5-26-2011

Mentoring in English Canadian Academic Libraries

Marni R. Harrington
The University of Western Ontario, mharring@uwo.ca

Elizabeth Marshall
The University of Western Ontario, emarsha3@uwo.ca

Follow this and additional works at: http://ir.lib.uwo.ca/wlpres
Part of the Archival Science Commons

Citation of this paper:
http://ir.lib.uwo.ca/wlpres/28
Mentoring in Canadian Academic Libraries

Marni Harrington & Elizabeth Marshall

2011 CLA Conference – Halifax NS
Roadmap

1. Mentoring background, briefly
2. Some other research
3. Overview of our research
4. Some results
5. Conclusions
6. Feedback, discussion, questions
Mentoring & Libraries
Recent Research

• Case reviews
• Minority groups
• Retention / promotion / advancement

8 Rs Study:

- **Recruitment**
- **Retention**
- **Reaccreditation**
- **Repatriation**
- **Retirement**
- **Restructuring**
- Remuneration
- Rejuvenation

Formal role for mentoring

- New librarians – recruitment
- Current librarians – retention, restructuring
- Administration – retirement, restructuring
Other Canadian Content

Mentoring Programs: In Search of the Perfect Model (Law, 2001)

McMaster University pilot project (2007-08, unpublished)

The Practice of Mentoring: reflecting on the critical aspects for leadership development (Hicks, 2011)
Mentoring in Canadian Academic Libraries

• Explore mentoring programs, opportunities and expectations

• New MLIS grads, practicing librarians, library administration

• College and university libraries
Mentoring is when a trusted and experienced individual acts as a friend, advisor, coach, guide, teacher or role model to someone less experienced and in need of such a relationship.
More definitions
(for the purposes of our research...)

• **Mentor** – a person who acts as a guide, adviser and / or provides support to another person

• **Mentee** – a person who receives guidance and / or support from another person

• **Formal** – organized by administration, expected to participate

• **Informal** – independently seek someone out with more experience (or new experience)
Survey methodology

• Collect email addresses:
  – MLIS Graduates
  – Librarians
  – Directors, deans or heads

• Distribute web survey
  – Fluid Surveys

• Analyze data
Recent MLIS Graduates* (Grad)

- Seeking academic library position
- Mentoring expectations
- 23 completed responses

*in progress
Academic Librarians (Lib)

- College or university
- Mentoring experiences
- Mentoring expectations
- Demographic information
Academic Librarians N=292

Response Rates
College: 17%
University: 21%
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Lib-College (43)</th>
<th>Lib-University (245)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Full-time professional librarian</td>
<td>77%</td>
<td>82%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female to Male ratio</td>
<td>3:1</td>
<td>6:1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Librarians by Age

- **Lib-College**
  - 20-30 yrs: 10
  - 31-40 yrs: 6
  - 41-50 yrs: 12
  - 51-60 yrs: 11
  - >61 yrs: 2

- **Lib-University**
  - 20-30 yrs: 25
  - 31-40 yrs: 84
  - 41-50 yrs: 56
  - 51-60 yrs: 53
  - >61 yrs: 16
Number of years as academic librarian

- 0 to 5 yrs
- 6 to 10 yrs
- 11 to 20 yrs
- >21 yrs

Lib-Course
- 16
- 11
- 10
- 5

Lib-University
- 80
- 52
- 53
- 53
Librarians by student population

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>&lt;5,000 students</th>
<th>5-10,000 students</th>
<th>10-20,000 students</th>
<th>&gt;20,000 students</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lib-College</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lib-University</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Library Administration (Adm)

• Director, dean or head of libraries (one per institution)
• Mentoring experiences and expectations
• Institutional support
• Success / Costs / Risks
• Demographic information
Academic Administration N=21

- College Library: 67%
- University Library: 33%

Response Rates
Adm-College: 13%
Adm-University: 18%
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Adm-College (7)</th>
<th>Adm-University (14)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Female to Male ratio</td>
<td>1:2</td>
<td>6:1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Image of gender ratio]
A Canadian Perspective?
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Province</th>
<th>Lib-College (n=43)</th>
<th>Lib-University (n=245)</th>
<th>Adm-College (n=7)</th>
<th>Adm-University (n=14)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>British Columbia</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alberta</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manitoba</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saskatchewan</td>
<td></td>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ontario</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quebec</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Brunswick</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nova Scotia</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Newfoundland and Labrador</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prince Edward Island</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yukon</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nunavut</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northwest Territories</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Research Questions

1: Who is mentoring?
2: What are mentoring expectations?
3: What are important mentoring activities?
4: Is mentoring supported by administration?
1. Who is mentoring?
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Lib-College</th>
<th>Lib-University</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes, formal mentoring</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes, informal mentoring</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No mentoring</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Are you a mentor **within** your library?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Lib-College:</th>
<th>Adm-College:</th>
<th>Lib-University:</th>
<th>Adm-University:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>✓21%</td>
<td>✓29%</td>
<td>✓29%</td>
<td>✓50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>✓89% formal</td>
<td>✓100% informal</td>
<td>✓22% formal</td>
<td>✓100% informal</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Are you a mentor outside of your library?

Lib-College:
- ✓ 7%
  - ✓ 67% formal

Lib-University:
- ✓ 20%
  - ✓ 23% formal

Adm-College:
- ✓ 0%

Adm-University:
- ✓ 50%
  - ✓ 57% formal
Librarians: *Is there a relationship b/w mentoring and student population?*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of students</th>
<th>We have a mentoring program</th>
<th>% Yes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>YES</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&lt;5,000</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5-10,000</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10-20,000</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&gt;20,000</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**YES** \( \chi^2(3) = 12.58, p < .05 \)
Librarians: *Is there a relationship between being mentored and being a mentor?*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I was mentored as a new librarian</th>
<th>I am a mentor</th>
<th>% Yes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>YES</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NO</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**YES** $\chi^2(1) = 5.96, p < .02$
Librarians: *Is number of years as librarian related to mentoring?*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of years in academic lib</th>
<th>I am a mentor</th>
<th>% Yes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>NO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0 to 5</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 to 10</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 to 20</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&gt;21</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**YES**  \( \chi^2(3) = 23.51, p < .001 \)
Librarians and Collective Agreements
(individual data NOT institutional numbers)

*No relationship* between having a collective agreement and a mentoring program.

✓ 88% Lib-College
   (63% part of Faculty Association)

✓ 89% Lib-University
   (97% part of Faculty Association)
2. What are mentoring expectations?
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Potential mentors (choose all that apply)</th>
<th>Grad (n=23)</th>
<th>Lib-College (n=43)</th>
<th>Lib-University (n=245)</th>
<th>Adm-College (n=7)</th>
<th>Adm-University (n=14)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Library Colleague</td>
<td>96%</td>
<td>80%</td>
<td>84%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supervisor</td>
<td>92%</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td>53%</td>
<td>86%</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Library Director or Head</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td>53%</td>
<td>86%</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faculty members</td>
<td>42%</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>39%</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University Librarian /Dean</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>39%</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td>57%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Looking back...

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Lib-College (%)</th>
<th>Lib-University (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>When began career, did you have a mentor?</td>
<td>✓ 25%</td>
<td>✓ 34%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>If you did not have a mentor, did you expect to have one?</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓ 28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓ 16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Question</td>
<td>College</td>
<td>University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>When began career, did you have a mentor?</td>
<td>✔️ 1/7</td>
<td>✔️ 5/14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>If you did not have a mentor, did you expect to have one?</td>
<td>✗ 6/6</td>
<td>✗ 9/9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Thinking about my future (or new) position as an academic librarian, I am expecting mentoring to be available:

✓ Grad: 83%

50% formal / 33% informal
3. What are important mentoring activities?
How important are each of the following in a mentoring relationship?

• All groups surveyed
• Investigated 19 mentoring activities
• Importance ranking on 5-point scale
  1=not important
  2=somewhat important
  3=neutral
  4=important
  5=very important
Activity Groupings

1. Career Assistance*
2. Academic Expertise
3. Psychosocial Support*
4. Role Model*
5. Evaluation

*Adapted from *Mentoring: A Learning Collaboration*, Goodyear (2006)
Career Assistance

“I would want my mentor to share professional experiences... and to help me reflect critically on my own goals, career choices, and practices.”
# Career Assistance

**Rated as important or very important:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Service</th>
<th>Grad n=21</th>
<th>Lib-College n=43</th>
<th>Lib-University n=245</th>
<th>Adm-College n=7</th>
<th>Adm-University n=14</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Career counselling</td>
<td>82%</td>
<td>79%</td>
<td>81%</td>
<td>47%</td>
<td>57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assist with networking</td>
<td>87%</td>
<td>90%</td>
<td>77%</td>
<td>86%</td>
<td>72%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Help with setting professional goals</td>
<td>83%</td>
<td>88%</td>
<td>78%</td>
<td>86%</td>
<td>57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Open doors for opportunities</td>
<td>56%</td>
<td>81%</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>64%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Offer challenges</td>
<td>69%</td>
<td>75%</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>86%</td>
<td>79%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
“Academic librarianship is not straightforward and a lot is expected of you. Any time devoted to the explanation of publishing expectations, special projects, promotion and tenure, is very welcome. It’s a complicated world and often new academic librarians are left to figure it out alone.”
## Academic Expertise

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rated as important or very important:</th>
<th>Grad n=21</th>
<th>Lib-College n=43</th>
<th>Lib-University n=245</th>
<th>Adm-College n=7</th>
<th>Adm-University n=14</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Provide knowledge of subject or discipline</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>82%</td>
<td>67%</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td>43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advise on preparation of promotion and tenure materials</td>
<td>83%</td>
<td>72%</td>
<td>80%</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td>72%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Act as a research resource</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>58%</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assist with grant writing</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>42%</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>36%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Psychosocial Support

“... want feedback and advice about working as a librarian.”
## Psychosocial Support

**Rated as important or very important:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Grad n=21</th>
<th>Lib-College n=43</th>
<th>Lib-University n=245</th>
<th>Adm-College n=7</th>
<th>Adm-University n=14</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Show interest and listen to my professional concerns</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>98%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>86%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provide encouragement</td>
<td>92%</td>
<td>93%</td>
<td>96%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>93%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provide candid feedback</td>
<td>96%</td>
<td>95%</td>
<td>90%</td>
<td>86%</td>
<td>64%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Share library gossip</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Role Model

“... a mentor should provide real wisdom and insight regarding organizational or professional culture.”
## Role Model

**Rated as important or very important:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Role Model</th>
<th>Grad n=21</th>
<th>Lib-College n=43</th>
<th>Lib-University n=245</th>
<th>Adm-College n=7</th>
<th>Adm-University n=14</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Confidential communication</td>
<td>87%</td>
<td>98%</td>
<td>93%</td>
<td>86%</td>
<td>93%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Act as a professional role model</td>
<td>96%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>94%</td>
<td>86%</td>
<td>93%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Share own professional experiences</td>
<td>92%</td>
<td>93%</td>
<td>95%</td>
<td>86%</td>
<td>86%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Help with orientation to library culture</td>
<td>96%</td>
<td>93%</td>
<td>91%</td>
<td>72%</td>
<td>79%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
“I do not view a mentor as an evaluator, but as a colleague who shares experiences and insight.”
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Grad n=21</th>
<th>Lib-College n=43</th>
<th>Lib-University n=245</th>
<th>Adm-College n=7</th>
<th>Adm-University n=14</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Evaluate performance</td>
<td>69%</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report to supervisor on progress of relationship</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>As a mentee, how important was ...</td>
<td>Grad (n=23)</td>
<td>Lib-College (n=11)</td>
<td>Lib-University (n=85)</td>
<td>Adm-University (n=5)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CA Exposure to more service opportunities</td>
<td>74%</td>
<td>91%</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td>80%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CA Support for job changes / promotions</td>
<td>78%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>68%</td>
<td>80%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AE Collaboration on peer-review publication</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>39%</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AE Collaboration on conference presentation</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>55%</td>
<td>42%</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RM Exposure to new teaching methods</td>
<td>78%</td>
<td>82%</td>
<td>54%</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS Reduction of professional isolation</td>
<td>96%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>94%</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4. Is mentoring supported by administration?
Do you have a mentoring program?

Adm-College

✓ 29%
  100% informal
  100% considered a success

Adm-University

✓ 31%
  50% formal
  33% considered a success
Do not have mentoring because...

• Lack of:
  – interest
  – time
  – people
  – turnover

• Other priorities take precedent

• Cannot agree on mentoring program details
Drawbacks or risks?

• May not be taken seriously
• Lack of appropriate mentors
• Problematic matching mentors with mentees
• Preferential treatment
• Remote locations
• Resource intensive
Would mentoring aid in succession planning?

Adm-College

✅ 100%

Adm-University

✅ 50%

Unsure 36%

- Mentoring for managers does not translate
- Loss of pay and benefits
- Mentoring for new employees only
Cost of mentoring program?

- Unknown, not sure
- Just time involved
- Not costed
- $0
Conclusions

1. Who is mentoring?
   ✓ Librarians who were mentored
   ✓ Experienced librarians

2. What are mentoring expectations?
   ✓ New grads are expecting to be mentored
   ✓ Colleagues would be best mentors
Conclusions

3. **What are some important mentoring activities?**
   - Psychosocial support
   - Role modeling
   - Academic expertise

4. **Does administration support mentoring?**
   - Less than 1/3 have programs
   - *Mostly* agree would aid in succession planning
   - Monetary cost low
Take Home Messages

1. New librarians expect to be mentored
2. Although costs of mentoring programs are negligible, programs are not available
3. If mentored, more likely to be a mentor – continuity of a program could have future benefit
4. Potential mentors are available
Final thoughts...

• **New librarians** – ask about mentoring programs

• **Seasoned librarians** – reach out to new colleagues (pay-it-forward)

• **Administration** – support a program around Role Models / psychosocial support

• **Library education programs:**
  – promote mentoring
  – look at Academic Expertise – where will it come from?
Feedback, discussion, questions

Marni Harrington
The University of Western Ontario
mharring@uwo.ca