2000

NATO and the Bomb, Canadian Defenders Confront Critics

Erika Simpson

Political Science, simpson@uwo.ca

Follow this and additional works at: <https://ir.lib.uwo.ca/politicalsciencepub>

Part of the [Political Science Commons](#)

Citation of this paper:

Simpson, Erika, "NATO and the Bomb, Canadian Defenders Confront Critics" (2000). *Political Science Publications*. 103.
<https://ir.lib.uwo.ca/politicalsciencepub/103>

NATO THE BOMB

CANADIAN DEFENDERS CONFRONT CRITICS

ERIKA SIMPSON

NATO and the Bomb
*Canadian Defenders
Confront Critics*

ERIKA SIMPSON

McGill-Queen's University Press
Montreal & Kingston · London · Ithaca

Contents

Acknowledgments / ix

Abbreviations and Definitions / xiii

Introduction: Leader's Belief Systems and Canada's Defence
Commitments / 3

- 1 Canada's NATO Commitments during the Cold War / 9
- 2 Canadian Belief Systems in Context / 25
- 3 The Belief Systems of Defenders: General Patterns between 1963
and 1989 / 41
- 4 The Belief Systems of Critics: General Patterns between 1963 and
1989 / 72
- 5 A Case Study: The Diefenbaker Government's Shifting NATO
Commitments, 1957-1963 / 100
- 6 The Traditional Beliefs and Assumptions of Defenders, 1957-
1963 / 127
- 7 The Original Beliefs of Critics and the Onset of New Ways of
Thinking, 1957-1963 / 159
- 8 The Root Causes of Confrontation: Reasons for Defenders' and
Critics' Belief Systems, 1930s to 1980s / 184

Conclusion: The Dilemma of Alliance Membership / 221

Notes / 231

Bibliography / 321

Index / 339

Acknowledgments

To help explain Canada's approach to the North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO) during the Cold War years, this book documents the underlying beliefs and assumptions of high-level policy-makers. Its central argument is that for over thirty years two belief systems – the "Defenders" and the "Critics" – significantly influenced Canadian defence policy regarding NATO. The beliefs and assumptions of these two groups affected decision-making between 1957 and 1963 – particularly regarding nuclear weapon acquisitions – and policy-making between 1963 and 1989 – especially regarding Canada's troop contributions to Europe. The release of previously classified materials and Cabinet documents from the Cold War years has made it possible to better appreciate some Canadian leaders' assumptions and approaches.

In the past, political scientists and historians who wrote about Canada and NATO were obliged to use secondary sources or rely on personal experiences. For this book, many heretofore-classified documents were obtained through the Access to Information Act (1982). A wide variety of newly released Cabinet minutes, memoranda, personal letters, diaries, original drafts of speeches, and departmental files were examined with a view to discerning the underlying beliefs of high-level decision-makers. The Historical Section of the Department of Foreign Affairs, the Directorate of History in the Department of National Defence, the Privy Council Office, the Public Archives of Canada, and the John G. Diefenbaker Centre provided material. Interviews were conducted in Ottawa and Toronto, as well as at NATO headquarters. I am particularly grateful to the Canadian Institute for International Peace and Security and the Department of Foreign Affairs and International Trade for grants enabling me to complete this book. These awards were a great encouragement to

pursue research in Canadian security and defence policy. As well, scholarships awarded by the Department of National Defence Military and Strategic Studies Doctoral Fellowship program helped me pursue sources in Ottawa, Brussels, Toronto, and Saskatoon. The Department of National Defence and the Department of Foreign Affairs' interest in funding a long-term research project and providing travel funds was much appreciated. Special thanks also go to the Social Science and Humanities Research Council of Canada doctoral program for assistance. The opportunity in 1991-92 to work as a Research Fellow through the NATO Research Fellowship Programme, which aims to promote study on aspects relevant to NATO, was valuable too. At different times, the Centre for International Studies in Toronto and the Associates of the University of Toronto Travel Grant Fund helped finance travel to Ottawa and Toronto as well as research at NATO and SHAPE headquarters. The assistance of the Vice-President's (Research) Special Competition; the Agnes Cole Dark Fund, Faculty of Social Science; and the V.P. Smallman Fund of the University of Western Ontario is acknowledged as well. To all these organizations and a great number of individuals, I am truly thankful.

I am indebted as well to a number of persons who have offered advice and criticism. My particular thanks go to Professor Cranford Pratt, who read many different versions of each chapter, offered countless valuable suggestions, and was always a source of encouragement and sustenance. I would also like to thank Professor Janice Gross Stein for her support over the years, and Professor David Welch, who provided many astute suggestions. The book greatly benefited, too, from the insightful and constructive comments of Don Ward in Saskatoon.

I also wish to thank Wendy Dayton for her exceedingly helpful and meticulous assistance in editing this manuscript; Professor Bob Young for his pertinent advice; and Phil Cercone, Joan McGilvray, Joanne Pisano, and John Zucchi at McGill-Queen's University Press for their invaluable work in connection with the publication of this book.

The assistance of the following people was also very helpful during the research process: Isabelle Campbell and Owen Cooke in the Directorate of History at the Department of National Defence; Hector Mackenzie, John Hilliker, Greg Donaghy, Mary Halloran, and Ted Kelly in the Historical Section at the Department of Foreign Affairs; John Fletcher and Thelma Nicholson in the Privy Council Office; and Paul Marsden, Dick McClelland, Maureen Hoogenraad, and Loretta Barber at the Public Archives of Canada. Geoffrey Pearson very kindly provided information about Canadian decision-making, as well as access to the Lester B. Pearson Collection. Roger Hill at the

Canadian Institute of International Peace and Security allowed me to cite from the CIIPS transcripts. Special thanks also goes to Elizabeth Diamond, archivist at the John G. Diefenbaker Centre in Saskatoon, Saskatchewan for providing access to Diefenbaker's papers. In addition, Jane Barrett, Clayton Beattie, Gayle Fraser, Jack Granatstein, Knowlton Nash, and Basil Robinson provided invaluable information and inciteful comments.

In Ottawa and Brussels, I had the privilege of meeting many individuals who greatly contributed to my understanding of international affairs, alliances, and Canadian foreign and defence policy. Some of these are listed in the bibliography. The views and comments of delegates at NATO and the Supreme Headquarters Allied Power Europe (SHAPE) headquarters, many of whom have had considerable experience in NATO matters, provided an excellent cross-section of informed opinion.

Special thanks for their loving assistance go to my immediate family – Graham, Margarete, Janet, Michael, and Merran – and to my extended family – Howard, Marion, David, Susan, and Megan. My partner, Howard Peter Langille, offered many valuable suggestions and unfailing encouragement, proving that the best of friends can also be the best of partners.

Abbreviations and Definitions

ACE	Allied Command Europe
AEW	Airborne Early Warning
ALCM	Air-Launched Cruise Missile
ASW	Anti-Submarine Warfare
Bomarc	surface-to-air anti-aircraft missile
CAST	Canadian Air-Sea Transportable brigade
CCF	Co-operative Commonwealth Federation
CFB	Canadian Forces Base
CFE	Canadian Forces Europe
CF-100	A.V. Roe Canuck jet fighter
CF-101	McDonnell Douglas Voodoo interceptor
CF-104	Lockheed Starfighter interceptor/ground attack aircraft
CF-105	A.V. Roe Avro Arrow interceptor
CF-5	Northrop Freedom Fighter interceptor
CINCNORAD	Commander-in-Chief, NORAD
CIIPS	Canadian Institute for International Peace and Security
DEA	Department of External Affairs
DEW	Distant Early Warning line

DFAIT	Department of Foreign Affairs and International Trade (formerly Department of External Affairs)
DND	Department of National Defence
DHist	Directorate of History, DND, Ottawa
F-101B	US version of the CF-101, or Voodoo interceptor
F-104G	US version of the CF-104, or Starfighter
GLCM	Ground-Launched Cruise Missile
GNP	Gross National Product
<i>Hansard</i>	House of Commons Debates
H-bomb	Hydrogen bomb
Honest John	short-range surface-to-surface dual-capable missile
ICBM	Intercontinental Ballistic Missile
JGD Centre	Right Honourable John G. Diefenbaker Centre
Lacrosse	short-range dual-capable atomic missile
MBFR	Mutual and Balanced Force Reduction talks
MND	Minister of National Defence
MG	Manuscript Group
MP	Member of Parliament
NA	National Archives of Canada (formerly Public Archives of Canada)
NACC	North Atlantic Cooperation Council
NATO	North Atlantic Treaty Organization
NATO HQS	NATO Headquarters, Brussels, Belgium
NDP	New Democratic Party
NORAD	North American Air Defence (now Aerospace) Command
OAS	Organization of American States
PAL	Permissive Action Link
PJBD	Permanent Joint Board on Defence
PCO	Privy Council Office

PMO	Prime Minister's Office
RCAF	Royal Canadian Air Force
SAC	Strategic Air Command
SACEUR	Supreme Allied Commander, Europe
SACLANT	Supreme Allied Commander, Atlantic
SAGE	Semi-Automatic Ground Environment radar detection system
SCEAND	Standing Committee on External Affairs and National Defence
SCOND	Standing Committee on National Defence
SHAPE	Supreme Headquarters Allied Powers Europe
SSBN	ballistic missile-firing nuclear-powered submarine
SS-20	Soviet intermediate-range ballistic missile
STAFEUR	Special Task Force on Europe
Starfighter	CF-104 aircraft
TNF	Theatre Nuclear Forces
TNT	trinitrotoluene (high explosive)
UK	United Kingdom
UN	United Nations
US	United States
USAF	United States Air Force
USSR	Union of Soviet Socialist Republics
Voodoo	CF-101 interceptor