

Western University

Scholarship@Western

---

The Road Goes Ever On: Estelle Jorgensen's  
Legacy in Music Education

Music Education Department

---

12-2019

## Ch. 03 - Is It Athene, Minerva, or Estelle Disguised as Mentor? Or, Mentoring the Next Generation: Jorgensen as mentor qua Mentor

Pamela Stover

University of Toledo, Pamela.Stover@utoledo.edu

Follow this and additional works at: <https://ir.lib.uwo.ca/jorgensen>



Part of the [Music Education Commons](#), and the [Music Pedagogy Commons](#)

---

### Citation of this paper:

Stover, P. (2019). Is it Athene, Minerva, or Estelle disguised as mentor? or, mentoring the next generation: Jorgensen as mentor qua mentor. In R. E. Allsup & C. Benedict (Eds.), *The road goes ever on: Estelle Jorgensen's legacy in music education* (pp. 19-36). London, Ontario: Western University. <https://doi.org/10.5206/q1144262.jorgensen.2019.ch03>

# Section I - The Past is Our Future / The Past is Not Our Future

## Chapter 3

# Is It Athene, Minerva, or Estelle Disguised as Mentor? Or, Mentoring the Next Generation: Jorgensen as mentor *qua* Mentor

Pamela Stover

University of Toledo, Toledo, Ohio, USA  
[Pamela.Stover@utoledo.edu](mailto:Pamela.Stover@utoledo.edu)

### Abstract

The work of a mentor takes many forms. There is the formal mentoring of a student or a colleague done by advisors and professors. From Homer's *Odyssey*, however, comes another image in the character of "Mentor," the trusted friend of Odysseus who was charged with the care of Odysseus's young son, Telemachus. Although Mentor was male, there are two instances in literature wherein females—Pallus Athene and Minerva— took the form of Mentor and were successful where "Mentor" had failed. The feminine image of "Mentor in disguise" will be explored in this chapter to illustrate Jorgensen's approach to mentoring a generation of students, writers, scholars, professors and philosophers in both formal and informal settings. The mentoring by Jorgensen – mentor *qua* Mentor –emulates Athene and Minerva as all three women assume the role of Mentor. Through the past 40 years Estelle Jorgensen has mentored countless students and colleagues in her career in higher education. She has chaired at least 37 doctoral dissertations and documents at Indiana and Walden Universities and as an outside reader. This historical sketch will present Jorgensen's work as a thesis and dissertation advisor as well as an informal mentor and as Mentor.

---

### Introduction

The term *mentor* is indeed an

ancient one. Homer's epic poem, *The Odyssey*, contains an early use of the term. The Trojan War had called Odysseus, a distinguished and kingly warrior, off to

battle. In his absence, his young son, Telemachus, was entrusted to the care of his friend and advisor, Mentor. Through the course of the story, Mentor guides Telemachus on a journey to find his father and also, not incidentally, a new and fuller understanding of himself.—Michael V. Smith<sup>1</sup>

This paper will give a brief history of Estelle Jorgensen's role of mentor and as Mentor, as she fulfills both the general definition of mentor as well as emulating Mentor, especially in Pallus Athene's disguise of Mentor.<sup>2</sup> Pallus Athene, daughter of Zeus, assumed Mentor's form twice in Homer's *Odyssey* to give advice to Telemachus. Without Athena, Mentor was not successful in fulfilling the duties given to and expected of him. Roberts also posits that our modern definition of Mentor rests more in Fenelon's 1699 book *Les Aventures de Telemaque*.<sup>3</sup> Throughout this book, Mentor plays a major role in the form of the goddess Minerva.<sup>4</sup> These two images of the feminine goddesses disguised as Mentor are especially fitting for the role assumed by Estelle Jorgensen as Mentor.

Merriam-Webster defines Mentor not only as "a friend of Odysseus entrusted with the education of Odysseus' son Telemachus" but also mentor as "a trusted counselor or guide."<sup>5</sup> Mentoring is also a relationship and as a role model, a mentor can be informative, nurturing, supportive, or protective.<sup>6</sup> Mentoring can be formal or informal and can happen in a variety of settings.<sup>7</sup> Pellegrino, Conway, and Millican state that the mentoring of music teacher

education candidates for tenure can be found in these three ways: formal mentoring programs, informal mentoring in the participants' institution, and mentoring from former professors. All participants in their study reported keeping in touch with at least one of their former professors, and all found this relationship to be beneficial in navigating the research requirements for tenure and in getting good advice for making sound professional decisions.<sup>8</sup>

Estelle Jorgensen has a tenacious work ethic, with a balance for life with gardening and travel. She possesses an inquisitive mind, sharp wit, and clean and clear writing that answers important questions in music education, or sometimes raises more questions than are answered, as many good philosophical studies do. Jorgensen is fond of asking good questions and probing for answers in obvious and not-so-obvious lines of thought. During the 1990s, her syllabus for Foundations of Music Education listed weekly questions instead of topics and students were expected to come to class with an essay ready to discuss the question of the day.<sup>9</sup> Her classes were intense, but like Telemachus, her students often came out of classes with not only new knowledge but a "new and fuller understanding" of themselves.

She has mentored many music educators, musicians, and educators in formal and informal venues. Through her books, articles, speeches, and presentations, she has touched, and transformed, the lives of many in the field,

some of whom she has never met. Music education philosophers have been mentored by Jorgensen through her work as the founding editor of the *Philosophy of Music Education Review* (1992) and as founder and national chair (1988-1990) of the Philosophy Special Research Interest Group (SRIG) of the Music Education Research Council of the National Association for Music Education (NAfME).<sup>10</sup> She was the founding co-chair of the International Society for the Philosophy of Music Education (2003-2005). She often included younger scholars on Philosophy SRIG panels at conferences and encouraged the young philosophers whether they were her students or not. Many of the next generation of music education philosophers consider Jorgensen as one of their mentors. She also mentored many women and colleagues in navigating the job search, research and publication process, as well as the tenure and promotion processes.

This paper will, however, focus on her formal role of mentor/Mentor for Jorgensen's graduate students. As one of the few music education historians mentored by Jorgensen, I am honored to take this space to give a short history of her mentorship as delimited by the doctoral and masters theses, documents, and dissertations which she chaired at McGill University, Indiana University, Walden University, and as an outside reader. According to her most recent vita, Jorgensen chaired eight master's theses at McGill University and Indiana University.<sup>11</sup>

She lists three dissertations where she served as an outside reader but said that there are probably more. At Indiana in addition to the master's theses, she also chaired seventeen Doctor of Music (DM) documents as well as nine Doctor of Music Education (DME) and five PhD dissertations. At Walden University she has chaired three Education dissertations.

### *Jorgensen's Teaching Career in Higher Education*

Currently, Jorgensen is Professor Emerita of Music in Music Education at the Indiana University Jacobs School of Music and is a Contributing Faculty Member in the Division of Higher Education, Leadership, and Policy at Walden University. Jorgensen's first position as an Assistant Professor was for the 1976-77 school year at Notre Dame University in Nelson, British Columbia, Canada where she also coordinated student teaching. The next year she moved to McGill University in Montreal, Quebec, Canada where she stayed from 1977-87, leaving as a tenured Associate Professor of Music. After spending the 1986-87 year as a Visiting Associate Professor of Music at Indiana, she was appointed in 1987 as a Professor with tenure. She retired from Indiana in 2013 and was awarded Emerita status. Beginning in 2001, she was also working for Walden University in their online programs.

## *Jorgensen's Role in Advising Theses, Documents, and Dissertations*

Inspiration, dedication, guidance, probing questions, clear writing, editing and communication, distinguished, and mentor are all words that doctoral students have used in describing Estelle Jorgensen in the acknowledgement section of their dissertations. Several students were indebted to the “teacher’s teacher” who lit the path to complete the dissertation. Several mention her tirelessness and work ethic, support and encouragement in advising them. Her role in turning students into independent writers and researchers was acknowledged by many. And more than one mentioned that the questions were often more important than the answers.

The next section will present Jorgensen’s role in advising graduate final papers. First will be master’s theses at McGill and Indiana, followed by DM documents that were done by music performance majors at Indiana University. Next will be the three dissertations from Walden and as an outside reader. Lastly will be the DME or PhD dissertations by students at Indiana.

One must not assume that because Jorgensen is a philosopher, that all of her students did philosophical work for their thesis, document, or dissertation. In fact, one cannot even assume that all of her students were music educators. Her three Walden students were educators but not music educators. Her DM students at

Indiana were performance majors, and thus were musicians but not necessarily educators. Amongst her music education graduate students, the methodology for their theses and dissertations varied from philosophical to historic to quantitative.

## *Jorgensen as a Thesis Advisor*

Jorgensen’s first graduate students at McGill University all defended their theses in 1985 and were on topics that were familiar to Jorgensen as a researcher or from her role as a church organist and choir director. Cynthia Hawkins wrote “Aspects of the musical education of choristers in Church of England Choir Schools” pulling from Jorgensen’s experience as a church musician.<sup>12</sup> One of the first graduate research papers using an international topic was Stephanie Williams’ “On folk music as the basis of a Jamaican primary school music program.”<sup>13</sup> In 1984, Jorgensen published an article on early music educator William Channing Woodbridge<sup>14</sup> and in 1985 her student, Marcie-Ann Gilsig, did her thesis on “Elam Ives, Jr. (1802-1864): Musician-Educator.”<sup>15</sup>

At Indiana University, the five masters theses under her advisement took topics relating to history, philosophy and women’s studies. Jenna Richmond<sup>16</sup> and Tura Hayes<sup>17</sup> wrote theses concerning the roles of women in music education. Three others were concerned with beliefs and philosophy. In 2001 Melanie Coleman wrote “An exploratory study of the beliefs of two veteran instrumental music teachers,”<sup>18</sup>

James W. B. Clemens wrote “An historical study of the philosophies of Indiana University School of Music administrators from 1910 to 1973”<sup>19</sup> in 1994, the same year Bradley Klump wrote “Approaching the music of our time: An exploratory philosophical study of two aesthetics with application to music education.”<sup>20</sup>

### *Jorgensen as an Advisor for Performance Majors at Indiana University*

At Indiana University performance majors are awarded a Doctor of Music (DM) degree. At the doctoral level, DM students were required to have two minors, one of which needed to be in an academic area of Music History, Music Theory, or Music Education. These students write a bound document that is housed in the Indiana University School of Music Library but is usually not uploaded to ProQuest or other online dissertation sources. The document is typically not as large as a dissertation, but some of them can be full-scale studies. DM students need to have a reader who is outside of their major field on their document committee, and sometimes this outside reader chairs the document. Many DM students have taken Jorgensen’s courses in College Music Teaching, or Foundations of Music Education, and she would be an obvious choice for their outside reader.

Seventeen performance majors, however, were advised by Estelle Jorgensen

as chair of their document committee. Some of these documents relate to music education in a private studio or school, while others are in the realm of organ and church music and another set relate to philosophy. As students learn from their mentors, mentors also stretch their knowledge base by serving students with a wide variety of interests and research methodologies. This was the case for a Bonnie H. Campbell’s DM Document “An exploratory study of the functioning of selected masticatory muscles during clarinet playing as observed through electromyography.”<sup>21</sup> Jorgensen co-chaired this study with James Campbell in April of 1999. Bonnie Campbell acknowledged the scientific knowledge of her “Chicago people” who lent experimental and medical expertise.

### *Studio Teaching and Repertoire*

Six students wrote documents that focused on studio teaching or studio repertoire. The six were specialists in five different areas of performance: trumpet, guitar, bassoon, oboe, and voice. One of the earliest of these documents was the 1997 study by trumpet performance major, Kevin J. Kjos, who took a class from Jorgensen. Kjos wrote his document on “Reflections on the teaching of William Adam,” a prominent studio trumpet teacher.<sup>22</sup>

Two documents focused on vocal repertoire. The first of these was by Maya Frieman Hoover who wrote “A catalog of and introductory essay to selected

twentieth-century Latin American art songs: A guide to locating and selecting Latin American repertoire for vocal study and performance,” in May, 2003.<sup>23</sup> The other was completed nine years later. In May, 2012, Matthew Fagg-Latta wrote “Teaching undergraduate voice: a repertoire method for soprano, mezzo-soprano, tenor, baritone, and bass.”<sup>24</sup>

The other three documents were completed in 2004 and focused on aspects of teaching oboe, bassoon and classical guitar. First was Jason Edwards, who finished “Schools of oboe playing: formation, transmission, and evolution,” in May.<sup>25</sup> In September, Jose Antonio Lopez defended “Pedagogical principles for the college classical guitar teacher.”<sup>26</sup> The other fall semester document was “A description of selected aspects of three approaches to college-level bassoon instruction,” by Svet A. Atanasov.<sup>27</sup>

## *Organ and Church Music*

Estelle Jorgensen chaired six DM documents pertaining to organ and/or church music that were completed between 2000-2010. One document focused on hymns, three pertained to different aspects of the organ and two examined music in parochial or seminary education. Mary Thomason-Smith’s document was the only one focused on hymnody. She finished “Recent hymns of the Christian church: A reflective essay,” in September of 2004.<sup>28</sup>

Three documents were written on very different aspects of teaching or playing the organ. Betty Woodland focused on a single piece in “A performer’s study of the *Deuxième sonate pour orgue* by Raymond Daveluy” (2001).<sup>29</sup> Another 2005 document focused on organ competitions: John T. Lowe, Jr., “Winner takes all? A reflective study of the relationship of modern North American organ competitions and the careers of young organists.”<sup>30</sup> And finally, Thomas G. Alm’s “Cogent sequence: The *moment* in organ pedagogy” (2000) was only document related to organ pedagogy.<sup>31</sup>

Two documents were related to music education in church educational settings. Ronald R. Preloger’s “Reflections on Lutheran parochial music education in the United States,” (2007) focused on K-12 music education in Lutheran schools.<sup>32</sup> In 2010, Gregory Hooker wrote “Reflections on musical and theological education in Episcopal seminaries”<sup>33</sup> focusing on music as an aspect of preparing priests and others in church vocations. These six documents tapped into Jorgensen’s expertise and interest in music and spirituality.

## *Philosophy*

Four performance majors wrote documents pertaining to philosophical topics relating to music education. Three of these studies were completed in 2004, while Michael Hackett wrote “Self-concept, self-esteem, self-efficacy, and motivation in brass instruction at the collegiate level”<sup>34</sup> in

May of 2010. The 2004 defenses began in May with “Foundations for flow: A philosophical model for studio instruction to develop the intellectual, emotional, physical, and spiritual faculties of each student on the journey to self-actualization and optimal experience,” by Krista Dyonis Riggs.<sup>35</sup> Next was Nicole Riner’s “The girls in the band: Women’s perspectives on gender stereotyping in the music classroom,” in September.<sup>36</sup> In December, Keri Eileen McCarthy defended “A study of Howard Gardner’s theories of multiple intelligences and their applications in the collegiate oboe studio”.<sup>37</sup> These four documents tapped into Jorgensen’s expertise in various areas of music education, including one on a feminist topic.

### *Jorgensen as an Advisor for Dissertations Other Than at Indiana*

Jorgensen also served as an advisor for PhD dissertations that were completed in institutions other than Indiana. She lists six of these dissertations on her vita and they fall into two categories. The first three discussed were done at Walden University where Jorgensen serves as faculty. The second three were as an external reviewer for dissertations written in other countries. Jorgensen lists three on her vita but acknowledges that this is an incomplete list. These PhD dissertations were also filed with ProQuest or other online sources and comments from the acknowledgements

sections will partially illustrate Jorgensen’s role as mentor.

### *Doctoral Dissertations Advised at Walden University*

Since 2001, Jorgensen has been a contributing faculty member at Minneapolis, Minnesota-based Walden University, delivering instruction online. She works in the division of Higher Education, Leadership and Policy in the Richard W. Riley College of Education and Leadership at Walden. Three female education majors completed their PhD under Jorgensen’s direction in 2006, 2007 and 2015.

First was Theresa Hurley, who defended “International-mindedness in an international school in Cairo, Egypt,” to earn her PhD in Education in 2006.<sup>38</sup> In her dissertation, Hurley examines the difficult and perhaps unsuccessful transformation of a private-school for ex-patriots to an internationally-minded school. The other members of the dissertation committee were Iris Yob, Sigrin Newell, and Angela Djao. In her acknowledgements section, Hurley singles out Jorgensen: “And I must make special mention of my dissertation advisor who has been an inspiration to me as I progressed through Walden University. I humbly thank Estelle Jorgensen for her outstanding mentorship, her pointed directions and her intellectual clarity.”

Next to defend was art-educator Jennifer King Pullman, finishing her PhD in Education in 2007. Her dissertation was



“Inner city students’ perceptions about art education: Its role, value, and significance in their lives.”<sup>39</sup> In this qualitative study, Pullman interviewed 10 students for their perceptions in addition to gathering information from teachers, staff, parents, classroom observations and documents. After thanking her family and “furry muses” she gives unending gratitude to her esteemed Walden mentors: Dr. Caroline Bassett, Dr. Darrash Callahan, Dr. Iris Yob and her brilliant chairperson, Dr. Estelle Jorgensen. She stated that Jorgensen brought expertise, insight, and incredible organizational skills to her most important of all Walden challenges, her dissertation.

Another art education dissertation was done by Jacqueline Betty Henson-Dacey in 2015 for her PhD in Education. In “High school visual art students’ perceptions of creativity,”<sup>40</sup> Henson-Dacey used Csikszentmihalyi’s theory of creativity and flow in a phenomenological study exploring nine students’ perceptions of creativity and its relationship to flow, or the state of consciousness associated with optimal pleasure in their art. Henson-Dacey thanked “Dr. Estelle Jorgensen and Dr. Iris Yob for providing me with a refined approach to completing a dissertation. Dr. Jorgensen and Dr. Yob believed in my work and encouraged me to continue this pathway toward expanding my knowledge about creativity and the process of writing a dissertation. Their guidance and clear communication were reassuring in stressful times.”

In addition to these three dissertations listed on Jorgensen’s curriculum vita in her role of chair, another 2017 dissertation was found online where Jorgensen was a committee member. This study was “Professional Development Experiences of Southern California Elementary School Teachers” by Kim E. Du Cloux and chaired by Dr. Cheryl Keen.<sup>41</sup> She recognizes Dr. Estelle Jorgensen with “thank you for pushing me beyond my comfort zone causing me to stretch and consider additional angles as well. I appreciate you both. Thank you.”

Although this list of Walden University dissertations is most likely not complete, the expressions of thanks by the writers give a solid insight as to elements of Jorgensen’s mentorship they found valuable. These insights are echoed by other students from Indiana and from abroad.

### ***External Examiner for PhD Dissertations (incomplete list)***

Jorgensen has served on several international dissertation defenses. In Canada and the United Kingdom, this role is called “External Examiner” while in Finland it is called “Academic Opponent.” The list of international dissertations on Jorgensen’s curriculum vita is incomplete, but five are listed—one from Canada, one from the UK and three from Finland.

There were three Finnish doctoral dissertations listed on Jorgensen's vita where she served as an Academic Opponent. All three were students at the Sibelius Academy in Helsinki, Finland. Heidi Westerlund wrote "Bridging Experience, Action, and Culture in Music Education" in an undated doctoral dissertation.<sup>42</sup> Marja Heimonen "Music Education and Law: Regulation as an Instrument" in 2002<sup>43</sup> followed by Lotta Ilomäki's "In Search of Musicianship: A Practitioner-Research Project on Pianists' Aural-Skills Education" that was defended on June 3, 2011.<sup>44</sup> In 2012, Jorgensen was awarded an Honorary Doctorate, the DMus (honoris causa), from the Sibelius Academy.

Jorgensen has also served as an external examiner for PhD dissertations in Canada and the United Kingdom. The most recent Canadian defense was a dissertation by Paul Louth, "Music, metaphor, and ideology: Toward a critical theory of forms in music education," at the University of Western Ontario, London, Ontario, Canada, on April, 2008.<sup>45</sup> The most recent dissertation listed on Jorgensen's curriculum vita was the May, 2018 work by Hermione Ruck Keene. Jorgensen served at the external examiner for her PhD dissertation "Taking part and playing parts: Musical identities, roles, participation, and inclusion" at Dartington International Summer School, Institute of Education, University College London in the United Kingdom.<sup>46</sup>

## *Jorgensen as an Advisor for Music Education dissertations at Indiana University*

The bulk of Jorgensen's mentoring came in her role in advising nine DME and five PhD music education dissertations at Indiana University. At Indiana University, music education doctoral students could earn a Doctor of Music Education (DME), a degree that is administered through the School of Music. But with the addition of proficiency in two research languages, an additional research methods class and a public lecture, the PhD could be earned. The PhD is administered through the Graduate College and there are additional requirements from the Graduate College in addition to the courses/proficiencies mentioned. The DME and PhD students all have two 12-credit minors in addition to their Music Education major.

The first and last dissertations listed on Jorgensen's CV were awarded prizes. These two dissertations will be discussed last. It is also evident that Jorgensen took over as chair when some of her colleagues were unable finish with their students. This occurred especially with the 1999 death of Dr. Jean Sinor and the illness and retirement of Dr. Charles Schmidt, where Jorgensen left her philosophical comfort zone and chaired some quantitative studies. Eight of the nine DME dissertations will be discussed first, followed by the four of the PhD dissertations, finishing with the two prize-winning studies by Mary Jo Reichling (DME) and Leonard Tan (PhD).

## *Indiana University Music Education DME Dissertations*

In this section, eight music education dissertations will be discussed in chronological order. All were chaired by Estelle Jorgensen from the years 1996-2013. Following this section will be the chronology of the PhD dissertations in music education.

N. Carlotta Parr was the first dissertation defense to use a PowerPoint presentation in music education at Indiana University. Her 1996 work “Towards a philosophy of music teacher education: Applications of the ideas of Jerome Bruner, Maxine Greene, and Vernon A. Howard,”<sup>47</sup> was certainly in Jorgensen’s wheelhouse. Parr lauds Jorgensen in that “she has given me the confidence to celebrate the questions, and she has provided never-ending support and guidance in the search for some answers.” Upon leaving the dissertation defense, Jorgensen commented to the doctoral students attending that Parr and “upped the ante” with her PowerPoint presentation, and that they were to follow suit.<sup>48</sup>

Masafumi Ogawa, from Japan, studied with Jorgensen while he was still learning academic English. This was quite a feat, as Jorgensen’s classes were difficult for native-English speakers let alone for someone whose mother tongue was not English. In 2000, Ogawa returned from Japan to defend his dissertation: “Early nineteenth-century American influences on the beginning of Japanese public school music education: An analysis and

comparison of selected music textbooks published in Japan and the United States,”<sup>49</sup> Jorgensen admired Ogawa’s tenacity and Ogawa was thankful to Jorgensen for her mentorship.<sup>50</sup>

Just one month later, Christine Brown defended her philosophical study, “A humane approach to private piano instruction: An analysis and application of the ideas of Abraham Maslow, Carl Rogers, and Jerome Bruner.”<sup>51</sup> Brown’s study took a philosophical look at the three psychologists and made applications to the practice of piano pedagogy. She thanked Jorgensen for “her patience and encouragement as she capably lit my path.”

In February 2003, Lois M. Sabo-Skelton completed “Sol Babitz, the early music laboratory and string pedagogy, with annotated catalogues.”<sup>52</sup> This study marked the founding of the Early Music Laboratory in 1948 in Los Angeles, California. This laboratory was focused on performance on authentic instruments and early music treatises. Sabo-Skelton had originally worked with Dr. Jean Sinor who died before the dissertation was completed. She lauded Jorgensen as “a teacher’s teacher, who is not only responsible for the completion of this project but has provided the drive and courage when mine faltered.”

One of the few music education studies at Indiana involving people with special needs was Elizabeth Bauer’s “What is an appropriate approach to piano instruction for students with Down Syndrome?”<sup>53</sup> This 2003 dissertation

synthesized studies about piano instruction for students with Down Syndrome with the theories of John Dewey and Maria Montessori. Bauer thanked Jorgensen for “her patience and encouragement throughout the entire doctoral process.”

“Acoustic and perceptual analyses of the voices of classroom music teachers,”<sup>54</sup> was the topic for Anne Sinclair’s 2010 dissertation. Sinclair looked at the effect of the time of day on the acoustic measures of the voices of classroom music teachers. This quantitative study was begun under the direction of music psychologist Dr. Charles Schmidt. Upon Schmidt’s illness and retirement, Jorgensen took over as chair. Sinclair thanks Jorgensen for “her guidance, expertise, and willingness to chair this project through its final stages. Her dedication to the field of music education and her mastery of the art of teaching are an inspiration to me.”

J. Michael Kearns “Thinking about jazz education in Canada: A comparative case study of collegiate educators regarding pedagogy, administration and the future of jazz education”<sup>55</sup> drew on Jorgensen’s roots in Canada. Kearns used semi-structured interviews with seven collegiate jazz educators. Kearns states “This research has been a real growth experience with its highs and lows, but the resulting study is my greatest achievement to date, and something of which I am very proud. Nothing of this magnitude is accomplished without strong advisors...”

And lastly, Khin Yee Lo defended “An intercultural study of selected aspects of string educators’ beliefs and practices in the United States and the United Kingdom,”<sup>56</sup> in May of 2013. This was a cross-cultural ethnographic study that used repeated interviews and classroom observations with seven string educators in the United States and the United Kingdom. Lo stated: “I am greatly indebted to my distinguished research director, Dr. Estelle Jorgensen, who patiently advised me, yet gave me space to write, to think, and to explore in this research project. She has been my mentor since I started my doctoral study at IUB. Her life wisdom, compassionate spirit, and unwavering belief in me in arduous moments propelled me to the completion of this dissertation.”

These words of thanks and appreciation give an insight as to Jorgensen’s devotion to mentoring her students and to her teaching and advising style.

## *Indiana University PhD Dissertations*

In addition to Leonard Tan, whose 2012 PhD work was prize-winning and will be discussed below, four Indiana students took on the extra courses and language requirements to earn a PhD in Music Education. All studies were qualitative with two being historical. Jorgensen taught the historical research methods class, but it was rare for a doctoral student to do a historical study or to become a music education

historian. Jorgensen also taught the philosophical research methods class and the sociology in music education course that were the other additional options for the PhD research requirement.

I, Pamela Stover, had the honor of being Jorgensen's first PhD advisee in music education at Indiana University. My 2003 dissertation was originally chaired by Dr. Jean Sinor, but Jorgensen heartily took me on following Sinor's death in 1999, as my topic "Teacher preparation, methods and materials for music education in rural and one-room schools in selected areas of the Midwest (1890-1950),"<sup>57</sup> was inspired by cataloguing my grandmother's music teaching book in Jorgensen's historical methods class. In my preface, I thank Jorgensen for "her inspiration, her inquiring mind, and her ability to turn me into an independent writer and researcher. From her, I will always remember that the questions are often more important than the answers."

In 2006, J. B. Dyas completed his PhD dissertation "A description, comparison, and interpretation of two exemplary performing arts high school jazz programs,"<sup>58</sup> In the study, Dyas compared the renowned jazz programs at the High School or the Performing Arts in Houston and Booker T. Washington High School for the Performing and Visual Arts in Dallas. He thanks Jorgensen in that she was "extraordinarily generous with her time, expertise, editorial prowess, patience, and care in the completion of this work. She also taught me a great deal in her classes, not

the least of which was to read those I might not otherwise have considered before her tutelage, which has since opened up many a door. She encouraged me, along with all her students, to open our minds, think outside the box, and transform music education."

In 2009 John Seybert defended "A history of the National Association of Band Directors' Coordinating Council, 1960-1970."<sup>59</sup> This historical study used oral history and primary source documents. Sybert thanks Jorgensen for "her countless hours of time and expertise in molding and refining the entire work."

Besides Leonard Tan, Carla Aguilar was Jorgensen's final PhD advisee. Aguilar finished "The development and application of a conceptual model for the analysis of policy recommendations for music education in the United States" in 2011.<sup>60</sup> Aguilar looks at policy at the federal level with regards to MENC (now NAFME). In her preface she credits Jorgensen for pushing "me to think of things related to music education in different ways and to strive always to keep asking questions."

### *Prize-winning Dissertations*

There are two Indiana University dissertations listed in Jorgensen's Curriculum Vita as winning prizes. These dissertations are the first and last Indiana University dissertations advised by Jorgensen, bookending her work as a dissertation mentor at IU.

Mary J. Reichling was awarded the Dean's Prize at Indiana University as well as the Dissertation of the Year award from the Council for Research in Music Education for her 1991 work "Images of Imagination: A philosophical study of imagination in music with application to music education".<sup>61</sup> This dissertation was often used in Jorgensen's classes as an example of philosophical research.

In 2012, Leonard Yuh Chaur Tan won the Dean's Prize at Indiana University for his dissertation on "Towards a transcultural philosophy of instrumental music education."<sup>62</sup> In this work, Tan draws from the writing of four ancient Chinese philosophers (Confucius, Mencius, Xunzi, and Zhuangzi) and four American pragmatist philosophers (William James, John Dewey, George Mead, and Richard Shusterman). He expresses "my most heartfelt and sincere appreciation to Dr. Estelle R. Jorgensen, chair of my dissertation committee. Thank you very much for being the primary source of inspiration behind this study. I really appreciate your probing questions, dedicated guidance, and careful editing of

my work. You never fail to inspire me, and I owe my greatest intellectual debt to you."

## Conclusion

Many have been mentored by Estelle Jorgensen through the past 40 years, and many, as Tan expressed in his dissertation, "owe our greatest intellectual debt" to Jorgensen. While the fields of education, music, and music education are not analogous to the Trojan War, Estelle Jorgensen is analogous to Mentor. Many of her students and colleagues are Telemachi who have seen Estelle as Mentor, whether it was in the form of Athena or Minerva. Mentor is there, prodding us to open our minds, think in new ways, taking the path untaken, and finding our way on that path, and asking questions. And learning that in life and in academia, often the questions are more important than the answers. Thank you for lighting the path for so many, Estelle Jorgensen, our Mentor.

## Notes

- 1 Michael V. Smith, "Modern Mentoring: Ancient Lessons for Today," *Music Educators Journal* 92, no.2 (November, 2005): 62-67.
- 2 Andy Roberts, "Homer's Mentor: Duties Fulfilled or Misconstrued," adapted from "The Origins of the Term Mentor," *History of Education Society Bulletin* 64 (November, 1999): 313-329. Retrieved from [http://www.nickols.us/homers\\_mentor.pdf](http://www.nickols.us/homers_mentor.pdf).
- 3 *Les Aventures de Telemaque* by François de Salignac de La Mothe-Fenelon (1651-1715) was first published in 1699. *Telemaque* was very popular and was an imitation of Homer's *Odyssey*. It is

---

from this book that the use of the term mentor came into common use. Roberts, "Homer's Mentor," *History of Education Society Bulletin*.

- 4 Roberts, "Homer's Mentor," *History of Education Society Bulletin*.
- 5 "Mentor." Merriam-Webster.com. Accessed May 31, 2018. <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/mentor>.
- 6 Smith, "Modern Mentoring," 63-64.
- 7 Colleen M. Conway, Michael V. Smith, and Thomas M. Hodgman, *Handbook for the Music Mentor* (Chicago: GIA Publications, 2010).
- 8 Kristen Pellegrino, Colleen M. Conway, and J. Si Millican, "Tenure and Promotion Experiences of Music Teacher Educators: A Mixed-Methods Study," *Journal of Music Teacher Education* 27, no. 2 (September 14, 2017): 82-99. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1057083717720085> [Accessed May 31, 2018].
- 9 Personal papers and recollections of the author.
- 10 At the time of the founding of the Philosophy SRIG, NAFME was known as MENC: the Music Education National Conference.
- 11 Estelle R. Jorgensen, Long Curriculum Vita, April 16, 2018. Unpublished document.
- 12 Cynthia Hawkins, "Aspects of the musical education of choristers in Church of England Choir Schools," (MA Thesis, McGill University, 1985).
- 13 Stephanie E. Williams, "On folk music as the basis of a Jamaican primary school music program," (MA Thesis, McGill University, 1985).
- 14 William Channing Woodbridge's lecture, "On vocal music as a branch of common education" revisited. *Studies in Music* (University of Western Australia) 18 (1984): 1-32. Reprinted in *Visions of Music Education* 14 (June 2009) at <http://www-usr.rider.edu/~vrme/>.
- 15 Marcie-Ann Gilsig, "Elam Ives, Jr. (1802-1864): Musician-Educator," (MA Thesis, McGill University, 1985).
- 16 Jeana S. Richmond, "An exploratory essay on the status and contributions of women in music education in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries," (MME Thesis, Indiana University, August, 2004).
- 17 Tura Elizabeth Hayes, "Room for all: A reflective analysis of the role of women in music education," (MME Thesis, Indiana University, December, 2000).
- 18 Melanie A. Coleman, "An exploratory study of the beliefs of two veteran instrumental music teachers," (MME Thesis, Indiana University, May, 2001).
- 19 James W. B. Clemens, "An historical study of the philosophies of Indiana University School of Music administrators from 1910 to 1973," (MME Thesis, Indiana University, May, 1994).
- 20 Bradley Edward Klump, "Approaching the music of our time: An exploratory philosophical study of two aesthetics with application to music education," (MME Thesis, Indiana University, May, 1994).

- 
- 21 Bonnie H. Campbell, "An exploratory study of the functioning of selected masticatory muscles during clarinet playing as observed through electromyography," (DM Document, Indiana University, April, 1999).
  - 22 Kevin J. Kjos, "Reflections on the teaching of William Adam," (DM Document, Indiana University, December, 1997).
  - 23 Maya Frieman Hoover, "A catalog of and introductory essay to selected twentieth-century Latin American art songs: A guide to locating and selecting Latin American repertoire for vocal study and performance," (DM Document, Indiana University, May, 2003).
  - 24 Matthew Fagg-Latta, "Teaching undergraduate voice: a repertoire method for soprano, mezzo-soprano, tenor, baritone, and bass." (DM Document, Indiana University, May, 2012).
  - 25 Jason Edwards, "Schools of oboe playing: formation, transmission, and evolution," (DM Document, Indiana University, May, 2004).
  - 26 Jose Antonio Lopez, "Pedagogical principles for the college classical guitar teacher," (DM Document, Indiana University, September, 2004).
  - 27 Svet A. Atanasov, "A description of selected aspects of three approaches to college-level bassoon instruction," (DM Document, Indiana University, Fall, 2004).
  - 28 Mary Thomason-Smith, "Recent hymns of the Christian church: A reflective essay," (DM Document, Indiana University, September, 2004).
  - 29 Betty Woodland, "A performer's study of the *Deuxième sonate pour orgue* by Raymond Daveluy," (DM Document, Indiana University, April, 2001).
  - 30 John T. Lowe, Jr., "Winner takes all? A reflective study of the relationship of modern North American organ competitions and the careers of young organists," (DM Document, Indiana University, May, 2005).
  - 31 Thomas G. Alm, "Cogent sequence: The *moment* in organ pedagogy," (DM Document, Indiana University, May, 2000).
  - 32 Ronald R. Preloger, "Reflections on Lutheran parochial music education in the United States," (DM Document, Indiana University, May, 2007).
  - 33 Gregory Hooker, "Reflections on musical and theological education in Episcopal seminaries," (DM Document, Indiana University, May, 2010).
  - 34 Michael Hackett, "Self-concept, self-esteem, self-efficacy, and motivation in brass instruction at the collegiate level," (DM Document, Indiana University, May, 2010).
  - 35 Krista Dyonis Riggs, "Foundations for flow: A philosophical model for studio instruction to develop the intellectual, emotional, physical, and spiritual faculties of each student on the journey to self-actualization and optimal experience," (DM Document, Indiana University, May, 2004).
  - 36 Nicole Riner, "The girls in the band: Women's perspectives on gender stereotyping in the music classroom," (DM Document, Indiana University, September, 2004).



- 
- 37 Keri Eileen McCarthy, "A study of Howard Gardner's theories of multiple intelligences and their applications in the collegiate oboe studio," (DM Document, Indiana University, December, 2004).
- 38 Theresa Hurley, "International-mindedness in an international school in Cairo, Egypt," (PhD Diss., Walden University, 2006).
- 39 Jennifer King Pullman, "Inner city students' perceptions about art education: Its role, value, and significance in their lives," (PhD Diss., Walden University, 2007).
- 40 Jacqueline Betty Henson-Dacey, "High school visual art students' perceptions of creativity," (PhD Diss., Walden University, 2015).
- 41 Kim E. Du Cloux, "Professional Development Experiences of Southern California Elementary School Teachers" (PhD Diss., Walden University, 2017).
- 42 Heidi Westerlund, "Bridging Experience, Action, and Culture in Music Education" (Doctoral Diss., Sibelius Academy, Helsinki, Finland, 2002).
- 43 Marja Heimonen, "Music Education and Law: Regulation as an Instrument" (Doctoral Diss., Sibelius Academy, Helsinki, Finland, 2002).
- 44 Lotta Ilomäki, "In Search of Musicianship: A Practitioner-Research Project on Pianists' Aural-Skills Education" (Doctoral Diss., Sibelius Academy, Helsinki, Finland, 2011).
- 45 Paul Louth, "Music, metaphor, and ideology: Toward a critical theory of forms in music education," (PhD Diss., University of Western Ontario, Canada, 2008).
- 46 Hermione Ruck Keene, "Taking part and playing parts: Musical identities, roles, participation, and inclusion" (PhD Diss., Dartington International Summer School, Institute of Education, University College London, 2018).
- 47 N. Carlotta Parr, "Towards a philosophy of music teacher education: Applications of the ideas of Jerome Bruner, Maxine Greene, and Vernon A. Howard," (DME Diss., Indiana University, August, 1996).
- 48 Personal recollection of the author.
- 49 Masafumi Ogawa, "Early nineteenth-century American influences on the beginning of Japanese public school music education: An analysis and comparison of selected music textbooks published in Japan and the United States," (DME Diss., Indiana University, April, 2000).
- 50 Personal conversations with Jorgensen, Ogawa and the author.
- 51 Christine Anne Brown, "A humane approach to private piano instruction: An analysis and application of the ideas of Abraham Maslow, Carl Rogers, and Jerome Bruner," (DME Diss., Indiana University, May, 2000).
- 52 Lois M. Sabo-Skelton, "Sol Babitz, the early music laboratory and string pedagogy, with annotated catalogues," (DME Diss., Indiana University, February, 2003).
- 53 Elizabeth Anne Bauer, "What is an appropriate approach to piano instruction for students with Down Syndrome?" (DME Diss., Indiana University, May, 2003).

- 
- 54 Anne M. Sinclair “Acoustic and perceptual analyses of the voices of classroom music teachers” (DME Diss., Indiana University, October, 2010).
- 55 J. Michael Kearns, “Thinking about jazz education in Canada: A comparative case study of collegiate educators regarding pedagogy, administration and the future of jazz education” (DME Diss., Indiana University, April, 2011).
- 56 Khin Yee Lo, “An intercultural study of selected aspects of string educators’ beliefs and practices in the United States and the United Kingdom,” (DME Diss., Indiana University, May, 2013).
- 57 Pamela Jo Stover, “Teacher preparation, methods and materials for music education in rural and one-room schools in selected areas of the Midwest (1890-1950),” (PhD Diss., Indiana University, May, 2003).
- 58 J. B. Dyas, “A description, comparison, and interpretation of two exemplary performing arts high school jazz programs,” (PhD Diss., Indiana University, December, 2006).
- 59 John Seybert, “A history of the National Association of Band Directors’ Coordinating Council, 1960-1970,” (PhD Diss., Indiana University, December, 2009).
- 60 Carla Aguilar, “The development and application of a conceptual model for the analysis of policy recommendations for music education in the United States,” (PhD Diss., Indiana University, April, 2011).
- 61 Mary Josephine Reichling, “Images of imagination: A philosophical study of imagination in music with application to music education” (DME Diss., Indiana University, May, 1991).
- 62 Leonard Yuh Chaur Tan, “Toward a transcultural philosophy of instrumental music education” (PhD Diss., Indiana University, December, 2012).

### *About the Author*

**Dr. Pamela Stover** is an Associate Professor of Music Education at the University of Toledo (Ohio, USA) where she teaches elementary music education methods and pipe organ at the undergraduate and graduate levels. She is a music education historian and has taught or presented research throughout North America, Europe, Australia, Asia and the Middle East. Stover is a 2020 Fulbright Research Scholar at the Zoltán Kodály Institute in Hungary. She earned her PhD in 2003 from the Jacobs School of Music at Indiana University in music education with minor fields of pipe organ and church music.

---

## *Project Links*

This chapter comes from a book titled *The Road Goes Ever On: Estelle Jorgensen's Legacy in Music Education*. The philosophical essays contained within focus on themes that have intrigued Estelle Jorgensen whose forty years of scholarship have strongly influenced music education research and practice: the transformation of music education in public schools; feminist and LGBTQ voices; mentoring; the unfinished search for new ways of seeing, hearing, and doing; multiple and intersecting musical identities; the tension between tradition and change; and activist practice in music education.

The complete book can be found at the following link: <https://ir.lib.uwo.ca/jorgensen/>