

Western University

Scholarship@Western

The Road Goes Ever On: Estelle Jorgensen's
Legacy in Music Education

Music Education Department

12-2019

Ch. 19 - Rethinking the Good, the True, and the Beautiful for Music Education: New Visions from an Old Garden

Hanne Rinholm

Oslo Metropolitan University, hafo@oslomet.no

Follow this and additional works at: <https://ir.lib.uwo.ca/jorgensen>



Part of the [Music Education Commons](#), and the [Music Pedagogy Commons](#)

Citation of this paper:

Rinholm, H. (2019). Rethinking the good, the true, and the beautiful for music education: New visions from an old garden. In R. E. Allsup & C. Benedict (Eds.), *The road goes ever on: Estelle Jorgensen's legacy in music education* (pp. 253-237). London, Ontario: Western University. <https://doi.org/10.5206/q1144262.jorgensen.2019.ch19>

Section IV – A Passage to Elsewhere

Chapter 19

Rethinking the Good, the True, and the Beautiful for Music Education: New Visions from an Old Garden

Hanne Rinholm

Oslo Metropolitan University, Oslo, Norway
hafo@oslomet.no

Abstract

This chapter reconsiders the notion of the good, the true, and the beautiful for music education in our time, inspired by the writings of Byung-Chul Han, Michel Foucault, Iris Murdoch, Axel Honneth, and Martin Heidegger. This classical notion is imagined as a garden in which to dwell philosophically and to be used as an inspiration for music teachers' pursuit of happiness, authenticity, and liberty. The chapter departs from, plays with, and extends ideas from Jorgensen's *Transforming Music Education* (2003).

Helmer: Nora—can I never be anything more than a stranger to you?

Nora (taking her bag): Ah, Torvald, the most wonderful thing of all would have to happen.

Helmer: Tell me what that would be!

Nora: Both you and I would have to be so changed that—

.....

Nora: That our life together would be a real wedlock. Goodbye.

Act III of Henrik Ibsen's play *A Doll's House*¹

In the closing dialogue between Nora and Helmer in Henrik Ibsen's play *A Doll's House*, Nora has realized that she needs to escape from her untruthful coexistence with her husband in order to become a real human being, not just a doll.

This interpretation of *A Doll's House* points to a longing that all humans likely share in one way or another: the yearning to have good things in their lives beyond the basic needs, such as truth, authenticity, freedom, goodness, and beauty.² Sometimes, it might even be necessary to put one's established existence at risk to set out on a search for these goods (again), as Nora feels she has to.

In the preface to her book *Transforming Music Education*,³ Estelle Jorgensen reports having met several "refugees from the classroom"—music teachers who seem to have lost their belief in music teaching and fear that what they know and value is no longer relevant in the world in which they live. Some of these teachers even confess that "I no longer enjoy teaching children" and "I no longer enjoy music." According to Jorgensen, weariness, discouragement, and ennui have replaced "the hope, joy, and love of connecting with students or of the art that led them to teaching in the first place."

Whatever the different and certainly good reasons for the music teachers' disenchantment might have been, they seem to be like Nora in that they have "lost their first love"⁴ in their personal and professional lives, respectively. How did this cynicism arise in the music teachers over time? It has been said that "Where there is no vision, the people perish."⁵ Did the teachers lack a community where they could deepen their reflections on the dreams, ideals and values that once moved them, and where they could be invited to

widen both their worldview and their view of themselves in light of their challenging position as music teachers?

In this essay, I will ponder the meaning of the notion of the good, the true, and the beautiful in music education in our time. In particular, I will consider the importance of this notion for music teachers with regard to nurturing and maintaining a vision for their personal life and professional work. The essay departs from, plays with, and extends ideas from Estelle Jorgensen's *Transforming Music Education*. Due to limited space—but also to the philosophical perspectives I have chosen to delve into—the beautiful will play the main role in this essay as the value from which the good and the true derive. I will discuss this issue in light of contributions from a diverse selection of thinkers. Among these, Iris Murdoch's ideas about the role of art in moral development will be central. I regard the notion of the good, the true, and the beautiful as a classical theme that calls for reconceptualizations. This notion can be imagined as a garden to dwell in philosophically and as an inspiration for the pursuit of happiness, authenticity, and liberty in the personal and professional lives of both young and older music teachers.⁶ This pursuit is a lifelong process that requires a continual willingness to change, as a garden is a place of constant change.⁷ Moreover, willingness is required to radically break from established paths and dead forms and enter more profound processes of change, as Nora felt compelled to do.

A 21st century notion of the good, the true, and the beautiful must necessarily be grounded in a different view than was the case, for example, in the early 19th century, a time when it was taken for granted that these classical notions were closely connected to the greatest achievements of Western culture.⁸ However, in recent decades, this self-evident primacy—or even hegemony—of Western culture in music education has been thoroughly criticized.⁹ Today, it could be argued that it is rather the Western classical music tradition that is marginalized in music education in schools, as popular music culture currently seems to dominate, at least in the Scandinavian countries.¹⁰ Present-day music education thinking seems to take for granted that aesthetic experience, which is often solely associated with passive listening to “great” Western musical artworks, must be dismissed in music education for the benefit of contemporary culture and student activity.¹¹ In my view, a contemporary, genuinely pluralist position should not take any stance for granted. However, in this essay, it is not my agenda to discuss the choice of educational content. As already mentioned, I am interested in the possible meaning and function of the notion for music teachers today in a more general, existential sense. My contribution will further—considering the limited space available—take the form of a sketch presenting some preliminary ideas rather than a comprehensive theoretical position that accounts for all possible consequences of my suggestions.

Of Other Spaces

In his essay “Des Espaces Autres,” Foucault describes our time as the epoch of *space*, in contrast to the 19th century’s obsession with *history* “with its themes of the ever-accumulating past”¹² Foucault depicts the epoch of space as an epoch of simultaneity and of juxtaposition, that is, of the side-by-side. In my reading of this essay, Foucault is pointing to a side-by-side of different worldviews and approaches to life. He presents the idea of the *heterotopia*, which means “other place” and which exists as a simultaneously mythic and real counter-site. Heterotopias are spaces that give room for dual or several layers of meanings, which may be conflicting and divergent. In comparison, utopias are places where everything is good, while dystopias are places where everything is bad. Heterotopias, on the contrary, are places where things are different and whose inhabitants or participants live and act together side-by-side in spite of their differences.¹³ Arguably, Foucault’s heterotopia is a secular version of the notion “my Father’s house has many rooms.”¹⁴

One of the both mythic and real “other spaces” Foucault mentions as an example of a heterotopia—the oldest example—is the garden. Since early antiquity, the garden has been a universalizing heterotopia, a sort of happy “other place,” according to Foucault. The garden exemplifies Foucault’s third principle of the heterotopia,¹⁵ which is its capability of juxtaposing several sites that

are in themselves incompatible or foreign to another. The traditional Persian garden was a sacred place that was supposed to bring together the four parts of the world in its rectangle as a sort of microcosm. The garden thus can be seen as representing the totality of the world in all its diversity in a small parcel.¹⁶

In our time, which is characterized by relativism, pluralism, diversity, and complexity, I regard Foucault's heterotopic garden as a suitable model for envisioning an appropriate space for the good, the true, and the beautiful in music education. With that said, the choice of the garden as a metaphor, as well as the choice of the notion of the good, the true, and the beautiful in the first place, could indicate a somewhat romantic and idealistic view of music education. And yes, I will not deny that this is true to a certain degree. I actually *have* ideals for music education, and I regard it as vital for music teachers to be aware of the values and ideals upon which their practices are based. What is more, considering the paramount shift towards the ordinary and the everyday in music education in recent decades,¹⁷ which arguably may be characterized as a sort of "disenchantment of the world of music education,"¹⁸ I will argue for "re-romanticizing" this same world. In this context, this means, among other things, a return to a sense of awe and wonder connected to music and musical experiences.¹⁹

In his recent book about the meaning of gardens and gardening in our

time, the Korean-born German culture theorist Byung-Chul Han argues—with reference to Novalis—for "re-romanticizing the world."²⁰ Novalis defines romanticism as follows: "When I give the commonplace a higher meaning, the customary a mysterious appearance, the known the dignity of the unknown, the finite the illusion of the infinite, I romanticize it."²¹ For Novalis, romanticizing involves re-describing the world poetically, allowing us to disclose and articulate our fragmentary existence for what it is and live our lives more meaningfully. This may be accomplished by attending to the beautiful in nature and art.²²

In view of what Han calls "the digitalization of the world," which according to him deprives the world of any secret and unfamiliarity and transforms everything into "likes" and "unlikes,"²³ that is, into the familiar, the banal, and the same, he suggests re-romanticizing the world by rediscovering the poetry of the earth, giving her back her enigmatic dignity, her beauty, her majesty and sublimeness. The digitalization of the world, which implies the total humanization²⁴ and subjectivation of the earth by "covering her with our own *Netzhaut*,"²⁵ both makes the earth disappear to us and makes us blind towards the Other.²⁶

The issue of values and ideals as well as the concept of romanticism may be said to be among the concepts that are "playing the role of the scapegoat" in "the conceptual drama that is going on in today's academia,"²⁷ where being concerned with

romantic ideas as well as with meaning, values, and ideals does not seem very relevant.²⁸ However, I claim, along with Gert Biesta, that education is always based on values, whether we are aware of this or not. When we discuss the direction of education, we necessarily make value judgments.²⁹ Additionally, I find that a genuine pluralist position, which the Foucaultian garden invites, should represent a more open and tolerant approach than the mere political correctness of today's academia.³⁰ Therefore, as the reader has probably already realized, I intend to accommodate ideas that may be seen as somewhat old-fashioned alongside more currently accepted views in my account of the good, the true, and the beautiful.

The Beautiful

As indicated, I will draw special attention to the beautiful because of its potential for keeping music teachers' "first love" alive, which is the backdrop for my interest in the theme of this essay. I regard the love for music and music teaching as a vital part of a music teacher's professional identity. Without this fundamental component, what would be the driving forces that motivate the music teacher's work? Again, a scriptural passage on the issue of love may illustrate the state of being: "If I speak in the tongues of men or angels, but do not have love, I am only a resounding gong or a clanging cymbal."³¹ One could say that the music teacher's professional life would have lost its "music,"

and there would be merely empty "Klingklang" left.³² Continuing to work as a music teacher in spite of a lost love for music and music teaching comes close to acting as a type of "prostitute," whereby one would be objectifying and reifying oneself with the risk of doing harm to oneself.³³ Axel Honneth claims that reification, as a form of modern rationality, follows when we adopt a distanced and objectifying attitude to something that actually demands emotional engagement and participation.³⁴ Honneth points to the danger that based on such an attitude we could treat both ourselves and others as "things." Reification happens when we forget something fundamental about ourselves, namely, that we are humans living in this world under the condition of intersubjective recognition. Thus, according to Honneth, reification is "forgetfulness of recognition."³⁵ I regard the beautiful to represent a source of vitality as well as professional psychic health,³⁶ which can contribute to avoiding such "prostitution" among music teachers. Therefore, in my view, aesthetics and ethics, the beautiful and the good, are and should be interrelated conceptual frameworks in a music teachers' professional life.³⁷

However, I am not the first who sees aesthetics as pointing towards ethics. Plato is probably the most well-known exponent of this view, as he saw the arts as a necessary step towards both goodness and truth.

Iris Murdoch on the Significance of the Beautiful for the Good

In line with Plato, Iris Murdoch claims that an appropriate understanding of the moral self involves both aesthetics and ethics. She regards art as “the most educational of all human activities and a place in which the nature of morality can be seen.”³⁸ The fundamental moral problem for Murdoch is acquiring clarity of vision, which for her is the necessary condition for taking the right action.³⁹ Experiencing the beautiful in art sets in motion processes of “unselfing,” through which our personal moral vision is cultivated into “virtuous consciousness.” In Murdoch’s view, “since art is actually a human product, and certain arts are actually ‘about’ human affairs in a direct sense,”⁴⁰ it provides the most edifying arena for developing virtuous consciousness. Through art experiences, we are able to attain a realistic vision; they make us “see” others as they really are with a loving, emphatic gaze that not only respects the virtues in others but also has a regard for others, especially when they suffer or fail to live up to certain standards of virtues.⁴¹ As Murdoch writes, art “exhibits to us the connection, in *human* beings, of clear realistic vision with compassion. The realism of a great artist is not a “‘photographic’ realism, it is essentially both pity and justice.”⁴² Simultaneously, the kind of vision necessary to see the real implies a form of “detachment” similar to scientific observation: “It is obvious here what is the role, for the artist or spectator, of exactness and good vision: unselfish, detached,

unselfish, objective attention. It is also clear that in moral situations a similar exactness is called for.”⁴³ However, there is no discrepancy between this “scientific” view and the empathy and compassion characterizing Murdoch’s account. Seeing others clearly with this detached gaze occurs through the creative use of aesthetic sensibility, attention, and imagination, which are guided by love as the primary virtue that reveals the fullness of others.⁴⁴ Consequently, attention, imagination, passion, empathy, and not least, love, are involved in the development of Murdoch’s moral self.

Murdoch’s account articulates criteria for morality that go beyond choices and the will, as opposed to Continental-existentialist⁴⁵ and Anglo-Saxon moral philosophy, which have tended to see morality as related with questions about what we ought to do. Charles Taylor uses an image of three less-restricted and rules-directed spaces to illustrate Murdoch’s change of position within moral philosophy:

We were trapped in the corral of morality. Murdoch led us not only to the broad field of ethics but also beyond that again to the almost untracked forests of the unconditional. . . . This takes us beyond the question of what we ought to do to that of what it is good to be, and then beyond that again, to what can command our fullest love.⁴⁶

Murdoch no longer believes in following abstract moral principles as an act of the rational will for developing morality. In her view, she advocates of theoretical ethics

isolate the ethical situations they want to discuss into moral idealizations in which “the messy details” that bring complexity and ambiguity into our lives are not accounted for.⁴⁷ Instead, Murdoch believes that morality is best exhibited in art, and that we may be attracted to the good through “seeing” beauty in artistic expressions, such as when we are unable to put aside a good book because we are so deeply engaged by its characters.⁴⁸

Murdoch for Music Teachers?

The question remains, however, exactly how and by which powers—or through which psychological or spiritual processes— does the transformation of Murdoch’s moral self come to pass. The same critical question applies to Plato’s account. In both cases, it seems to be assumed that art or music has an intrinsic power that unfolds its good, transforming impact almost automatically, as if it were a medicine or a magic potion.⁴⁹ It is also somewhat hard to believe that human beings are actually capable of becoming other-directed to the extent they are expected to through the process of unselfing.⁵⁰

Then again, in spite of this impression of “too good to be true” in Murdoch’s account, there is something very real and familiar about her vision. Arguably, love, which is the guiding principle of her idea of virtuous consciousness, is nearly “too good to be true” for this world, but still we hope for it, believe in it, and experience

it, and it is seen as one of the basic needs of human existence.⁵¹ The impact and significance of art and music on humans may be difficult, even impossible to prove empirically, but still, art and music have always been and still are central to all cultures, and humans see music as a vital part of their lives even today.⁵² Furthermore, the other-directedness in Murdoch’s account may arguably be compared to values such as tolerance, respect, inclusion, and cooperation—imperatives that are central in most current educational settings, for example, in education for democratic citizenship.

Trying to understand how transformation through unselfing into virtuous consciousness happens may not be all that different from trying to understand how processes of *Bildung* come to pass,⁵³ such as how students may develop into mature and reflective professionals within a few years. We usually rely on these processes and regard them as a natural outcome of education, even though it is actually quite unclear how this can happen, as we know very little about what is going on inside of our students. As Heidegger writes: “At bottom, the ordinary is not ordinary; it is extraordinary.”⁵⁴ So, should not unselfing, as a type of *Bildung*, be possible? The outcomes of unselfing, for example, the development of a “clear realistic vision with compassion” that has regard for others even when they fail, is a capacity that in my view is central to a music education that takes into consideration the dignity of all students.⁵⁵ Likewise, “seeing others as they are” with a

“detached attention” is fundamental to teachers’ ability to view their pupils as a diverse group of individuals.

A Norwegian study found that teachers often talk about both individual pupils and whole classes in stereotypes, for example, as “strong” and “weak,” and that such views are easily adopted in the school’s culture and become part of the informal talk in the teachers’ lounge.⁵⁶ This is a quite typical but subtle way of “not seeing” and thereby objectifying and possibly marginalizing pupils and students. This makes Murdoch’s focus on attaining “a clear realistic vision with compassion” very relevant.⁵⁷ In music classes, a hasty generalization can be made about “those who can sing” and “those who cannot” or about “the talented” and “the not talented.” Such use of stereotypes might lock pupils into roles it is hard to escape, and it may hinder their musical development as well as their positive relation to music for the rest of their lives.

The Uncovering of Truth in the Artwork

Byung-Chul Han’s concept of re-romanticizing the world deals with the issue of “seeing” as well. In both Han’s and Murdoch’s accounts, their agenda is a matter of attaining a state of being that enables one to see the world “as it is.” This form of seeing implies the ability to see the Other with a realistic, “detached,” and at the same time passionate gaze, without the veil of assumptions and superficial “likes”

that hinder one’s true seeing. Thus, both accounts are essentially about attaining a more truthful, “uncovered,” humble, and passionate view of the world and the Other through the initial experience of beauty in nature and art.

The opening of this essay with the last words of Ibsen’s play *A Doll’s House* gives us the opportunity to experience how art uncovers truth. We immediately sense the artistic power of this artwork. With the entire play in mind—I suppose the storyline is known to most readers—these few words evoke in us compassion for Nora, and also for Helmer, as we empathize with their existential misery. At the same time, we can sense not only fear but also excitement in thinking about Nora’s courageous act and what her future will be like. According to Murdoch, we can empathize in this way because this work of art is “about human affairs,” that is, “it is essentially both pity and justice.” We can see parts of ourselves and our own lives in *A Doll’s House*, as in a mirror. It unveils truths about ourselves and the human condition that we would otherwise not see. In the context of this essay, it even uncovers “truths” about music education.

Among the strongest claims about artworks’ power to uncover truth are those proposed by Martin Heidegger in *The Origin of the Work of Art*, where he writes, “Art is . . . a becoming and happening of truth. . . . The essence of art . . . is the setting-itself-into-work of truth.”⁵⁸ Heidegger points to art’s power to let truths about the human condition and about ourselves occur: “The

artwork opens up in its own way the Being of beings. This opening up, i.e., this revealing, i.e., the truth of beings, happens in the work.”⁵⁹ Heidegger’s point of departure is the condition that we are struck with a certain blindness, an “oblivion-of-being,”⁶⁰ which makes us unable to see the world as it is and ourselves in it. This is especially the case in our time, the “age of technology,”⁶¹ in which we “experience everything including ourselves as resources to be enhanced, transformed, and ordered simply for the sake of greater and greater efficiency.”⁶²

Heidegger’s vision for a way out of oblivion-of-being is to attain a state of being called *Releasement* (*Gelassenheit*). This shift will be attainable to us through a two-sided comportment:

Releasement towards things and openness to the mystery belong together. They grant us the possibility of dwelling in the world in a totally different way. They promise us a new ground and foundation upon which we can stand and endure in the world of technology without being imperiled by it.⁶³

By using the word “mystery,” Heidegger refers to the characteristic way in which the phenomena of the world at the same time reveal and hide themselves. This is remarkably obvious in an artwork, which brings us face to face with being and allows us to regain a forgotten way of thinking. The attitude of releasement is characterized by a certain humbleness and contrasts the attitude of the sovereign subject in the age

of technology, whose primary ambition it is to control and predict reality. The sovereign subject has lost sight of the greatness of being.⁶⁴ Arguably, attaining releasement is a process of *Bildung* as well, comparable to Murdoch’s notion of unselfing. Unselfing is about refraining from applying one’s own selfish perspective to everything.

A Garden of the Good, the True, and the Beautiful for Music Teachers

So, how could such a vitalizing garden of ideas, values, and ideals with heterotopic and transformative qualities, but also with the beautiful—the artistic—as an attraction in its center, be established in practice? I have already stated that re-romanticizing the world of music education means rediscovering a sense of awe and wonder in relation to musical experiences. Behind this statement lies the assumption that there is a connection between music teachers’ own experiences with music, or their love for music, and their choice of profession. I believe that it could be advantageous for disillusioned music teachers to revitalize the values that once motivated them to become music teachers.

In her doctoral dissertation, Eva Georgii-Hemming, based on five music teachers’ life histories, studied the significance of the teachers’ earlier musical experiences for their teaching.⁶⁵ She found that what was vital to their teaching was what they had *derived* from their musical experiences: pleasure and play, skill, a sense of community, and an outlet for

emotion. This was what they wanted to pass on to their students. Georgii-Hemming's findings suggest that there actually seems to be a close relation between the teachers' own experiences with music and their picturing of themselves as music teachers.

Many music teachers have an identity as artists and musicians as well as teachers.⁶⁶ In the everyday life of the music teachers, the artistic part of their professional identity may dwindle. Many music teachers work a lot, and they have sound around them all day, which may result in a situation where silence is all they want when they are by themselves. They may feel that they have no energy left to put into their own musicianship. These music teachers might be in the situation described by Heidegger in which they "experience everything including [them-]selves as resources to be enhanced, transformed, and ordered simply for the sake of greater and greater efficiency."⁶⁷ In such cases, the way is short to Honneth's reification, which involves adopting "a distanced and objectifying attitude to something that actually demands emotional engagement and participation."⁶⁸

There are surely many reasons why music teachers could become in danger of losing their first love of music. How could this be prevented? As stated in the beginning of this essay, I believe that music teachers need a personal vision for their professional work, and that they need to keep this vision alive. I think that such vision-building should be nurtured in

student teachers in the beginning of their careers, as a treasured part of their identity as music teachers throughout their professional lives. I have personally sought to initiate philosophical reflection connected to significant musical experiences with students to motivate such vision-building.

Building A Vision for Music Teaching

The idea has simply been to start the school year with a round table discussion. The students have been invited to present themselves by telling about an experience with music that was special to them. They have further been invited to reflect on what their relationship to music has to do with the fact that they have chosen to become music teachers. Even though not all students have undergone special musical training, most of them have reported that they have had significant experiences with music or a strong commitment to it. These experiences and this commitment have contributed to their choice of doing a major in the subject.

I believe that an initial foundation for maintaining the music teachers' engagement with music and music teaching is laid here, in the circle of peers, where musical experiences and dreams connected to music and music-making are shared. Over the years of study, the students will have rich opportunity to share and reflect on both the successes and disappointments connected to their own development as musicians and music teachers and, not

least, to share musical experiences and their love for music. They will grow in maturity, experience, and knowledge as they delve into and discuss profession-relevant problems that makes them rethink their approach to their profession.

A similar effort, based on the Heidegger-inspired pedagogical concept of *Wonder*, has been implemented in a research development project with students at the Pedagogical University of Denmark. The project rests on the assumption that an ontological turn in teacher education is vital, which calls for a pedagogy that engages students as persons, not merely as knowers.⁶⁹ Such an educational approach acknowledges that openness, wonder, commitment, and passion are integral to learning.⁷⁰

What applies to student teachers in this approach holds equally true for experienced teachers. Openness, wonder, commitment, and passion are integral to music *teaching* as well, and teachers should be engaged as persons as well as knowers. In this fellowship, the music teachers could reflect on what is really important to them in their jobs as music teachers—as well as what is less important.

Building such a community is like gardening; it is a matter of cultivating and treasuring values and ideals that are vital for living a good life as a music teacher. Dwelling in this garden can motivate disillusioned music teachers and let them re-experience awe, wonder, and astonishment when faced with the beauty,

magic, and mysteries of music. For disillusioned music teachers, it is essentially a matter of rediscovering the lost “music” of their professional lives.

It might be a temptation for the music teachers to hide inside of this quiet and beautiful place to escape from their problems, free from all concerns and directives that obstruct their work. However, the garden should not be used to withdraw from reality. As Murdoch puts it, “(we) use our imagination not to escape the world, but to join it.”⁷¹ Moreover, the harmonizing and preserving effect that may follow from such a focus on the beautiful and good should not prevent the teachers from standing up for their own and others’ rights when this is required, or to protest against unjust and wrong practices. Furthermore, such a community needs to be heterotopic in nature in order to provide space for diverging and even conflicting views, for the incompatible and foreign, for “the messy details” of our lives, and for the changing of views.⁷²

In essence, the notions of re-romanticizing the world, recognition, unselfing, and releasement, which I have been discussing in this essay, refer to educational processes of change comparable to *Bildung*. In education, we usually think of the students as the ones who have to go through such processes. In this essay, I have focused on the teachers. Not only for the sake of the students but also for themselves, teachers should be learners as well and continue to go through processes of *Bildung* throughout their

entire professional careers. It can be challenging to enter into such processes of change. However, processes of change also involve a certain excitement, which even Nora may have felt as she set off for the pursuit of a more truthful existence. This ambivalence is described precisely, and yet with optimism by the Swedish poet Karin Boye:

In Motion

The sated day is never first.
The best day is a day of thirst.
Yes, there is goal and meaning in our path—
but it's the way that is the labour's worth.
The best goal is a night-long rest,
fire lit, and bread broken in haste.
In places where one sleeps but once,
sleep is secure, dreams full of songs.
Strike camp, strike camp! The new day
shows its light.
Our great adventure has no end in sight.⁷³

Notes

- 1 Henrik Ibsen, "A Doll's House," in *Four Great Plays*, trans. Robert Farquharson Sharp (Toronto, New York: Bantam Books, 1981 [1879]).
- 2 What is seen as good and beautiful will of course differ depending on the cultural context.
- 3 Estelle Ruth Jorgensen, *Transforming Music Education* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2002).
- 4 Revelation, 2:4. *New American Standard Bible*.
- 5 Proverbs 29:18, *Holy Bible*, King James Version.
- 6 My argument in this essay on the importance of having a vision for music teachers resembles Jorgensen's argument on music teachers' need for having a personal philosophy for their music teaching. Where I use the garden as a metaphor for the space where this vision is nourished, Jorgensen uses the picture of a house:
"Philosophers clarify meaning as a maid sweeps clean the house of ideas, and they also design the conceptual framework of the profession, much as an architect designs the house," Arguably, the most important ethical questions in the "house of ideas" are, for Jorgensen, those about "what we ought to do," while I aim at the ethics of "what it is good to love." See Jorgensen, "Philosophy and the Music Teacher: Challenging the Way We Think," *Music Educators Journal* 76, no. 5 (Jan., 1990): 17-23; Charles Taylor, "Iris Murdoch and Moral Philosophy," in *Iris Murdoch and the Search for Human Goodness*, eds. Maria Antonaccio and William Schweiker (Chicago, The University of Chicago Press, 1996), 3-28.
- 7 See Jorgensen, "Garden and Growth," in *Pictures of Music Education* (Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2011), 111-130; Byung-Chul Han, *Lob der Erde: Eine Reise in den Garten [Praising the Earth: A Journey through the Garden]* (Berlin: Ullstein Verlag, 2018).
- 8 See Jorgensen, *Transforming Music Education*, 2.

-
- 9 See, for example, David Elliott, *Music Matters: A New Philosophy of Music Education* (New York, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1995), 193.
- 10 The current Norwegian curriculum plan for music in lower secondary school is free from Western classical music; instead, “rhythmical music” is the genre that is worked with at this stage—which is assumed to be the “youth’s own music.” In Sweden, popular music is dominant as well. See, for example, Eva Georgii-Hemming and Maria Westwall, “Music Education—A Personal Matter? Examining the Current Discourses of Music Education in Sweden,” *British Journal of Music Education* 27, no. 1 (2010), 21–33. DOI: 10.1017/S0265051709990179 [accessed January 20, 2019].
- 11 See Hanne Fossum and Øivind Varkøy, “The Changing Concept of Aesthetic Experience in Music Education,” *Nordic Research in Music Education, Yearbook 14* (Oslo: Norwegian Academy of Music, 2013), 9-26.
- 12 Michel Foucault, “Of Other Spaces” [Des Espaces Autres], *Diacritics* 16 (Spring 1986): 22-27.
- 13 Walter Russell Mead, “Trains, Planes, and Automobiles: The End of the Postmodern Moment,” *World Policy Journal*. 12, no. 4 (Winter 1995–1996): 13-31.
- 14 John 14:2, *Holy Bible: The New International Version*.
- 15 In this essay Foucault presents six principles characterizing the heterotopia.
- 16 Foucault, “Of Other Spaces.”
- 17 The “turn to the ordinary” in contemporary arts may be seen as a reaction against the elitist Western aesthetics after 1945. This turn has influenced music education since the late 1960s or early 1970s, when popular music started to be played and sung in schools.
- 18 An allusion to Max Weber’s notion of “Disenchantment of the World.” Max Weber, “Science as a Vocation,” in *From Max Weber: Essays in Sociology* (Oxon and New York: Routledge, 2009), 129-158.
- 19 I find parallels to my own ideas in Jorgensen’s writings, this time in the notion of “reverence,” the sense that one is standing on holy ground, which is the second virtue in her quartet of values established in *The Art of Teaching Music*, 20-25.
- 20 Han, *Lob der Erde*, 24-34.
- 21 Richard Samuel, Hans-Joachim Mähl and Gerhard Schulz, eds., “Logologische Fragmente,” [“Logological Fragments”] II, 545, #105, *Novalis’ Schriften. Die Werke Friedrich von Hardenbergs* (Stuttgart: Kohlhammer, 1960-2008); Han, *Lob der Erde*, 31.
- 22 Terry Pinkard, *German Philosophy 1760–1860: The Legacy of Idealism* (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2002), 148.
- 23 This resembles Charles Taylor’s framework of strong and weak evaluations, where the first concerns existential questions that really make a difference in our lives and the latter are mere preferences, evaluations made by the radically individualistic modern self. See Charles Taylor, *Sources of the Self: The Making of the Modern Identity* (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1989) as well as Hanne Fossum, “From Relevance Rationality to Multi-Stratified Authenticity in

Music Teacher Education: Ethical and Aesthetical Frameworks Revisited," *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 25, no. 1 (Spring 2017): 46–66.

- 24 This word is here used in a negative sense, implicitly referring to Heidegger's assertion that the individual's relation to reality has developed from "letting beings be" to "mastery" and "control." In the current paradigm of *enframing*, we increasingly deal with objects, including ourselves, as resources to be exploited. See Hanne Fossum, "Towards an Ontological Turn in Music Education with Heidegger's Philosophy of *Being* and His Notion of *Releasement*," in *Philosophy of Music Education Challenged: Heideggerian Inspirations, Landscapes: The Arts, Aesthetics, and Education* 15 (Dordrecht: Springer Science + Business Media, 2015): 75-97.
- 25 The German word "Netzhaut" refers in a double sense to both the eye's retina—with which we can see/cannot see the world—and the Internet ("im Netz sein"—to be on the Internet). This is Han's version of Heidegger's view of how technological rationality in modernity narrows our view of the world, making us lose sight of more primordial modes of world disclosure. See Fossum, *Ontological Turn*, 90.
- 26 Han, *Lob der Erde*, 20-34.
- 27 The literary theorist Hans Ulrich Gumbrecht uses these expressions to point out how certain concepts and terms have become problematic in postmodernity. Other names and concepts that share the scapegoat position are "metaphysics," "hermeneutics," "Cartesian worldview," "subject/object paradigm," and "interpretation." Still, Gumbrecht himself, who criticizes the "old-fashioned" idealistic hermeneutic paradigm with its trust in the interpretation of underlying meaning from a historical perspective, knowingly uses Gadamer, the master of hermeneutics, as his main source to justify his argument for an aesthetics of presence. Hans Ulrich Gumbrecht, *Production of Presence: What Meaning Cannot Convey* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2004), xiv.
- 28 Adorno is a prominent critic of romantic and idealistic stances, which in his view are naïve. Even the concept of "meaning" has for him become problematic after Auschwitz. See Alexandra Kertz-Welzel, "The Pied Piper of Hamelin: Adorno on Music Education," *Research Studies in Music Education* 25 (2005); Petra Kiedaisch, ed., *Lyrik nach Auschwitz? Adorno und die Dichter* [*Poetry after Auschwitz? Adorno and the Poets*] (Stuttgart: Philipp Reclam Jr., 1995), 14. See also Denise Dutton, who, with reference to Judith Sklar's book *After Utopia*, argues that we know too much to fall into even the slightest utopianism, and that therefore a reasoned skepticism remains the sanest attitude for the present. At the same time, she asks how this skeptical stance can give us enough to live by. Denise Dutton, "Between Hubris and Humility: Considerations on Cynicism as a Form of Democratic Faith," Paper presented at the annual meeting of the American Political Science Association, Philadelphia Marriott Hotel, Philadelphia, PA, Aug. 27, 2003.
- 29 Gert Biesta, *Good Education in an Age of Measurement* (Boulder, London: Paradigm Publishers, 2009), 12f.
- 30 See also Øivind Varkøy, "Perspectives on Uniformity, Sameness, and Homogeneity and Proclamations of Pluralism, Diversity, and Heterogeneity," *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 25, no. 1 (2017): 4-9.
- 31 1 Corinthians 13, 1, *Holy Bible*, New International Version.

-
- 32 Hans Blumenberg, "Sprachsituation und immanente Poetik [Linguistic Situation and Immanent Poetics]", *Poetik und Hermeneutik II. Immanente Ästhetik. Ästhetische Reflexion. Lyik als Paradigma der Moderne*, ed. Wolfgang Iser (Munich, Fink, 1966), pp. 145-55 (p. 151).
- 33 See Hanne Fossum, "Musikkundervisning og verdighet [Music Education and Dignity]," *Musikkpedagogen [The Music Educator]* 4, no. 15 (2015): 61–4.
- 34 Axel Honneth, *Reification: A New Look at an Old Idea* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008).
- 35 This alludes to Heidegger's notion *oblivion of being*. See Martin Heidegger, "Letter on Humanism," in *Basic writings*, ed. D. F. Krell (London/New York: Routledge, 2011), 165.
- 36 Varkøy argues that one of the reasons why music teachers should reflect on the fundamentals of their profession is to preserve their psychic health. Varkøy, *Musikk-strategi og lykke: bidrag til musikkpedagogisk Grunnlagstenkning [Music—Strategy and Happiness: A Contribution to the Foundations of Music Education]* (Oslo: Cappelen Akademisk Forlag, 2003).
- 37 See also Jorgensen, *The Art of Teaching Music*, 27.
- 38 Iris Murdoch, *The Sovereignty of Good* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1970), 99.
- 39 Maria Antonaccio, *Picturing the Human: The Moral Thought of Iris Murdoch* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000), 131.
- 40 Maria Antonaccio, "Contemporary Forms of Askesis and the Return of Spiritual Exercises," *The Annual of the Society of Christian Ethics* 18 (1998): 86.
- 41 Ibid.; Lita, *Seeing Human Goodness*.
- 42 Iris Murdoch, *The Sovereignty of Good* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1970), 87.
- 43 Iris Murdoch, "Vision and Choice in Morality," *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society*, suppl. 30 (1956), 32-58.
- 44 Lita, *Seeing Human Goodness*.
- 45 See, for example, the discussion of Søren Kierkegaard's theory about the stages on life's way and the necessity of choosing in Øivind Varkøy and Inger Anne Westby, "Intensity and Passion: On Musical Experience, Layers of Meaning, and Stages," *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 22, no. 2 (Fall 2014).
- 46 Charles Taylor, "Iris Murdoch and Moral Philosophy," in *Iris Murdoch and the Search for Human Goodness*, eds. Maria Antonaccio and William Schweiker (Chicago, The University of Chicago Press, 1996), 5.
- 47 Lita, *Seeing Human Goodness*.
- 48 In Murdoch's account, vision is inseparably connected to the fundamental motive energy of human beings, which is *Eros* or desire. Murdoch's Platonic use of vision is here supplemented with a Freudian account of the psyche. See Antonaccio, *Picturing the Human*, 132 ff.
- 49 Adorno criticized the German *Jugendmusikbewegung* for such a belief in music's transforming power, which he found to be romantic and naïve. He argues that the *Jugendmusikbewegung's* belief in

“the aesthetic forces” of music and music-making merely represents a secularized version of earlier religious and metaphysical-beliefs, such as those of Plato, where the religious ritualistic function of music has been transferred to a belief in the social effects of music. Theodor Wiesengrund Adorno, *Dissonanzen. Musik in der verwalteten Welt [Dissonances: Music in the Administered World]* (Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1956/2003). See also Hanne Rinholm and Øivind Varkøy, “Music Education for the Common Good?: Between Hubris and Resignation--A Call for Temperance,” in *Humane Music Education for the Common Good*, ed. I. Yob and E. R. Jorgensen (Indiana, Indiana University Press, forthcoming).

50 Ana Lita holds Murdoch’s concept of virtue being a rigorous one, as it comes closer to the holiness of a saint than to the excellence of a hero. Lita, *Seeing Human Goodness*.

51 Abraham Harold Maslow, “A Theory of Human Motivation,” *Psychological Review* 50, no. 4 (1943): 370–396. Murdoch writes, “I want now to speak of what is perhaps the most obvious as well as the most ancient and traditional claimant, though one which is rarely mentioned by our contemporary philosophers, and that is Love.” Iris Murdoch, “The Sovereignty of Good over Other Concepts,” *Existentialists and Mystics: Writings on Philosophy and Literature*, ed. Peter Conradi (Allen Lane/The Penguin Press, 1997), 384. Axel Honneth has also included the notion of love into his moral grammar as one of the three types of recognition. Honneth, *The Struggle for Recognition: The Moral Grammar of Social Conflicts*, transl. Joel Anderson (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 1996).

52 See, for example, Tia DeNora, *Music in Everyday Life* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000).

53 See Varkøy, “The Concept of ‘Bildung,’” *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 18, no. 1 (Spring 2010), 85-96; Werner Jank, “Didaktik, Bildung, Content: On the Writings of Frede Viggo Nielsen,” *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 22, no. 2 (Fall 2014), 113-131.

54 Martin Heidegger, “The Origin of the Work of Art,” *Basic Writings*, ed. F. Krell (London/New York: Routledge, 2011), 115.

55 See Fossum, *Musikkundervisning og verdighet* (Music Education and Dignity).

56 Sidsel Werner, *Tilpasset opplæring og læreres bilder av en mangfoldig skoleklasse; en undersøkende samtalesyklus med lærere fra tre skoler* (Adaptive Education and Teachers’ Picturing of a Diverse School Class: An Investigative Cycle of Dialogues with Teachers from Three Schools). Doctoral diss., University of Oslo, 2008.

57 There are clear parallels between Murdoch’s notion of “seeing” and Axel Honneth’s theory of recognition. *Social invisibility* is one of the subtle forms of exclusion that he points out as a *loss of recognition*. Axel Honneth, “Invisibility: On the Epistemology of ‘Recognition,’” *Supplement to the Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society* 75, no. 1 (2001): 111-126.

58 Heidegger, “The Origin of the Work of Art,” 127.

59 Ibid., 105.

60 The first, simplest, and most fundamental question one in a state of “not seeing the forest for the trees” has forgotten to ask is the question of Being: “Why are there entities at all and not

nothing?" Heidegger, *Introduction to Metaphysics*, trans. Gregory Fried and Richard Polt (New Haven/London: Yale University Press, 2000), 1.

61 The word "technology" is not to be understood too literally in Heidegger's account. In his critique of technology, Heidegger is more interested in how technology influences human attitudes and thinking than in technology itself: "Yet it is not that the world is becoming entirely technical which is really uncanny. Far more uncanny is our being unprepared for this transformation, our inability to confront meditatively what is really dawning in our age." Heidegger, *Discourse on Thinking* (New York: Harper & Row, 1969), 52.

62 Hubert Dreyfus, *Being-in-the-World: A Commentary on Heidegger's Being and Time, Division I* (Cambridge/London: The MIT Press, 1991), 337-338.

63 Heidegger, *Discourse on Thinking*, 55.

64 Ibid.

65 Eva Georgii-Hemming, *Berättelsen under deras fötter. Fem musklärares livshistorier* (The Story Beneath Their Feet: Five Music Teachers' Life Histories). Doctoral Diss., *Örebro Studies in Music Education* 1 (2005).

66 See Elin Angelo and Signe Kalsnes, eds., *Kunstner eller lærer? Profesjonsdilemmaer i musikk- og kunstpedagogisk utdanning* (Artist or teacher? Dilemmas in Professional Music- and Arts Education) (Oslo: Cappelen Damm Akademisk, 2014).

67 Dreyfus, *Being-in-the-World*, 337-338.

68 Honneth, *Reification: A New Look at an Old Idea*.

69 Finn Thorbjørn Hansen, "The Phenomenology of Wonder in Higher Education," in *Erziehung. Phänomenologische Perspektiven*, ed. M. Brinckmann (Würzburg: Königshausen & Neumann, 2010).

70 See Gloria Dall'Alba and Robyn Barnacle, "An Ontological Turn for Higher Education," *Studies in Higher Education* 32, no. 6 (2007), 679-691.

71 Antonaccio, *Picturing the Human*, 140.

72 However, as Jorgensen points out, in a society preoccupied with change, there is a danger of failing to recognize the value of traditional things, which might be precious and should be kept at all costs. Hence, there should not be change for change's own sake. See Jorgensen, *Transforming Music Education*, 9.

73 Karin Boye, "In Motion," in *Complete Poems*, trans. David McDuff, (Newcastle upon Tyne, Bloodaxe Books Ltd, 1996).

About the Author

Hanne Rinholm (previously Fossum) is Associate Professor of Music at Oslo Metropolitan University. She has been working as a pianist and singer, music educator, children's choir conductor and songwriter in Germany and Norway. Besides her academic work in the field of philosophy of music education, she is engaged in multi-disciplinary research funded by the Norwegian Research Council, as well as in an international collaboration project in Kampala, Uganda. Thematically, her works connected to music education currently circle around issues as aesthetic experience, musical *Bildung*, dialogic pedagogy, diversity, democratic citizenship, sustainable development, professional relevance, and teacher competencies for the 21st century.

Project Links

This chapter comes from a book titled *The Road Goes Ever On: Estelle Jorgensen's Legacy in Music Education*. The philosophical essays contained within focus on themes that have intrigued Estelle Jorgensen whose forty years of scholarship have strongly influenced music education research and practice: the transformation of music education in public schools; feminist and LGBTQ voices; mentoring; the unfinished search for new ways of seeing, hearing, and doing; multiple and intersecting musical identities; the tension between tradition and change; and activist practice in music education.

The complete book can be found at the following link: <https://ir.lib.uwo.ca/jorgensen/>