ideals. Indeed, it can be concluded that many global

economic and social changes can be related to an increase in neo-liberal policies, which

are discussed next.

3.3.2   Neo-liberal ideals

Neo-liberalism entails shifting from a state-centred to a market-driven system

(Haque, 1999, p. 199). The recent advent of neo-liberalism stems from criticisms of the

welfare state that gained popularity in the 1980s under the leadership of Ronald Reagan

and Margaret Thatcher. For advocates of neo-liberal policy, the keys to a prosperous

future for the greatest number of individuals throughout the world are the expansion of a

free market system and a large decrease in national governments' responsibilities for

social welfare. Specifically, neo-liberal economic policies, which have been taken up in

countries around the world, advocate a freer, competitive market system; decreased

public spending; and decreased government interventions (Harris, 2007). The increased

competitiveness and expansion of market values is characteristic of a globalized nation-

state. In terms of economics, in a neo-liberal environment, the state has the job of

enabling and steering its citizens through a competitive and an open market system.

Education is also impacted by neo-liberal ideology, particularly the belief that

there should be less government funding and intervention in institutions associated with

social welfare. Because of the neo-liberal emphasis on a decrease in public spending on

social services, such as education, there has been a move toward the privatization of

educational institutions and services. This process has been seen in such diverse places as

England and Cambodia to the United States and Mongolia (Berman et al., 2003; Steiner-

Khamsi, 2006). It has greatly influenced who has a say over the direction of education

curricula and also who has access to various forms of education. Private entrepreneurs

can set the price of the education they offer which can serve to restrict access (Berman et

al., 2003). In addition, neo-liberalism promotes the treatment of education as part of the open market (Steiner-Khamsi, 2006). Therefore, schools become areas of business rather than the promoters of social values. In sum, neo-liberalism has led to education becoming a commodity operated to maximize economic productivity. Under neo-liberal ideology, education has become much more like a general commodity, bought and sold on an open market, with policy makers downplaying matters such as social justice, citizenship and democracy, which are much more difficult to measure on standardized tests, another characteristic of neo-liberal education reforms.

So if, according to neo-liberal ideology, there is to be little influence from the national governments on social, political, or economics sectors of society, is there still a role for these governments?

3.3.3   Globalization and Neo-liberalism

The spread of neo-liberal ideals has occurred along with the movement toward the globalized economic and political world that has characterized the late 20th and early 21st century. The combination of globalization and neo-liberalism has created an environment where education is now viewed as a business with national and international partners. According to Beckmann and Cooper (2004), a system now exists where educational institutions and reforms are "inextricably linked to the global social structure" (p. 2). Gewirtz and Ball (2000) hold that the shift to a business model in education entails a move from a "learner-needs" perspective to an "institutional-needs" perspective situated in the "paradoxical logic of market discipline" (p. 254). As shall be demonstrated, this shift, which is indicative of a neo-liberal reform agenda, is certainly clear within the multinational policy directives. However, I shall demonstrate, in chapter 8, that the shift

is more veiled in the Cambodian policy documents where there appear to be attempts to

hold onto a learner-needs perspective.

Larner (2000) also makes some key points about the understanding of neo-

liberalism and its relation to reform and governance that I will incorporate in my analysis

(chapter 8 and 9). She states that neo-liberalism can be thought of in three

complementary and connected ways. These are as a policy agenda, as an ideology, and as

a form of governmentality (Larner, 2000). This line of thinking is very interesting and

can be applied in this thesis. In this case, the policy documents and directives contain

several examples of neo-liberalism as a policy agenda. This can be seen in the prevalence

of neo-liberal ideals such as efficiency, decentralization, and accountability throughout

the policies.

However, I agree with Larner (2000) when she states that seeing neo-liberalism

solely as a policy agenda is erroneous as doing this would underestimate the significance

of the impact neo-liberalism has on current transformations in governance (p. 6). She

also states that another error many researchers make is to see neo-liberal reforms and

policies as being understood and applied uniformly across contexts when in fact "it is

clear that neo-liberal policies are differentially applied" (2000, p. 7). Specifically Larner

(2000) states,

> Most immediately, we are alerted to the possibility that there are different
> configurations of neo-liberalism, and that close inspection of particular neo-liberal
> political projects is more likely to reveal a complex hybrid political imaginary,
> rather than the straightforward implementation of a unified and coherent
> philosophy (p. 11).

I also want to reference earlier studies by Hall (1988) and Jensen (1993, 1995). Hall feels

that an ideological tension can arise when neo-liberalism emerges. This tension can be

particularly acute in a post-conflict nation where the influences of neo-liberal financial

organizations such as the World Bank and Asian Development Bank are being countered

by a local desire for the re-emergence of a national cultural identity. In her work, Jenson

(1993, 1995) emphasizes political agency, specifically how groups come together around

a particular collective identity in order to promote their own interests and influence social,

political, and cultural restructuring. I believe that the documents show that the Cambodian

government has demonstrated political agency through their desire to emphasize cultural

elements in their policies in order to influence the restructuring agenda. This will become

particularly clear in the discussion of the purposes of education later in this thesis,

specifically chapters 6 through 10.

3.3.4   *The role of national governments in a globalized world*

In a neo-liberal economic environment, the state is considered to have the job of

enabling and steering its citizens through a competitive and open market system.

Increased competitiveness and expansion of market values are characteristic of a

globalized nation-state. Therefore, a primary economic role of the state in this type of

market driven climate is to ensure the presence of a competitive work force with

marketable skills (Rizvi and Lingard, 2006). Traditionally, in most nations, education has

been the mandate of the national or state-level government. Since education is still

officially a national endeavour, national or state governments are able to gear education

programs and policies toward creating the type of workforce they feel is necessary to

compete in the international market (Rizvi and Lingard, 2006). However, it is difficult to

explore the economic impacts of globalization without exploring the political aspects of

the trend.

3.4   *Political Effects of Globalization*

The economic changes mentioned above have forced national governments to re-assess their roles in both the private and public spheres. This is particularly the case in relation to neo-liberal economics. The advocates of these types of policies hold that the state should be less interventionist in the market. Hence, the political organizations within nation-states are forced to change direction and look for new roles in their economic participation. The changing ties to the economy of the nation-state (and beyond) will have consequences for political institutions and individuals who rely on these connections for their social positions. Of particular importance for Cambodia is the increased economic and political prominence of multinational organizations.

3.4.1   The age of multinational organizations

Globalization has involved the spread of multinational bodies and organizations. Some of these well known organizations include the: United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO); The World Bank (WB); Asian Development Bank (ADB); International Monetary Fund (IMF); North American Treaty Organization (NATO); and the Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD).

Many of these organizations are well funded and supported and this can put pressure on the leaders of nations who rely on their help. In addition, the multinational organizations have political impact in that they often create new positions in the global political hierarchy. The spread and growing importance of the multinational organizations is changing the global and national political structure. For example, Cooper (1996) points out that organizations like NATO take away national governments' autonomy over defence and weaponry, a key element of national sovereignty. Cooper (1996) also goes on

to point out that this situation has developed because there is an increase in the value of international diplomacy to settle disputes rather than armed conflict.

Multinational organizations have influenced governments' autonomy. No government is currently able to operate in complete isolation, with the exception perhaps of North Korea. However, even in this case, multinational organizations such as the United Nations are dictating what sort of energy program the North Koreans can carry out. In order to ensure compliance, the atomic energy inspectors affiliated with the United Nations carry out inspections. If compliance is not met, severe economic sanctions (locking a nation out of the global market) are instituted to pressure the government to back out of programs deemed to be unacceptable to the majority of nations. This is one example that shows no national government can have complete autonomy in the current world economic and political system.

The prominent financial position of many multinationals, such as the World Bank and International Monetary Fund has led to a situation where national governments are losing sovereignty and autonomy. Green (1997) states that, "Whether or not it is argued that national governments have exercised their national sovereignty by willingly ceding control to these bodies, or have had it wrested from them, it remains the case that national autonomy, if not sovereignty, is inevitably curtailed" (p. 155). This has a direct impact on policy making within a national context. If national governments are no longer in control of their own sovereignty, then it would go hand in hand with their loss of control over national policy. So given this new social reality, what is the political role of national governments in a globalized world? Does monetary power equate to political power?

3.4.2 Monetary power and political influence

As was discussed above, global economic changes have created a new political dynamic in both developed and developing countries. Yet, how much political influence is gained through economic influence? This is an important question to examine in this thesis which seeks to explore multinational influence over Cambodian national education policy.

Specifically, this thesis is focussed on the impact of globalization on a post-conflict developing nation. Within any developing nation there are class differences and differing access to power and resources. Developing nations' reliance on foreign aid has led to the creation of strong ties between political elites in developing countries and international players. Held (1995) and Harding and Phillips (1986) have argued that this process results in less domestic trust of the state apparatuses. This can be very detrimental to a post-conflict state that is already struggling to establish and maintain legitimacy. The internal instability can then force domestic state officials to become more heavily dependent on international agencies to maintain their social position (Green, 1997).

Foreign economic aid becomes essential for the continuation of a post-conflict national state. Without the foreign aid, major rebuilding projects would be impossible. In addition, financial aid is needed for economic rejuvenation that allows a developing country to enter the global market system (Daun, 2002). However, since the aid comes with restrictions such as those seen in the Structural Adjustment Plans and Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers from the IMF (IMF, 2009), the ability of the national politicians to set policy directives is severely restricted by the conditions laid down by the international financial donors. For example, in the early 1990s the International Monetary Fund and World Bank lent money to the African nation of Somalia. One of the

conditions of these loans was that the money would be used to develop the Somalia

banana export crop (Samatar, 1993). Another condition was that the Somali government

had to liberalize several industries, including the banana industry that had previously been

under greater state control. This liberalization allowed Italian investor De Nadai to buy

several large banana plantations and eventually become the only sole exporter of Somali

bananas (Samatar, 1993). Therefore, the economic benefits from a profitable banana

exporting business went directly out of Somalia. This is only one example of how the

conditions laid down by major financial organizations take power away from the

governments of developing countries.

Yet despite the conditions, officially the national state still maintains control over

domestic policy. Therefore, it is important to recognize the financial and political

influence of international organizations and powerful nations on the domestic policies of

developing countries while still recognizing a degree of local autonomy. The amount of

autonomy will vary by country. As Taylor and Henry (2007) state, "the nation-state's

authority to allocate values has not ceased, but rather increasingly sits alongside other

value-allocating authorities" (p. 16). The state's values are reflected by the culture of a

country and, as shall be seen in the next section, globalization has influenced national and

regional cultures as well.

3.5   *Cultural Effects of Globalization*

Economics and politics are not the only areas of life influenced by globalization.

In its essence, cultural globalization holds that there is cultural hybridization occurring.

That is, cultures around the world are tending toward a homogeneity of Anglo-American

values and norms (Stromquist and Monkman, 2000). The first sign of this is the

increasing dominance of the English language in all aspects of society throughout the

world. English is the primary language in most business transactions and it is increasingly

becoming the language of instruction in higher education facilities around the world. Yet,

the English language is also symbolic of Western values or way of life. Thus, many

researchers feel that the spread and dominance of the English language is just one sign of

the spread and dominance of Anglo-American values. According to Stromquist and

Monkman (2000), "not only is English becoming the global language, but there has

developed a tendency, particularly among elites and middle classes all over the world, to

adopt what might be termed an American way of life" (p. 7).

This process has much to do with improved information technologies and the

mass media. These developments have made the exchange of ideas and information more

rapid and regular. Time and space, so the argument goes, are disappearing (Monahan,

2005). Yet, is there really a global culture? Have the local cultures disappeared

altogether? Others assert that cultural transfers are seldom all encompassing and uni-

directional (Rizvi, 2000). Rizvi (2000) feels that theorists are naively overlooking the

impact of local cultures on people's acceptance of dominant global views. It is wrong not

to recognize that when outside cultural elements are implemented within a new context,

the individuals and organizations within that new context will interpret and incorporate

them in a manner that meshes with the existing way of life (Rizvi, 2000). Therefore, it is

better to see that certain cultural elements will transfer, in a variety of ways; however,

their manifestations within local contexts will vary.

For this thesis, I believe that the discussion of cultural globalization inevitably

also relates back to economics. This is because much of the flow that results in cultural

transfer relates directly back to economic activity associated with the spread of capitalism

with its emphasis on values such as self-interest, competition, and instrumental rationality

(Daun, 2002). The promotion of capitalist values through the economic and political institutions in a nation-state will have an inevitable impact on cultural life. Capitalism is based on the success of the market and a global market can work much better if there is the standardization of demand and supply (Stromquist and Monkman, 2000). However, as was discussed above, new ideals do not just simply replace existing value systems but are adapted by people to fit local realities. So, various interpretations of capitalist values are being incorporated into cultural systems throughout the globe.

The fact that cultural globalization is intimately tied to the economic and political elements of globalization is significant for this thesis. Ultimately, the focus of my research is on the economic and political elements of globalization as they relate to national education policy development. There are particular cultural elements that become apparent in the Cambodian education policies as shall be discussed in chapters 7 and 8. However, the cultural influences of globalization are much more apparent in the implementation of policies and this area of research is beyond the scope of this thesis. Despite this, I believe it is important to acknowledge the cultural elements of globalization in this study as an examination of the implementation of the policies under study here is an important area for future research.

3.6 *Policy, Reform, Education and Globalization*

3.6.1 Globalization and Education Policy Reform

Education is strategically placed in the middle of the economic, political, and cultural sectors of society. When discussing reform, there are several issues to look at. One issue is the transformation in what policies are dominating education in different regions (Lindblad and Popkewitz, 2004). There have been some distinctive trends in education policy reforms over the last thirty years. One of these trends has been the

movement toward standardization. Standardization does not mean that all schools are the same but rather the ideology and practices behind education are becoming increasingly similar (Rezai-Rashti, 2004). One of the common ideals of education in a globalized world is that education should be seen as an economic investment that is geared to making productive workers who can help create a nation's economic growth (Spring, 2009, p. 3). In addition to the emphasis on education as an economic investment, education standardization has been characterized by the widespread use of English as the primary language of educational instruction (Clayton, 2006). Increasingly students in all areas of the world are using English in their classrooms. This situation ties into the ideal that education is an economic investment since the primary language of international business is also English. There is also a move to standardize curricular categories and subjects of study across educational institutions around the globe (Dale, 2000). The emphasis on English and more "Western" curricular categories has led to the term "Americanization" to describe these recent changes in educational practices.

One of the main purposes of education in a globalized world is to enrich the private and business sectors with individuals and resources that allow them to excel in the global market (Monahan, 2005). As was discussed earlier, multinational organizations provide financial aid with the primary goal being profitability. Money is given to increase the ability to make money in the future. There tends to be a perception that an educated human resource base provides a good return on financial investment. Investing in people is supposed to lead to increased profits for those investors. In order to achieve this goal, greater control has been established over people in the education sector, particularly teachers and students. This control is being imposed through policy reforms that favour the neo-liberal trends associated with increased global exchanges and

interconnectedness. The recent global wave of education policy reform has focused on issues of "accountability", "new managerialism", and "teacher professionalism" (Lindblad and Popkewitz, 2004). These issues lead to pedagogical alignment with industry, school accountability, organizational restructuring, and technological projects (Monahan, 2005).

The globalization of education policy also affects students, in that the definition of a well-educated person is changing alongside the wider social changes. Educational policy reforms are being conducted within a neo-liberal social and economic environment (Rezai-Rashti, 2009). Increasingly a well-educated person is being seen as someone who is adaptable and can function within the community, national, and global environments. National education systems are seeing their focus shift from the reproduction of national culture and the creation of good national citizens to the production of a profitable and marketable workforce and adaptable global citizens with roots in and loyalty to their homeland which is in line with neo-liberal ideals. In a globalized world, education becomes about creating collective memories that advocate an attachment to the nation-state but also to global processes. For the national governments however, loyalty to a homeland is still an important value to have embedded in the education system. The trend to balance the local amid the global can be seen in many nations. Recently, Singapore's Ministry of Education changed its slogan to "Think global, but be rooted in Singapore" (Spring, 2006, p. 241). The rooting of people's identity to the geographic and cultural nation is important if nations are to remain a prominent political entity in a global world.

Another characteristic of globalizing education reform is privatization and de-centralization each of which "decrease[s] the collective concern and bring heterogeneity

of purpose and publics as unquestioned values" (Stromquist and Monkman, 2000, p. 13).

Thus, governments are trying to instil national character through their schools, while

losing the control over these schools. It is a complex dilemma and one that each nation

deals with uniquely.

3.6.2   *The changing role of government in educational provision*

In the past the national government (or provincial/state government) has been

pivotal in determining and implementing education policy. That, some have argued, has

changed with the advent of globalization. Those theorists who follow a hyperglobalist

globalization perspective believe that the nation-state and its governments are being

fundamentally changed by globalization and these changes will eventually make the

nation-state government irrelevant and fundamentally change the way policies are created

and implemented (Held, McGrew, Goldblatt and Perraton, 1999). In recent years, there

have been changes in the extent to which national governments determine education

policies and also in how policies are established and put in place. According to the

hyperglobalists, these changes are proof of the decreasing role of national governments in

determining the direction of their own policies. Yet, ultimately the hyperglobalists say

this process will lead to the disappearance of the nation-state. This writer believes that

changes in the era of globalization will not lead to the disappearance of the nation-state

but rather will lead to fundamental changes in the structure of nation-states. One such

change is that in a globalized world, governing becomes much more about setting up

institutions and structures that allow for their productivity to be maximized under good

management (Harris, 2007). In essence, government officials become managers,

government becomes a business. This is demonstrated in the education reforms policies

discussed in this thesis. In addition, this writer also sees the marketization of all sectors

of political life as a trend in the globalization process. It falls in line with the neo-liberal non-interventionist economic ideals. Consequently, not only do governments have to adjust their economic roles, they also have to change their political roles. Thus, rather than completely disappearing, the nation-state is morphing under economic and political pressures from within and outside of their national boundaries.

Gutek (2006) adds that, "Globalization is a force that causes the setting of new educational priorities and the restructuring of the curriculum" (p. 111). The setting of new educational priorities is of particular interest in relation to the changing role of government. Education is an essential social element for any country but is particularly relevant to developing countries dependent on multinational organizations for their education funding, such as Cambodia. The setting of educational priorities is usually a task of the national or state level governments. However, increasingly, multinational financial agencies have become involved either directly or indirectly in the educational goal setting task.

According to Lindblad and Popkewitz (2004), this transformation involves "a shift from bureaucratic control to the introduction of other agencies, public as well as private, in the governing of education" (p. vii). This shift in governance is often related to changes in the economic and political direction of a nation-state. This shift is at the heart of the research questions posed in this thesis. These larger, more structural, changes then have an impact on the individuals in the education system. This is particularly true when looking at the spread of neo-liberal ideals. As was discussed earlier, the spread of capitalism often entails a change in social values, particularly in developing, post-conflict nations. One of the key ways to teach these values is through the school system. All of these terms are rooted in neo-liberal ideals.

In the past, education policy has generally been a domestic concern. That is education policy has been the concern of domestic governments, whether they be at the national or state/provincial level. This is why the exploration of national education policy is critical when trying to determine how the state is responding to global movements within a distinctive local context. Do local governments still maintain control over the direction of their education policies? Or do other organizations and institutions exert influence on governments to direct their policies in certain ways? According to Bottery (2000), it has become clear recently that the real forces influencing current policy initiatives in developing countries are global pressures, particularly economic and political pressures. Interestingly though, Bottery does not stop at examining just direct education policy to see the impact of globalization on education reform. He feels that there are also many other indirect policies that have an impact on educational institutions. These policies should also be studied in the research of educational trends (Bottery, 2000). In this thesis, I also looked beyond education policies, particularly when looking at the multinational policy directives. The reform of education is seen as part of the larger development process and as a result, as Bottery states, looking only at the education directives does not give the whole picture of the reform process. This wider focus is particularly important in relation to theories about globalization which hold that economic, political, and cultural changes are all tied together in a unified process of change.

3.7   *Conclusions*

Theories about globalization hold that current trends in the economic, political, and cultural spheres of society are creating fundamental changes in forms of governance and social life. Hyperglobalist theories hold that globalization is leading to the demise of

the nation-state while sceptical theories believe that globalization is a myth. In contrast, tranformationalist globalization theories see these trends as creating an increasing connectivity between all nation-states and this connectivity is leading to new roles and positions for national governments. Globalization as a process is cyclical and involves economic and political life in a world structure of nation-states and multinational organizations.

A key interest in theories about globalization is the process of the transfer of social ideals through policy development. In this thesis, I posit that the Cambodian case demonstrates how international initiatives, promoted through multinational financial agencies, have infiltrated national education policies in post-conflict, developing countries. They are able to infiltrate because of the process of financial borrowing and lending which leads to changes in the economic and political sectors of societies which then directly affect education and other social institutions.

In sum, in this thesis I apply a transformationalist theoretical perspective that sees globalization as a continuing process that has economic, political, and cultural effects on all nations. These effects have transformed the traditional roles of national governments, especially those in developing countries, in setting their own domestic policies. Globalization has brought about the increased influence of multinational organizations and these organizations now play a large role in the setting of domestic policy in developing countries because of their financial influence. In the following chapter, I outline the methodology and methods used to uncover and analyze the data.

Chapter 4: Methodological Approach

The Cambodian educational story is both fascinating and tragic and presents an excellent study of post-conflict reconstruction since the education system was almost entirely wiped out by the 1980s. The central problem of this study is how international initiatives and organizations have influenced educational reconstruction in post-conflict Cambodia (1993-present). The primary methodologies used are case study and policy analysis.

This chapter will lay out the methodologies and methods that were used and the research issues that arose through the course of this study. First, I will discuss comparative and international education as a guiding framework. This will include an examination of the concept of educational transfer and comparison as a general research tool. In addition, I will present the use of vertical case study as an appropriate methodology for this study (Vavrus & Bartlett, 2006). Next, I will turn to policy analysis. In this section, I will lay out different interpretations of policy and various policy analysis approaches. I will then present a case for the use of Levin's stage model of policy analysis in this study. Following this, I present the specific method, content analysis, that was used during the course of this study. Finally, I lay out several issues that arose throughout the course of this study including the problems associated with conducting interviews in post-conflict countries.

4.1   Research Questions

The primary research questions in this thesis are:

- To what extent is globalization influencing education policy development in post-conflict Cambodia?

- How have multinational agencies influenced national education policy making in post-conflict Cambodia?

- Whose needs are addressed in the policy documents and directives?

- What have been the consequences of international influence on Cambodian national education policy?

4.2   *Comparative and International Education*

As was stated above, this thesis combines two principal methodological approaches. These are case study and policy analysis within a comparative and international education framework. Specifically, from comparative and international education this thesis focuses on the concept of educational transfer. The comparative aspect of this research comes in examining how certain internationally driven concepts, such as neo-liberalism, are taken up in educational policies.

4.2.1   *Comparison as method*

In traditional studies of education systems in comparative and international education, the comparative element has taken on the form of looking at bounded units within the context of the nation-state. The use of comparison as a method can be traced back to Durkheim's "The Rules of Sociological Method" (Schriewer, 2000). In this text, Durkheim held that the only way to go beyond just description at the macro-level, to get at sociological facts, was to compare (Durkheim, 1982).

In comparative research today, it is important to make the distinction between comparison that seeks only to provide proof of a relationship between contexts due only to their factual aspects and those comparisons which seek to establish connections between contexts based on larger macro-social relations (Schriewer, 2000). These comparisons move

beyond describing something such as scores on standardized tests to exploring the reasons behind the similar scores across settings. What intra-national relations do these specific contexts share that could cause the similarities in scores? Therefore, if comparison is to work as a research method, it is not enough to simply describe factual aspects of education systems but to move beyond and explore larger relations and social factors that impact on the specific contexts under study.

      As was noted briefly above, traditionally in comparative and international education the unit of comparison was the national education systems of specific nation-states (Bray, 2004). For example, Sir Michael Sadler (1907) and Isaac Kandel (1930) compared the education systems of England, Germany, and the United States. However, a great deal has changed in the political and economic structure of many nation-states. As was discussed in the previous chapter on globalization, the role of the nation-state in determining national policies is changing as is the notion of the nation-state as an independent element. Globalization has created an interconnected system with multinational organizations taking up a primary place in the world economic and political hierarchy. Therefore, these multinational organizations can become a source of comparison. In addition, regional comparison is also possible given the emergence of regional organizations such as the Association of Southeast Asian Nations (ASEAN). Comparativists are recognizing more and more the internal variation that exists in nation-states particularly in relation to education reforms such as privatization. All of these changes have led to valid new forms of comparison.

      These new forms of comparison have been elaborated upon by Manzon (2007) and Bray and Thomas (1995). Manzon (2007) states that comparison can move beyond geographical space to include units of analysis such as cultures, policies, curricula, and

systems (p. 85). This is significant for this thesis because the units of analysis are policies from various organizations and ministries of education. Manzon builds on the work of Bray and Thomas (1995) who listed three dimensions for comparative analysis. These were the geographic/locational, the nonlocational, and aspects of education and of society (Bray and Thomas, 1995). Bray and Thomas hold that comparative research crosses all three dimensions. In the case of this thesis, the geographical dimension is at the country level with Cambodian national education policy being the focus. The nonlocational dimension of this research would be, what Bray and Thomas label other groups, the comparison between various multinational organizations. Finally, the aspects of education and society under study in this thesis are educational financing and policy making. Therefore, taking Bray and Thomas' conception into account, the research undertaken for this thesis uses comparison as a method.

The study presented in this thesis is comparative in that it seeks to compare the policy directives from the multinational organizations with the Cambodian national education policy documents. This comparison is undertaken to explore the ways in which international objectives are taken up in national education policy.

4.2.2 *The concept of educational transfer*

Comparative and international education has gone through several transformations since its inception in the mid-18th century. However, during each transformation the process of educational transfer has been a primary concern of individuals involved in the field. Educational transfer is often understood as the transplantation of educational methods from one national system to another. Early studies of transfer were largely descriptive, rather than being critical (Kubow and Fossum, 2007). These descriptive accounts failed to recognize the local contexts that were affecting the education systems

in each nation. This thesis takes a more critical approach and employs the more current view put forward in the field of comparative and international education that educational transfer is not a simple process of exchange, but rather that local context plays a vital role in the manifestation of any transference into a new environment (Kubow and Fossum, 2007).

Educational transfer can occur on many levels (Beech, 2006). These levels range from basic classroom instructional changes to modifications in state education policy. In this thesis I examine transfer from a macro perspective as the focus is on a new state educational policy directive rather than transfer to the individual school or classroom. I also explore the degree to which education policy in Cambodia is being adopted with the local context in mind or whether educational policy in Cambodia is being influenced by the economic, political, and ideological desires of multinational financial organizations such as the World Bank, the Asian Development Bank and UNESCO.

Steiner-Khamsi is one comparative researcher who has introduced new ways to study educational transfer through policy analysis. Steiner-Khamsi proposed a framework that, "acknowledges the agency of both lending and borrowing countries" (2000, p. 156). She states that researchers have often limited their research to how educational methods and policies are transferred from the perspective of the lending nation or group. This is an error in that by looking only at how educational items are borrowed, that is by only looking at the elements that are transferred, researchers have a tendency to detach education from its political, economic, and cultural context (Steiner-Khamsi, 2000). This thesis seeks to situate education policy in Cambodia within the political, economic, and cultural context of the country. Steiner-Khamsi (2000) states:

In more ways than one, educators and policy analysts in borrowing countries have been portrayed as passive receivers of educational goods - models, reforms, policies - which they then gratefully implement in their own context. In response to that portrayal, I would like to make the point that their stories of resisting, modifying, and indigenizing imported educational goods have not been sufficiently told (p. 156).

Therefore, educational transfer has to be reconceptualized in this thesis. It can no longer be seen as a uni-directional force that is implemented and received in the same manner in all areas. Transfer is much more about relationships both within and between nations. In her work, Steiner-Khamsi is very interested in how policies are *implemented* within receiving countries. In contrast, as shall be seen in a following section, this thesis is interested how policy *originates* and is *adopted* within receiving countries. However, this thesis applies the theories in Steiner-Khamsi's work to the origin and adoption stages of policy analysis, because the resistance, modification, and indigenization she discusses can also be seen in the earlier stages of policy development.

In sum, as part of a comparative and international education approach, the concept of transfer is useful because it enables researchers to explore larger relationships between structural forces within and between the nation-state units. It is not simply a description of the similarities between education systems but rather an exploration of the causes and functions of the similarities and dissimilarities and how they are manifested within the specific economic, political, and cultural situation of any given context.

4.3   Case study methodology

Case study is viewed as a viable methodology within a comparative and international education framework. Generally a case study provides a specific example of a situation that allows "readers to understand ideas more clearly than simply by presenting them with abstract theories or principles" (Cohen et al., 2005, p. 181). In this case, Cambodian education reform is used as a specific example of the impact of

globalization and neo-liberalism. In addition, case studies examine the effects of large scale movements, such as neo-liberalism, in real contexts (Cohen et al., 2005). Case study researchers recognize the importance of context in any situation. This is particularly significant for this study which seeks to explore how multinational trends are taken up within a national context.

4.3.1 Vertical case study

Research methodology in comparative and international education allows for single country case studies. Arnove (2003) has stated that at its core the comparative method is principally a case-oriented strategy of research. This thesis is a case-oriented approach in that it is focused on national education policy in Cambodia, a single geographic location. In relation to case studies, Ragin (1987) has stated that the analysis must focus on the intersection of both national and international conditions. Vavrus and Bartlett (2006) describe the vertical case study as, "a means of comparing knowledge claims among actors with different social locations in an attempt to situate local action and interpretation within a broader cultural, historical, and political investigation" (p. 95). For the study presented in this thesis, the principal site of this comparative study is Cambodia. However, examining this site and its policies are not enough to gain a full understanding of how and why education reforms are taking place as international organizations are active participants in the policy making process in Cambodia. The study needs to be grounded in a principal site but also be focused on how historical trends, social structures, and international forces influence local processes at that site (Vavrus and Bartlett, 2006). In the research in this thesis, the policy making process is grounded in Cambodia but the understanding of the origins of those policies can not be separated from the historical trends and international forces that have and do impact the

whole process. The vertical case study provides a methodology that views levels of comparison beyond the level of nation-state to nation-state. Vertical case studies are focussed on the larger international forces, which aligns with the globalization theoretical orientation presented in this thesis. Vavrus and Bartlett (2006) hold that the vertical case study involves all levels of the policy making process, however this study will only focus on the national level and the international level.

As was discussed in an earlier section, Bray and Thomas (1995) suggest that comparative education research should span three levels. Both Bray and Thomas (1995) and Vavrus and Bartlett (2006) see the vertical case study as decentring the nation-state as the primary focus of comparative and international education to one of several important units of analysis in the field. Marginson and Mollis (2001) echo this when they state that although governance is still a national endeavour, increasingly nation-states are local agents of global forces. Therefore, a look at only national processes is incomplete given the interconnectedness of the current global system. Therefore, based on my research questions, the vertical case study is an ideal approach to use when studying a national policy that is highly influenced by international trends and forces. As shall be seen in the next section, it also complements the second methodological approach used in this thesis, policy analysis.

4.3.2   *Generalizability*

One of the critiques of case study methodology is the generalizability of cases. Stenhouse (1979) and Crossley and Vulliamy (1984) have addressed this critique by stating that in principle case studies are to be descriptive rather than experimental and as such they do not deal with specific laws that would allow for wide scale generalizing and replicability. However, this does not mean that no level of generalizability is possible

when conducting and examining case studies. I contend that what makes the Cambodian case generalizable is that there is a common component that is shared by most developing post-conflict countries, such as Cote d'Ivoire, Democratic Republic of Congo, Sri Lanka, and East Timor and that is the presence of multinational financial organizations. In each of these countries, these organizations are involved in the funding of education. The ideology and practices of these multinational organizations are consistent across national boundaries. This can be seen in the works of researchers such as Rideout (2000) on Sub-Saharan Africa, Woodward (1995) on the Balkans and Dobbins et al. (2009) on Iraq to name a few. Therefore, Cambodia may be an individual case but the research demonstrates that the processes occurring in Cambodia are also occurring in other developing post-conflict nations around the world because of the presence of the multinational organizations.

4.4   Policy Analysis

The following section provides an outline of the policy analysis methodology used in this thesis. First, a discussion of the working interpretations of policy will be presented. Next, an outline of various policy analysis approaches will be given. This will be followed by a general discussion of a stage model of policy analysis, specifically the origins and adoption stages, which are the first two stages of policy making.

4.4.1   What is policy?

One of the first things to make clear before moving onto a discussion of the various policy analysis methodologies is how this thesis uses the term "policy". There are different interpretations in the literature about what constitutes a policy. One of the more important debates related to this question is when does a trend or initiative actually become a policy. One pair of researchers, Berkhout and Wielemans (1999), feel that there

are hidden dimensions to policy that are often overlooked at the expense of government action. There are all kinds of questions related to power that need to be addressed in any interpretation of policy. It is discouraging to note the conclusion of Berkhout and Wielemans (1999) that policy is really only a symbolic performance of popular values and not a provider of solutions or a change maker. Hence, although while Berkhout and Wielemans are correct in that there are hidden dimensions to a policy, their position that policy is only symbolic is in contrast to the position held in this thesis which is that policy has very concrete effects on individuals and systems.

A preferable interpretation is put forth by Pal (2006). He feels that policy has enjoyed a resurgence in the public arena and this has been matched by an increasing international interest in developing policy capacity. Interestingly, Pal calls it "public policy" rather than just policy. This is a contrast to other authors, such as Berkhout and Wielemans, who only ever refer to policy. The use of the adjective "public" says a lot about the way Pal views the ownership of policy. Pal (2006) defines public policy as, "a course of action or inaction chosen by public authorities to address a given problem or interrelated set of problems" (p. 2). It is this interpretation that best corresponds to the understanding of policy used in this thesis.

One important element of Pal's definition is that he does not make a separation between policy makers and policy receivers. Bowe et al. (1992) also deride the trend to separate policy makers and policy receivers. People expect something from policy makers and vice versa and when those expectations are not met there are political and/or social consequences. Therefore, a policy will impact multiple groups in society, although these effects may be different from group to group. This is particularly important when looking at the influence of multinational groups on national education policy in a post-conflict country such as Cambodia. For this

thesis, one of the elements I am exploring is who exactly are the policy makers and receivers. Is the Cambodian national government the policy maker and its population the policy receiver or are the multinational financial organizations the policy makers with the conditional loans? Therefore, the distinction between policy receivers and policy makers is an important distinction to think through in the definition of terms in this thesis.

When a policy is created, there are three elements that impact its manifestation into reality according to Pal (2006). These are: problem definition (the policy makers define a problem or set of problems they are seeking to address through the creation of the text); policy goals (what the policy makers are hoping to achieve with this policy); and policy instruments (what mechanisms are in place to aid in implementing the policy). These elements are incorporated into the research design for this thesis.

Like Pal, Ball (1993) has stated that often times researchers do not clearly identify what they understand policy to be in their research. He perceives policy as two major characterizations. These are policy as text and discourse. Ball suggests that policy is both text and discourse and researchers need to be aware of both in their understanding of policy. Policy as text holds that policies are representations which are encoded and decoded in complex ways. Policy is not stable. It is always changing depending on who is reading the text and within what context. This is a similar idea to Steiner-Khamsi's (2006) focus on how policies are taken up on the ground and interpreted differently by different individuals in different contexts. The text, the reader, and the context all have histories and how those histories meld is very unpredictable. As a result, a researcher has to be aware of the historical, social, and cultural environments into which policy is introduced.

On the other hand, a policy is also a discourse and, as shall be discussed below, it is this view of policy that is most relevant to this thesis. This is based on the work of Foucault (1977) and it holds that policies and policy makers exercise power through a production of what they deem to be truth and knowledge. People take up social positions constructed for them within policies. Ball's work is important because it forces a researcher to understand that policy is much more than the physical document. To get a true understanding of policy, a researcher must see it as a piece of social history with multiple layers of development and understanding. A policy analysis must try to understand as many of these levels as possible but to also understand that any reading of that policy will be very much rooted in the researcher's own social and cultural positioning. In trying to get at these multiple layers, many researchers employ varying policy analysis methodologies. An examination of several of these methodologies follows in the next section in order to justify the approach used in this thesis.

4.4.2   *Policy analysis conceptualizations and forms*

The previous section laid out the interpretation of policy to be used in this thesis. This section seeks to further this by clarifying which policy methodology will be used in relation to the policy analysis. There are many conceptualizations in the literature around what constitutes an appropriate form of policy analysis. For example, Downey (1988) feels that any policy analysis should have the purpose of generating information to inform the policy making process. Also, along this line, Gallagher (1992) feels that policy analysis should be practical in that it must help guide action. These types of ideas assume an interest in policy research at the level of policy makers. This can be problematic especially if studying a policy that was created by groups from multiple organizations and

institutions. For example, researchers could pass their findings onto a national

government in a developing nation. That government may express an interest in using

those findings to guide their future actions. However, if these governments receive

funding from organizations such as the World Bank their own actions are very restricted

by the conditions attached to the loans. There is no guarantee that the World Bank would

share a similar interest in a researcher's findings. Therefore, although it would be ideal if

all policy analysis could help to guide future action and have a practical purpose for

informing policy making, this is not always the case in developing countries where the

policy making process is especially complex because of the reliance on international aid.

In this thesis policy analysis is viewed as an intellectual activity that explores the

issues and actions that inform the policy making process. Pal (1987) says that policy

analysis is about seeing patterns and connections such as historical and international

comparisons. This conceptualization fits into the use of a comparative approach as well.

Williams (1982) provides one of the clearest rationales for policy analysis. He states that

policy analysis is, "a means of synthesizing information including research results to

produce a format for policy decisions (the layout of alternative choices) and of

determining future needs for policy-relevant information" (p. ix). This conceptualization

is useful in that it recognizes that policy analysis should have a practical purpose but that

purpose should be about producing a format and laying out a variety of alternative

choices rather than dictating the future direction of policy to policy makers.

4.4.3   Levin's stage model of policy analysis

This thesis is loosely based on the conceptual framework put forth by Levin

(2001). Levin's (2001) proposed framework involves a stage model of policy analysis

because as he states, all the policy studies on education reform he examined used a form

of stage theory either explicitly or implicitly. The proposed stages are: origins, adoption, implementation, and outcomes. With reference to the research questions in this study, the first two stages of policy analysis are a particularly useful an analytical tool when analyzing the Cambodian national education policies and their relationship to the multinational documents. The origins stage involves looking at where the ideas for the policy came from, specifically, focusing on political events, problem recognition, and policy proposals and how these three interact. Adoption then is the process of moving from a policy proposal to an approved piece of legislation, regulation, or policy (Levin, 2001). Here several elements come together including the agendas of various interest groups. The questions in this thesis really involve the origins and adoption of the Cambodian national education policies.

It is through a focus on the origins and adoptions stages where Ball's understanding of policy as text and discourse can be useful. In these stages, policies and policy makers exercise power through a production of truth and knowledge, particularly the truth about what is the best direction for education and what is "valuable" educational knowledge. Often times the knowledge deemed most appropriate comes from international sources.

Levin's model is not without its problems. One particular problem is that the stages are not as easily distinguishable in reality and it is sometimes difficult to make the break between origin and adoption. However, overall the stages presented by Levin provide an accessible way to break down the complexity that surrounds the creation of many education policies.

To further examine the policies under study in this thesis, several methods were used. These will be discussed in the following section.

4.5   *Research Methods*

Before discussing the research methods used, I would like to once again lay out the primary research questions used in this thesis. They are:

- To what extent is globalization influencing education policy development in post-conflict Cambodia?

- How have multinational agencies influenced national education policy making in post-conflict Cambodia?

- Whose needs are addressed in the policy documents and directives?

- What have been the consequences of international influence on Cambodian national education policy?

This section will move beyond the specific methodologies used in this thesis to exploring the research methods that were utilized, including laying out the sources of data that were used.

4.5.1   *Sources of data*

Several primary sources of data were used in this thesis to conduct a content analysis. These documents came from the various multinational organizations, the Royal Government of Cambodia, and the Cambodian Ministry of Education, Youth, and Sport.

The sources of data used in this project were primarily qualitative in nature. These included several Cambodian education policies, policy directives on Cambodia from the major multinational organizations, such as the Asian Development Bank, UNESCO, and the World Bank, and some secondary literature on the background of Cambodian education. In terms of Cambodian education policy, the key documents that were examined included: the National Education for All goals (MoEYS, 2003); the 3rd Education Strategic Plan (ESP) 2006-2010 (MoEYS, 2005a); the Education Sector

Support Program (ESSP) 2006-2010 (MoEYS, 2005b); the Law on Education (RGoC, 2007); Policy of Non-Formal Education (RGoC, 2002); Policy for Child-Friendly Schools (MoEYS, 2007); and the Policy for Curriculum Development 2005-2009 (MoEYS, 2004).

For the multinational organizations, there are many documents that relate to the education sector in Cambodia. The sources of data from the multinational financial organizations were selected from the World Bank, International Monetary Fund (IMF), and the Asian Development Bank (ADB). These three organizations were selected because they are the three largest sources of financial aid for the education sector in Cambodia. In addition, the Education for All goals from UNESCO were also examined and included as a source of data as they are directly referenced in the education policies from both the Cambodian government and the multinational organizations. Several of the multinational documents examined in this thesis became key sources of data. From the World Bank the following sources of data were used: Country Assistance Strategy 2005-2008 (CAS) (World Bank, 2005b); Fast Track Initiative Catalytic Fund Project (World Bank, 2008); and Education Sector Support Project (WB ESSP) (World Bank, 2005a). The IMF laid out multiple initiatives concerning Cambodian education, the most significant being the Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP) (IMF, 2006). In terms of the ADB, there were several publications and policies laid out for the direction of educational funding in Cambodia. These included: the Second Education Sector Development Program (ESDP II) (ADB, 2004a), the Country Strategy Program (2004b), and the Country Operations Business Plans (COBP) (ADB, 2008). These documents were subsequently analyzed using a method of coding and content analysis.

Table 1: The Cambodian National Education Policies and Laws

Organization	Policy Directive	Description
Royal Government of Cambodia (RGoC)	Law on Education (RGoC, 2007)	- officially implemented in November 2007 - holistic vision of education
	Policy of Non-Formal Education (RGoC, 2002)	- implemented in 2002 - states that informal education is as important as formal
Ministry of Education, Youth and Sport (MoEYS)	3rd Education Strategic Plan (3rd ESP) (MoEYS, 2005a)	- set to run from 2006-2010 - MoEYS lays out its overall vision for education reform in this document
	National Education for All goals (MoEYS, 2003)	- created in 2003 - universal primary education by 2015 - 6 domestic dimensions
	Education Sector Support Program (ESSP) (MoEYS, 2005b)	- set to run alongside the 3rd ESP from 2006-2010 - outlines how objectives will be put in place
	Policy for Child-Friendly Schools (MoEYS, 2007)	- adopted in 2007 - promotes child-friendly schools
	Policy for Curriculum Development (MoEYS, 2004)	- set to run from 2005-2009 - lays out the national curriculum

Table 2: Policy Directives from the Multinational Organizations

Organization	Policy Directive	Description
International Monetary Fund (IMF)	Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP) (IMF, 2009)	- A plan to reduce poverty, education is part of that plan - Pre-condition for access to IMF and World Bank funds
United Nations (UNICEF, UNESCO)	Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) (UNESCO, 2004)	- Includes universal primary education for all by 2015
World Bank (WB)	Education Sector Support Project (ESSP) (WB, 2005a)	- Implemented in 2005 and set to run 5 years - Purpose was to set out plan of direction for education sector
	Country Assistance Strategy (CAS) (WB, 2005b)	- Ran from 2005-2008 - Lays out WB operations and development agenda in a specific country. - Used in conjunction with PRSP
	Fast Track Initiative (FTI) (WB, 2008)	- Implemented in 2008 - Used to increase scholarship program for ethnic minorities
Asian Development Bank (ADB)	2nd Education Sector Development Program (ESDPII) (ADB, 2004a)	- Ran from 2005-2008 - Purpose is to reduce poverty through the development of demand-driven skills education
	Country Operations Business Plan (COBP) (ADB, 2008)	- created in conjunction with the country strategy and program - lists the education sector as a key target for the economic and business development

4.5.2   Issues with data sources

One of the problems associated with using policy documents and directives as the primary source of data is that the documents and directives do not give an indication of motive or process. For example, they give no indication of the length of time that the documents took to write or who was all involved in the process. The documents and directives indicate the official signatures but do not indicate everyone who was at the table. As such, it is impossible to get at the complexities of the process of policy creation just by examining the final products of that process. Therefore, given these constraints, there will be elements such as individual and organizational motivation that will be missing in the analysis in this thesis.

4.5.3   Content analysis and coding

In breaking down the data, a content analysis of the policy documents was very helpful. In content analysis, the main goal is to "take a verbal, non-quantitative document and transform it into quantitative data" (Cohen, Manion and Morrison, 2005, p. 164). Content analysis is a description of content of a policy (Pal, 1987). It seeks to lay out the policy's goals, problem definition and intentions by looking at language content alone (Delaney, 2002). In addition, an historical analysis of policy documents was also useful. An historical analysis assumes that current policies are a product of their historical development and as such can only be understood by examining their historical evolution (Delaney, 2002). This is particularly the case in relation to the Cambodian national education policy documents.

When conducting a content analysis, one of the first steps is to come up with codes. In regards to the coding process, Cohen et al. (2005) state, "Approaches to content analysis are careful to identify appropriate categories and units of analysis, both of which will reflect the nature of the document being analyzed and the purpose of

research" (p. 164). The creation of the codes in this thesis was done through an iterative process whereby I read the documents and looked for common words, phrases, and ideas. Then I proceeded to develop codes and continued the process in a back and forth between the developing codes and the documents. This process allowed the codes to emerge from the data sources rather than being imposed on the documents.

The purpose of the content analysis in this thesis was to look for patterns in content between the policy directives of the multinational financial agencies and the most recent policies from the Ministry of Education, Youth and Sport, such as the final draft of the 3rd Educational Strategic Plan, to help determine how much international influence impacted the Cambodian educational policy. Content analysis aids in breaking down the text of the policy into appropriate and manageable units of analysis, codes, to aid in the understanding of the role multinational financial agencies have played in the origin and adoption of Cambodian national education policy and how much, or if any, direct Cambodian concerns have been addressed.

The process of coding, described above, began after the collection of the documents to be used in the thesis. Bogdan and Biklen (1998) wrote about several families of codes and these were quite useful when developing codes. As a result, I will lay out these coding categories before discussing the ones I developed. First, Bogdan and Biklen identified a category of "setting/context" codes. These types of codes are used to identify the most general information on the setting, topic, or subjects in a policy or document under analysis. A second category of coding that Bogdan and Biklen identified and I used was the "perspectives held by subjects" grouping. These types of codes look for data that indicates a subject's orientation toward a particular way of perceiving a situation. According to Bogdan and Biklen, these include shared rules and norms and

general points of view. For this thesis, this is very important in that I am interested in

discovering if there are shared rules and points of view between the Ministry of

Education, Youth, and Sport in Cambodia and the multinational financial agencies.

A third category of coding parameters used in this thesis are "process" codes.

These codes identify content that indicates a sequence of events, in this case the creation

and adoption of a national education policy. Finally, the last category of codes that I

utilized was "strategy" codes, which identify content that indicate a person, organization,

or group's tactics, methods, techniques, manoeuvres, ploys, or other conscious ways they

accomplish certain things (Bogdan and Biklen, 1998).

Once I had settled on the type of coding categories, I set about creating my own

codes within the allotted categories. I developed these codes on the basis of the

individual research questions. In terms of my primary research question, "to what extent

is globalization influencing education policy development in post-conflict Cambodia", I

laid out three categories (see Table 1).

Table 3: Coding for research question 1

Setting/Context	Perspectives held by subjects	Process Codes
• amount of funding • donor names • loan names • receiver of loans • sources of funds	• purpose of education (purpose statements, expansion, connection to economy, development) • goal statements and objectives (directives, neo-liberal agenda, cultural, political, economic objectives) • direction of education loans (supplies, technology, language training, teacher training, expansion of facilities, privatization)	• dates • timelines • implementation • results

Each of these codes was created to help answer the question listed above.

In relation to my second research question, "how have multinational agencies influenced national education policy making in post-conflict Cambodia?" I used codes in the "setting/context", "perspectives held by subjects" and "strategy" categories.

Table 4: Coding for Research Question 2

Setting/Context	Perspectives held by subjects	Strategy Codes
• amount of funding • donor names • loan names • receiver of loans • sources of funds • amount of education and international funding in relation to Cambodian economy	• purposes of education • goal statements • purposes of loans vs. purposes of policy	• restrictions of loans • conditions of loans

These codes relate primarily to the actions of the multinational financial organizations which is the main focus of question #2.

In relation to the third research question in this thesis, "whose needs are addressed in the policy documents and directives?" I focused on the "strategy" coding category. The main focus for this question involved looking at the restrictions attached to the loans; conditions of the loans; and needs. Has the policy been created to solely meet the needs of the lending agencies or has the Cambodian government been able to address some of their own needs. What type of education reform was conducted in Cambodia?

For the fourth research question in this thesis, "what have been the consequences of international influence on Cambodian national education policy?", I focused on the coding categories of "perspectives held by subjects". In terms of the codes for thi

Table 5: Coding for research question 3

Strategy Coding		
Restrictions attached to loans	Conditions of loans	Needs
- limits - accessibility of funds	- privatization (school ownership and school location) - accountability - standard testing - teacher training	- language of instruction - training programs - curriculum

question, I divided them further into the purposes of policy and purpose of loans (see

table 6 below). The purpose of the two sub-categories was to allow for the comparison of

findings between the two categories to see if the purposes of the loans matched to the

purpose of the national policies, therefore addressing the above question.

These codes were created after reading through several documents from financial

agencies and Cambodian ministries about what they perceived to be the needs of the

Cambodian education system and population. I used these statements as the basis of

formulating my codes for this question.

Table 6: Coding for research question 4

Perspectives held by subjects	
Purposes of Policy	Purposes of Loans
- expansion of elementary education (new programs, standardized testing, language, increased enrolment, literacy, expansion in rural areas) - expansion of secondary and tertiary education (accessibility of degrees, increased accessibility, who is enrolled, ownership of institutions, language, connection to economy, instructors)	- what is money used for (expansion, new institutions, teacher training and salary, technology, specific programs) - rises in statistical awareness (specific targets for key areas, literacy, numeracy, enrolment) - standardization (ties to international programs and testing, language uses, expansion of international education partners)

The use of coding allowed me to break a vast amount of data into categories that were accessible and directly related to my research questions. This was the primary method that I used since, as was discussed above, my primary sources of data were documents. Therefore, I felt a content analysis was the most ideal way to work with my data. However, in addition to the content analysis, the original plan was to also get data from interviews, but as shall be discussed in the following section, this was not feasible at the research site.

4.5.4 Issues of interviewing

In addition to the content analysis, the original plans for this study included conducting interviews with individuals from the Cambodian Ministry of Education, Youth, and Sport and the World Bank in Cambodia. However, due to several unforeseen circumstances, these interviews were never able to take place. One such incident was due to the nature of conducting research in a post-conflict, developing country. Although Cambodia has been relatively peaceful since the early 1990s, disputes still exist in the region. A recent flare-up occurred between Cambodia and Thailand in October 2008. During this time, the Cambodian government declared a state of war between the two nations after the Thai military refused to leave a disputed ancient temple. The Cambodian military was mobilized and soldiers were killed along the border. As a result of the political situation, the interviews I had scheduled during that time were cancelled. Due to the distance and technological difficulties that exist between Canada and Cambodia, it was not possible to reschedule the direct interviews. Instead, the documents became the primary sources of data.

4.5.5 Other research issues in post-conflict countries

In any research project there are issues and limitations that arise. For this thesis research, two primary issues arose. Of particular significance were the problems associated with doing research in a post-conflict country as an outsider. This issue has been addressed extensively in the research literature. Doing research in a post-conflict country can be quite problematic given the social and political situation in many of these countries. It can be especially problematic for researchers who are coming from a privileged background. Doing research in Cambodia raises some particular issues that need to be addressed briefly.

Doing research in a country other than one's own presents some ethical questions. A limitation of this study may be researcher background. According to research literature, policy analysis can fall into the category of interpretative research, as it is research based on the interpretations of the researcher and participants (Terhart, 1985; Smetherham, 1978). It is almost guaranteed that the researcher's interpretations will be different from those of native Cambodians because of the researcher's personal knowledge of multinational organizations and position as a white, middle-class Canadian. One critique of interpretative research is that it often neglects "the power of external – structural – forces to shape behaviour and events" (Cohen et al., 2005, p. 27). According to Ball (1993), Berkhout & Wielemans (1999), and Levin (2001), policy making is a very complex, often messy, process. These researchers show how it is seldom linear and there are multiple parties and individuals who have a role and interest in the creation and adoption of a policy, particularly an education policy. Identifying all the people and groups who had a part in the education policy making process in Cambodia is very difficult and it was impossible for me to contact everyone who had a part in the process. Therefore, these limitations had to be set, and those limitations were in direct relation to

the research questions and personal interpretations.

As an outsider from the West, the power differential is also something a researcher has to be acutely aware of while doing research in Cambodia, a developing country. These issues have also been addressed in the literature. Specifically, there has been a great deal written about the methodological challenges of differential power relations in research. Imperialist research has been of great concern to researchers such as Edward Said and Eric Wolf. In regards to relationships between researcher and researched, Said concluded that "there is no vantage *outside* the actuality of relationships between cultures, between unequal imperial and nonimperial powers, between different Others, a vantage that might allow one the epistemological privilege of somehow judging, evaluating, and interpreting free of the encumbering interests, emotions, and engagements of the ongoing relationships themselves" (1989, p. 216). In his discussion of the challenges of working in a developing country, Wolf stated that, "Your selection of what goes on and of what is said will always be non-random; and from the non-random sample you must draw diagnostic, second-order conclusions about which behavior and discourse are unique, irregular, or idiosyncratic and which are recurrent, patterned, and general" (2001, p. 52). He goes on to say that, "Nor can your account be one that some locals might have written. It is necessarily selective, and the selectivity has to do with the problems to which your writing is addressed" (2001, p. 54). The things written about in this thesis will be in direct relation to the questions asked and these questions relate to academic interests and these interests, which are of concern to me, may or may not be of concern to Cambodian educators and policy makers.

4.6   *Conclusions*

This chapter has laid out the methodological approaches used in this thesis. The study is a

policy analysis situated within the framework of comparative and international education.

Throughout the course of the research, several key documents were identified as the primary texts

influencing Cambodian national education policy. The texts came primarily from the Ministry of

Education, Youth, and Sport. However, an examination of Cambodian national education policy

could not be complete without exploring the multinational organizations policy directives for the

sector due to their financial influence on policy making. Therefore, the key sources of data for

this project included both Cambodian state documents and documents from the major

multinational organizations. Levin's stage model was used to trace the origins and adoption of

Cambodian national education policy. The examination of Cambodian national education policy

also fits into the globalization perspective that was presented in the previous chapter. It has

elements of and affects the economic, political, cultural sectors of Cambodian society.

In sum, this thesis combines two methodologies. These are case study and policy

analysis grounded in a comparative and international education framework. Levin's stage model

is an appropriate means of breaking down the sources of data used in this project. Furthermore, a

method of content analysis was used to categorize the content of the various policies under study.

This was all done with the understanding of the limitations of conducting research on post-

conflict developing countries from a privileged researcher background. These methodologies and

methods allow for an in-depth examination of international influence on education reform in

Cambodia.

Chapter 5: Literature Review

Cambodia is a very complex place with a rich history. The recent history has been characterized by two major trends: a post-conflict transitional period and the influx of international aid and influence. This chapter will review the literature surrounding these trends in greater detail and give a brief summary of the social, political, and educational conditions in Cambodia since the turn of the 20th century.

To begin, I will discuss the post-conflict nature of Cambodia. The first section will address issues such as what is meant by post-conflict and how does being in a state of post-conflict affect the rebuilding of government and social institutions. Next, a review of the literature on the history and development of multinational organizations will follow. The examination of the literature surrounding multinational influence will help to clarify how these organizations operate in developing countries in a post-conflict situation. Finally, a review of literature on educational reconstruction in post-conflict countries will complete the chapter.

5.1 *Post-conflict reconstruction – Issues for societies and research*

The end of a conflict is an extremely trying and complicated time for all of those involved. Transitioning from chaos to calm is not an easy undertaking. This is particularly the case in a country like Cambodia that went from being a colony into a brief period of tranquility to a devastating civil war and occupation by a neighbouring regime. Over a relatively short period of time, the country went from one disruption, one form of government, to another with little consistency. Perhaps the only consistencies were the disruption and upheaval the country experienced. Therefore, at the end of the last formal conflict (1991), establishing some form of stable government and working social

institutions was of the utmost importance. Yet accomplishing this was a major challenge

for all involved in the on-going process, and it continues to be a major challenge in

Cambodia today, as in many post-conflict societies. Much of the research literature on

post-conflict societies focuses on the challenges of social and educational reconstruction

(Baker & LeTendre, 2005; Daun, 2007, Degu, 2005; Collier & Hoeffler, 2004).

Specifically, the literature on Cambodia demonstrates that this country remains a

developing country in the rebuilding phase (Ayres, 2000; Chandler, 1994; Matin, 1994).

All groups involved are looking at and trying to solidify their roles in this new era, not

least of which is the Cambodian government itself. The following section will explore

the general literature on the place and role of governments in post-conflict societies.

5.1.1   Place and role of governments in post-conflict societies

According to A.A. Goldsmith (2007) and Addison et al. (2005), the end of a

conflict often entails the implementation of an internationally funded program of reform

and reconstruction. This influx of international aid leads to the emergence of a

multinational presence in the political and economic structures of the rebuilding society.

Given this situation, researchers must ask, what type of role and position is the national

government expected, or allowed, to take?

First of all, Junne and Verkoren (2005) points out that it is important to remember

that just because a peace agreement is signed by the various warring factions in a country,

tensions and fighting seldom end over night. In 44% of all post-conflict situations, war

resumes in the first five years (Junne and Verkoren, 2005). Therefore, in the majority of

the post-conflict literature, the term post-conflict refers to the period directly after the end

of the last major hostilities and rebuilding phase that follows (Brinkerhoff, 2007;

O'Halloran, 2005; Zoomers, 2007). In the case of Cambodia, this is the period directly

after the withdrawal of the Vietnamese in 1989, through the transition government (1991-1993) and the re-establishment of the democratically elected governments (1993 onward). Yet, despite the fact that these years are labelled post-conflict, conflict is still very much a part of life in such settings. For instance, Cambodia and its neighbours, Thailand and Vietnam, continue disputes today over claims to land and sacred temples. The latest incident occurred in October of 2008 when Cambodia and Thailand were involved in an armed confrontation over a disputed temple. To those outsiders working in Cambodia, incidents like this justify their continued presence in the country as they underline the still shaky post-conflict nature of the country.

At the end of a conflict, or series of conflicts in Cambodia's case, there are several major tasks to be worked on. According to Plunkett (2005), these include: reconstructing infrastructure, re-establishing the rule of law, rebuilding social institutions, and re-establishing the apparatus of the state. All of these are done in a social environment of mistrust and fear, which often starts with the national government. Plunkett (2005) points out that one of the first tasks any post-conflict government must do is to try and get the support of the population. According to the literature, several key factors influence whether a post-conflict government can get that support. These include how successfully they are able to demobilize and reintegrate combatants and depoliticize structures and institutions (Verkoren, 2005; Plunkett 2005; Schultz & Merrill, 2007). These are huge tasks for governments in post-conflict situations, under a mountain of internal and external pressures.

In the case of Cambodia, the government was never truly able to demobilize and reintegrate former members of the Khmer Rouge regime. Ayers (2000), Verkoren (2005) and Zimmer et al. (2006) point out how many members fled to areas near the Thai border

and opened up illicit trade with Thailand. The ability of the Khmer Rouge to flee from justice was aided by the failure of a World Bank funded demobilization program that was to re-integrate 30,000 former soldiers (Bretton Woods Project, 2003). As a result even today, tensions run high along the Thai-Cambodia border. Many high ranking former Khmer Rouge members were never brought to justice and continue to live in remote areas of the country, creating fear among many Cambodians and making their government appear weak.

The literature on post-conflict rebuilding goes on to point out that, beyond a post-conflict government's complex relations with the general population, are the complexities associated with its relationship to multinational organizations (Hatcher, 2007; Ritzen, 2005). Researchers such as Hatcher (2007) demonstrate how the balancing of all of these issues is very difficult and it is little wonder that governments in post-conflict countries fail and change regularly. For example, following the first general election in 1993 in Cambodia, there was little political progress. After a follow-up election in 1997, a coup was carried out amid accusations of fraud, bribery, and corruption. The post-conflict governments have all failed to garner wide spread support and gain legitimacy. It is not surprising then that multinational influence remains strong in the country and is prevalent in attempts to rebuild social institutions (Zimmer et al., 2006; Pellini, 2007; Torres, 2003; Tan, 2007; Sisowath, 2006). In fact, Lefrancois (2004) reports that the World Bank now lends over a fifth of its total current financial programs to post-conflict situations.

5.1.2   The rebuilding of social institutions in post-conflict countries

The rebuilding of social institutions is very important if a post-conflict society is going to successfully avoid slipping back into a state of war and conflict. Research from Herrero (2005), Brinkerhoff (2007), and Emmerij (2007) holds that ensuring local

participation in state institutions once they are operating is particularly important.

Herrero (2005) states that this process is the case because, "it could be argued that as

pieces of institutional setting can be replicated from other places – an electoral system,

for instance – the same could apply to the overall political system - in effect creating a

model democratic system" (p. 47). However, in reality this "model system" could never

work without local support and participation. This point is very important within the

context of globalization and multinational influence in developing countries. The

literature points out that the conditions that come attached to development loans after

conflict aim to create social institutions in developing countries that replicate what is

found in the West (McIntyre, 2007; Toussaint, 2008). Yet development history has

shown that the implementation without adaptation has led to many unsuccessful attempts

at institutional reconstruction. Examples of this include the UN's failed mission in

Rwanda and the 1995 massacre in Srebrenica in Bosnia-Herzegovina (Plunkett, 2005).

Both were examples of a multinational organization trying to implement a rule of law

(justice system) based on Western ideals rather than local realities. These two examples,

found within the post-conflict/multinational literature, demonstrate the likelihood of

failure when institutions are established in unstable environments without consideration

of local context (O'Halloran, 2005; Bahcheli & Noel, 2005). Education and research are

other sectors where the rate of successful rebuilding depends on local acceptance and

participation (Buckland, 2004). Gaining this acceptance is a particular challenge in post-

conflict societies.

5.2   *Multinational Organizations*

Before examining the presence and extent of multinational involvement in

Cambodia, I will provide some background on the general development, structure, and

purpose of multinational organizations in order to clarify the understanding of
multinational organizations in this study and in the wider literature on the topic.

5.2.1   The emergence of multinational organizations and regionalism

The emergence of multinational financial organizations can be traced to the mid-
1940s. In July of 1944, representatives from 44 countries gathered together in Bretton
Woods, New Hampshire (Toussaint, 2008). The purpose of the conference was to discuss
the rebuilding and development process that would have to occur at the end of World War
II. What came out of this meeting was the founding of the modern international
economic system (Rugman and Doh, 2008; Pauly, 1996). The Bretton Woods conference
resulted in the creation of the International Monetary Fund (IMF), the International Bank
for Reconstruction and Development (the World Bank), and the General Agreement on
Tariffs and Trade (GATT), which was succeeded by the World Trade Organization
(WTO) in 1995. The conference ushered in the era of multinational organizations, which
would be used to monitor and deal with the political, economic, and social security of
member states.

The hierarchy of states within and outside of these new multinational
organizations became clear very early and was laid out quite clearly by vote
representation at the Bretton Woods conference. Toussaint (2008) reports that there was
representation from 44 countries; however, each country did not receive an equal number
of votes. The United States and Great Britain had almost 50% of available votes alone.
Because of their wartime connection with the allies, Russia had the third highest
percentage of votes. Therefore, representation from other areas of the world was severely
lacking. As Toussaint (2008) points out, all African nations combined only had 2.34% of
the votes and all Asian nations combined had 11.66% of the votes. Cambodia, like many

other developing countries, was not invited to participate in the conference. Therefore, from the beginning, the power in the multinational organizations would rest with the wealthiest nations in the West.

According to the research, recently there has been another shift in the proliferation of multinational organizations around the world (Bowles & MacLean, 1996; Poon, 2001; Bowles, 2002). There has been a spread of regional alliances since 1960s. According to Urata (1998), most of these regional organizations were formed in response to an increased desire for easier trade within specific regions. The starting of the regionalization trend can be traced back to the West once again with the formation of the European Community in 1967 and North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA) in 1994 (Urata, 1998). However, the concept of regionalization has spread out beyond the West to reach the Far East (Bowles, 2002). In Asia, three major regional organizations are dominant: the Asia-Pacific Economic Co-operation (APEC), Association of South-East Asian Nations (ASEAN), and Asian Development Bank (ADB). These organizations seek to improve trade with, investment in, and development for member nations in the area. Fukasaku and Urata (1998) point out that APEC initiatives include creating freer and open trade and investment in the region by 2010 for developed members and 2020 for developing members. This initiative is interesting in that it aims for integration in stages. What is key about the Asian region is that the three major regional organizations work together to promote greater economic integration as the key to the development of poorer countries in the region (Bowles and MacLean, 1996; Poon, 2001). According to Fukasaku and Urata (1998), APEC's initatives are carried out through funding from the ADB. This is quite significant as the emergence of these regional organizations has added a new layer to the development funding process.

Traditionally, funding for development has come from Western dominated institutions such as the World Bank and IMF. Certainly, much funding still comes from these organizations (World Bank, 2005a; IMF, 2006). However, new regional funding sources have come available, particularly in Asia (ADB, 2004a). This, then, adds new complexities to the situation facing developing nations as they now must deal with regional and international demands and these are often contradictory.

Given the fact that modern multinational organizations emerged toward the end of World War II, it is not surprising that they have been closely tied to the process of development. According to the research by Rugman and Doh (2008) and Toussaint (2008), the World Bank was originally created to help speed up post-war reconstruction in Europe, a process which in turn it was thought, would aid political stability and foster peace. However, the World Bank also had a secondary mandate to promote the economic growth of many colonial or former colonial nations. The mandate fell under the term "development", a highly contested term (Toussaint, 2008).

In addition, the IMF also played a key role in the post-war economic and political environment. Its mandate was to "help stabilize economic relations among countries and to provide support for countries experiencing balance-of-payments problems or other economic pressures" (Rugman and Doh, 2008). On the surface these key multinational organizations were supposed to exist as purely economic entities. However, as the world emerged from the post-war, post-Cold War eras, the scope of the organizations changed. Researchers like Tehranian (2002) and Gill (2002) report that globalization blurs the lines between economics, politics, and culture and increasingly, multinational organizations find themselves engaged in all of these areas.

Rugman and Doh (2008) demonstrate that this is particularly the case in the area of development. As was just discussed, the World Bank, International Monetary Fund, and United Nations were created to deal with the economic, political, and social rebuilding of Europe. Yet, as the world recovered from World War II, these organizations, and others that had emerged in the post-war era, looked for new purpose. The purpose was found in the development of the world's poorer countries. Specifically, the goal of alleviating poverty became a key focus (Newell, Rai, and Scott, 2002; World Bank, 2005a; IMF, 2006; ADB, 2004a). This is important because the causes and consequences of poverty go beyond just economics. Hatcher (2007) and Oxfam (2002) find that the focus on poverty can justify multinational incursions into the public sector, including health and education in developing nations.

Multinational organizations provide the funding for these domestic institutions as they are seen as keys to raising the standard of living. For example, extending primary education to all children is a target of the United Nations (UNICEF, 2005). The justification for this goal is that if people are better educated they will be better able to provide for their families (UNESCO, 2004). The United Nations has set the Millennium Development Goals that state that all nations should achieve universal primary education by 2015 (Ritzen, 2005; UNICEF, 2005; UNESCO, 2004). Developing nations then look to the World Bank or other donor agencies to help them fund their education sectors in order to meet their targets, which can be seen in the multinational policy directives studied in this thesis (World Bank, 2005a; World Bank, 2005b). It is through these types of processes that multinational organizations have used development agendas to expand their scope into the creation of domestic policies and institutions in developing countries.

Their presence has inevitably led to a change in governance in developing and developed

nations.

5.2.2 Multinational organizations and the changing notion of governance

The growth of multinational organizations brought about the emergence of

powerful political figures on the international scene. These new organizations held a

wide scope and the ability to influence domestic policies and practices. This new reality

has forced national governments, particularly in the developing world, into new forms of

governance. Williams (2008) and Gill (2002) show how it became apparent that this shift

in governance became especially pronounced after the 1970s when the process of

globalization and economic integration heated up. Prior to the 1980s, the multinational

organizations, particularly the World Bank, were interested in funding large-scale

infrastructure projects in the name of sound economic practices (Williams, 2008).

Development during this period (1950s-1980s) was initially conceived of primarily in

economic terms. The focus was on raising the Gross National Product of poorer

countries. These organizations were less interested in a country's institutional or political

structure. Only later did multinational corporations consider the importance of supporting

social institutions such as education and health care (Williams, 2008). As a result funding

was granted to dictators of some of the world's most notorious regimes, such as to Idi

Amin in Uganda (1971), Pinochet in Chile (1973), and the Shah in Iran (1953), through

the early post-war era (1950-1980) (Toussaint, 2008). Sound political practices in the

recipient countries were not seen as a key to development: therefore, multinational

funding was not conditional on any particular form of governance.

However, the literature from researchers such as Stone and Wright (2007),

Weaver & Leiteritz (2005), and Johnson & Watsy (1993), shows that by the mid-1980s

the notion was changing as multinational organizations soon realized political instability

played a major part in economic development. A new view of the state's role and

abilities for development emerged. State activities in some developing countries were

seen to be detrimental to development because of the fact that the politicians running key

institutions were interested in pursuing personal interests at the expense of the larger

economic and social interests of their society (Williams, 2008; Toye, 1992; Johnson &

Watsy, 1993). Given their penchant for funding rogue and corrupt regimes, it is of little

surprise that multinational organizations, such as the World Bank and International

Monetary Fund, developed this perception of domestic governments in developing

countries. According to Williams (2008), "These developments provided a rationale for

development interventions designed to constrain the activities of the state" (p. 48).

According to the literature on multinational organizations, it was under this new

direction that the World Bank and International Monetary Fund started to introduce

Structural Adjustment Loans and Programs (Stone & Wright, 2007; Ritzen, 2005; Daun,

2007). These loans and programs were intended to impose a disciplinary framework on

recipient governments. Tan (2007) reports that within this framework, governments

would be expected to carry out reforms, seen as keys to development such as

liberalization, privatization, fiscal and monetary adjustments in order to receive loans

from the organizations. These structural adjustment programs were heavily criticized by

aid workers, academics, and others for their lack of success (Oxfam, 2002; Ghosh, 1993;

Kemper & Jurema, 2002). Ghosh (1993) describes the programs as misplaced and

dangerous. As a result of the lack of development progress, they were replaced by the

more kindly named Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP) in 1999. The latest PRSP

for Cambodia is studied in this thesis in chapter 4. However, although the name changed,

the PRSP strategies are still rooted in the structural adjustment legacy. Tan (2007) states

that the PRSP approach is only possible now due to the "regulatory precedents set by

structural adjustment policies" (p. 147). The implementation of conditional loans to

developing countries forever changed the governing structures within them (Daun, 2007;

Ghosh, 1993). Governments in developing countries have seen their roles shift from

proactive steering to monitoring and evaluating with policy direction left to the demands

of the international market (Daun, 2007). Thus, rather than domestic needs, international

demands are now driving the governance of developing countries. The literature shows

that this switch is a direct result of the impact of multinational organizations and their

programs of development. This reliance on market forces to determine domestic agendas

has had a huge impact on areas such as education and it is not surprising that

multinational organizations have been very interested in the direction of education in the

countries they are funding.

5.3   Educational Reconstruction

There is a great deal of literature on the process of educational reconstruction in

post-conflict societies. The following section reviews this literature and discusses recent

trends in Cambodia.

5.3.1   Education reconstruction in post-conflict societies

The World Bank has issued several directives for working in post-conflict countries.

One publication entitled, "Reshaping the Future" (2004) deals directly with education and post-

conflict reconstruction. Buckland, the author of this publication, states that,

> schools and education systems, whether they were a contributory factor to a conflict, are
> invariably debilitated by conflict. They are left weakened, damaged, and under-
> resourced at precisely the time when communities, governments, and international
> agencies need them to help rebuild and transform themselves and the societies they
> serve (2004, p. xii).

What this passage indicates is that oftentimes the education sector is very vulnerable during the rebuilding phase. Huge pressure is put on the education system, and the people within it, to quickly transform society (Graham-Brown, 1991). This goal becomes especially problematic when the people in the education system are new to their position. The situation in Cambodia over the past three decades has left the education system decimated (Mysliwiec, 2003; Ayers, 2000). Those who remained or have returned to the education sector are often dependent on international agencies for part, if not all, of their salary and the low level of salary leaves them in a lower and weaker social position.

The literature on conflict holds that oftentimes in conflict, education is often used to reinforce "the circle of hate" (Whitehead, 2003; Buckland, 2004; Smith, 2008). That is, it is used by those in power to justify the on-going conflict. Also, the education sector often becomes the target of the conflict (Smith, 2008, Buckland, 2004). As shall be discussed in the following section, this was certainly the case in Cambodia where schools were destroyed and teachers and administrators were killed during the civil war period.

At the end of the conflict however, education can be a key tool in the social and economic recovery of a nation. According to Smith (2008), education is vital to community recovery because it reintroduces routines and helps people psychologically recover from war (p. 66). Yet Verkoren (2005) and Goldsmith (2007) hold that for education to fully do this, it must be free from the negative connections associated with the conflict. This is almost impossible to do, so the ideal neutral post-conflict education system will not exist. The people involved in the sector must deal with and in some way address the violent past and transitional present. Literature by Smith (2008) and the Cambodian Ministry of Education, Youth, and Sport (2004) on post-conflict societies

point out some ways that this can be done. These include: the education sector must employ teachers who are supportive of new institutions, and it must have a curriculum that teaches non-violent conflict resolution and prepares citizens to function in a democratic system (Smith, 2008).

Hamber and Wilson (2003) and Smith (2008) point out that individuals in the education sector must come to terms with the conflict legacy. This makes education reform particularly difficult, as there are a variety of people in the sector, each with their own memories and perceptions of the causes and nature of the conflict (Hamber and Wilson, 2003). What collective memory is expressed through education? Because of education's strong connection with many roots of a conflict, its reform often gets tied into political situations (Degu, 2005). According to Degu (2005), this creates a situation where decisions related to education reform are made on the basis of political and economic realities. The primary reasons for this are that the impact of education reform is often not felt immediately and reforming an education system takes a great deal of human, financial, and material resources (Degu, 2005).

There are two major issues for post-conflict governments. According to Goldsmith (2007) and Haufler (2007) post-conflict governments are trying to establish their regime and gain credibility and legitimacy and immediate results go a long way toward making the government look strong. In terms of resources, multinational policy directives and national education policies show that the conditions attached to multinational loans restrict the amount that can be spent on educational reform (World Bank, 2005a; World Bank, 2005b; ADB, 2004a). Therefore, unless the multinational organizations see value in education reform, the resources will not be available. When there are resources available for education reform it is generally because education

reforms can be directly connected to further neo-liberal economic and political changes. For example, in Cambodia there is a push to further develop the garment trade, which is supported by multinational organizations, and therefore any educational reform that occurs promotes this economic initiative. Yet this economic purpose for education takes away from education's potential to help society and individuals get past or come to terms with the violent legacy left after conflict (Degu, 2005; Smith, 2008; Whitehead, 2003). The presence of multinational organizations then in post-conflict countries can become a detriment to educational reforms that would promote peace and social development over economic prosperity.

5.3.2   *Multinational organizations and education*

The literature shows that education is uniquely positioned between politics, economics, and culture. The operation and regulation of schools is of extreme importance to a nation's government (Baker and LeTendre, 2005; Daun, 2007; Duggan, 2003). Schooling has been used as a means through which positive economic change is promoted and national identity is reinvented or strengthened (Baker and LeTendre, 2005). Traditionally, education has been perceived to be a primarily national (or state/provincial) endeavour. However, as was just discussed above, conditions attached to loans from multinational organizations have taken local control of major domestic sectors out of the hands of domestic governments. Increasingly, as was discussed in chapter 3, education is being related to economics and market forces (Herrero, 2005; Newell et al., 2002). The goals of education, particularly in developing countries, are becoming about making productive citizens able to compete in the global market. This view is very much in line with the neo-liberal ideologies of major multinational organizations which hold that market processes should drive policy. As a result, poorer countries who are forced to

accept loans from multinational organizations in order to survive in the current world system also must accept the conditions attached to those loans. This process directly impacts the direction of education policies in their countries. Yet, do these governments have any avenue for resisting these conditions? This question will be explored in the following chapters when examining Cambodian education policies. However, before moving on it is necessary to review the role of multinational loans and agendas in recent post-conflict Cambodian educational development and reconstruction.

5.3.3 Multinational presence in post-conflict Cambodia financial assistance and recent reforms in education

In reviewing the literature it became clear that development aid for Cambodia has been through various phases of generous assistance and complete abandonment. The literature demonstrates that the cycles of international aid in Cambodia often went along with the socio-political situation in the country. In the period right after independence (1954-1969) aid was made available through the UNESCO. However it all came to a screeching halt with the onset of the American-Vietnam War (Mysliwiec, 2003). Between 1970 and 1979, there was almost no foreign presence in Cambodia. All development aid ceased completely and all foreign aid workers were expelled from the country (Mysliwiec, 2003). Directly after the overthrow of the Khmer Rouge (1979-1982) some foreign development money flowed into the country. However, the process was slow and arduous as the occupying Vietnamese were wary of international attempts to overthrow them in Cambodia (Mysliwiec, 2003). This situation continued throughout the 1980s. According to the literature, the true emergence of a multinational presence in the country can be traced back to the Paris Peace Accord and installation of United Nations Transitional Authority in Cambodia (UNTAC). Here, multinational

organizations took on key roles in the rebuilding and development of Cambodian society.

The focus in this discussion then will be on the first post-election period, after 1993.

The literature shows that in total, between 1993 and 2005, multinational agencies loaned Cambodia $5 billion USD (Tan, 2007). The two principal multinational organizations for educational reform are the Asian Development Bank (ADB) and the World Bank's International Development Association (IDA) (Tan, 2007). According to the World Bank, external assistance (financial, technical, and personnel) has contributed to every major public sector development project in post-conflict Cambodia (World Bank, 2005b). On a per capita basis, Cambodia receives a great deal more financial assistance than other low income countries (World Bank, 2005b). The majority of that assistance goes toward health and education, the rebuilding of physical infrastructure, and institutional capacity building (World Bank, 2005b).

In terms of education, between 2002 and 2007 a total of $282,484,278 (USD) in financial aid was provided to Cambodia from multilateral and bilateral financial organizations (ADB, 2008, p. 40). The largest single financial supporter was the Asian Development Bank which provided $76,326,000 (USD). The World Bank provided the second largest amount with $42,199,014 (USD). In addition, United Nations agencies contributed heavily to education reform in Cambodia. The three UN agencies (UNESCO, UNICEF, UNWFP) provided $43,915,504 (USD) (ADB, 2008). This is slightly more than the World Bank but since it is divided among three separate agencies, the World Bank total is larger for a single organization. The Asian Development Bank and World Bank are also two groups that are involved in the most subsections of the education agenda. For example, the World Bank supports primary quality, lower secondary facilities/access, lower secondary quality, and higher education quality. The Asian

Development Bank supports these areas as well as primary facilities/access, upper secondary facilities/access, technical and vocational education and skills, teacher training, and sector budget support (ADB, 2008). In contrast, many of the other financial contributors support one specific area with their funding. For example, Japan is a large bilateral financial contributor but their funding focuses primarily on teacher training and upper secondary education quality (ADB, 2008). This breakdown helps to justify the selection of the multinational organizations under study here just as the research questions seek to explore multinational influence.

The ADB's key premise in loaning money for Cambodian educational reform was the view that education is the cornerstone of a country's economic recovery. In 1996, the year when the Asian Development Bank took a more active role in Cambodian development, one-half of Cambodia's population was under the age of 15, two-thirds were illiterate, and the average educational attainment was two years (ADB, 1996). According to the ADB, this was unacceptable for any nation trying to develop economically. ADB education specialist, Gudrun Forsberg stated several priorities for Cambodian education reform, including new forms of teacher training, investment in educational resources, and a focus on primary and lower secondary education facilities and access (ADB, 1996). The Asian Development Bank inspectors also felt that the dropout rate among primary and lower secondary students was far too high. For example, in 1996, the dropout rate was still at 70%, with 7 out of 10 students originally enrolled in grade 1 dropping out before grade 5 (ADB, 1996).

So how have the more politically stable Cambodian government and multinational organizations responded more recently to the disappointing early educational reforms? Today, the ADB and the IDA continue to be the two largest financial supporters.

However, there were 113 organizations supporting 233 education projects totalling $225 million USD between 2003-2008, leading to a very complex and complicated situation in Cambodia (Tan, 2007). According to Duggan (2003), by 1994 there were concerns with the expansion of multinational presence in the Cambodian public institutions, with many "programs on the verge of a rapid phase of disbursement and expansion, a growing sense of anxiety about the purpose and impact of investment programs was evident" (p. 422). With over one hundred organizations having an interest in the education sector at all levels, the government lost its grip and the system became highly fractured. This will be seen later in chapter 7, particularly in this discussion of the use of a variety of partners to carry out Cambodian education reforms. The policy documents discussed in the following two chapters demonstrate how the government of Cambodia has been pressured to allow for the decentralization of state organizations and sectors and the opening up of the economy to private enterprises in education and other sectors because of the neo-liberal policies that come attached to rebuilding loans (WB, 2005a; WB, 2005b; ADB, 2004a, MoEYS, 2005a). Neo-liberalism holds that the state should be less interventionist. This approach can create problems when there are so many groups with influence in a certain sector and no one dominant group taking the lead. With neo-liberal policies stressing a non-interventionist state, other non-state groups step into the overseeing role previously held by the state. At this point, the largest multinational organizations have the largest say in the macro-level direction of a national education system funded by their money. In the case of Cambodia, these groups are the ADB and the IDA.

According to Sisowath (2006), in Cambodia the "educational process is gearing the next generation toward the market economy. Privately owned educational establishments are flourishing across the country, providing the younger generation with

technical skills so they will be better prepared for the market system" (p. 305). This

approach falls in line with the neo-liberal policies present in the literature and the global

movement toward an all encompassing market system that dictates economic, political,

and cultural life. When the World Bank extends a loan to a developing country, their

ideals come with the money. This is because the World Bank arrives in a nation with a

compact proposal for the use of that money (Torres, 2003). This proposal includes, "a

diagnosis of problems and a package of recommendations aimed at improving access,

equity, and quality of school systems" (Torres, 2003, p. 299). The package of

recommendations impact on the "financial, administrative, human resources, curricular,

and pedagogical issues" (Torres, 2003, p. 299). As a result, the impact of global issues

and movements is being strongly felt in Cambodia now and this is reflected in the policy

documents.

Yet, according to the research literature reviewed in chapter 3 (Green, 1997;

Daun, 2002; Dale, 2000), the globalization movement is about thinking globally but being

rooted to a local context. Cambodia is a post-conflict country, a country that suffered

through twenty years of civil war and foreign occupation. The Khmer Rouge genocide

destroyed over one-eighth of the population and displaced hundreds of thousands more.

Therefore, paying attention to local contexts can be especially problematic. This is why

Verkoren's (2005) suggestion for a locally relevant education system is so important.

However, because of the globally focused demands of multinational organizations,

education policy reform that takes local needs into consideration in meaningful and

sustainable ways has not occurred.

Today, the Cambodian Ministry of Education, Youth and Sport is working

through its third Education Strategic Plan (ESP). This Plan was first implemented in

December 2005 and is in place until 2010 when the education system will be re-assessed

to see if the plan has been successful (Tan, 2007). According to the Senior Minister of

Education, Youth and Sport Kol Pheng, the Plan is designed to give the "highest priority

to equitable access and to high educational quality in the basic education services guided

by the National Education for All plan strategies and targets" (MoEYS, 2005a). The

Minister goes on to point out the plans for the expansion of upper secondary and post-

secondary education through a "well regulated partnership between the Government,

development partners, private sector, NGO's, communities, and parents" (MoEYS,

2005a, p. i). The plan also emphasizes the importance of efficiency and ensuring that the

expense put into the system will be worth more in the economic benefit of having a well

educated population which is able to compete in the global marketplace.

5.4 Conclusions

The literature review conducted for this thesis indicates that there is a real gap in

the literature surrounding the process of development in Cambodia. Much of the research

on the country is based on Cambodian history, specifically the Khmer Rouge period

(Ayres, 2000 and Chandler, 1994; Short, 2004). The history of Cambodia is very

interesting and provides a vital context for the current situation. However, I have

discovered that going forward, more research is needed on the forces of globalization that

influence the course of the country today. In much of the literature Cambodia is

discussed in relation to its neighbours of Vietnam and Thailand (Hugo, 2003; Forbes,

2003; Development Analysis Network, 2005; DeKoninck, 2003). That is these pieces of

research study the whole area rather than focusing on the countries of Southeast Asia as

independent entities. Therefore, I contend that the study presented in this thesis fills a

gap in the literature. There is very little research on Cambodian education policy and

very little on the multinational presence in the country. This thesis combines these two areas. The majority of research on the multinational presence in Cambodia comes principally from the multinational organizations. Yet, as shall be seen in chapters 8, the national education policies do show a degree of resistance to the directives of the multinational organizations and this study highlights the differences between the Cambodian and multinational documents. Given these reasons, this study can add to the existing research on Cambodia.

The following two chapters will present a content analysis of several key Cambodian policy documents, including the 3rd ESP, and multinational directives for education in Cambodia. The content analysis will explore how the interests of domestic parties and multinational organizations come together in the origins and creation of national education policy in a post-conflict country. Whose interests and values are truly reflected in these documents?

Chapter 6: Multinational Policy Documents

The end of Vietnamese occupation in Cambodia in 1989 was followed by the implementation of a United Nations Transitional Authority. The significance of this government assistance strategy was that it set the precedent of direct international influence over Cambodian domestic structure and institutions. In this thesis I explore the extent to which international influence has had an impact on Cambodian national education policy. Therefore, it is important to identify some key topics within the multinational documents first to see how these were transferred or incorporated into Cambodian national education policy.

This chapter will be broken down according to multinational organizations. I analyze key policy directives from the World Bank, the Asian Development Bank, the International Monetary Fund and United Nations organizations. The analysis of the documents will help identify several key topics that cross organizational boundaries and relate back to concepts present in globalization research. First, I outline the key elements of each organization's documents. Then, I explore several key topics across these policy documents. These topics are the economic purpose of education, accountability, and the use of partnerships.

6.1   *International Monetary Fund (IMF) and the United Nations (UN)*

The key document from the International Monetary Fund that deals with Cambodia is the Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP). The PRSP does not deal directly with education but is a plan to reduce poverty with education perceived to be a key element in the fight against poverty. The PRSP is also significant in that it is a pre-condition for access to IMF and World Bank funds (UNICEF, 2005). The PRSP is a

results driven policy directive that is created to inform concrete actions and quantifiable and realistic targets (UNICEF, 2005; IMF, 2006). Because of this goal, the PRSP requires the establishment of a monitoring system and evaluation strategy (UNICEF, 2005; IMF, 2006). Within the PRSP, there are several key target areas. These include expanding job opportunities, strengthening institutions, improving governance, and improving rural livelihoods (IMF, 2006). The above list clearly demonstrates the role that education can play in each one of these targets.

According to the IMF, the PRSPs are "prepared by governments in low-income countries through a participatory process involving domestic stakeholders and external development partners" (2009, p. 1). The PRSP is the foundation upon which multinational partnership can be built. All the multinational organizations can utilize the themes of the PRSPs in their development agendas as poverty reduction is largely accepted as the key to development.

The reason for including the PRSP in the analysis in this study is that it is a foundational directive in the development agenda in low-income countries like Cambodia. The IMF states that the PRSP will describe "policies and programs that a country will pursue over several years to promote broad-based growth and reduce poverty, as well as external financing needs and the associated sources of financing" (2009, p. 1). However, at its core, the PRSP is supposed to encourage national ownership of strategies; however, whether this has occurred in Cambodia remains to be seen and will be explored in the following chapter.

Given its purpose to help eradicate poverty, it is not surprising that education reform is a component of the PRSP. According to the IMF, education is a priority area in human development and capacity building (2006). The goals for education reform are

listed in the PRSP and are very similar to those found in the World Bank and ADB

documents. The IMF, in the PRSP, recognizes the importance of universal basic

education but also emphasizes the importance of vocational training. The PRSP also

suggests the use of scholarships to reduce the financial burden on the poor. Both the

ADB and World Bank have had scholarship programs written into their policy directives.

Another IMF educational priority is to ensure quality and efficiency of education

services, a topic also found throughout the other multinational documents.

In terms of finances, the IMF, through the PRSP, gives an interesting breakdown

of the overall funding structure in Cambodia. The PRSP states that to alleviate poverty in

the country by 2010, a total investment of $6401 million (USD) is needed. Out of that

total, $2384 million (USD) will have to come from the public sector, where $4016 million

(USD) will come from the private investment. The IMF then breaks down the public

investment number into domestic and foreign sectors. The IMF predicts that $783 million

(USD) will come from domestic funds (the Cambodian government) and $1601 million

(USD) will have to come from foreign organizations and governments (IMF, 2006).

Given this breakdown, it is clear to see that the Cambodian government is highly

dependent on foreign assistance, without which they will be caught in the cycle of

poverty. Out of the total investment for poverty reduction by 2010, the IMF says that

15% should be dedicated to the education sector, a large share for a single sector,

showing how closely tied education is to poverty reduction in the development agenda.

The United Nations, through UNICEF and UNESCO, is the third largest

multinational contributor to education reform in Cambodia. Most of their funding

programs are directed specifically toward the achievement of the Millennium

Development Goals. Although their financial contribution is substantial, the greatest

contribution of the UN is in the formulation of the MDGs which have infiltrated the

development ideologies of all major multinational organizations operating in Cambodia,

not the least of which is the World Bank.

In this section, I have chosen to discuss the IMF and the United Nations together.

The reason for this is that they have both laid down foundational policy directives for

development in poor countries like Cambodia. The IMF's focus on poverty reduction is

directly tied to the UN's Millennium Development Goals (MDGs).   These goals were

created in 2000 and are an eight point directive that has measurable targets that were

created to ease the lives of the world's poorest people. The target date to achieve the

MDGs is 2015. The MDGs are as follows: ending poverty and hunger; universal

education; gender equality; child health; maternal health; combat HIV/AIDS;

environmental sustainability; and global partnership (UNICEF, 2005). In response to the

declaration of 2000, the Cambodian government localized the MDGs in 2003. The

Cambodian Millennium Development Goals (CMDG) are: to eradicate poverty and

hunger; achieve universal primary education; promote gender equality and empower

women; reduce child mortality; improve maternal health; combat HIV/AIDS, malaria,

and other diseases; ensure environmental sustainability; develop global partnership for

development; de-mining, UXO (unexploded ordnance), and victim assistance. In

examining these goals after reading through all the other multinational documents, it is

clear to see how they inform and guide the development process. Education is a CMDG

and as such received a great deal of attention from the multinational organizations. It can

be tied into so many of the other CMDGs as well. For example, an education in basic

health can help people improve maternal health and learn how to prevent the spread of

HIV/AIDS. The multinational organizations also consider that it is central in the fight against poverty. The whole development process can be seen in these goals.

6.2   The World Bank

The World Bank is the largest multinational financial organization in Cambodia. There are several key World Bank policy directives that directly address Cambodian national education policy. The Education Sector Support Project (WB ESSP), implemented in 2005, is the most significant World Bank policy directive as it sets out the organization's vision for education in Cambodia for five years. It is the overarching document of the World Bank for education. In contrast, the Country Assistance Strategy (CAS) is a directive that lays out the objectives and development agenda for all sectors in Cambodia, including education. Finally, the Fast Track Initiative (FTI) is a World Bank policy that was implemented to supplement an objective in the WB ESSP, specifically the inclusion of ethnic minorities in education. These will be described below.

6.2.1   Policy Documents

The Education Sector Support Project (WB ESSP)

The most significant World Bank policy directive, in relation to Cambodian education, is the Education Sector Support Project (WB ESSP). The WB ESSP was implemented on March 29th, 2005 and was set to run for five years. The purpose of this directive was to set out a plan of direction for the education sector in Cambodia. The World Bank states that their educational objectives, "promote a rigorous agenda to increase access to basic education, improve the quality and relevance of schooling and enhance decentralized management and efficiency of educational services" (World Bank, 2005a, p. 2). In order to meet these objectives, the World Bank Education Sector Support Project, a broad, sector-wide approach to education planning and development, was put in

place (World Bank, 2005a, p. 2). Within the project there is a "strong emphasis on

capacity building and institutional strengthening," which is expected to achieve

sustainable results relating directly to the overall educational objectives of the World

Bank (World Bank, 2005a, p. 2).

The WB ESSP and its overall educational objectives closely relate to World Bank

development objectives, specifically education for poverty reduction. As was discussed

earlier, multinational organizations such as the World Bank and International Monetary

Fund, have championed poverty reduction as their raison d'être since the early 1990s.

This goal is apparent in the WB ESSP. In their rationale for involvement in Cambodian

education, the World Bank states that, "there is extensive research evidence about the

contributions of the education sector to improvements in living standards, poverty

alleviation, economic growth, public health and civic participation" (World Bank, 2005a,

p.1).

In total, the five year WB ESSP required an amount of $30.09 million (USD) to

achieve its objectives (World Bank, 2005a, p. i). Of this money, the World Bank

financed $28 million (USD). The additional $2 million (USD) was to be paid by the

Cambodian government. The World Bank contribution came from the International

Development Association (IDA), a part of the Bank that lends interest-free loans to the

poorest countries in the world. Cambodia will have 35-40 years to pay back the interest

free loan.

The World Bank classifies the WB ESSP under the theme "Education for All"

(World Bank, 2005a p. i). The Education for All directives emphasize universal primary

education by 2015, yet the sectors targeted by the WB ESSP do not necessarily reflect

this goal. The percentage of sector funding is as follows: primary education (25%),

secondary education (65%), and higher education (10%) (World Bank, 2005a, p. i). After

reading through the document, it seems to be that the connection between primary and

secondary education is inseparable according to World Bank doctrine. One of the main

justifications in the WB ESSP for the emphasis on secondary education is that a lack of

access to higher education leads to dropouts at the primary level. The WB ESSP talks

repeatedly about the bottleneck that exists as children try to move beyond the lowest

primary grades (JK-3) to upper levels. The World Bank surmises that the drop-out rate is

so high above grade 3 because there are not enough student spaces to accommodate

demand beyond grade 3. Therefore, the idea that the primary and secondary sectors are

inseparable justifies the World Bank focus on secondary development in the WB ESSP

despite their insistence that it fits into the Education for All commitment to primary

education.

Country Assistance Strategy (CAS) for Cambodia

In addition to the WB ESSP, the Country Assistance Strategy for Cambodia

(CAS) is also an important World Bank document in relation to Cambodian education

policy. The CAS was implemented on April 18th, 2005, three weeks after the WB ESSP.

Although given some of the overlapping present in the two documents, it appears they

were jointly conceived. The CAS lasts for a period of 3 years, and covers the fiscal years

of 2005-2008 (World Bank, 2005b, 2). The CAS is used by the World Bank to lay out its

operations and development agenda in a specific country. They have been used in

conjunction with the International Monetary Fund's Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper

(PRSP) since the late 1990s (Ritzen, 2005). These documents cover all the operations of

the organization within the given country. This emphasis on organizational co-operation

and partnership is very apparent in the CAS for Cambodia. In the introduction to the

CAS, the document describes the process of bringing multiple organizations together to create a unified development agenda. Of particular interest for this thesis is the acknowledgment of the Asian Development Bank's role in regional development. The CAS states how the ADB and World Bank (and the UK Department for International Development), "agreed to follow a joint country strategy formulation process" (World Bank, 2005b, p. 1). This linkage is significant for this study in that an exploration of the CAS not only helps clarify the World Bank's agenda for Cambodian education, but also justifies the selection of the World Bank, IMF, and ADB as the most influential multinational financial organizations. The development agendas of these three organizations are intimately linked and it is impossible to explore one organization's policy directives without being referred to a corresponding document from one of the other two organizations. This also relates back to the whole process of globalization and the influence of multinational organizations on development strategies in Cambodia.

Fast Track Initiative (FTI)

In addition to the WB ESSP and CAS, I also examined a Fast Track Initiative Catalytic Fund Project directed toward increasing the presence of ethnic minorities in the education sector. This World Bank initiative was created in 2008 after it was deemed that the goal of increasing the school retention rate of ethnic minorities was not being met in an efficient manner (World Bank, 2008). The Fast Track Initiative project, seeks to expand a scholarship program that was implemented under the WB ESSP and 3rd Education Strategic Plan (ESP). The new scholarship program established under the Fast Track Initiative is for lower primary school students from poor, minority families (World Bank, 2008). It established a scholarship program to run between 2008 and 2012 (World Bank, 2008).

The reason for the expansion was to increase progress toward net enrolment retention, progression rates, and improved grade 6 completion rates (World Bank, 2008). The new scholarship program targets specific provinces, Mondulkiri, Preah Vihear, and Ratanakiri. These areas were selected because they have the highest primary school drop out rates in the country (World Bank, 2008). In total, 18,000 students, over a four year period, in the three provinces receive a $20 (USD) per year scholarship (World Bank, 2008). The students maintain their scholarship as long as they are enrolled in school and receive adequate marks on tests in mathematics and Khmer.

However, in order to be eligible, there are several processes for students to go through. Students in grade three are eligible for the scholarships. The grade three students must fill out application forms at their schools. The application forms are then submitted to the Ministry of Education, Youth, and Sport (MoEYS). The students must also write tests in math and Khmer at their schools. These tests are also taken to the MoEYS to be graded. The test grades and scores from the application forms are matched up to a poverty index to determine a student's final score in the application process. However, this process is so very wrought with issues and susceptible to tampering. First of all, most grade three students are incapable of grasping the importance of filling in an application form of any kind, let alone one that would be of such personal value. Therefore, coercion from teachers and administrators is possible given the value these scholarships must have for their schools. Parents are also left out of the application process and this is very troubling given the age and impressionability of these students. Therefore, the validity of the scholarship program can be called into question.

Initially, this Initiative was created based on lessons learned from the lower secondary scholarship scheme established under the WB ESSP in 2008 (World Bank,

2008 p. 2). Therefore, this Initiative is directly tied to the WB ESSP and is an important example of how the World Bank and its partners use policy directives to assess and evaluate current educational practices and expand upon or retract funding for objectives.

6.3   Asian Development Bank

6.3.1   Policy documents

The primary policy directive from the ADB, which focuses specifically on Cambodian education, is the Second Education Sector Development Program (ESDP II) (ADB, 2004a). The ESPD II consists of three different but connected components. There is a program loan for $20 million (USD); a project loan for $25 million (USD); and a technical assistance of $500,000 (USD) (ADB, 2004a). Therefore, the total financial contribution from the ADB in this project is $45,500,000 USD. This money was to be disbursed over a period of three years, 2005 to 2008. In comparison, the World Bank provided $28 million (USD) over a period of five years (2005-2010).

Thus, the financial contribution of the ADB to education is quite a bit more substantial. However, in reading through the documents, it appears that despite the disparity in financial contributions, the World Bank leads the development agenda in Cambodia, as a much larger and politically powerful organization internationally. There are many references throughout the ADB policy directives to World Bank objectives and ideologies. However, despite many similarities, each organization has a clear and distinct agenda within Cambodia. Although, as shall be discussed, the underlying ideologies are the same, the means to get there are different.

According to the ADB, "the overall objective of the ESDP II is to contribute to poverty reduction in Cambodia by improving access to and the quality of secondary education and lifelong learning opportunities for out-of-school youth" (ADB, 2004a, p. i).

Here it is clear that the World Bank and ADB share the same ultimate goal, poverty

reduction through education. However, this statement demonstrates how each

organization has different approaches to achieving this goal. The World Bank is focused

primarily on primary and lower secondary education while the ADB is focused on upper

secondary and lifelong learning. In tandem with the World Bank, the focus of aid from

the ADB is on the 40% of the communities in Cambodia with the highest poverty rates.

The ESDP II is highly focused on a connection to the market economy. The ADB

hopes this project will help to create a market-responsive education and training system

that will result in an increase in household prosperity (ADB, 2004a). This will be

explored further in chapter 8.

In order to do this, the ADB has invested a great deal of money in the education

sector. As was discussed earlier, the ESDP II is divided into three components. The

program loan of $20 million (USD) is aimed at improving equity in terms of access,

improving quality and internal efficiency, enhancing capacity for greater decentralization,

and increasing resource mobilization (ADB, 2004a). Ultimately, the ADB states that the

primary purpose of the program loan is to ensure that the ADB continues its leadership

role in Cambodian education reform (ADB, 2004a, p. 11). The project loan of $25

million (USD) is set up to supplement the policy initiatives under the program loan. The

project loan objectives are much more concrete and include providing training

opportunities, lower and upper secondary education expansion, and community based

skills training (ADB, 2004a). One of the most interesting elements of the ESDP II is the

technical assistance of $500,000. The whole purpose of this money is to assist the

MoEYS plan and implement education regulatory reform and governance for

decentralization (ADB, 2004a). Specifically, it is to assist with the creation of a new

education law that would help increase educational institutional decentralization (ADB, 2004a). Therefore, a specific element of this loan is to provide financial backing for a legislative process that would see educational decentralization become law in Cambodia.

Another interesting element written into the procurement section of the ESDP II has to do with a required international element which reflects the regional nature of the ADB. A large part of the loan goes toward paying the foreign currency exchange rate. For example, out of the $25 million (USD) for the project loan, $13.9 million (USD) is for the foreign exchange cost (ADB, 2004a). However, the justification for this is that Cambodia is receiving technical services or goods from other members of the ADB. Therefore, they are providing Cambodia the money to buy from their members. In addition, the ADB loans are not interest free, like the IDA grants. The interest rate is 1% during the 8 year grace period and 1.5% there after (ADB, 2004a). The loan has a term of 24 years which is also less than the World Bank term of 35-40 years.

The second Asian Development Bank policy directive that has had an impact on the educational agenda in Cambodia is the Country Operations Business Plan (COBP) (ADB, 2008). The COBP is created in conjunction with the country strategy and program and is very much like the World Bank's CAS. What is particularly interesting about the COBP is that it lists the education sector as a key target for the economic and business development in the country. The education sector is listed alongside the agriculture and natural resource sector, financial sector, power sector, transport sector, water supply and sanitation sector, and private sector development as the keys to expanding business in Cambodia. The list is interesting in that it helps clarify the breakdown of the steering committee that was formed to oversee policy development and outcome in the WB ESSP. Each of the above listed sectors had a representative on the steering committee. The use

of an inter-ministerial steering committee is also promoted in the ESDP II. The COBP also gives insight into the fact that the ADB sees education as a business and as closely and intimately connected to several of the prime industrial and commercial sectors in the country. This breakdown illustrates the ADB's perception of education.

The COBP does not lay out a specific amount of funding for each sector; however, it does set out a road map for their involvement in each area. From the outset, it is clear that the country strategy is on poverty reduction through private sector development and stronger governance (ADB, 2008). This echoes the goals of the ESDP I from three years earlier. In terms of education, the broad goal is to promote "overall institutional capacity development for more efficient delivery of education in order to promote equitable access to school education and support demand-driven community based skills development" (ADB, 2008, p. 56). Out of this statement come several topics which are consistently explored in the ADB policy directives. These are: partnership with the private sector; skills training as a strategy for poverty reduction; and an emphasis on efficiency at the community and local level (decentralization). Each of these will be discussed further below.

6.4 Topics appearing across the documents

Through the content analysis, several major topics became apparent. These topics emerged through the use of the codes laid out in chapter 4. The topics are: the purposes of education, the notion of accountability, and the value of partnerships. Each of these will be explored below.

6.4.1 The purposes of education

The primary topic that permeates the World Bank policy directives is the concept of education reform as a means to reduce poverty. This topic became apparent through

the use of the codes that focused on the "setting/context" and "perspectives held by subjects" (for further elaboration of these codes, see chapter 4). The purpose of education for the World Bank is primarily an economic purpose. As was discussed earlier, the reduction of, and ultimate elimination of, poverty remains the principle justification for the lending of multinational funds to poor countries. This is reflected in the International Monetary Funds switch from using Structural Adjustment Programs to the more politically correct programs of Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSP). The drive to reduce poverty then drives the development agendas of the multinational financial agencies, and is reflected in their policy documents.

The term poverty appears in the CAS a total of 151 times, with a third of those being concerned directly with poverty reduction. In the WB ESSP, the term poverty appears a total of 45 times with the majority of these referring to education as a means of reducing poverty. The World Bank and Asian Development Bank talk about poverty as a strictly economic issue. Poverty is discussed in terms of a lack of economic wealth and prospects and not a social issue in the multinational documents.

According to the World Bank documents, education is seen as a means of poverty reduction because it can help develop new sources of economic growth and prosperity. In addition, in terms of individual benefits, education can increase an individual's ability to enter the wage sector and thus increase income and living standards and reduce personal vulnerability (World Bank, 2005a; World Bank, 2005b). The documents show a connection in Cambodia between income and education level through statistical evidence. For example, 48.26% for people with no levels of education completed live on less than $12 (USD) a year. In contrast, only 1.35% of people with no completed education earn more than $119 (USD). In terms of those individuals with a university level education,

only 18.42% live on less than $12 (USD), while 10.25% of these individuals earn $119 (USD) a year (World Bank, 2005a, p. 59).

In 2005, the World Bank only funded two projects in Cambodia. These were the Education Sector Support Program for $28 million (USD) and the Trade Facilitation and Competitiveness Project for $10 million (USD) (World Bank, 2005b, p. 138). The majority of the funding focus was on education reform and the focus of the education reform was on poverty reduction. This focus on poverty reduction was clear in the objectives listed in the WB ESSP. The development objective of the WB ESSP is "to assist the Borrower to implement the ESSP goals and to expand educational services by addressing supply, demand, quality, and efficiency constraints, with special focus on the poor and underserved communities" (World Bank, 2005a, p. 2).

This is reflected not only in the selection of specific geographical areas but also in the distribution of money within the project itself. Out of the $28 million (USD), $18.95 million (USD) is set aside for the objective of "enabling equitable access to education". This objective relates directly back to targeting high levels of poverty in order to improve a regions ability to increase household income through access to more skills based employment. Within these objectives, $12.07 million (USD) is set aside for the expansion of educational facilities in poor and underserved areas. This includes the construction of lower secondary schools; completing incomplete primary schools; building latrines and wells; supplying schools with furniture, instructional equipment, library books, and educational materials; and providing professional development for teachers and principals (World Bank, 2005a). In this objective, there seems to be the intent to mesh quantity of educational facilities with quality practices from teachers and principals. However, the description of the expansion process is tempered by phrases

such as "where needed", "where cost-effective", and "where appropriate"; therefore, the

extent to which this will be carried out seems very much dependent on financial

considerations.

The second goal under the objective of "enabling equitable access to education" is

the creation of a scholarship program. This program fits under the goal of "reducing

barriers for disadvantaged children" (World Bank, 2005a). The financial aid set aside for

this objective is $6.88 million (USD) (World Bank, 2005a). In this goal, the World Bank

recognizes the fact that just because a school is built, there is no guarantee of student

attendance and participation. Therefore, in World Bank terms, they needed to come up

with a "demand-side incentive" (World Bank, 2005a, p. 4). Getting at student demand for

education seems to be a real issue especially in poor, rural communities that often rely on

children to contribute to family income. It is estimated that children in Cambodia can

earn close to $1 a day and their income contributes about 28% of household income

(World Bank, 2008). In addition, providing scholarships to poor children helps ease the

financial burden of schooling in Cambodia where it is common for communities to pay

hefty education fees (Pellini, 2007). According to the World Bank, a scholarship program

for poor children is "an actionable measure under the NPRS to foster universal basic

education" (2005a, p. 5). The students selected for the scholarships are identified through

the use of an index that recognizes students at risk of dropping out. There are application

forms and scoring procedures based on household surveys (World Bank, 2005a). These

are analyzed in the selection process. However, given an adult illiteracy rate of 70% in

Cambodia, it is difficult to envision how the application process could be transparent and

inclusive.

Despite this issue, it is clear that the purpose of the education reforms proposed in the WB ESSP is poverty reduction from an economic standpoint. The largest financial allocation within the WB ESSP goes toward enabling equitable access to education and poor communities are specifically targeted. This focus on poor communities and poverty reduction is in line with multinational development agendas. This trend can also be found in the policy directives of the Asian Development Bank.

The ADB's agenda for Cambodia also focuses on poverty reduction. However, the ADB's approach towards and perceptions about poverty reduction differs from the World Bank. The World Bank's poverty reduction strategy focused on starting at the bottom; that is, ensuring quality basic education for all. The justification for this was that all children need access to the very basics of education and routine of school in order to diversify their means of getting out of poverty. In contrast, the focus of the ADB is on lifelong learning opportunities. For example, the $25 million (USD) of the project loan is to be used "to provide improved access to and quality of secondary education in the poorest 40% of communes in Cambodia, and lifelong learning opportunities for out-of-school youths" (ADB, 2004a, p. i). This objective combines the aspects of lifelong learning and poverty reduction through its focus on the poorest communes in Cambodia.

In terms of content in the policy directives, the terms lifelong, skills and poverty are very prevalent. For example, in the ESDP II, a 79 page document including annexes, the term skills appears 104 times. The majority of these refer to life-long or demand-driven skills. The content analysis also shows a real concern with poverty in relation to education in the ESDP II and COBP. In the ESDP II, there are 54 references to poverty, while in the COBP it appears 62 times.

The content analysis of the ADB policy directives demonstrates that the focus of ADB policy is cost-effective and accessible skills training for unemployed youth between the ages of 12 and 21 (ADB, 2004a). To do this, the ESDP II targets three key objectives. These are: expanding lower secondary education opportunities; expanding upper secondary education opportunities; and expanding community-based skills training for out-of-school youth in poor communities (ADB, 2004a). The justification for targeting this age group is that the Cambodian population is relatively young, with 49% under the age of 20 and as a result there are between 150,000 and 175,000 people entering the labour force each year (ADB, 2004a, p. 2). As a result, there needs to be economic growth to create jobs for all these individuals, yet economic growth will not occur without a qualified labour force. Therefore, it is essential to give youths the necessary skills before they attempt to enter the labour force.

So how successful have the education reforms been in helping to alleviate poverty in Cambodia? At the start of the World Bank's ESSP in August of 2005, 35-40% of the Cambodian population lived below the poverty line (World Bank, 2005a). Out of that number, 15-20% lived in extreme poverty. In 2005, Cambodia ranked 130 out of 173 countries in the United Nations Human Development Index. In the more recent 2008 Human Development Index, Cambodia is ranked 136th out of 179 countries. In addition, inequality between rich and poor in Cambodia has increased exponentially. Any of the economic growth that occurred prior to the implementation of the latest education policy directives did not lead to a decrease in poverty and inequality. In fact, the poverty level in Cambodia remained static, particularly in rural areas. With 85% of the population living in rural areas, it is clear that any economic improvements have only had an impact on the lifestyle of the upper classes in Cambodia (Oxfam, 2002).

In addition to their drive to alleviate poverty through education reform, the policy directives of the multinational organizations also demonstrate an emphasis on partnership and capacity building. These shall be discussed below.

6.4.2   Partnership and capacity building

The value of partnerships is very explicit in the multinational documents concerning Cambodia and Cambodian education reform. As was discussed above, the documents were written in partnership with other major multinational financial agencies. Specifically, the World Bank and Asian Development Bank agreed upon a joint development strategy for Cambodia. The justification for the reliance on partnership is given in the Country Assistance Strategy. The World Bank reports that the use of partnerships results in less duplication and fewer gaps in funding sectors (World Bank, 2005b). In addition, the Country Assistance Strategy states that the benefits of the financial agencies partnership extend to the Cambodian government also in that it reduces their transaction costs (World Bank, 2005b).

The World Bank's reliance on partnerships for efficiency and quality can be found in the content of the policy directives. This topic emerged through the "strategy" codes that focused on the conditions of loans and restrictions attached to loans. In addition, it was apparent in the "setting/context" codes which included the sources of funds and amount of funding by donor. In addition, the topic partnership was very apparent in the language of the documents. For example, in the CAS partnership is discussed 70 times throughout the document, while in the WB ESSP it was discussed 24 times. The notion of partnership was worked through the text of every distinct section of the WB ESSP and CAS, once again demonstrating how a concept can permeate an organization's agenda. Yet, the perception of what constitutes a good partnership can also be found in the content

of the World Bank documents. As was discussed above, the World Bank sees partnership among international agencies as a key to the development agenda. This is clear in the WB ESSP because out of the 24 references to partnerships in the document, 14 of them refer specifically to international partners while only 3 refer to partnership with the Ministry of Education, Youth, and Sport. In the CAS, out of the 70 references to partnership, 25 are directly concerned with donor coordination in the education sector. This is quite substantial since the CAS discusses development objectives in all World Bank funded sectors. In addition, the importance of an efficient and quality education can be found in the content of the text. The term quality is used 94 times in the WB ESSP to discuss education reform and the importance of financial partnerships. The heavy reliance on financial coordination in the education sector demonstrates how the World Bank places a great deal of emphasis on the multinational partnerships to reform education in Cambodia.

As was the case in the World Bank policy directives, the idea of forming and utilizing partnerships to rebuild Cambodian education is also prevalent in the Asian Development Bank policy directives. This is not all that surprising given that the two agencies agreed to a joint development agenda. However, although both organizations believe in the value of partnerships, the targets of each seem different. For example, the World Bank is very focused on forming partnerships with other financial agencies to spread around the financial, technical, and personnel needs of rebuilding education in Cambodia. There is a great deal of discussion around partnership in the WB ESSP as was discussed earlier. In contrast, the Asian Development Bank certainly acknowledges the value of partnering with other multinational financial agencies in facilitating education reform in Cambodia. However, for the ADB the most valuable type of partnership is with

the private sector. This can be seen in the content of the various ADB documents. For example in the COBP, partnerships are mentioned 22 times. Yet out of those 22 times, 12 refer to public-private partnerships while only 5 refer to the importance of international partnerships. In the ESDP II, partnerships are mentioned 19 times and 10 of those refer directly to private-public partnerships. This probably relates back to the ADB's conception of education as a business venture.

The support for private sector partnerships can be found throughout the EDSP II and the COBP. For example, the COBP lists several education projects for 2008-2009. A 2009 initiative for enhancing technical and vocational education lists enhancing and promoting "public-private partnerships for skills development and strengthening linkages with employers and private skills providers" as major components of their agenda (ADB, 2008). In addition in the EDSP II, there is an expansion on the private-public partnership discussion in the form of financing for voucher schemes. The voucher scheme is established under the ESPD II with the goal of providing skills training vouchers to the poorest communes in Cambodia (ADB, 2004a). In order to sustain the voucher system, the ADB suggests a corporate tax transfer program. Those enterprises who support the skills education project will get a tax break (ADB, 2004a). The ADB sees this partnership with the private sector as essential for developing a skills based education system. This skills based education system is the basis of the ADB's poverty reduction scheme and once again illustrates the emphasis on education for economic purposes.

6.4.3   The notions of accountability and efficiency and neo-liberal reform

Another of the three major topics that run through the multinational documents is the notion of accountability. This notion of accountability became very apparent when I broke the documents down into "perspectives held by subjects" codes. Specifically, I

used the codes to examine the purposes of the loans versus the purposes of the policy. What becomes apparent throughout the documents is that individuals, groups, and organizations must justify and explain their actions at all levels. The projects and policy directives financially supported by the World Bank put mechanisms in place that monitor and evaluate all elements of the education sector affected by the funding. This drive for accountability starts at the highest levels of international and national governance.

Content analysis of the World Bank policy directives clearly demonstrates how the notion of accountability is emphasized. For example, in the WB ESSP the term accountability is used 14 times while effectiveness is found in the document 32 times. This number is much higher in the CAS, a document that is double in size to the WB ESSP, with the term accountability appearing 48 times and effectiveness 61 times. The use of these terms was found in a variety of sections in the documents. This included accountability in the financing of education to the accountability of teachers in the education sector. The fact that the terms accountability and effectiveness permeated all sections of the documents points to how these concepts dominate World Bank policy.

In addition, the drive for accountability can also be found in some basic conditions laid out in the World Bank policies and programs. For example, when discussing the prospect of using money from the WB ESSP to complete the building of several incomplete primary schools, the policy says that this will be done "where needed" and "cost-effective". It is the burden then of local officials to demonstrate need and to be accountable for the cost-effectiveness of their projects. Plus, when discussing several major objectives for the funding of the education sector in Cambodia, the conditional phrases "where acceptable to the IDA" or "satisfactory or acceptable to the IDA" are included. In the WB ESSP the term, "satisfactory to" appears 18 times when discussing

educational objectives, while the term "acceptable to" appears 24 times. This is demonstrated in the following phrase, "the adoption of a Community Contracting Operational Manual, satisfactory to IDA, before the start of school construction" (World Bank, 2005a, p. 43). The actions around education reform must be satisfactory or acceptable to the IDA and must be cost-effective. This demonstrates how education reform in Cambodia is a top-down process with the World Bank setting the agenda.

As was discussed earlier, the World Bank placed a great deal of emphasis on efficiency, accountability, decentralization, and quality. Each of these concepts are intimately linked in a cause and effect relationship. The idea that educational, and further institutional, decentralization leads to greater efficiency and accountability and in turn a quality education system is also present in the Asian Development Bank policy directives. This can be seen in the content analysis of the text. In the COBP the term efficiency appears 34 times, while it appears in the ESDP II 38 times. However, once again there is a slight variation in the two organizations' perceptions of efficiency. While the World Bank stresses accountability to improve efficiency, there is less emphasis on accountability for efficiency from the Asian Development Bank. For example, the term accountability or accountable appears only 4 times in the ESDP II and only 8 times in the COBP. The term accountable was used primarily in relation to individuals in the system such as teachers in the Asian Development Bank policy directives. In contrast, the World Bank predominantly discussed efficiency and accountability at the institutional level, the goal being a quality, decentralized education system. In contrast, the ADB discusses efficiency as a local and individual endeavour, and as such, individuals must be accountable for their performances within the sector. Specifically, the ADB really tends to emphasize the efficiency of students and teachers. This emphasis on accountability

and efficiency as language prevalent in neo-liberal education reforms will be analyzed in further detail in chapter 8 to demonstrate how the multinational organizations have adopted the ideas of business in their education policy directives.

6.5   Conclusions

The multinational policy directives that concern Cambodian education reform present documents that have several major topics running through them. These include: accountability, efficiency, and partnership. However, the primary topic that dominates the education reform agenda is the idea of education as a means of poverty reduction. It is clear that the multinational financial agencies want their funds to be used toward education reform that will help alleviate poverty among Cambodia's poorest individuals and communes. However, this desire is always tempered by neo-liberal economic thinking. The reform must be cost-effective, market-oriented, sustainable, and based on the principle of supply and demand. It is not easy to balance the needs of all the organizations and individuals who have a financial, social, and cultural investment in the Cambodian education sector. It has been up to the Cambodian government to try to balance everyone's needs and wants, including their own, into a working education system. Creating this system after years of instability and war has proven to be a challenge. The educational policies of the Cambodian government will be explored in the following chapter.

Chapter 7: Cambodian National Education Policy

The second element of the content analysis of this thesis is the examination of recent Cambodian national education policies. These documents include: the National Education for All goals (MoEYS, 2003); the 3rd Education Strategic Plan (ESP) 2006-2010 (MoEYS, 2005a); the Education Sector Support Program (ESSP) 2006-2010 (MoEYS, 2005b); the Law on Education (RGoC, 2007); the Policy of Non-Formal Education (RGoC, 2002); the Policy for Child-Friendly Schools (MoEYS, 2007); and the Policy for Curriculum Development 2005-2009 (MoEYS, 2004). Each of these documents will be described below. After the descriptions, several key topics which emerged through a careful reading and content analysis of the documents will be discussed. These include the purposes of education (formal vs. informal education), partnership, and good governance.

7.1   Cambodian national policy documents

7.1.1   Cambodian National Education for All Plan (NEFA)

The Royal Government of Cambodia officially joined the global movement for Education for All in 2003. As was discussed in the previous chapter, the Royal Government of Cambodia set out nine domestic Millennium Development Goals to align with those promoted by the United Nations. One of these goals was the achievement of universal primary education by 2015. The process of achieving these goals involved long-term and medium-term policies. The medium-term objectives are laid out in the 3rd Education Strategic Plan and Education Sector Support Program, while the long-term objectives are set out in the National Education for All Plan (MoEYS, 2003).

Within the NEFA Plan there are six inter-dependent dimensions which are early childhood care and development, basic education, learning achievement, adult literacy, training in essential skills, and education for better living (MoEYS, 2003). As shall be discussed later in this chapter, the laying out of these internationally created objectives has influenced the Cambodian education reform process. Each of these dimensions can be seen within the policies set out in the 3rd ESP and in the priority programs of the ESSP. Therefore, it is clear that the NEFA Plan is the underlying connection between all the national education policies examined in this study. Currently the most significant national education policy is the 3rd Education Strategic Plan which will be discussed below.

7.1.2   The 3rd Education Strategic Plan 2006-2010

The 3rd Education Strategic Plan (3rd ESP) is the clearest national policy for education reform in Cambodia. The latest ESP was adopted in December 2005 and is set to run a course of four years.

The creation and adoption of the ESP is clearly identified as a collaborative process. In his introduction to the policy document, Senior Minister Kol Pheng states that the 3rd ESP is a synthesis of strategy papers prepared by the Ministry of Education, Youth, and Sport and the international consultants of the Education Sector Working Group (MoEYS, 2005a). These international consultants included representatives from the World Bank, Asian Development Bank, and UN agencies. This statement confirms claims from the various multinational organizations that they were actively involved in the Cambodian policy making process.

The 3rd ESP lays out three main policies for education reform in Cambodia. These are: equitable access to education services; quality and efficiency of education services; and institutional development and capacity building for decentralization

(MoEYS, 2005a). What is interesting about these policies is that they tend to echo multinational agendas rather than reflect the objectives and vision of the MoEYS. Before discussing the topics found within Cambodian national education policies, a discussion of the ESSP is necessary as it was created to work in tandem with the 3rd ESP.

7.1.3   Education Sector Support Program (ESSP) 2006-2010

The Cambodian Education Sector Support Program 2006-2010, named after the World Bank policy directive that was used to create the Cambodian version, was adopted in December 2005, the same year and month as the 3rd Education Strategic Plan. This is not surprising given that the ESSP was created to complement the objectives laid out in the 3rd ESP. The ESSP is very much the practical element of the education reform process. Basically, the purpose of the ESSP is to "outline how the policies and strategies laid out in the Education Strategic Plan (ESP) 2006-2010 will be put into practice" (MoEYS, 2005b, p. 1). This program aims to translate over-arching policy into manageable and measurable tasks. As a result, it is an interesting document to examine as it gives a clearer view of areas where the Royal Government feels they need to achieve their educational goals.

The 3rd ESP identifies several key priority programs and these priority programs clarify the Royal Government's view on what areas of the education sector deserve the most attention. These policy priorities are equitable access to education services, quality and efficiency of education services, and institutional development and capacity building for decentralization (MoEYS, 2005a). The ESSP then breaks these policies down into priority programs that fit into two categories. The categories are recurrent budget program priorities and capital program priorities. Table 7 lays out these priorities and demonstrates how they relate to the 3rd ESP policy priorities (MoEYS, 2005b).

Table 7:

ESP Policy Priorities	Equitable Access to Education	Quality and Efficiency of Education Services	Institutional Development and Capacity Building for Decentralization
	↓	↓	↓
ESSP Recurrent Budget Priority Programs	Education service efficiency	Continuous Teacher Education	Youth and Sport Development
	Early Childhood Education	Core Instructional Materials	Strengthened Monitoring Systems
	Primary Education Quality and Efficiency	Non-formal Education Expansion	Secondary Scholarship for the Poor
	Lower Secondary Education Access, Quality & Efficiency		
	Upper Secondary Education Access & Equity		
	Higher Education Quality, Efficiency & Equity		
	↓	↓	↓
ESSP Capital Priority Programs	Education Facilities Development Program		Institutional Development and Capacity Building

For each of these priority programs, the ESSP lays out objectives and justifications, indicators and targets, strategies and coverage, main programs and activities, program management and monitoring, financing plan, and capacity development needs (MoEYS, 2005b).

Of particular concern to the government is the monitoring and assessment of the capital program priorities. The recurrent budget priorities have measurable targets that can be reported on, but how does the Royal Government assess institutional development

and capacity building? The Royal Government is faced with very strict reporting

processes to the multinational financial organizations, and there seems to be a real sense

of confusion about how they achieve this directive and report back on it. This confusion

is clear in the introduction when the government reports that they were unable to

complete all their reporting within the allotted time frame and as a result were unable to

align the program for institutional development and capacity building with capacity

building needs laid out in other parts of the education reform agenda. The inclusion of

this objective as a priority seems to be an external demand based on information included

in the multinational and Cambodian documents (MoEYS, 2005b).

Finally, the ESSP also laid the foundation for a new piece of legislation. The

Royal Government stated that the implementation of the programs in the ESSP would be

underpinned by a new education law (MoEYS, 2005b). This law was intended to regulate

and legalize many of the decentralization elements set out in the 3rd ESP and ESSP. It

was also going to include regulations that clearly set out job roles and duties for those

employed in the education sector. At the time of the creation and adoption of the ESSP,

the education law was expected to be passed in the first few months of its mandate,

therefore ensuring a smoother implementation process. However, the education law was

not enacted until two years later in 2007. The next section describes this most recent Law

on Education.

7.1.4   *The Law on Education, 2007*

The Law on Education was officially approved in November of 2007, almost two

full years after the creation and adoption of the 3rd ESP and ESSP. It is significant in that

it lays out the official education objectives for the Royal Government of Cambodia after

the experience of trying to implement the 3rd ESP and ESSP. In the 3rd ESP, the Ministry

stated that its objective was to create a holistically educated individual (2005a). In the 2007 Law on Education the objective of education is to "develop the human resources of the nation by providing a lifelong education for the learners to acquire knowledge, skills, capacities, dignity, good moral behaviour and characteristics, in order to push identification, cultures and language" (RGoC, 2007, p. 2). This objective is very much in line with a holistic vision of education with a nationalistic bent. The nationalist nature of the Law on Education is fairly evident throughout the 54 articles.

The Law states that education "refers to the process of educational development or training for physical, mental and spiritual development through all activities that allow learners to obtain a set of knowledge, skills, capacities and values to become individuals who are useful for themselves, their families, their communities, the nation and the world" (RGoC, 2007, p. 2). Perhaps most significant in this definition is what is missing. There is no specific mention of the economic element of education that is so prevalent in the multinational policy directives. In addition, the Law on Education recognizes all forms of education, including non-formal education. I turn next to describing the government's policy of non-formal education.

7.1.5 Additional National Education Policies

In 2002, the Royal Government of Cambodia passed the Policy of Non-Formal Education. In the Policy of Non-Formal Education, the Royal Government states that non-formal education is as important as the formal education system. In addition, they feel that non-formal education is necessary within a global context as it aligns with the education for all mandate, in that non-formal education leads to a lifelong learning environment. This is socially and culturally significant for a country such as Cambodia where there is a high illiteracy rate among adults and youths (RGoC, 2002).

In addition to the Policy of Non-Formal Education, the Ministry of Education, Youth and Sport also created and adopted a National Policy for Curriculum Development (2005-2009) (MoEYS, 2004) and a Child-Friendly School Policy (MoEYS, 2007). The former was adopted in December 2004 and the latter was adopted in December 2007. Each of these policies relates directly to the education reform agenda, specifically all of the national education policy documents discussed in this thesis. Throughout these documents several key topics became apparent and these will be discussed below.

7.2   Topics present in the Cambodian national policy documents

7.2.1   Purpose of education (formal vs. informal education)

As was discussed earlier, in the multinational policy documents there is a real focus on the use of education as a tool for poverty reduction. The idea is that education can reduce poverty by teaching individuals marketable skills that would enable them to gain better employment opportunities. The Cambodian national education policies do mention the economic connection to education; however, it is not their priority for a quality education system. I came to this conclusion when comparing and contrasting the information from the multinational and Cambodian documents that was coded during the content analysis. Specifically, I was very interested in the content that came out in the codes "perspectives held by subjects". In these codes, I looked for things that would indicate each organization's ideas about the purpose of education which would come out in their goal statements and objectives.

Perhaps indicative of the post-conflict nature of the country, the Royal Government advocates that all individuals should gain skills that allow them to work harmoniously with others, show responsibility in matters of morality and have an

understanding and appreciation of other people and other cultures, civilizations, and histories that lead to the building of a public spirit (MoEYS, 2004).

The Royal Government holds that an impact can be made on reducing poverty through non-formal education. One of the biggest concerns for the multinational financial agencies is that there is a great deal of inefficiency in the Cambodian education sector, highlighted by the high student repetition and dropout rates. The Cambodian government is also concerned with this. For the multinationals, the prime reasons for the repetition and drop out rates were economic. Poor students were unable to afford the cost of education. Therefore, their solution was to implement and then expand a scholarship program.

The purpose of education reform in Cambodia, from a multinational perspective, is to instil a culture of formal learning which will lead to a more economically prosperous society, instil a business-like attitude across every sector of society. However, this is a long and arduous task and the documents indicate that the use of non-formal education can help the transition to the social acceptance of formal education as a norm, while also using education to develop socially and culturally responsible individuals. To help in this transition, they encourage the involvement of a variety of ministries to encourage an "education environment". These ministries include the Ministry of Culture and Religion and the Ministry of Information (RGoC, 2002). In terms of the purpose of education, non-formal education includes programs for increasing functional literacy for youth and adults; equivalency programs for out-of-school children and youths; short-term income generation skills training; family education for early childhood development (including HIV/AIDS education and childhood and maternal health education); and post-literacy programs which sustain and expand levels of literacy (RGoC, 2002). These are all very

manageable and community-based. They are also programs that can be implemented by community leaders and can be taken to people.

Reforms throughout the 1990s failed to take local context and culture into account. In 1996, three years after the re-installation of democratic political rule, the education sector still had not provided the benefits that were anticipated to Cambodians and their investors. Cambodia remained a principally rural country focused around an agricultural lifestyle. The first reforms throughout the 1990s were geared at constructing a capitalist, manufacturing-centred country. Yet, the literature demonstrates that this was not possible given existing social arrangements in Cambodia. According to Verkoren (2005) and Ayers (2000), this lack of regard for local context led to the disappointing results of the initial reforms. Basic education was needed at first rather than the straight marketization of formal education. Students and communities had to re-adjust to having regular, formalized education. Verkoren (2005) states that post-conflict education reform needs to take pre-war precedents and the immediate economic needs of the local community into account if they are to be successful and reach a basic stage of development. Yet, globalization critics hold that in situations such as this, there is little recognition of local context as the sole focus is on the promotion of the neo-liberal global market system. In the case of Cambodia, the research showed that attention needed to be paid to teaching practical skills in agricultural methods, basic manufacturing, medicine, and administrative management to help the country develop a working internal infrastructure before reaching out for global initiatives (Verkoren, 2005).

The Cambodian policy documents indicate that the Royal Government is aware of the failure of earlier reforms and sees the solution in non-formal education. Therefore, they devised a national policy of non-formal education that is geared toward meeting the

social and cultural needs of Cambodian individuals and communities. The Cambodian

policy documents demonstrate the government's belief that a balanced system between

formal and non-formal education (education that takes place outside of recognized

educational institutions) is a key for successful education reform. The Policy of Non-

formal Education states:

> While quality formal schools may eventually (in 25 or 30 years) become the most common modality for achieving basic education for most children and youth, creating such a school system is still a long way off in Cambodia and a generation of children and youth can not be denied their right to an education in the meantime. At the same time, the long-term goal of building and maintaining a formal education system requires a pro-learning environment of educated parents and young adults who value education sufficiently to support their children and provide time and resources for learning. Non-formal education modalities are particularly appropriate to providing this education base (RGoC, 2002, p. 7).

This quotation suggests a commitment to both formal and non-formal education systems.

Non-formal education meets the cultural reality of the learning environment currently in

Cambodia, it can be rolled out relatively cheaply since there are already elements in

communities, and it meets international demands for a decentralized system. However,

financial agencies have tended to place little value on the non-formal sector.

7.2.2   *Partnership and capacity building*

As was discussed in the previous chapter, the importance of partnerships in the

development process is a common topic throughout the multinational policy directives.

Each organization had a slightly different notion of the role of and their place within a

respective partnership. For example, the World Bank saw partnership among financial

groups and the Ministries of Cambodia as a key to efficiency and quality. In contrast, the

Asian Development Bank saw partnerships with the private sector as the key to education

reform in Cambodia. Within the Cambodian national education policies there is also an

emphasis on the value of development partnerships. Yet once again, there is a different

perception of and purpose for those partnerships. The Cambodian policy documents indicate that partnership is a part of a development process that will ultimately lead to independence for the government, its institutions, and its citizens. For example, the 3rd ESP states, "The shift from donorship to partnership and towards government ownership demonstrates good collaboration from all stakeholders" (MoEYS, 2005a, p. 2). This statement demonstrates how the Royal Government of Cambodia sees partnerships with international agencies as a temporary state as they re-establish a viable infrastructure and form of governance.

According to the Royal Government, the creation and adoption of their national education policy documents, including the ESSP, was a highly collaborative process. For instance, the World Bank dedicated all their funding to the Education Sector Support Project. Throughout the introduction to the ESSP there are several key statements about how the Ministry recognizes the importance of sector-wide consultation. However, there is very little mention of specific multinational agencies. In addition when there is recognition of financial support it is always mentioned after all national and domestic acknowledgments. In the introduction, the MoEYS, states that the ESSP creation process was done to ensure that all key stakeholders were consulted and all levels of the education sector participated including province and district level representatives, Ministry representative, NGO communities, and donors (MoEYS, 2005b). There is little emphasis on international assistance throughout the Cambodian national policies.

This can also be found in the content of the Cambodian policy documents. I once again separated the content according to the codes listed in chapter 4. For the Cambodian government's ideas concerning partnership I looked at the content that fit into the "strategy" and "setting/context" codes. The term partnership is not used nearly as much

in the Cambodian content as in the multinational policy directives. For example, in the 3rd ESP, the term partnership is used only 15 times and only twice does it refer to partnerships with external donors. In a more striking example, in the Policy on Non-Formal Education, the term partnership is used 16 times and in each time the term is used in conjunction with non-governmental organizations. These examples demonstrate how there is a move from an emphasis on international and private partnerships within the multinational documents to an emphasis on partnerships with non-governmental organizations, local and provincial representatives, and community groups.

However, more recent national education policy documents indicate a further shift in government priorities around the notion of partnership. The Law on Education (2007) article 29, guarantees the use of partnership in the education sector. Article 29 states, "The state shall widely open the participation of the relevant stakeholders such as public and private sector, national and international organizations, non-governmental organizations and communities in the process of development, draft, monitoring and assessing the implementation, the review and the amendment of national education policies, plans and strategies" (RGoC, 2007). Two years earlier the government was stating that partnership was part of a progression toward government ownership. That same government has now written into law the right of international organizations to participate in the development and amendment of national education policies.

However, in the above article, the Royal Government also includes non-governmental organizations (NGOs) in the list of acceptable partners in the development of education. The policy documents illustrate the Cambodian government's desire to involve NGOs as partners in educational development. The emphasis on partnership stems from the government's awareness of its limited ability to fund its educational

programs, and awareness of the capacity of NGOs to work in disadvantaged communities.

In particular, the policy documents indicate a desire from the government to involve

NGOs in the expansion of the non-formal education sector. For instance, in the Policy of

Non-Formal Education (RGoC, 2002), the Prime Minister acknowledged the

government's need to find all available funds and technical assistance to develop the non-

formal education sector. The main reason for involving NGOs in the non-formal sector is

their experience working with highly disadvantaged communities, where individuals are

unable to attend formal education institutions due to their poor economic or social

situations (RGoC, 2002). The documents indicate the government's awareness of the

existing work that NGOs are doing with piloting and implementing non-formal education

programs, and desire to build on these partnerships and expand programs to meet national

education goals in this area.

However, the success of the partnerships advocated in the national policy

documents remains in question as a great many resources are needed to complete

education reforms in Cambodia and a reliance on multinational financial assistance will

continue. Because of the continued need for financial aid, a third topic emerged in the

Cambodian national education policies and that was the drive for good governance.

7.2.3   *Good governance*

One of the key concepts driving the development agenda is the notion of good

governance, as reviewed in the previous chapter. The World Bank is particularly

interested in ensuring that their financial assistance goes to countries that score relatively

well [highly] on their Country Policy and Institutional Assessment which measures a

nation's policy environment and administrative capabilities. The CPIA is based on an

index of 24 parameters set by the World Bank to determine if their aid is being used for

good governance or if their projects are held back due to poor governance and corruption (Ritzen, 2005). At the time of the latest Country Assistance Strategy (CAS) and Education Sector Support Program (WB ESSP) in Cambodia, 96.6% of all World Bank aid went to countries that had a ranking of "relatively good" in terms of their policy environments, which equated to a score of 3.0 or better on their CPIA (Hatcher, 2007). The World Bank is able to enforce their rules through the denial of financing for those countries who do not maintain a certain standard. This relatively good environment means that the country has decent policies for the "productive use of development assistance for poverty reduction" (World Bank, 2004, p. 14). This index is very interesting in that it is part of the "strategic selectivity" program espoused by the Bank when determining how they are to distribute money to the poorest countries in the world. Therefore, the governments of these countries need to be accountable to the World Bank officials for the types of policies they pass and how they operate their social institutions. If they do not maintain a positive policy environment, they will not receive funding. In turn, that positive nature of the policy environment is determined based on how "effective" it has been in rebuilding the economic structure in Cambodia. This effectiveness has been an issue in the past and in current reform programs, leading many to be deemed as failures.

The question of good governance is of particular importance in Cambodia where corruption and a weakened bureaucracy have been issues in the past, particularly in the eyes of the multinational organizations. Therefore, one of the primary objectives for the Royal Government in general and the Ministry of Education, Youth, and Sport in particular is to remove any perception of poor governing and fiscal incompetence. As a result, they are very eager to emphasize throughout their policy documents how they are

addressing any shortfalls in previous administrations' abilities to govern in an internationally acceptable manner. As the Ministry of Education, Youth, and Sport states, they need to "strengthen good governance in all aspects to gain support and involvements from all commitment holders" (2007, p. 9).

As was discussed earlier, the Royal Government has created a Rectangular Strategy for development and reform. At the centre of this Strategy is the drive for good governance which is the underlying theme that is designed to infiltrate all areas of reform. Yet, one of the problems with this concept is that it is poorly defined in both the multinational and Cambodian documents. Content analysis, focusing on the "perspectives held by subjects" and "strategy" coding categories, demonstrates that what this entails at the core is a decentralized state focused on efficiency and fiscal responsibility. The terms efficiency, accountability, and transparency are prevalent throughout all Cambodian national policy documents. For example, in the ESSP the term efficiency appears a total of 53 times in all areas of the document which is only 56 pages in length. In addition, the term accountability appears 37 times in the 3rd ESP. Once again, the term accountability is prevalent throughout all sections of the Cambodian national education policy documents. Members of the state, its institutions, and its citizens are expected to be accountable for their actions and activities and these actions and activities are to be monitored through a series or reports, assessments, and evaluations. Key concepts, such as student performance, are translated into measurable targets for ease of assessment. Funding is used on those areas that effectively and efficiently utilize their resources to achieve maximum results. Those countries that display programs and policies that demonstrate this type of system will be deemed to be displaying good governance and will continue to receive financial assistance. In

Cambodia, multinational funding is essential for reform, particularly education reform, and their education policies demonstrate the move toward the type of system described above.

One of the prime concerns for the Ministry of Education, Youth, and Sport is the predictability of financial resources. For example, in the 3rd ESP it states that, "The Ministry recognizes that effective implementation of the ESP policy and strategy will require predictability of available resources" (2005a, p. 19). If the country is deemed to have slid into a situation of poor governance according to international standards, then those resources dry up and the Royal Government is left with a huge reform agenda that they can no longer carry out. Therefore, it is not surprising to see so many assurances of improved monitoring and reporting in their decentralized education sector. Under the targets listed for every priority program in the 3rd ESP is the promise of greater monitoring and accountability. Here are just a couple of examples of listed targets taken from the 3rd ESP that illustrate the government's commitment to good governance: an accountable and effective institutional and governance framework that ensures standards improvement and quality services needs to be put in place at a central, provincial, and district and school level (MoEYS, 2005a, p. 13); increase the schools' and training institutions' operational autonomy and accountability regarding operational budgets (MoEYS, 2005a, p. 13); increase transparency and improve performance monitoring and accountability of teachers, schools and post-secondary institutions (MoEYS, 2005a, p. 14). These types of targets and goals are evident throughout the MoEYS policies, and indicate their primary concern in meeting international standards for monitoring and accountability.

7.3   *Conclusions*

There are a variety of differences between the Cambodian national policy documents and the multinational policy directives. These include differing perceptions about the purposes of education, different understandings about the purpose and structure of partnerships, and the importance of good governance. In terms of the purpose of education, the Cambodian government has a much more holistic view. There is evidence throughout the policy documents that there is a focus on the cultural purposes of education in the national education policies. This is indicated in the emphasis on Buddist ideals in the Policy for Child Friendly Schools (2007) and the inclusion of a Local Life Skills Program in the National curriculum.

In relation to the use of the term partnership, the Cambodian documents indicate that the government sees partnership as part of a progression from donorship to ownership. This is in contrast to the views held by the multinational organizations.

A finally emphasis in the Cambodian national policy documents is in the insistence upon good governance. This is of such a prominent concern that the Royal Government has made good governance the centre of their rectangular strategy for development.

These differences between the multinational organizations and Cambodian government's documents and directives are not always extreme. In actuality they are often quite subtle. Yet, this subtlety can speak volumes about the various perceptions about education and demonstrate the complexities involved in reforming education in a collaborative manner in a post-conflict nation. The following chapter will further analyze the documents in relation to the research questions asked in this thesis.

Chapter 8: Analysis and discussion

The policy directives from the multinational organizations and the national policy documents from the Ministry of Education, Youth, and Sport in Cambodia share several similarities but also demonstrate some key differences. This chapter will elaborate on these similarities and differences and analyze what this may mean for educational reconstruction in Cambodia. A discussion of the major themes that cut across all of the documents and first touched upon in the previous two chapters will be the focus of this chapter. These themes include neo-liberalism and the marketization of education, the development of partnerships, and purposes of education.

The analysis will answer the research questions asked in this thesis. Once again, the research questions are:

- to what extent is globalization influencing education policy development in post-conflict Cambodia?

- how have multinational agencies influenced national education policy making in post-conflict Cambodia?

- whose needs are addressed in the policy documents and directives?

- what have been the consequences of international influence on Cambodian national education policy?

This analysis will look at areas such as international influence, needs and consequences.

8.1   *Analysis of the policies*

As was discussed in chapter 4, I used Levin's (2001) stage model as an analytical tool while conducting the policy analysis of the Cambodian national education policies in this thesis. I conceptualized Cambodia as the principal site in a vertical case study. In

this chapter, I will be further developing a vertical case study of Cambodia through the analysis. The vertical case study methodology is situated within a comparative and international education framework, as vertical case study allows for the situating of local knowledge within the larger global context (Vavrus and Bartlett, 2006). Marginson and Mollis (2001) have stated that in a globalized world nation-states are local agents of global force. Through the analysis undertaken in this chapter, I hope to demonstrate a case study of a situation where a national government acts as both agents of global and local pressures.

In his stage model, Levin has stated that there are four stages, origins, adoption, implementation, and outcomes. In this analysis, I have only explored the first two stages in relation to the Cambodian national education policies. I used the stage model to think about the development process of the Cambodian national education policies. Specifically, I found Levin's questions quite useful. He states that several key questions must be addressed when doing a policy analysis. These are: where did particular reform proposals come from? How did they become part of the government agenda, when so many ideas do not? What role did various actors and interests play in the development of reform programs? These questions guided my thinking when analyzing the origins of the Cambodian national policies and their relationship to the multinational organizations policy directives. Kingdon (1994) also influenced my thinking about the origins of policy and education reform. He believes that policies emerge in the interaction of three key elements: political events, problem recognition, and policy proposals. The interaction of these three elements will vary from setting to setting and therefore case study methodology is particularly relevant for policy analysis (Kingdon, 1994). These elements all come together in the origins of policy in Cambodia. Cambodia is a post-conflict

country and therefore there were political events, such as claims of corruption and military disputes (specifically with Thailand), that have a great deal of impact on the policy process in the country. These political events have allowed international organizations to take up places within the political structure of the country.

Problem recognition is also key in the origins of the policies being analyzed in this chapter. According to Levin (2001), "External influences on the definition of problems are wide ranging" (p. 7). The policy directives from the multinational organizations sought to recognize the perceived problems with education in Cambodia and these then influenced the origins of the national policies. I found this in the analysis of the documents.

In addition, the policy directives from the multinational organizations also act as the policy proposals. However, policy proposals have to be accepted by policy makers and this leads into the adoption stage of the policy process (Levin, 2001). I found it very difficult to separate the origins and adoption stages of the policy making process and this is why I chose to analyse the policies using these two stages of the model. All the Cambodian policies I analyzed had been adopted.

According to Levin (2001), adoption is "the process of moving from a policy proposal to an approved piece of legislation, regulation, or policy" (p. 8). What is of particular importance in the analysis undertaken in this thesis is that adoption is influenced by a government's commitment to a specific program (Levin, 2001). Therefore, I used the adoption stage to explore how committed the Cambodian government was to the proposals put forth from the multinational organizations. It is in the adoption stage that a degree of local agency can be best viewed as shall be discussed below.

8.2   Neo-liberalism and the marketization of education

The content analysis conducted in this study has lead to the conclusion that neo-liberalism is the key concept underlying the policy directives and documents under study in this thesis. I found it present in the themes that emerged and the overall reform agenda in Cambodia. As a result, I want to begin this chapter with a brief discussion of neo-liberalism's relationship to education.

As was discussed in an earlier chapter, one of the key aspects of a neo-liberal reform agenda is the shift from a state-centred system to a market-driven social, political, and institutional system (Haque, 1999). I have concluded that the policy documents analyzed in this thesis reflect a neo-liberal reform agenda, both on behalf of the multinational organizations and the Cambodian government. The drive toward neo-liberalism is reflected in the themes that emerge in the policy documents. These themes include: good governance, assessment and evaluation, decentralization, teacher and student accountability, partnerships, and the purposes of education, specifically the economic purposes.

In relation to this is the marketization of education which has been a particular trend since the 1980s when neo-liberal ideals infiltrated national and international political structures leading to calls for a shift from "welfarism" to "new managerialism" (Gewirtz and Ball, 2000). This shift has had a direct impact on education and education policy as the "economic imperative" of neo-liberalism came to dominate the educational agenda of national governments and multinational organizations (Tomlinson, 2001, p. 155).

Multinational organizations hold important political, economic, and social roles in the global social structure (Beckmann and Copper, 2004). Their influence can clearly be

seen in national education reforms such as those occurring in Cambodia. Beech (2009) points out that they become "new types of actors" who participate "in the 'business' of giving policy-oriented advice based on the transfer of 'solutions' from one context to another" (p. 344). In the case of Cambodia, the "new types of actors" in their policy making process include the World Bank and Asian Development Bank. Because of their emphasis on banking and finance, their policy-oriented advice and their policy directives emphasize a business-model approach that focuses on neo-liberal ideals such as efficiency, effectiveness, and accountability.

As I shall discuss in the following section, the policy documents and directives studied in this thesis support Larner's (2000) claim that a hybrid understanding of neo-liberal reforms exist, particularly in developing countries receiving aid from larger multinational financial organizations.

Throughout this chapter, this notion of different configurations of neo-liberalism and the understanding of neo-liberalism as political agenda, ideology, and governmentality will be woven into the discussion of the major themes present in the documents analyzed for this study beginning with governance. In addition, this will tie in with the discussion of the movement away from a learners-needs to an institution-needs perspective in neo-liberal reform agendas.

Neo-liberal ideology in education reform is evident in four key areas in the policy documents analyzed for this thesis. We see evidence of neo-liberalism within the education reforms related to good governance, decentralization, student assessment and accountability, and teacher policies and accountability. The next section I will analyze each of these areas of education reform.

8.3   Major themes across the documents

8.3.1   Good Governance

Globalization has created an economic and political system of global governance that is characterized by the prominence of global institutions such as the United Nations and World Bank. According to Tehranian (2002), "global institutions currently shape the rule-making, rule-enforcement, rule-adjudication, rule-communication and rule-surveillance functions of our global civilization" (p. 8). These global institutions exist with nation states; however, their global reach gives them power and scope beyond that of a national government. Thus, it is within this context of global governance that the Cambodian education reforms take place. The economic and political power of global institutions, such as the multinational organizations discussed in this thesis, exist in their ability to set rules and enforce those rules. The content analysis I undertook demonstrates that this ability is clear in the policy documents and directives, particularly in relation to the multinational organizations' demands for and insistence upon good governance from the Cambodian government.

The documents indicate that the multinational organizations hold that the majority of the blame for the failure of the development agenda lies with the Cambodian government and is seen to be due to their lack of good governance. This implies that the breaking of global governance rules leads to failure. This notion is indicative of the hegemonic nature of the global reform agenda espoused by many multinational organizations. The failure of developing nations to meet the rules of the dominant global institutions is given as the only reason for the failure of reform and development programs. There is no recognition that there could be deficiencies within the agenda itself.

The Country Assistance Strategy notes that poor governance in Cambodia is to blame for a reduced Bank Group effectiveness and the failure to achieve development outcomes in the country. This notion was then used as a filter through which projects the World Bank decided to fund flow. If a government is strongly committed to reforming its governance of a sector, then the World Bank and its partners would support a defined reform agenda with financial aid. I found it interesting that the CAS set out the WB ESSP as the first project under the new development paradigm. Much of the dialogue in the CAS has to do with the achievement of the Cambodian Millennium Development Goals.

Therefore, at the highest level, the Cambodian Government is accountable for their governing practices. If they fail to meet World Bank standards for effectiveness, the IDA will utilize their right to "strategic selectivity" and cease funding basic programs and policy directives in Cambodia. This demonstrates clearly the influence that multinational organizations have on Cambodian educational policy making.

The notion of accountability and effectiveness through good governance trickles down throughout the multinational funded educational projects. For example, in terms of the financial management and disbursement arrangements, money for the Education Sector Support Program is to be put only into special accounts. These accounts are monitored by a special World Bank Division (WBD) of the Ministry of Economy and Finance (MoFE) for the Royal Government of Cambodia (World Bank, 2005a, p. 40). Therefore, even at the Ministry level all financial operations are run through and by World Bank people and procedures. Tehranian (2002) talks about the "grudging partnership" that exists between national states and global institutions (p. 20). This is a prime example of that partnership. In this case, two national ministries are penetrated by

a global institution. Cambodia must grudgingly accept this situation in order to receive

the financial funding that makes the existence of a Ministry of Education, Youth, and

Sport necessary. Without the financial backing of the multinational organizations, the

Ministry of Education, Youth and Sport would be severely handicapped and unable to

carry out a full program of reform.

I found that the multinational organizations used Cambodia's past problems with

political corruption as a justification for their presence in the national ministries. For

example, WB ESSP states that a 2004 Country Procurement Assessment Review found

that in Cambodia, "corruption still pervades public sector activities and creates a

significant disincentive to foreign investment in the country" (World Bank, 2005a, p. 53).

The report also reveals the World Bank's perception that a lack of transparency has

created a system whereby domestic financial management systems and procedures could

not be relied upon to use public funds for authorized purposes (those laid out in the rules)

(World Bank, 2005a).

The Cambodian government policies also indicate the internalization of the notion

of effectiveness through good governance, efficiency, and accountability. This can be

seen in one of the key collaborative strategy papers that influenced the creation and

adoption of the 3rd Education Strategic Plan (ESP) and education reform in general, the

Royal Government of Cambodia's (RGoC) Rectangular Strategy Policy. According to

the Royal Government, the Rectangular Strategy is a key element used to support the

implementation of their political platform. What I find particularly interesting is that at

the centre of the rectangles is good governance which the Royal Government perceives to

be the core of their agenda, a key element of neo-liberal ideology. However, what makes

this particularly interesting is that the multinational financial agencies insist on an

improved governing structure to maintain their funding programs. The Cambodian government has internalized this focus on improved governance and made it a core aspect of their education agenda, thus demonstrating the influence of the multinational organizations.

The content analysis conducted for this study indicates that the Cambodian government's perception is that education's primary role is to increase the social capacity for development by creating a richer and deeper human resource base. The 3rd ESP states that education can be used for "enhancing capacity of human resources with technical and scientific skills that effectively respond to labour market needs" (MoEYS, 2005a, p. 8). This is very much in line with the World Bank and Asian Development Bank's principle that education's purpose is to enrich the economic structure of a country. The key to developing an education system capable of enriching the economic structure of the country, according to the multinational organizations, is to improve governance of that system according to a managerial business model.

The documents show that one of the ways of improving governance is through ongoing reforms to public administration. In accordance with this, the Royal Government instituted a program of Public Financial Management Reform (PFM). The purpose of this reform is to improve financial management and monitoring. How this relates to the 3rd ESP is that the management and monitoring of the 3rd ESP programs was to act as a pilot project for the PFM reforms. This then means that the Ministry of Education, Youth, and Sport is to be highly monitored throughout the course of the 3rd ESP by other ministries and international financial organizations who had particular interests in public financial management reforms. Some of the key tenets in the PFM reforms are the decentralization

and de-concentration of authority from the national level to the local level of bureaucracy (MoEYS, 2005a).

What I found to be particularly significant about these reforms is the insistence on the application of business principles on the education sector. These reforms are all about instilling a management culture in public institutions, such as education, in Cambodia. According to Ball (1992), the use of specialized managers excludes others from decision making processes and is ultimately about gaining control over the education system (p. 154). Therefore, those managers in charge of the PFM reforms had tight control over the financial decisions made within the education sector during the course of the 3rd ESP and their primary focus was on effectiveness, efficiency, and accountability as opposed to the educational enrichment of Cambodian students. This is indicative of the movement away from an education system focused on learner-needs to a system focused on institutional-needs. To reiterate, by instituting these reforms the Cambodian government has internalized and imposed a business model on the education sector.

At the international level, the MoEYS intends to demonstrate its commitment to effectiveness through good governance through the continued monitoring of and reporting on their fiscal plans. The MoEYS states, "It is also important to ensure sufficient information to all contributors to education costs in order for them to effectively judge on the value of current and future investments in the sector" (2005a, p. 18). The content analysis showed that fiscal responsibility is viewed as the hallmark of effectiveness and efficiency and the Royal Government and the Ministry of Education, Youth, and Sport are determined to demonstrate sound fiscal practices in the education sector. The drive for effectiveness in all areas of education is a key concern in the national policy documents.

The breakdown of priorities in the Cambodian Education Sector Support Program (ESSP) is also interesting in that it indicates things that the Royal Government feels they need to report on to the international, and, to a lesser extent, the national communities. For example, each priority program has its own financing plan that has to be clearly laid out and monitored. This demonstrates the global institution's method of rule-surveillance. In addition, the whole notion of accountability is clear as measurable targets are laid out for each priority program as is a plan for monitoring each program. This breakdown of the policies into priority programs also helps to indicate where the bulk of financial assistance is going to year by year.

One of the key arguments I am putting forward is that neo-liberal ideals underlie all the major themes in the policy documents and directives. So how does neo-liberalism relate to the current state of global governance and the resulting need for good governance in Cambodia? I believe that the policy documents and directives demonstrate that neo-liberalism and the related notion of good governance are inextricably connected. To make this argument, I want to go back to the notion of neo-liberalism as a form of governmentality. At its most basic level, neo-liberalism calls for minimal government and the dominance of the market. However, less government does not necessarily mean less governance (Larner, 2000, p. 12). The new forms of governance that emerge under neo-liberalism encourage institutions to conform to a business model, which can be seen in the policy documents. Thus, governance in a neo-liberal environment becomes about efficiency, effectiveness, and accountability on a global scale to meet the demands of the global economic market. In this environment, social institutions, such as educational facilities, are to be governed through technologies such as audits and assessment indexes (Rose, 1993). Neo-liberal governance is about the grudging partnership between national

governments and global institutions that is formed in response to the demands of the global marketplace. Global institutions use their dominant position in this partnership to create rules, enforce rules, communicate rules and use forms of surveillance to ensure compliance (Tehranian, 2002). The policy documents and directives under study here demonstrate how rules are written into multinational policy directives (CPIA index requirements) as well as the forms of surveillance, such as the WBD within the MoFE. In contrast, the Cambodian national education policies demonstrate how the need to comply with the rules becomes internalized and part of a national agenda that is reflected in national education policies. This demonstrates how the global political power of institutions such as the World Bank and Asian Development Bank (ADB) does not just act upon national governments but also constructs them in particular ways (Larner, 2000, p. 18).

8.3.2   Decentralization

Decentralization is another aspect of the neo-liberal reform agenda. The justification for decentralization is tied into the drive for increased educational efficiency and quality. The rationale is that local needs must be addressed at a local level. However, since education is a national endeavour there must be some consistency and strong connections must exist between all stakeholders to ensure quality and efficiency. In a decentralized system of education, the political contract of governing is re-written with new measures of accountability at all levels (Popkewitz, 2004). All members of a decentralized sector much be focused on effectiveness and efficiency in order to maximize educational reforms. In a decentralized system of education, institutional-needs are often prioritized over learner-needs as efficiency is of the utmost concern.

In order to create a decentralized system, there needs to be strong connections in place between public and private education service providers and international financial agencies and local officials. However, it is questionable whether the dependence on these connections and co-operation between stakeholders can lead to anything but an efficient system.

The structure of the MoEYS now reflects the move toward decentralization. In total, the MoEYS has 24 provincial education offices and 182 district education offices. In total, the Ministry has over 80, 000 education personnel and this is about half of the total public service in Cambodia (SEAMEO INNOTECH, 2003). This decentralized structure has however led to several administrative issues. Culturally, the trend is to look to higher authorities for the approval of decisions. Because of the fact that expected regulations outlining roles and responsibilities for provincial, district, and community level jobs were delayed, a situation emerged where there was unclear delegated authority (SEAMEO INNOTECH, 2003).

The documents I examined indicate that the MoEYS is not to be responsible for the overall education policy direction and project oversight in this decentralized system. This task will go to a decentralized inter-ministerial Steering Committee (World Bank, 2005a). The committee will include representatives from the following Cambodian ministries: the Ministry of Labor and Vocational Training, the Ministry of Economy and Finance, the Ministry of Planning, the Council of Administrative Reform, the Ministry of Justice, the Ministry of Interior, the Ministry of Women's Affairs, the Ministry of Rural Development, the Ministry of Urban and Land Management, and the Ministry of Social Affairs and Youth Rehabilitation (World Bank, 2005a). The Steering Committee is responsible for approving the annual programs and budget allocations. This arrangement

creates a situation where it will be difficult for a committee with representatives from such a vast and varied group of ministries to create a more efficient system than one that is centralized within the Cambodian Ministry of Education, Youth, and Sport whose prime focus is education. The decision making process must be long and arduous with so many stakeholders involved with different agendas and concerns. Yet, according to the policy documents and directives, this type of committee is set to be the cornerstone of a more decentralized, efficient education system in Cambodia.

In addition, I found one of the primary tenets of the WB ESSP to be the strengthening of decentralized *quality* education service delivery. The delivery of quality education services in a decentralized system depends upon regulated provincial/district/cluster level supervision. Each of the levels must work in tandem to ensure that reforms and finances trickle down through the various levels. In addition, they must all be in agreement about what types of reforms are required and expected. Yet this is difficult, especially in a place like Cambodia where there is great diversity between communities, regions, and educational experiences. One of the first attempts at decentralization in Cambodia has been the implementation of cluster schools.

The Cambodian government first introduced cluster schools in 1995. The clustering of schools was seen to be ideal for the rural, widely dispersed setting in Cambodia. The cluster schools consist of a group of five to six geographical proximal schools that are organized into a mutual support network (Pellini, 2007). Within the clustering, there is a core school that is responsible for the administrative duties associated with all schools in the cluster. Then there are satellite schools attached to the core. The leader of the cluster is the principal of the core school as he/she is the head of the Local Cluster School Committee (Pellini, 2007). Initial attempts to decentralize the

operations associated with Cambodian educational facilities through cluster schools were generally unsuccessful and the MoEYS remained in charge of a still centralized system. However, this changed as financial organizations took a real interest in education reform and the process of decentralization. Recent support of the cluster system has led to a form of financial support that sees distribution of grants to schools and clusters after local proposals are submitted (Pellini, 2007). The reforms proposed in the WB ESSP led to operational budgets created by and disbursed directly to individual clusters and schools. The system aims for decentralized school budgets and operational plans. Therefore, these responsibilities shift from a national level down to the local level and are an example of decentralization in education reform.

However, one of the issues with the recent reforms to the cluster school system is that the WB ESSP is designed to target ten impoverished provinces/municipalities. Therefore, there will be inconsistent implementation of the cluster school system across the whole country which can lead to problems in the education sector. I would argue that the directing of money to only ten provinces/municipalities does not take the needs of all Cambodian students into account. As a result, the cluster school system could lead to greater discrepancies between Cambodian students as they are being introduced to stricter forms of national and international assessment and accountability

8.3.3   Student Assessment and Accountability

The policy directives and documents I analyzed in this thesis demonstrate a concerted effort by both the Cambodian government and multinational financial organizations to implement an institutional-needs system of education. Neo-liberal ideals hold that the success of an educational system is increased if it operates according to a capitalist business model. Parents and students are viewed as clients, supervisors as

managers, and teachers as labourers. To maximize economic returns, effectiveness, efficiency and accountability must be stressed at all levels of the system. In this model, the purpose of education becomes the improvement of the economic structure of the nation. I argue that the multinational policy directives certainly indicate that this is the intended purpose of their funding of education reforms in Cambodia. However, as will be discussed later, the Cambodian policy documents give a different indication of what the purpose of education should be.

As was just discussed, accountability is a key element of neo-liberal ideology and reform as it is indicative of a managerial business model. In Cambodia, one of the major reforms laid out in the multinational policy directives and the national education policies is the creation of a National Assessment Monitoring System (World Bank, 2005a; World Bank, 2005b). The National Assessment System (NAS) evaluates education quality and student achievement at the primary and secondary levels by using a series of standardized tests (World Bank, 2005a). The standardized tests are to be carried out in grades 3, 6, and 9 in the Khmer language and mathematics. The purposes of these tests are to appraise student competencies, uncover variables associated with student achievement, inform policy development, and provide pedagogical inputs for enhancing teaching and learning practices (World Bank, 2005a, p. 6). In general, the NAS is used by government officials to make teachers, administrators, and students accountable for their academic achievements and school performance in order to make them more effective in the rebuilding of the economic structure of the country.

The shift to assessment and accountability in education reform has been taken up across a wide range of settings. In Ontario, Canada for instance, the Education Quality and Accountability Office (EQAO) was established in 1996. What is really interesting in

this situation is that EQAO in Ontario also tests students in grades 3, 6, and 9 in language and mathematics. In both Cambodia and Ontario, an assessment institution is used as a means of educational accountability. In addition, there is a longer, more entrenched history of standardized assessment in the United States and the United Kingdom. In the United Kingdom, the Education Reform Act of 1988 put the issues of assessment and accountability to the fore (Dann, 2002). Under the Reform Act of 1988, a new national curriculum was implemented alongside of national assessments that sought to meet perceived national needs and ensure the accountability of teachers, students, and administrators (Dann, 2002). In the United States, nearly every state has made statewide assessment mandatory (Cooper et al., 2004). According to Cooper et al. (2004), student testing has become the principal way to provide state accountability for education (p. 193). In many cases, performance of state assessments is tied into school based rewards and punishments. For example, in Texas, schools are ranked on the basis of student performance on the state assessments. Schools that rank in the top two categories are given cash bonuses (Cooper et. al, 2004). This situation is found throughout most American states.

What is significant about the development of the National Assessment System in Cambodia and other similar institutions around the world is that they are indicative of the broader business model promoted under neo-liberalism. Specifically, Ball (2004) relates the spread of assessment systems to the theory of performativity. Performativity refers to a mode of regulation that "employs judgements, comparisons and displays as means of control, attrition and change". The results on the standardized tests come to serve as "measures of productivity or output" (Ball, 2004, p. 143). The NAS in Cambodia is a

part of this new system of performativity where educational achievement becomes a quantifiable measurement.

Gewirtz and Ball (2000) discuss how this process has occurred in the United Kingdom through a switch from a policy program of "welfarism" to "new managerialism". In this environment of "new managerialism", the purpose of schooling becomes about raising standards and student performance which are measured through the use of standardized tests (p. 255). I surmise that this is the same mindset behind the implementation of the National Assessment System in Cambodia. It is another example of how globalization has led to multinational organizations "selling" policy directives from one context to another.

The content analysis indicates that the multinational policy directives also seek to make educational officials accountable to community members. For example, the WB ESSP states that one of its goals is to "encourage community mobilization for educational programs, more active community participation in school governance, parental voice in school affairs, and local accountability through the dissemination of information on school effectiveness" (World Bank, 2005a, p. 6). The WB ESSP continuously espouses the important role community members can play in assuring quality in their local educational facilities. Perhaps most interestingly is that the greatest discussion of community participation in the education sector is in Annex 13 of the WB ESSP. This Annex is subtitled "Promoting Good Governance" (World Bank, 2005a). The WB ESSP holds that one of the keys to good governance is a strengthening of the "accountability loop" between school service providers and members of their community. This strengthening of accountability goes hand in hand with the drive toward decentralizing educational authority.

I found that one of the key concerns of the multinational organizations was the high repetition rate of Cambodian students. One of the strategies they propose in the policy directives to help alleviate the repetition rate is to introduce "cost-effective remedial programs" (ADB, 2004a). These programs are designed to help students progress to the next grade level in a shortened time period. It would be much more cost-effective to have these students complete a short remedial program rather than have them repeat an entire year of school at the same grade level. Doing a short remedial program for the primary grades is quite complex given that the development of basic skills such as reading and writing is a long-term process. As a result, effectiveness may not lead to quality. In addition, this program shows how neo-liberal education reforms are moving education away from a learners-needs agenda to an institutional-needs agenda. A short remedial program is certainly more beneficial for the institution rather than the learner. The ADB sees the remedial programs existing in all levels of education. The notion is that catching kids at the primary level in remedial programs will improve efficiency at higher levels by reducing the need for remedial subject upgrading (ADB, 2004a). In sum, the issue of repetition rates of students has come to be associated with inefficiency and overall ineffectiveness of the educational system, rather than an equity or fairness issue with deep historical and cultural roots.

8.3.4   Teacher Policies and Accountability

In addition to wanting to improve student efficiency and accountability, the multinational organizations and Cambodian government have also targeted teacher effectiveness, efficiency, and accountability. The documents indicate their commitment to a more efficient use of staff and facilities. The signs of efficiency monitored by the ADB are the pupil teacher ratio (PTR) and the pupil class ratio (PCR), numbers which are

easily calculated and able to be understood by individuals in the financial sector. The pupil teacher ratio at the time of the ESDP II's adoption was 57 and the PCR was 45-46 pupils per class (ADB, 2004a). The ADB is actually very pleased with these numbers. This is again, a sign that there is a greater emphasis on an institution-needs agenda rather than learner-needs agenda for education reform, as 45-46 pupils in a classroom is never ideal for either the teacher or the students.

The ADB is also pleased by the increase in the number of educational facilities that have become double shift institutions. These are educational facilities that have two shifts of students and teachers and are therefore operating all day. In the past, Cambodian schools tended to be open only half the day as the children were expected to be helping their families during the rest of the day. The increase in the number of double shift schools indicates either a shift in cultural practices so that children can be in school all day or an increase in local enrolment and thus enough students to warrant two shifts of instruction. In the majority of Cambodian areas, the latter is true; however, the former is becoming more common in urban areas.

In terms of teacher efficiency and accountability, the ADB has several objectives listed in their education policy directives. First of all, the ADB suggests that teacher employment and training should be done using a supply and demand approach, a business-minded approach. The ESDP II reports that, "forward planning will take account of the projected fall in overall enrolment and expansion of secondary enrolment, requiring a reorientation of teacher supply and demand and staff deployment strategies" (ADB, 2004a, p. 4). Therefore, the suggestion is that to make a more efficient and effective use of teacher training funds, teaching candidates should be placed in targeted programs based on market demands. The current need, according to the ADB, is for

secondary teachers in science, math, and information communication technologies who are willing to work in poor communities (ADB, 2008). Therefore, the documents I analyzed indicate that the most efficient and effective use of funds is to target individuals who fit this profile.

Another approach utilized by the ADB to improve teacher effectiveness, efficiency and accountability is the expansion of performance based teacher allowances. That is teachers who receive good performance ratings will receive financial bonuses and access to prime teaching assignments. Part of the teacher's performance assessment is how well their students perform on the national tests, the justification for this being that, it is a more effective and efficient use of funds to reward good teachers in order to encourage their continued presence in the field. This also ties into the argument that a quality system is an efficient system. However, once again, this education reform is tied into the marketization of education. According to Ball (1992), techniques like the use of performance based teacher allowances subject teachers to "the logics of industrial production and market competition" (p. 153). I would argue that student performance and effectiveness become symbolic of economic gain, rather than the educational and social development of the student.

One of the reasons for focusing on improving teacher quality is that in the recent past in Cambodia, teachers have been poorly trained and quite scarce as a result of the Khmer Rouge and their direct targeting of educated individuals. Teachers have also been very poorly paid and often expected informal payments from parents for their services to supplement their official income. Although the Royal Government recognizes this as a common practice in the education sector, the multinational financial organizations have viewed it as an example of corruption and bribery. They have also seen informal teacher

payments as contrary to their pro-poor agenda as they see it as a major barrier for poor

individuals seeking to enter the formal education sector. However, a flaw in this

assessment is that they fail to acknowledge that the teachers themselves also fit into that

poor category. However, the multinational financial organizations have demanded that

informal payments be discouraged and eventually outlawed. They are not considered

cost-effective. In order to offset the loss of the informal payments as part of teacher's

incomes, the MoEYS has come up with a plan to ensure quality teaching practices within

a pro-poor system. In the 3rd ESP and ESSP, they are have advocated the implementation

of a strict staff performance appraisal system with appropriate reporting procedures

(MoEYS, 2005a; MoEYS, 2005b).

In addition to this is the movement to tie teacher salaries to their performance

appraisals, an idea promoted by the ADB and common in neo-liberal education reform

agendas. According to the 3rd ESP, "[t]he elimination of informal contributions, offset by

improved performance-based teacher salaries and allowances is designed to create a

climate within which Government and communities are prepared to hold school directors

and teaching and non-teaching staff accountable" (MoEYS, 2005a, p. 19). This new

system of performance based salary is intended to create a "more effective institutional

framework for pro-poor access as well as quality improvement" as it aims to eliminate

informal payments to teachers (MoEYS, 2005a, p. 19). The Cambodian education policy

documents also place a great deal of emphasis on the performance of teachers and

individuals at the local level. They are to be held accountable for the local education

institutions. This is in line with the concept of decentralization. Outputs at the local level

are much easier to measure. Measurements at the national level are more difficult and the

focus is primarily on fiscal responsibility.

I want to put forth the argument that the attempt to eradicate the traditional payment system within the Cambodian education sector is an example of how "policy-oriented advice" from the international community gets taken up within a national context (Beech, 2009). In this case, multinational financial organizations presented a "solution" to a perceived "problem". The informal payments to teachers were seen by the multinational organizations as a problem because they were viewed as neither efficient nor effective in promoting the development of the economic structure of Cambodia. They were also very difficult to account for as they were outside of the official accountability and monitoring system. As a result, they ran counter to the policy-oriented advice given to the Royal Government of Cambodia by the multinational financial organizations and were addressed in the Cambodian national policy documents. Ball (1992) explains that in situations such as this, where a poor country is dependent on international financial assistance, "attempts are made to displace issues of moral and cultural identity with the imperatives of administrative efficacy" (p. 154). Informal teacher payments were part of Cambodian, and many other developing nations', cultural identity, yet within the Cambodian policies themselves they were discouraged in favour of effectiveness and efficiency.

So once again, it can be demonstrated that neo-liberalism has deeply influenced Cambodian education policy. The use of assessment and accountability measures for teachers and students is very much in line with the shift toward a business-model for education. The influence of neo-liberalism can also be seen in the following two themes: partnerships and purposes of education.

8.4   Partnerships

The use of partnerships is espoused in all the policy documents read for this thesis. However the understanding of the roles, makeup, and positions of these partnerships vary between organizations and the Cambodian government. The multinational organizations see partnerships as a key to an efficient reform agenda while the Cambodian government sees partnership as a temporary stage in the movement toward government independence. I feel that the Cambodian case is in line with Buenfil Burgos' (2004) notion that the term partnership has become a "floating signifier" within educational policies and reform (p. 55). Specifically, he states that "the meaning of this word changes in each particular moment and site of enunciation" despite the appearance in educational policies that there is a universal, natural value attached to the term (2004, p. 55). Again, I think this notion can be applied to other concepts such as the notion that neo-liberal reforms lead to a hybrid political imaginary. This can be seen throughout the policy documents reviewed in this thesis.

The notion of partnership is another example of neo-liberal education reform. Franklin et al. (2004) also discuss how the term partnership has been taken up in educational reform policies in developing countries. Specifically, they indicate that partnership is becoming a key element of educational policies and this is indicative of changing patterns of governing. According to Franklin et al. (2004), "[t]he notion of partnership provides a way of understanding the regulative mechanisms of society in which the state as entity is only one of a number of sectors...in the governing of society" (p. 2). The use of partnerships allows other elements, such as multinational organizations, to become entities in the regulative mechanisms of a society through their provision of policy-oriented advice.

If partnership is indicative of changing patterns of governing and the term itself is in flux, there can be a great deal of (mis-) or multiple understandings of the roles and positions organizations, ministries, private enterprises and national governments are expected to take in any educational reforms. This complexity can be seen in the use of the term partnership throughout the policy documents analyzed for this thesis.

For example, in their policy directives I found that the World Bank tends to emphasize the importance of multinational-national partnerships and focus on partnerships to enhance financial accountability. They have many reasons for promoting this type of relationship. First, the World Bank sees the partnering of multinational agencies involved in education reform in Cambodia as providing an additional benefit to the relationship between the Royal Cambodian Government and the financial community. According to the CAS, the partnership of financial agencies "has also helped to ensure greater coherence and consistency in the messages that the four donors (World Bank, ADB, DFID, UNDAF) (and by extension the financial community) send the Government – and other Cambodian stakeholders – about their objectives and requirements" (World Bank, 2005b, p. 1). A partnership between the major multinational and national financial organizations helps to send a clear message to the Cambodian government about what type of conditions and expectations come along with the financial assistance. The partnership also limits the Cambodian government's ability to seek financial assistance elsewhere if they are unhappy with the conditions of one financial agency. Once the financial agencies form a relationship, the Cambodian government has little choice but to accept the objectives and requirements of the major financial partnership if they are to receive any amount of substantial funding.

I would conclude that the use of partnership among multinational organizations allows for the multinational organizations as a group to gain enough of a political stakehold to influence the governing structure of the Cambodian government. The term partnership is used to promote a particular agenda and that agenda is focused on institutional-needs of the country.

In addition to this political and financial partnership espoused by the World Bank, their documents also promote the value of partnerships among all educational stakeholders. I question whether this is just rhetoric. The multinational documents talk repeatedly about the value of partners in the private sector and civil society when conducting education reform (World Bank, 2005a; World Bank, 2005b). This varied understanding of the term partnership allows the multinational organizations to influence national government directives but also to reach all levels of the education sector through their partners in a decentralized, neo-liberal system (Popkewitz, 2004). Interestingly, the discussion of partnership goes alongside with the discussions about increasing efficiency within Cambodian society in general and the education sector in particular. For example, the CAS demonstrates how a partnership among community members and financial agents helped to reduce the time and effort required to achieve the goals of a past project (World Bank, 2005b) while the WB ESSP demonstrates how partnerships promote harmonization and help avoid overlapping or duplication in reform efforts (World Bank, 2005a). Therefore, the whole idea of using partnerships in development efforts and education reform in Cambodia is very much tied into the notion of creating an efficient educational system, which I discussed in the previous section.

Partnership is understood by the multinationals within an economic context. As it stands the ADB is the main financial provider for Cambodian educational reform. They

speak of the need to involve other institutions and organizations, from the public and the private sector, in educational financing. In the ADB policy directives, there is a recognition that the Cambodian government is limited financially so there is a shift to discussions about partnerships with the private sector. It appears that the ADB wants to create and utilize partnerships with the private sector in order to offset the costs of rebuilding the education sector in Cambodia. The ADB is acutely aware of the costs of this rebuilding and seeking out private partnerships contributes another source of financing to the cause. The greatest increase in financial investment can come from the private sector. This can be seen in one of the recommendations from the ADB at the end of the last Country Strategy Program (2004) was for the Bank to work at improving aid coordination and mobilizing additional resources (ADB, 2004b). It seems clear after reading through the ESDP II that those additional resources are to come from the private sector.

In addition to domestic private partners there is also a drive within the ADB educational agenda to encourage international private education investment. Specifically, the ADB is very interested in seeing investment from private enterprises from other member countries. This is evident in the fact that they will cover the foreign currency exchange involved in the cost of items produced in and procured from ADB member countries (ADB, 2004a). The private sector partnership seems to be highly regional in nature. Despite this, partnerships are an important element of ADB educational objectives. Thus once again, the variance between the World Bank and Asian Development Bank's understanding of the use of the term partnership indicates how the term's meaning changes from one group to another.

The reasons for this changing nature have to do with control. The ambiguity of the term becomes quite politically productive as it allows for negotiation and dissension around who belongs in the partnership and what exactly it is created for (Buenfil Burgos, 2004). Membership in the partnership allows those organizations and governments particular say and influence over the agenda of the group (Beckmann and Cooper, 2004). I contend that inevitably, there will also be varying degrees of control between the members of the partnerships as they seldom are complete democracies. In the case of educational reform partnerships in Cambodia, the organizations with financial power tend to have political power as well in order to have their "policy-oriented advice" implemented in national education policies.

With that being said, the Cambodian government also sees value in partnership. However, I would argue that their perception is that partnership is part of a progression toward independence. The 3rd ESP makes the distinction between donorship and partnership. Donorship implies the process of just giving money with no other influence on how that money is spent. In contrast, partnership implies influence beyond the giving of money. Partnership indicates a working relationship used to develop institutions and government ownership. It is clear that external financial agencies have an active role in Cambodian social and education reform and development. The statement from the 3rd ESP also lays out the Royal Government's ultimate goal is to move away from a dependence on partnership to total government ownership.

The Ministry of Education, Youth, and Sport indicates in their policies that they have been particularly successful in establishing partnerships with the multinational financial organizations around the issue of harmonization of external assistance. This is in line with the desire of the World Bank to co-ordinate the aid programs of multinational

organizations to ensure greater efficiency. To support this assertion the Royal

Government of Cambodia, along with its development partners, issued a declaration on

harmonization and alignment (RGoC, 2004), which reiterated the governments'

"willingness to create an effective development partnership based on mutual

commitment, trust, respect, and confidence" (RGoC, 2004, p. 1). In creating this official

partnership, the Royal Government and its partners agreed to nine key tenets, including

the tenet that development assistance must be delivered in accordance with partner

country priorities and that all involved will promote harmonized approaches in global and

regional programs (RGoC, 2004).

     The declaration on harmonization is also very interesting in that it provides the list

of signatures from partners in the development process. The representative from the

Royal Government was His Excellency Keat Chhon who was the Minister of Economy

and Finance, rather than the Prime Minister or King of the country. In terms of the

development partners, there were representatives from the ADB, World Bank, UN and

European Commission. There were also several national representatives including the

Ambassador of Canada. This list indicates who has the largest stake and say in the

Cambodian development process.

     The above indicates that the Cambodian government also understands partnership

in economic terms. There seems to be recognition on the part of the Royal Government,

in their policy documents, that there will just not be enough financial and social resources

provided by multinational governmental organizations, and as such, alternate assistance

will be needed. For example, when discussing the implementation of the early childhood

education expansion priority program, the ESSP states that "[g]iven the limited scope for

Government provision of ECE, it will be important to mobilize non-Government

contributions including in-kind community contributions, private sector partnership financing, and complementary donor and NGO support" (MoEYS, 2005b, p. 4).

However, the real desire for NGO partnership seems to come in the area of non-formal education. The Royal Government has emphasised the expansion of the non-formal education sector, yet there was little allocated funding for it in the multinational policy directives. My content analysis shows that the multinational organizations are acutely interested in the formal system of education but are wary to invest their money in a non-formal sector. As a result, the Royal Government has had to look elsewhere for assistance in developing this sector. In the Policy of Non-Formal Education, the Prime Minister Hun Sen acknowledges that the Royal Government must find all available funds and technical assistance to develop the non-formal education sector. In this venture, the non-governmental organizations (NGOs) can play a key role. The main reason for this appears to be the NGO's placement in highly disadvantaged communities. The non-formal education sector is generally intended to target poorer communities and individuals who are unable to attend a formal education institution due to their economic and/or social situation. Utilizing NGOs that are already in place in many of the poorer communities could be very efficient for a government struggling with the financial realities of education reform. In addition, the Royal Government acknowledges that NGOs are already at the forefront of piloting and implementing non-formal education programs (RGoC, 2002). Their goal is to increase partnerships with these NGOs to have them expand their programs to help the Royal Government meet its national education goals by 2015.

I would surmise that the emphasis on partnership with NGOs that is consistent through the Cambodian government documents seems to serve two key purposes. The

first is the acknowledgement, on the Royal Government's behalf, that they will not be able to meet the education reform goals by 2015 through multinational financial assistance to the formal sector alone. Partnership between donors and the government is important but not enough. The Royal Government continually recognizes the fact that they need to partner with the private sector, informal community groups and NGOs. NGOs are a very acceptable partner in that they are already working in the non-formal education sector (a priority program in the ESSP) and they understand local needs. Therefore, this type of partnership can help Cambodian officials work toward their national education targets.

In addition, another possible reason for the Royal Government's leaning toward NGO partnership could have to do with their view that partnership is viewed as a step in the progression toward government autonomy. As was just discussed above, the ambiguous nature of the term partnership often has political purposes. NGOs are by definition non-governmental and therefore they have no governmental ties and aspirations. If the Royal Government truly wants ownership over the education sector, all other governmental ties will have to be cut. This cannot be done while large multinational financial organizations are partnering to develop and operate the sector and develop and amend national education policy. Interestingly, in the Law on Education, the NGOs are given the same rights as other international organizations to influence the education sector. Therefore, emphasizing NGO partnerships and making them key stakeholders in the education sector can allow the Royal Government to obey this law while working towards government ownership of education. Therefore, the tendency to venture toward NGO partnership, particularly in the non-formal sector – a sector which the Royal Government sees as more socially and culturally appropriate for Cambodia, can

be seen as an attempt to move beyond partnership to the government ownership

advocated in the 3rd ESP.

As can be seen in this discussion, the term partnership can have multiple uses and

understandings within the educational reform discourse. Partnerships are understood in

economic terms, political terms, and to a lesser extent, cultural terms. The emphasis on

partnership is attached to changing patterns of governing, particularly in a post-conflict

developing nation such as Cambodia. According to Buenfil Burgos (2004), partnership

can be

> both the road to salvation – to democracy and national progress, equity and control over corruption, the civil society involvement in education, and so on- and also the road to imperialist exploitation-that is, the withdrawal of government responsibility over public education (p. 73).

Within the policy documents analyzed in this thesis, this double purpose becomes very

clear and is indicative of the different configurations of neo-liberalism that are emerging

in Cambodia leading to the complex implementation of the reforms. The Cambodian

government hopes for the use of partnerships to be a temporary stage of national progress,

their salvation for development and yet the multinational organization policy directives

give no indication that this will be part of a progressive path. In fact, their "policy-

oriented advice" indicates an increase in international control over the education sector.

However, this control is not a given and the Cambodian government has shown attempts

at resistance particularly in their understanding about the purposes of education as shall

be discussed below.

8.5   *The purposes of education reform, economic and social justifications*

The final theme in the policy documents and directives analyzed for this thesis is

the purpose of education. I feel that this is important to examine because it is indicative

of each organization's or the country's values about education. Once again there are

some commonalities among the various stakeholders but there are also some major

differences. Specifically, there is a variation among the groups about how much

emphasis should be placed on the economic purposes of education and the social/cultural

purposes of education. On one hand, I found through the content analysis that the

multinational organizations hold the belief that the "rationale for learning is openly

technical-rationalist, economic and reductionist, and provides no reasons why learning

might be a good other than its economic usefulness" (Bottery, 2000, p. 19). In this

situation, the purpose of education is for the government to use learning to steer global

forces in beneficial (ie. effective and efficient) ways (Bottery, 2000). This again relates

back to the business model and the marketization of education. According to human

capital theory, a key sign of economic backwardness is the level of poverty among a

people. Therefore it is not surprising that the multinational organizations, key proponents

of human capital theory, based their education reforms around the concept of poverty

reduction (Beech, 2009). Poverty cannot lead to prosperity, and education, through the

investment in individuals, is the key to eradicating poverty in the view of the

multinational organizations. In Cambodia, poverty remains a major issue, as outlined in

chapter 6.

According to the World Bank, there is a great deal of evidence to support the

notion that reforms in the education sector can lead to improvements in living standards,

economic growth, public health, and most importantly, poverty alleviation. The World

Bank holds that education reforms that take place in a developing nation must be aligned

with the development of the nation's economic structures (World Bank, 1995). They

have two key priorities then in the funding of education reform. These are that the

reforms lead to a system where education can meet the economy's growing demands for adaptable workers and the education system is reformed alongside the economic system (Beech, 2009, p. 346). The role of the Bank in this reform agenda is to become a "Knowledge Bank" that is a global catalyst for the spreading of "cutting edge knowledge" that is necessary for poverty reduction and economic development (Beech, 2009, p. 346). Therefore, according to the World Bank and ADB, the purpose of education is solely economic. An improvement in a person and a nation's economic security is the key to a prosperous and viable future.

The ideology present in the multinational policy directives is that an educated person is a better paid person and better paid people are indicative of a strong economy. This follows human capital theory which holds that people and society in general will benefit economically through investments in people (Sweetland, 1996). It is assumed that education will increase and improve the "economic capabilities of people" (Sweetland, 1996, p. 341). A strong education system will lead to more skilled workers who will diversify the Cambodian economy and move it away from a dependence on subsistence agriculture. The discussion of the connection between education and poverty is very technical in the multinational policy directives. For example, the large number of unskilled agricultural workers in Cambodia are referred to as the country's "low human resource base" in the World Bank directives (World Bank, 2005a, p. 58). The multinationals hold that if the country's economy is to move into the production of goods with higher skill content, then there needs to be a more diversified, higher level human resource base.

The World Bank's poverty reduction strategy focused on starting at the bottom, that is ensuring quality basic education for all. The justification for this is that all

children need access to the very basics of education and routine of school in order to diversify their means of getting out of poverty. In contrast, the focus of the ADB's poverty reduction strategy is on lifelong learning opportunities. However, the economic purpose of education is the same between the two organizations.

In terms of addressing poverty, the ADB's EDSP II is designed to reform education in Cambodia into a market-responsive sector that allows for an increased level of educational attainment in the workforce and increased household income which is very much in line with human capital theory (ADB, 2004a). The ADB feels that the high incidences of poverty in Cambodia are related to the workforce's heavy reliance on low-productivity agriculture, the World Bank's low human resource base (ADB, 2004a). Most of the individuals in agriculture have little or no education and as such a connection can be drawn between education and income. As the ADB states, "incidence of higher levels of poverty correlates strongly with levels of participation in education and training and geographical variations in provision of basic education and skills training" (2004a, p. 1). A lack of education is directly correlated with the failure to achieve economic success. For the ADB, education is about skill attainment. Those skills that are most valued are those that translate to employability and therefore the ADB also emphasizes the economic purposes of education.

I contend that it is for this reason that the majority of ADB funding goes toward secondary education and skills training. The ADB has used the ESDP II to push for the strengthening of a network of eighteen provincial training centres. Prior to this, the Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) was centred in Phnom Penh with little provincial access. The creation of the eighteen centres goes alongside the desire to see the education sector in Cambodia decentralize. The provincial centres are a

part of the decentralization process. The provincial training centres are the cornerstone of the ADB's plan for demand-driven community based skills training. The goal is to use the provincial training centre as the hub of an educational network of skills training opportunities at the provincial, district, and commune level. It is a system similar to the cluster schools at the primary level. What is key to this program however is its emphasis on a demand-driven approach; this is in line with the Bank's attempt to implement a business model on education reform and focus primarily on the economic purposes of education.

The Cambodian government, while adopting much of the business based language of education reform emphasizing the economic purpose of education, has a much more holistic understanding of the broader purposes of education. The Cambodian government seems to hold with the belief that a monitored, efficient system is good for Cambodia. They acknowledge that corruption has been an issue in the past and know that reform is necessary. However, I would argue that the Cambodian government stops at giving primacy to the economic purposes of education and the institutional-needs agenda.

The Royal Government's vision, as laid out in the 3rd Education Strategic Plan, is to "establish and develop human resources of the very highest quality and ethics in order to develop a knowledge-based society within Cambodia" (2005a, p. 1). In addition, the MoEYS sees its mission as "leading, managing and developing education, youth and sport sector in Cambodia in responding to the socio-economic and cultural development needs and the reality of globalization" (2005a, p.1). These statements are very interesting in that the MoEYS recognizes the significance of globalization and sees it as their mission to help Cambodian citizens develop *economically* and *culturally* within a new global system. Yet more importantly, the 3rd ESP holds that a major purpose of education is to

develop a holistic individual able to operate in a proud national and international environment. In its overall objectives then the MoEYS sees the 3rd ESP and national education policy in general, as having nationally and internationally driven purposes.

According to the Royal Government, a quality education system creates quality individuals. The goals and objectives of Cambodian education are listed in the 3rd ESP. I contend that these goals and objectives interestingly demonstrate the above assertion. For example, the MoEYS state that they envision a system that creates graduates who are competitive in job markets worldwide and these graduates will drive Cambodia's economic and social development (MoEYS, 2005a). However, they then state that their overarching objective is to achieve the holistic development of Cambodian youth. In order to do this, the Ministry states in the 3rd ESP that within their education system they intend "to engender a sense of national and civic pride, high standards of moral and ethics and a strong belief in being responsible for the country and its citizens" (2005a, p. 1). The idea of creating a moral and nationalistic individual is particularly relevant in the Royal Government's push for a Local Life Skills Program in the curriculum development policy.

According to the Policy for Curriculum Development (2004), the aim of curriculum is to fully develop "the talents and capacities of all students in order that they become able people, with parallel and balanced intellectual, spiritual, mental and physical growth and development" (MoEYS, 2004, p. 1). Nowhere in this statement does it make mention that the goal of the curriculum is to produce an economically viable individual. This is also reflected in the content of this policy. The terms cultural, spiritual, and moral appear eleven times in relation to curriculum and student development. The term economic appears in the whole document three times and never in relation to curriculum

and student development. However, the policy does go on to say that when students

leave school they should have developed a love of learning that will allow them to pursue

employment (MoEYS, 2004). The Royal Government acknowledges the importance of

science and technology, but only in conjunction with innovation and creativity (MoEYS,

2004).

The Ministry of Education, Youth, and Sport breaks the school curriculum into

two distinct sections in their Policy for Curriculum Development. The first is comprised

of core subjects such as Khmer language and literature, mathematics, sciences, social

sciences, foreign languages, health and physical education. Students are expected to gain

a high level of knowledge about these subjects. The second element of the curriculum

program is a local life skills program. This program is intended to help students reach

their full potential to be effective members of society. The local life skills program is

written into the national curriculum at every level as the Royal Government sees it as the

most important element of education.

The Child Friendly Schools Policy also emphasizes the social, cultural, and moral

development of Cambodian youth. This policy stresses the importance of generating the

four compassions, which are: metha (empathy); karuna (loving kindness); obeka

(equanimity); muktetha (feeling arising from seeing reduction in suffering of others).

These are grounded in the Buddhist faith of the country (MoEYS, 2007). The spiritual

tone present in the Cambodian education reform agenda is much more in line with the

culture of the country as the Buddhist faith has historically been deeply ingrained in the

education sector.

Specifically, education was often taken up in the community wat with monks

being the teachers and instructors. However, like all individuals in the education sector,

Buddhist monks were also targeted by the Khmer Rouge. In total over 50, 000 Buddhist

monks were killed and all others were forced into manual labour camps as religion was

seen as detrimental to the country (Ross, 1987). The suppression of public Buddhist

practices continued during the communist Vietnamese occupation, although there were

attempts by Cambodian communities to re-establish a local community wat and monk

presence (Ross, 1987). Ross (1987) reports that although the outward practice of

Buddhism was often suppressed or discouraged over the last half of the 20th century, it

remained a pivotal part of Cambodian life and culture. The re-emergence of the Buddhist

faith into the public discourse has only commenced in the post-United Nations period.

This re-emergence officially began in 1991 when Buddhism was declared the state

religion (Harris, 2001). Since this declaration Buddhism has become tied to Cambodian

nationalism and cultural identity once again. This movement toward and embracing of

the Buddhist faith and values is present in the Cambodian national education policies.

For instance, within the Policy of Non-Formal Education the Royal Government

states that, "the main approach for human resource development is to develop human

resources with good health, knowledge, and a high level of culture" (RGoC, 2002, p.1).

Even when discussing human resources they feel that there must be a strong cultural

identity based on Buddhism running through their human resource base. In their stated

purposes of education, the Cambodian government has shown a real desire to meet local

needs and specifically the needs of individuals.

I would argue that in stating these purposes of education, the Cambodian

government has shown the desire and ability to resist and reinterpret global educational

discourses that are put forward by the multinational financial institutions. It is in the

variation in purposes of education that a "complex and hybrid political imaginary" in

relation to neo-liberalism can be seen (Larner, 2000, p. 11). The Cambodian government, although recognizing the economic purposes of education, also emphasizes the cultural, social, and moral elements of education.

Beech (2009) reports how this type of trend appeared in Brazil and Argentina at the end of the twentieth century as well. In these countries, the governments, at the insistence of multinational financial organizations, instituted reforms based on neo-liberalism promoted by those organizations. Education had a solely economic purpose. This new system was in stark contrast to the type of system that had been present in the countries. As a result, the new system was met by resistance and reinterpretation (Beech, 2009). This idea was also presented in chapter 4 of this thesis in the discussion around how policies are interpreted differently on the ground (Steiner-Khamsi, 2000; Bowe et al., 1992). The same type of resistance and reinterpretation is evident within the Cambodian policy documents. This variance in understanding around the purpose of education between the Cambodian government and multinational organizations is also indicative of different visions for the re-development of the country. For the Cambodian government, a post-conflict government, there is still a great deal of emphasis on the social and cultural elements of education. They see it as important for them to develop and instil a sense of national pride and citizenship in a wary populace after decades of social unrest and political instability. In a sense, education becomes a tool of self-preservation for the Cambodian state and culture. Yet, for the multinational financial organizations, economic matters are their sole concern, as reflected in the policy directives. The Cambodian government is able to resist this sole purpose through their insistence on the development and expansion of non-formal education. This does not mean that the Cambodian government sees no economic purpose for education. They do, but they reinterpret this

purpose and combine it with social and cultural purposes to create a uniquely Cambodian system through all their national education policies.

8.6   Conclusions

The trends discussed above tend to indicate a move toward convergence. That is the Cambodian education is converging toward an "emerging international model" (Guthrie & Pierce, 1990, p. 202). According to Guthrie and Pierce (1990) under this model, education systems around the world share: a nationally established curriculum that is focused on math, science, and foreign languages; a devolution of operational decision-making authority to the school site; a greater use of performance tests for accountability purposes; an emphasis on teacher professionalism; and access to lifelong learning opportunities (p. 202).

In the current environment of educational convergence, Steiner-Khamsi (2000) notes that education has been reframed into an "education for" framework. This is certainly the case in Cambodia where education reform has become about education for development and education for poverty reduction in the official discourse. Steiner-Khamsi goes on to say that the "education for" programs become akin to political campaigns and what is being transferred in these campaigns is not necessarily "a particular model of education, but the political discourse embedded in a particular education program" (2000, p. 181). Therefore, transfer goes beyond educational practices and policies to the ideology behind them. In this sense then one can see the application of Larner's understanding of neo-liberalism as more than just a policy agenda. Neo-liberalism as ideology is manifest in the policy agenda laid out in the multinational and national policy documents and directives. According to Hall (1988), neo-liberalism can be understood as a "struggle to gain ascendancy over the entire social formation, to

achieve positions of leadership in a number of different sites of social life at once, to achieve the commanding position on a broad strategic front" (p. 52). This is achieved through the connection to the global market and business structure. The market, and those with the closest ties to it, ascend to the commanding position.

However, this must also be tempered by the assertion that there are often complex hybrid understandings of neo-liberalism and that there is seldom a straightforward implementation of the philosophy (Larner, 2000).

The policy documents and directives studied in this thesis present a compelling view of an education system in transition caught between global demands and national needs. As my policy analysis has demonstrated, there are many overlapping themes but also many distinct variations between the documents of each group involved in the education reforms in Cambodia. The situation in Cambodia demonstrates how the implementation of a philosophy such as neo-liberalism is not a straightforward top-down process. In the Cambodian education reform process, neo-liberalism is certainly the underlying current. Neo-liberal concepts have infiltrated both the multinational and national education policies and directives. However, the variations between each groups' documents show how multiple understandings can manifest in one context and it is the blending of these understandings that emerge. Therefore, within each context there is a distinctive set of institutions that are unique to the nation in which they are found.

In this case, the Cambodian government has recognized the international demand for neo-liberal economic reforms and these reforms have been written into the national education policies. The case study method has enabled me to demonstrate how the policies in Cambodia are linked to global policies for education. However, these reforms are instituted within the Cambodian cultural context. The neo-liberal economic demands

are tempered by Cambodian cultural demands, specifically the Buddhist culture of the

country.

Larner (2000) has stated that "the emergence of new forms of political power does

not simply involve the imposition of a new understanding on top of the old" with the new

eventually squeezing out the old (p. 20). In this case, the new forms of political power

have to do with globalization and the increasing influence of politically and economically

powerful multinational organizations. In post-conflict developing countries these

organizations have a great deal of influence due to their heavy financial investments in

key sectors. However, this does not mean that there are no forms of resistance to the

imposition of the agendas of these organizations in developing countries. The Royal

Government of Cambodia has demonstrated attempts at resistance by asserting their

desire for an economically viable but culturally relevant system of education. This

melding of international demands and national needs has been seen in other sectors in

other places. Fougere (1997) has demonstrated how New Zealand's health care system is

a hybrid of design from above and "skilful improvisation" from below. If we take this

notion and apply it in the Cambodian case, the national education policies can be seen as

a hybrid of design from above (the multinational organizations) and skilful improvisation

from below (the Cambodian government). Thus, the policies indicate a complex process

of give and take and subtle negotiation between the global movement toward a neo-liberal

dominated system and the local desire for cultural preservation.

Chapter 9: A Return to the Research Questions

After conducting the analysis in chapter 8, I feel it is important to come back to the research questions and directly connect the analysis to the questions. Therefore, this chapter will seek to answer each of the four principal research questions that were asked in this thesis.

9.1 Globalization and Cambodian education policy development

The first question asked in this study was: To what extent is globalization influencing education policy development in post-conflict Cambodia? As was discussed in chapter 3, Monahan (2005) stated that globalization can be thought of as a multi-layered phenomenon, with each layer being a transparency that contributes to a final but never completely visible picture. Each one of the documents studied in this thesis can be thought of as a transparency that is brought together with the others to form a picture of a specific example of post-conflict education reconstruction within a globalized world. These documents present a partial picture of the complexities and processes behind educational reconstruction in a developing country, in this case Cambodia. Yet, the Cambodian case is only one and that is why this study can become another transparency to add to the visible, but incomplete, picture of education reform using a globalization paradigm.

The policy initiatives, such as the ESSP and 3rd ESP, are planned to generally run over a course of five years. Education reform is not an overnight phenomenon. It is a gradual process. It is gradual because immersing Cambodia back into the global marketplace and political structure, as is the aim of the multinational organizations, takes times as the country redevelops. This immersion is about the increasing connectivity

between Cambodia and the rest of the world, it is about globalization and globalization is a process and, as such, so is education reform.

In addition, researchers have also stated that globalization leads to a situation in which there is no longer a clear distinction between international and domestic, global and local (Dale, 2000; Green, 1997; Daun, 2002; Monahan, 2005). The layers of transparencies blur the boundaries between the global and the local. This can be seen in the objectives laid out in the policy documents and directives studied in this thesis. The national policy documents of the Cambodian government clearly reflect those of the multinational organizations, in several key areas. Each discuss the use of partnerships and the importance of education as a tool for economic rejuvenation. The prominence of neo-liberal objectives, such as decentralization and accountability, in the Cambodian national education policies also demonstrate how the global initiatives promoted by multinational organizations become internalized and become part of a national discourse. The boundaries between multinational organizations and the Cambodian government are not clear and are very blurred within the education policy documents and directives.

This blurring of the global and the local is very much in line with the transformationalist understanding of globalization. Transformationalists feel that the nation-state, though still a viable political, economic, and cultural unit, has been altered by the process of globalization. This alteration has blurred the boundary between the local and global. This is clearly demonstrated in this case study of Cambodia. Cambodian policy making is still carried out by the national government but globalization has led to a situation where there is an expanding jurisdiction for institutions of international governance and finance (Held, McGrew, Goldblatt, and Perraton, 1999). In this situation, the nation-state exists but in a transformed manner. An example of this can be found in

Cambodia, particularly in the financing of the education sector. Because of previous problems with government corruption, the multinational financial organizations have insisted upon strict financial regulations for education funding. This approach is reflected in the establishment of the World Bank Division within the Ministry of Economy and Finance. In this situation, the nation-state of Cambodia is still structured with specific national ministries to take care of key sectors; however, within these ministries there are now divisions that are run by multinational organizations such as the World Bank. These divisions then give the multinational organizations direct access to the decision and policy making process within these ministries. According to Taylor and Henry (2007), "the nation-state's authority to allocate values has not ceased, but rather increasingly sits alongside other value-allocating authorities" (p. 16). The situation in the funding to the education sector in Cambodia demonstrates this element of globalization. Cambodia is still able to allocate values but with a specific division within the Ministry of Economy and Finance the World Bank has also become a value-allocating authority in the funding of the education sector.

In addition to specific divisions, the multinational organizations are also able to allocate values through the conditions attached to the loans for education. A specific example of this is the IMF and its Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers. Globalization leads to greater connectivity and the creation of specific organizational divisions within national ministries is a prime example of this interconnectedness.

Daun (2002) has stated that globalization has two components – scope and intensity. Scope refers to how international trends have spread geographically while intensity refers to how ingrained and accepted these trends have become within national contexts (Daun, 2002). These two concepts relate directly back to the first research

question asked here. To what extent, how intensely, has globalization effected post-conflict education reconstruction? Evidence of scope can be found in the expansion of the National Assessment System and standardized testing in Cambodia. As was discussed in chapter 8, the standardized tests laid out in the policy documents of both the multinational organizations and Cambodian government reflect the same structure as those used in the province of Ontario in Canada and many American states, such as Texas. These tests are administered by an over-arching organization whose primary reason for being is to demand accountability from all of those in the education sector. The very ideology behind these organizations is neo-liberalism which emphasizes the need for public sectors to be more business-oriented in form, structure and performance. The fact that neo-liberalism, a capitalist economic model, is ingrained in Cambodian education institutions demonstrates the spread of international trends and is reflective of the scope of globalization.

Intensity is also reflected in the trends described above and evidence provided in this thesis. According to the policy directives and documents, the World Bank proposed the establishment of the NAS in the WB ESSP and it is taken up by the Cambodian government in their ESSP and 3rd ESP (World Bank, 2005a; MoEYS, 2005a, 2005b). Yet, according to Daun (2002), intensity refers to how ingrained *and* accepted these trends have become. International trends have certainly been ingrained into Cambodian national education policy as can be demonstrated by the NAS. However, the acceptance of these trends can be questioned, as was pointed out in chapter 8 in the discussion around the purposes of education. The multinational organizations clearly state in their directives that education's purpose is primarily economic, that is its purpose is to improve Cambodia's human resource base. The economic purpose of education is also ingrained

in the Cambodian policy documents; however, it is not the sole purpose as it is in the multinational documents. It is infused in the Cambodian documents because they are dependent on funding from multinational organizations for education reform and therefore they must reflect a similar purpose for reform with the financial multinationals. Why would multinational organizations fund national education reconstruction if the national governments had completely different purposes and objectives from those proposed by the organizations? The answer is that they would not. Therefore, in order to receive financial backing from the World Bank, the Asian Development Bank, and the IMF the Cambodian government had to commit to support certain objectives and ideologies into their national education policies. One such ideology is that education has an economic purpose.

However, the Cambodian government does not accept that this is the sole purpose of education. Their documents also stress the cultural and social purpose of education. The 3rd ESP holds that the MoEYS has a responsibility to help Cambodian students develop economically and culturally (MoEYS, 2005a). Therefore, the documents and directives demonstrate that the scope of globalization is reflected in Cambodian education reform; however, the intensity with which globalization has been injected into education policy can be questioned. Certainly, global initiatives have found their way into the national policy documents; yet it is the acceptance of these initiatives that can be questioned.

When discussing acceptance, Rizvi (2000) makes a key point. He states that when new elements are introduced into an existing context the individuals within that context will interpret and incorporate them in a manner that meshes with the existing way of life. That is new ideals are adapted to local realities, they do not just replace the existing value

system. This notion then relates back to the research question under discussion here.

There is no doubt that globalization has had an impact on education reform in post-

conflict Cambodia. This can be seen in elements of the policy directives and documents

discussed in detail in this thesis such as the creation of the NAS, the standardization of

curriculum and testing, the marketization of education, and the emphasis on partnerships.

Therefore these examples answer the first element of this question.

However, the key purpose of this thesis was to determine the *extent* to which

globalization was influencing education policy development in post-conflict Cambodia.

This brings me back to Daun (2002) and Rizvi (2000). The Cambodian government has

incorporated key multinational initiatives into their national education policy, yet they

have not accepted them without regard for local influence. This was demonstrated above

and in this thesis through the discussion of the similarities and differences between the

multinational and national documents. There were similarities in the understanding of the

purposes of education; yet it was not the similarities that told the greatest story, it was the

differences. The Cambodian government took the economic purpose of education and

adapted it to the local realities in their country. The adaptation was to emphasize the

economic alongside of the cultural and social elements of education. This was also the

situation with the use of partnerships to build the education sector. The Cambodian

government conceded that partners were needed. However, when little emphasis was put

on non-formal education in the multinational policy directives, the government gave

NGOs the same rights to participate in education development under the Education Law

of 2007. This decision was taken because the Cambodian government felt that non-

formal education was more culturally appropriate for their country. In addition, the

Cambodian government felt that partnership was more about progression toward

independence and this view was in contrast to the understanding of partnership presented in the multinational documents. These examples show that the acceptance of international ideals has been taken up by the Cambodian government, as is expected under the conditions of international financial assistance, but they have been adapted to the local context in a manner that meshes with existing ways of life. Therefore, it can be concluded that globalization has influenced the creation of Cambodian education policy, but not to the extent that local influence has been lost.

9.2   *Multinational organizations and policy making in Cambodia*

The next research question asked in this thesis relates directly back to the first: How have multinational agencies influenced national education policy making in post-conflict Cambodia? If globalization and multinationals have influenced education policy development in post-conflict Cambodia, it is essential to look at how they have influenced it. What mechanisms have been put in place to allow international influence to penetrate national policies?

There are three key ways that multinational organizations have influenced the origins of Cambodian national education policy. First, they have done this through the establishment of financial conditions. Second, they have established clear assessment and monitoring strategies to ensure that their education and economic goals are met. Finally, they have insisted on good governance from the Cambodian government.

A prime example of this is the International Monetary Fund and World Bank's Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSP). The PRSP is very influential on the direction taken in education reform because it is a pre-condition for access to IMF *and* World Bank funds (UNICEF, 2005). The PRSP is particularly significant in that it demands quantifiable targets. In order to monitor the progress toward the laid out targets, the

PRSP requires the establishment of a monitoring system and evaluation strategy. These have clearly been established within Cambodian national education policy. There is a great deal of concern with monitoring results. Of particular concern to the government is the monitoring and assessment of the capital program priorities in the ESSP. As was discussed in chapter 7, the Cambodian government is faced with very strict reporting procedures to multinational organizations and this drive for strict monitoring is a direct result of the objectives laid out in the PRSP. This is one way the multinational organizations are able to influence national policy.

A second example of conditional financing influencing national education policy development is the multinational organizations' insistence on good governance which is measured through the World Bank's Country Policy and Institutional Assessment (CPIA). As was discussed in this thesis, Cambodia must maintain a certain standard on the CPIA in order to receive financing for their development and reform projects. Education is such a project. The CPIA is part of the "strategic selectivity" program espoused by the World Bank and financial organizations when determining how they are to distribute money to the poorest countries in the world. Through the program of "strategic selectivity", the government of Cambodia is accountable to multinational officials for what types of policies they pass and how they operate their social institutions. Thus, this program is able to influence the creation and adoption of national education policy. The emphasis on good governance is found throughout the Cambodian education policy documents, including in the priority programs listed in the ESSP. A demand for good governance is demonstrated in the education policy documents through such things as accounting measures for all elements of education funding, programs of inspections and increased transparency at all levels of the education sector. These elements demonstrate

how conditions become a mechanism through which multinational organizations can influence national education policy.

The multinational organizations also influence the creation and adoption of national education policy through the setting of universal goals for education. Of particular importance for education are the United Nations Millennium Development Goals (MDG). The goal for education is to achieve universal primary education by 2015 (UNICEF, 2005). These goals underline the education reform agenda of multinational organizations and national governments and thus have a large influence on the development of national education policy in post-conflict countries.

So in response to the second research question asked in this thesis, the evidence shows that multinational organizations have been able to influence Cambodian national education policy through the conditions attached to their financing and through the setting of universal goals. So, given this influence, whose needs are truly addressed in the education reform policy documents and directives in post-conflict Cambodia? This question will be addressed next.

9.3   *Global and local needs*

The third research question asked in this thesis was: Whose needs are addressed in the policy documents and directives? In order to respond to this question, I want to go back to the understanding of the purposes of education held by the multinational organizations and the Cambodian government because I think that the purposes of education relate directly to the needs of those involved in the education sector. Each group involved in the education reform process has an understanding about what education *should* be designed to do in Cambodia. This understanding revolves around what they *need* education to do. The multinational organizations are very different from

the Cambodian government in their international political and economic positioning.

Specifically, the Cambodian government is still a post-conflict state. As was discussed in the introduction to this thesis, the Cambodian state has had a very troubled recent history. Since the end of French colonialism, there have been periods of monarchical rule, dictatorship, foreign occupation, an internationally-run transition government and the current constitutional monarchy. Cambodia is a country that is accustomed to going from one disruption to another with little consistency in their social institutions. As a result, the current Cambodian government is one that needs to establish a stable government with working social institutions. As reviewed above, post-conflict governments need to reconstruct infrastructure and rebuild social institutions in order to regain the trust and support of the population. For Cambodia, this is a particular issue given the history of the Khmer Rouge regime and Vietnamese occupation. The population of Cambodia is used to looking upon its governments with suspicion, distrust, and even hatred. This was the situation facing the Cambodian government after the disillusion of UNTAC. It was a poor, undeveloped, inexperienced, and not highly supported nation. Building trust and support is not an overnight task and it continues to this day with the education reforms taking place. Thus, one of the primary needs of the Cambodian government was to re-establish trust with the Cambodian population. Education is a tool through which trust can be established if reform is conducted in an appropriate manner.

Smith (2008) has shown that education can be a vital tool in helping a community recover from traumatic events as it can reintroduce routines and create a sense of normalcy. Yet, for reforms to be successful there must be an acknowledgement of local context. Herrero (2005) has said that replicating institutional models from one place to

another without recognition of local context leads to failure. This view is echoed by

O'Halloran (2005) and Bahcheli and Noel (2005) who also feel that there is a great

likelihood of failure when institutions are established, under international guidance, in

unstable environments without consideration of local context. Therefore, a need of the

Cambodian government was that education reforms take the local situation into account

in order to be successful. Success is necessary for a post-conflict government in order to

establish trust and support from the population. Success itself can be defined in various

ways but in the Cambodian case, because of its particular history, successful reform has

had two primary purposes and needs, and these are economic and cultural rejuvenation.

In contrast, the multinational organizations have different needs for education

reform in Cambodia. As was discussed in this thesis, multinational organizations were

created at the end of World War II to help rebuild Europe. Thus from the start,

multinational organizations were closely tied to social and economic development. This

purpose is reflected in the fact that their stated purpose is now poverty reduction.

However, the causes and consequences of poverty go beyond just economic growth.

Hatcher (2007) and Oxfam (2002) have both stated that the shift in focus from European

reconstruction to poverty reduction in developing nations has helped to justify

multinational organizations' interests in education reform. The primary philosophy of the

multinational organizations is that education can be used to create positive economic

change which in turn will increase the stability of the population and allow them to

become productive members of the global and national community in order to repay their

debts. Therefore, the primary need of organizations such as the World Bank and Asian

Development Bank is to create an education sector that leads to economic reform and

creates a viable workforce that can participate in the global marketplace. Greater

economic productivity from individuals would help to alleviate poverty and thus justify the aims and goals of these multinational organizations.

How do the policy documents and directives address these needs? Again to address this, I want to re-examine the stated purposes of education. The multinational organizations hold that the purpose of education is economic. An improvement in a person's economic security is the key to a prosperous and viable future. Therefore, the multinational organizations need reforms that address economic prosperity and poverty reduction. Their support and funding for education reform depend upon this. As a result, there are many aspects of the policy documents and directives that are specifically intended to address poverty alleviation and economic stability.

Yet, as was just discussed above, the Cambodian government has some distinctly different needs in relation to education reform. The Cambodian government also needs education reforms that help to rejuvenate Cambodian culture. This need is significant because so much of that culture was wiped out or sent underground throughout the preceding periods. The Cambodian government needs to re-establish a relationship with the population. The attempts at cultural rejuvenation can be seen in the structure of the post-conflict government. The government went back to being a monarchy with the Cambodian King as the head of state. The darkest periods of Cambodian history (the Khmer Rouge regime and Vietnamese occupation) occurred when the monarchy was away from the government and there is the sense that for Cambodia to prosper again there needs to be a link made in the national psyche with past times of greatness and prosperity. Policy makers see education is a great tool to use in trying to heal. Therefore, the needs of the Cambodian government are that education reform be both economically and

culturally relevant. As was discussed above, reforms that fail to take local context into account are bound to fail.

So do the policy documents and directives take the needs of the Cambodian government and people into account? The answer to this is yes, to an extent. There is no doubt that the Cambodian government needs to develop economically and improve the economic situation of the majority of people in the country. Poverty is rampant and needs to be addressed. The education policy documents of the Cambodian government address the economic needs of education reform, as do the multinational organizations' policy directives. There are objectives and goals in place in the education reform documents that aim to improve the economic prospects of Cambodian students. These include goals for increased literacy and numeracy, targeted scholarships, and the expansion of technical and vocational training. The Cambodian policy documents, however, go further than the multinational organizations' directives in emphasizing the need for the cultural rejuvenation of Cambodia. There is little mention of the cultural element in the multinational directives. Yet, there is a marked focus on the cultural elements of education in the Cambodian documents. This can be seen in the Cambodian government's curriculum structure and stated objectives for education. There is also the emphasis on non-formal education in the Cambodian documents and this is because it is culturally relevant. It is the sector of education that takes local context into account and puts it to the forefront. It is through this sector that the needs of the Cambodian government and people are best addressed. Therefore in relation to this research question, the policy analysis done for this thesis indicates that the economic needs of all groups involved in education reform are strongly addressed in the policy documents and

directives while the cultural needs of the Cambodian government are addressed only in the Cambodian documents and are seen as a priority only for them.

9.4   Consequences of international influence

The fourth question was: What have been the consequences of international influence on Cambodian national education policy? The answer to this question can relate back to the discussion of globalization and how the lines between the global and the local become blurred. One of the consequences of international influence on Cambodian education policy is that there is a distinctive melding of global initiatives and local needs. As was just discussed above, in the international directives global economic needs take priority but in the Cambodian national policy documents local social needs are addressed. Yet, several key theories about globalization hold that if globalization has truly taken hold then the distinction between the global and local is almost indistinguishable. The global and the local become one.

However, in the Cambodian case, it appears that although the Cambodian government willingly accepts international initiatives in their education reform agenda, local needs have not been abandoned. There are certainly key elements of the multinational ideology in the Cambodian national education policy documents. This can be seen in aspects like the promotion of strong accountability measures and the drive for an efficient system. The Cambodian government has internalized several neo-liberal points, such as decentralization. There is a move toward the marketization of education within the Cambodian national policy documents. This can be seen in the 3rd ESP which lays out a policy whereby teacher salaries will be connected to student performance on standardized tests, thus introducing a bonus like system that is prevalent in the business community. The marketization of education can also be seen in the desire for

partnerships to make the sector more cost-effective for all involved. These international ideologies have found their way into Cambodian national because of to the multinational funding of the sector. So, this clearly shows that one consequence of the international funding is that international ideologies are embedded in Cambodian national policy.

But beyond this, I think another consequence of international influence on Cambodian national education policy is that the country's cultural needs have been identified and elaborated upon. The local has become visible through its contrast to the global. As shall be discussed in chapter 10, a Cambodian national education discourse has emerged.

By 1991 when the United Nations Transitional Authority took over the administrative duties of Cambodian governance, there were few native Cambodians with any educational expertise and few with educational experience in their own country. As was discussed in chapter 2, the years of conflict, in particular the Khmer Rouge regime had absolutely decimated the Cambodian education sector. There was no national debate about the purpose of education nor was there a national understanding about the educational rights of citizens. Cambodians privately valued education but there was little public discussion about the value of education. The Cambodian national policy documents present an interesting picture of a government positioned between the economic realities of educational reconstruction and the need for culturally relevant education reforms. In this way, the Cambodian government is situated distinctly between the global and the local. Because of their position as a dependent developing nation, they are not fully immersed into the global. Cambodia is not in a prominent economic or political position globally. Then in terms of the local, the Cambodian government has still not been completely accepted by the general population. As was discussed earlier, in

post-conflict situations the new governments are often looked upon with distrust and in

Cambodia the government is still working toward developing a trust that was lost in the

mid-20th century. Therefore, the Cambodian government sits in limbo between local and

global pressures and this position is reflected in their education policies. They are

dependent on the multinational organizations for the economic survival, yet dependent on

the Cambodian population for their political survival.

This precarious position is reflected in the policy documents. The major policy

documents, the 3rd ESP and the ESSP, are directly supported by the multinational

organizations. As the evidence presented in this study shows, the language and the

objectives laid out in these documents are very closely related to the objectives and

language used in the multinational directives. Yet, where a real Cambodian view of

education can clearly be seen is in the smaller, yet equally as important, policy

documents. For example, the National Policy for Curriculum Development, the Child-

Friendly School Policy and the Policy of Non-Formal Education all stress the importance

of the cultural element of education. There are Buddhist undertones in the Child-Friendly

School Policy and in the Curriculum Development Policy there is the establishment of a

Local Life Skills Program to create moral and nationalistic individuals. Even within the

3rd ESP and ESSP there is a subtle emphasis on the cultural element of education. This

emphasis can be seen when the Ministry states that through their education system they

intend to "engender a sense of national and civic pride" (2005a, p. 1). This focus on the

creation of national and civic pride, on moral individuals, on instilling the four

compassions in their students is now part of the Cambodian national education discourse.

It is not enough for the Cambodian government to accept international initiatives devoid

of local context because they will not work and the government will look weak and

become irrelevant. Their position between the global and local has forced the Cambodian government to create policies that are balanced between demands. I conclude that Cambodia, the global is influencing the local just as greatly as the local is influencing the global

9.5   *Conclusions*

The responses to the research questions present a compelling picture of education reform in Cambodia. Through the policy analysis conducted for this thesis it became apparent that multinational influence is clearly written into the Cambodian national policies. However, despite this presence, the Cambodian voice has not been lost. This and several other key conclusions will be discussed in the final chapter.

Chapter 10: Conclusion

This thesis sought to explore the degree to which international influence was able to penetrate the national education policies of post-conflict Cambodia. This chapter will briefly summarize the theoretical and methodological approaches used in this study. Then I will outline some of the key findings and conclusions and finish up with some suggestions for future research.

10.1 *Overview of study*

In this study there were four principal research questions. These were:

- To what extent is globalization influencing education policy development in post-conflict Cambodia?

- How have multinational agencies influenced national education policy making in post-conflict Cambodia?

- Whose needs are addressed in the policy documents and directives?

- What have been the consequences of international influence on Cambodian national education policy?

Comparative and international education was the guiding framework behind the study presented here. Traditionally, comparative and international education has focused on the comparison of education systems between countries. However, this study fit into the more recent manifestation of the discipline in which, using a globalization paradigm, comparison between national and multinational organizations is validated. Vertical case study in comparative and international education also allows for comparison within one national context.

The use of case study methodology raises the issue of generalizability. This thesis sought to give a descriptive account of Cambodian national education policies and their

relationship to the policy directives of the major multinational financial organizations. Thus the focus was on one national context. However, what makes the case presented in this study generalizable is the presence of the same multinational organizations in other post-conflict countries. These organizations do not change their ideology from one context to another. The literature studied for this thesis indicates that organizations such as the World Bank apply neo-liberal principles in all of their policy directives despite their presence in a variety of diverse cultural and social environments. The spread of neo-liberal ideals then allows the conclusions and findings from this thesis to be explored in other contexts as well. The generalizability of this case study shall be discussed in section 10.3 areas for future research.

In addition to case study, content analysis was also used to break down the sources of data in this research. The sources of data included a variety of policy directives from the World Bank (WB ESSP, FTI, CAS) and the Asian Development Bank (ESDP II, COBP) as well as Cambodian national education policies such as the 3rd Education Strategic Plan and Education Sector Support Program. I carried out a content analysis on these documents using codes that were created through an iterative process. Once the information was broken down into codes, several key topics and themes became apparent. These themes and topics became the basis of the analysis in this thesis.

Because of the international focus, the most appropriate theoretical perspective for this study was globalization. Globalization is a broad and much debated term and therefore it was important to clearly define what understanding of this concept was used in this study. Of particular importance was the view that globalization was a process that involved the economic, political, and cultural sectors of society. Specifically,

globalization was viewed as a process of increasing connectivity between nations that primarily involves economic, political, and cultural elements of society.

One of the key trends in the era of globalization is neo-liberalism. Neo-liberalism is the movement toward managerialism with its focus on efficiency, accountability, and effectiveness. In relation to education policy, neo-liberalism involves implementing a business model on education reform. Neo-liberalism was an underlying theme throughout all policy documents and directives. As a result, it was present in many of the findings in this study.

10.2 *Summary of Findings*

In a review of the responses to the research questions and the evidence presented in this thesis, several things become very clear about the education reform process in Cambodia. Firstly, international influence is most definitely present. In the methodology chapter of this thesis there was a discussion about the concept of educational transfer. At the most basic level, educational transfer is about the transplantation of educational methods from one national system to another. This thesis demonstrates that this understanding of educational transfer is no longer enough. The transfer of educational methods, and more importantly, educational ideology has become decidedly more global in nature. Educational transfer is no longer an exchange between two nation-states but rather now involves the exchange of macro level ideals across and between global and local boundaries. Global boundaries can no longer be perceived as those that exist between nation-states alone but now encompass multinational and multiregional political, economic, and cultural groupings. Global boundaries are no longer clearly marked on a map and as such researchers must be willing to look at educational transfer beyond the traditional understanding of transfer between national education systems alone. This

thesis has demonstrated how ideals of accountability, efficiency, effectiveness, and decentralization, have transferred from an international arena to be manifested and translated into a national education policy agenda.

Finally, in this thesis I have demonstrated how, despite a dependence on international funding, a national government is still able exert some independent agency, even if it is subtle. Steiner-Khamsi (2000) proposed a framework that acknowledges the agency of both borrowing and lending countries. This framework is very relevant in the Cambodian case. To conclude that international influence is the primary force driving Cambodian education reform would be erroneous. The Cambodian government, through its education policy platform, has made attempts to situate a reformed education system within the Cambodian cultural context. Their statements concerning the desire for an economically viable education system are always tempered with their equal desire for a culturally viable education system. They have refused to be "passive receivers of educational goods" (Steiner-Khamsi, 2000, p. 156). Steiner-Khamsi (2000) has stated that she would like "to make the point that their [borrowing countries'] stories of resisting, modifying, and indigenizing imported education goods have not been sufficiently told" (p. 156). My hope is that this thesis can act as a small part of the movement toward the telling of stories of resistance, stories of modification, and stories of empowerment, where developing nations such as Cambodia will no longer be seen as passive receivers but rather active agents in their own development.

10.3 *Areas for future research*

As was just discussed above, the research presented in this thesis examines the presence of multinational financial organizations in post-conflict developing countries. What has become apparent to me over the course of this research project is that the

processes occurring in Cambodia are also occurring in other countries in a similar situation. I have learned of this through contact with other researchers, travel, and by becoming familiar with existing literature. Therefore, I feel that the study presented here can help to shed light on the development of national policies in other post-conflict countries. Specifically, this can be valuable in the near future as places like Iraq and Afghanistan seek to rebuild their systems of education with the aid of international financing. In Cambodia, conflict almost completely eradicated the education system. Cambodia today presents a very relevant example of the education rebuilding process in a country starting from very little.

In addition, I believe that researchers and policy makers in other post-conflict countries can look to the Cambodian case as one where local agency was exerted through national education policy. Therefore, it can demonstrate the value of local input in the policy making process. Policy making, even in developing post-conflict, relatively poor countries, is not an entirely top down process with all the decisions coming from large multinational financial organizations.

Yet, this leads to my next point about where to go from here. I referred earlier in this thesis, to the work of Levin (2001) who feels that there are four key stages to the policy making process. In this research I have only touched on the first two, origin and adoption. The third stage, implementation, is also a very important topics for research. How have these policies been transformed once they are in the classroom? Have all of the recommendations and accountability procedures been followed? A policy on paper is usually much different then a policy in action, and I think that a key area of research for the future is what these policies, and subsequent policies, look like in action.

In addition to this, the majority of policy documents and directives under study in this thesis are set to expire in 2010. As a result, another area for future study is watching the development of the next set of Cambodian national education policies. This would involve examining the outcomes of these documents and how the success or failures of these outcomes influences the next set of national policies and multinational policy directives. Did any of these latest reforms result in concrete improvements in student achievement, poverty reduction, economic development, or universal primary education?

This study started due to a native son's passion for his homeland. In a sense, Dr. Rethy Chhem is symbolic of Cambodia. A part of him is forever marked by conflict; this past is part of his present. The legacy of the conflict forced him to look internationally for survival and the opportunity to rebuild his life. He worked hard and successfully acclimatized to a Western lifestyle. Yet, through all this international influence through living and working in Europe and North America, his Cambodian core has survived and I would even say thrived.

At the end of it all, I hope that this study has answered the questions it asked and gave insight into the relationship between multinational organizations and the national government in the policy making process in post-conflict Cambodia. Oftentimes, it felt like the answer to one question only led to more questions, but then Cambodia is a complex place, so I shouldn't have expected, nor would I have wanted, anything different.

Bibliography

Addison, T., Chowdhury, A., & Mansoob Murshed, S. (2005). Financing Reconstruction. In G. Junne and W. Verkoren (Eds.), *Postconflict development: Meeting new challenges* (pp. 211-222). Boulder, CO: Lynne Rienner Publishers.

Allen, D. (2006). Public institutions in an era of globalization: The need to keep pace. In J. Dator, D. Pratt & Y. Seo (Eds.), *Fairness, globalization, and public institutions* (pp. 135-144). Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press.

Arnove, R. (2003). Introduction: Reframing comparative education: The dialectic of the global and the local. In R. Arnove and C. A. Torres (Eds.), *Comparative education: The dialectic of the global and the local* (pp. 1-23). Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield Publishers Ltd.

Asian Development Bank (ADB). (2008). *Country Operations Business Plan: Cambodia 2008-2010*. Manilla: ADB.

Asian Development Bank (ADB). (2004a). *Second Education Sector Development Program (ESDP II)*. Manilla: ADB.

Asian Development Bank (ADB). (2004b). *Country Strategy Program*. Manilla: ADB.

Asian Development Bank (ADB). (1996). *Cambodia's children: Investing in their future* [videorecording]. Manila: Information Office of the Asian Development Bank.

Ayres, D. (2000). *Anatomy of a crisis: Education, development, and the State in Cambodia, 1953-1998*. Chiang Mai, Thailand: Silkworm Books.

Bahcheli, T. & Noel, S. (2005). Power sharing for Cyprus (again)? European Union accession and the prospects for reunification. In S. Noel (Ed.), *From power sharing to democracy: Post-conflict institutions in ethnically divided societies* (pp. 215-238). Montreal & Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press.

Baker, D. & LeTendre, G. (2005). *National differences, global similarities*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.

Ball, S. (1992). Management as moral technology: A Luddite analysis. In S. J. Ball (Ed.), *Foucault and education: Disciplines and knowledge* (pp. 153-166). New York: Routledge.

Ball, S. (1993). What is policy? Text, trajectories and toolboxes. *Discourse, 13*(2), 10-17.

Ball, S. (2004). Performativities and fabrications in the education economy: Towards the performative society. In S. J. Ball (Ed.), *The Routledge Falmer reader in sociology of education* (pp. 143-155). London: RoutledgeFalmer.

Beckmann, A. and Cooper, C. (2004). "Globalisation", the new managerialism and education: Rethinking the purpose of education in Britain. *Journal for Critical Education Policy Studies*, *2*(2), 1-16.

Beech, J. (2009). Who is strolling through the global garden? International agencies and educational transfer. In R. Cowen and A. Kazamias (Eds.), *International Handbook of Comparative Education* (pp. 341-357). New York: Springer.

Beech, J. (2006). The theme of educational transfer in comparative education: A view over time. *Research in Comparative and International Education, 1*(1), 2-13.

Berkhout, S. J. & Wielemans, W. (1999). Toward understanding education policy: An integrative approach. *Educational Policy 13*(3), 402-420.

Berman, E., Marginson, S., Preston, R., McLennan, B., and Arnove, R. (2003). The political economy of educational reform in Australia, England and Wales, and the United States. In R. Arnove and C. A. Torres (Eds.), *Comparative education: The dialectic of the global and the local* (pp. 252-291). Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield Publishers Ltd.

Bogdan, R. & Biklen, S. (1998). *Qualitative research in education (3ʳᵈ edition).* Boston: Allyn and Bacon.

Bottery, M. (2000). *Education Policy and Ethics*. London: Continuum.

Bowe, R., Ball, S. & Gold, A. (1992). *Reforming education and changing schools: Case studies in policy sociology*. London: Routledge.

Bowles, P. & MacLean, B. (1996). Understanding trade bloc formation: The case of the ASEAN free trade area. *Review of International Political Economy, 3*(2), 319-348.

Bowles, P. (2002). Asia's post-crisis regionalism: Bringing the state back in, keeping the (United) States out. *Review of International Political Economy, 9*(2), 230-256.

Boyer, R. and Drache, D. (1996). Introduction. In R. Boyer and D. Drache (Eds.), *States against markets* (pp. 1-30). New York: Routledge.

Bray, M. & Bunly, S. (2005). *Balancing the books: Household financing of basic education in Cambodia.* Hong Kong: Comparative Education Research Centre.

Bray, M. (2004). Other fields and ours: Academic discourse and the nature of comparative education. *Comparative and International Education Review, 3*, 61-83.

Bray, M. and Thomas, R. (1995). Levels of comparison in educational studies: Different insights from different literatures and the value of multilevel analyses. *Harvard Educational Review, 65*(3), 472-490.

Bretton Woods Project (2003, July 21). Questions raised over World Bank post-conflict work. *Bretton Woods Project*, Update 34.

Brinkerhoff, D. (2007). Introduction – governance challenges in fragile states: re establishing security, rebuilding effectiveness, and reconstituting legitimacy. In D. Brinkerhoff (Ed.), *Governance in post-conflict societies: Rebuilding fragile states* (pp. 1 -22). New York: Routledge.

Buckland, P. (2004). *Reshaping the future: Education and post-conflict reconstruction.* Washington, DC: World Bank.

Buenfil Burgos, R. (2004). Partnership as a floating and empty signifier within educational policies: The Mexican case. In B. Franklin, M. Bloch, and T. Popkewitz (Eds.), *Educational partnerships and the state: The paradoxes of governing schools, children and families* (pp. 55-79). New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Chandler, D. (1994). *A History of Cambodia.* Chiang Mai, Thailand: Silkworm Books.

Clayton, T. (2006). *Language choice in a nation under transition: English language spread in Cambodia.* New York: Springer.

Cohen, L., Manion, L., & Morrison, K. (2005). *Research Methods in Education.* New York: RoutledgeFalmer.

Collier, P. & Hoeffler, A. (2004). *Aid, policy and growth in post conflict societies*. World Bank Policy Research Working Paper 2902.

Cooper, B., Fusarelli, L., and Vance Randall, E. (2004). *Better policies, better schools: Theories and applications*. New York: Pearson Education.

Cooper, R. (1996). *The post-modern state and the world order*. London: Demos.

Crossley, M. & Vulliamy, G. (1984). Case-study research methods and comparative education. *Comparative Education*, *20*(2), 193-206.

Dale, R. (2000). Globalization: A new world for comparative education? In J. Schriewer (Ed.), *Discourse formation in comparative education* (pp. 87-110). New York: P. Lang.

Dann, R. (2002). *Promoting assessment as learning: Improving the learning process*. London: RoutledgeFalmer.

Daun, H. (2002). Globalization and national education systems. In H. Daun (Ed.), *Educational restructuring in the context of globalization and national policy* (pp. 1-31). London: Routledge Falmer.

Daun, H. (2007). Globalization and the Governance of National Education Systems. In H. Daun (Ed.), *School Decentralization in the Context of Globalizing Governance* (pp. 5-26). Dordrecht, the Netherlands: Springer.

Degu, W. A. (2005). Reforming Education. In G. Junne & W. Verkoren (Eds.), *Postconflict development: Meeting new challenges* (pp. 129-145). Boulder, CO: Lynne Rienner.

DeKoninck, R. (2003). Southeast Asian Agriculture Post-1960: Economic and territorial expansion. In Lin Sien Chia (Ed.), *Southeast Asia transformed: A geography of change*, (pp. 191-230). Singapore: Institute of Southeast Asian Studies

Delaney, J. (2002). *Educational policy studies.* Calgary, AB: Detselig Enterprises Ltd.

Development Analysis Network (2005). *The cross border economies of Cambodia, Laos, Thailand, and Vietnam.* Phnom Penh: Cambodia Development Resource Institute.

Dobbins, J., Jones, S., Runkle, B., & Mohandas, S. (2009). *Occupying Iraq: A history of the coalition provisional authority.* Santa Monica, CA: RAND Corporation.

Downey, L. (1988). *Policy analysis in education.* Calgary, AB: Detselig Enterprises Ltd.

Duggan, S. (2003). Education, teacher training and the prospects for economic recovery in Cambodia. In E. Beauchamp (Ed.), *Comparative education reader* (pp. 411-429). New York: RoutledgeFalmer.

Durkheim, E. (1982). *The rules of sociological method* (W. Halls, Trans.). New York: Free Press. (Original work published 1895).

Dy, S. (2004). Strategies and Policies for Basic Education in Cambodia: Historical Perspectives. *International Education Journal, 5*(1), 90-97.

Emmerij, L. (2007). Turning points in development thinking and practice. In G. Mavrotas & A. Shorrocks (Eds.), *Advancing development: Core themes in global economics* (pp. 37-49). New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Forbes, V. (2003). Geopolitical change: Direction and continuing issues. In Lin Sien Chia (Ed.), *Southeast Asia transformed: A geography of change* (pp. 47-94). Singapore: Institute of Southeast Asian Studies.

Foucault, M. (1977). *Discipline and punish: the birth of the prison.* (A. Sheridan, Trans.). New York: Pantheon Books.

Fougere, G. (1997, August). Transforming health sectors: New logics of organising in the New Zealand health system. Paper presented at the Annual meeting of the American Sociological Association, Toronto, Ontario.

Franklin, B., Bloch, M., and Popkewitz, T. (2004). Educational partnerships: An introductory framework. In B. Franklin, M. Bloch, and T. Popkewitz (Eds.), *Educational partnerships and the state: The paradoxes of governing schools, children and families* (pp. 1-23). New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Fukasaku, K. & Urata, S. (1998). Introduction and Overview. In K. Fukasaku, F. Kimura, & S. Urata (Eds.), *Asia & Europe: Beyond competing regionalism* (pp. 1-12). Portland: Sussex Academic Press.

Gallagher, K. (1992). *Shaping school policy: Guide to choices, politics, and community relations*. Newbury Park, CA: Corwin.

Geeves, R. (2002). *Speaker's notes*. Sihanoukville, Cambodia: proceedings of VSO Cambodia Annual Conference 2002.

Gerwirtz, S. and Ball, S. (2000). From 'Welfarism' to 'New Managerialism': Shifting discourses of school headship in the education marketplace. *Discourse: Studies in the cultural politics of education*, *21*(3), 253-268.

Ghosh, A. (1993). "Structural Adjustment" and education. *Economic and Political Weekly, 28*(31), 1561-1562.

Gill, S. (2002). The political economy of globalization: the Old and the New. In E. Aksu & J. A. Camilleri (Eds.), *Democratizing global governance* (pp. 77-89). New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Goldsmith, A.A. (2007). Does nation building work? Reviewing the record. In D. Brinkerhoff (Ed.), *Governance in post-conflict societies: Rebuilding fragile states* (pp. 25-44). New York: Routledge.

Gordon, D. (1988). The global economy: New edifice or crumbling foundations? In D. Kotz, T. McDonough, M. Reich (Eds.), *Social structures of accumulation: The political economy of growth and crisis* (pp. 292-306). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Graham-Brown, S. (1991). *Education in the developing world*. New York: Longman Publishing.

Green, A. (1997). *Education, globalization and the nation state*. New York: St. Martin's Press Inc.

Gunn, S. (2005). Introduction. In C. Cullingford and S. Gunn (Eds.), *Globalisation, education and culture shock* (pp. 1-9). Burlington, VT: Ashgate Publishing Co.

Gutek, G. (2006). *American education in a global society.* Long Grove, IL: Waveland Press Inc.

Guthrie, J. and Pierce, L. (1990). The international economy and national education reform: A comparison of education reforms in the United States and Great Britain. *Oxford Review of Education*, *16*(2), 179-205.

Hall, S. (1988). The Toad in the Garden: Thatcherism among the Theorists. In C. Nelson and L. Grossberg (Eds.), *Marxism and the Interpretation of Culture* (pp. 35-57). London: Macmillan Education.

Hamber, B. & Wilson, R. (2003). Symbolic Closure through Memory, Reparation and Revenge in post-Conflict Societies. In E. Cairns & M. Roe (Eds.), *The Role of Memory in Ethnic Conflict* (pp. 144-168). New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Haque, M. (1999). The fate of sustainable development of neo-liberal regimes in developing countries. *International Political Science Review, 20*(2), 197-218.

Harding, S. and Phillips, P. (1986). *Contrasting values in Western Europe: Unity, diversity and change.* Basingstoke, UK: Macmillian in association with the European Value Systems Study Group.

Harris, S. (2007). *The governance of education: How neo-liberalism is transforming policy and practice*. London: Continuum International Publishing Group.

Harris, I. (2001). Sangha Groupings in Cambodia. *Buddhist Studies Review, 18*(I), 65–72.

Hatcher, P. (2007). Partnership and the reform of international aid: Challenging citizenship and political representation? In D. Stone & C. Wright (Eds.), *The World Bank and Governance: A decade of reform and reaction* (pp. 189-207). New York: Routledge.

Haufler, V. (2007). The private sector and governance in post-conflict societies. In D. Brinkerhoff (Ed.), *Governance in post-conflict societies: Rebuilding fragile states* (pp. 143-160). New York: Routledge.

Held, D. (1995). *Democracy and the global order: From modern state to cosmopolitan governance*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Held, D., McGrew, A., Goldblatt, D., and Perraton, J. (1999). *Global transformations: Politics, economics, and culture.* Stanford, Calif : Stanford University Press.

Herman, E. (1999). The threat of globalization. *New Politics, 7*(2) (new series), whole no. 26, Winter.

Herrero, J. (2005). Building State Institutions. In G. Junne & W. Verkoren (Eds.), *Postconflict development: Meeting new challenges* (pp. 43-58). Boulder, CO: Lynne Rienner.

Hervouet, G. (1988). *The return of Vietnam to the international system* (occasional paper no. 6). Ottawa: Canadian Institute for International Peace and Security.

Hirst, P. and Thompson, G. (1999). *Globalization in question: The international economy and the possibilities of governance*. Cambridge, MA: Polity Press.

Hugo, G. (2003). Demographic change and implications. In Lin Sien Chia (Ed.), *Southeast Asia transformed: A geography of change* (pp. 95-142). Singapore: Institute of Southeast Asian Studies.

Institute of Policy Studies of Singapore (IPS) & United Nations Institute for Training and Research (UNITAR). (1995). *The United Nations Transitional Authority in Cambodia (UNTAC): Debriefing and lessons*. Cambridge, MA: Kluwer Law International.

International Monetary Fund (IMF). (2009). *Factsheet: Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSP)*. Retrieved September 4, 2009 from International Monetary Fund Web site: http://www.imf.org/external/np/exr/facts/prsp.htm.

International Monetary Fund (IMF). (2006). *Cambodia: Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper*. Washington: International Monetary Fund Publication Services.

Jenson, J. (1995). Mapping, naming, and remembering: Globalization at the end of the Twentieth Century. *Review of International Political Economy, 2*(1), 96-116.

Jenson, J. (1993). All the World's a stage: Ideas, spaces, and time in Canadian political economy. In J. Jenson, R. Mahon, and M. Bienefeld (Eds.), *Production, Space, Identity: Political Economy Faces the 21st Century* (pp. 143-170). Toronto: Canadian Scholars Press.

Johnson, J. H. & Watsy, S. S. (1993). *Borrower Ownership of Adjustment Programmes and the Political Economy of Reform*. World Bank Discussion Paper No. 199.

Junne, G. & Verkoren, W. (2005). The Challenges of Postconflict Development. In G. Junne & W. Verkoren (Eds.), *Postconflict development: Meeting new challenges* (pp. 1-18). Boulder, CO: Lynne Rienner.

Kandel, I. (1930). *History of Secondary Education.* Boston: Houghton Mifflin.

Kempner, K & Jurema, A.L. (2002). The global politics of education: Brazil and the World Bank. *Higher Education, 43*(3), 331-354.

Kingdon, J. (1994). *Agendas, alternatives and public policies. 2nd edn*. New York: HarperCollins.

Kubow, P. & Fossum, P. (2007). *Comparative education: Exploring issues in international context.* Upper Saddle River, NJ: Pearson Education, Inc.

Larner, W. (2000). Neo-liberalism: Policy, ideology and governmentality. *Studies in political economy*, *63*, 5-25.

Lefrancois, F. (2004, April 5). World Bank, IMF: Helping peace or creating conditions for war? *Bretton Woods Project*, Update 39.

Levin, B. (2001). Conceptualizing the process of education reform from an international perspective. *Educational Policy Analysis Archives, 9*(14), 1-17.

Lindblad**,** S. & Poplewitz, T. (2004). Introduction: (Re)thinking the problematic of reform. In S. Lindblad and T. Poplewitz (Eds.), *Educational restructuring: International perspectives on traveling policies* (pp. vii-xxxi). Greenwich, CT: Information Age Publishing Inc.

Manzon, M. (2007). Comparing Places. In M. Bray, B. Adamson, and M. Mason (Eds.), *Comparative Education Research: Approaches and Methods* (pp. 85-121). Hong Kong: CERC.

Marginson, S. & Mollis, M. (2001) "The door opens and the tiger leaps": Theories and reflexivities of comparative education for a global millennium. *Comparative Education Review, 45*(4), 581-615.

Martin, M. (1994). *Cambodia: A shattered society*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

McIntyre, R. (2007). Credit co-operatives in locally financed economic development: Using energy efficiency as a lever. In G. Mavrotas & A. Shorrocks (Eds.), *Advancing development: Core themes in global economics* (pp. 578-592). New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Ministry of Education, Youth, and Sport (MoEYS). (2007). *Child friendly school policy*. Phnom Penh: Ministry of Education, Youth, and Sport.

MoEYS. (2005a). *Education Strategic Plan 2006-2010*. Phnom Penh: Ministry of Education, Youth, and Sport.

MoEYS. (2005b). *Education Sector Support Program 2006-2010*. Phnom Penh: Ministry of Education, Youth, and Sport.

MoEYS (2004). *Policy for curriculum development 2005-2009*. Phnom Penh: Ministry of Education, Youth, and Sport.

MoEYS. (2003). *Education for all national plan 2003-2015*. Phnom Penh: Ministry of Education, Youth, and Sport.

Moghadam, V. (2005). *Globalizing women: Transnational feminist networks*. Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press.

Monahan, T. (2005). *Globalization, technological change, and public education*. New York: Routledge.

Morris, S. (1999). *Why Vietnam invaded Cambodia: Political culture and the causes of war*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.

multinational corporation (MNC). (2009). In *Encyclopaedia Britannica*. Retrieved October 04, 2009, from Encyclopaedia Britannica Online: http://www.britannica.com/EBchecked/topic/397067/multinational-corporation

Mysliviec, E. (2003). The Case of Cambodia. In J. Olsson & L. Wohlgemuth (Eds.), *Dialogue in Pursuit of Development* (pp. 107-128). Stockholm: Almquist & Wiksell International.

Newell, P., Rai, S. & Scott, A. (2002). Introduction: Development and the challenge of globalization. In P. Newell, S. Rai, & A. Scott (Eds.), *Development and the Challenge of Globalization* (pp. 1-26). London: ITDG Publishing.

Nguyen-vo, T-h. (1992). *Khmer-Viet relations and the third Indochina conflict*. Jefferson, NC: McFarland & Company, Inc.

O'Halloran, P. (2005). Post-conflict reconstruction: Constitutional and transitional power-sharing arrangements in Bosnia and Kosovo. In S. Noel (Ed.), *From power sharing to democracy: Post-conflict institutions in ethnically divided societies* (pp. 104-119). Montreal & Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press.

Ohmae, K. (1990). *The borderless world: Power and strategy in the interlinked world economy*. New York: Harper Business.

Oxfam (2002). *Rigged rules and double standards*. Oxford: Oxfam.

Pal, L. (2006). *Beyond policy analysis: Public issues management in turbulent times*. Toronto: Nelson.

Pal, L. (1987). *Public policy analysis: An introduction*. Toronto: Methuen.

Pauly, L. (1996). *The League of Nations and the foreshadowing of the International Monetary Fund*. Princeton, NJ: International Finance Section.

Pellini, A. (2007). Decentralization and community participation: School clusters in Cambodia. In H. Daun (Ed.), *School decentralization in the context of globalizing governance* (pp. 175-194). Dordrecht, Netherlands: Springer.

Plunkett, M. (2005). Reestablishing the Rule of Law. In G. Junne & W. Verkoren (Eds.), *Postconflict development: Meeting new challenges* (pp. 73-98). Boulder, CO: Lynne Rienner.

Poon, J. (2001). Regionalism in the Asia-Pacific: Is geography destiny? *Area, 33* (3), 252-260.

Popkewitz, T. (2004). Partnerships, the social pact, and changing systems of reason in a comparative perspective. In B. Franklin, M. Bloch, and T. Popkewitz (Eds.), *Educational partnerships and the state: The paradoxes of governing schools, children and families* (pp. 27-54). New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Ragin, C. (1987). *The comparative method: Moving beyond qualitative and quantitative strategies*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Reich, R. (1991). *The work of nations*. New York: Vintage Books.

Rezai-Rashti, G. (2009). The assault of neo-liberalism on education reform, restructuring, and teaching in Ontario secondary schools. In C. Levine-Rasky (Ed), *Canadian perspectives on the sociology of education* (pp. 307-321). Toronto: Oxford University Press.

Rezai-Rashti, G. (2004). Introduction. *Canadian and International Education*, *33*(1), 1-6.

Rideout, W. (2000). Decentralization in Sub-Sharan Africa. In N. Stromquist and K. Monkman (Eds.), *Globalization and Education: Integration and Contestation across cultures* (pp. 255-274). Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield.

Royal Government of Cambodia (RGoC). (2007). *Law on Education*. Phnom Penh: Royal Government of Cambodia.

RGoC. (2004). *Declaration by the Royal Government of Cambodia and development partners on harmonization and alignment*. Phnom Penh: Royal Government of Cambodia.

RGoC. (2002). *National Policy of Non-Formal Education*. Phnom Penh: Royal Government of Cambodia.

Ritzen, J. (2005). *A chance for the World Bank*. London: Anthem Press.

Rizvi, F. (2000). International education and the production of global imagination. In N. Burbules and C. Torres (Eds.), *Globalization and education: Critical perspectives* (pp. 205-225). New York: Routledge.

Rizvi, F. and Lingard, B. (2006). Globalization and the changing nature of the OECD's educational work. In H. Lauder, P. Brown, J. Dillabough and A.H. Halsey (Eds.), *Education, globalization, and social change* (pp. 247-260). Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Rose, N. (1993). Government, Authority, and Expertise in Advanced Liberalism. *Economy and Society*, *22*, 263-300.

Ross, R. (1987). *Cambodia: A country study*. Washington: GPO for the Library of Congress.

Rugman, A. & Doh, J. (2008). *Multinationals and Development*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.

Sadler, M. (1907). *Continuation Schools in England and Elsewhere*. Manchester: Manchester University Press.

Said, E. (1989). Representing the Colonized: Anthropology's Interlocutors. *Critical Inquiry, 15*(2), 205-225.

Samatar, A. (1993). Structural adjustment as development strategy? Bananas, boom, and poverty in Somaila. *Economic Geography, 69*(1), 25-43.

Scatamburlo-D'Annibale, V. and McLaren, P. (2008). Contesting the new "Young Hegelians": Interrogating capitalism in a world of "*difference*". In P. Pericles Trifonas (Ed.), *Worlds of difference: Rethinking the ethics of global education for the 21st century* (pp. 137-178). Boulder, CO: Paradigm Publishers.

Schriewer, J. (2000). Comparative education methodology in transition: Towards the study of complexity? In J. Schriewer (Ed.), *Discourse formation in comparative education* (pp. 3-52). New York: P. Lang

Schultz, T. & Merrill, S. (2007). From bullets to ballots: the US Army role in stability and reconstruction operations. In D. Brinkerhoff (Ed.), *Governance in post-conflict societies: Rebuilding fragile states* (pp. 115-142). New York: Routledge.

Seo, Y. (2006). A brief history of Cambodia. In J. Dator, D. Pratt & Y. Seo (Eds.), *Fairness, globalization, and public institutions* (pp. 307-311). Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press.

Short, P. (2004). *Pol Pot: The history of a nightmare*. London: John Murray Publishers.

Sisowath, C. (2006). Globalization and generational change: The evolution of Cambodia's social structure. In J. Dator, D. Pratt & Y. Seo (Eds.), *Fairness, globalization, and public institutions* (pp. 300-307). Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press.

Smetherham, D. (1978). Insider Research. *British Educational Research Journal, 4*(2), 97-102.

Smith, M. (2008). Education and Post-Conflict Recovery. In B. Hart (Ed.), *Peacebuilding in Traumatized Societies* (pp. 65-82). Lanham, MD: University Press of America.

Southeast Asian Ministers of Education Organization Regional Center for Educational Innovation and Technology (SEAMEO INNOTECH) (2003). *Cambodia: Administration and management of the education system.* Retrieved September 3, 2009 from http://www.seameoinnotech.org/resources/seameo_country/ educ_data/cambodia/ cambodia4.htm

Spring, J. (2009). *Globalization of education*. New York: Routledge.

Spring, J. (2006). *Pedagogies of globalization: The rise of the educational security state*. Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Starr, A. (2000). *Naming the enemy: Anti-corporate movements confront globalization*. London: Zed Books.

Steiner-Khamsi, G. (2006). The economics of policy borrowing and lending : A study of late adopters. *Oxford Review of Education, 32*(5), 665-678.

Steiner-Khamsi, G. (2000). Transferring education, displacing reforms. In J. Schriewer (Ed.), *Discourse formation in comparative education* (pp. 155- 188). New York: P. Lang.

Stenhouse, L. (1979). Case study in comparative education: Particularity and generalisation. *Comparative Education*, *15*(1), 5-10.

Stone, D. & Wright, C. (2007). Introduction: The currency of change: World Bank lending and learning in the Wolfensohn era. In D. Stone and C. Wright (Eds.), *The World Bank and governance: A decade of reform and reaction* (pp. 1-26). New York: Routledge.

Stromquist, N. & Monkman, K. (2000). Defining globalization and assessing its implications on knowledge and education. In N. Stromquist and K. Monkman (Eds.), *Globalization and education: Integration and contestation across cultures* (pp. 3-25). Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield Publishers.

Suárez-Orozco, M. and Sattin, C. (2007). Introduction: Learning in the global era. In M. Suárez-Orozco (Ed.), *Learning in the global era: International perspectives on globalization and education* (pp. 1-43). Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

Sweetland, S. (1996). Human capital theory: Foundations of a field of inquiry. *Review of Educational Research*, *66*(3), 341-359.

Tan, Celine (2007). The poverty of amnesia: PRSPs in the legacy of structural adjustment. In D. Stone and C. Wright (Eds.), *The World Bank and governance: A decade of reform and reaction* (pp. 147-167). New York: Routledge.

Tan, Charlene (2007). Education reforms in Cambodia: Issues and concerns. *Educational Research for Policy and Practice, 6*(1), 15-24.

Taylor, S. and Henry, M. (2007). Globalization and educational policymaking: a case study. In B. Lingard and J. Ozga (Eds.), *The Routledge Falmer reader in education policy and politics* (pp. 101-116). New York: Routledge.

Tehranian, M. (2002). Globalization and governance: An overview. In E. Aksu and J. Camilleri (Eds.), *Democratizing global governance* (pp. 3-27). New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Terhart, E. (1985). The adventures of interpretation: Approaches to validity. *Curriculum Inquiry, 15*(4), 451-464.

Titarenko, M. (2002). Russia, China, and India in the global world. *Medzdunarodnaya Dzizn, 6*, 54-64.

Tomlinson, S. (2001). *Education in a post-welfare society*. Buckingham: Open University Press.

Torres, C. A. (2003). Comparative education: The dialectics of globalization and its discontents. In R. Arnove and C. A. Torres (Eds.), *Comparative education: The dialectic of the global and the local* (pp. 446-461). Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield Publishers Ltd.

Torres, R-M. (2003). Improving the quality of basic education? The strategies of the World Bank. In E. Beauchamp (Ed.), *Comparative education reader* (pp. 299-328). New York: RoutledgeFalmer.

Toussaint, E. (2008). *The World Bank: A critical primer* (E. Anne, V. Briault, B. Declercq, S. Dhar, J. Harris, R. Krishnan, M. Lagatta, C. Pagnoulle, V. Renard, G. Sloane-Seale, & D. Valayden, Trans.). London: Pluto Press. (Original work published 2006)

Toye, J. (1992). Interest group politics and the implementation of Adjustment policies in Sub-Saharan Africa. *Journal of International Development, 2*(4), 183-197.

UNESCO (2004). *Participation of UNESCO in the Education Sector Working Group (Cambodia)*. Phnom Penh: UNESCO.

UNESCO. (1991). *Intersectoral basic needs assessment mission to Cambodia*. Bangkok: UNESCO.

UNICEF (2005). *Country Programme Evaluation Royal Government of Cambodia*. New York: United Nations Children's Fund.

Urata, S. (1998). Regionalization and the Formation of Regional Institutions in East Asia. In K. Fukasaku, F. Kimura, & S. Urata (Eds.), *Asia & Europe: Beyond competing regionalism* (pp. 13-44). Portland: Sussex Academic Press.

Utkin, A.I. (2001). *Globalization: A process and a comprehention.* Moscow: Logos.

Vavrus, F. & Bartlett, L. (2006). Comparatively knowing: Making a case for the vertical case study. *Current issues in comparative education, 8*(2), 95-103.

Verkoren, W. (2005). Bringing it all together: A case study of Cambodia. In G. Junne & W. Verkoren (Eds.), *Postconflict development: Meeting new challenges* (pp. 289-306). Boulder, CO: Lynne Rienner.

Waters, M. (1995). *Globalization*. London: Routledge.

Weaver, C. E. & Leiteritz, R. J. (2005). Our poverty is a world full of dreams: Reforming the World Bank. *Global Governance, 11*(3), 369-388.

Whitehead, J. (2003). *Escaping the circle of hate: The role of education in building sustainable peace.* Nottingham, UK: Educational Heretics Press.

Williams, D. (2008). *The World Bank and Social Transformation in International Politics: Liberalism, governance and sovereignty*. New York: Routledge.

Williams, W. (1982). *Studying implementation: Methodological and administrative issues*. Chatham, NJ: Chatham House.

Wolf, E. (2001). *Pathways of power: Building an anthropology of the modern world*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

Woodward, S (1995). *Balkan Tragedy*. Washington: The Brookings Institution.

World Bank (2008). *Ethnic Minorities Action Plan: Education sector support scale up action program*. Washington: World Bank.

World Bank (2005a). *Cambodia: Education Sector Support Program.* Washington: World Bank.

World Bank (2005b). *Country assistance strategy for the Kingdom of Cambodia.* Washington: World Bank.

World Bank (2004). *2003 Annual Review of Development Effectiveness: The effectiveness of bank support for policy reform.* Washington: World Bank.

World Bank (1995). *Priorities and strategies for education: A World Bank sector review.* Washington, DC: World Bank.

Zimmer, Z., Knodel, J., Kim, K.S., & Puch, S. (2006). The impact of pact conflicts and social disruption on the elderly in Cambodia. *Population and Development Review, 32*(2), 333-360.

Zoomers, A. (2007). Three decades of rural development projects in Asia, Latin America and Africa: Learning from successes and failures. In G. Mavrotas & A. Shorrocks (Eds.), *Advancing development: Core themes in global economics* (pp. 493-517). New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Curriculum Vitae

Name: Kelly T. Crowley

Post-secondary   University of Western Ontario
Education and   London, Ontario, Canada
Degrees: 1994-1998 B.A. (Anthropology)

                       University of Western Ontario
                       London, Ontario, Canada
                       1999-2000 M.A. (Journalism)

                       University of Western Ontario
                       London, Ontario, Canada
                       2001-2002 B.Ed.

                       University of Western Ontario
                       London, Ontario, Canada
                       2004-2006 M.A. (Anthropology)

                       University of Western Ontario
                       London, Ontario, Canada
                       2006-2010 Ph.D.

Honours and   Ontario Scholar
Awards: 1994

                       University of Western Ontario Entrance Scholarship
                       1994

                       Grad Club Bursary
                       2008

                       University of Western Ontario Graduate Scholarship
                       2004-2006, 2006-2010

Related Work   Teaching Assistant
Experience: University of Western Ontario
                       2004-2006, 2006-2008

                       Research Assistant
                       University of Western Ontario
                       2008-2010

Conferences: Comparative and International Education Societies Annual
Conference
Baltimore, Maryland, United States of America
March 2007

World Congress of Comparative and International Education
Societies
Sarajevo, Bosnia,
September 2007

Conference for Higher Education in Southeast Asia
Siem Reap, Cambodia
January 2008

ACLA-CAAL
Co-presented with Suzanne Majhanovich, Maureen Smith and
Farahnaz Faez
Ottawa, Ontario, Canada
May 2009

CSSE
Montreal, Quebec, Canada
May 2010

Publications:
Crowley-Thorogood, K. (2010). National Isolation vs. National Incorporation: a
comparative examination of the historical development of education policies for
indigenous people in Mexico and Canada. In V. Masemann and S. Majhanovich (Eds.),
Clamouring for a Better World: The life and work of David N. Wilson. Rotterdam: Sense
Publishers.

Crowley-Thorogood, K. (2010). Cambodian national education policy: Global wants
or/and local   needs? *Canadian and International Education* (forthcoming).

Reports:
Describing FSL language competencies: The CEFR within an Ontario context (Research
report to the Ontario Ministry of Education on the study of the French immersion
participants), March 2010
Co-authored with Suzanne Majhanovich, Farahnaz Faez, Maureen Smith, Shelley Taylor,
Laurens Vandergrift, Patrick Brown, Hongfang Yu, Jordana Garbati

Describing FSL language competencies: The CEFR within an Ontario context (Research
report to the Ontario Ministry of Education on the study of the French core **and**
immersion participants), June 2010
Co-authored with Suzanne Majhanovich, Farahnaz Faez, Maureen Smith, Shelley Taylor,
Laurens Vandergrift, Patrick Brown, Hongfang Yu, Jordana Garbati