Yoghurt kitchens summative report

Gabriella Texeira
Tara Wiedeman

Follow this and additional works at: https://ir.lib.uwo.ca/whebussoc
This report is intended for use by APYNO, community partners, the womens' groups and future interns. It contains up-to-date information on the kitchens and their current business operations.
# Table of Contents

- Letter to yoghurt mamas, kitchen leaders and community partners (English) 3
- Letter to yoghurt mamas, kitchen leaders and community partners (Swahili) 5
- Kitchen Specific Sustainability Updates .......................................................... 7
  - Tukawamne Women’s Group-Kitchen Sustainability Update ........................... 7
  - TWG 2015 Income Statement ........................................................................... 9
  - Sayuni, Mecco-Kitchen Sustainability Updates ................................................. 10
  - Upendo Igoma- Kitchen Sustainability Updates .............................................. 11
- Interview Minutes ............................................................................................. 13
  - Interview Minutes- Ruth Magawa ..................................................................... 13
  - Interview Minutes-Celestine of APYNO ....................................................... 14
- SAUT Student Feedback .................................................................................... 17
  - Context of the Project and Role of the SAUT Students .................................. 18
- Feedback on the partnership program ............................................................... 19
  - SAUT student feedback .................................................................................... 19
  - WHE Student Feedback .................................................................................. 19
  - Recommendations for the Future of the Partnership Program .................... 20
- Thank you .......................................................................................................... 21
Dear yoghurt mamas, kitchen leaders and community partners,

This is Tara and Gabriella, two students from Western University in Canada. We are involved in the Western Heads East program and during our three-month stay in Tanzania (May 17-August 17) we set out to understand how all the yoghurt kitchen businesses were performing. We wanted to understand the triumphs and challenges of the yoghurt business and report our information back to you, Maimuna and APYNO so that Maimuna and APYNO can equip you with more skills and knowledge to strengthen and sustain your business.

During May through July we went around to your kitchens and did interviews with you to better understand your needs and challenges. We are so thankful for the time you shared with us during our interviews this summer. We appreciate your feedback about your business, its triumphs and its challenges. We also consulted community partners that are involved in the operation of the yoghurt program, including Ruth Magama at NIMR, Maimuma from Mikono Yetu, and Celestine from APYNO. These individuals helped us better understand the history of the yoghurt program, the context of its operation and the challenges it continues to face as a whole.

The intention of our interviews was to work together to provide you with helpful and constructive information regarding your yogurt kitchens. We recognize that our interviews and goals may not have come across as transparent during this process. We apologize for any miscommunication that may have arisen throughout these summer months that may have caused any discomfort or confusion. In the future we are hope to regain your trust and confidence by working in a more inclusive and transparent way. Our goal has always been to be a supportive body to your businesses. We have tried our very best and we hope that the information we’ve provided will be valuable to you and your kitchens.

We noticed that all the yoghurt mamas worked very hard and put a lot of time and effort into their business for improvement. All the kitchens were driven and determined to make a better future for themselves, their kitchen, and their community. There is no shortage of dreams and goals in the yoghurt kitchens!

There are no kitchens that are currently using probiotics in their yoghurt. This is an issue because certified fiti yoghurt MUST be probiotic. Please do not brand your yoghurt as Fiti if it is not probiotic. Please be transparent with your customers and inform them if the yoghurt you are selling them is not probiotic. Despite what most kitchens believe there has been no miscommunication between NIMR and the donors. The probiotics are still being produced at NIMR and cost 1200tsh/L. You must go to NIMR to pick them up.
each week. This is a time commitment well worth making; your yoghurt sales and resultant income, as well as your customers' health both benefit greatly.

There are some kitchens that are who are struggling to make adequate yoghurt sales. We noticed that some kitchens sell yoghurt both in store and well as performing mobile sales. Mamas will fill a bucket with yoghurt and bring cups; they will walk around their surrounding village and sell yoghurt to passersby. Mobile yoghurt sales markedly increased yoghurt sales, resident awareness of the benefits of probiotic yoghurt, and overall financial health of the kitchen.

Almost all the kitchens noted that they are not satisfied with their current method of packaging; the same kitchens are waiting for APYNO or another external party to provide them with training on proper packaging. All kitchens have the knowledge and capability to develop appropriate packaging solutions for their businesses. Mamas should ignite their sense of creativity and innovation and develop some packaging solutions on their own. Mamas can ask their customers what they are looking for in packaging, try out a few prototypes, and use their own knowledge of the yoghurt to create a packaging solution that best fits their customers' needs.

We both learned so much from our time spent at the kitchens, and the time we spent thinking critically about the operation of the program. We were so amazed by the sense of community each of the kitchens creates. The mamas always look out for each other, their families and their neighbours. We also learned how committed the mamas and kitchen leaders are to providing yoghurt for the community. It didn't matter what other struggles the mamas were personally facing, getting yoghurt to the community was still very important to them.

We are confident that your knowledge and abilities will allow you to successfully run your businesses. We are certain that you will all reach the business goals you described to us during the interview process.

We don't need to wish you luck in the future because you have all the skills and determination to make your kitchen dreams come true.

All the best,

Tara and Gabriella
Letter to yoghurt mamas, kitchen leaders and community partners (Swahili)

KWENU;
kina mama watengenezajimaziwamgando, viongozinawashirikawote,

Mimi ni Tara na Gabriella, wanafunzi wawili kutoka chuo cha Western Canada. Tunahusika katika program hii, kwa muda wa miezi mitatu Nchini Tanzania kutambua maendeleo ya biashara ya kutengeneza maziwa mgando kwa kutazama mafanikio na biashara hiyo nakutura ripoti au majibu kwa Maimuna na APYNO, ili mashirika hayo yaweze kuwasaidia biashara na kuwapatia ujuzi na maarifa ili kuimarisha na kuendeleza biashara zenu.

Tangu mwezi wa tano tumetembelea maeneo ya uandaaji na uuzaji wa maziwa mgando na kufanya mahojiano kutambua mahitaji yenu na matatizo yanayowakumba. Tunashukuru kwa muda wenu mliotupatia wakatitunafanya mahojiano, Tunawapongeza kwa majibu ya biashara zenu, Vilevile tuliwatembelea watu mnaoshirikiana nao katika mradi kama vile Ruth Magama wa NIMR, Maimuna kutoka Mikono yetu na Celestine kutoka APYNO, watu hawa wametusaidia kutambua historia ya miradi hii, Mazingira na Changamoto zinazowakumba kwa Ujumla.

Malengo yamahojiano tuliofanya nanyi ni kufanya kazi kwa pamoja nakuwasaidia katika majiko yenu. Tunaomba radhi kama chochote tulichokikusanya kitaleta mgongano wakati ujao, kwa baadaye tunahitaji mfanye kazi kwa uwazi na ukweli. Lengo letu kuu ni kuwasaidia mfanikiwe. Tuna imani taarifa mlizotupatia zitakuwa na thamani katika majikoyenu.

Tumegundua kwamba kikundi hiki kimefanya kazi kwa bidii na kimetumia muda wao mwingi pamoja na juhudi kubwa kwenye biashara yao ili kuiboresha. Vikundi vyote vimehamiria kutengeneza maisha bora ya baadaye kwa ajili yao binafsi, kikundi na jamii kwa ujumla. Hivyo, hakuna uhaba wa ndoto na malengo kwa kikundi hiki cha kutengeneza maziwa ya mgando.

Kwa sasa hakuna maziwa yaliandaliwa yakiwa na probiotic (bacteria muhimu katika mwili wa binadamu wanaosaidia katika mmeng’enyo wa chakula). Hili ni jambo la kuzingatia kwa sababu maziwa ya mgando yaliyothibitishwa ni LAZIMA yawe na bacteria hao muhimu.
Tafadhali muwe wawazi kwa wateja wenu na muwataarifu kuwa maziwa mnayowauzia hayana bacteria hao. Pamoja na hayo, watengenezaji wengi wa maziwa ya mgando wanaamini kuwa hakuna mawasiliano potofu baina ya NIMR na wafadhili katika kufuatilia na kujua kwamba maziwa hayo hayana bacteria hao muhimu.

Bacteria hao muhimu wanatengenezwa na NIMR na gharama yake ni tshs. 1200 kwa lita moja. Mnapaswa kwenda NIMR kila wiki kuchukuwa bacteria hao. Jambo hili linahitaji kuwajibika kwa wakati ili kufanya jambo la thamani kwa mauzo ya maziwa yenu, matokeo ya mapato yenu pamoja na maufaa kwa afya za wateja wenu.

Wote tumejifunza mengi kwa muda tuliotumia katika majiko yenu na muda tuliotumia kufikiri kwa kina jinsi ya kuendesha miradi hii. Tumefurahi jinsi mnavyoangalia jamii inayowazunguka pamoja na familia zenu. Tumejifunza mengi kuhusu mnavyojitoa kuwapatia maziwa walishikilia, kuachilia mbali changamoto mnazozipata lakini mmethubutu kutekeleza wajibu wenu.

Kuna waandaaji (watengenezaji wa maziwa mgando) wanaojitahidi kuwa maziwa mgando ya kutosha. Tumegundua kwamba baadhi ya waandaaji wanauza maziwa mgando yakiwa bado katika stoo pamoja na kuwajungushi kwa wateja mtaani.

Waandaaji wanayajaza maziwa katika ndoo na wakiwa na vikombe huzunguka katika vijiji vinavyowazunguka na kuwa maziwa hayo kwa wapitanjia. Uuzaji wa aina hii umechangia kwa kiasi kikubwa ongezeko katika mauzo ya maziwa, ulewe wa jamii/wakazi kuhusu faida za maziwa ya mgando na kukuwa kwa afya ya uchumi na waandaaji wa maziwa kwa ujumla.

Karibu watengenezaji wote wamegundua kwamba hawajaridhika na namna wanavyoyahifadhi (packaging) maziwa hayo kwa sasa. Watengenezaji hao wanasubiri APYNO au mtu mwinine yeyote kuwa sahihi ya uhifadhi wa maziwa mgando.

Watengenezaji wote wana ulewaa na uwezo wa kutafuta njia sahihi ya uhifadhi kama suluhisho kwa biashara zao. Hivyio wao wenye we wanatakiwa kutumia ubunifu na uvumbuzi ili kupata ufumbuzi wa tatizo la uhifadhi bora.
Pia wanaweza kuwauliza wateja wao ni kwa namna gani wangependa maziwa hayo yahifadhiwe na kutumia mifano michache ya maoni yaliyotolewa na zaidi, kutumia ulewa wa wa kutengeneza maziwa mgando kufikia suluhisho la uhifadhi bora ambalo litakuwa linakidhi mahitaji ya wateja.

Tunaamini kwamba, ulewa na uwezo wenu utawaruhusu kuendesha biashara yenu kwa mafanikio. Pia tuna uhakika kwamba wote mtimiza malengo yenu ya biashara ambayo mlitueleza wakati wa mahojiano.

Hatuna budi kuwatakia mafanikio mema ya baadaye kwa sababu wote mna ujuzi na mmedhamiria kuhakikisha ndoto zenu zinatimia.

Kila la heri
Tara na Gabriella.

**Kitchen Specific Sustainability Updates**

**Tukawamne Women's Group-Kitchen Sustainability Update**

**Strengths**

**Customer Loyalty**

TWG has a strong customer loyalty because they provide great customer service, listen to their customer’s needs and serve yogurt their customers like.

TWG serves their customers promptly. In addition to serving yogurt they also serve chapati and tea; this allows a variety of customer needs to be met in one convenient location. Serving chapati and tea is conducive to increasing the number of dine-in customers who purchase both yogurt and food, which generates more profits for the kitchen. Dine-in customers also contribute to building the invaluable sense of community that is found in the TWG kitchen.

In short TWG’s great customer service is one of the reasons why their business is doing so well. This kitchen should continue to find ways to build their sense of community. They should also ask their customers for feedback on other health, nutrition or business services they are looking for at TWG.
Strong Sales Performance

TWG is producing 120L of yoghurt a day and has more than 100 customers walking into the kitchen each day. Their strong sales performance results from their long history of operation in the community, their great customer service, strong customer awareness of their kitchen, and the hard work and coordination of the mamas. Customer awareness of the kitchen and of the benefits of probiotic yoghurt both drive yoghurt sales. Our interview findings showed that customers who understood the benefits of probiotics were more likely to purchase the yoghurt. TWG should continue to find ways to increase customer awareness of their kitchen and the benefits of the probiotic yoghurt. The mamas mentioned implementing educational programming in schools; this would be an effective way of improving customer awareness.

TWG yoghurt mamas clearly work hard and work well together. Their positive relationships make the kitchen run smoothly because problems are resolved quickly, allowing customer service to not be disturbed.

Healthy Financial Performance

TWG is a healthy and profitable business. Their net income in May 2015 was approximately 1,370,000 TZS. They are bringing in 5,700,000 TZS in revenue from yogurt, but their biggest profit generator is chapati and tea. Although TWG is bringing in the most in yogurt revenue sales, they are making the most off of chapati and tea. A good strategy would be to

TWG’ s biggest profit generator is chapati and tea. Yogurt sales don’t generate as much profit comparatively. If TWG encouraged customers to dine-in with chapati and tea as well as take yogurt home they would effectively make the most profit per customer. The customer’s dine-in experience would also build on the kitchen’s sense of community, which is an integral part of great customer service.

Weaknesses

TWG’s areas of improvement include producing yogurt with the correct concentration of probiotics, finding an adequate packaging solution and getting yogurt to the beneficiaries.

Producing yogurt with the correct concentration of probiotics is the main objective of the Fiti brand and must be upheld by TWG as per the signed Fiti contract. Putting effort into going to NIMRI to pick up probiotics is important to both the integrity of the Fiti brand and the quality of the yogurt. If the yogurt does not have probiotics in it, it is important that the Mamas communicate this to their customers.

Packaging has been an ongoing issue. Encouraging customers to bring their own water bottles or containers is more cost effective and reliable for transporting yogurt. We understand that there is a minor stigma in using recycled packaging but the Mamas can
address this challenge by communicating to their customers that the cost savings of using this packaging is passed on to the customers.

Getting yogurt to beneficiaries has been a complicated issue given the history of the yogurt program. Due to TWG’s profitability the Mamas could give the beneficiaries yogurt for free when and if they feel it is appropriate; they are in a healthy financial position to do this.

Goals

TWG outlined two goals: to provide yoghurt for the beneficiaries and to be financially able to buy packaging bags in bulk.

With TWG’s current profitability some beneficiaries could receive free yoghurt, with little impact on their financial health and the mamas incomes. Mamas should be wary of also setting aside a portion of their kitchen monthly income for business savings. Savings can be used at a later times to purchase needed equipment, make necessary upgrades to the kitchen, and buy bags in bulk.

### TWG 2015 Income Statement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Monthly Revenues</th>
<th>Cost Input Values</th>
<th>Revenue Input Values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yoghurt</td>
<td>TSh 5,700,000</td>
<td>Milk (L)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Milk</td>
<td>TSh 2,700</td>
<td>Yoghurt/L</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Revenues</td>
<td>TSh 5,700,000</td>
<td>Yoghurt (L) produced/day</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Milk</td>
<td>TSh 1,200</td>
<td>Yoghurt (L) sold/day</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Expenses</td>
<td>TSh 4,330,000</td>
<td>Yoghurt (L) sold/month</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Additional Profit</td>
<td></td>
<td>Additional Profit Input Values</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapati &amp; tea</td>
<td>55,000</td>
<td>Income/mana</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 bags=1L milk</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>price/ plastic bag</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Net Monthly Income | TSh 1,370,000 |
Strengths

**High Community Involvement**
The Sayuni Kitchen has a high degree of involvement with APYNO as well as their local and kitchen community. This demonstrates their commitment to the mission of the Community Probiotic Yogurt Program.

A high degree of involvement allows the kitchen to build relationships and a trusting environment amongst themselves and their community. This relationship is advantageous to identifying challenges and finding solutions that satisfy both the customer’s and business’ needs. Continuing to be involved and promoting involvement amongst their local community is an invaluable way to building a supportive network around their business.

**Determination and Drive**
Their determination and drive to improve their business is essential to developing a successful business. The Mamas of the Sayuni kitchen have the ability to make good business decision beyond solely waiting for instruction. Working hard and making a conscious effort to find solutions oppose to waiting for direction is an important entrepreneurial quality to developing a healthy business.

Weaknesses

Sayuni’s areas of improvement are record keeping and improving customer awareness about the benefits of probiotics.

**Record Keeping**
Regular and accurate record keeping is important for monitoring healthy financial practices of the business. When details about the business such as expenses, sales, number of customers etc. are recorded this information may be applied to addressing challenges that the business may be facing. Record keeping is also beneficial to sharing reliable information quickly with other kitchen leaders, yogurt Mamas and APYNO in order to maintain transparent communication about the financial health of the business. Training for record keeping is a program offered by the municipality of Mwanza. Other kitchens that have received training and continuously applied the training to their business practices have seen improvements in the financial health and personal awareness of their business.

**Customer Awareness of Benefits of Probiotics**
Education and awareness of the benefits of probiotics are important to communicating the
value of the probiotic yogurt to the community.

Vocalizing the benefits of consuming probiotic yogurt within the kitchens and in the community is a way to improve customer awareness of the benefits of probiotics and drive sales. Mobile sales are a way to communicate the benefits of probiotic yogurt that is cost effective and can improve sales. The Sayuni kitchen employs 7 Mamas that may be enough to maintain kitchen operations while sparing a few Mamas to test engagement in mobile sales. In the past, Mamas that have filled a bucket with yogurt to walk around the community promoting the benefits of probiotics and sold yogurt to customers on the street have seen improvements in customer awareness.

Understanding the benefits of probiotics can be an added incentive for customers to come in and purchase yogurt beyond solely enjoying the taste. The Sayuni kitchen had 97 yogurt beneficiaries coming in to take yogurt when donor funding was being received. The result of yogurt beneficiaries failing to return after the loss of donor funding was the Sayuni kitchen saw a decrease in their customer base. Growing a customer base outside of the beneficiaries with loyal customers who buy yogurt because they enjoy the taste, want to improve their health and for the benefits of the probiotics can be beneficial to attracting more customers.

Goals

The goals shared by the kitchens were to increase sales and to produce more yoghurt for the community. The Sayuni kitchen believes that they have few customers because community members don't understand the benefits of probiotics. A strategy to expand their customer base to non-beneficiaries is by communicating the benefits of probiotic yogurt through word of mouth within the community and mobile sales.

It is a good to remind the kitchen that as business owners it is important that they test appropriate strategies to meeting the challenges of their business. Asking their customers about their needs and having the yogurt Mamas work together to come up with strategies to meet those needs is a practice that they should exercise frequently. The Mamas should continue to work hard and strive to meet their goals through healthy financial practices such as record keeping and communicating with their customers.

Upendo Igoma- Kitchen Sustainability Updates

Strengths

Strong sales performance: Upendo Igoma is producing 100-120L/day; this sales performance is admirable given that this kitchen was only established three years ago.

High awareness of probiotic yoghurt and benefits
Their strong sales performance is likely a result of the fact that residents in the kitchen area are well educated on the benefits of the probiotics, and the mamas continue to spread
positive awareness about probiotic yoghurt in the community. Continued educational awareness programs and positive probiotic marketing will improve future sales performance.

**Correct probiotic concentration**
This kitchen is not currently using probiotics. However, when they did use probiotics in the past they were creating probiotic yoghurt that was the correct concentration; they would add two litres of probiotic milk to every 50L of regular milk. Using the correct concentration of probiotics in the past helped them to create quality yoghurt that was effective in producing health benefits; this allowed the kitchen to generate loyal return customers and draw in new customers from positive reviews of the yoghurt.

Many kitchens do not use the correct concentration of probiotics in their yoghurt and it lessens the yoghurt's health benefits. This kitchen is experiencing positive sales growth because they are producing quality yoghurt with the correct probiotic concentration.

**Weaknesses**

**Current lack of use of probiotics**
This kitchen is not currently using probiotics. This is limiting the targeted health benefits of the yoghurt, reducing customer satisfaction with the yoghurt, and harming sales growth.

**Packaging**
This kitchen is currently buying used water bottles, washing them, and using them as packaging for their yoghurt. This is currently forbidden by government regulation. Upendo Igoma should stop using this illegal method of packaging and continue to encourage customers to bring their own bottles, reminding them that the cost savings from this recycled packaging keeps the price of the yoghurt low.

**Milk**
This kitchen is struggling to maintain consistent quality of milk. They find they purchase milk that has been diluted with water and this compromises their ability to produce quality yoghurt. Upendo Igoma should collaborate with APYNO to develop a solution to this problem that is culturally appropriate and fitting within the local context.

**Goals**
First and foremost Upendo Igoma wants to improve their packaging, as they believe it is limiting their sales because their customers are unsatisfied. The kitchen mamas believe that this goal can be attained once they receive training on yoghurt production and packaging. As an independent business packaging is the kitchen's responsibility; the mamas are creative and innovative enough to develop an appropriate packaging solution for themselves and their business.
Upendo Igoma also wants to expand and open another kitchen. Their current kitchen location is doing well and with continued energy and effort but into its operations it will expand and generate the sales and income growth the mamas are looking for. Opening another kitchen will negatively impact financial health and sales performance of the current, open kitchen.

**Interview Minutes**

**Interview Minutes - Ruth Magawa**

Monday July 6, 2015

Ruth’s email: ruthmagawa@gmail.com

Role: lab scientist at NIMR
- attended Bugando University
- studied lab science
- cultures lactobilli and adds it to milk from her own cows, she started two years ago in 2013
- for every 1L of milk she uses 10ml of culture; she charges the mamas 1200tsh/L because "the kitchen mamas beg for a lower price because they tell her they do not have money"
- normally, to her other probiotic customers she sells 1L for 2500tsh because it allows her to make a profit
- until April 14/2014 (last APYN probiotic pickup) APYN came to NIMR to collect probiotics once a week (they took about 70 bottles/week) and these were delivered to kitchens. Ruth would get paid at the end of the month (1200tsh/L of yoghurt purchased that month)
- Ruth says that 5 1L bottles of probiotic milk last the kitchens one week

After APYN stopped picking up the probiotics the kitchens began coming themselves:

This is a recording of the probiotic pickup records from NIMR:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Kitchen</th>
<th>Person</th>
<th># of 1L bottles taken</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8/7/14</td>
<td>Igoma</td>
<td>Hellena</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23/07/14</td>
<td>Buswelu</td>
<td>Perpetua</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26/08/14</td>
<td>Mecco</td>
<td>Paskwauna</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5/09/14</td>
<td>Buswelu</td>
<td>Vumilia</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9/9/14</td>
<td>Tukawamne</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16/9/14</td>
<td>Tukawamne</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23/9/14</td>
<td>Buswelu</td>
<td>Perpetua</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15/9/14</td>
<td>Tukawamne</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6/11/14</td>
<td>Mahina</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
November 6 2014 was the last pickup done by the kitchens for 2014. On Feb 23 2015 the Nuru Mahina kitchen came to pick up some probiotics but no one has been back since.

Therefore, most kitchens have not been using probiotics since near the end of 2014.

Ruth said she is not producing probiotics because she has no customers; none of the kitchens are willing to travel to NIMR to pick them up. If she had customers she would prepare the probiotics.

Culture

Concern: Ruth is not certain that the current lactobilli culture is still alive. The culture that is currently in the freezer (that she cultured from the original brought from Canada) has been in there for over a year without being cultured.

She needs to culture what is frozen in the freezer to see if it is still alive. If it is not alive she will need to ask for a new culture from Canada.

The reason she is not sure if it is still alive is because she left NIMR for a couple months and isn't sure if the temperature of the freezer stayed constant (needed for bacteria in culture to keep).

Interview Minutes-Celestine of APYNO

Monday July 6, 2015

Role:

Celestine worked for APYN and is now volunteering for APYNO. He graduated from SAUT as a business student and has been volunteering with the kitchens since June. He is interested in making each of the yoghurt kitchens sustainable businesses.

Time of APYN (2012-2013)

- mamas were doing well with their businesses
- at this time they wanted basic business education, leadership skills etc.
- Celestine said "you could give them everything but they still wanted more"
- Celestine thinks this is a root issue of the kitchens current troubles because "right now their businesses are not stable because they want APYN to provide everything for them"
- this goes back to a cultural heritage and tradition of women being told what to do, and not working on their own and making their own decisions about their work
- the history of WHE hasn't helped; interns come in every year, do the work, and tell the mamas what to do.
After donor funding ended
- immediately after the donor funding ended things went very badly for all the kitchens
- now "most kitchens are doing fine"; Celestine defined 'fine' in that the kitchens are producing lots of yoghurt (>100L/day at some kitchens)
- "some kitchens are closed (Ebeneza, Mkyuni, Youth to Youth), some are struggling (Nuru Mahina, Buhongwa), but most are fine"
- now that the mamas are not being directed and told what to do, they will do as they please based on their own self interest (ex. not going to NIMR, not using probiotics) OR they will give up and give in (close the kitchen)
- "most kitchens don't want to work on their own because they know people will take care of them"
- Celestine believes that there are 3 kitchens that are ready to makes themselves a self-sustaining business and are working hard: Upendo (Igoma), Sayuni, Tukawamne

Issues at all kitchens:

Issue #1) Not using probiotics in yoghurt (but telling customers they are)
- "the women don't take this issue seriously"
- "the women say they do not have enough money to go to pick up probiotics at NIMR but they are not planning their days well and do not see any value in going to NIMR".
- If you are a working woman just wanting to feed your children and send them to school you are motivated by self interest and selling as much yoghurt as possible in a given day (going to NIMR cuts in on these sales) so that you can take home more money home to your family

Celestine's proposed solution:

- TWG, Upendo and Sayuni make a schedule so that one mama from one kitchen goes to NIMR each week so less staff are lost in the kitchens. This mama would travel by bus to and from NIMR and carry about 15 1L bottles (5 for each kitchen) on her trip.

Considerations:
-these kitchens are very far from each other and they need to carry at least 15 bottles for 3 kitchens each trip; they'd need to bus all over the city to accomplish this
- even with a schedule, the mamas have no incentive to use probiotics. they can make yoghurt sales without probiotics and not have to use up a day of travelling, time away from family and work, and bus money.
At the current moment no kitchens are producing probiotic yoghurt because none of them have come to pick up probiotics from Ruth.

*Celestine is banking on the case being resolved and APYNO getting the car back to make this process easier; if this happened he would drive the car each week to pick up and drop off the probiotics at the kitchens

**Issue # 2) Diluting the probiotics**

- Celestine said the kitchens are supposed to be using 1L of probiotic mixture for every 40L of milk (according to literature they are supposed to be using 2L of probiotic mixture for every 50L of milk)
- in reality Celestine said the kitchens are using 1L of probiotic mixture for every 80-100L of milk, when the kitchens are using probiotics
- diluting the yoghurt of probiotics was happening after the donor funding ended while the mamas where still going to Ruth to pick up probiotics themselves

**Issue # 3) There is no incentive or accountability to produce probiotic yoghurt anymore**

- mamas don't see the value in going to NIMR to pick up and pay for probiotics because they don't need them to make sales, generate an income and bring that home to their families. Personal income generation is their first priority.
- there is no accountability mechanism in place that would make the mamas responsible for producing good and consistent quality yoghurt that is probiotic.

**Proposed Solutions:**

1) Introduce a health inspector that would visit the kitchens and quality test their yoghurt to ensure it met quality consistency markers and had the correct concentration of probiotics

**Considerations:**

- mamas could bribe the health inspector
- testing the yoghurt for a specific probiotic concentration would be difficult and expensive

However, there is a huge incentive for the mamas to be honest and abide by the health inspectors' regulations because there is an engrained culture of 'commitment to your neighbour'; the mamas care about their 'neighbours' or customers' health and may wish to use the probiotics and produce good quality yoghurt for this reason.

2) Create a template kitchen

Celestine is suggesting that we turn the Sayuni kitchen into a template kitchen for production of the yoghurt to the correct quality standards (and probiotic concentration). Mamas will come to this kitchen to learn these standards and how to sell the yoghurt efficiently and effectively.
Celestine thinks this is a great way to achieve quality control.

Considerations:

- mamas expressed interest in further training in yoghurt production so this strategy is aligned with their desires
- travel time may be an issue as mamas are resistant to travel to NIMR and Sayuni is also a fair distance to travel

**Issue # 4) The HIV+ beneficiaries are no longer getting the yoghurt they need** (the main goal of the yoghurt project is not being achieved)

Since the donor funding ended the beneficiaries have not been receiving the yoghurt they need; many were angry and outraged. The probiotic yoghurt gave them proper nutrition, strength, and energy.

Proposed solution:

- Celestine wants to have one kitchen produce yoghurt, package it and then other kitchens will sell it in their respective locations
- this production streamlining would theoretically reduce overhead costs (and be transferred to a decrease in price/L of yoghurt)
- the profit from this yoghurt production enterprise would then be used to buy beneficiaries yoghurt; essentially this mass yoghurt production business would be a social enterprise

Considerations:

- Celestine says "this would be very hard to do unless there is a leader directing them and getting them together"
- Overhauling the entire yoghurt model into one enterprise goes against the culture and business operations in Tanzania; everything is done by small business operation
- mamas would be resistant to the payment structure of one yoghurt production facility (paid by salary)
- adequate transportation from the yoghurt factory to each of the kitchens would be integral for the execution of this strategy. Transport costs would largely overwhelm overhead costs, making the project unprofitable.

**SAUT Student Feedback**

**SAUT Student partners:**
Mansour Lee - mansour.jumanne@yahoo.com 0716653430
Humphrey Mgonja- humphmgonja@gmail.com 0658439042
Context of the Project and Role of the SAUT Students

Western University and SAUT University are trying to grow a mutually beneficial partnership. It was difficult to find students willing to participate and give their time to make this partnership happen. This was due to the fact that the SAUT students enter exam period at about the same time that the Western Heads East (WHE) interns are looking to work and collaborate with them. Nonetheless, these two SAUT students were committed and hardworking. The partnership experience was beneficial for both the SAUT students and the WHE interns.

WHE has been involved with the community probiotic yoghurt project in Tanzania for 12 years. This project aims to economically empower women through production and sale of probiotic yoghurt; this yoghurt is healthy and beneficial for all individuals but especially helpful for growing children and HIV+ patients.

Between May and August WHE interns were tasked with visiting each of the yoghurt kitchens in the areas surrounding Mwanza, Tanzania and assessing their sustainability needs. The interns needed to summarize the challenges and triumphs of the kitchens and how they were fairing as independent, sustainable businesses. We, as the WHE interns (Gabriella and Tara), quickly found that as muzungos our presence during the interviews was skewing the answers of the yoghurt mamas; the mamas were under the impression that we were present to give donor funding. We were having a lot of difficulty understanding the true struggles and sustainability needs of the kitchens.

At this point we decided this would be a great collaboration with the SAUT students. The SAUT students were fully briefed on the purpose, context and goals of the community yoghurt project and set out to interview the yoghurt kitchens themselves. Only the two SAUT students completed the remaining kitchen interviews; the muzungo WHE interns were not present at these interviews. The SAUT students conducted the interviews by explaining that they went to SAUT university and studied social studies; their purpose was only to do some community research. WHE and the muzungos were not mentioned and this kept the experiment blind.

Notes
WHE interns completed interviews with six kitchens (TWG, Sayuni, Tujikomboe, VSI, Mikono Yetu, Upendo Sahwa) and the SAUT students completed interviews with five kitchens (Tunnawezza, Upendo (Igoma), Nuru Mahina, Tujikomboe, new Sahwa). Cost of transportation, food and calling for the SAUT students was covered by SAUT administration in the amount of 100,000tsh. Respective costs for the WHE interns during their kitchen interviews were covered with personal savings.
Feedback on the partnership program

SAUT student feedback

"We thoroughly enjoyed it and it was very beneficial for us. We gained a different perspective from people living in our own community. I also got to use my knowledge from the class in a practical way."

"I got to travel to areas of Mwanza that I've never been to even though I've lived here for my entire life!"

Skills the SAUT students learned:
- teamwork
- how to properly conduct interviews
- how to establish trust with interviewee so answers and results are accurate
- how to reliably and accurately collect data
- how to properly record data
- English speaking skills
- cross cultural collaboration (Canadian-Tanzanian)
- adapting to language barriers

Knowledge gained by SAUT students
- Learned that probiotics are an integral part of health management and disease prevention, for both HIV+ positive and all other individuals
- "As students studying mass communication we will be spreading this knowledge of probiotics to people through many mediums"
- "Doing field work helped me learn how to interview people, collect data, and do research in an effective and polite way; I also learned how to get the interviewees to trust me."
- "I learned that people that are uneducated can still be very successful in business management; they use societal support to help run their project."

Potential Future Project for SAUT-WHE Interns

The SAUT students interviewed several kitchens but two of them, Upendo Igoma and Nuru Mahina, expressed interest in selling their yoghurt on SAUT campus after speaking with the students. Both SAUT students agreed that if students on campus were educated on the benefits of probiotic yoghurt, they would buy it. Currently yoghurt is sold on campus for 700tsh, but it isn't probiotic.

WHE Student Feedback

"Culturally and locally, they were a huge asset to the yoghurt kitchen research. They were also a pleasure to work with because they were interested in the project, kept us updated on their progress, and were timely in submitting research results."
"The SAUT students showed us the local perspective on how the yoghurt businesses are running here and this really helped us think critically about the program, its goals and its progression toward those goals."

"They were so willing to be patient with our lack of knowledge; we learned so much from them!"

"It was refreshing to see a high level of curiosity in the project and this wasn't communicated by the first set of SAUT students that dropped out of the program. They seemed very enthusiastic about the future of this partnership and what information they learned and how that can be shared with the rest of the SAUT community to benefit the yoghurt project."

**Skills the WHE interns learned:**
- patience
- flexibility
- communicating needs
- cross cultural engagement (convincing SAUT students this was a beneficial project for them)
- managing language barriers

**Recommendations for the Future of the Partnership Program**

1) Getting the ball rolling on this partnership program was extremely difficult, time confusing and frustrating. We were more than halfway through our time here before we finally got assigned students to work with and then after spending five hours briefing them on the yoghurt program, preparing them for the interviews and scheduling all the interviews, they dropped out of the program. They were supposed to go to conduct kitchen interviews and simply didn't show up. The kitchens were angry and frustrated that the students didn't show up. For future programs the partnership commitment and requirements needs to be clearly outlined beforehand and students should be reliable, committed candidates.

2) Money was another huge issue. The students continued to add on costs that they wanted us (the muzungos) to cover for their expenses. This made us feel used and generally taken advantage of. Mary, to our delight, stepped in and SAUT administration covered 100,000tsh for their transportation costs. We wanted the students to go to more kitchens and do more interviews but that was all that was available in the budget. For future programs and for this partnership to be beneficial there needs to be a larger budget allocation.

3) We were also torn as to whether future kitchen interviews should be done with only SAUT students. When asked whether they thought this was beneficial for the integrity of the interview results the SAUT students expressed:
"Yes, for sure. They see us and trust us; we are local and part of the university (showed their university ID). We also speak swahili with no need to translate it is easier to have the interview flow. The mamas were open and trusting to tell us everything."

However, one of our community partners (Bernard Makachia) expressed that the kitchens were confused because some of them had 'muzungo' interviews and some had SAUT students interviewing them. Bernard thought that if we did the interviews together, both SAUT students and muzungos, the interview would be more transparent in its intention and be culturally and locally appropriate. **For future program, WHE and SAUT interns will need to discuss decide what interview method they would like to use.**

4) Location of SAUT was by far the biggest issue and significantly hindered the progress and quality of the internship. SAUT was much too distant from our locations to work; we needed to ride four buses each day, spending anywhere from 2.5-4 hours on public transit a day. The buses are not safe and should not be ridden by Western students but there were no other affordable transportation options. The SAUT campus is also 40 minutes from town and created a huge exclusion from the rest of the interns. The distance also significantly limited our cultural immersion, which is a key part of the Western Heads East program.

Housing and accommodation were not properly arranged until three weeks before we left for Canada. We spend two months in housing that was not what we were promised and was not adequate living conditions for the period of our stay; this included lack of running water, no working shower, toilet or sinks, lack of kitchen equipment and utensils, and an unsafe location too close to the public transport station. **We would highly recommend that future interns not live on SAUT campus. It is beautiful but not appropriate for WHE interns.**

**Thank you**

A big thank you to everyone that has been involved in the making of this summative report: our community partners, SAUT university, WHE staff. Thank you for your time and expertise, we so enjoyed our time working with you and we hope you can use this report to make informed decisions about the future of the probiotic program.

Sincerely,

Tara and Gabriella
WHE Interns 2015