2000

NATO and the Bomb, Canadian Defenders Confront Critics

Erika Simpson

Political Science, simpson@uwo.ca

Follow this and additional works at: https://ir.lib.uwo.ca/politicalsciencepub

Part of the Political Science Commons

Citation of this paper:


https://ir.lib.uwo.ca/politicalsciencepub/103
NATO AND THE BOMB
CANADIAN DEFENDERS CONFRONT CRITICS
ERIKA SIMPSON
Acknowledgments / ix
Abbreviations and Definitions / xiii

Introduction: Leader’s Belief Systems and Canada’s Defence Commitments / 3

1 Canada’s NATO Commitments during the Cold War / 9
2 Canadian Belief Systems in Context / 25
3 The Belief Systems of Defenders: General Patterns between 1963 and 1989 / 41
4 The Belief Systems of Critics: General Patterns between 1963 and 1989 / 72
5 A Case Study: The Diefenbaker Government’s Shifting NATO Commitments, 1957–1963 / 100
6 The Traditional Beliefs and Assumptions of Defenders, 1957–1963 / 127
7 The Original Beliefs of Critics and the Onset of New Ways of Thinking, 1957–1963 / 159
8 The Root Causes of Confrontation: Reasons for Defenders’ and Critics’ Belief Systems, 1930s to 1980s / 184

Conclusion: The Dilemma of Alliance Membership / 221

Notes / 231
Bibliography / 321
Index / 339
Acknowledgments

To help explain Canada’s approach to the North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO) during the Cold War years, this book documents the underlying beliefs and assumptions of high-level policy-makers. Its central argument is that for over thirty years two belief systems—the “Defenders” and the “Critics”—significantly influenced Canadian defence policy regarding NATO. The beliefs and assumptions of these two groups affected decision-making between 1957 and 1963—particularly regarding nuclear weapon acquisitions—and policy-making between 1963 and 1989—especially regarding Canada’s troop contributions to Europe. The release of previously classified materials and Cabinet documents from the Cold War years has made it possible to better appreciate some Canadian leaders’ assumptions and approaches.

In the past, political scientists and historians who wrote about Canada and NATO were obliged to use secondary sources or rely on personal experiences. For this book, many heretofore-classified documents were obtained through the Access to Information Act (1982). A wide variety of newly released Cabinet minutes, memoranda, personal letters, diaries, original drafts of speeches, and departmental files were examined with a view to discerning the underlying beliefs of high-level decision-makers. The Historical Section of the Department of Foreign Affairs, the Directorate of History in the Department of National Defence, the Privy Council Office, the Public Archives of Canada, and the John G. Diefenbaker Centre provided material. Interviews were conducted in Ottawa and Toronto, as well as at NATO headquarters. I am particularly grateful to the Canadian Institute for International Peace and Security and the Department of Foreign Affairs and International Trade for grants enabling me to complete this book. These awards were a great encouragement to
pursue research in Canadian security and defence policy. As well, scholarships awarded by the Department of National Defence Military and Strategic Studies Doctoral Fellowship program helped me pursue sources in Ottawa, Brussels, Toronto, and Saskatoon. The Department of National Defence and the Department of Foreign Affairs' interest in funding a long-term research project and providing travel funds was much appreciated. Special thanks also go to the Social Science and Humanities Research Council of Canada doctoral program for assistance. The opportunity in 1991-92 to work as a Research Fellow through the NATO Research Fellowship Programme, which aims to promote study on aspects relevant to NATO, was valuable too. At different times, the Centre for International Studies in Toronto and the Associates of the University of Toronto Travel Grant Fund helped finance travel to Ottawa and Toronto as well as research at NATO and SHAPE headquarters. The assistance of the Vice-President's (Research) Special Competition; the Agnes Cole Dark Fund, Faculty of Social Science; and the V.P. Smallman Fund of the University of Western Ontario is acknowledged as well. To all these organizations and a great number of individuals, I am truly thankful.

I am indebted as well to a number of persons who have offered advice and criticism. My particular thanks go to Professor Cranford Pratt, who read many different versions of each chapter, offered countless valuable suggestions, and was always a source of encouragement and sustenance. I would also like to thank Professor Janice Gross Stein for her support over the years, and Professor David Welch, who provided many astute suggestions. The book greatly benefited, too, from the insightful and constructive comments of Don Ward in Saskatoon.

I also wish to thank Wendy Dayton for her exceedingly helpful and meticulous assistance in editing this manuscript; Professor Bob Young for his pertinent advice; and Phil Cercone, Joan McGilvray, Joanne Pisano, and John Zucchi at McGill-Queen's University Press for their invaluable work in connection with the publication of this book.

The assistance of the following people was also very helpful during the research process: Isabelle Campbell and Owen Cooke in the Directorate of History at the Department of National Defence; Hector Mackenzie, John Hilliker, Greg Donaghy, Mary Halloran, and Ted Kelly in the Historical Section at the Department of Foreign Affairs; John Fletcher and Thelma Nicholson in the Privy Council Office; and Paul Marsden, Dick McClelland, Maureen Hoogenraad, and Loretta Barber at the Public Archives of Canada. Geoffrey Pearson very kindly provided information about Canadian decision-making, as well as access to the Lester B. Pearson Collection. Roger Hill at the
Canadian Institute of International Peace and Security allowed me to cite from the CIIPS transcripts. Special thanks also goes to Elizabeth Diamond, archivist at the John G. Diefenbaker Centre in Saskatoon, Saskatchewan for providing access to Diefenbaker’s papers. In addition, Jane Barrett, Clayton Beattie, Gayle Fraser, Jack Granatstein, Knowlton Nash, and Basil Robinson provided invaluable information and inciteful comments.

In Ottawa and Brussels, I had the privilege of meeting many individuals who greatly contributed to my understanding of international affairs, alliances, and Canadian foreign and defence policy. Some of these are listed in the bibliography. The views and comments of delegates at NATO and the Supreme Headquarters Allied Power Europe (SHAPE) headquarters, many of whom have had considerable experience in NATO matters, provided an excellent cross-section of informed opinion.

Special thanks for their loving assistance go to my immediate family – Graham, Margarete, Janet, Michael, and Merran – and to my extended family – Howard, Marion, David, Susan, and Megan. My partner, Howard Peter Langille, offered many valuable suggestions and unfailing encouragement, proving that the best of friends can also be the best of partners.
Abbreviations and Definitions

ACE Allied Command Europe
AEW Airborne Early Warning
ALCM Air-Launched Cruise Missile
ASW Anti-Submarine Warfare
Bomarc surface-to-air anti-aircraft missile
CAST Canadian Air-Sea Transportable brigade
CCF Co-operative Commonwealth Federation
CFB Canadian Forces Base
CFE Canadian Forces Europe
CF-100 A.V. Roe Canuck jet fighter
CF-101 McDonnell Douglas Voodoo interceptor
CF-104 Lockheed Starfighter interceptor/ground attack aircraft
CF-105 A.V. Roe Avro Arrow interceptor
CF-5 Northrop Freedom Fighter interceptor
CINC NORAD Commander-in-Chief, NORAD
CIIPS Canadian Institute for International Peace and Security
DEA Department of External Affairs
DEW Distant Early Warning line
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DFAIT</td>
<td>Department of Foreign Affairs and International Trade (formerly Department of External Affairs)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DND</td>
<td>Department of National Defence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DHist</td>
<td>Directorate of History, DND, Ottawa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F-101B</td>
<td>US version of the CF-101, or Voodoo interceptor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F-104G</td>
<td>US version of the CF-104, or Starfighter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GLCM</td>
<td>Ground-Launched Cruise Missile</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GNP</td>
<td>Gross National Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hansard</td>
<td>House of Commons Debates</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H-bomb</td>
<td>Hydrogen bomb</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Honest John</td>
<td>short-range surface-to-surface dual-capable missile</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICBM</td>
<td>Intercontinental Ballistic Missile</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JGD Centre</td>
<td>Right Honourable John G. Diefenbaker Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lacrosse</td>
<td>short-range dual-capable atomic missile</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MBFR</td>
<td>Mutual and Balanced Force Reduction talks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MND</td>
<td>Minister of National Defence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MG</td>
<td>Manuscript Group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MP</td>
<td>Member of Parliament</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NA</td>
<td>National Archives of Canada (formerly Public Archives of Canada)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NACC</td>
<td>North Atlantic Cooperation Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NATO</td>
<td>North Atlantic Treaty Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NATO HQS</td>
<td>NATO Headquarters, Brussels, Belgium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDP</td>
<td>New Democratic Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NORAD</td>
<td>North American Air Defence (now Aerospace) Command</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OAS</td>
<td>Organization of American States</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAL</td>
<td>Permissive Action Link</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PJBD</td>
<td>Permanent Joint Board on Defence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PCO</td>
<td>Privy Council Office</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PMO  Prime Minister's Office
RCAF  Royal Canadian Air Force
SAC  Strategic Air Command
SACEUR  Supreme Allied Commander, Europe
SACLANT  Supreme Allied Commander, Atlantic
SAGE  Semi-Automatic Ground Environment radar detection system
SCEAND  Standing Committee on External Affairs and National Defence
SCOND  Standing Committee on National Defence
SHAPE  Supreme Headquarters Allied Powers Europe
SSBN  ballistic missile-firing nuclear-powered submarine
SS-20  Soviet intermediate-range ballistic missile
STAFEUR  Special Task Force on Europe
Starfighter  CF-104 aircraft
TNF  Theatre Nuclear Forces
TNT  trinitrotoluene (high explosive)
UK  United Kingdom
UN  United Nations
US  United States
USAF  United States Air Force
USSR  Union of Soviet Socialist Republics
Voodoo  CF-101 interceptor