So you think you can Glee? Implementation of popular styles in the secondary school arts programs

Jennifer Hutchison

Abstract

This paper addresses the issues of popular culture, media- in particular television programmes such as Glee and So You Think You Can Dance Canada- and the effects on music and dance programs in the secondary school system. A comparison of the two performing art forms demonstrates many similarities and some significant differences in their current position within an educational context and the challenges that potentially face the two streams. A small-scale qualitative study was conducted using interview methodology seeking data from a dance teacher (secondary school and private studio) investigating this teacher's opinions on the issues identified above and the similarities and differences between the two subjects-dance and music. This data is contrasted with the researcher's own perceptions of the issues based on her experiences as a secondary school music teacher of nine years. An examination of the implications that are faced by music and dance educators is discussed in consideration of sociological theories of culture and education drawn from the work of scholars such as Bourdieu, Bernstein, Green and Wright. The paper identifies the relevance and challenges of implementing popular music and dance into the secondary school arts curriculum while examining the relationship of music and dance through an exposition of their commonalities. The connection of dance to music is established in their similar social function, personal identity relationships, relationship to cultural capital, gender issues and communicative forces. These similarities are further examined as both forms are confronted with challenges of how to negotiate classical technique with popular style infusion. An underlying factor of student perception and attitudes toward popular music and dance as a result of their portrayal in the television industry is revealed through the teachers' perspectives. The challenge for dance and music in education arising from their association with visual media is discussed with particular reference to the issues facing students and teachers as they are forced to negotiate a discovery between the images presented by such shows and the ultimate reality of replicating that ideal.

There has been much concern recently with respect to the quality of music education delivered in the classroom, as the insertion of world and popular music styles appears in the curriculum. Many music educators fear that they are compromising their pedagogical responsibility by entertaining student desire to study and perform popular and familiar music. This fear is also rooted in job insecurity, especially as schools increase the placement of teachers in music sections who may be proficient in traditional rock band instruments, but do not necessarily hold music specialist degrees. As an influx in popular music juxtaposes itself against high-art classical music, the classically trained music teacher finds himself in a philosophical struggle. The majority of music teachers have trained exclusively in the western high-art classical tradition. It is said that many music educators "continue to assume it is acceptable to teach music as they themselves were taught, with curriculum and pedagogy that is both elitist in approach and ethnocentric in content (Hebert, 2010, p. 108).

The strong resistance against the incorporation of popular and other non western art musics into the curriculum is not unique to Canada or even North America. The inclusion of these musics resulted in a huge political battle in England during the 1980s. Kenneth Clarke, the Secretary of State for Education under the leadership of Margaret Thatcher, prescribed an English National Curriculum for Music, which detailed composers, historical periods and genres for study, much to the chagrin of the Music Working Group, who proposed a more relevant, contemporary selection of musical works and styles (Wright & Davies, 2010). Even though music educators in England recognized that western art music was no longer as widely reflected in society as it once

was, the journey to gradually incorporate music that did not solely represent the traditional western canon was an arduous one.

England has not been the only country to demonstrate a cautious attitude in the implementation of popular and world music in the curriculum. A significant shift in curriculum music can be observed in Ontario's educational policy between Mike Harris' Common Sense Revolution and the 2010 curriculum under Dalton McGuinty's Liberal rule. Whereas Beynon & Veblen (2003) noted that Harris' *Common Sense Revolution* introduced in the late 1990s provided minimal examples of non-traditional western music within grades 1-8 with slightly more attention in the senior documents, the current curriculum (2010) provides over one hundred references, examples, suggestions and prompts on how to incorporate music other than the traditional western canon into the grade 9-12 music program.

The necessity to represent a variety of relevant genres and styles in the music curriculum occurs at this time of post-modern culture because "there are no longer clearly defined boundaries between elite and popular culture; all has collapsed into a single, confused mass" (Wright & Finney, 2010, p. 232). Clearly, this statement highlights the dilemma that faces the music education community as it navigates between teaching elite music, traditionally characterized as classical music, and popular music, which may take various forms of contemporary music. While it may appear that this post-modern clash lends itself solely to the subject of music, there are several school disciplines that confront this controversy. For example, student interest has shifted from Shakespeare to graphic novels and contemporary monologues in dramatic and literature studies. Perhaps the subject area that most closely reflects music in the partnership of high art and popular

taste is the performance art of dance. Through an examination of music and dance in the secondary school curriculum and in reviewing responses provided by Miss X, a secondary school and studio dance teacher, the similarities and differences between the two areas will emerge to demonstrate the commonalities in modern-day challenges that confront these two art forms.

Methodology

The researcher has approached this paper with a firm background in musical pedagogical knowledge as it relates to the music curriculum in the secondary school system. While she may understand the influence that popular music has on the secondary school music curriculum, her experience in dance is quite limited. For this reason, data from an 'expert witness' in dance education was sought in recognition that a knowledgeable source within the dance community would provide enlightenment on the issue. The researcher has collaborated closely with the dance program and dance teacher as a result of working in the same secondary school arts academy for eight years. For this reason and the practical limitations of conducting small scale research alongside a full time work commitment, the researcher sought permission from this dance teacher for her participation in the study. This inside perspective would assist the researcher in investigating the issues within the secondary school. Furthermore, consulting a dance specialist would provide insight into a more accurate portrayal of the similarities and differences with respect to how both music and dance programs are influenced by contemporary media, in particular television. Therefore, the researcher's quest for information regarding the dance program has allowed her to use research that combines examining the issues through various sociological lenses with qualitative observations

through interviews of the dance program. As such, the interview data collected was a result of a qualitative study using interview methodology. The nature of this investigation meets the criteria of qualitative methods and therefore represents a viable research paradigm, because its characteristics feature holistic, case oriented and field oriented observations by informants; preference for natural language description; a focus in schools learning about educational concerns; and written results containing quotations (Bresler & Stake, 1992). The researcher composed a list of questions that pertained to the composition of dance classes, curriculum expectations, effects of the media on student perception and attitudes related to classical and contemporary dance styles. Since the researcher has established a specific set of criteria, the approach would be categorized as expert sampling, which is assembling a sample of persons with known or demonstrable experience and expertise in some area. More specifically, non-proportional quota sampling is used since the target interviewee was selected non-randomly according to specific criteria. The questions were sent through electronic mail and the responses were received in the same manner. The interviewee was given an opportunity to view the final version of the paper and she felt that the product reflected her comments and opinions accurately.

Data Analysis

During the research process, it was evident that the challenges uncovered by the researcher that faced the music program in secondary schools could also be projected onto the current status of the dance program. An examination of certain studies and theories, some of which include Green's (2010, 2006) research on gender, popular music and learning environments, Wright's (2010) scholarly contributions to research on

adolescent attitudes toward popular music, and Hargreaves et al. (2002) social

constructionist and identity theories allowed certain themes to emerge as research

pertains to musical studies. Additional themes of learning environments, participant

immersion, musical styles, identity development, student attitude and perceptions on

contemporary and classical styles were then projected onto the art of dance to assess if

those themes are applicable in an alternative performing arts environment. In the

researcher's correspondence with the studio/classroom teacher the themes that surfaced

from musical research were applicable in the cross-curricular environment. As

government-mandated curricula continue to change and technological advances

encourages the ease of accessing popular culture into the classroom these issues will

continue to develop and transform. It would be interesting to note for future research

how the use of popular music in the arts programs affects the enrolment, the structure of

the learning environment and pedagogical strategies used to teach and learn different

styles of music and dance.

The Relationship of Music and Dance

　　　　In many cultures, there are not separate words for music and dance. The two

activities are unified representing the inability to perform one without the other.   In a

society previously rooted in a nomadic lifestyle of hunting and gathering, humans used to

sing and dance together in order to build trust and co-operation which was essential for

survival (Mithen, 2005). The function of music and dance may have gravitated more

towards entertainment in the 21st century, at least as far as media involvement is

concerned. Nor are these two art forms conceived of as indissoluble partners, particularly

in education where they are two separate subject areas in the Ontario curriculum. Music

and dance do however continue to share many common sociological challenges in the educational system.

In order to determine how similar issues affect both disciplines it is necessary to demonstrate the relationship of these two subjects. Firstly, music has been defined as a performing art because "through it we perform social meaning," (Cook, 2003, p. 213, in Hebert, 2010, p. 97). The same shall be said about dance in how this particular art form conveys meaning and messages through movement, rather than acoustics. Furthermore, as each listener or performer approaches a piece of music with pre-conceived notions, experiences, and attitudes so does an audience member or performer who participates in a dance movement. When Miss X was questioned regarding her views on dance as a performing art her response was as follows:

Extract from interview with Miss X. 09 December 2010.

> JH: Why do you believe that a dance program in the school should be included in the arts curriculum as opposed to being associated with the physical education department?
>
> Miss X: Dance education connects mind, body and soul to foster character development so that students become positive contributors to society. Dance is an art form and the course curriculum does not just include physical movement. The program teaches students about dance's social, cultural and historical origins, critical analysis of their own work and others, the physiology of movement, and how to choreograph and present their own dance works. I consider dance similar to the other arts courses like music and drama as opposed to physical education because of the creativity and artistry involved with those courses.

Miss X's response clearly connects the idea of creativity in dance with the creative aspect of the other performing arts, including music and drama. One could extrapolate from this reply that there is an additional element of communication in the intention of a message or meaning being delivered and received. Hargreaves, Miell and

MacDonald (2002) suggest that music is also a "fundamental channel of communication" in that it can "exert powerful physical effects, can produce deep and profound emotions within us, and can be used to generate infinitely subtle variations of expressiveness by skilled composers and performers" (p.1).

Furthermore, Miss X's intimation of the multiple functions and layers in dance connects to the research that has been conducted into identities in music. The aforementioned authors connect the social and cultural roles within music to the ways in which professional musicians define themselves. The nature of music is structured in such a way that participation in it can manifest itself in a multitude of ways; as a performer, composer, conductor, educator, or arranger. These "culturally defined features…central to the identities of professional musicians," (Hargreaves et al., 2002, p. 2) can also be transferred into the world of dance in the roles of performers, adjudicators, appraisers, commentators, choreographers and teachers.

Another lens in examining the manner in which dance and music function at a similar level is through looking at their relationship to identity. Many researchers have considered the role of identity as it relates to multicultural music (Hebert, 2010), parallel music identities (Hall, 1992, in Karlsen, 2010) and gender (Green, 2010). The socio-cultural perspective that is often used to examine individual difference in behaviour such as gender, age and personality differences in musical identity could also be applied to a dance identity. The elaborate research presented by Lucy Green regarding sexuality, femininity, masculinity and gender in music would undoubtedly apply to the study of dance in various cultures, styles and genres (2010). Furthermore, Hargreaves et al. (2002) referred to Bem's proposal of gender schemas in that "our self-definitions as

'masculine' or 'feminine', are at the core of most of the other constructs we use to define ourselves (p. 2). Gender issues inherently run throughout the form of dance as men and women assume different roles in cultural dances. These roles are accompanied by social stigma that are attached to male and female dancers and in turn, attitudes of sexuality are perceived by the dancers themselves in the image that they are projecting. In the manner that Green (2010) recommends music teachers recognize instrument assignment to particular genders, in addition to recognizing the conformist and rebellious attitudes that result from boys' and girls' reactions to classical versus popular music, dance educators are confronted with the same issues of femininity and masculinity in their classrooms.

In the similar fashion that musicians embrace the notion of parallel and multiple identities, dancers also may be confronted with these identity categories. Hargreaves et al. (2002) describe this idea through a social constructionist theory which suggests that people have many identities, which at times can be contradictory. The example they provide is that of a musician who "can be a 'different person on stage than when in solitary rehearsals, and be different again when engaged in each of a number of non-musical activities," (p. 10). If one inserts the word 'dancer' in lieu of 'musician' then the example is no less relevant. In terms of parallel musical identities, musicians can assume an identity from the role that they hold, through the various tastes and preferences for styles, and an ability to become engaged at different levels with a variety of genres. The vast number of dance styles included in Miss X's secondary school program is provided below:

Extract from interview with Miss X. 09 December 2010.

JH: What types of dance do you include in your program?

Miss X: Jazz, Hip Hop, ballet, modern, contemporary, lyrical, tap, ballroom, African, creative movement as well as opportunities for cultural dance with guest artists.

JH: Do these dance styles differ from grade 9 to 12?

Miss X: They do change but there is overlap. The students increase their technical skills and knowledge as they take each course.

From Miss X's response it is clear that a plethora of dance genres and styles are delivered in the secondary school program. Therefore, the same extent of personal taste, preference and engagement that musicians occupy can also be assumed by their dance colleagues. Whereas, Lave and Wenger's theory (Karlsen, 2010) of situated learning suggests that learning can occur based on legitimate peripheral participation, as well as core immersion, in an informal musical learning environment, the same could be said about the dance experience. Participants can either be considered full members in that they are fully immersed in the culture of music or dance or they can be spectators who are still able to learn the etiquette associated with the practice from role models or full participants (Karlsen, 2010).

The presence of cultural dance styles in Miss X's response, suggests a further link between dance and music. As Hebert (2010) identifies the shift in multicultural music from a "peripheral to mainstream practice," (p. 104) the recognition of non-western art forms in the classroom is unavoidable. The growth of cultural music in the music and dance curriculum implies that these disciplines are forms linked to culture. The relevance of these art forms as cultural collateral is explained by Wright and Finney (2010) in their presentation of Habermas' view that "culture could be used as a tool of control and exclusion by any social group capable of establishing power over others" (p. 225). In the

way that money is a precious commodity that others use to exert power and influence, participation and appreciation of certain types of music and consequently dance styles now function as symbolic capital (Wright & Finney, 2010). In recognition that music and dance function as cultural connections, Bourdieu posits that "culture can be viewed as a form of symbolic capital which enables cultural items to be used in the struggle for social domination of some individuals over others," (p. 225). The notion that certain types of music and dance may be regarded in higher esteem than others and that the identification of oneself with a particular kind of music or dance style may be used to demonstrate superiority in a social system recognizes that both music and dance can function as symbolic capital.

The relationship of preference to identity in music and dance can also be extended to their social purpose. Miss X indicates in her interview that she believes social opportunities constitute a reason for students enrolling in her dance program at the school (personal communication, December 9, 2010). Hargreaves et al. (2002) suggest music provides social benefits in that "people use music as a means of developing and negotiating interpersonal relationships. One's musical preferences can define which social groups one does and does not belong to, and this is particularly clear in the case of teenage music preferences," (p. 5). The multitude of dance styles that are covered in the curriculum will most certainly result in teenagers assuming preferences for different types, just as they would in music. Therefore, the collaborative natures of dance and music provide a common bond in two ways; both inherently encourage the aspect of performance of students with their peers; and both enable students to choose their musical or dance preferences based on their social influences. If one is to search for the

importance of identity, genres and social function in music, the seeker will find it in Hargreaves et al. (op loc cit.) statement that "for adolescents striving to establish their identities and to increase their self-esteem, identifying with particular genres of music which they rate highly and distancing themselves from less valued genres allows them to establish favourable social and personal identities," (2002, p. 9).

Although a vast number of similarities comparing music to dance have been presented, to imply that they are identical would be naïve and misleading. Firstly, in the recognition of participants in both activities forming parallel identities, while both can be compared in varying roles and genres, music has the added component of instrument preference and selection to execute its action. In fact, "specific musical identities might exist in relation to particular instruments" (Hargreaves, ibid., p. 13) which is an element not featured in dance. Another clear difference between the two forms is in the senses that they utilize. Whereas both activities feature a performer, the action involved by the audience member is different. Music can be appreciated through the aural sense, however, the spectator in dance uses the visual sense to appraise the product. Therefore, music psychologists would be apt to question whether the cognitive activity that accompanies music listening is equivalent to the visual appreciation that is observed in dance.

Music and Dance Programs in the School System

Since the connection of dance to music has been established in their similar social function, personal identity relation, cultural capital, gender issues and communicative forces one is now able to compare the two art forms within the school system. Green (2006) has completed extensive research into the nature of popular music in the

classroom and she has recognized the "divide between popular and classical music that has continued to plague music education since the rise of the mass media," (p. 3). In addition to examining this issue of implementing popular music into a curriculum previously dominated by western high art music, it is interesting to compare the plight of the music classroom to the dance department. For the purposes of this paper, classical music will refer to the traditional western art form, whereas popular music will encompass mainstream, contemporary, radio-friendly music that is familiar to adolescents in the classroom. In order to ensure that an accurate comparison can be made, it is important to recognize what dance experts view as classical and contemporary dance styles in their programs:

Extract from interview with Miss X. 09 December 2010.

> JH: Please provide your definition of classical dance and examples of how it is used in your classes.
>
> Miss X: Classical dance refers to traditional dance forms that have been developed over time, have standardized exercises/movements and are the base for many other dance forms. Ballet and African dance are examples of classical dance. Ballet is the base of modern, lyrical, and jazz as well as many other forms. African is the base of jazz, tap, Hip Hop and other forms.
>
> JH: Please provide your definition of contemporary dance and examples of how it is used in your classes.
>
> Miss X: Contemporary dance has been referred to as an alternative term for modern dance but the definition has changed in recent years. Now, it usually refers to movement that incorporates a range of different forms of dance. Contemporary can include movements from jazz, lyrical, modern and Hip Hop. It is done to many genres of music and focuses on exploring movement and emotions.
> I use contemporary in my classes to teach musicality, creativity, self-expression and choreography techniques. It is very appealing to the students as they have more freedom with contemporary and they see examples of it on TV shows like So You Think You Can Dance.

Miss X's description of classical dance mirrors classical music in that both are considered to be foundational with respect to building proper technique and for providing the training required for learning the more contemporary styles that have grown out of the classical form. When the researcher inquired about the respondent's personal opinions of why both forms should be included in the curriculum the response was as follows:

Extract from interview with Miss X. 09 December 2010.

JH: Why do you feel that classical dance styles should be taught in the classroom?

Miss X: Classical styles are the basis for most forms of dance. Students need to know where the movement comes from and the basics of dance before they can truly learn a dance style. It is similar to learning vocabulary in French; you can't have a conversation if you don't learn the vocabulary. In dance, you must know basic terms and movements in order to progress to the next level. As well, learning classical styles allows students to gain an appreciation of the art and the progression of dance.

JH: Why do you feel that contemporary dance styles should be taught in the classroom?

Miss X: It teaches them musicality, creativity and self-expression. It also gives them freedom in their choreography and develops their interest in dance in general. In general, experiences in the arts play a valuable role in helping students achieve their potential as learners and to participate in their community and in society as a whole.

Whereas many music educators express hesitation and tentativeness in implementing popular music into the curriculum, Miss X recognizes the function that contemporary dances serve in developing and enhancing student expression and creativity. Most noteworthy is the positive attribute that she awards contemporary dance in teaching students about musicality. While many music educators might favour classical music for teaching musicality, creativity and self-expression, Miss X recognizes

the role contemporary dance plays in complimenting the foundational skills that are provided by classical dance forms.

Even though classical and contemporary styles are encouraged in both the music and dance curricula, it does not necessarily imply that educators feel comfortable teaching either extreme. As has been mentioned, many music teachers have been trained in the classical sense and continue to teach what is familiar to them. Dance teachers, on the contrary, are more likely to have received training in multiple styles, including jazz, hip-hop, tap, ballet and have considerable access to attend workshops of specific styles in order to work with different teachers and choreographers. These opportunities for professional development in various music styles rarely present themselves in the music community. Henceforth, the comfort level for dance teachers to cover a broad area of the curriculum may be higher than that of their music colleagues.

The approach that students in a secondary school classroom assume to these differing styles may be vastly different from their teachers. In order to understand how the rise in popular music and dance influence attitudes of adolescents, it is important to ascertain their approach to certain styles:

Extract from interview with Miss X. 09 December 2010.

> JH: How would you describe the general impression of the students' attitudes regarding learning classical dance styles?
>
> Miss X: At first they are not interested and/or complain about having to do classical dance. Once they have had a few days of it, they come around and gain an appreciation for it. Sometimes they even enjoy it!!
>
> JH: In your dance teaching career have you noticed any general changes in the students' attitudes toward classical dance?

Miss X: I think that students' attitudes towards classical dance have remained the same. For example, there is always some trepidation towards taking ballet classes but once they try it, they enjoy it and understand its' importance.

Music and dance share a commonality in that they are skills that can be acquired either informally through imitation in social situations or through formal class instruction with a qualified teacher. In the aforementioned example, Miss X observed student perception about classical dance as it was learned in a formal classroom environment. If the variable of instructional context is removed and one isolates the issue of student perception on classical dance or music, it is appropriate to suggest a comparison between Miss X's observations and the observations of Lucy Green. Miss X's response confirms the results of a music study conducted by Green (2006) in which students who expressed a dislike for classical music, learned it in an informal learning environment and gradually developed an affinity for it as they acquired the required skills to perform it. The behaviour explained of Miss X's dance students mirrors that initial trepidation, followed by a genuine appreciation for the art form once some skills have been mastered. Miss X's comparative response to student appraisal of contemporary dance follows:

Extract from interview with Miss X. 09 December 2010.

JH: How would you describe the general impression of the students' attitudes regarding learning contemporary dance styles?

Miss X: Students are interested in learning contemporary dance but have a narrow view on what it is until they start learning. They think they know what it is because of what they have seen on TV.

JH: When you bring in guest artists or host workshops on your dance days, do you notice a significant difference in the response that students have towards engaging in a classical workshop compared to a contemporary one?

Miss X: Students usually enjoy classical workshops and guest artists but contemporary ones seem to cause more excitement. They are usually engaged in both types of workshops but I get more response and requests for the contemporary ones.

JH: In your dance teaching career have you noticed any general changes in the students' attitudes toward contemporary dance?

Miss X: I think that students are more interested in contemporary now because of the popularity of the genre on SYTYCD. Also, dance has evolved quite a bit in the last decade and contemporary has been a big part of that.

In comparing Miss X's responses of contemporary to classical dance, it is evident that while students begin to develop an appreciation of the latter style, they appear to favour the contemporary style when they approach dance partly because of the attention that it receives in television shows. With the post-modern culture "ruled by individual preference and the vagaries of the mass media," (Wright & Finney, 2010, p. 232), it is no wonder that students have preconceived notions and preferences for contemporary styles based on the popularity of dance shows portrayed on television. Music, as a subject, is not exempt from this plight. The variety of television shows, such as "American Idol", "Canadian Idol" and "Glee", present idealized images of musical talent while perpetuating student desire to learn the skills required for fame in the popular music industry.

As demonstrated below, both dance and music programs have seen a significant increase in program enrolment which many attribute to the related shows on television. Miss X believes that one of the reasons students enrol in dance at the school level is because of the "interest developed from current TV shows (SYTYCD and Dancing with the Stars)."

Extract from interview with Miss X. 09 December 2010.

> JH: Do you believe that popular television shows including "So You Think You Can Dance" and "Dancing with the Stars" have affected student enrolment in your dance program?

> Miss X: Absolutely! I have noticed that more males are interested and I believe that is because the shows show masculine dancers and it has become more acceptable for males to dance. For all dancers, the TV shows have made dancing more popular and there are students that want to learn things they see on TV.

Miss X's observation of the increased enrolment in dance because of shows in the media has not gone unnoticed in the music field as well. The Canadian Music Educator released its most recent publication in which the editorial was devoted to the television show "Glee" and its impact on music education programs. Many music educators have noticed the increased interest in a variety of students coming out to join choir. The article states that "in a poll conducted by the U.S. National Association for Music Education, 43% of participating choral directors noted a significant increase in student interest and enrolment in vocal music, which they directly attributed to Glee's impact," (Bolden, 2010, p. 3). To coincide with this influx is the notable increase in sales of "Glee" sheet music published by Hal Leonard (Bolden, 2010). In one particular interview conducted by Bolden, his participant noted the challenge in introducing the "Glee-struck choir members to varied repertoire," and the difficulty in meeting "the Glee-provoked expectations that students will sound and feel like rock stars," (Bolden, 2010, pg. 3). Further considerations put forth by Bolden include the risks associated with the audience's appreciation of sound that has been digitally enhanced and for the beginning singer to have unrealistic expectations of producing those results immediately, let alone eventually. Furthermore, the availability of professional-sounding instrumental

accompanists is not a feature that every high school choir is accustomed to having, nor do

school budgets usually allow for the elaborate costume and stage designs reflected in the

ensemble's performing venue. Of great concern to another critic in Bolden's paper is the

misrepresentation the audience is receiving with respect to the focus on the polished

product, rather than the arduous process involved in music making. This glorification

suggests that success in music is a result of natural talent or giftedness, rather than

perseverance. In fact, the edited presentation of similar dance television shows leaves

much to be desired in the dance community as well, as indicated in Miss X's response:

Extract from interview with Miss X. 09 December 2010.

> JH: When examining some of the shows on television that feature dance (Glee, So
> You Think You Can Dance (SYTYCD), Dancing with the Stars, etc...) what are
> some of the unrealistic elements and expectations of dancers that you feel are
> being communicated to your high school students?

> Miss X: On Glee the students are sometimes shown to be improvising
> complicated choreography and formations without prior rehearsal. To show that
> all of the students pick up the choreography as they are singing the song (with
> harmonies) is very unrealistic. They also learn numerous routines every week. For
> an after-school club, this is not possible. There would have to be many, many
> hours of rehearsals to learn those various routines. Shows like SYTYCD and
> Dancing with the Stars do show the rehearsal footage of the dancers but also have
> unrealistic elements. I find that students want to be able to do movements from
> these shows but are not realistic about the amount of time that the dancers have
> been training. Students that don't have a background in dance technique seem
> to have more unrealistic expectations of themselves and what they can be taught
> in a small amount of time. Most of the students that have had prior dance training
> seem to understand how hard the movements are and know how much work goes
> into learning the technique but still want to do them. They are also able to
> recognize the technique used in the movements so they can understand how
> difficult the movements are. The choreography and production values on these
> shows also raise students' expectations. The choreography is done for two people
> that are pre-professional or professional dancers so the choreographers can push
> the boundaries and create very intricate movements. In a classroom situation, the
> teacher must choreograph and teach at the level that best fits the majority of the
> class. The amount of money spent on costumes, sets, music production and
> hair/makeup definitely are unrealistic for a school situation. A school budget does

not allow for the purchase of the expensive costumes and different sets/props for each dance. The shows employ music producers that can professionally mix songs or have access to artist's music that is not released or special mixes."

Both the music and dance communities have articulated that in many ways television shows misrepresent the art forms as they appear in the school system. The influence of how these shows colour one's belief about dance is articulated in Miss X's response below:

Extract from interview with Miss X. 09 December 2010.

> JH: Do you believe that these same aforementioned television shows have affected student perception about classical dance? Contemporary dance?

> Miss X: I do believe that the shows have affected students' perception of dance in general. Sometimes the TV shows focus more on contemporary dance but the judges talk about the need for dancers to train in classical dance. Students find contemporary dance is interesting and exciting to watch and it appeals to them. It is what they prefer to do but they also learn that most of those dancers do so well because of their classical training.

The comparison of classical and popular styles in music and dance illustrates that the media exerts tremendous influence on student perception and attitude toward each genre in the classroom. Curriculum writers have responded to interest in contemporary styles through its inclusion in pedagogical expectations. With students and provincial mandates in favour of a contemporary approach to the curriculum, it is now at the discretion of educators to decide how this style will be implemented in the classroom.

Implications for Music and Dance Education in Schools

Bolden concludes his editorial with a series of thought-provoking questions, one of which is whether educators will be "compromising rich and varied music learning possibilities" (2010, p. 4) if they entertain the idea of Glee and its television equivalents

in their classrooms. With the influence of media acting as one of the strongest forces in the adolescent world, the ubiquitous presence of contemporary culture encourages school programs to embrace the role that media has played in increasing student interest in popular music and contemporary dance.

As the similarities in dance and music have been uncovered throughout this paper, it is sufficient to suggest that these subjects also face the same risks and challenges, particularly in the education system. In recognition of the rise of popular music and contemporary dance, on some level educators who have been exclusively trained in the style of classical technique must react in some way to the statement that "if understanding or 'intellectual commitment' to the art form are no longer necessary, what function does a curriculum dominated by art music have? (Wright & Finney, 2010, p.233). One begins to question one's value as a teacher trained in classical high art technique when "schooling in the arts and in a music curriculum dominated by western art music, in particular, no longer holds comparable importance," (pg. 228). Furthermore, one's skills appear to diminish in importance when the knowledge that is held by a teacher is not necessarily the same knowledge sought by the students. The trend of "cultural inversion" (Wright, 2010b) no longer equates high cultural capital with social status. Henceforth, the students demonstrate favourable regard for the knowledge and skills that will be useful for them to acquire fame and celebrity status, rather than the elite cultural capital that was associated in the past with music and dance's high art form.

While this celebrated interest in popular art in this post-modern culture appears to do wonders for the issue of enrolment in programs, the trend may be an immediate reaction to a cultural media craze. Even though some revere these television programs

for the potential they serve in convincing superintendents and administrators to support arts courses and teachers (Bolden), the concern with the concept of trainability acts as a negative factor in program enrolment. In Wright's (2010b) reflection of Bernstein's concept of trainability within the Totally Pedagogized Society, the intimation is made that education is preparation for work and life. "In a society where emphasis is placed upon the ability to recreate oneself professionally as required and where the ultimate educational goal is a workforce capable of meeting the demands of the ever-changing marketplace, the status of a subject, such as music, with few perceived employment outcomes must be questionable," (p. 17). Therefore, the limited opportunities for success in the fields of dance and music in the workforce presents limited appeal and even less encouragement from parents to enrol in a program that does not present employment options or increase one's chances for upward mobility in social classes. Support for these claims stem from Borthwick and Davidson's studies (Hargreaves et al., 2002) whereby parents expressed a keen interest for their children to develop advanced musical skills and even viewed music as one of the most important activities in which their children were involved. "At the same time, however, these parents were not keen for their children to become professional musicians, and this *double bind* situation often perplexed the children," (p. 16). Unfortunately, the negative impact of trainability on course enrolment may perplex arts educators even more.

The survival issue of arts programs in education is not only threatened by the concept of trainability for the workforce, it is also challenged by the existence of training academies outside the classroom walls. Music conservatories, private music teachers, and community dance studios flourish with after-school lessons and instruction.

Although this extra-curricular training is optional, it is often the case that admission into post-secondary programs demands the skill level and time that cannot always be afforded to the classroom setting. As a result, many students who demonstrate a keen ability for their arts speciality compliment their talents with additional instruction. Due to the Ontario Secondary School Diploma requirement for students to take only one art elective course, students often feel increased pressure to complete their compulsory courses, leaving little room to enrol in elective arts courses. The likelihood that students will be able to continue in an arts program for their entire secondary school career is even rarer. As a result, music and dance courses can appear threatened because these are non-compulsory subjects that can be mastered outside of the classroom. Secondary school music courses are even granted to students who have proven successful completion of Royal Conservatory exams, thereby eliminating the need to enrol in school music courses at all.

Conversely, core subjects, such as English, science and math, are protected by their compulsory status and the lack of availability to complete them outside of the school curriculum. Furthermore, these subjects rarely have opportunities outside of school whereby students can feel they are receiving superior or additional training in their subject of choice. For students who wish to view themselves as serious musicians or dancers, the evidence supports their decision to enrol in extra-curricular arts programs, perhaps in lieu of the programs offered in schools. Alexandra Lamont's research, described by Hargreaves et al (2002), discovered that enrolling in formal instrumental lessons was the critical factor in a student's self-description of himself as a musician. She reported that "half of the musicians she studied described themselves as 'non-musicians'

because they did not have this formal tuition even though they did play instruments within general class musical activities," (p. 14). Implications of this research as it pertains to arts education are two-fold; firstly, due to time constrictions within the lives of artistic students, many may feel obliged to devote their time to their craft outside of the school community, which may affect the population of students able to enrol in the school programs.

The additional reality is that educators must be aware of the identity students assume in relation to their subject based on their involvement in extra-curricular training and understand how to nurture students' positive perceptions of themselves and the subject. The connection that these two subjects have to parallel identities combined with varying degrees of training within the different areas of the discipline may be a source of potential internal conflict. Educators must be cognizant of the various layers that comprise one's discipline; for example, the diversity of roles, genres, styles, preferences and instrument selection. The multitude of combinations that can be formed within each discipline fosters identities in music (Hargreaves, et al.) or identities in dance. A student's perceived limitation in a specific component or in the process, through which a concept is being taught or learned, may result in psychological distress (Hargreaves et al., 2002). Hargreaves et al. provide the example that "an accomplished musician with classical western training may be disturbed to be asked to improvise in informal situations, for example. Equally, someone whose ideal self is built on their ability to improvise may feel embarrassed about their ignorance of musical theory, or their inability to read a score," (2002, p. 8). Student susceptibility to psychological distress, that may occur in dancers as well, may manifest itself in the form of lowered self-esteem. For

music and dance educators, whose general intent is the betterment of a student's self worth, this potential obstruction to a healthy identity is worthy of their attention.

Not only might the compositional nature of the student population in both music and dance classes face challenges, but so may the required pedagogical strategies utilized to accommodate the balance between classical and contemporary art styles. It is imperative that teachers understand that various societal institutions, the educational system in particular, often operates in codes that are not always understood by all members in society. Wright and Finney (2010) relate Bernstein's concept of codes specifically to music teachers and question whether they "operate in an 'elaborated' code drawn from, for the majority, a lifelong immersion in the sphere of western art music, embedded in a habitus so deeply ingrained that it colours the perception and teaching of all other musics," (p. 238). While the outlet of expression may assume a different form in music and dance, both are comparable in that the teachers may encompass a lifestyle rooted in classical training and they may also have been socialized in high culture, which may be inaccessible to every student. Since "it is mainly the children of cultured families who gain access to the key to some forms of high culture," (p. 225) arts teachers must be aware that their backgrounds may potentially act as a barrier to learning for all students.

Although it would seem that the obvious solution is to introduce popular forms of culture into the classroom to which the students may relate, the problem continues to exist when the treatment of this music is still approached from a classical perspective. Wright (2010a) supports this claim by demonstrating that "although the *content* of music lessons changed to incorporate rock, popular, and jazz musics, pedagogic modes often remained traditional," (p. 274). The risk that is incurred when teachers attempt to

implement popular styles of music and dance in the classrooms is that the process of recontextualization alters the meaning of the art form. Although the intention to incorporate popular music and contemporary dance styles appear altruistic, it must be done with considerable sensitivity to the style and to the teaching-learning process. It is quite possible that the nature of popular styles may suffer the same fate of previous musical styles that have been introduced into the formal music classroom. The canonization of jazz produced a style of music that Hebert affectionately refers to as "school jazz" (2010, p. 104), which was a result of jazz music that was subjected to the traditional classical teaching style. The underlying implication of the jazz transformation analogy is that if arts educators want to honour the authenticity of the style being studied, they are unable to do so by subjecting it to the classical method of teaching. Green recognizes the potential fate that may befall popular music as she identifies that even though popular music has been brought into the curriculum, it is being treated like western art music. Furthermore, she recognizes that as soon as 'pop' music enters the classroom it loses its meaning since the inherent or structural meaning is being treated in the same way as classical music. In addition to the modification of inherent meaning, the delineated meaning or its relevance in a social context is altered so that it "ceases to be considered as 'pop music' by the pupils," (Green, 2006, pg. 6). Thornton's work on sub-cultural capital supports this view because "as soon as a musical genre becomes the subject of formal education in school, it stands to risk losing its 'hip' or 'cool',"(Wright & Finney, 2010, p. 231). As the comparison can be made to dance in that contemporary styles may be subjected to the pedagogical styles of classical training, the similarities

imply that both music and dance may be at risk of popular styles losing their appeal to students once they are transported and transformed in the classroom.

Fortunately, Green has identified a key idea that may reduce the canonization of popular music and dance styles in schools. Her studies of successful music outcomes in informal learning environments coincide nicely with the nature of the dance environment in schools. The characteristics she identifies as elements in informal learning environments, which are conducive to learning and performing popular music and dance include; the students ability to choose the music/dance themselves; the focus on informal transmission where the style is picked up by observation; an emphasis on group learning; an integration of skills with an emphasis on creativity; and a learning model that is not necessarily an acquisition of skills according to sequential development or scaffolded progression (2006).

Evidence that these practices may be employed in the dance class is demonstrated in the different strategies Miss X utilizes for classical as opposed to contemporary dance sessions:

Extract from interview with Miss X. 09 December 2010

> JH: How would you describe your teaching style or teaching strategies for classical dance (i.e. tap, ballet)? How would you describe your teaching style or teaching strategies for contemporary dance styles?
>
> Miss X: When I teach classical dance styles, I focus on teaching students the basics of the technique to give them a better understanding of the form. I start with the basics and, depending on the class, build to more complicated steps. I choreograph and teach a dance based on the technique. While teaching the dance, I teach the students how to put steps together to create more complex movements as well as choreographic techniques.
> For contemporary dance, I begin with teaching the students technique basics as well but allow for more expression and improvisation in the movements. As students learn more of the technique, I give them opportunities to choreograph

their own short movement pieces. I also show them how the contemporary forms they enjoy have evolved from the classical forms.

Miss X's response clearly demonstrates a different approach to teaching depending on the style of dance. While the classical form relies strongly on a teacher-directed model, the contemporary dance sessions work well as an informal approach where students assume more leadership and freedom to develop artistic expression. The intent for teachers to ascribe to a more informal mode of teaching popular styles may prove to have desirable results. Green suggests that "introducing informal music learning approaches to classrooms based on research into the ways in which real, popular musicians worked and learned might raise levels of enthusiasm and commitment to music, elevate motivation and provide a range of musical skills hitherto omitted from the school music curriculum," (Wright, 2010a, p. 275). Even though Green's studies caution the imminent danger that may befall popular music and dance as they are introduced into the classroom, her suggestions that they are taught and learned in school in the same fashion as they are in the outside world, potentially avoids this downfall when popular art is recontextualized into the classroom.

Conclusion

While it has been suggested that "in no other curriculum subject can there be seen so direct a contradiction of cultural or subcultural affiliation as within the music curriculum," (Wright & Finney, 2010, p. 231) the relationship that has been established between music and dance clearly reveals the similar challenges that confront both disciplines. Thus, the education system is forced to react to the students' affinity to study and perform contemporary styles as they are portrayed in the media. With dance and

musical shows, such as Glee and So You Think You Can Dance, soaring in television ratings, the effect is an increased desire among students to participate in these portrayed styles within the classroom walls. As such, both subject areas require their educators to consider how the popular genres will affect program survival, enrolment, teaching methods, learning environments and personal pedagogical philosophies.

The necessity for the performing arts teachers to be flexible in accordance with the style being taught will never cease to be a challenge. Technological advances have made access to world styles convenient and inevitable, thereby increasing the opportunity for fusion and transformation of musical and dance styles. Similarly, through the processes of transculturation and hybridity, genres are increasingly adopted via creative cultural fusions, (Hebert, 2010). The metamorphoses of these styles will continually challenge arts educators to adapt and adopt teaching methods that will honour the authenticity of the inherent and delineated meanings for each style of music and dance.

References

Beynon, C., & Veblen, K. (2003). Curriculum as culture: An analysis of the 2000 arts documents. Paper presented at the meetings of the Canadian Society for Studies in Education. Dalhousie University, Halifax.

Bolden, B. (2010). To glee or not to glee. *Canadian Music Educator*, 52 (2), 3-4.

Bresler, L., and Stake, R.E. (1992). Qualitative research methodology in music education. In R. Colwell (Ed.), *Handbook of research on music teaching and learning* (pp. 75-90). New York: Schirmer Books.

Green, L. (2006). Popular music education in and for itself, and for 'other' music: Current research in the classroom. *International Journal of Music Education*, 24 (2), 101-118.

Green, L. (2010). "Gender identity, musical experience and schooling." In R. Wright (Ed.), *Sociology and music education* (pp. 139-154). Surrey: Ashgate Publishing Limited.

Hargreaves, D.J., Miell, D., & MacDonald, R.A.R. (2002). "What are musical identities, and why are they important?" In. R.A.R. MacDonald, D. J. Hargreaves, & D. Miell, (Eds.), *Musical identities* (pp. 1-20). Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Hebert, D.G. (2010). "Ethnicity and music education: Sociological dimensions." In R. Wright (Ed.), *Sociology and music education* (pp. 93-114). Surrey: Ashgate Publishing Limited.

Karlsen, S. (2010). "Revealing musical learning in the informal field." In R.Wright (Ed.), *Sociology and music education* (pp.193-206). Surrey: Ashgate Publishing Limited.

Mithen, S. J. (2005). *The Singing Neanderthals: The origins of music, language, mind and body*. London: Weidenfeld & Nicolson.

Ontario Ministry of Education. (2010). *The Ontario curriculum, Grades 9-12: The Arts,* p. 55-148.

X, Miss. (personal communication, December 9, 2010).

Wright, R. (2010a). "Democracy, social exclusion and music education: Possibilities for change. In R. Wright (Ed.), *Sociology and music education* (pp.263-281). Surrey: Ashgate Publishing Limited.

Wright, R. (2010b). "Sociology and music education. In R. Wright (Ed.), *Sociology and music education* (pp.1-20). Surrey: Ashgate Publishing Limited.

Wright, R., & Davies, B. (2010). "Gender identity, musical experience and schooling." In R. Wright (Ed.), *Sociology and music education* (pp.25-50). Surrey: Ashgate Publishing Limited.

Wright, R. and Finney, J. (2010). "Culture, society and music education." In R. Wright (Ed.), *Sociology and music education* (pp.223-242). Surrey: Ashgate Publishing Limited.